

Page 12215

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 29 JULY 2013]
 2 [10:40] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
 3 I'm sorry that we're starting later than we intended this
 4 morning, but there were a number of matters that we had to
 5 deal with in chambers, which caused the delay. Mr Mpofo, I
 6 see you're back with us this morning?
 7 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson –
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Is there anything you have
 9 to report with regard to the matters that were discussed
 10 when you were last with us?
 11 MR MPOFU: Yes. Well, Chairperson, I'm
 12 here for two reasons. One is to, because we were summoned
 13 to come here by letter, but also to –
 14 CHAIRPERSON: I think "requested" might
 15 be a more accurate word, but let's not debate that now.
 16 MR MPOFU: Well, okay, I can leave it
 17 there, Chairperson. Well, not politely, but the second
 18 reason is of course what the Chairperson is raising, which
 19 is to report on progress, and also we've been told that
 20 there's going to be opposition from an unknown quarter of
 21 the application for postponement.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: - quite what that means.
 23 MR MPOFU: Well, it says here –
 24 CHAIRPERSON: But please proceed with
 25 what you –

Page 12216

1 MR MPOFU: Alright, ja. Okay, what it
 2 means is that letter that we received on Friday say "You
 3 are specifically advised that you should not assume that
 4 the application will be unopposed." I also don't know what
 5 that means.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, sorry, Mr Mpofo,
 7 before you carry on I think we should wait for the
 8 interpreter to be with us. I wasn't aware of the fact that
 9 he wasn't. He's coming now, I believe.
 10 MR MPOFU: No, there's no need,
 11 Chairperson –
 12 CHAIRPERSON: No, I think the people in
 13 the auditorium are entitled to have an interpretation of
 14 what's being said; not only those in the auditorium, but if
 15 this is being available to a wider audience outside the
 16 auditorium, I think it's also desirable that people who –
 17 MR MPOFU: Ja, maybe for later, yes.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes. Mr Mahlangu is now
 19 with us. I think he didn't realise we were going to start
 20 when we did. I asked Mr Mpofo to give Mr Mahlangu, to give
 21 us a report of what has happened that's relevant to our
 22 proceedings since he was last with us, and he started
 23 making some remarks. Perhaps he should repeat them so you
 24 can then interpret them into Xhosa for the benefit of
 25 people in the auditorium who are dependent upon that

Page 12217

1 interpretation.
 2 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you. Chairperson,
 3 yes, I think I wanted to read from the letter we received,
 4 which says, "You are specifically advised that you should
 5 not assume that the application will be unopposed." That's
 6 what I was addressing, but the next sentence is one in your
 7 favour, Chairperson, which says, "You are invited to be
 8 present to reply to the submissions which are to be made."
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Well, yes, my understanding
 10 is that that letter was written on the basis that we would
 11 have definite information at this stage as to the outcome
 12 of the funding application or applications, and as I will
 13 be telling you in a moment, that aspect of the matter is
 14 not yet final. So it was just a warning, a letter written
 15 on the basis that if we were going to consider the
 16 postponement application this morning and not consider the
 17 possibility of a further adjournment for a few days, then
 18 you should be here to deal with it, otherwise it will be
 19 dealt with in your absence. But –
 20 MR MPOFU: Yes –
 21 CHAIRPERSON: That's, as I understand it,
 22 as we explained, will be explained more fully in a moment,
 23 that's not the position at the moment. So I don't think
 24 you need to deal with that any further, unless there's
 25 something further you want to say on the matter. I

Page 12218

1 obviously don't want to stop you from saying what you
 2 consider appropriate.
 3 MR MPOFU: Yes. Yes, Chairperson, we
 4 understand that, and I don't want to muddy the waters more
 5 than it is necessary. I just want to say that there's a
 6 letter that we wrote - I won't go much into it – which
 7 deals with the reply to this letter, save to just say that
 8 we want to register our serious protest at the idea of
 9 people who are approaching our funders directly without
 10 informing us, but the rest of that has been dealt with in
 11 the letter that I referred to. We would have expected
 12 people to have the courtesy to talk to us about our, you
 13 know, the efforts that we have repeatedly mentioned here.
 14 Just to recap, Chairperson, firstly the reason
 15 that we are here is because, as you know that there were
 16 these intimations or rumours that there was possible
 17 funding either coming from private sources or from the
 18 State – "possibility" I think is the word that was used.
 19 Our position, which did not carry the day, was that we
 20 should have the postponement and if any of that
 21 materialises then we would be the first ones to inform the
 22 Commission. But nevertheless, despite the fact that we are
 23 expressed our scepticism about the possibility even of that
 24 funding materialising within two or three days, as was
 25 intimated, we left here and spent the next 24/48 hours

| | |
|--|--|
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 12219</p> <p>1 concentrating on pursuing the rumours, and to that end we 2 wrote letters to the State Attorney representing the 3 President and the Minister of Justice, and to the Raith 4 Foundation, which is the funder that was rumoured to be 5 ready to assist, and also to Legal Aid South Africa, and 6 the gist of those letters, although differently worded, 7 mutatis mutandis depending on who was the recipient, the 8 gist of those was to say that we've heard that there is 9 this possibility, if it's true can we meet or can you act 10 on it, or tell us what we should do effectively. 11 [cellphone disturbance] Chairperson, since I've 12 provisionally withdrawn – 13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I wouldn't like 14 to be an interpreter having to interpret what you've said 15 for 10 minutes, so perhaps we can stop at this stage, give 16 Mr Mahlangu chance to catch up and when he's ready – 17 MR MPOFU: And Chairperson, thank you, 18 Chairperson. 19 CHAIRPERSON: We have simultaneous 20 translation facilities in place, but I understand the family 21 who's supposed to be in the place where the simultaneous 22 translation was going to happen aren't there, so we will 23 proceed for the moment with consecutive translation, as we 24 have up to now. 25 MR MPOFU: Yes. I was saying,</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 12221</p> <p>1 relation to those groups with the least resources who were 2 witnesses to the events and who were directly affected by 3 them, such as the clients of Maluleke Msimang & 4 Associates." They say, "We feel that should these parties 5 not be able to be involved in the Commission, the 6 Commission and its finding will be the poorer for it." 7 They say, "In the interest of equality and justice for the 8 full truth to emerge, we feel that all concerned parties 9 should be supported so as to ensure legal representation 10 and a robust Commission." Then they say in the next 11 paragraph, "We obviously noted the pending litigation which 12 is intended to be brought before the Constitutional Court, 13 and advise that it is our intention to await the decision 14 of the Constitutional Court on this matter." And finally 15 they say, "In the result we decline to provide further 16 funding at this time." 17 So the – or before I deal with that, I can say 18 some good came out of the, what was otherwise a wild goose 19 chase for this money, namely that the, some outstanding 20 issue or misunderstanding or disagreement which obtained, 21 was resolved by the Raith Foundation in that they agreed 22 with what we had suggested, which until that point there 23 was a bit of a problem. I don't want to get into that. I 24 simply want to say there was some resolution. 25 But apart from that, as I say, Chairperson, it</p> |
| <p style="text-align: right;">Page 12220</p> <p>1 Chairperson, all I was saying was that since I've 2 provisionally withdrawn I'll only buy half a cake for the 3 cell phone. 4 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, well I did think Mr 5 Mahlangu was going to interpret more than just that remark 6 about your cell phone going off. 7 MR MPOFU: Yes, apologies to all. 8 Chairperson, we have then – well, let me put it this way. 9 Of those letters that we wrote, in addition we approached 10 other possible funders outside of the three that I've 11 mentioned, and so I'll deal with the responses. Chair, the 12 Legal Aid Board did not even bother to reply. 13 I think they thought we're out of our minds or 14 something. The State Attorney also probably harboured 15 similar thoughts because they, in their letter they say 16 that, "Our clients are dismayed that such rumours or their 17 source thereof. To this end our clients' position 18 regarding the legal funding has not changed." So we now 19 add dismay to their previous situation that they were not 20 willing to assist; now they are dismayed. 21 Then the Raith Foundation, I'll paraphrase really 22 what – what they say effectively is that they feel that the 23 different levels of financial support available to those 24 affected by and involved in the Marikana crisis is unfair 25 and unjust, and they say, "This is particularly the case in</p> | <p style="text-align: right;">Page 12222</p> <p>1 turned out to be a wild goose chase and those are the 2 responses, and in relation to the other, just for 3 completion, for the sake of completion, in relation to 4 other people that we approached, the attitude that is 5 displayed by the Raith Foundation seems to be the prevalent 6 view, namely that the private sector, or the non- 7 governmental sector, is not prepared to assume what they 8 feel is the primary responsibility of the State, and that 9 in effect they support the move to appeal the judgment in 10 the Constitutional Court and only thereafter will they, 11 obviously depending on the outcome, either – I suppose if 12 we succeed in the Constitutional Court then their position 13 will have been vindicated. If not, then we will obviously 14 then try other means to ensure our participation. 15 On a related matter, Chairperson, our position 16 remains unchanged. We feel that coming in here, in and out 17 of here, is completely uncalled for and we repeat our 18 assurance that if the situation changes – or assuming that 19 the Commission is inclined to grant the postponement and if 20 the situation changes, as we have already said, we will 21 inform yourselves, as we should. Until then, really the 22 only purpose served by us coming in and out of here is just 23 to distract us from the task of concentrating on the 24 Constitutional Court preparations, which we are busy with 25 and which is my next subject of discussion.</p> |

Page 12223

1 Apropos the Con Court application, Chairperson,
 2 we sadly have not yet received a judgment, a written
 3 judgment, some 15 days or so after we finished the
 4 argument. We remain optimistic and hope that maybe today,
 5 or within a short space of time we will receive the
 6 judgment. Our instructions at this stage were to await the
 7 judgment, despite what I said to you last time,
 8 Chairperson, but after this weekend we're back in that
 9 situation where we will probably, I think tomorrow, to be
 10 realistic, because now we thought we'd be here just for
 11 about an hour, but already we're almost here for half of
 12 the day, and so realistically I think we'll be able to
 13 serve the application by tomorrow.
 14 [11:00] Chairperson, maybe I think given the urgency of
 15 the matter, we might effect short service and give the
 16 application to one of the judges who's going to be in the
 17 Constitutional Court.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: I understood his
 19 appointment was as to be a judge, not for some kind of
 20 messenger or courier.
 21 MR MPOFU: As you know, Chair, being a
 22 judge encompasses everything. But yes, on a more serious
 23 note, Chairperson, one of the implications of that will
 24 obviously be, will make it unrealistic for us to do the
 25 set-down that we had mentioned to you, which was the 7th.

Page 12224

1 The notice of application as it currently stands sets it
 2 down for the 12th, which is the following Monday after the
 3 long weekend. But as you know, Chairperson, that is not to
 4 say that we will get that date, but we have put that date
 5 so that hopefully it does not change our target date for
 6 the postponement here. In other words if it's still heard
 7 on the 12th, we obviously have to pray that we get the
 8 judgment by the end of that week, or we'll try and hint
 9 that it should be done in that way, and our return on the
 10 19th would still materialise. But all that is subject to
 11 the chief justice's directions, which of course as soon as
 12 we receive them, we will transmit to the Commission and all
 13 the parties.
 14 I'm sure he won't mind if I mention that I
 15 received a call this morning from my opponent, Mr
 16 Oosthuizen, regarding this issue of fixing times. When the
 17 phone rang I assumed he was going to say he has interim
 18 funding, but it wasn't to be. He just wanted to know what
 19 the set-down date was, and so we continue to engage them.
 20 It will be better if the date is by agreement.
 21 Yes, so Chairperson, it would seem that the
 22 position is that the, assuming that the threatened
 23 opposition will come, that we will await that, but we will
 24 not going to have much to add by way of application to what
 25 we had already said, and then the Chairperson will be at

Page 12225

1 large to do whatever pleases the Commission, namely either
 2 to accede to our request to postpone the matter, or
 3 continue in our absence, which would be regrettable.
 4 You'll have noticed, Chairperson, that our
 5 clients are not here, neither are the representatives of
 6 the deceased families or the families themselves, and AMCU
 7 is not here. Those are the parties that have formally
 8 withdrawn provisionally and so I think it would stand to
 9 reason that should the Commission continue, it should also
 10 continue in their absence, and in that regard, Chairperson,
 11 and finally, I'd just like to reiterate that we hope that
 12 you and the Commissioners will exercise Solomonic wisdom
 13 and ensure that even if we invest two or three weeks by way
 14 of postponement, which is clearly not something that should
 15 be done as a first choice, but that that would preserve the
 16 integrity of the Commission and not drive us to a situation
 17 where maybe irreparable harm is done, so that we have
 18 something to salvage after the Constitutional Court
 19 application. But I've already made those submissions
 20 before.
 21 A matter that needs to be put in its true
 22 perspective as well is unfortunately I have to speak
 23 against my good friend, the spokesperson for the
 24 Commission. There was a report in one of the newspapers on
 25 Friday that the parties – I'm trying to paraphrase it – the

Page 12226

1 parties representing the victims had asked to be given
 2 until Monday so that they can pursue alternatives for
 3 funding. Well, we want to place on record that no, that
 4 statement is incorrect. We didn't even know about this
 5 Monday thing until we received the letter referred to. So
 6 if it can be corrected in the public domain, I think
 7 similarly to the one, Chairperson, where it was said that
 8 the Commission does not need us, which was correct by
 9 yourself, that the Commission does not need anybody, which
 10 I think Mr Ntsebeza had raised and you, Chairperson, had
 11 corrected as not –
 12 CHAIRPERSON: It appears to have been
 13 some kind of misunderstanding. What you say is correct,
 14 yes.
 15 MR MPOFU: Yes. Thank you, Chairperson.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofu. Do
 17 the evidence leaders wish to say anything in response to
 18 anything that Mr Mpofu has said?
 19 MR MADLANGA SC: Mr Chairman, we have
 20 nothing to say, thank you.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Is there anyone else
 22 representing any of the parties still here who wish to say
 23 anything?
 24 SPEAKER: Thank you, Chair. For the
 25 South African Human Rights Commission, we've prepared a

Page 12227

1 short statement which I'd like to read.
 2 "Last Monday the South African Human Rights
 3 Commission indicated that it would abide by the decision of
 4 this Commission in respect of the adjournment application
 5 made on that day. That position was influenced by our
 6 support for the stand-down and by our strong desire to give
 7 the parties another chance to negotiate a settlement to the
 8 funding dispute. Given the failure of those efforts to
 9 date, and after consideration, the South African Human
 10 Rights Commission must now support the application for an
 11 adjournment. This Commission must be inclusive and must
 12 allow all voices to be heard, especially those who were
 13 most affected by the tragic events at Marikana. Although
 14 the SAHRC is concerned at the impact of an adjournment in
 15 light of the current October deadline for completing the
 16 Commission's work, we would call for an extension of that
 17 deadline in the public interest should an adjournment be
 18 granted. In the event that the Commission does not grant
 19 the adjournment and the proceedings continue in the absence
 20 of the injured and arrested persons, in the absence of the
 21 families, and in the absence of AMCU and the Bapo Ba Mogale
 22 Community, then the SAHRC will reconsider its position. We
 23 do not intend to withdraw from proceedings, but our
 24 continued participation will be informed by the
 25 Commission's willingness and ability to take into account

Page 12228

1 the interests of those who are no longer able to be here.
 2 The SAHRC calls on the Commission to hold a meeting with
 3 all parties to discuss the way forward." Thank you.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Ms [inaudible] -
 5 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, just one small
 6 thing that I forgot to mention regarding our intention to
 7 file papers tomorrow. One of the reasons, as I've already
 8 said, is obviously the optimism that we'll get a judgment
 9 today, but the other is certainty as to what's going to
 10 happen this morning, so that we can then inform, properly
 11 inform the Constitutional Court in the papers as to whether
 12 there's an adjournment or not, because that's a factor that
 13 will obviously influence the urgency with which the matter
 14 is to be heard. Thank you.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Does any other party wish
 16 to say anything? No? Mr Ramphile?
 17 MR RAMPHILE: Thank you, Judge. We
 18 represent the families of Mabebe and Mabelane and we have
 19 not been regular at the Commission precisely because of the
 20 issue of funding. We have conferred with Adv Mpofo and we
 21 wholeheartedly support this application and believe that if
 22 the Commission is going to consider this application for
 23 postponement, it will be in the benefit of our clients and
 24 it will also assist that even just these two families are
 25 able to present their cases to the Commission in the best

Page 12229

1 manner possible.
 2 We've also made two applications for funding,
 3 both to the Legal Aid and to Amnesty International. We are
 4 busy with Amnesty International and it could be that we
 5 may, even if not everything, but maybe in part be assisted
 6 in this application. We'll also be following with Adv
 7 Mpofo to see how best we can be accommodated in that
 8 application. So we support the application for
 9 postponement. Thank you, Judge.
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Is there anyone else who
 11 wishes to say anything? Mr Bizos?
 12 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman, very briefly,
 13 you will recall that we submitted a letter on the Legal
 14 Resources Centre attitude. We do not want to add anything
 15 to that letter and we stand by it.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Is there any other party
 17 who wishes to say anything? Yes, we've considered what has
 18 been said to us. We've come to the conclusion, for a
 19 reason which I will give in a moment, that we should make
 20 one more effort to see to it whether funding can be made
 21 available, and I will explain why I say that in a moment.
 22 As has been said last week, we're informed that there was a
 23 possibility that interim funding for the arrested parties
 24 might be made available by a charitable foundation. The
 25 proceedings were adjourned firstly to Thursday, and

Page 12230

1 thereafter till today to await the decision of the
 2 foundation because if it were favourable, the postponement
 3 application would fall away. We have since learned – and
 4 Mr Mpofo has confirmed this, this morning – that the
 5 foundation concerned decided not to provide the interim
 6 funding sought. I have, however, been reliably informed
 7 that another body may well decide to provide the funding
 8 sought, and its decision should be made known by the end of
 9 tomorrow. I am not at liberty to say more than that.
 10 Though it is regrettable that another two days' sitting
 11 time will be lost in addition to the days which we've lost
 12 already, it is desirable, as counsel for the Human Rights
 13 Commission for example amongst others pointed out, that
 14 every effort should be made to ensure a process which is as
 15 inclusive as possible.
 16 In the circumstances the proceedings will be
 17 adjourned until Wednesday when, if the funding has not been
 18 made available, the Commission will have to address the
 19 question of whether the proceedings should be postponed.
 20 [11:20] So we adjourn until Wednesday at 9AM –
 21 MR MPOFU: Sorry, Chair –
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Mpofo?
 23 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, yes, I just
 24 also thought for the sake of good order that we should
 25 mention that this toing and froing really has affected our

1 preparation, so if, unless something materialises, that we
2 should be excused from being here on Wednesday. One of the
3 unintended consequences of the good intentioned efforts is
4 that because our team is already so thin on the ground, it
5 is not possible for us to be concentrating on the matter
6 that we should be concentrating on, and also preparing for
7 the Commission, and that in any event is a factor that we
8 hope will be taken into account, whatever the outcome of
9 those efforts are, because we do have to start doing heads
10 of argument within a very short space of time. So I'm just
11 saying, if we're not here on Wednesday, that will be the
12 context.

13 CHAIRPERSON: It might be advisable for
14 you to be here if the postponement matter is argued. On
15 the other hand, you have put your submissions before us –

16 MR MPOFU: We have; we have nothing to
17 add to the postponement application.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Well, you might wish to
19 reply to points that are made, if points are made of
20 substance which it is desirable that they should be replied
21 to, but it's your election, not mine.

22 MR MPOFU: Certainly.

23 CHAIRPERSON: We will adjourn now until
24 Wednesday at 9AM.

25 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]



| | | | | |
|--|--|---|---|--|
| <p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>abide 12227:3 ability 12227:25 able 12221:5 12223:12 12228:1,25 absence 12217:19 12225:3,10 12227:19 12227:20,21 accede 12225:2 accommodated 12229:7 account 12227:25 12231:8 accurate 12215:15 act 12219:9 add 12220:19 12224:24 12229:14 12231:17 addition 12220:9 12230:11 address 12230:18 addressing 12217:6 adjourn 12230:20 12231:23 adjourned 12229:25 12230:17 12231:25 adjournment 12217:17 12227:4,11,14,17,19 12228:12 Adv 12228:20 12229:6 advisable 12231:13 advise 12221:13 advised 12216:3 12217:4 Africa 12219:5 African 12226:25 12227:2,9 agreed 12221:21 agreement 12224:20 Aid 12219:5 12220:12 12229:3 allow 12227:12 Alright 12216:1 alternatives 12226:2 AMCU 12225:6 12227:21 Amnesty 12229:3,4 anybody 12226:9 apart 12221:25 apologies 12220:7 appeal 12222:9 appears 12226:12 application 12215:21 12216:4 12217:5,12 12217:16 12223:1,13 12223:16 12224:1,24 12225:19 12227:4,10 12228:21,22 12229:6 12229:8,8 12230:3 12231:17 applications 12217:12 12229:2 appointment 12223:19 approached 12220:9 12222:4 approaching 12218:9</p> | <p>appropriate 12218:2 Apropos 12223:1 aren't 12219:22 argued 12231:14 argument 12223:4 12231:10 arrested 12227:20 12229:23 asked 12216:20 12226:1 aspect 12217:13 assist 12219:5 12220:20 12228:24 assisted 12229:5 Associates 12221:4 assume 12216:3 12217:5 12222:7 assumed 12224:17 assuming 12222:18 12224:22 assurance 12222:18 attitude 12222:4 12229:14 Attorney 12219:2 12220:14 audience 12216:15 auditorium 12216:13 12216:14,16,25 available 12216:15 12220:23 12229:21 12229:24 12230:18 await 12221:13 12223:6 12224:23 12230:1 aware 12216:8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>Ba 12227:21 back 12215:6 12223:8 Bapo 12227:21 basis 12217:10,15 believe 12216:9 12228:21 benefit 12216:24 12228:23 best 12228:25 12229:7 better 12224:20 bit 12221:23 Bizos 12229:11,12 Board 12220:12 body 12230:7 bother 12220:12 briefly 12229:12 brought 12221:12 busy 12222:24 12229:4 buy 12220:2</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <p>cake 12220:2 call 12224:15 12227:16 calls 12228:2 carry 12216:7 12218:19 case 12220:25 cases 12228:25 catch 12219:16</p> | <p>caused 12215:5 cell 12220:3,6 cellphone 12219:11 Centre 12229:14 Certainly 12231:22 certainty 12228:9 Chair 12220:11 12223:21 12226:24 12230:21 Chairman 12226:19 12229:12 Chairperson 12215:2,7 12215:8,11,14,17,18 12215:22,24 12216:6 12216:11,12,18 12217:2,7,9,21 12218:3,14 12219:11 12219:13,17,18,19 12220:1,4,8 12221:25 12222:15 12223:1,8 12223:14,18,23 12224:3,21,25 12225:4,10 12226:7 12226:10,12,15,16,21 12228:4,5,15 12229:10,16 12230:22,23 12231:13,18,23 chambers 12215:5 chance 12219:16 12227:7 change 12224:5 changed 12220:18 changes 12222:18,20 charitable 12229:24 chase 12221:19 12222:1 chief 12224:11 choice 12225:15 circumstances 12230:16 clearly 12225:14 clients 12220:16,17 12221:3 12225:5 12228:23 come 12215:13 12224:23 12229:18 coming 12216:9 12218:17 12222:16 12222:22 Commission 12215:2 12218:22 12221:5,6 12221:10 12222:19 12224:12 12225:1,9 12225:16,24 12226:8 12226:9,25 12227:3,4 12227:10,11,18 12228:2,19,22,25 12230:13,18 12231:7 12231:25 Commissioners 12225:12 Commission's 12227:16,25 Community 12227:22 completely 12222:17</p> | <p>completing 12227:15 completion 12222:3,3 Con 12223:1 concentrating 12219:1 12222:23 12231:5,6 concerned 12221:8 12227:14 12230:5 conclusion 12229:18 conferred 12228:20 confirmed 12230:4 consecutive 12219:23 consequences 12231:3 consider 12217:15,16 12218:2 12228:22 consideration 12227:9 considered 12229:17 Constitutional 12221:12,14 12222:10,12,24 12223:17 12225:18 12228:11 context 12231:12 continue 12224:19 12225:3,9,10 12227:19 continued 12227:24 correct 12226:8,13 corrected 12226:6,11 counsel 12230:12 courier 12223:20 course 12215:18 12224:11 Court 12221:12,14 12222:10,12,24 12223:1,17 12225:18 12228:11 courtesy 12218:12 crisis 12220:24 current 12227:15 currently 12224:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">D</p> <p>date 12224:4,4,5,19,20 12227:9 day 12218:19 12223:12 12227:5 days 12217:17 12218:24 12223:3 12230:10,11 deadline 12227:15,17 deal 12215:5 12217:18 12217:24 12220:11 12221:17 deals 12218:7 dealt 12217:19 12218:10 debate 12215:15 deceased 12225:6 decide 12230:7 decided 12230:5 decision 12221:13 12227:3 12230:1,8 decline 12221:15 definite 12217:11 delay 12215:5 dependent 12216:25</p> | <p>depending 12219:7 12222:11 desirable 12216:16 12230:12 12231:20 desire 12227:6 despite 12218:22 12223:7 didn't 12216:19 12226:4 different 12220:23 differently 12219:6 directions 12224:11 directly 12218:9 12221:2 disagreement 12221:20 discuss 12228:3 discussed 12215:9 discussion 12222:25 dismay 12220:19 dismayed 12220:16,20 displayed 12222:5 dispute 12227:8 distract 12222:23 disturbance 12219:11 doing 12231:9 domain 12226:6 don't 12216:4 12217:23 12218:1,4 12221:23 drive 12225:16</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <p>effect 12222:9 12223:15 effectively 12219:10 12220:22 effort 12229:20 12230:14 efforts 12218:13 12227:8 12231:3,9 either 12218:17 12222:11 12225:1 election 12231:21 emerge 12221:8 encompasses 12223:22 engage 12224:19 ensure 12221:9 12222:14 12225:13 12230:14 entitled 12216:13 equality 12221:7 especially 12227:12 event 12227:18 12231:7 events 12221:2 12227:13 evidence 12226:17 example 12230:13 excused 12231:2 exercise 12225:12 expected 12218:11 explain 12229:21 explained 12217:22,22 expressed 12218:23 extension 12227:16</p> |
|--|--|---|---|--|

| | | | | |
|---|--|--|---|---|
| <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <p>face 12219:20 facilities 12219:20 fact 12216:8 12218:22 factor 12228:12 12231:7 failure 12227:8 fall 12230:3 families 12225:6,6 12227:21 12228:18 12228:24 family 12219:20 favour 12217:7 favourable 12230:2 feel 12220:22 12221:4,8 12222:8,16 file 12228:7 final 12217:14 finally 12221:14 12225:11 financial 12220:23 finding 12221:6 finished 12223:3 first 12218:21 12225:15 firstly 12218:14 12229:25 fixing 12224:16 following 12224:2 12229:6 forgot 12228:6 formally 12225:7 forward 12228:3 foundation 12219:4 12220:21 12221:21 12222:5 12229:24 12230:2,5 Friday 12216:2 12225:25 friend 12225:23 froing 12230:25 full 12221:8 fully 12217:22 funder 12219:4 funders 12218:9 12220:10 funding 12217:12 12218:17,24 12220:18 12221:16 12224:18 12226:3 12227:8 12228:20 12229:2,20,23 12230:6,7,17 further 12217:17,24,25 12221:15</p> | <p>12216:19 12217:15 12219:22 12220:5,6 12223:16 12224:17 12224:24 12228:9,22 good 12221:18 12225:23 12230:24 12231:3 goose 12221:18 12222:1 governmental 12222:7 grant 12222:19 12227:18 granted 12227:18 ground 12231:4 groups 12221:1</p> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <p>half 12220:2 12223:11 hand 12231:15 happen 12219:22 12228:10 happened 12216:21 harboured 12220:14 harm 12225:17 heads 12231:9 heard 12219:8 12224:6 12227:12 12228:14 he's 12216:9 12219:16 hint 12224:8 hold 12228:2 hope 12223:4 12225:11 12231:8 hopefully 12224:5 hour 12223:11 hours 12218:25 Human 12226:25 12227:2,9 12230:12</p> | <p>interest 12221:7 12227:17 interests 12228:1 interim 12224:17 12229:23 12230:5 International 12229:3 12229:4 interpret 12216:24 12219:14 12220:5 interpretation 12216:13 12217:1 interpreter 12216:8 12219:14 intimated 12218:25 intimations 12218:16 invest 12225:13 invited 12217:7 involved 12220:24 12221:5 irreparable 12225:17 issue 12221:20 12224:16 12228:20 it's 12216:16 12219:9 12224:6 12231:21 I'd 12225:11 12227:1 I'll 12220:2,11,21 I'm 12215:3,11 12224:14 12225:25 12231:10 I've 12219:11 12220:1 12220:10 12225:19 12228:7</p> | <p>12217:14 12218:6,7 12218:11 12220:15 12226:5 12229:13,15 letters 12219:2,6 12220:9 let's 12215:15 levels 12220:23 liberty 12230:9 light 12227:15 litigation 12221:11 long 12224:3 longer 12228:1 lost 12230:11,11</p> | <p>12219:13,17,25 12220:7 12223:21 12226:15,16,18 12228:5,20 12229:7 12230:4,21,22,23 12231:16,22 Msimang 12221:3 muddy 12218:4 mutandis 12219:7 mutatis 12219:7</p> |
| <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <p>gist 12219:6,8 give 12216:20,20 12219:15 12223:15 12227:6 12229:19 given 12223:14 12226:1 12227:8 go 12218:6 going 12215:20</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <p>idea 12218:8 impact 12227:14 implications 12223:23 inaudible 12228:4 inclined 12222:19 inclusive 12227:11 12230:15 incorrect 12226:4 indicated 12227:3 influence 12228:13 influenced 12227:5 inform 12218:21 12222:21 12228:10 12228:11 information 12217:11 informed 12227:24 12229:22 12230:6 informing 12218:10 injured 12227:20 instructions 12223:6 integrity 12225:16 intend 12227:23 intended 12215:3 12221:12 intention 12221:13 12228:6 intentioned 12231:3</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>ja 12216:1,17 judge 12223:19,22 12228:17 12229:9 judges 12223:16 judgment 12222:9 12223:2,3,6,7 12224:8 12228:8 JULY 12215:1 justice 12219:3 12221:7 justice's 12224:11</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">M</p> <p>Mabebe 12228:18 Mabelane 12228:18 MADLANGA 12226:19 Mahlangu 12216:18,20 12219:16 12220:5 making 12216:23 Maluleke 12221:3 manner 12229:1 Marikana 12220:24 12227:13 materialise 12224:10 materialises 12218:21 12231:1 materialising 12218:24 matter 12217:13,25 12221:14 12222:15 12223:15 12225:2,21 12228:13 12231:5,14 matters 12215:4,9 means 12215:22 12216:2,5 12222:14 meet 12219:9 meeting 12228:2 mention 12224:14 12228:6 12230:25 mentioned 12218:13 12220:11 12223:25 messenger 12223:20 mind 12224:14 minds 12220:13 mine 12231:21 Minister 12219:3 minutes 12219:15 misunderstanding 12221:20 12226:13 Mogale 12227:21 moment 12217:13,22 12217:23 12219:23 12229:19,21 Monday 12224:2 12226:2,5 12227:2 money 12221:19 morning 12215:4,6 12217:16 12224:15 12228:10 12230:4 move 12222:9 Mpofu 12215:5,7,11,16 12215:23 12216:1,6 12216:10,17,20 12217:2,20 12218:3</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">N</p> <p>necessary 12218:5 need 12216:10 12217:24 12226:8,9 needs 12225:21 negotiate 12227:7 neither 12225:5 nevertheless 12218:22 newspapers 12225:24 non 12222:6 note 12223:23 noted 12221:11 notice 12224:1 noticed 12225:4 Ntsebeza 12226:10 number 12215:4</p> |
| | | <p style="text-align: center;">L</p> <p>large 12225:1 leaders 12226:17 learned 12230:3 leave 12215:16 left 12218:25 legal 12219:5 12220:12 12220:18 12221:9 12229:3,13 letter 12215:13 12216:2 12217:3,10</p> | <p style="text-align: center;">P</p> <p>papers 12228:7,11 paragraph 12221:11 paraphrase 12220:21 12225:25 part 12229:5 participation 12222:14 12227:24 particularly 12220:25 parties 12221:4,8 12224:13 12225:7,25 12226:1,22 12227:7 12228:3 12229:23 party 12228:15 12229:16 pending 12221:11</p> | |

| | | | | |
|---|---|--|---|---|
| <p>people 12216:12,16,25 12218:9,12 12222:4 persons 12227:20 perspective 12225:22 phone 12220:3,6 12224:17 place 12219:21 12226:3 please 12215:24 pleases 12225:1 point 12221:22 pointed 12230:13 points 12231:19,19 politely 12215:17 poorer 12221:6 position 12217:23 12218:19 12220:17 12222:12,15 12224:22 12227:5,22 possibility 12217:17 12218:18,23 12219:9 12229:23 possible 12218:16 12220:10 12229:1 12230:15 12231:5 postpone 12225:2 postponed 12230:19 postponement 12215:21 12217:16 12218:20 12222:19 12224:6 12225:14 12228:23 12229:9 12230:2 12231:14,17 pray 12224:7 precisely 12228:19 preparation 12231:1 preparations 12222:24 prepared 12222:7 12226:25 preparing 12231:6 present 12217:8 12228:25 preserve 12225:15 President 12219:3 prevalent 12222:5 previous 12220:19 primary 12222:8 private 12218:17 12222:6 probably 12220:14 12223:9 problem 12221:23 proceed 12215:24 12219:23 proceedings 12215:1 12216:22 12227:19 12227:23 12229:25 12230:16,19 process 12230:14 progress 12215:19 properly 12228:10 protest 12218:8 provide 12221:15 12230:5,7 provisionally 12219:12 12220:2 12225:8 public 12226:6</p> | <p>12227:17 purpose 12222:22 pursue 12226:2 pursuing 12219:1 put 12220:8 12224:4 12225:21 12231:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Q</p> <hr/> <p>quarter 12215:20 question 12230:19 quite 12215:22</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <hr/> <p>raised 12226:10 raising 12215:18 Raith 12219:3 12220:21 12221:21 12222:5 Ramphile 12228:16,17 rang 12224:17 read 12217:3 12227:1 ready 12219:5,16 realise 12216:19 realistic 12223:10 realistically 12223:12 really 12220:21 12222:21 12230:25 reason 12215:18 12218:14 12225:9 12229:19 reasons 12215:12 12228:7 recall 12229:13 recap 12218:14 receive 12223:5 12224:12 received 12216:2 12217:3 12223:2 12224:15 12226:5 recipient 12219:7 reconsider 12227:22 record 12226:3 referred 12218:11 12226:5 regard 12215:9 12225:10 regarding 12220:18 12224:16 12228:6 register 12218:8 regrettable 12225:3 12230:10 regular 12228:19 reiterate 12225:11 related 12222:15 relation 12221:1 12222:2,3 relevant 12216:21 reliably 12230:6 remain 12223:4 remains 12222:16 remark 12220:5 remarks 12216:23 repeat 12216:23 12222:17 repeatedly 12218:13 replied 12231:20</p> | <p>reply 12217:8 12218:7 12220:12 12231:19 report 12215:9,19 12216:21 12225:24 represent 12228:18 representation 12221:9 representatives 12225:5 representing 12219:2 12226:1,22 request 12225:2 requested 12215:14 resolution 12221:24 resolved 12221:21 resources 12221:1 12229:14 respect 12227:4 response 12226:17 responses 12220:11 12222:2 responsibility 12222:8 rest 12218:10 result 12221:15 resumes 12215:2 return 12224:9 Rights 12226:25 12227:2,10 12230:12 robust 12221:10 rumoured 12219:4 rumours 12218:16 12219:1 12220:16</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <hr/> <p>sadly 12223:2 SAHRC 12227:14,22 12228:2 sake 12222:3 12230:24 salvage 12225:18 save 12218:7 saying 12218:1 12219:25 12220:1 12231:11 says 12215:23 12217:4 12217:7 SC 12226:19 12229:12 scepticism 12218:23 second 12215:17 sector 12222:6,7 see 12215:6 12229:7,20 sentence 12217:6 serious 12218:8 12223:22 serve 12223:13 served 12222:22 service 12223:15 sets 12224:1 settlement 12227:7 set-down 12223:25 12224:19 short 12223:5,15 12227:1 12231:10 similar 12220:15 similarly 12226:7 simply 12221:24 simultaneous 12219:19 12219:21</p> | <p>sitting 12230:10 situation 12220:19 12222:18,20 12223:9 12225:16 small 12228:5 Solomonic 12225:12 soon 12224:11 sorry 12215:3 12216:6 12230:21 sought 12230:6,8 source 12220:17 sources 12218:17 South 12219:5 12226:25 12227:2,9 space 12223:5 12231:10 speak 12225:22 SPEAKER 12226:24 specifically 12216:3 12217:4 spent 12218:25 spokesperson 12225:23 stage 12217:11 12219:15 12223:6 stand 12225:8 12229:15 stands 12224:1 stand-down 12227:6 start 12216:19 12231:9 started 12216:22 starting 12215:3 State 12218:18 12219:2 12220:14 12222:8 statement 12226:4 12227:1 stop 12218:1 12219:15 strong 12227:6 subject 12222:25 12224:10 submissions 12217:8 12225:19 12231:15 submitted 12229:13 substance 12231:20 succeed 12222:12 suggested 12221:22 summoned 12215:12 support 12220:23 12222:9 12227:6,10 12228:21 12229:8 supported 12221:9 suppose 12222:11 supposed 12219:21 sure 12224:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <hr/> <p>take 12227:25 taken 12231:8 talk 12218:12 target 12224:5 task 12222:23 team 12231:4 tell 12219:10 telling 12217:13 thank 12217:2 12219:17 12226:15 12226:16,20,24</p> | <p>12228:3,4,14,17 12229:9 that's 12216:21 12217:5,21,23 12228:12 thereof 12220:17 there's 12215:20 12216:10 12217:24 12218:5 12228:12 thin 12231:4 thing 12226:5 12228:6 think 12215:14 12216:7,12,16,19 12217:3,23 12218:18 12220:4,13 12223:9 12223:12,14 12225:8 12226:6,10 thought 12220:13 12223:10 12230:24 thoughts 12220:15 threatened 12224:22 three 12218:24 12220:10 12225:13 Thursday 12229:25 till 12230:1 time 12221:16 12223:5 12223:7 12230:11 12231:10 times 12224:16 today 12223:4 12228:9 12230:1 toing 12230:25 told 12215:19 tomorrow 12223:9,13 12228:7 12230:9 tragic 12227:13 translation 12219:20 12219:22,23 transmit 12224:12 true 12219:9 12225:21 truth 12221:8 try 12222:14 12224:8 trying 12225:25 turned 12222:1 two 12215:12 12218:24 12225:13 12228:24 12229:2 12230:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">U</p> <hr/> <p>uncalled 12222:17 unchanged 12222:16 understand 12217:21 12218:4 12219:20 understanding 12217:9 understood 12223:18 unfair 12220:24 unfortunately 12225:22 unintended 12231:3 unjust 12220:25 unknown 12215:20 unopposed 12216:4 12217:5 unrealistic 12223:24 urgency 12223:14 12228:13</p> |
|---|---|--|---|---|

| | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|
| <p style="text-align: center;">V</p> <p>victims 12226:1 view 12222:6 vindicated 12222:13 voices 12227:12</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">W</p> <p>wait 12216:7 want 12217:25 12218:1 12218:4,5,8 12221:23 12221:24 12226:3 12229:14 wanted 12217:3 12224:18 warning 12217:14 wasn't 12216:8,9 12224:18 waters 12218:4 way 12220:8 12224:9 12224:24 12225:13 12228:3 Wednesday 12230:17 12230:20 12231:2,11 12231:24 week 12224:8 12229:22 weekend 12223:8 12224:3 weeks 12225:13 we'd 12223:10 we'll 12223:12 12224:8 12228:8 12229:6 we're 12215:3 12220:13 12223:8,11 12229:22 12231:11 we've 12215:19 12219:8 12226:25 12229:2,17,18 12230:11 what's 12216:14 12228:9 wholeheartedly 12228:21 who's 12219:21 12223:16 wider 12216:15 wild 12221:18 12222:1 willing 12220:20 willingness 12227:25 wisdom 12225:12 wish 12226:17,22 12228:15 12231:18 wishes 12229:11,17 withdraw 12227:23 withdrawn 12219:12 12220:2 12225:8 witnesses 12221:2 won't 12218:6 12224:14 word 12215:15 12218:18 worded 12219:6 words 12224:6 work 12227:16 wouldn't 12219:13 written 12217:10,14</p> | <p>12223:2 wrote 12218:6 12219:2 12220:9</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p>Xhosa 12216:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <p>You'll 12225:4 you're 12215:6 you've 12219:14</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>10 12219:15 10:40 12215:2 11:00 12223:14 11:20 12230:20 12th 12224:2,7 15 12223:3 19th 12224:10</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>2013 12215:1 24/48 12218:25 29 12215:1</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">7</p> <p>7th 12223:25</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9AM 12230:20 12231:24</p> | | | |
|---|---|--|--|--|