RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 114 22 JULY 2013 PAGES 12158 TO 12205



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



CHAIRPERSON:

24

25

Page 12160

Major-General, as you have

Page 12158 [PROCEEDINGS ON 22 JULY 2013] 2 [10:31] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. We 3 were due to commence at 9:30, but we were asked to wait 4 until half past 10 to enable people who are on the way here 5 and whose bus broke down, to be here. That's one of the reasons why we're starting late. Mr Mpofu, I understand 6 7 you propose bringing an application. Would you tell us 8 briefly what the nature of the application is, and I will 9 then ask some of the other parties present to give us their 10 reaction to it before we see whether it's necessary for you 11 to proceed at this stage with your argument. 12 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much, 13 Chairperson. Chairperson, and thank you for the indulgence of giving us a few minutes. I just, I thought I should 14 15 start with addressing that issue. As you and I once agreed, Chairperson, sometimes when people are uneducated, 16 we don't realise their wisdom. What happened is the last 17 18 time when we were in court, we suggested that we should 19 come here and we were instructed to come here and we 20 thought it would not be necessary for the clients 21 themselves to be here since we are just doing an 22 application, but they were very adamant that they wanted to 23 be here. So it's unfortunate that the bus broke down, and

they stated their reason, they said if you were not there

it will look like this is your call, as the lawyers; we

heard, there's going to be an application argued, possibly argued, and the viewpoints of the various parties are going to be heard in relation to questions arising from the 5 withdrawal of the parties. So it won't be necessary for 6 you to give evidence this morning. So you're welcome to 7 sit there, if you wish, but if you wish to be excused, you 8 may be. Yes, Mr Mpofu. 9 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much, 10 Chairperson. Having said that, Chairperson, before I move 11 the application, I also thought that I should give the 12 Commission a brief report back since the last time that we 13 were here, which is also relevant to the issue of the 14 postponement. Chairperson, indeed we reported to the Commission the judgment was delivered on Thursday afternoon and effectively the judgment dealt, or at least purported to deal with part A of the application, which part, the most important order of which was dismissed, which was the 19 order for interim relief that we have alluded to last week. 20 We then indicated, because we already had 21 instructions at that stage that the intention was to appeal 22 the judgment directly to the Constitutional Court. 23 Unfortunately the judge was not at that stage prepared to 24 hand down the judgment, the written judgment. He indicated that he still wanted to edit a few parts of the judgment,

1 want to be there so that it's clear that it's ours, and we 2 took instructions from them that time. 3 CHAIRPERSON: We're pleased that they are here. I think we'll allow Mr Mahlangu to interpret what 4 5 you've said so far for their benefit before we proceed. MR MPOFU: 6 No, Chairperson, then those 7 particular ones are still not here, but we've decided in 8 the interest of time to start. The people who are here are 9 the widows mainly, and other victims, but the group -10 CHAIRPERSON: I see. MR MPOFU: 11 - the other representatives, 12 ja. 13 CHAIRPERSON: Do we have any information as to when the persons to whom you referred are likely to 14 15 be here? 16 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, they were, 17 typically they said they're not far and so they've been saying that, that's why we thought we should start at half 18 19 past – we told them that if they're not here by half past 10, we would start. So hopefully they might join us in the 20 21 course of the proceedings. CHAIRPERSON: 22 Thank you. MR MPOFU: So I was just expressing, save 23

for the bus, that they really wanted to be here, if the bus

had not broken.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12161 and we tried to put some subtle pressure on the basis that we would have to attach the judgment on the application. The best we could get was that he would do it on Tuesday, or as soon as possible, which I suppose also means on 5 Tuesday. So if that happens then, Chairperson, by tomorrow we will have a written judgment, but we have not, we're not 7 waiting for that literally. We have started drafting the papers on the basis that we'll simply attach the judgment, and we're drafting the papers on the basis of the notes 10 that we all took in court, given that that's the best we 11 have. So that's the -12 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to interrupt you, Mr Mpofu. I just received a message from Ms Schubert that 14 Herman wants to speak to me. So I'm going to adjourn now 15 for 10 minutes. 16 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. 17 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS **COMMISSION RESUMES**] 18 [10:43] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. I'm sorry about that interruption, but please proceed, Mr 19 20 Mpofu. 21 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much, Chairperson. As it happened, Chairperson, I had finished 23 with the preliminaries, so I'll now move into the 24 application proper. 25 CHAIRPERSON: Tell us briefly what the

CHAIRPERSON:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25 thank you. So I propose calling upon the parties, the

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

I understand that. Okay,

24

25

```
Page 12162
                                                                                                                          Page 12164
    nature of the application is. You've told me privately,
                                                                        others parties represented, for their comments at this
    but I think it's important that you should tell us here in
                                                                        stage. Does someone wish - Mr Semenya, do you wish to tell
2
3
    the auditorium, and then I will ask the representatives of
                                                                        us what the attitude of your client, the SAPS is to the
4
    the various parties if they have comments to make, and in
                                                                    4
                                                                        application?
5
    the light of the comments we will either proceed or do what
                                                                    5
                                                                              MR SEMENYA SC:
                                                                                                      Chairperson, we will
    they suggest. Let's see how it turns out.
                                                                    6
                                                                        abide the ruling that you make in this regard.
6
7
                                                                    7
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
            MR MPOFU:
                               Thank you. Chairperson, the
                                                                                                    Thank you. Lonmin?
                                                                    8
                                                                                                Thanks, Chair. We too will
8
    application we'll make is an application for a postponement
                                                                              MR SHOZI:
                                                                    9
9
    of the proceedings of the Commission. It is pending the
                                                                        abide the decision that you will make. Thank you.
    hearing of the Constitutional Court appeal that we intend
                                                                   10
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                    Thank you. Mr Ntsebeza on
10
                                                                   11
    to lodge, given the background that I explained earlier,
                                                                        behalf of the families?
11
    which will be lodged in the course of this week.
                                                                   12
                                                                              MR NTSEBEZA SC:
12
                                                                                                       Thank you, Mr Chairman.
13
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  When do you anticipate will
                                                                   13
                                                                        Mr Chairman, we have instructions not only to abide, but to
14
    the Constitutional Court be in a position firstly to hear
                                                                   14
                                                                        support the application because we are instructed to be
    your application, and secondly to give judgment thereon?
                                                                        appellants in the appeal to the Constitutional Court. You
15
16
                                                                        may or may not know that we were merely respondents in the
            MR MPOFU:
                               Yes, Chairperson, based on
                                                                        court a quo. We took instructions. We indicated to those
17
    previous experience, but also on some informal enquiries
18
    that we have made, we reasonably anticipate the hearing to
                                                                        who were affected by the nature of the judgment, and we got
19
    be in the week starting on the 5th to the 8th. It should be
                                                                   19
                                                                        a very clear and firm instruction that we must now be
20
    the 5th to the 9th, but the 9th is a public holiday. It's
                                                                   20
                                                                        involved in the appeal, as well as to move the application
21
                                                                   21
                                                                        as co-applicants in this forum for the postponement.
    that week, round about the 7th, to be more specific,
                                                                   22
                                                                              CHAIRPERSON:
22
    Chairperson.
                                                                                                    Thank you, Mr Ntsebeza.
23
                                                                   23
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Of August, I take it.
                                                                        Adv Barnes, you appear for AMCU.
                                                                   24
24
            MR MPOFU:
                               Of August, yes, that's right.
                                                                              MS BARNES:
                                                                                                 Yes, thank you, Chair. We
25
    Of August 2013, and once again, Chairperson, we anticipate
                                                                        also support the application for the postponement and will
                                                       Page 12163
                                                                                                                          Page 12165
    that because it's quite a substantial matter and a complex
                                                                    1
                                                                        also be participating actively, supporting actively the
1
                                                                    2
                                                                        appeal to the Constitutional Court. We will be submitting
2
    matter, we anticipate that the judgment would then be the
3
    following week, starting on the 12th sometime, thereabouts,
                                                                    3
                                                                        affidavits and making submissions in that appeal.
4
    especially given the long weekend.
                                                                    4
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      Thank you. Mr Tip for NUM?
                                                                    5
5
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  So effectively what you are
                                                                               MR TIP SC:
                                                                                                 Thank, you, Mr Chairperson.
    proposing is that we should postpone the sitting of the
                                                                    6
                                                                        We will abide the decision.
6
7
    Commission until after the judgment, which you anticipate
                                                                    7
                                                                               CHAIRPERSON:
                                                                                                      Thank you. Mr Bizos for
8
    will be given then?
                                                                    8
                                                                        the Legal Resources Centre.
9
                                                                    9
                                                                               MR BIZOS SC:
            MR MPOFU:
                               In that week, and therefore we
                                                                                                    Mr Chairman, I want to
    ask for the 19th.
10
                                                                   10
                                                                        place on record that we are on the side of the people who
11
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  The 19th.
                                                                   11
                                                                        lost their loved ones and the persons who have been
12
            MR MPOFU:
                              Postpone it to the 19th, yes.
                                                                   12
                                                                        injured. I think that our conduct before this Commission
                                                                        must be clear to everyone as to which side we are on. We
13
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  I see. So we would
                                                                   13
    effectively, if your application is granted, not sit for
                                                                   14
                                                                        are on their side. We also in relation to the litigation
14
15
     something over three weeks.
                                                                   15
                                                                        brought by the applicants, we participated in it, filed
            MR MPOFU:
16
                              About three weeks, that's
                                                                   16
                                                                        papers, and two of the counsel that argued strenuously
17
    correct, Chairperson.
                                                                   17
                                                                        before the provincial judge that they are entitled to legal
18
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  So we would lose that time.
                                                                   18
                                                                        representation and to funding. We submit with the greatest
19
            MR MPOFU:
                              We'd lose three weeks - well,
                                                                   19
                                                                        respect that the learned judge was wrong and we intend
    obviously we won't lose the other days where we would not
                                                                        applying to be joined as amicus in support of the
21
     be sitting -
                                                                        application if the Constitutional Court grants leave. We
22
            CHAIRPERSON:
                                  Yes, yes, I understand.
                                                                   22
                                                                        will be on the side of the victims, if the Constitutional
                              - and the public holiday, ja.
           MR MPOFU:
23
                                                                   23
                                                                        Court wants us to repeat the submissions that we made
```

This matter is of great importance to the Legal

before the provincial division.

17

18

19

20

21

22

4

10

11

Page 12168

Page 12166 Resources Centre and also to our board of trustees, persons 2 not strangers to the legal process, and we don't have to 3 identify them. We had a meeting on Saturday afternoon when 4 certain information that had come to our notice that there

5 was a possibility of funding being made available to the

applicants, and our trustees instructed us to make an 6

7 application for three or four days in the hope that the

8 information that we then had and we transmitted to them may

9 bear fruit in order to avoid a lengthy postponement of the

10 whole of August -

CHAIRPERSON: 11 Sorry, I'm interrupting. 12 You say an application of three or four days - you mean, I

13 take it an application for three or four days'

14 postponement; in other words the matter should stand down

15 for three or four days while these other possibilities in

relation to obtaining funding will be explored. Is that 16

17 what you're saying?

18

19

20

1

4

7

15

16

17

18

19

20

MR BIZOS SC: This is the request that we make on behalf of the Legal Resources Centre, with the support of our trustees. Mr Chairman -

21 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, give the

22 interpreter an opportunity, Mr Mahlangu, to interpret -

23 MR BIZOS SC: I'm sorry.

24 CHAIRPERSON: It's important that those

25 who are in the auditorium who only understand Xhosa should injured and arrested people on the one hand who had been

represented by Mr Mpofu, and the main respondents in the

3 application in the High Court. Am I correct?

4 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, this is correct, Mr

Chairman, but because for obvious reasons they are aligned,

6 this is why I speak to both, and appeal to them, as I would appeal to the three respondents in the application, and I

7

8 have spoken to the senior counsel representing each one of

9 them, to use their good offices in order to get a

10 settlement of the dispute between those three respondents,

11 the President, the Minister of Justice, and the Legal Aid

12 Board. I would appeal to them publicly, and even though Mr

13 Ntsebeza is shaking his head, to both of them to try and

14 take an opportunity that may be offered to settle the

15 matter. If both sides behave in good faith, the difficult

16 issue of a lengthy postponement may be avoided.

We have no definite instructions from our trustees and our clients as to whether we should support or abide by the application for a postponement for a lengthy period. We are meeting again tonight. In the meantime the probabilities are that we will abide the decision, but we want you, Mr Chairman and the other members of the

23 Commission, to seriously consider a short postponement to

24 Thursday in order to give an opportunity for the benefit of

all for negotiations to take place to solve the problem.

Page 12167

understand what's happening.

2 MR BIZOS SC: Yes. Mr Chairman, our

3 belief as counsel for the Legal Resources Centre and our

attorneys within the centre, believe that it is important

5 for the applicants to get funding. Equally important, with

respect, is that this Commission should try and do its work 6

as expeditiously as possible. I want to place on record

8 that the headline, or headlines that the LRC has withdrawn

9 from the Commission are incorrect, and we believe that we

10 should try and be of assistance to the Commission, and

11 particularly the people representing the injured people,

12 that the sooner this Commission makes a finding, the better 13

for all of us, including themselves, the country, and the

administration of justice. 14

On the information available to us, there is a possibility - a possibility, not a probability, or we cannot make promises for others - that a few days of this week may lead to the settlement of the dispute between the representatives of the deceased and the injured people to provide funding to the applicants. If there is a -CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, Mr Bizos, I'm

21 sorry to interrupt you, Mr Bizos. It's only the injured 22

people, isn't it? As I understand it, the representatives

24 of the deceased people, in other words the families, they

are receiving legal aid. The dispute is between the

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12169 May I remind the Commission of the well-published 1

appeal by the judge who dismissed the application, that

attempts should be made to do what I have articulated here.

We are not alone in that, in hoping that that will happen.

5 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bizos. Is

there anything else that you wish to say? 6

7 MR BIZOS SC: No, Mr Chairman, I think 8 that I said what I, we wanted to say on behalf of the Legal

9 Resources Centre.

> CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Do we have a representative here of the Human Rights Commission?

12 MR FISCHER: Yes, Chair.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Fischer.

14 MR FISCHER: Thank you, Chairman. The South African Human Rights Commission will abide by the 15

decision of the Commission. The Human Rights Commission 16

17 is, however, very concerned at the current situation and

18 will support the Constitutional Court appeal. The judgment

19 of the High Court did not preclude funding to the injured

20 and arrested miners; it merely determined that there was no

21 obligation on the State or Legal Aid Board to do so. In

that light the Human Rights Commission calls on this

23 Commission and all parties to the Constitutional Court

24 appeal to do everything in their power to reach a solution

that can allow the injured and arrested miners to continue

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

Page 12172

Page 12173

Page 12170

to take part in this Commission process. This Commission

- 2 of Inquiry must remain inclusive and must remain responsive
- 3 and allow a fair procedure. We would support the LRC's
- 4 suggestion of a stand-down until Thursday to see if these
- 5 appeals for sense can have effect. Thank you, Chair.

CHAIRPERSON:

7 there any other representative of one of the parties before

Thank you, Mr Fischer. Is

- us who wishes to say something before I call upon the 8
- 9 evidence leaders to give us their attitude? Mr Gumbi?
- 10 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson. On behalf
- of Lieutenant Shulumu(?) we are still awaiting the High 11 12
- Court's judgment in our application. As soon as that 13 judgment is delivered, then we will see, I will get
- 14 instruction whether are we taking the matter forward or
- not, but we will abide by the decision of the Chairperson 15 in this regard. 16
- 17 CHAIRPERSON: Do we have a representative
- 18 of the Monene family?
- 19 MS MASEVHE: Yes, Chairperson, on behalf
- 20 of the Monene family we'll abide the decision of the
- 21 Commissioner of the Constitutional Court.
- 22 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Any other
- 23 representative of any of the other parties who wishes to
- 24 say something?
- 25 [11:03] MS CHABEDI: Chairperson, the DMR will

- Thursday. There is, in any event, plenty of work which can
- 2 be done in the meantime, certainly on the part of the
- 3 evidence leaders, which will mean that the time is not
- entirely lost. So in summary, we support the proposal that
- 5 the application stand down till Thursday. If by then the
- 6 problem has been resolved, the application for a
- 7 postponement will fall away. If by then it has not been
- 8 resolved, the application can then be argued and decided by
- 9 the Commission. Thank you, Chair.
- 10 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Budlender.
- 11 Mr Mpofu, that seems prima facie to be a satisfactory way
- 12 of dealing with the matter.
- 13 MR MPOFU: Well no, Chairperson, it's
- 14 not. I'll make my response. Firstly, Chairperson, I must
- thank the majority of the parties for supporting or abiding
- by the decision of the Commission; particular thanks to 16
- 17 SAPS and Lonmin because we had anticipated them to be the
- ones who were going to and we want to say that we think
- 19 they took that position sensibly, understanding that what
- 20 we're asking for the Commission is not something that is
- 21 easy to ask. It's the lesser of two evils. One is
- 22 obviously the delay in the Commission, which nobody wants,
- 23 and the other evil is where the Commission might continue
- 24 in the absence of certain important parties, which also we
- 25 don't think anybody wants.

Page 12171

- abide the decision of the Commission.
- 2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, and the
- 3 Administrator of the Traditional Authority, do you wish to
 - say something on behalf of your client?
- 5 MR KGAKA: Thank you, Mr Chairperson,
- Bapo Ba Mogale also will abide by the decision. 6
 - CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Madlanga.
- 8 MR MADLANGA SC: Mr Chairman, I've asked
- 9 Mr Budlender to address the question of the postponement;
- that will include the question of the stand-down, thank 10
- 11 you.

1

4

7

- 12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Budlender.
- 13 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, in our view it
- is possible that it will be necessary for the application 14
- for the postponement to be fully argued and decided, but 15
- 16 it's also our view that it's possible that over the next
- 17 few days arrangements can be made which will make that
- 18 unnecessary. We believe that every effort should be made
- 19 to resolve the matter without the necessity of dealing with
- 20 the application for the postponement, or for that matter,
- 21 the application, or the contemplated application to the
- 22 Constitutional Court, and we believe that all avenues
- should be exhausted before we reach those points.
- So the evidence leaders therefore support the

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

25 proposal that this application should stand down until

1

We would rather have a situation where the power of what happens is really taken back to the hands of the

- 2 3 Commission to avoid all this drama of people walking out
- 4 and all sorts of things like that, and that the Commission
- 5
- itself should hear our plea that we would like to shorten 6 the time within which we will, under pressure, draft the
- 7 papers to the Constitutional Court, appeal to that court,
- 8 to the Chief Justice, because he's the one who gives the
- 9 directions, to hear this matter expeditiously, mindful of
- 10 minimising the delay in the Commission. So it's a very
- 11 difficult weighing process, it's not something that was
- 12 frivolously made, and that's why we appreciate those
- 13 parties that support that difficult situation.

14 Chairperson, we also support the calls by the 15 other parties for everything to be done to try and get this

- 16 matter settled out of court. There is no party, I'm
- 17 prepared to say this without any fear of equivocation,
- 18 there is no party in this room that has tried more than we
- 19 have since October last year to have this matter resolved
- 20 out of court. We have written letters to the Minister, we
- 21 have written letters to the President. One of those
- 22 letters took five months for us to even get a response.
- 23 After that we did the application for relocation to try and
- 24 mitigate our situation. After that we approached the courts; after that, during the course of the discussion -

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE RealTime Transcriptions

Page 12174

- we made sure we approached the courts during the recess of
- 2 the Commission so that minimum disruption to the Commission
- 3 should be caused. Even when we were at the doorstep of the
- 4 court, Chairperson, we approached the State Attorney, and
- 5 with your indulgence, Chairperson, I'll read out a letter
- that we wrote to them where we said we made informal 6
- 7 representations and I'll jump the first paragraph. We say,
- "Our clients' proposal" this was on the 5th of July, a few 8
- 9 days before the hearing, "Our clients' proposal is
- 10 therefore that your clients" - that is the President and
- the Minister and Legal Aid, first, second and third 11
- respondents, "together or separately consider offering to 12
- pay the applicants' reasonable and agreed legal fees for 13
- 14 the period pending the hearing of part B of the
- 15 application. This would be along the lines suggested in
- the 17th respondent's answering affidavit, the LRC." We 16
- say, "This important step and gesture would ensure that, 17
- 18 (1), All the parties have adequate time to prepare for and
- 19 deal with the important constitutional and jurisprudential
- 20 issues raised by all sides. (2), More importantly the
- 21 resumption of the Commission on the 15th of July would be
- 22 guaranteed. Our clients have specifically indicated that
- 23 they will not participate in the Commission unless the
- 24 issues they raise are addressed. It is not the lawyers who
- 25 will, in that event, withdraw; it is the clients. The

respect, that's the last word we had. It's not that they

- say they have legal constraints or they don't have money or
- whatever. They say they are "not willing" to fund the
- legal representation of our clients, and that was on the 5th 5

of July.

6 After the judgment, Chairperson, again we had 7 discussions, including yesterday I called my learned

8 opponent representing these parties and he informed me that

9 his attorneys are on holiday. We were talking more about

10 the practicalities of trying to speed up also the

11 constitutional process, Constitutional Court processes, and

12 he would only be able to even respond even on those issues

13 later in the week. So we are here, Chairperson, as parties

14 that have tried everything, but everything under the sun to

have this matter settled, as I say, even before when we

were at the doorstep of the court. So, and we have a

17 mandate to continue to do so, and we will do so, as we did

yesterday, as we did on Thursday in court, as we will do

19 tomorrow, as we will do this afternoon, Chairperson. But

20 the point we are making is that we are asking the

21 Commission to give the postponement now so that we can then

22 spend the time exactly continuing with those efforts, but

23 also drafting the papers that we have to draft, because

24 should we delay in delivering the papers in the

Constitutional Court, the same parties might come back and

Page 12175

- withdrawal of the lawyers is merely consequential and
- 2 incidental. (3), It would save considerable costs for all
- 3 the parties." Then we say, "(4), It is not necessary at
- 4 this stage to get into the specific details of the required
- 5 interim funding, save to say that it would be paid, (1),
- without any admission of liability on your client's part; 6
- 7 and (2), Only after some discussions as to its exact
- 8 parameters and nature. (5), Should there be the necessary
- 9 political will, we are confident that such a step would be
- 10 beneficial to all parties and be in the public interests.
- 11 We await your urgent response."

1

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

This was the response that we got from the attorneys of the President and the Minister. "(1), The discussion today 5 July prior to the conference with Deputy Judge President concerning this matter refers. (2)," this is the important one, "Your proposal has been conveyed to the first respondent," that's the President, "and the second respondent," that's the Minister. "We have received firm instructions that the said proposal is not acceptable to our clients and they are not willing, even on a

- 21 provisional basis, to fund the legal representation of your
- 22 clients before the Marikana Commission of Inquiry. Under
- the circumstances we await your replying affidavit," and so
- 24 on. It's very important, Chairperson.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

So that's the last word, Chairperson, with RCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Page 12177 say we got the judgment, we relaxed, we didn't do anything

- and therefore now we want to put pressure on the court, and
- all those stories that we heard in the previous
- application. So we have a duty, a professional duty to
- 5 come to the Constitutional Court as soon as humanly
- possible, which is why we asked the judge last week, almost
- 7 put pressure on him to give us the written judgment.

So what we are saying is not different,

8 Chairperson; we will continue to try. Obviously we are not

10 so foolhardy that if a solution presents itself on

11 Thursday, or on Wednesday or this afternoon, that we will

12 say no, Chairperson, remember you gave us the postponement

13 until the 19th of August. We are not that infantile. What

14 we will do, if such a solution does come to the fore is to

15 approach, is obviously to approach the Chairperson at an

16 informal level, as we always do, and the evidence leaders

17 and all the parties, and we will reconvene should that

18 miracle, which I'm not at this stage sure is going to

19 happen in the next couple of days, but you never know,

20 miracles do happen.

21 So our suggestion is not opposed as such to the other suggestion. It simply says that instead of making it 23 compulsory for us to come back here, to be shuttling up and down and come here on Wednesday or on Thursday, let us

concentrate on the work that is in our hands, which is to

18

1

Page 12178

- try and continue to make this overture, but also to
- 2 discharge our duties to the Constitutional Court, to
- 3 prepare the papers and be there as soon as possible, and
- 4 should the optimism of the other parties be well placed,
- 5 then we'll be back tomorrow for that matter. If this
- 6 happens and somebody says to us there's a solution, forget
- 7 Thursday; we'll be back tomorrow or any other time before
- 8 the Constitutional Court hearing takes place.

9 Lastly, Chairperson, we have strict instructions 10 to be here today, given our position that we had

11 publicised, or rather announced here, to be here today for

12 the specific purposes of making this application. We have

13 no instructions to be here on any other day, and even those

14 instructions, as I explained, we obtained because we wanted

15 sense to prevail to our clients on the basis that it would

16 be better if it is the Commission itself that governs its

17 owns procedures, as it were, so that if we come back on the

19th, in the unlikely event that there's a problem we'll

19 still come back. It's a more orderly way of doing things

20 than having some people remaining, others going and so on.

21 We really think that if anything protects the integrity of

22 the Commission it is the suggestion that we are making,

23 which as I say, is made not easily; it's made reluctantly

24 because even three weeks lost in this Commission is three

25 weeks too much. But we have the choice between that or Page 12180

- [11:23] That was canvassed with our clients and we as the
- 2 legal advisors were open-minded, as we always are, but the
- 3 prevalent view was that it is important not to engage in
- 4 this two-stage approach, especially because it is premised
- 5 on nebulous suggestions that approaches are going to be
- 6 made to nameless and faceless people - I'm more than 60
- 7 years old, Mr Chairman, certainly not the 80 years that Mr
- 8 Bizos is, but I expect Mr Bizos, whom I respect, to have
- 9 the decency to call me aside. We have been sitting here,
- 10 waiting for this Commission to start. I have known him for
- 11 a long time, for him to know that if there was anything
- 12 that he wanted to share with me in confidence about the approaches he is making, to whomsoever he is making,
- 14 trustees, government, or anybody, I would seriously have
- 15 taken those into account and I would have caused my clients
- 16 to take that into consideration. He hasn't. He is
- 17 expecting me, when I have instructions, when he has
- instructions, he is expecting me on the basis of a
- 19 possibility - he said it's not even a probability - a
- 20 possibility probably from his trustees, offering some
- 21 assistance to the arrested and detained, to go against the
- 22 instructions of my clients who say this has now become a
- 23 fundamental issue of whether this country says it is okay
- 24 for the taxpayer to fund seven lawyers representing SAPS,
 - but my clients and I represent those who are allegedly

Page 12179

- having a skewed commission that is seen by the public to be
- only attended by certain types of parties, which is not 2
- 3 desirable and must be avoided at all costs, Chairperson.
- 4 So the bottom line, Chairperson is that we'd
- 5 like, particularly in view of the fact that there's no 6 party that is really opposing the application, we'd beg the
- 7 Commission to grant us this indulgence for the reasons that
- 8 we have put, but also for the reasons that we, apropos Mr
- 9 Budlender's suggestion that we will not be here on Thursday
- to move the application. We are here to move it today, and 10
- 11 those are our instructions at this stage. So our
- 12 suggestion embraces everything that has been said in terms
- 13 of making the attempts; that we can guarantee on the record
- 14 without any contradiction that we will pursue, as we have
- 15 done for the past eight months or so, a solution that does
- 16 not involve litigation and unnecessary waste of money and
- 17 time. Thank you.
- 18 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza.
- 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, if you
- could grant me the indulgence to support the applicants in
- 21 their application for a postponement, which has been
- calculated would be for three weeks. I have been told over
- the weekend, before we even took instructions, that the
- 24 LRC's position would be that we should ask for a stand-
- down.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12181 being funded - Mr Chairman, I'm on record here as having

- stated the basis on which the families are being funded.
- 3 You yourself, Mr Chairman, using your statutory power,
- 4 appointed evidence leaders because you were appreciative of
- 5 the volume of work, the complexity of the issues that were
- 6 going to be dealt with here. Now we want the highest court
- 7 in the land, that is why we are getting in now as co-
- 8 applicants; we're not asking for sameness of resources.
- 9 That's never been our position. Our position is for that
- 10 highest court in the land to tell us an everybody else,
- 11 including my learned friend Mr Bizos, that it is okay that
- 12 these families must be supported on the basis that their
- 13 senior counsel will be funded for 30 days, or so many days,
- 14 for the duration of the funding. I'm just indicating the
- 15 first terms that we arrived at, and that it is okay for the
- 16 families to have only one silk, two juniors, when it is so
- 17 complex to go through footage, to go through records, and 18 to prepare.

19 Now I don't want to think that this is still 20 consistent with what Mr Bizos has submitted earlier on when we raised this issue, that we are in this predicament because we are not knocking on the right doors. Maybe 23 those are the doors that he seeks to go and knock at. I am

very disturbed when he says he is appealing to us in public

because what he does is to portray us as recalcitrant, as

24

11

18

21

Page 12184

Page 12182

- 1 people who are not advising our own clients properly. I
- 2 take offense, Mr Chairman, to that kind of attitude because
- 3 it is something that Mr Bizos in his knowledge of where I
- 4 come from with him in a number of these issues knows I
- 5 would not I'm not here to posture. You will note, Mr
- 6 Chairman, that I've not been coming to these proceedings
- 7 and I've not moved the application because I moved the
- 8 application in October before you, and I stated the basis
- 9 why I thought it was important for us to be funded
- 10 adequately, not on the same basis, but adequately for us to
- 11 be able to deal with the issues that are raised. So for me
- 12 to be called in public, and for my learned friend to say so
- 13 in so many words that he's calling upon us in public you
- 14 know, to use our influences with our clients for them to be
- 15 able to agree only to a stand down is an assumption that we
- 16 have not done so.

17

18

19

My learned friend Mr Mpofu has indicated the correspondence that he has made to the department. Those who instruct me in the Socio-Economic Rights Institute had written similar letters right at the very beginning,

- written similar letters right at the very beginning,prevailing upon the Minister of Justice to understand why
- 22 we needed to be funded even on a better basis than we are
- 23 currently being funded. So I just want to correct in the
- 24 same public that Mr Bizos called upon me to put my position
- 25 here, that I am quite sympathetic, I'm the first person

Page 12183

- 1 who'd love this Commission to come to an expeditious
- 2 finding and end to the deliberations. But I've got
- 3 instructions and I understand, I understand fully why the
- 4 families are feeling that Mr Chairman, in your name, you
- 5 know the Commission spokesman is reported, and I saw it
- 6 also on television this morning that they don't need is.
- 7 That's what he has been saying, that the Commission does
- 8 not need the presence of any parties because the Commission
- 9 can subpoena any people. But I know that is not your
- 10 position –

11 CHAIRPERSON: I wasn't aware of that

12 statement.

15

13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There is the –

14 CHAIRPERSON: I did speak to the

spokesman this morning about something I heard on the

16 radio, but certainly that's not our attitude.

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So, Mr Chairman, I know

that, you know, the spokesman may not have meant it in thatsense, but that's how it came across, and that's how our

20 people hear these things. So if they don't need us, we may

- 21 just as well stay at home until the Constitutional Court
- 22 has given a decision. So there is a delicateness with
- which we must handle our submissions, and I would prevail
- 24 upon my elder statesman and counsel to understand that
- 25 sometimes what he says, you know, in good faith, may come

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

across out there as very insensitive. Incidentally, I

2 don't want to be portrayed in the light that I simply want

3 to put a spanner in the wheels of the Commissioner's

proceedings.

CHAIRPERSON: I think we'll take the tea adjournment now and then I'll hear Mr Bizos in reply, and

7 perhaps the evidence leaders as well. We'll now take the

8 tea adjournment.

9 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
10 [12:03] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. Mr

Ntsebeza?

12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.

13 Mr Chairman, Commissioners, I just wanted to indicate to –

14 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, I'm sorry, I thought

15 you had finished when I took the tea adjournment. I was

16 informed subsequently that you had not finished and so –

17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No.

CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry for having

19 created the impression that you had finished. Please

20 proceed.

MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, it was just giving

22 the interpreter an opportunity, who had been feeling that

23 I'm not giving him the opportunity. I was going on a long

24 tirade. Mr Chairman, there are just two points that I

wanted to make. The first one is that whether it is or it

Page 12185

1 is not an argument, the families want to make it very clear

2 that even though we as legal advisors indicated to them

3 there are ways and means of assisting the Commission - even

4 if the injured and arrested are not physically here, we can

5 use all sorts of things, technology, best evidence

6 documentation, footages. Their position is a principled

7 one and it is to say we are largely dependent on the

8 arrested, detained, and injured, for us to get the comfort

9 that what is communicated to the Commission, also at least

10 comes from those widows of our relatives who died, came

11 from. They were mineworkers, and they were unfortunate to

12 have been killed, but we would love them to be represented,

13 and if they are not represented, we don't really see much

14 point.

Now I'm saying, I'm not, these are the merits, but that's the reasoning behind all of this, and it is not being challenged, it's not being disrespectful of the efforts made by the Department of Justice in bringing them

19 to be here in the first place. They take offense at the

20 indication that they are being kept at hotels, why are they

21 now not coming to this Commission when they have lost, I 22 mean when the case has been lost. They feel if there is a

23 possibility that by an approach to the highest court in the

24 land there might be a different view held by that court,

5 then that should be given an opportunity, and if it is so

9

10

11

12

13

Page 12186

that the Department of Justice takes a view that because

2 they are here and not attending, then they are quite ready

3 to go home, back home. In fact, as things are, some of

4 them have not even arrived back from the recess period

5 because when, once things started to happen in the way in

which they did, they said until the question of funding has 6

7 been sorted out, we may just as well stay away.

Then our instructions are to say you tell us all the time that you are officers of the court and therefore even in the Commission your word will be taken. Give the word that as soon as there is a viable solution, and if the viable solution is the one that we are promised might come on Thursday, then in the meantime let's go home, but you as

14 officers of the court, if it is so that you are told that

15 there is a solution on Thursday, your word must be taken

because you will have to go back immediately there is an 16

indication that some solution has been taken. What we are 17

18 uncomfortable about is to be remaining here when there is a

19 view taken by the Department of Justice that we should not

20 be wasting taxpayers' money by being at hotels when we are

21 not attending the Commission. If that is the view, then

22 pending either an approach to the Constitutional Court or a

23 resolution that is satisfactory, we are quite happy to go

24 home. Those were the submissions that I wanted to make for

25 the record.

Page 12188 them to try and settle the difference between them. I

think that such, or similar words from the Chairman of this

Commission may favourably resound in the ears of both

parties.

5

6

8

9

11

12

13 14

17

19

20

21

22

23

1

3

I do not want to enter into a debate with my learned friend Mr Ntsebeza and his statements. They are personal; they are not of particular relevance to the problem that we are facing, but I do wish to place on record that in the morning we spent half an hour, we, the Legal Resources Centre, about half an hour of explaining our attitude to Mr Mpofu. It was in the foyer. We deliberately came early in order to apprise Mr Mpofu of our attitude to the application for postponement, and for the sake of clarity might we say that we do not disagree with Mr Mpofu in that a postponement may be necessary in the circumstances. Unfortunately, Mr Chairman, Mr Ntsebeza was not around in the foyer. We assumed that what we told Mr Mpofu would have been transmitted to Mr Ntsebeza, who I did not see until the first time this morning. A couple of minutes before the Commission came in I came here and I saw my learned friend, Mr Ntsebeza, sitting here. There was no

important things happening here, and let us concentrate on

that, Mr Chairman.

Page 12187

CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Ntsebeza. Mr

Bizos? 2

1

5

6 7

8

11 12

14 15

17

18

19

21

3 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman -

4 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, I'm sorry, I beg

your pardon, before I called upon you I should have allowed

the interpreter to interpret what Mr Ntsebeza had said. So

I withdraw my invitation calling upon you to speak. I will

renew it later when the interpreter is finished. Mr Bizos.

9 MR BIZOS SC: Mr Chairman, I was saddened 10 by the contents of the letter written by the respondents to

the legal representatives of the injured people. It's

written from a very high horse, if I may use the

13

expression, but experience has taught us that potential

litigants do ride high horses, but that doesn't mean that

we must not attempt to get people off high horses for the

16 benefit of all of us.

One of the great lawyers that I was happy to be the junior of, Bram Fischer, reminded me when I was in despair of failure in a particular case, I must remember that no-one has been condemned for trying and having failed. I would appeal both to the government and the legal representatives here to get off high horses and really try in the next few days to solve the problem. May 24 I say, Mr Chairman, that you have a precedent of the 25 Pretoria High Court judge in making an appeal to both of

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12189 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, I see you've

2 turned your light on.

MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you, Chair.

4 Chairperson, firstly I think on a positive note I just want

opportunity for me to speak to him. I want to place on

record that we mustn't personalise things; there are more

to confirm that we've also renewed our instructions about

6 what Mr Ntsebeza was saying, namely that the, should a

7 solution arise from any quarter whatsoever during the

8

period of the postponement, starting with the next few

9 minutes, then we will not only be here running, but we'll

10 be here as soon as possible and ready actually to run. So

11 I think it's important to place that on the record, so that

12 our position is simply that we now want to focus on the

13 drafting and on the attempts that are referred to, and we

14 hope that our word as professionals and officers of the

15 court will be taken at face value, that should any of these

16 things succeed, we will be back here with the speed of

17 light. So there's no question about that.

Apropos the discussions this morning, well Chairperson, I'm afraid since these things are said in the public, I have to say this. There is no discussion that took place between me and Mr Bizos this morning. The discussions that did take place were, included some people in his team, but all stages they also included Mr

23

24 Ntsebeza's juniors and other representatives.

Unfortunately Mr Ntsebeza had a mishap this morning where

18

19

20

21

10

11

12

13

14

15

```
Page 12190
   he was locked out of his own gate, or inside the yard, so
2
   he arrived a bit late, (1).
3
           (2), in none of those discussions was it ever -
4
   of this morning, was it ever mentioned that there is some
5
   specific attempts which might bear fruit. There couldn't
```

have been because Mr Bizos himself has said that it's not 6 7 even a probability. 8

The third issue is that what did happen is that yesterday evening I had a discussion with Mr Varney, who is Mr Bizos' junior, and he mentioned two things. One was to do with government overtures, which I've already addressed. The other one was he said there's somebody who lives next door to somebody who said that they might help - no names, no nothing - and I take it, all that I take it in good faith that Mr Varney - as a colleague, I accept that if he

16 said there was that rumour, there was that rumour, and we 17 would like to pursue it, but all we are saying is that let

18 us not belabour the point; let us get the postponement on

19 the understanding that both Mr Ntsebeza and myself, and I'm

20 sure any other parties, those who have supported or abide

21 by the decision will be prepared to come back here should 22

any of these probabilities, possibilities, whatever, bear

23 any fruit. Thanks, Chairperson.

24 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofu. 25 MR MPOFU: Sorry, Chairperson, just - I'm Page 12192

friend. Thank you. 2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. 3 MR MPOFU: Confirm that, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu has very fairly said that what Mr Varney has stated was correct. Mr Bizos, 6 my colleague Adv Tokota wants to ask you a question. 7 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, of course, Sir. 8 COMMISSIONER TOKOTA: Mr Bizos, all I 9 want to check from you, do I understand you correctly that 10 you are not opposed to the application for postponement as such; all you need is to see if any efforts can bear fruit 11 12 until Thursday, that the funding may come out or - and if it doesn't, then you are not opposed to the postponement? 14 Is that understanding correct? 15 MR BIZOS SC: No, that is correct, but you know, unless you put deadlines, people say well - the 17 good Afrikaans expression, "more is ook 'n dag," and we don't want -19 CHAIRPERSON: What the interpreter would 20 say, tomorrow is also a day. 21 MR BIZOS SC: Yes, so time is of 22 fundamental essence. People want to know when is this 23 going to end. Having long postponements which may or may 24 not bear fruit is not helpful, and this is why we have

Page 12191

sorry, one small thing that I forgot. I just want also to 1

place on record that as I've already indicated, we do not 2

3 need anybody's encouragement to try and settle this matter.

4 We've done everything, more than anybody, to try and settle

5 this matter, and all these attempts that we have made over

the past eight months, if they are portrayed as high horse, 6

7 well then so be it, but we certainly do not - of course if

8 the Chairperson is minded to encourage us to settle, we

9 will accept that humbly, but rest assured, Chairperson,

10 that there's nobody in this room who has tried to settle

this matter quietly - we have even sent deputations, 11

12 diplomatic deputations, I can't mention people's names. If

13 I show you SMSes that I've made to senior government

people, I would be compromising them, but we've done 14

15 nothing else in the past few months but to try and settle

this matter out of court, and if that's called a high 16

17 horse, well so be it.

18 MR VARNEY: Chairperson -

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

19 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Varney -

20 MR VARNEY: With your leave, since my

21 learned friend has disclosed the discussion that we did

have last night, I must correct him on one small aspect. I

did disclose the name of the funder, who I mentioned was

24 amenable to a further approach for funding. So that, the

25 name of the organisation was made clear to my learned

Page 12193

have been made by the judge in Pretoria, we hope the appeal

suggested that if something can be done, the appeals that

- that will be made by this Commission and other persons that
- may be concerned, by limiting the period to Thursday may
- make the engine run better in the hope that a settlement
- will be entered into.
- 6 [12:23] COMMISSIONER TOKOTA: Thank you, Mr

7 Bizos.

10

8 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Budlender?

9 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair and

Commissioners, very briefly, the view of the evidence

11 leaders is that the best solution for the difficult

12 situation which arises at the moment is twofold; firstly

13 that a suitable interim arrangement should be made for the

14 next month, which would make it unnecessary - when I say

15 interim arrangement, interim arrangement for funding should

16 be made for the next month, which would make it unnecessary

17 for the Commission to decide whether a postponement would

18 otherwise be necessary because there will be funding for

19 the representation, and then secondly, the second leg,

20 meanwhile the applicants should proceed with their case to

21 the Constitutional Court and obtain a decision from that

court on a permanent arrangement. So we think that's the

23 best way to deal with this now, an interim arrangement

24 which solves the problem while the court, while the case is

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

pending in the Constitutional Court, and that is in fact

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

7

8

9

10

11

23

Page 12194

what the applicants in Mr Magidiwana's case were seeking as 2

part A of their relief. They were seeking it from the

3 government. It may be that the government will do it; it

4 may be other people will do it.

So the question is what is the best way to create a space for an interim solution to be found while the principal matter is being debated in the Constitutional Court, and we suggest that the best way to do that is to stand the matter down to Thursday so that efforts which are being made can be made, can be pursued, and that other efforts can be pursued, and then for the Commission only to deal on Thursday, and then only if it's necessary, with the question of whether a postponement will be necessary in the absence of interim funding.

CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, how do you react to the point which Mr Budlender has made, that if money can be found either from the fiscus or from some other organisation, to give you what you sought before the High Court, namely interim funding until the decision on the merits, as it were, is given? Is that the thing that would bring you back, to which you referred earlier? MR MPOFU: Chairperson, yes, that

question doesn't even have to be asked. I'm sure you're asking it for clarity, but surely what Mr Budlender is saying is exactly the prayer we sought under part A, so how

1

2

5

6

Page 12196

disclose -MR MPOFU: Well, they must even say that.

3 They even need to say that. We don't want names. Tell us,

just say there's a -

CHAIRPERSON: I did understand Mr Varney actually gave you the name of an organisation which might -

7 MR MPOFU: No, that's irrelevant,

8 Chairperson, with greatest respect. What Mr Varney said is

9 that a particular organisation, whose name we've been at

10 pains not to drag into these things, and that's the only

11 reason that I didn't mention it, but knowing the name of

12 the organisation is neither here nor there. The issue is

13 whether those efforts, whether they come from Father

Christmas or whoever, must just, they must just tell us

there is a possibility as colleagues, they are working on

it. We will trust them, as our colleagues, and we'll leave 16

17 it at that. We won't pry them and say what, who, who,

where, what time. We don't want this -

19 CHAIRPERSON: You're now using the word 20 Mr Bizos used, which is possibility.

MR MPOFU: Yes.

CHAIRPERSON: But anyway, we will take an adjournment at this stage to consider what's been put to us, but before we do that, my colleague Hemraj wants to ask a question.

7

21

22

23

24

Page 12195

could we reject that what we went to court for? What we

are saying is simply this; we agree that if - this is why I 2

3 read these letters, Chairperson, because what Mr Budlender

4 is saying is exactly what was contained in the

correspondence that I read to yourself, Chairperson, and it 5

was rejected on the basis of unwillingness. 6

Now if between the 5th of July, when that was the position, and today something has changed, then I think the people who are here owe us as colleagues to tell us what it is because clearly there are people here who know something we don't know. We know the position to be what is written in black and white, which I've read out. As I say, I spoke

12 13 to the representatives of the President and the Minister

yesterday; he did not mention anything of the sort, but if 14

15 Mr Budlender, Mr Bizos, or Mr Varney or whoever knows

something that we do not know, then they must follow what

17 Mr Ntsebeza has said - as colleagues, take us to the side,

18 outside of this glare of cameras, and tell us what it is

19 that is likely to happen between now and Thursday. Failing

that, then we take the position to be what it is, always

21 laced with the guarantee that we are giving that should

22 their efforts succeed, we will be back.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

CHAIRPERSON: To be fair, of course, they

24 may have been told things by people on a confidential

without-prejudice basis, which they're not at liberty to

ARCHIVE FOR JUSTICE

Page 12197 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: 1 Mr Mpofu, in the

light of what you've just said, you can then have no

objection to us standing over for a couple of days until

these matters about interim funding is sorted out before

you actually bring your application, because your

6 application might not be necessary if that is sorted out in

the interim.

8 MR MPOFU: Well, thank you very much, 9 Commissioner Hemraj, what you've just said portrays the

10 dilemma that we are being placed in by these parties. Let us assume that we accept what you say and we sit until 11

12 Thursday, and then on Thursday these overtures don't

13 materialise; we would have wasted four days of the

14 Constitutional Court's time within which they would have

15 been able to give us the time, which is already squeezed,

to get a hearing, and only on Friday must we then start

17 pursuing that course. That is undesirable. What we are

18 saying, that's why we are saying the most - and what we are

19 saying is not opposed to anybody. We are saying we are

20 committing as professionals that we will attend, if the

21 meeting is at midnight today, we will be there, and if it

bears fruit, we will be back tomorrow. So what can be

23 wrong with that? But in the meantime let us pursue the

24 parallel work that needs to be done. A lot of work still

has to be done in analysing the judgment, drafting the

Page 12198 Page 12200 necessary affidavit, and giving the Chief Justice CHAIRPERSON: Of course then officially sufficient time to give us direction. If all that drafting 2 you would carry on with the work, and insofar as you might 3 is, it turns out to have been unnecessary, I'll be the have to come back later if these attempts to raise interim 4 first one to jump for joy and I will not blame anyone and funding fail, the point could never be taken against you 5 say I was drafting here and now you've brought a solution. even by the most ingenuous and inventive opponents, that But we cannot be asked to sort of put everything on pause you somehow delayed because you lost a day because you had 6 7 to come back to the Commission. I mean it's a -7 because time doesn't go on pause. By Friday we will have jeopardised our chances of being heard expeditiously at the 8 MR MPOFU: No. 8 CHAIRPERSON: 9 9 Constitutional Court, if it doesn't work. If it works -- if they tried that, hallelujah. 10 really they'd be scraping the bottom of the barrel. 10 11 MR MPOFU: Correct, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: 11 Sorry, I don't understand 12 CHAIRPERSON: So anyway, you don't 12 the last point you've made. 13 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Perhaps we're 13 suggest -14 talking here at cross purposes. It's not being suggested 14 MR MPOFU: I don't. by Mr Budlender at all that you do not proceed with your 15 CHAIRPERSON: - that if the application 15 Constitutional Court matter. What is being suggested is stands down, you won't prepare in the meanwhile? 16 17 MR MPOFU: 17 that interim funding to enable you to carry on for the next No, no -18 month while that process is being followed. Now that being 18 CHAIRPERSON: So that's not what you say, 19 the case, you can't have an objection to us standing over 19 as I understand it. while the issue of interim funding is discussed. That 20 20 MR MPOFU: I'm not. That's not what I'm 21 21 doesn't preclude you from proceeding with your papers. 22 CHAIRPERSON: I understand that, right. 22 MR MPOFU: No, no, well I've already 23 23 MR MPOFU: - not misunderstanding. answered that question. How on earth could I have an 24 CHAIRPERSON: Okay, thank you. 24 objection to the thing, the very thing that we went to court to seek? It's not possible. All we are saying, the 25 25 COMMISSIONER TOKOTA: Mr Mpofu, I just Page 12199 Page 12201 want to ask you this question. In the event of us deciding 1 only question here is whether we come back here on Thursday 2 or not, and we are saying, I've said to the Commission and to stand down this matter, I just want to check with you 3 I'll say it again, I have specific instructions to be here 3 whether is there anything else that you would like to add 4 today to seek the postponement. If other people want to in – because as I understand you, this is your application; 5 5 come back here on Thursday, well they can come back on you have given reasons why you apply for this postponement. Thursday, but - and if their efforts have borne fruit, once 6 6 Is there anything else, I'm asking, in case we decide 7 again we will be back on Friday. But we cannot be 7 nonetheless we're going to reserve judgment, or we're going 8 8 schizophrenic and on the one hand be pursuing what we have to come back on Thursday, and I don't want you to say on

22

23

24

9 to pursue in the interest of time, and then on the other hand come and sit here again to say exactly what we have 10 11 already said, which is that we seek a postponement. Or if 12 the Commission is prepared to then take what we have said 13 into account as our application, full stop, then what the 14 Commission does with its time on Thursday is none of our 15 business. 16 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, Mr Mpofu, a stand-down 17 of the application wouldn't be a stand-down of your

of the application wouldn't be a stand-down of your preparation for Constitutional Court. So I don't understand that argument. You say, one point you seem to suggest that if the application was stood down, you would then not do any work for your Constitutional Court application. I'm not sure that I understood you correctly

MR MPOFU:

No, that's certainly not what

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

9 Thursday when we come back, you wanted to renew an 10 application, there were certain things that you wanted to 11 add. Is there anything else that you would really - other 12 than what you said today? 13 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Commissioner Tokota, I really appreciate that opportunity. There are 14 15 two things that I want to say. One is that the application 16 that we have made here so far is unopposed. (2), is to say 17 that insofar as this practical, or kind of via media is 18 being suggested, I can only repeat for the third time that 19 the only problem on our side is that we cannot, we do not 20 have instructions to be here. So we would like to register 21 that if the Commission for some reason is minded to come

back on Thursday, our absence should not be misconstrued

because this is exactly what we are trying to avoid. We do

not want the world to be saying victims have walked out, and all these things. We would rather have the Commission

Page 12202 itself taking charge of the situation and granting the 2 2 postponement on the understanding, and trusting our word 3 that if a solution does come about, we will come back, and 3 4 therefore I just want to say that because all sorts of 4 5 interpretations, especially when we are not here to explain 6 ourselves, might be given. I just want to say that we 6 7 7 really, it will simply be because - at least Mr Ntsebeza 8 has said that his clients want to go home in the meantime. 8 9 9 My clients certainly have given us the limited instructions 10 to come here and move this application today, and they even 10 11 asked us for them to be present here so that they can 11 12 12 supervise that we don't stray from that mandate, and so MR MPOFU: 13 that's our position. It will be unfortunate, but ja, it 13 14 will be very unfortunate if it happens that way, but we 14 opposing it. understand that the - we also don't want to put the 15 15 16 Commission in a difficult position where it's seen to be 17 blasé about the delay that we're suggesting, because we are 17 18 also suggesting it as a very, very last resort. 18 19 COMMISSIONER TOKOTA: Then I also 19 20 understand that you will not be here on Thursday if we 20 21 stand down until that date, on the understanding that there 21 MR MPOFU: 22 is no opposition and therefore you would be surprised if on 22 Chairperson. 23 Thursday someone else comes up and says I'm objecting to 23 24 24 this postponement? MR MPOFU: 25 MR MPOFU: as that is the scout's honour, I think, and I want to also Thank you. Yes, no, that is

Page 12204 I want to be very careful that we shouldn't mislead anybody as to where we are going forward. The evidence leaders have very deliberately this morning not taken any position on the application for a postponement. We haven't said we oppose; we haven't said we support it; we haven't said we abide it, and we deliberately avoided being drawn into that because we think it's desirable, if possible for the matter to be resolved without the dispute about the postponement going. But I wouldn't like anybody to think that because we haven't said what our position is, that means we abide. Nobody should be under that misapprehension. I accept that, Chairperson. There's no dispute about the postponement. Nobody is CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, my colleague Hemraj asks me to ask you this, and I take it, I would like to think the answer is self-evident. Do you commit yourself, that's you and your team on behalf of your clients, to working with any attempts that are being made or going to be made to obtain interim funding for you? On our word of honour, CHAIRPERSON: Alright.

And Chairperson, on that note,

Page 12203 1 true, Commissioner, thank you very much. 2 CHAIRPERSON: Your clients would 3 obviously have to consider is there other possibility and 4 they may wish to be in a position to answer any contentions 5 that are put up, but they certainly can't say we won't come 6 and therefore the Commission has got to do what we say 7 because otherwise it will be said we weren't heard in reply, or anything of that kind. But anyway -8 9 MR MPOFU: Nο 10 CHAIRPERSON: That's not a matter that we 11 need deal with at this stage. 12 MR MPOFU: No, Chairperson, I think -13 yes, I think what Commissioner Tokota was saying is that if 14 we are not here because of the constraints that we have 15 defined, and should the position, let's assume - I don't 16 want to make an example about my learned friend Mr Semenya, 17 but I have to - let's assume he then now says no, 18 Commissioner, we're no longer abiding, and this is the 19 situation, I think that's the situation that Commissioner Tokota is addressing, and we say we would indeed be 21 surprised, but it's unlikely; we don't think that it will 22 arise, ja. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Budlender raised his 23 hand; he wants to say something.

MR BUDLENDER SC:

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 12205 1 adopt what rule number 1 is for the scouts - be prepared. 2 CHAIRPERSON: That sounds a very sensible 3 approach. - the circumstances we consider it appropriate 4 to let the matter stand down until Thursday. There is a, 5 from what we can ascertain, a possibility at the very 6 least, I would think a reasonable possibility, that interim 7 funding may be able to be obtained for the fees of the 8 injured and arrested persons, interim funding, that is at 9 least until the Constitutional Court has given judgment in 10 the appeal which is to be brought. So in the circumstances 11 the order we make is that the matter stands down until 12 Thursday, and the Commission adjourns until then. [12:43 13 14 I was going to do it at 9 o'clock, but I have to 15 do these things unanimously, so it's going to be 9:30. 16 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED] 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24

Chair, I just want to,

25

r
A
abide 12164:6,9,13
12165:6 12168:19,21
12169:15 12170:15
12170:20 12171:1,6
12190:20 12204:6,10
abiding 12172:15
12203:18
able 12176:12
12182:11,15
12197:15 12205:7
absence 12172:24
12194:14 12201:22
accept 12190:15
12191:9 12197:11
12204:12
acceptable 12175:19
account 12180:15
12199:13
actively 12165:1,1
adamant 12158:22
add 12201:3,11
address 12171:9
addressed 12174:24
12190:11
addressing 12158:15
12203:20
adequate 12174:18
adequately 12182:10
12182:10
adjourn 12161:14
· ·
ADJOURNED
12205:16
adjournment 12184:6
12184:8,15 12196:23
adjourns 12161:17
12184:9 12205:12
administration
12167:14
Administrator 12171:3
admission 12175:6
adopt 12205:1
Adv 12164:23 12192:6
advising 12182:1
advisors 12180:2
12185:2
affidavit 12174:16
12175:23 12198:1
affidavits 12165:3
afraid 12189:19
African 12169:15
Afrikaans 12192:17
afternoon 12160:15
12166:3 12176:19
12177:11
agree 12182:15
12195:2
agreed 12158:16
12174:13
aid 12167:25 12168:11
aiu 12107.23 12108:11
12169:21 12174:11
aligned 12168:5
allegedly 12180:25
allow 12159:4
12169:25 12170:3
ARCHIVE EC

allowed 12187:5
alluded 12160:19
Alright 12204:23 AMCU 12164:23
amenable 12191:24
amicus 12165:20
analysing 12197:25 announced 12178:11
announced 121/8:11 answer 12203:4
12204:17
answered 12198:23
answering 12174:16 anticipate 12162:13,18
12162:25 12163:2,7
anticipated 12172:17
anybody 12172:25 12180:14 12191:4
12197:19 12204:1,9
anybody's 12191:3
anyway 12196:22 12200:12 12203:8
appeal 12160:21
12162:10 12164:15
12164:20 12165:2,3 12168:6,7,12 12169:2
12169:18,24 12173:7
12187:21,25 12193:1
12205:10
appealing 12181:24 appeals 12170:5
12192:25
appear 12164:23
appellants 12164:15 applicants 12165:15
12166:6 12167:5,20
12174:13 12179:20
12181:8 12193:20 12194:1
application 12158:7,8
12158:22 12160:2,11
12160:17 12161:2,24 12162:1,8,8,15
12163:14 12164:4,14
12164:20,25
12165:21 12166:7,12 12166:13 12168:3,7
12168:19 12169:2
12170:12 12171:14
12171:20,21,21,25
12172:5,6,8 12173:23 12174:15 12177:4
12174:15 12177:4 12178:12 12179:6,10
12179:21 12182:7,8
12188:13 12192:10 12197:5,6 12199:13
12199:17,20,22
12200:15 12201:4,10
12201:15 12202:10 12204:4
apply 12201:5
applying 12165:20
appointed 12181:4
appreciate 12173:12 12201:14
appreciative 12181:4
apprise 12188:12

approach 12177:15.15 12180:4 12185:23 12186:22 12191:24 12205:3 **approached** 12173:24 12174:1,4 approaches 12180:5,13 appropriate 12205:3 **apropos** 12179:8 12189:18 argued 12160:2,3 12165:16 12171:15 12172:8 **argument** 12158:11 12185:1 12199:19 arises 12193:12 arising 12160:4 arrangement 12193:13 12193:15,15,22,23 arrangements 12171:17 **arrested** 12168:1 12169:20,25 12180:21 12185:4,8 12205:8 **arrived** 12181:15 12186:4 12190:2 articulated 12169:3 ascertain 12205:5 aside 12180:9 asked 12158:3 12171:8 12177:6 12194:23 12198:6 12202:11 asking 12172:20 12176:20 12181:8 12194:24 12201:6 asks 12204:16 aspect 12191:22 assistance 12167:10 12180:21 assisting 12185:3 assume 12197:11 12203:15,17 assumed 12188:17 **assumption** 12182:15 assured 12191:9 attach 12161:2.8 attempt 12187:15 **attempts** 12169:3 12179:13 12189:13 12190:5 12191:5 12200:3 12204:19 attend 12197:20 attended 12179:2 attending 12186:2,21 **attitude** 12164:3 12170:9 12182:2 12183:16 12188:11 12188:13 **Attorney** 12174:4 attorneys 12167:4 12175:13 12176:9 auditorium 12162:3 12166:25

available 12166:5 12167:15 avenues 12171:22 avoid 12166:9 12173:3 12201:23 avoided 12168:16 12179:3 12204:6 await 12175:11,23 **awaiting** 12170:11 aware 12183:11 В **B** 12174:14 **Ba** 12171:6 back 12160:12 12173:2 12176:25 12177:23 12178:5,7,17,19 12186:3,4,16 12189:16 12190:21 12194:21 12195:22 12197:22 12199:1,5,5 12199:7 12200:3,7 12201:8,9,22 12202:3 background 12162:11 **Bapo** 12171:6 Barnes 12164:23,24 barrel 12200:10 **based** 12162:16 basis 12161:1,8,9 12175:21 12178:15 12180:18 12181:2,12 12182:8,10,22 12195:6,25 bear 12166:9 12190:5 12190:22 12192:11 12192:24 bears 12197:22 beg 12179:6 12187:4 **beginning** 12182:20 behalf 12164:11 12166:19 12169:8 12170:10,19 12171:4 12204:18 **behave** 12168:15 belabour 12190:18 **belief** 12167:3 believe 12167:4.9 12171:18.22 beneficial 12175:10 benefit 12159:5 12168:24 12187:16 best 12161:3,10 12185:5 12193:11,23 12194:5.8 better 12167:12 12178:16 12182:22 12193:4 bit 12190:2 **Bizos** 12165:7,9 12166:18,21,23 12167:2,21,22 12168:4 12169:5,7 12180:8,8 12181:11 12181:20 12182:3,24 12184:6 12187:2,3,8

Authority 12171:3

12187:9 12189:21 12190:6.10 12192:5.7 12192:8,15,21 12193:7 12195:15 12196:20 black 12195:12 blame 12198:4 blasé 12202:17 board 12166:1 12168:12 12169:21 borne 12199:6 bottom 12179:4 12200:10 Bram 12187:18 brief 12160:12 **briefly** 12158:8 12161:25 12193:10 **bring** 12194:21 12197:5 **bringing** 12158:7 12185:18 broke 12158:5,23 **broken** 12159:25 **brought** 12165:15 12198:5 12205:10 **Budlender** 12171:9,12 12171:13 12172:10 12193:8,9 12194:16 12194:24 12195:3,15 12198:15 12203:23 12203:25 **Budlender's** 12179:9 bus 12158:5,23 12159:24,24 **business** 12199:15 C

calculated 12179:22 call 12158:25 12170:8 12180:9 called 12176:7 12182:12,24 12187:5 12191:16 calling 12163:25 12182:13 12187:7 calls 12169:22 12173:14 cameras 12195:18 canvassed 12180:1 can't 12191:12 12198:19 12203:5 careful 12204:1 carry 12198:17 12200:2 case 12185:22 12187:19 12193:20 12193:24 12194:1 12198:19 12201:6 caused 12174:3 12180:15 centre 12165:8 12166:1 12166:19 12167:3,4 12169:9 12188:10 certain 12166:4 12172:24 12179:2

12201:10

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

August 12162:23,24,25

12166:10 12177:13

certainly 12172:2
12180:7 12183:16
12191:7 12199:24
12202:9 12203:5
CHABEDI 12170:25
Chair 12164:8,24
12169:12 12170:5
12169:12 12170:5 12171:13 12172:9
12189:3 12193:9
12200:11 12203:25
Chairman 12164:12,13
12165:9 12166:20
12167:2 12168:5,22
12169:7,14 12171:8
12179:19 12180:7
12181:1,3 12182:2,6
12183:4,17 12184:12
12184:13,24 12187:3
12187:9,24 12188:2
12188:16,25
challenged 12185:17
chances 12198:8
changed 12195:8
charge 12202:1
check 12192:9 12201:2
Chief 12173:8 12198:1
choice 12178:25
Christmas 12196:14 circumstances
12175:23 12188:16
12205:3,10
clarity 12188:14
12194:24
clear 12159:1 12164:19
12165:13 12185:1
12191:25
clearly 12195:10
client 12164:3 12171:4
clients 12158:20
12168:18 12174:8,9
12174:10,22,25
12175:20,22 12176:4
12178:15 12180:1,15
12178:15 12180:1,15 12180:22,25 12182:1
12182:14 12202:8,9
12203:2 12204:19
client's 12175:6
colleague 12190:15
12192:6 12196:24
12204:15
colleagues 12195:9,17
12196:15,16
come 12158:19,19
12166:4 12176:25
12177:5,14,23,24
12178:17,19 12182:4
12183:1,25 12186:12 12190:21 12192:12
12190:21 12192:12 12196:13 12199:1,5,5
12196:13 12199:1,5,5
12199:10 12200:3,7 12201:8,9,21 12202:3
12201:8,9,21 12202:3
comes 12185:10
12202:23
12202:23 comfort 12185:8
Common t 12103.0
coming 17187.6
coming 12182:6

Ma
12185:21
commence 12158:3 comments 12162:4,5
12164:1 commission 12158:2
12160:12,15
12161:17,17,18 12162:9 12163:7
12165:12 12167:6,9 12167:10,12
12168:23 12169:1,11
12169:15,16,16,22,23
12170:1,1 12171:1 12172:9,16,20,22,23
12173:3,4,10 12174:2
12174:2,21,23 12175:22 12176:21
12178:16,22,24 12179:1,7 12180:10
12183:1,5,7,8
12184:9,9,10 12185:3
12185:9,21 12186:10 12186:21 12188:3,20
12193:2,17 12194:11 12199:2,12,14
12199:2,12,14 12200:7 12201:21,25
12202:16 12203:6
12205:12,16 Commissioner
12170:21 12192:8
12193:6 12197:1,9 12198:13 12200:25
12201:13 12202:19
12203:1,13,18,19 Commissioners
12184:13 12193:10 Commissioner's
12184:3
commit 12204:17 committing 12197:20
communicated 12185:9
complex 12163:1 12181:17
complexity 12181:5
compromising 12191:14
compulsory 12177:23
concentrate 12177:25 12188:24
concerned 12169:17 12193:3
concerning 12175:15
condemned 12187:20 conduct 12165:12
conference 12175:14
confidence 12180:12 confident 12175:9
confidential 12195:24
confirm 12189:5 12192:3
consequential 12175:1 consider 12168:23
12174:12 12196:23
12203:3 12205:3
considerable 12175:2

consideration 12180:16

consistent 12181:20
constitutional
12160:22 12162:10 12162:14 12164:15
12165:2,21,22
12169:18,23
12170:21 12171:22
12173:7 12174:19
12176:11,11,25
12177:5 12178:2,8
12183:21 12186:22
12193:21,25 12194:7
12197:14 12198:9,16
12199:18,21 12205:9
constraints 12176:2
12203:14
contained 12195:4
contemplated 12171:21
contentions 12203:4
contents 12187:10
continue 12169:25
12172:23 12176:17
12177:9 12178:1
continuing 12176:22
contradiction 12179:14
conveyed 12175:16
correct 12163:17
12168:3,4 12182:23
12191:22 12192:5,14
12192:15 12200:11
correctly 12192:9
12199:22
correspondence
12182:18 12195:5
costs 12175:2 12179:3
couldn't 12190:5
counsel 12165:16
12167:3 12168:8
12181:13 12183:24
country 12167:13
12180:23
couple 12177:19
12188:19 12197:3
course 12159:21
12162:12 12173:25
12191:7 12192:7 12195:23 12197:17
12193.23 12197.17
court 12158:18
12160:22 12161:10
12162:10,14
12164:15,17 12165:2
12165:21,23 12168:3
12169:18 19 23
12169:18,19,23 12170:21 12171:22
12173:7,7,16,20
12174:4 12176:11,16
12176:18,25 12177:2
12177:5 12178:2,8
12181:6,10 12183:21
12185:23,24 12186:9
12186:14,22
12187:25 12189:15
12191:16 12193:21
12193:22,24,25
12194:8,19 12195:1

12198:9.16.25 12199:18.21 12205:9 **courts** 12173:25 12174:1 Court's 12170:12 12197:14 co-applicants 12164:21 create 12194:5 created 12184:19 cross 12198:14 current 12169:17 **currently** 12182:23 D dag 12192:17 date 12202:21 day 12178:13 12192:20 12200:6 days 12163:20 12166:7 12166:12,13,15 12167:17 12171:17 12174:9 12177:19 12181:13,13 12187:23 12197:3,13 **deadlines** 12192:16 deal 12160:17 12174:19 12182:11 12193:23 12194:12 12203:11 **dealing** 12171:19 12172:12 dealt 12160:16 12181:6 **debate** 12188:5 debated 12194:7 deceased 12167:19,24 decency 12180:9 decide 12193:17 12201:6 decided 12159:7 12171:15 12172:8 deciding 12201:1 **decision** 12164:9 12165:6 12168:21 12169:16 12170:15 12170:20 12171:1,6 12172:16 12183:22 12190:21 12193:21 12194:19 defined 12203:15 **definite** 12168:17 delay 12172:22 12173:10 12176:24 12202:17 delayed 12200:6 deliberately 12188:12 12204:3,6 deliberations 12183:2 delicateness 12183:22 **delivered** 12160:15 12170:13 delivering 12176:24 **department** 12182:18 12185:18 12186:1,19 dependent 12185:7

deputations 12191:11

12191:12

Deputy 12175:14 desirable 12179:3 12204:7 despair 12187:19 details 12175:4 detained 12180:21 12185:8 **determined** 12169:20 didn't 12177:1 12196:11 died 12185:10 difference 12188:1 different 12177:8 12185:24 **difficult** 12168:15 12173:11,13 12193:11 12202:16 dilemma 12197:10 **diplomatic** 12191:12 direction 12198:2 directions 12173:9 directly 12160:22 **disagree** 12188:14 discharge 12178:2 **disclose** 12191:23 12196:1 **disclosed** 12191:21 discussed 12198:20 discussion 12173:25 12175:14 12189:20 12190:9 12191:21 discussions 12175:7 12176:7 12189:18,22 12190:3 **dismissed** 12160:18 12169:2 dispute 12167:18,25 12168:10 12204:8,13 disrespectful 12185:17 disruption 12174:2 **disturbed** 12181:24 division 12165:24 **DMR** 12170:25 documentation 12185:6 doesn't 12187:14 12192:13 12194:23 12198:7,9,21 doing 12158:21 12178:19 don't 12158:17 12166:2 12172:25 12176:2 12181:19 12183:6,20 12184:2 12185:13 12192:18 12195:11 12196:3,18 12197:12 12198:11 12199:18 12200:12 12200:14 12201:8 12202:12,15 12203:15,21 door 12190:13 doors 12181:22,23 **doorstep** 12174:3 12176:16 draft 12173:6 12176:23 **drafting** 12161:7.9 12176:23 12189:13 12197:25 12198:2.5 drag 12196:10 drama 12173:3 drawn 12204:6 due 12158:3 duration 12181:14 duties 12178:2 duty 12177:4,4 E earlier 12162:11

12181:20 12194:21 early 12188:12 ears 12188:3 earth 12198:23 easily 12178:23 easy 12172:21 edit 12160:25 **effect** 12170:5 effectively 12160:16 12163:5,14

effort 12171:18 efforts 12176:22 12185:18 12192:11 12194:9,11 12195:22 12196:13 12199:6 **eight** 12179:15 12191:6

either 12162:5 12186:22 12194:17 elder 12183:24 **embraces** 12179:12

enable 12158:4 12198:17

encourage 12191:8 encouragement

12191:3

engage 12180:3 engine 12193:4 **enquiries** 12162:17

ensure 12174:17

enter 12188:5 **entered** 12193:5

entirely 12172:4

entitled 12165:17

Equally 12167:5 equivocation 12173:17

especially 12163:4 12180:4 12202:5

essence 12192:22

evening 12190:9 event 12172:1

12174:25 12178:18

12201:1 everybody 12181:10

evidence 12160:6

12170:9 12171:24 12172:3 12177:16 12181:4 12184:7

12185:5 12193:10 12204:2

evil 12172:23

evils 12172:21

exact 12175:7 exactly 12176:22

12194:25 12195:4 12199:10 12201:23 **example** 12203:16 excused 12160:7 **exhausted** 12171:23 expect 12180:8 expecting 12180:17,18 expeditious 12183:1 expeditiously 12167:7 12173:9 12198:8

experience 12162:17 12187:13 **explain** 12202:5 **explained** 12162:11 12178:14

explaining 12188:10 **explored** 12166:16 expressing 12159:23 expression 12187:13 12192:17

F

face 12189:15 **faceless** 12180:6 facie 12172:11 **facing** 12188:8 fact 12179:5 12186:3 12193:25 fail 12200:4 **failed** 12187:21 Failing 12195:19 **failure** 12187:19 fair 12170:3 12195:23 fairly 12192:4 faith 12168:15

12183:25 12190:15 fall 12172:7 **families** 12164:11

12167:24 12181:2,12 12181:16 12183:4 12185:1

family 12170:18,20 far 12159:5,17 12201:16

Father 12196:13 favourably 12188:3

fear 12173:17 feel 12185:22

feeling 12183:4 12184:22 fees 12174:13 12205:7

filed 12165:15 **finding** 12167:12 12183:2

finished 12161:22 12184:15,16,19 12187:8

firm 12164:19 12175:19 **first** 12174:7,11

12175:17 12181:15 12182:25 12184:25 12185:19 12188:19

12198:4 firstly 12162:14 12172:14 12189:4

12193:12 Fischer 12169:12.13.14

12170:6 12187:18 fiscus 12194:17

five 12173:22 focus 12189:12

follow 12195:16 **followed** 12198:18

following 12163:3 **foolhardy** 12177:10

footage 12181:17

footages 12185:6 fore 12177:14

forget 12178:6 forgot 12191:1

forum 12164:21 forward 12170:14

12204:2

found 12194:6,17 four 12166:7,12,13,15 12197:13

foyer 12188:11,17 **Friday** 12197:16

12198:7 12199:7 friend 12181:11

12182:12,17 12188:6 12188:21 12191:21

12192:1 12203:16 frivolously 12173:12

fruit 12166:9 12190:5 12190:23 12192:11 12192:24 12197:22

12199:6 full 12199:13

fully 12171:15 12183:3 fund 12175:21 12176:3

12180:24

fundamental 12180:23 12192:22

funded 12181:1,2,13 12182:9,22,23

funder 12191:23 **funding** 12165:18

12166:5,16 12167:5 12167:20 12169:19

12175:5 12181:14 12186:6 12191:24

12192:12 12193:15 12193:18 12194:14

12194:19 12197:4 12198:17,20 12200:4

12204:20 12205:7,8 **further** 12191:24

G

gate 12190:1 gesture 12174:17 getting 12181:7 give 12158:9 12160:6 12160:11 12162:15 12166:21 12168:24 12170:9 12176:21

12177:7 12186:10 12194:18 12197:15 12198:2

given 12161:10

12162:11 12163:4.8 12178:10 12183:22 12185:25 12194:20

12201:5 12202:6,9 12205:9

gives 12173:8

giving 12158:14 12184:21,23 12195:21 12198:1

glare 12195:18

go 12180:21 12181:17 12181:17,23 12186:3 12186:13,16,23

12198:7 12202:8 going 12160:2,3

12161:14 12172:18 12177:18 12178:20 12180:5 12181:6 12184:23 12192:23

12201:7,7 12204:2,9 12204:20 12205:14 12205:15

good 12168:9,15 12183:25 12190:14 12192:17

government 12180:14 12187:21 12190:11 12191:13 12194:3,3

governs 12178:16 **grant** 12179:7,20 granted 12163:14 **granting** 12202:1

grants 12165:21 great 12165:25

12187:17 greatest 12165:18 12196:8

group 12159:9 **guarantee** 12179:13

12195:21

guaranteed 12174:22 Gumbi 12170:9,10

H

half 12158:4 12159:18 12159:19 12188:9,10 halleluiah 12198:10 hand 12160:24 12168:1 12199:8.10 12203:24 handle 12183:23

hands 12173:2 12177:25

happen 12169:4 12177:19,20 12186:5

12190:8 12195:19 happened 12158:17

12161:22 happening 12167:1

12188:24 happens 12161:5 12173:2 12178:6

12202:14

happy 12186:23 12187:17

hasn't 12180:16 haven't 12204:4,5,5,10 head 12168:13 headline 12167:8 headlines 12167:8 hear 12162:14 12173:5 12173:9 12183:20 12184:6

12177:3 12183:15 12198:8 12203:7 hearing 12162:10,18

heard 12160:2,4

12174:9,14 12178:8 12197:16

held 12185:24 help 12190:13 helpful 12192:24

Hemraj 12196:24 12197:1,9 12198:13

12204:16 **Herman** 12161:14 he's 12173:8 12182:13 high 12168:3 12169:19 12170:11 12187:12 12187:14,15,22,25

12191:6,16 12194:18 highest 12181:6,10 12185:23

holiday 12162:20 12163:23 12176:9

home 12183:21 12186:3,3,13,24 12202:8

honour 12204:21,25 hope 12166:7 12189:14 12193:1,4

hopefully 12159:20 hoping 12169:4

horse 12187:12 12191:6.17

horses 12187:14,15,22 hotels 12185:20

12186:20 hour 12188:9,10 Human 12169:11,15,16

12169:22 humanly 12177:5 humbly 12191:9

identify 12166:3 immediately 12186:16 **importance** 12165:25 **important** 12160:18 12162:2 12166:24 12167:4,5 12172:24 12174:17,19 12175:16,24 12180:3 12182:9 12188:24 12189:11 importantly 12174:20 **impression** 12184:19

incidental 12175:2 **Incidentally** 12184:1 **include** 12171:10

included 12189:22,23 **including** 12167:13

12176:7 12181:11

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

inclusive 12170:2
incorrect 12167:9
indicate 12184:13
indicated 12160:20,24
12164:17 12174:22 12182:17 12185:2
12182:17 12185:2
indicating 12181:14
indication 12185:20
12186:17
indulgence 12158:13
12174:5 12179:7,20 infantile 12177:13
influences 12182:14
informal 12162:17
12174:6 12177:16
information 12159:13
12166:4,8 12167:15
informed 12176:8
12184:16
ingenuous 12200:5 injured 12165:12
12167:11,19,22
12168:1 12169:19,25
12185:4,8 12187:11
12205:8
Inquiry 12170:2
12175:22 insensitive 12184:1
inside 12190:1
insofar 12200:2
12201:17
Institute 12182:19
instruct 12182:19
instructed 12158:19 12164:14 12166:6
instruction 12164:19
12170:14
instructions 12159:2
12160:21 12164:13 12164:17 12168:17
12164:17 12168:17
12175:19 12178:9,13
12178:14 12179:11 12179:23 12180:17
12179:23 12180:17 12180:183:3
12186:8 12189:5
12199:3 12201:20
12202:9
integrity 12178:21
intend 12162:10
12165:19
intention 12160:21 interest 12159:8
12199:9
interests 12175:10
interim 12160:19
12175:5 12193:13,15
12193:15,23 12194:6
12194:14,19 12197:4
12197:7 12198:17,20 12200:3 12204:20
12205:6,8
interpret 12159:4
12166:22 12187:6
interpretations
12202:5

interpreter 12166:22
12184:22 12187:6,8
12192:19 interrupt 12161:12
12167:22
interrupting 12166:11
interruption 12161:19
inventive 12200:5 invitation 12187:7
involve 12179:16
involved 12164:20
irrelevant 12196:7
isn't 12167:23 issue 12158:15
12160:13 12168:16
12180:23 12181:21
12190:8 12196:12
12198:20 issues 12174:20,24
12176:12 12181:5
12182:4,11
it's 12158:10,23
12159:1,1 12162:2,20
12163:1 12166:24 12167:22 12171:16
12167:22 12171:16 12171:16 12172:13
12172:21 12173:10
12173:11 12175:24 12176:1 12178:19,23
12170:1 12178:19,23
12187:11 12189:11
12190:6 12194:12
12198:14,25 12200:7 12202:16 12203:21
12202:16 12203:21
I'll 12161:23 12172:14
12174:5,7 12184:6
12198:3 12199:3 I'm 12161:14,19
12166:11,23
12167:21,21
12173:16 12177:18
12180:6 12181:1,14 12182:5,25 12184:14
12184:18,23
12185:15,15 12187:4
12189:19 12190:19
12190:25 12194:23 12199:22 12200:20
12199:22 12200:20 12200:20
12202:23
I've 12171:8 12182:6,7
12183:2 12190:11 12191:2,13 12195:12
12191:2,13 12195:12 12198:22 12199:2
12170.22 12177.2
J
ja 12159:12 12163:23
12202:13 12203:22 jeopardised 12198:8
join 12159:20
joined 12165:20

12187:25 12193:1 judgment 12160:15,16 12160:22,24,24,25 12161:2,6,8 12162:15 12163:2,7 12164:18 12169:18 12170:12 12170:13 12176:6 12177:1,7 12197:25 12201:7 12205:9 July 12158:1 12174:8 12174:21 12175:14 12176:5 12195:7 jump 12174:7 12198:4 junior 12187:18 12190:10 juniors 12181:16 12189:24 jurisprudential 12174:19 justice 12167:14 12168:11 12173:8 12182:21 12185:18 12186:1,19 12198:1
<u>K</u>
kept 12185:20 KGAKA 12171:5 killed 12185:12 kind 12182:2 12201:17 12203:8 knock 12181:23 knocking 12181:22 know 12164:16 12177:19 12180:11 12182:14 12183:5,9 12183:17,18,25 12192:16,22 12195:10,11,11,16 knowing 12196:11 knowledge 12182:3 known 12180:10 knows 12182:4 12195:15

L laced 12195:21 land 12181:7.10 12185:24 largely 12185:7 Lastly 12178:9 late 12158:6 12190:2 lawvers 12158:25 12174:24 12175:1 12180:24 12187:17 lead 12167:18 leaders 12170:9 12171:24 12172:3 12177:16 12181:4 12184:7 12193:11 12204:2 **learned** 12165:19 12176:7 12181:11 12182:12,17 12188:6 12188:21 12191:21 12191:25 12203:16

```
12191:20 12196:16
leg 12193:19
legal 12165:8,17,25
  12166:2,19 12167:3
  12167:25 12168:11
  12169:8,21 12174:11
  12174:13 12175:21
  12176:2,4 12180:2
  12185:2 12187:11,22
  12188:10
lengthy 12166:9
  12168:16,19
lesser 12172:21
letter 12174:5
  12187:10
letters 12173:20,21,22
  12182:20 12195:3
let's 12162:6 12186:13
  12203:15,17
level 12177:16
liability 12175:6
liberty 12195:25
Lieutenant 12170:11
light 12162:5 12169:22
  12184:2 12189:2,17
  12197:2
limited 12202:9
limiting 12193:3
line 12179:4
lines 12174:15
literally 12161:7
litigants 12187:14
litigation 12165:14
  12179:16
lives 12190:12
locked 12190:1
lodge 12162:11
lodged 12162:12
long 12163:4 12180:11
  12184:23 12192:23
longer 12203:18
Lonmin 12164:7
  12172:17
look 12158:25
lose 12163:18,19,20
lost 12165:11 12172:4
  12178:24 12185:21
  12185:22 12200:6
lot 12197:24
love 12183:1 12185:12
loved 12165:11
LRC 12167:8 12174:16
LRC's 12170:3
  12179:24
          M
Madlanga 12171:7,8
Magidiwana's 12194:1
Mahlangu 12159:4
  12166:22
```

main 12168:2

12160:1

majority 12172:15

Major-General

making 12165:3

12176:20 12177:22

12178:12.22 12179:13 12180:13 12180:13 12187:25 mandate 12176:17 12202:12 **Marikana** 12175:22 **MASEVHE** 12170:19 materialise 12197:13 matter 12163:1,2 12165:25 12166:14 12168:15 12170:14 12171:19,20 12172:12 12173:9,16 12173:19 12175:15 12176:15 12178:5 12191:3,5,11,16 12194:7,9 12198:16 12201:2 12203:10 12204:7 12205:4,11 matters 12197:4 mean 12166:12 12172:3 12185:22 12187:14 12200:7 means 12161:4 12185:3 12204:10 meant 12183:18 media 12201:17 meeting 12166:3 12168:20 12197:21 members 12168:22 mention 12191:12 12195:14 12196:11 mentioned 12190:4,10 12191:23 merely 12164:16 12169:20 12175:1 merits 12185:15 12194:20 message 12161:13 midnight 12197:21 minded 12191:8 12201:21 mindful 12173:9 miners 12169:20,25 mineworkers 12185:11 **minimising** 12173:10 minimum 12174:2 Minister 12168:11 12173:20 12174:11 12175:13,18 12182:21 12195:13 minutes 12158:14 12161:15 12188:20 12189:9 miracle 12177:18 miracles 12177:20 misapprehension 12204:11 misconstrued 12201:22 mishap 12189:25 mislead 12204:1 misunderstanding 12200:23 mitigate 12173:24

joined 12165:20

judge 12160:23

12165:17,19 12169:2

12175:15 12177:6

joy 12198:4

leave 12165:21

Mogale 12171:6

moment 12193:12

12192:10.13

opposing 12179:6

opposition 12202:22

optimism 12178:4

order 12160:18,19

orderly 12178:19

outside 12195:18

overture 12178:1

overtures 12190:11

12196:12

12197:12

12166:9 12168:9,24

12188:12 12205:11

organisation 12191:25

12194:18 12196:6,9

12197:19

12204:14

Monene 12170:18,20
money 12176:2
12179:16 12186:20
12194:16
month 12193:14,16
12198:18
months 12173:22
12179:15 12191:6,15
morning 12160:6
12183:6,15 12188:9
12188:19 12189:18
12189:21,25 12190:4
12204:3
move 12160:10
12161:23 12164:20 12179:10,10
12179:10,10
12202:10
moved 12182:7,7
Mpofu 12158:6,12
12159:6,11,16,23
12160:8,9 12161:13
12161:16,20,21
12162:7,16,24
12163:9,12,16,19,23
12168:2 12172:11 13
12182:17 12188:11
12168:2 12172:11,13 12182:17 12188:11 12188:12,15,18
12189:1,3 12190:24
12190:25 12192:3,4
12194:15,22 12196:2
12196:7,21 12197:1,8 12198:22 12199:16
12198:22 12199:16
12199:24 12200:8,11
12200:14,17,20,23,25
12201:13 12202:25
12203:9,12 12204:12
12204:15,21,24
mustn't 12188:23
N
10100-17

n 12192:17 name 12183:4 12191:23,25 12196:6 12196:9,11 nameless 12180:6 names 12190:13 12191:12 12196:3 nature 12158:8 12162:1 12164:18 12175:8 nebulous 12180:5 necessary 12158:10,20 12160:5 12171:14 12175:3,8 12188:15 12193:18 12194:12 12194:13 12197:6 12198:1 necessity 12171:19 need 12183:6,8,20 12191:3 12192:11 12196:3 12203:11 needed 12182:22 needs 12197:24

negotiations 12168:25

neither 12196:12

ARCHIVE

never 12177:19

ook 12192:17

open-minded 12180:2

opportunity 12166:22

12185:25 12188:22

opponent 12176:8

opponents 12200:5

12168:14,24

12184:22,23

12201:14

oppose 12204:5

opposed 12177:21

```
owe 12195:9
owns 12178:17
o'clock 12205:14
          P
paid 12175:5
pains 12196:10
papers 12161:8,9
  12165:16 12173:7
  12176:23,24 12178:3
  12198:21
paragraph 12174:7
parallel 12197:24
parameters 12175:8
pardon 12187:5
part 12160:17,17
  12170:1 12172:2
  12174:14 12175:6
  12194:2,25
participate 12174:23
participated 12165:15
participating 12165:1
particular 12159:7
  12172:16 12187:19
  12188:7 12196:9
particularly 12167:11
  12179:5
parties 12158:9
  12160:3,5 12162:4
  12163:25 12164:1
  12169:23 12170:7.23
  12172:15.24
  12173:13,15
  12174:18 12175:3,10
  12176:8,13,25
  12177:17 12178:4
  12179:2 12183:8
  12188:4 12190:20
  12197:10
parts 12160:25
party 12173:16,18
  12179:6
pause 12198:6,7
pay 12174:13
pending 12162:9
  12174:14 12186:22
  12193:25
people 12158:4,16
  12159:8 12165:10
```

```
12167:11.11.19.23.24
  12168:1 12173:3
  12178:20 12180:6
  12182:1 12183:9,20
  12187:11,15
  12189:22 12191:14
  12192:16,22 12194:4
  12195:9,10,24
  12199:4
people's 12191:12
period 12168:20
  12174:14 12186:4
  12189:8 12193:3
permanent 12193:22
person 12182:25
personal 12188:7
personalise 12188:23
persons 12159:14
  12165:11 12166:1
  12193:2 12205:8
physically 12185:4
place 12165:10 12167:7
  12168:25 12178:8
  12185:19 12188:8,22
  12189:11,21,22
  12191:2
placed 12178:4
  12197:10
plea 12173:5
please 12161:19
  12184:19
pleased 12159:3
plenty 12172:1
point 12176:20
  12185:14 12190:18
  12194:16 12198:12
  12199:19 12200:4
points 12171:23
  12184:24
political 12175:9
portray 12181:25
portrayed 12184:2
  12191:6
portrays 12197:9
position 12162:14
  12172:19 12178:10
  12179:24 12181:9,9
  12182:24 12183:10
  12185:6 12189:12
  12195:8,11,20
  12202:13,16 12203:4
  12203:15 12204:3,10
positive 12189:4
possibilities 12166:15
  12190:22
possibility 12166:5
  12167:16,16
  12180:19,20
  12185:23 12196:15
  12196:20 12203:3
  12205:5,6
possible 12161:4
  12167:7 12171:14,16
  12177:6 12178:3
  12189:10 12198:25
  12204:7
```

```
possibly 12160:2
postpone 12163:6,12
postponement
  12160:14 12162:8
  12164:21,25 12166:9
  12166:14 12168:16
  12168:19,23 12171:9
  12171:15,20 12172:7
  12176:21 12177:12
  12179:21 12188:13
  12188:15 12189:8
  12190:18 12192:10
  12192:13 12193:17
  12194:13 12199:4,11
  12201:5 12202:2,24
  12204:4,8,13
postponements
  12192:23
posture 12182:5
potential 12187:13
power 12169:24
  12173:1 12181:3
practical 12201:17
practicalities 12176:10
prayer 12194:25
precedent 12187:24
preclude 12169:19
  12198:21
predicament 12181:21
preliminaries 12161:23
premised 12180:4
preparation 12199:18
prepare 12174:18
  12178:3 12181:18
  12200:16
prepared 12160:23
  12173:17 12190:21
  12199:12 12205:1
presence 12183:8
present 12158:9
  12202:11
presents 12177:10
President 12168:11
  12173:21 12174:10
  12175:13,15,17
  12195:13
pressure 12161:1
  12173:6 12177:2,7
Pretoria 12187:25
  12193:1
prevail 12178:15
  12183:23
prevailing 12182:21
prevalent 12180:3
previous 12162:17
  12177:3
prima 12172:11
principal 12194:7
principled 12185:6
prior 12175:14
privately 12162:1
probabilities 12168:21
  12190:22
probability 12167:16
  12180:19 12190:7
probably 12180:20
```

right 12162:24

problem 12168:25
12172:6 12178:18
12187:23 12188:8
12193:24 12201:19
procedure 12170:3
procedures 12178:17
proceed 12158:11
12159:5 12161:19
12162:5 12184:20
12193:20 12198:15
proceeding 12198:21
proceedings 12158:1
12159:21 12162:9
12182:6 12184:4
process 12166:2
12170:1 12173:11 12176:11 12198:18
processes 12176:11 professional 12177:4
professionals 12177.4
12197:20
promised 12186:12
promises 12167:17
proper 12161:24
properly 12182:1
proposal 12171:25
12172:4 12174:8,9
12175:16,19
propose 12158:7
12163:25
proposing 12163:6
protects 12178:21
provide 12167:20
provincial 12165:17,24
provisional 12175:21
pry 12196:17
public 12162:20
12163:23 12175:10
12179:1 12181:24
12182:12,13,24
12189:20
publicised 12178:11 publicly 12168:12
purported 12160:16
purposes 12178:12
12198:14
pursue 12179:14
12190:17 12197:23
12199:9
pursued 12194:10,11
pursuing 12197:17
12199:8
put 12161:1 12177:2,7
12179:8 12182:24
12184:3 12192:16
12196:23 12198:6
12202:15 12203:5
Q
quarter 12189:7
question 12171:9,10
12186:6 12189:17
12192:6 12194:5,13 12194:23 12196:25

```
questions 12160:4
quietly 12191:11
quite 12163:1 12182:25
  12186:2,23
quo 12164:17
          R
radio 12183:16
raise 12174:24 12200:3
raised 12174:20
  12181:21 12182:11
  12203:23
reach 12169:24
  12171:23
react 12194:15
reaction 12158:10
read 12174:5 12195:3,5
  12195:12
ready 12186:2
  12189:10
realise 12158:17
really 12159:24
  12173:2 12178:21
  12179:6 12185:13
  12187:23 12200:10
  12201:11,14 12202:7
reason 12158:24
  12196:11 12201:21
reasonable 12174:13
  12205:6
reasonably 12162:18
reasoning 12185:16
reasons 12158:6
  12168:5 12179:7,8
  12201:5
recalcitrant 12181:25
received 12161:13
  12175:18
receiving 12167:25
recess 12174:1 12186:4
reconvene 12177:17
record 12165:10
  12167:7 12179:13
  12181:1 12186:25
  12188:9,23 12189:11
  12191:2
records 12181:17
referred 12159:14
  12189:13 12194:21
refers 12175:15
regard 12164:6
  12170:16
register 12201:20
reject 12195:1
rejected 12195:6
relation 12160:4
  12165:14 12166:16
relatives 12185:10
relaxed 12177:1
relevance 12188:7
relevant 12160:13
relief 12160:19 12194:2
relocation 12173:23
reluctantly 12178:23
remain 12170:2,2
remaining 12178:20
```

12186:18 remember 12177:12 12187:19 remind 12169:1 **reminded** 12187:18 renew 12187:8 12201:9 renewed 12189:5 repeat 12165:23 12201:18 reply 12184:6 12203:8 replying 12175:23 report 12160:12 reported 12160:14 12183:5 represent 12180:25 representation 12165:18 12175:21 12176:4 12193:19 representations 12174:7 representative 12169:11 12170:7,17 12170:23 representatives 12159:11 12162:3 12167:19,23 12187:11,22 12189:24 12195:13 represented 12164:1 12168:2 12185:12,13 representing 12167:11 12168:8 12176:8 12180:24 request 12166:18 **required** 12175:4 reserve 12201:7 **resolution** 12186:23 resolve 12171:19 resolved 12172:6,8 12173:19 12204:8 resort 12202:18 resound 12188:3 resources 12165:8 12166:1,19 12167:3 12169:9 12181:8 12188:10 respect 12165:19 12167:6 12176:1 12180:8 12196:8 respond 12176:12 **respondent** 12175:17 12175:18 respondents 12164:16 12168:2,7,10 12174:12 12187:10 respondent's 12174:16 **response** 12172:14 12173:22 12175:11 12175:12 responsive 12170:2 rest 12191:9 resumes 12158:2 12161:17,18 12184:9 12184:10 resumption 12174:21 ride 12187:14

12181:22 12182:20 12200:22 Rights 12169:11,15,16 12169:22 12182:19 room 12173:18 12191:10 round 12162:21 rule 12205:1 ruling 12164:6 rumour 12190:16,16 run 12189:10 12193:4 running 12189:9 saddened 12187:9 sake 12188:14 **sameness** 12181:8 **SAPS** 12164:3 12172:17 12180:24 satisfactory 12172:11 12186:23 **Saturday** 12166:3 save 12159:23 12175:2 12175:5 saw 12183:5 12188:20 **saying** 12159:18 12166:17 12177:8 12183:7 12185:15 12189:6 12190:17 12194:25 12195:2,4 12197:18,18,19,19 12198:25 12199:2 12201:24 12203:13 says 12177:22 12178:6 12180:23 12181:24 12183:25 12202:23 12203:17 SC 12164:5,12 12165:5 12165:9 12166:18,23 12167:2 12168:4 12169:7 12171:8,13 12179:19 12183:13 12183:17 12184:12 12184:17,21 12187:3 12187:9 12192:7,15 12192:21 12193:9 12203:25 schizophrenic 12199:8 **Schubert** 12161:13 scouts 12205:1 scout's 12204:25 scraping 12200:10 second 12174:11 12175:18 12193:19 secondly 12162:15 12193:19 see 12158:10 12159:10 12162:6 12163:13 12170:4,13 12185:13 12188:19 12189:1 12192:11 seek 12198:25 12199:4 12199:11 **seeking** 12194:1,2 seeks 12181:23

Page 6 seen 12179:1 12202:16 self-evident 12204:17 Semenva 12164:2.5 12203:16 senior 12168:8 12181:13 12191:13 sense 12170:5 12178:15 12183:19 sensible 12205:2 sensibly 12172:19 sent 12191:11 separately 12174:12 seriously 12168:23 12180:14 settle 12168:14 12188:1 12191:3,4,8,10,15 settled 12173:16 12176:15 settlement 12167:18 12168:10 12193:4 seven 12180:24 **shaking** 12168:13 **share** 12180:12 **short** 12168:23 **shorten** 12173:5 **shouldn't** 12204:1 **show** 12191:13 **SHOZI** 12164:8 **Shulumu** 12170:11 **shuttling** 12177:23 **side** 12165:10,13,14,22 12195:17 12201:19 sides 12168:15 12174:20 silk 12181:16 similar 12182:20 12188:2 simply 12161:8 12177:22 12184:2 12189:12 12195:2 12202:7 Sir 12192:7 sit 12160:7 12163:14 12197:11 12199:10 sitting 12163:6,21 12180:9 12188:21 **situation** 12169:17 12173:1,13,24 12193:12 12202:1 12203:19,19 skewed 12179:1 small 12191:1,22 SMSes 12191:13 Socio-Economic 12182:19 solution 12169:24 12177:10,14 12178:6 12179:15 12186:11 12186:12,15,17 12189:7 12193:11 12194:6 12198:5 12202:3 solve 12168:25 12187:23 solves 12193:24 somebody 12178:6

12194:23 12196:25

12198:23 12199:1

12201:1

121911-1218-3 12191-1218-5 12181-5 121					Page
soon 121614-12179:128-3 atatement 12188:3-2 2188611 12189-10 statesman 12188:3-2 12189-1212190:14 they'd 12200:10 12209:15 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:22 12195:23 12189:1212196:22 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12195:23 12188-12195:17 12188-12195:17 12188-12195:17 12188-12195:17 1	12190:12 13	12192.5	12180-16 12182-2	12204:13	12193:6 12200:25
12175.12178.3 statements 12188.6 12188.6 12188.12185.0 12186.11 12185.12 13185.0 12186.11 12195.17 12195.12 12					
12186:11 12189-10 statesman 12183:24 storpy 1216:12.2 storpy 1216:12.2 storpy 1216:12.2 storpy 1216:12.2 storpy 1216:12.3 storpy 1216:13.3 storpy 1					
					· ·
sorry 1216:12,19 1216:611,213 1216:611,213 1216:611,213 1218:614,14.18 121874,4 12190:25 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:14 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:15 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:16 12191:12198:19 121918:12198:19 1219					
12166:11.23 step 12174:17 12175:9 taken 12175:2 12198:2424 taken 12175:2 12198:1414.1418 taken 12199:20 tale 12199:10 tale 12199:10 tale 12199:10 tale 12198:10 tale 12198:11 tale 12186:1 t					
12167-21.22 1218-14 1418 12187-34 12190-25 1218-15 12186-15 1218-15	sorry 12161:12,19				12188:17 12195:24
12184:14,14,18 12187:19 12187:19 12188:20 12197:19 12187:19 12188:20 12197:19 12188:19 121	12166:11,23	step 12174:17 12175:9	taken 12173:2		tomorrow 12161:5
12187.4, 12190.15 12197.4 12197.6 1219	12167:21,22	stood 12199:20	12180:15 12186:10	things 12173:4	12176:19 12178:5,7
12191:112198:11 strangers 12166:2 streauously 12165:16 streauously 12165:23 streauously 12165:16 streauously 12165:20 streauously 12165:16 stre	12184:14,14,18	stop 12199:13	12186:15,17,19	12178:19 12183:20	12192:20 12197:22
12191:112198:11 strangers 12166:2 streauously 12165:16 streauously 12165:23 streauously 12165:16 streauously 12165:20 streauously 12165:16 stre	12187:4,4 12190:25		12189:15 12200:4	12185:5 12186:3,5	tonight 12168:20
sort 12195:14 12198:6 12197-6 12197-6 12197-6 12197-7				•	
		C			
12197-6 submissions 12165-3 12165-23 12183-23 12165-23 12165-23 12183-23 12165-23 121					
		•	C		
12162-23 t2183-23 sounds 12205-2 sounds 12205-15 sounds 12205-2					
sought 1219418,25 Cauch 12169:15 taxpayers 12186:20 think 12159:41 [216:22] true 12203:1 1216:6:1 true 12203:1 1216:8:1 1216:8:1 1218:10:1 1218:8:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:1 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 1218:9:2 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>O</td><td>-</td><td></td></t<>			O	-	
sounds 12205:2 submitt 12165:18 submitt 12165:2 submitted 1218:120 space 12194:6 submitted 1218:20 submitted					
tam 12169:15 spanner 12184:3 space 12194:6 spanner 12184:3 space 12194:6 spanner 12184:3 space 12194:6 spanner 12184:3 subsequently 12184:16 subsequently 12184:16 subsequently 12184:16 substantial 12163:1 substantial 1	_				
			, ,		
spanner 12184-3 subspoema 12183-9 subsequently 12184-16 substantial 12163-1 substant		submitted 12181:20	team 12189:23	12172:18,25	trustees 12166:1,6,20
speak 1216:14 substantial 1216:1 substantial 1216:2 speed 12176:1 succeed 12189:1 succeed 12199:2 sufficient 12198:2 suggest 1216:2 speed 12176:10 12198:1 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12189:18 sugg	space 12194:6		12204:18	12178:21 12181:19	12168:18 12180:14
speak 1216:14 substantial 1216:1 substantial 1216:2 speed 12176:1 succeed 12189:1 succeed 12199:2 sufficient 12198:2 suggest 1216:2 speed 12176:10 12198:1 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12158:18 suggested 12189:18 sugg	spanner 12184:3	subpoena 12183:9	technology 12185:5	12184:5 12188:2	12180:20
12186.6 12183-12	_			12189:4,11 12193:22	trusting 12202:2
2187-7 12188-22 specific 12162-21 12162-21 12162-21 12195-21	-				
12175:4 12178:12 12195:22 12195:13 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 12196:15 12196:14 1				-	
12190:5 12199:3 suggest 12162:6 terms 12179:12 12201:18 third 12174:11 12190:8 12187:20 12201:23 third 12174:11 12190:8 12187:20 12201:23 trying 1216:13,5 trying 12	_				
specifically 12174:22 suggest 12162:6 terms 12179:12 12201:18 trying 12176:10 121876:10 12187:15 thought 12158:14,20 12187:16 12201:23 12181:15 thought 12158:14,20 12187:18 12198:18 12198:18 12181:15 thought 12158:14,20 12187:18 12187:			· ·		
Testage 12189:16 12200:13 12159:12 12169:19 12182:12160:91 12182:12160:11 12182:12160:1218 12159:12 12160:12160:13 12182:12160:13 1216					
spend 12176:22 spent 12188:9 spoke 12168:8 spoke 12195:12 spoke 12195:12 spoke 12195:12 spoke 12168:8 spoke 12168:8 spoke 12168:8 spoke 12168:8 spokes 12188:15 12183:18 suggesting 12202:17,18 stage 12158:11 stage 12158:11 stage 12158:14 support 12164:14,25 support 12164:14,25 support 12164:14,25 support 12164:14,25 support 12165:12 support 12164:14,25 stage 12189:15 stade 12197:35 stade 12189:35 support 12165:14 stage 12189:15 stade 12197:35 stade 12189:35 spokes 12189:25 stade 12165:04 spokes 12189:31 stade 12193:13 spokes 12189:25 spokes 12189:3 spokes 12189:4	_				
spent 12188:9 12174:15 12192:25 12161:16,21 12162:7 three 12163:15,16,19 turns 12162:6 12198:3 turns 12162:14 turns 12162:6 12198:3 turns 12162:6 12198:3 turns 12162:6 12198:3 turns 12162:6 12198:3 turns 12162:6 12182:1 turns 12162:6 1218:3 turns 12162:4			· ·		•
Spoke 12195: 12 12198: 14, 16 12163: 25 12164: 79 12166: 7, 12, 13, 15 12168: 7, 12168: 8 12201: 18 12164: 10, 12, 22, 24 12168: 7, 10 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 10, 124 12179: 24 12169: 10, 124 12179: 24 12169: 10, 124 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 24 12169: 12178: 24 12179: 12169: 15 12178: 12179: 12179: 12189: 15 12179: 12169: 12179: 12189: 15 12179: 12169: 12179: 12189: 15 12179: 12169: 12179: 12189: 15 12179: 12169: 12179: 12189: 15 12179: 12169: 12179: 12189: 15 12169: 12169: 12199: 12169: 12199: 12169: 12199: 12169: 12199: 12169	_				
Spokem 12168:8	spent 12188:9	12174:15 12192:25	12161:16,21 12162:7	three 12163:15,16,19	turns 12162:6 12198:3
spokesman 12183:5,15 12183:18 suggestion 12202:17,18 12183:18 suggestion 12170:4 12169:10,14 12170:5 12177:21,22 12170:6,22 12171:2,5 12172:1,5 12176:18 12177:18 12179:12 12178:22 12179:9,12 12177:10,12 12172:1,5 12176:18 12179:11 12196:23 12203:11 stand 12166:14 support 12164:14,25 12179:24 12182:15 12169:20 12166:20 12166:20 12166:20 12166:20 12172:4 12172:4 12172:4 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:24 12179:3 1217	spoke 12195:12	12198:14,16	12163:25 12164:7,9	12166:7,12,13,15	two 12165:16 12172:21
12183:18 suggestion 12170:4 12169:10,14 12170:5 12168:24 12170:4 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,13 12160:21,23 12164:2 suggestions 12180:5 suitable 12193:13 summary 12172:4 sumprive 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 12165:20 12166:20 12169:24 12199:34 12199:14 12199:24 12199:24 12199:24 12199:24 12199:25 12199:24 12199:25 12199:25 12199:25 12199:25 12199:1	spoken 12168:8	12201:18	12164:10,12,22,24	12168:7,10 12178:24	12181:16 12184:24
12183:18 suggestion 12170:4 12169:10,14 12170:5 12168:24 12170:4 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,12 12177:12,13 12160:21,23 12164:2 suggestions 12180:5 suitable 12193:13 summary 12172:4 sumprive 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 supervise 12202:12 12165:20 12166:20 12169:24 12199:34 12199:14 12199:24 12199:24 12199:24 12199:24 12199:25 12199:24 12199:25 12199:25 12199:25 12199:25 12199:1		suggesting 12202:17,18	12165:4,5,7 12169:5	12178:24 12179:22	12190:10 12201:15
squeezed 12197:15 I 2177:21,22 12176:62 2 12171:2,5 12166:24 2171:45 two-stage 12180:4 two-stage 12180:4 types 12179:2 types 12179:2 types 12180:4 types 12190:2 types 12190:2 types 12180:4 types 12190:2 types 12179:2 types 12180:1 types 12179:2 types 12180:1 types 12180:1 types 12179:2 types 12180:1 types 12180:1 types 12179:2 types 12179:2 types 12199:2 types 12199:2	_			Thursday 12160:15	twofold 12193:12
stage 12158:11 12178:22 12179:9,12 12171:7,10,12 12172:1,5 12176:18 types 12179:2 types 12179:2 typically 12159:17 12160:21,23 12164:2 suggestions 12180:5 suitable 12193:13 12179:17 12184:12 12179:17 12184:12 12179:17 12184:12 typically 12159:17 12179:11 12196:23 summary 12172:4 12187:1 12189:3 12192:12 12193:3 12199:12 12193:3 U unanimously 12205:15 stages 12189:23 support 12164:14,25 12200:24 12201:13 12199:5,6,14 12201:8 12199:55,6,14 12201:8 12186:18 12179:24 12182:15 12165:20 12166:20 12202:25 12203:1 12200:24 12202:20 12200:24 12200:4 12200:24 12202:20 12200:9,22 12202:20 12186:18 12186:18 12199:20 12179:24 12182:15 12179:20 12204:5 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12161:12 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12161:12 12159:18 12161:12 12159:18 12161:12 12166:25 12167:1,23 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:34 12192:9 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12161:12 12166:12 12174:18 12179:17			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
12160:21,23 12164:2 suggestions 12180:5 12172:9,10,15 12177:11,24 12178:7 12179:11 12196:23 12179:11 12196:23 summary 12172:4 12182:13 12190:24 12192:12 12193:3 12192:12 12193:3 12192:12 12193:3 12194:9,12 12195:19 unanimously 12205:15 uncomfortable 12171:25 12172:5 12166:20 12166:20 12202:25 12203:1 tlanks 12164:8 12172:4 12182:15 12168:18 12169:18 12172:14 12173:13,14 tlanks 12164:8 12172:4 12173:13,14 tlanks 12200:16 12190:20 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:11 12163:14 12173:13 14 tlanks 12200:16 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:8 12193:19 12193:19 12173:19 12193:19					
12175:4 12177:18 212179:11 12196:23 212197:13 212196:13 212197:13 212196:14 212196:14	S				
12179:11 12196:23 summary 12172:4 sun 12176:14 12189:3 12192:12 12193:3 12192:12 12193:15 12194:9;12 12195:19 12194:9;12 12195:19 12194:9;12 12195:19 12197:12;12 12199:1 12197:12;12 12199:1 12197:12;12 12199:1 12197:12;12 12199:1 12197:12;12 12199:1 12197:25;12 12172:5 12165:20 12166:20 12200:24 12201:3 12200:24 12202:20 12165:20 12166:20 12202:25 12203:1 12201:9,22 12202:20 12166:28 12170:3 12171:24 12172:16 12190:23 12172:26 12190:23 12172:4 12173:13,14 12179:20 12204:5 12179:20 12204:5 12159:18 12161:10 12159:18 12160:12 12163:18 12172:3 12193:29 12193:20 12193:21 12193:2 12163:18 12172:3 12193:29 12193:21 12193:21 12179:17 12180:11 12179:16 12199:16 12179:17 12183:16 12191:16 12199:17 12199:16 12199:22 12196:21 12197:16 12199:22 12197:18 12199:19 12200:19 12197:16 12197:16 12199:16 12199:22 12197:18 12199:22 12197:18 12199:22 12197:18 12199:22 12197:18 12199:22 12197:18 12199:22 12197:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12188:16 12191:16 12188:16 12191:16 12188:16 12191:16 12188:16 12191:18 12188:18 12188:16 12188:16 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12188:16 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:18 12199:28 12188:16 12192:18 12188:18 12199:28 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12192:18 12188:16 12188:18 12188:16 12188:18 12188:16 12188:16 12188:16 12188:16 12188:16 1219					typicany 12139.17
12203:11 stages 12189:23 supervise 12202:12 stages 12189:23 supervise 12202:12 stages 12182:15 12165:20 12166:20 12165:20 12166:20 12165:20 12166:20 12169:25 12168:18 12169:18 12202:25 12203:1 12202:21 12202:15 122				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
stages 12189:23 support 12164:14,25 12193:6 12197:8 12197:12,12 12199:1 uncomfortable 12171:25 12172:5 12165:20 12166:20 12200:24 12201:3 12219:5,6,14 12201:8 12186:18 12179:24 12182:15 12168:18 12169:18 12200:225 12203:1 12201:9,22 12202:20 12201:9,22 12202:20 12194:9 12201:2 12170:3 12171:24 12172:4 12173:13,14 thanks 12164:8 12202:23 12205:4,12 12166:25 12167:1,23 standing 12197:3 12179:0 12204:5 12199:10 till 12172:5 12166:25 12167:1,23 stands 12200:16 12190:20 12199:10 12199:8 12166:10 12159:8 12160:12 12182:21 12183:3,3 stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12175:17,18,25 12176:1 12181:9 12176:1 12181:9 12176:1 12181:9 12199:17 12190:19 12199:17 12187:14 12177:18 12199:17 12187:14 12177:18 12199:22 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:16 12197:14 12199:17 12186:16 12197:14 12199:19 12199:19 12187:19 12196:18 12199:19 12199:19 12199:19 12199:19 12199:19 12199:19 12183:11 12202:13 12186:19 12199:19 <		•			
stand 12166:14 support 12164:14,25 12200:24 12201:13 12199:5,6,14 12201:8 12186:18 12186:18 12171:25 12172:5 12165:20 12166:20 12162:20 12166:20 12202:25 12203:1 12201:9,22 12202:20 12163:21,24 12163:22,24 12163:22,24 12179:20 1220:23 12205:4,12 12163:22,24 12162:223 12205:4,12 12166:25 12167:1,23 12172:16 12190:23 12172:16 12190:23 12172:5 12166:25 12167:1,23 12172:16 12190:23 12172:15 12158:18 1216:10 12159:18 1216:10 12159:18 1216:10 12159:18 1216:10 12159:18 1216:12 12163:18 12172:3 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12183:24 12192:9 12199:19 12163:1 12175:17,18,25 12175:17,18,25 12176:12181:9 12176:12181:9 12176:121818:9 12179:17 12180:11 12186:9 12188:19 12199:19 12200:19 12185:16 12191:16 12199:17 12186:11 12190:20 1214:23 12197:18 12199:24 12197:14,15 12198:2 12197:14,15 12198:2 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:13 12192:11 1299:14 12192:21 12196:18 12192:11 12199:14 12109:19 12199:19 12199:19 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td>,</td> <td>•</td> <td></td>			,	•	
12171:25 12172:5	O			-	
12179:24 12182:15 12168:18 12169:18 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:24 12170:3 12171:4 12170:3 12171:4 12170:3 12171:4 12170:3 12171:4 12170:3 12170:4 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12163:16 12173:12 12170:3 12170:4 12170:15 12170:1 12181:9 12170:1 12180:11 12190:10 12					
12194:9 12201:2 12170:3 12171:24 12172:16 12190:23 till 12172:5 12166:25 12167:1,23 12190:20:11 12190:20 12161:11 12162:24 12163:18 12172:3 12182:21 12183:3,3 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:3,3 12182:21 12183:3,3 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 1218:1 12182:21 12183:3,3 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12183:1 12182:21 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12182:1 12					
12202:21 12205:4 12172:4 12173:13,14 that's 12158:5 time 12158:18 12159:2 12182:21 12183:3,3 standing 12197:3 12179:20 12204:5 supported 12181:12 12159:18 12161:10 12159:8 12160:12 12183:24 12192:9 stands 12200:16 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:18 12199:19 12200:19 stand-down 12170:4 supporting 12165:1 12172:15 12176:1 12181:9 12179:17 12180:11 12200:22 12201:4 start 12158:15 12199:16 suppose 12161:4 suppose 12161:4 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:9 12188:19 12202:15,20 understanding start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12199:22 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12199:19 1290:19 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12200:18,20 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 understood 12199:22 starting 12158:6 12162:19 12163:3 12162:19 12163:3 12162:19 12163:3 12178:10 12195:8 12178:10 12195:8 State 12169:21 12174:4 12186:23 12178:10 12195:8 12179:10 12195:8 12178:11 12202:13 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12<				· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	The state of the s
standing 12179:3 12179:20 12204:5 12159:18 12161:10 12159:8 12160:12 12159:8 12160:12 1218:24 12192:9 12198:19 supported 12181:12 12161:11 12162:24 12163:18 12172:3 12196:5 12198:11 12205:11 supporting 12155:1 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:18 12199:19 12200:19 12171:10 12199:16 supporting 12161:1 12175:17,18,25 12176:2 12178:7 12200:22 12201:4 12171:10 12199:16 suppose 12161:4 12176:1 12181:9 12179:17 12180:11 12200:22 12201:4 12199:17 sure 12174:1 12177:18 12186:9 12188:19 12186:9 12188:19 12192:21 12196:18 12192:21 12196:18 12192:21 12196:18 12192:21 12196:18 12192:21 12196:18 12192:14 12202:2,21 12198:2 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12198:7 12199:9,14 12198:7 12199:9,14 12202:13 12203:10 12201:18 12186:54,5 12203:19 12204:18 12203:19 12204:18 12203:19 12204:18 12179:10 12195:8 12185:11 12202:13 12185:11 12202:13 12185:11 12202:13 12185:11 12202:13 12185:12 1236:4 12185:16 12191:10 <td< td=""><td></td><td>12170:3 12171:24</td><td>12172:16 12190:23</td><td></td><td></td></td<>		12170:3 12171:24	12172:16 12190:23		
12198:19 supported 12181:12 12161:11 12162:24 12163:18 12172:3 12196:5 12198:11 stands 12200:16 12205:11 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:18 12199:19 12200:19 stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12176:1 12181:9 12179:17 12180:11 12200:22 12201:4 12199:17 suppose 12161:4 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:9 12188:19 12190:20 12194:23 12190:20 12194:23 12199:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12201:18 12199:22 12199:22 12197:18 12199:24 12200:18 12201:18 12199:22 12186:5 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 12203:19 12204:18 12175:14 12186:54,5 12186:12184:24 12185:16 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:15 12175:15 121775:18 12190:12 12175:14 12175:15 <t< td=""><td>12202:21 12205:4</td><td>12172:4 12173:13,14</td><td>that's 12158:5</td><td>time 12158:18 12159:2</td><td>12182:21 12183:3,3</td></t<>	12202:21 12205:4	12172:4 12173:13,14	that's 12158:5	time 12158:18 12159:2	12182:21 12183:3,3
12198:19 supported 12181:12 12161:11 12162:24 12163:18 12172:3 12196:5 12198:11 stands 12200:16 12205:11 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:18 12199:19 12200:19 stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12176:1 12181:9 12179:17 12180:11 12200:22 12201:4 12199:17 suppose 12161:4 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:9 12188:19 12190:20 12194:23 12190:20 12194:23 12199:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12200:18,20 12201:18 12199:22 12199:22 12197:18 12199:24 12200:18 12201:18 12199:22 12186:5 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 12203:19 12204:18 12175:14 12186:54,5 12186:12184:24 12185:16 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:14 12175:15 12175:15 121775:18 12190:12 12175:14 12175:15 <t< td=""><td>standing 12197:3</td><td>12179:20 12204:5</td><td>12159:18 12161:10</td><td>12159:8 12160:12</td><td></td></t<>	standing 12197:3	12179:20 12204:5	12159:18 12161:10	12159:8 12160:12	
stands 12200:16 12190:20 12163:16 12173:12 12173:6 12174:18 12199:19 12200:19 stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12176:1 12181:9 12176:2 12178:7 12202:15,20 12199:17 suppose 12161:4 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:9 12186:9 12188:19 12190:20 12190:19 start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12199:22 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 understood 12199:22 12186:5 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 undecaded 12158:16 12189:8 T 12203:19 12204:18 thereabouts 12163:3 thereon 12162:15 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12199:24 1218:2 1218:2 1218:2 12203:19 12202:13 12203:10 12203:19 12202:13 12203:10 12202:13 12202:13 12202:13 12202:13 12202:13 12202:14 12202:13 12202:13 12202:13 12178:10:12 <th< td=""><td>_</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td>12196:5 12198:11</td></th<>	_				12196:5 12198:11
12205:11 supporting 12165:1 12175:17,18,25 12176:22 12178:7 12200:22 12201:4 stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12176:1 12181:9 12179:17 12180:11 12202:15,20 12199:17 sure 12174:1 12177:18 12185:16 12191:16 12192:21 12196:18 12172:19 12190:19 start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 12201:18 understood 12199:22 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12203:19 12204:18 12201:18 Tip 12165:4,5 understood 12199:22 starting 12158:6 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 understood 12199:22 starting 12163:3 12162:19 12163:3 thereabouts 12163:3 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 12189:8 T there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12168:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 121					
stand-down 12170:4 12172:15 12176:1 1218:9 12179:17 12180:11 12202:15,20 12199:17 sure 12174:1 12177:18 12185:16 12191:16 12186:9 12186:9 12188:19 understanding start 12158:15 12159:18 12190:20 12194:23 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 understood 12199:22 started 12186:5 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 12201:18 understood 12197:17 starting 12158:6 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 12203:19 12184:24 unfortunate 12188:23 starting 12162:19 12163:3 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:13 12178:10 12195:8 12185:11 12202:13 12189:8 T T there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 12160:23 12188:16					
12171:10 12199:16 suppose 12161:4 12183:7,16,19,19 12186:9 12188:19 understanding 12199:17 sure 12174:1 12177:18 12185:16 12191:16 12192:21 12196:18 12172:19 12190:19 start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 understood 12199:22 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 understanding 12186:5 12203:21 12200:18,20 12201:18 understood 12199:22 starting 12158:6 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 understanding 12186:5 12202:13 12200:18,20 12201:18 understood 12199:22 starting 12158:6 12203:21 12202:13 12203:10 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 12162:19 12163:3 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:14 there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 1					
12199:17 sure 12174:1 12177:18 12185:16 12191:16 12192:21 12196:18 12172:19 12190:19 start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12159:18,20 12199:22 12197:18 12199:24 12198:7 12199:9,14 understood 12199:22 12186:10 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 12201:18 undesirable 12197:17 starting 12158:6 12203:21 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 12189:8 T thereabouts 12162:15 12179:10 12195:8 12179:10 12195:8 State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18					*
start 12158:15 12159:8 12190:20 12194:23 12193:22 12196:7,10 12197:14,15 12198:2 12192:14 12202:2,21 12159:18,20 12199:22 12197:18 12199:24 12198:7 12199:9,14 understood 12199:22 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 undesirable 12197:17 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 undesirable 12197:17 starting 12158:6 sympathetic 12182:25 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 12189:8 T thereabouts 12162:15 12179:10 12195:8 12197:21 12199:4 12202:14 State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18					
12159:18,20 12199:22 12197:18 12199:24 12198:7 12199:9,14 understood 12199:22 12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 undesirable 12197:17 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 uneducated 12158:16 12186:5 12203:21 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 starting 12158:6 sympathetic 12182:25 thereabouts 12163:3 today 12175:14 12187:10,11 12202:13 12189:8 T thereon 12162:15 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18					
12180:10 12197:16 surely 12194:24 12200:18,20 12201:18 undesirable 12197:17 started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 uneducated 12158:16 12186:5 12203:21 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 starting 12158:6 sympathetic 12182:25 thereabouts 12163:3 today 12175:14 12185:11 12202:13 12189:8 T there's 12160:2 12178:10,11 12202:14 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18			The state of the s	-	
started 12161:7 surprised 12202:22 12202:13 12203:10 Tip 12165:4,5 uneducated 12158:16 12186:5 12203:21 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 starting 12158:6 12162:19 12163:3 12162:15 thereabouts 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:14 12189:8 T there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18					
12186:5 12203:21 12203:19 12204:18 tirade 12184:24 unfortunate 12158:23 starting 12158:6 sympathetic 12182:25 thereabouts 12163:3 today 12175:14 12185:11 12202:13 12189:8 T there's 12160:2 12178:10,11 12202:14 State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18			•		
starting 12158:6 sympathetic 12182:25 thereabouts 12163:3 today 12175:14 12185:11 12202:13 12162:19 12163:3 T thereon 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:14 State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18				-	
12162:19 12163:3 thereon 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:14 12189:8 there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18			12203:19 12204:18		unfortunate 12158:23
12162:19 12163:3 thereon 12162:15 12178:10,11 12202:14 12189:8 there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18	starting 12158:6	sympathetic 12182:25			
12189:8 T there's 12160:2 12179:10 12195:8 Unfortunately State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18		Charles Charles			
State 12169:21 12174:4 take 12162:23 12178:6,18 12179:5 12197:21 12199:4 12160:23 12188:16 stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18	In II Desire	1 to 1 1 The			
stated 12158:24 12166:13 12168:14 12189:17 12190:12 12201:12 12202:10 12189:25 12181:2 12182:8 12168:25 12170:1 12191:10 12196:4 Tokota 12192:6,8 unnecessary 12171:18					
12181:2 12182:8			-		
·	The state of the state of the				
			14191.10 14190.4	1 UNUIA 12172.0,0	unifecessary 121/1:18
	_ A A C A I Y E F O				

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

				Page
12179:16 12193:14	week 12160:19	working 12196:15	12195:7	
12193:16 12198:3	12162:12,19,21	12204:19		
unopposed 12201:16	12163:3,9 12167:18	works 12198:9	6	
unwillingness 12195:6	12176:13 12177:6	world 12201:24	60 12180:6	
urgent 12175:11	weekend 12163:4	wouldn't 12199:17		
use 12168:9 12182:14	12179:23	12204:9	7	
12185:5 12187:12	weeks 12163:15,16,19	written 12160:24	7th 12162:21	
	12178:24,25	12161:6 12173:20,21		
V	12179:22	12177:7 12182:20	8	
value 12189:15	weighing 12173:11	12187:10,12	8th 12162:19	
various 12160:3	welcome 12160:6	12195:11	80 12180:7	
12162:4	well-published 12169:1	wrong 12165:19		
Varney 12190:9,15	went 12195:1 12198:24	12197:23	9	
12191:18,19,20	weren't 12203:7	wrote 12174:6	9 12205:14	
12192:5 12195:15	we'd 12163:19 12179:4		9th 12162:20,20	
12196:5,8	12179:6	X	9:30 12158:3 12205:15	
viable 12186:11,12	we'll 12159:4 12161:8	Xhosa 12166:25		
victims 12159:9	12162:8 12170:20			
12165:22 12201:24	12178:5,7,18 12184:5	<u> </u>		
view 12171:13,16	12184:7 12189:9	yard 12190:1		
12179:5 12180:3	12196:16	year 12173:19		
12185:24 12186:1,19	we're 12158:6 12159:3	years 12180:7,7		
12186:21 12193:10	12161:6,9 12172:20	yesterday 12176:7,18		
viewpoints 12160:3	12181:8 12198:13	12190:9 12195:14		
volume 12181:5	12201:7,7 12202:17	you're 12160:6		
	12203:18 we've 12159:7 12189:5	12166:17 12194:23		
wait 12158:3		12196:19		
waiting 12161:7	12191:4,14 12196:9 whatsoever 12189:7	you've 12159:5 12162:1 12189:1		
12180:10	what's 12167:1	12102.1 12109.1 12197:2,9 12198:5,12		
walked 12201:24	12196:23	12197.2,9 12196.3,12		
walking 12173:3	wheels 12184:3	1		
want 12159:1 12165:9	white 12195:12	1 12174:18 12175:5,13		
12167:7 12168:22	whomsoever 12180:13	12190:2 12205:1		
12172:18 12177:2	who'd 12183:1	10 12158:4 12159:20		
12181:6,19 12182:23	widows 12159:9	12161:15		
12184:2,2 12185:1	12185:10	10:31 12158:2		
12188:5,22 12189:4	willing 12175:20	10:43 12161:18		
12189:12 12191:1	12176:3	11:03 12170:25		
12192:9,18,22	wisdom 12158:17	11:23 12180:1		
12196:3,18 12199:4	wish 12160:7,7 12164:2	12th 12163:3		
12201:1,2,8,15,24	12164:2 12169:6	12:03 12184:10		
12202:4,6,8,15	12171:3 12188:8	12:23 12193:6		
12203:16,25 12204:1	12203:4	12:43 12205:13		
12204:25	wishes 12170:8,23	15th 12174:21		
wanted 12158:22	withdraw 12174:25	17th 12174:16		
12159:24 12160:25	12187:7	19th 12163:10,11,12		
12169:8 12178:14	withdrawal 12160:5	12177:13 12178:18		
12180:12 12184:13	12175:1			
12184:25 12186:24	withdrawn 12167:8	2		
12201:9,10	without-prejudice	2 12174:20 12175:7,15		
wants 12161:14	12195:25 won't 12160:5	12190:3 12201:16		
12165:23 12172:22		2013 12158:1 12162:25		
12172:25 12192:6	12163:20 12196:17	22 12158:1		
12196:24 12203:24 wasn't 12183:11	12200:16 12203:5 word 12175:25 12176:1	3		
	12186:10,11,15			
waste 12179:16 wasted 12197:13	12189:14 12196:19	3 12175:2 30 12181:13		
wasting 12186:20	12189:14 12190:19	SU 12101:13		
way 12158:4 12172:11	words 12166:14	4		
12178:19 12186:5	12167:24 12182:13	4 12175:3		
12178.19 12180.3	12107.24 12102.13	7 12173.3		
12193.23 12194.3,8	work 12167:6 12172:1	5		
ways 12185:3	12177:25 12181:5	5 12175:8,14		
Wednesday 12177:11	12197:24,24 12198:9	512175.8,14 5th 12162:19,20		
12177:24	12199:21 12200:2	12174:8 12176:4		
ARCHIVE FO		121, 121,0.1		