

RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON
MR TOKOTA SC
MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 54 26 FEBRUARY 2013 PAGES 5770 TO 5877

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg
P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037
Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335
E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za
Web Address: <http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278>



Page 5770

1 [PROCEEDINGS ON 26 FEBRUARY 2013]
 2 [09:32] CHAIRPERSON: The commission resumes. Mr
 3 Phatsha you're still under oath. I think the cross-
 4 examination from -
 5 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: From AMCU, are there any
 7 questions from, cross-examination?
 8 MS DE VOS: There are Chair.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Yes please proceed.
 10 MR SEMENYA SC: Mr Chair?
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Yes Mr Semenya.
 12 MR SEMENYA SC: Might I be indulged to
 13 put to the one proposition to the witness, if I may.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: I'm sure the
 15 representatives of AMCU won't object. So please do so.
 16 MR SEMENYA SC: Thank you Chair. We are
 17 going to argue that the Mambush group to which you were
 18 part went around the crawl with an intention to attack the
 19 police.
 20 MR PHATSHA: No, it was not so.
 21 MR SEMENYA SC: Thank you Chair.
 22 CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MS DE VOS: Mr
 23 Phatsha I represent AMCU.
 24 MR PHATSHA: Thank you.
 25 MS DE VOS: I would like to ask you some

Page 5771

1 questions about what happened after you went through the
 2 crawl.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry to get my [inaudible]
 4 information on record.
 5 MS DE VOS: I'll do so chair. I'm De
 6 Vos. D-E V-O-S.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: [inaudible].
 8 MS DE VOS: I'm an advocate Chairperson.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: [inaudible].
 10 MS DE VOS: Thank you Chair. Mr Phatsha
 11 I'm going to ask you some questions about what happened
 12 after you went through the kraal on the 16th of August. You
 13 gave evidence yesterday that there was a Hippo in front
 14 causing a lot of damage, I was scared of being run over by
 15 that Hippo. Mr Phatsha where was that Hippo?
 16 MR PHATSHA: As I went out of the crawl
 17 running the Hippo was, he indicates on my right hand side
 18 running parallel to how I was running.
 19 MS DE VOS: Why were you scared of that
 20 Hippo?
 21 MR PHATSHA: When people were going
 22 passed it it would bump them.
 23 MS DE VOS: In which direct, apologies
 24 can you go to slide 194 of exhibit L.
 25 MR PHATSHA: I'm looking at it, yes.

Page 5772

1 MS DE VOS: Can you try and indicate for
 2 us on that, on that map where the Nyala came from?
 3 CHAIRPERSON: It's not a map, it's a
 4 photograph isn't it?
 5 MR PHATSHA: The Hippo was driving from
 6 the direction of the kraal towards the koppie.
 7 MS DE VOS: When you say it was bumping
 8 people what does that mean?
 9 MR PHATSHA: As a person is walking and
 10 he goes pass him it bumps him to an extent that some of
 11 them fell.
 12 MS DE VOS: What were you doing at the
 13 stage when the Hippo was bumping people?
 14 MR PHATSHA: I was running towards them,
 15 the hill to hide because I had the difficulty in running
 16 with my, with the piece of flesh hanging from the wound.
 17 MS DE VOS: Thank you Chair. Those are
 18 our questions.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: Now who is going to cross-
 20 examine on behalf of the families?
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Good morning, Chairman.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: You're back with us after
 23 various other commitments. But we're not concerned with
 24 that, you have questions for the witness, do you?
 25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: There are just a couple

Page 5773

1 of questions. Can I get indulge Chair to introduce myself
 2 in a language that I think this gentleman will understand.
 3 MR PHATSHA: I am from that area, a young
 4 man from Naleni area, yes I am from Naleni, Sir. My clan
 5 name is Nsangwe, I'm from the village, in other words the
 6 son of Phalo.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes now I just want to
 8 establish that.
 9 MR PHATSHA: Thank you.
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now you, there's just a
 11 couple of questions that I want to ask you about your
 12 evidence when you were answering to questions put by my
 13 colleague, Mr Semenya, and those questions were around the
 14 identity of a person who has come to be known as Mambush.
 15 Do you follow?
 16 MR PHATSHA: I'm listening, yes.
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Ja and just for you to
 18 know, I represent the families of those people who were
 19 miners whose relatives got killed on that day, on the 16th
 20 and Mambush has come to be known, it is common cause that
 21 he's one of the people who died on that day. You know that
 22 don't you?
 23 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I understand that
 25 Mambush was a [African language] he came from Nkanduli.

Page 5774

1 MR PHATSHA: I did not know him, Sir, but
 2 I came to know, to hear that he was a man from Nkanduli.
 3 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes I thought so but
 4 you, do you agree with me that with the passage of time he
 5 has come to be known more by what he was wearing then to
 6 some people knowing him by sight, he was referred to as the
 7 man with the green blanket.
 8 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, and if that was the
 10 only thing to anyone like you who heard about it for the
 11 first time in a certain place that that man is Mambush you
 12 would associate anything green with him, sometimes
 13 mistakenly so.
 14 MR PHATSHA: That is correct.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I want to show you
 16 the picture that was shown by Adv Semenya to you. I'm
 17 told, Commissioner that it's, what, exhibit L26, slide 26.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: 26 of Exhibit LL?
 19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now there is a green,
 20 there's somebody wearing green there.
 21 MR PHATSHA: That is the kind of clothing
 22 he was wearing.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now I'll get to that
 24 question. I just want you to take one step at a time.
 25 MR PHATSHA: Yes sir.

Page 5775

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Just look at the picture
 2 very closely. Now I want to suggest to you that that green
 3 garment is not a blanket, it is a sweater. Just take your
 4 time, it is a sweater.
 5 MR PHATSHA: Now that you are drawing my
 6 attention to it, yes it is only now that I see it.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes and it's not though
 8 that he doesn't have a blanket, there is a blanket to that
 9 green garment.
 10 MR PHATSHA: Above the green yes he has
 11 got a blanket.
 12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And it is not green?
 13 MR PHATSHA: It's like what he is wearing
 14 that has got the sleeves.
 15 MR NTSEBEZA SC: What colour do you think
 16 the blanket is?
 17 MR PHATSHA: I have a difficulty with -
 18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes.
 19 MR PHATSHA: I have a difficulties with
 20 colours Mr Chairperson because of the fact that I haven't
 21 been to school. Colours like green and the others I cannot
 22 really say.
 23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now if you look
 24 around the -
 25 CHAIRPERSON: To be fair to him, he may

Page 5776

1 be colour blind you know.
 2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No I -
 3 CHAIRPERSON: There are people who are
 4 colour blind.
 5 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, no, no.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Can't tell difference in
 7 colours. I don't think you have to go to school to be able
 8 to identify colours. But if you're colour blind there's
 9 not much you can do about it. I don't think he is colour
 10 blind and maybe we should investigate that.
 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No, yes, Chair, I
 12 appreciate that.
 13 MR PHATSHA: If you look around the chest
 14 area. There is a colour there that will be, again that
 15 [African language] is to me in English yellow oak.
 16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And at the back,
 17 backside on his -
 18 MR PHATSHA: That is a different colour.
 19 The answer is that it is a different colour yes.
 20 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now what I wanted
 21 to suggest to you is that that colour, the red colour, if
 22 you look at it on his back and on his front and on his
 23 chest that's a blanket that he has wrapped over the green
 24 sweater that he wears. Can we agree on that?
 25 MR PHATSHA: I see it yes.

Page 5777

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now let's go to
 2 slide 1, what's this, L192. L192. Do you see that?
 3 MR PHATSHA: I see it, yes.
 4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now you'll notice there,
 5 now everybody's agreed that that is Mambush, I also agree.
 6 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.
 7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now you will notice
 8 there, I suggest to you that the sweater that that person
 9 is wearing, that person is wearing a white sweater.
 10 MR PHATSHA: I can see it, yes.
 11 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And the green is the
 12 blanket around his neck.
 13 MR PHATSHA: I can see it, yes.
 14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now everybody agrees
 15 that that is Mambush.
 16 MR PHATSHA: I understand, yes.
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now let us look at them
 18 when they are all dead, or as they are lying there after
 19 they had been shot and that would be L208.
 20 MR PHATSHA: I'm looking at it.
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. You see there that
 22 there is the person whose wearing an all green top, it's a
 23 sweater not a blanket, where number 1 is pointing to. You
 24 see that?
 25 MR PHATSHA: Yes, I see it.

Page 5778

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And that red blanket is
2 beneath him, under his right arm.
3 MR PHATSHA: I can see it yes.
4 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. Now next to him
5 you see that same man you saw with a pair of dungarees and
6 a white sweater and a green blanket.
7 MR PHATSHA: I can see that, yes.
8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now if there was any
9 doubt that Mambush was wearing a white shirt or white
10 sweater on that day there is, I'm told by my juniors
11 exhibit DDD 6.4.
12 CHAIRPERSON: DDD6.4 is the one you're
13 referring.
14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you Chair. Now
15 that is a post-mortem photo of Mambush. You remember even
16 yesterday -
17 [09:52] MR PHATSHA: I can see it, yes.
18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: - Mr Semenya presented
19 to you as an indication of that person being Mambush. Do
20 you recall that?
21 MR PHATSHA: I remember that, yes.
22 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, you can see, even
23 colour blind as you may be and I am also guilty of that,
24 that the sweater or shirt that he is wearing is a white
25 shirt.

Page 5779

1 MR PHATSHA: Yes, it's of a white colour.
2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So if we now went to
3 where you were started to identify Mambush, and that is
4 L206, it seems to me, and I would suggest to you and I
5 would argue this, that the person whom you had initially
6 identified as Mambush, for the reasons I've indicated, is
7 in fact not Mambush, the one in the photograph 206.
8 MR PHATSHA: Yes, Sir, I agree but it's
9 because what he was wearing, what this person on 206 is
10 wearing, is the similar colour to that one on the other
11 side, though not exactly.
12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. No, no, we are
13 agreed about that, I mean it's a mistake that is common,
14 that you would make.
15 CHAIRPERSON: I think, you are not the
16 only person who made that mistake, you don't have to be
17 ashamed.
18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: We had a duty to unravel
19 the common mistake to everybody. Now, just to round off
20 this little point, without suggesting anything else, but
21 that photograph and I am talking about that photograph
22 alone, there isn't anybody there who is wearing a white
23 sweater and a green blanket.
24 MR PHATSHA: No, nobody is wearing white
25 there.

Page 5780

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, I - to go to
2 another point, I believe that, I don't know whether you are
3 currently a member of the NUM or you were a member of the
4 NUM.
5 MR PHATSHA: I am no more a member of the
6 NUM.
7 MR NTSEBEZA SC: But around the - when
8 you got injured, you were still a member of NUM.
9 MR PHATSHA: I was until December last
10 year all along been a member of the NUM, since I started -
11 since my arrival around Gauteng.
12 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Which was when?
13 MR PHATSHA: It was in 1982.
14 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So you have been
15 virtually as long a member of NUM as the organisation
16 itself, that's just about 30 years, isn't it?
17 MR PHATSHA: It is so.
18 MR NTSEBEZA SC: So for 30 years, you
19 owed your loyalty to NUM.
20 MR MAHLANGU: He said, "yes, I loved the
21 NUM. The reason I left was," and then he was stopped by
22 counsel.
23 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, because the
24 question I was simply asking is, you agree then that you
25 have been a loyal member of the NUM for 30 years.

Page 5781

1 MR PHATSHA: It is so.
2 MR NTSEBEZA SC: And your, out of your
3 salary there was an amount that was deducted as for
4 subscription for membership of the NUM, for that number of
5 years.
6 MR PHATSHA: Yes, totally yes, for all
7 the years deduction was made from my salary for membership.
8 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Now, when you got
9 injured in the manner in which you have told the Chairman
10 and the Commissioners, did you get hospitalised?
11 MR PHATSHA: Yes, I was admitted in the
12 hospital.
13 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Do you know if anybody
14 from the NUM visited you in the hospital?
15 MR PHATSHA: Nobody came.
16 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Have they ever contacted
17 you in any way, NUM members?
18 MR PHATSHA: Not a single person.
19 MR NTSEBEZA SC: I can tell you as a
20 fact, that in this Commission my learned brother, Karel
21 Tip, is a lawyer from NUM. Have you ever been offered any
22 legal assistance by NUM, as a loyal card carrying member of
23 30 years?
24 MR PHATSHA: Not at all.
25 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Thank you very much, Mr

Page 5782

1 Chairman, Commissioners, that's our cross.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Anyone else
 3 wish to ask anything in cross-examination of the witness,
 4 before I ask Mr Mpfu, if he wishes to re-examine?
 5 MR MOTAU SC: Chair, perhaps just to go
 6 back to the issue that was outstanding at the time when I
 7 finished my cross-examination.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: You reserve your rights to
 9 start cross-examination again.
 10 MR MOTAU SC: I am advised -
 11 CHAIRPERSON: You may do so.
 12 MR MOTAU SC: No, Chair, I am advised by
 13 the evidence leaders that they have not been able to locate
 14 the video, which they call the – Mr Chaskalson's videos,
 15 and they are still looking for it, so we haven't made much
 16 progress, Chair. I will probably advise the Commission at
 17 a later stage, what is to occur.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: You are still reserving
 19 your rights, that is duly recorded.
 20 MS PILLAY: Chair, just to clarify the
 21 position. We have established that the video clip that Mr
 22 Motau was looking for is not one of the exhibits that were
 23 on Mr Chaskalson's compilation, but I did have a word with
 24 Mr Chaskalson, and he recalls having seen the video on one
 25 of the hard drives, he just couldn't find it at that

Page 5783

1 particular time and he said he will revert once he finds
 2 the particular video clip we are referring to.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: You will have to be content
 4 with that, Mr Motau.
 5 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair –
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Yes?
 7 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, just for the
 8 record, we placed on record that there are 19 Nyalas on the
 9 day of the 16th, so we should not be assumed to accept as
 10 correct the evidence that there was a Nyala bumping people
 11 around, it is just that I can't cross-examine without
 12 consulting 19 drivers of Nyalas to see if that is factually
 13 accurate. We just place it on record.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I understand. You can
 15 of course consult them or have someone consult them, a team
 16 of people consulting them, if necessary you could recall
 17 the witness to deal with this issue, if you consider it
 18 important enough. So, no further cross-examination.
 19 Before Mr Mpfu re-examines, Adv Hemraj, would like to ask
 20 some questions.
 21 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: The informal
 22 settlement Nkaneng, there are other points of access to the
 23 settlement, apart from the one directly behind the police
 24 line.
 25 MR PHATSHA: There was only one visible

Page 5784

1 entrance at the time. As one goes towards the kraal, the
 2 kraal is surrounded by wire, and there was no entrance
 3 there, except the road that we intended taking.
 4 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: I understand that,
 5 but apart from that entrance, are there other entrances to
 6 the settlement at other points, around the settlement?
 7 MR PHATSHA: There was one straight way
 8 past the kraal into the road that leads Nkaneng. The one
 9 next to the kraal, that was surrounded by wire and one
 10 could not go through there.
 11 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Apart from that
 12 entrance, are there other entrances, other points of
 13 access, any other place around the settlement?
 14 MR PHATSHA: There was no other way
 15 because the place had been surrounded by the police.
 16 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Is the settlement
 17 surrounded by a fence or a wall at all?
 18 MR PHATSHA: It's the kraal that is
 19 surrounded by a fence, and then next to it there is a road
 20 which leads straight to the shack settlement.
 21 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Is the shack
 22 settlement surrounded by a wall or a fence at all?
 23 MR PHATSHA: Each and every shack is
 24 surrounded by its own fence.
 25 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: The entire

Page 5785

1 settlement, has that got a wall or a fence around it?
 2 MR PHATSHA: There is no such a fence.
 3 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Now from where you
 4 were on the mountain, the police line up, was that clearly
 5 visible to you?
 6 MR PHATSHA: Yes, very clear.
 7 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And you could see
 8 the number of policemen standing very close together in a
 9 line.
 10 MR PHATSHA: They stood in that one line
 11 after closing up with the barbed wire.
 12 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And you could also
 13 see from where you were on the mountain all the police
 14 vehicles lined up there as well.
 15 MR PHATSHA: Yes, they were visible.
 16 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Now, if you'd be so
 17 kind as to look at slide L206 please. You've told that you
 18 were part of that group.
 19 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 20 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And at that stage,
 21 that's depicted on that slide, you were trying to get to
 22 the settlement, to the entrance to the settlement.
 23 MR PHATSHA: It is so.
 24 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And when we looked
 25 at the video yesterday, that group, all of you were walking

Page 5786

1 very closely together, slightly bent over.
 2 MR PHATSHA: A person walks away in a
 3 manner in which he deems fit, the way he thinks.
 4 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Yes, I appreciate
 5 that. I am just saying to you that when we were here
 6 yesterday, showing that scene up there n that slide 206,
 7 the group of which you were part of were all walking
 8 together, slightly bent over, but walking, walking at that
 9 stage.
 10 MR PHATSHA: I agree.
 11 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And from that
 12 point, you were even closer to that line up of policemen
 13 and police vehicles, that you were able to see from your
 14 spot on the mountain.
 15 MR PHATSHA: The police were there.
 16 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And it would have
 17 been clearer to you from this closer position there on the
 18 mountain, how many policemen and how many vehicles were
 19 lined up there in front of you.
 20 MR PHATSHA: You could see them, yes.
 21 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And you told us
 22 yesterday that you intended to go through that police line
 23 towards the entrance to the settlement.
 24 MR PHATSHA: No, I did not say that. I
 25 said, we were on our way to the road that would lead us to

Page 5787

1 the settlement.
 2 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And that road, Sir,
 3 was behind the police line.
 4 MR PHATSHA: In what way?
 5 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: The entrance to
 6 that road was behind where the police were standing.
 7 MR PHATSHA: No, that I did not observe.
 8 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Thank you.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: My colleague, Adv Tokota,
 10 also wishes to ask some questions.
 11 COMMISSIONER TOKOTA: Mr Mambush, I got
 12 the impression yesterday that – I am sorry, Mr Phasha, I am
 13 very sorry, I got the impression yesterday that in order
 14 for you to get into the informal settlement, you would have
 15 to go through the line of police.
 16 [10:12] MR PHATSHA: We had no way of going
 17 through the police because our way was blocked and turned
 18 away and ran towards the kraal.
 19 COMMISSIONER TOKOTO: So the road to the
 20 informal settlement was clear. There was no impediment in
 21 other words for you to get there.
 22 MR PHATSHA: I'm sorry, Sir?
 23 COMMISSIONER TOKOTO: There was no
 24 impediment for you to get to the informal settlement after
 25 you had gone around -

Page 5788

1 MR PHATSHA: Mr Chairperson, we left the
 2 idea of getting to that road because of the blockage, it
 3 was closed we could not go through and that is the reason
 4 we turned towards the kraal.
 5 COMMISSIONER TOKOTO: So if you had had
 6 to turn around the kraal there was no blockage whatsoever
 7 for you to get to the informal settlement?
 8 MR PHATSHA: The police were the only
 9 blockage there. When we turned around the kraal the police
 10 were there and then they started firing.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Would you please look at
 12 slide 198 in the exhibit bundle? That could be shown to
 13 you.
 14 MR PHATSHA: 198?
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Yes 198.
 16 MR PHATSHA: I can see it there.
 17 CHAIRPERSON: Do you see Mr Nortje or
 18 Mambush on that slide?
 19 MR PHATSHA: I see a blanket similar to
 20 the one that he was wearing.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Where is that?
 22 MR PHATSHA: He is walking next to the
 23 Hippo. Next to the Nyala.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: Where do we see him, where
 25 on the Hippo where in line with the Hippo.

Page 5789

1 MR PHATSHA: He is in front but not much
 2 he's in front of the people but not much.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: He's the person walking in
 4 front of the Hippo, the person on the extreme left of the
 5 photograph.
 6 MR PHATSHA: It looks like him.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: There's someone else who
 8 might be, Mr Noki and that's if you look at the coils of
 9 barbed wire just at the rear section of the, Nyala the rear
 10 section just behind or in line with a point behind the
 11 coils of barbed wire there's someone with dungarees and a
 12 white sweat shirt and what looks like a green blanket over
 13 his left arm in the forefront of the picture.
 14 MR PHATSHA: I'm look at it yes, Sir.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Could that also be Mr Noki?
 16 MR PHATSHA: I cannot only recognise the
 17 man who is wearing the blanket, there he is not wearing it.
 18 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Would you just stay
 19 at that same slide please at slide L198. You told us
 20 yesterday that the group were singing and chanting when you
 21 were walking alongside the Nyala.
 22 MR PHATSHA: It is so yes.
 23 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: And that you were
 24 waiting for the employer to arrive.
 25 MR PHATSHA: I'm still saying that.

Page 5790

1 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: At that stage it
 2 would have been easy for the group to access the entrance
 3 to the settlement?
 4 MR PHATSHA: We were waiting for the
 5 employer.
 6 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: I understand that,
 7 but at that stage, before all the barbed wire had been
 8 deployed it would have been easy for that group to access
 9 the settlement.
 10 MR PHATSHA: We would have done that if
 11 the employer had come and responded to our demands.
 12 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Does that mean yes
 13 it would have been easier at that stage to access the
 14 settlement?
 15 MR PHATSHA: Maybe I'm not understood.
 16 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: At that point when
 17 your group was next to the Nyala all the barbed wire had
 18 not been deployed. Had the group wished at that stage to
 19 proceed towards the settlement it would have been easier to
 20 do so.
 21 MR PHATSHA: It wouldn't have been easier
 22 for us to do so, this is before the employer came to
 23 respond to our demands.
 24 COMMISSIONER HEMRAJ: Thank you Mr
 25 Phasha.

Page 5791

1 MR PHATSHA: Thank you.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: While we're still looking
 3 at that slide 198, you are obviously part of that group
 4 depicted on the slide although I take it it's not possible
 5 for us to identify you, is that correct? See if you can
 6 see yourself on the photograph.
 7 MR PHATSHA: I am in the group, yes.
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Can you see yourself in the
 9 picture?
 10 MR PHATSHA: I would not be able to
 11 identify because of the number.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Now according to what the
 13 police have told us just after that photograph was taken
 14 water canons started spraying the strikers who were coming
 15 forward and stun and tear grenades were fired, rubber
 16 rounds were fired as well. Can you confirm that that's
 17 what happened to the people who were there, depicted in
 18 that photograph?
 19 MR PHATSHA: No it's not true.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Not true. You see because
 21 what the police say and I'm checking whether that's correct
 22 by asking you these questions is that - I'll read you the
 23 relevant paragraphs from slide 199. "Water canons started
 24 spraying the attacking protestors" they say you were
 25 attacking, you deny that but "water canons started spraying

Page 5792

1 the attacking protestors to prevent them from entering the
 2 police enclosure, this action had no effect on the
 3 protestors and kept," I take it that to be "they kept on
 4 coming forward. Public order policing members applied the
 5 less lethal methods including stun and tear grenades,
 6 firing of rubber rounds within the force continuum in an
 7 effort to stop and disburse the group of attacking
 8 protestors. This gave Nyala 4, that's the Nyala on the
 9 photograph time to close the gap with the remaining barbed
 10 wire." Now I take it that you say that that's not correct.
 11 MR PHATSHA: We did not attack the
 12 police, we did not start attacking. They were standing
 13 quite a distance away from us with the Nyalas there. The
 14 police only started shooting after they had enclosed the
 15 place with the barbed wire.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: No but the passage I read
 17 you didn't relate to the police shooting you. It related
 18 to stun and tear grenades being fired, rubber bullets being
 19 fired and water canons being used - did that happen while
 20 you people were at the place which we see depicted on slide
 21 198.
 22 MR PHATSHA: No it is not so, Mr Chair.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: I got the impression that
 24 you said yesterday that it was at that point that the
 25 police started spraying you with water and subjecting you

Page 5793

1 to tear gas.
 2 MR PHATSHA: No that I did not say.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: I see alright. If I
 4 understood you to say that then I have misunderstood you.
 5 MR PHATSHA: I would not know that.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Then I must put you for the
 7 sake of completeness - in slide 199 that you said that
 8 during this incident, the incident which I have - the
 9 description which I have read to you, he said in this
 10 incident various shots were fired from the protestors at
 11 the police Nyala. Is it possible that one or some of the
 12 strikers may have fired shots at the police Nyala at that
 13 stage?
 14 MR PHATSHA: That I did not observe.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Mpofo are
 16 you now ready to proceed with your re-examination?
 17 RE-EXAMINATION BY MR MPOFU: Thank you
 18 Chairperson. Good morning Mr Phasha.
 19 MR PHATSHA: Morning Sir.
 20 MR MPOFU: How are you today?
 21 MR PHATSHA: I'm healthy, no problems and
 22 how are you.
 23 MR MPOFU: No we're all right thank you.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: Now that we have had the
 25 medical bulletins for the day are over can we carry on

Page 5794

1 with the evidence?

2 MR MPOFU: I'm fine thank you, I'm also

3 fine Mr Chairperson, I'm also going to ask you a few

4 questions. Let's start with the issue that was dealt with

5 just now. On the 16th this process of people singing and

6 moving up and down which you described, going back to the

7 koppie singing and so on, for how long did that take place?

8 MR PHATSHA: I would not be with precise

9 with the time Sir, but it happened several times, the

10 singing, going and going back to the mountain and singing

11 again all the time waiting for our employer.

12 MR MPOFU: There is footage which I

13 cannot access now which shows that happening around about

14 11:00 in the morning. Could it have started that long

15 back?

16 MR PHATSHA: It could be so, yes.

17 MR MPOFU: So if that happened so many

18 times over so many hours would it be possible for you from

19 one still frame to identify which of those several times

20 you are going up and down?

21 MR PHATSHA: No, I would not be because I

22 was one of those people going up and down so I would not be

23 able to say who of the group went up and down all the time.

24 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Then you have been

25 questioned about this so called police lying. Can you go

Page 5795

1 to slide number 191?

2 MR PHATSHA: I'm looking at it, yes.

3 MR MPOFU: Now can you see between the

4 Nyala, there's one, two, three, four, five Nyalas with a

5 yellow line between the kraal and the those five Nyalas

6 which is marked 50 metres? Can you see that?

7 MR PHATSHA: I can see it.

8 MR MPOFU: Right. Now -

9 CHAIRPERSON: That one on the screen

10 hasn't got the yellow lines there.

11 MR MPOFU: Oh of course, the one that you

12 have in front of you.

13 MR MPOFU: For other people yes. Okay.

14 CHAIRPERSON: He must obviously look at

15 the hard copy, the slide doesn't show what -

16 MR MPOFU: I see, Chairperson. Alright

17 for the benefit of those people who don't have this copy

18 you'll the Nyalas, there's a first line of Nyalas and I

19 should have seen these are the barbed wire Nyalas, then

20 there's another - behind that there's a kind of a semi

21 circle of Nyalas. Can you see that?

22 MR PHATSHA: I can see that, yes.

23 MR MPOFU: Now the 50 metres I'm talking

24 about is between the kraal and the foot of the horseshoe so

25 to speak. No if you look at this one. If you look at the

Page 5796

1 one in front of you you'll see the yellow line is between

2 the kraal and that foot of the horseshoe. Do you see that

3 yellow line?

4 MR PHATSHA: I can see it yes.

5 MR MPOFU: Right. Now at that stage can

6 you see that there are many people on the road that you

7 have testified about?

8 [10:32] MR PHATSHA: Yes, these are people

9 walking from the shack settlement towards Marikana. That's

10 the road they use.

11 MR MPOFU: No, Mr Phasha, can you see

12 that there are many people on that road, now? In front of

13 the kraal. I know they are too small, you can look

14 carefully.

15 MR PHATSHA: There are people visible in

16 the slide, yes but people who were walking from the shack

17 settlement going past there.

18 MR MPOFU: Okay, let me put it this way,

19 Mr Phasha. It is common cause – it will be common cause,

20 that at that stage, the barbed wire was in the process of

21 being pulled. In fact, if you go to slide 197, that

22 becomes clearer. That picture at 197 is exactly the same

23 one, at exactly the same time as the one at 191. The time

24 on both pictures is exactly 15:40 and on the one at 197,

25 you can see 1, 2, 3, 4 arrows of the Nyalas which were

Page 5797

1 pulling the barbed wire.

2 MR PHATSHA: I can see it.

3 MR MPOFU: So we can accept that it will

4 be common cause that when that picture was taken, the

5 barbed wire was more than, it was in fact, I think three or

6 four of the Nyalas had pulled the barbed wire, and I would

7 assume people had started running away.

8 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.

9 MR MPOFU: Now, if – now that I've given

10 you that information, what would you think the direction of

11 the people that you see running on that road in front of

12 the kraal, which way would they be running to?

13 MR PHATSHA: They would run towards, back

14 towards the settlement.

15 MR MPOFU: Thank you. And so we know

16 that by 15:40 that road was not, was accessible to

17 everybody, it was not part of any so-called police line.

18 MR MAHLANGU: Was not accessible? Was?

19 MR MPOFU: Was accessible, and people

20 were using it actually.

21 MR PHATSHA: Yes, it was.

22 MR MPOFU: And from the people who were

23 still at the koppie all this was visible because it's

24 elevated, you could see these people using that road.

25 MR PHATSHA: It is so.

Page 5798

1 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now, let's go to
 2 the – let's still talk about that road, from the questions
 3 that you were asked by Commissioner Tokota. Can you help
 4 the Commission with this, when the police shot at the group
 5 for the – I am talking about the rain of fire, the volley
 6 of fire that was directed towards the strikers, were the
 7 police on the kraal side of that road, or over that road?
 8 MR PHATSHA: They were on the other side
 9 of the wire.
 10 MR MPOFU: Of the road? I am asking in
 11 relation to the road, sorry. Were they over the road, the
 12 people were coming behind the kraal, or were they on the
 13 nearer side of the road? In other words, okay, let me put
 14 it this way, if you had to go and greet one of them, would
 15 you have had to cross the road?
 16 MR PHATSHA: They were on the other side
 17 of the wire.
 18 MR MPOFU: Okay. I am asking about the
 19 road, Mr Phasha.
 20 MR PHATSHA: They were on our side of the
 21 road. The wire was drawn up to the beginning of the kraal.
 22 MR MPOFU: Okay, I am sorry, maybe it's
 23 my mistake, yes. Alright, let's then start there, you are
 24 saying that when you were accessing the road for the first
 25 time, was the wire, the wire was in front of you, is that

Page 5799

1 what you have been saying?
 2 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 3 MR MPOFU: Right, okay. Now let's leave
 4 that part. Then after that, you then go around the kraal,
 5 correct?
 6 MR PHATSHA: It is so.
 7 MR MPOFU: And then which one was nearer
 8 to you, the police who were shooting in the line, or the
 9 road, after you went behind the kraal?
 10 MR PHATSHA: Immediately we came from
 11 behind the kraal, the police immediately shot at us.
 12 MR MPOFU: Yes, and were they standing –
 13 where were they standing? Was the road before them or was
 14 the police before the road?
 15 MR PHATSHA: They were on the other side
 16 of the road.
 17 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now, the – you've
 18 also been questioned, I think by Commissioner Hemraj, and
 19 Mr Semenya, about why effectively, you did not take the
 20 option of going towards the other kraals. Remember that?
 21 MR PHATSHA: Just repeat that, I don't
 22 clearly understand.
 23 MR MPOFU: Okay, ja that's because I have
 24 not yet asked the question. I was simply saying, you have
 25 been questioned in general about why you did not take the

Page 5800

1 option of running in the direction of the other kraals, by
 2 Commissioner Hemraj, by Mr Mojapelo and by Mr Semenya in
 3 different forms. Now, the question that I wanted you to
 4 clarify is whether according to your knowledge of the
 5 geography of the place, you could have run freely towards
 6 the other kraals.
 7 MR PHATSHA: There was an opening as to
 8 run in that direction, but we wanted to run towards the
 9 road that would lead us in the direction in which we wanted
 10 to go.
 11 MR MPOFU: No, Sir, you've left all the
 12 evidence about [African language]. The witness said -
 13 MR MAHLANGU: I am still coming to that,
 14 Sir.
 15 MR MPOFU: Oh.
 16 MR PHATSHA: But then, we were stopped by
 17 the wire whilst proceeding in that direction.
 18 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Maybe this will be
 19 cleared up if we go for another inspection there.
 20 Actually, no, I will clear that with another witness who is
 21 more familiar with that place, but anyway you said that
 22 there was something. Now, this –
 23 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 24 MR MPOFU: So was the – apart from the
 25 gap, or let me put it this way, between the kraal, excuse

Page 5801

1 me Chairperson, I am trying to find an appropriate slide.
 2 Let's look at 209. You see that on the northern side or on
 3 the side closer to Nkaneng, there is a kind of stand alone
 4 shack, which you can see in front of the road.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: The shack we can see on 208.
 6 MR MPOFU: Oh, yes, thank you,
 7 Chairperson. Exactly. And yes, is that the same shack
 8 that you can see on 208, actually 208 is a better position.
 9 MR PHATSHA: Yes, it's the same shack.
 10 MR MPOFU: Yes, and in fact – thank you,
 11 Chairperson, 208 covers, my next question was whether that
 12 area is also fenced in, which is much clearer in 208.
 13 MR PHATSHA: The place is fenced off,
 14 yes.
 15 MR MPOFU: Yes. Now, between the corner
 16 of that fence, and the kraal, is about 20 metres, according
 17 to my unscientific measurement, I measured it there, you
 18 were there as well.
 19 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.
 20 MR MPOFU: Now, apart from that gap was
 21 there any other way for you to access the road to Nkaneng?
 22 MR PHATSHA: There was none.
 23 MR MPOFU: Right. And is it true that
 24 when the shots started, the volley of shots was sprayed on
 25 the protesters, was it before or after you had reached that

Page 5802

1 road?

2 MR PHATSHA: We had already turned around

3 the kraal, then the firing started.

4 MR MPOFU: Had you reached the road?

5 MR PHATSHA: Before reaching the road.

6 MR MPOFU: Thank you. And if you had

7 reached the road, what would you have done once you got

8 there?

9 MR PHATSHA: There was nothing we were

10 going to do, save to say we were running away towards the

11 settlement. That's all.

12 MR MPOFU: Okay, maybe I put it different

13 – in a difficult way by saying what would you have done?

14 Let me just say, when you had reached the road, what would

15 have been your movement into what direction?

16 MR PHATSHA: Straight towards the shack

17 settlement.

18 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now, whilst you

19 are there, just a quick one, there was an issue about your

20 evidence, using – of using the bush knife to cut wood,

21 remember that?

22 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.

23 MR MPOFU: Yes. Now, the – we see just

24 here, in these pictures that we have dealt with you see

25 three kraals, at least. Those kraals, do you know where

Page 5803

1 there – and they are all bush kraals, is that correct?

2 MR PHATSHA: We cut those thorn trees

3 with our bush knives, build the kraals for our cattle.

4 [10:52] MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

5 CHAIRPERSON: - bush kraal, but I think

6 the answer is, is it's a kraal made from thorn bushes that

7 have been cut with the knives. I think the answer came out

8 before I had a chance to put my problem.

9 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson, thank

10 you very much. And those people who would be in those

11 kraals do you know where they get their wood, the bushes?

12 MR PHATSHA: It's in the vicinity of the

13 picket.

14 MR MPOFU: Alright. Then there was from

15 Mr Motau's cross examination, there was an issue about

16 whether or not you were present, I think the word was

17 present because that's the word you used in your statement

18 during the march of the 11th August. Do you remember that?

19 MR PHATSHA: I remember that, yes.

20 MR MPOFU: Now without picking words and

21 semantics one thing that is not defeated is that you heard

22 shots being fired on that day.

23 MR PHATSHA: I heard that, yes.

24 MR MPOFU: Yes, now can you then explain

25 to the Commission when you heard those shots all we can

Page 5804

1 know is that you were within earshot of hearing shots of

2 the gunshots but can you explain to the Commission where

3 you were in relation to the area that was discussed? I

4 don't want to suggest the answer.

5 MR PHATSHA: I was quite far.

6 MR MPOFU: Okay let me put it this way -

7 all right and when using the NUM office, okay let me say

8 between the stadium and the taxi rank where would you have

9 been?

10 MR PHATSHA: Between the stadium and the

11 taxi ranks?

12 MR MPOFU: The taxi rank which is the end

13 of the road.

14 MR PHATSHA: It was before I reached the

15 side of the compound in the stadium, I'm still proceeding

16 in that direction.

17 MR MPOFU: I'm sure he didn't say he was

18 in the stadium but -

19 CHAIRPERSON: Were you at some point

20 between the stadium and taxi rank, had you not reached the

21 taxi rank?

22 MR PHATSHA: Mr Chairperson, the stadium

23 was on the other side, I went past the stadium but before I

24 reached the taxi rank.

25 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much.

Page 5805

1 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

2 MR MPOFU: Then there was quite an issue,

3 to say the least, about there being two groupings sitting

4 at the koppies and me being the only person who didn't

5 think so. Can we go to slide number 188?

6 MR PHATSHA: 188.

7 MR MPOFU: Now would you agree that if

8 one is going to talk about distinct groupings can you see

9 that there was at least a grouping that is koppie one and

10 another grouping on koppie two? It's just for starters.

11 Let me explain first, let's just explain this Chairperson.

12 There are according to the evidence three koppies there,

13 one is the big one and then the one - there's a small one

14 next to it and then there's the one where you said there

15 was a spraying of water and so on behind both. Do you

16 understand?

17 MR PHATSHA: I understand, yes.

18 MR MPOFU: And all I'm asking at this

19 stage is can you see that the grouping of people on 188,

20 the picture is cut obviously, but who seem to be on the big

21 koppie and another group is on the smaller koppie next to

22 it? Can you see that?

23 MR PHATSHA: Depending on the

24 availability of rocks there.

25 MR MPOFU: Yes, yes and then as if that

Page 5806

1 is not enough let's leave those two groupings on those two
 2 koppies and just deal with the people who are on the ground
 3 so to speak. Can you see that there are two groups in
 4 front of the big koppie and maybe another two groups, if
 5 you use the gap of the separators, in front of the small
 6 koppies?
 7 MR PHATSHA: People sat differently. One
 8 would elect to sit with that group and one would select to
 9 sit with the other.
 10 MR MPOFU: Ja look anyway look I don't
 11 want to belabour this but the point I'm making is that just
 12 a casual look at that you can separate something like six
 13 different groupings, not the two that was -
 14 MR SEMENYA SC: - have the witness tell
 15 us and himself tell us.
 16 MR MPOFU: Okay fair enough. In fact to
 17 make it - well now that -
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, Mr Mpofo, it's
 19 really - I don't want to stop you because I see the point
 20 you're endeavouring to make but it's really largely a
 21 matter of observation you know. We can observe it as well
 22 as the witness can really by looking at the photograph.
 23 MR MPOFU: Fair enough.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: But there may be some extra
 25 points you wanted to get from him seeing he was there -

Page 5807

1 MR MPOFU: I have one more question,
 2 Chair.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: So I won't stop you.
 4 MR MPOFU: Thank you Chairperson.
 5 CHAIRPERSON: It's really - you know you
 6 don't have to ask what he sees in the photograph if we can
 7 all see it.
 8 MR MPOFU: No, Chairperson, thank you.
 9 I'll only ask one more question on this. Of the people
 10 that I've called on the ground are you able to see that one
 11 of the things that separate the sections is the road that
 12 you say comes from Marikana to Nkaneng?
 13 MR PHATSHA: Yes that's so.
 14 MR MPOFU: And the situation is also the
 15 same if you look at picture 190 which apparently is when Mr
 16 Mathunjwa was addressing the group, the strikers.
 17 MR PHATSHA: Yes, it is so.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: I think we've reached a
 19 suitable to take the adjournment will you -
 20 MR MPOFU: Yes I think this is, I'm going
 21 to another topic, Chairperson. Thank you very much.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: The commission will take
 23 the tea adjournment.
 24 [ARBITRATION ADJOURNS ARBITRATION RESUMES]
 25 [11:39] CHAIRPERSON: The commission resumes,

Page 5808

1 you're still under oath. Mr Mpofo, you still had some
 2 questions for the witness.
 3 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Mr Chair.
 4 MR PHATSHA: I was still under oath.
 5 SIPETE PHATSHA: s.u.o.
 6 MR MPOFU: Mr Phasha, you were also
 7 questioned about the people that you said were washing at
 8 the koppie, you remember that?
 9 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 10 MR MPOFU: And you said something about
 11 people who were sent to fetch the water. Where were these
 12 people fetching the water?
 13 MR PHATSHA: From the shanties, from the
 14 shack settlement.
 15 MR MPOFU: And who are these people who
 16 were fetching the water and I think you were saying that in
 17 relation to the question whether there were buckets there,
 18 which you said there were.
 19 MR PHATSHA: Anybody available there to,
 20 would be sent to go and get water.
 21 MR MPOFU: And then you were also asked
 22 about the time of washing, are you able to say whether at
 23 that time which was sort of early August, mid August what
 24 the weather was like? Can you still remember, was it still
 25 winter, was it already spring, was it warm, was it cold?

Page 5809

1 MR PHATSHA: I'm not very certain of what
 2 the weather conditions were.
 3 MR MPOFU: Yes. If you consider what you
 4 were wearing on, the top that you were wearing that assist
 5 you in remembering whether it was cold or hot?
 6 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, I don't want to
 7 interrupt unduly. What, what the weather conditions were
 8 we can easily ascertain from the weather bureau. So you
 9 may have a reason for asking this witness questions about
 10 it. But if it's an issue as to whether it was cold or hot
 11 or whatever it was on that particular day we can find out
 12 from the weather bureau, we don't have to have a week of
 13 conflicting evidence from a whole lot of different
 14 witnesses as to what the weather conditions were. So you
 15 might bear that in mind for future questions you're going
 16 to ask this witness on this point.
 17 MR MPOFU: Ja well, Chairperson, I will
 18 bear it in mind but I'm not asking about weather conditions
 19 per se in that fashion. I'm asking about the experience of
 20 the witness.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Well he said he wasn't
 22 quite sure, he couldn't remember.
 23 MR MPOFU: Well -
 24 CHAIRPERSON: But that being so, if
 25 certainty is required we can get it elsewhere. I

Page 5810

1 understand your point.
 2 MR MPOFU: No, I accept that Chair, thank
 3 you very much.
 4 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya wants to say
 5 something, either that he's turned his microphone on by
 6 mistake. Mr Semenya.
 7 MR MPOFU: Mistake.
 8 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the record will
 9 show there are people with heavy blankets, it has
 10 absolutely nothing to do with the condition of the weather.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: But if the weather shows
 12 that it was warm, you may be right, if the weather shows it
 13 was bitterly cold it may, but that's a matter we can decide
 14 on later.
 15 MR MPOFU: Okay I think let's get
 16 straight to the issue. You know that, it has been
 17 suggested, it has been, the real issue, Mr Phasha, it has
 18 been suggested that people were dressed in a particular way
 19 in order to stave off rubber bullets, do you remember that?
 20 MR PHATSHA: A person dresses the way he
 21 feels like, he does the thinking for himself.
 22 MR MPOFU: Yes I accept that, well the
 23 question really that I wanted to ask you is, does it make
 24 sense to you that the same person would use blankets for
 25 rubber bullets and muti for live ammunition?

Page 5811

1 MR PHATSHA: That I don't know, Sir.
 2 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now the, you've
 3 also said that the, and I think this was quite an important
 4 answer that you gave, I'd like you to just elaborate for
 5 the commission. You were asked by Mr Semenya that if the
 6 police had asked you to disarm before the shooting what
 7 would you have done and you said you would have considered
 8 and disarmed. Can you explain that in more detail?
 9 MR PHATSHA: If you could repeat the
 10 question, Sir.
 11 MR MPOFU: You were asked by my learned
 12 colleague Mr Semenya what you would have done if the police
 13 had asked you to disarm and he specifically said if that
 14 had happened before the shooting incident, you in plural
 15 and you said we would have considered and disarmed. Can
 16 you explain that answer to the commission.
 17 MR PHATSHA: Because we did not fight
 18 them.
 19 MR MPOFU: Because you were not fighting
 20 with them, is that what you?
 21 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 22 MR MPOFU: Now, thank you Chairperson.
 23 Now you were also asked about the fact that some people may
 24 not necessarily have been from Nkaneng, can you tell us
 25 from where you were gathering at the mountain which was the

Page 5812

1 nearest residential area?
 2 MR PHATSHA: Nkaneng settlement is the
 3 nearest.
 4 MR MPOFU: I'm now going to ask you a set
 5 of questions which is effectively the last group of issues
 6 that I want to deal with you and I'm going to seek and
 7 indulgence from the Chairperson because where I'm going
 8 with this will become after a few questions and maybe let
 9 me prefix it like this. Do you think it is possible, you
 10 know that one of the key issues or objectives of this
 11 commission is to establish the truth and go beyond the,
 12 what the eye can see and try and get to the root causes.
 13 Do you appreciate that?
 14 MR PHATSHA: I understand that, yes.
 15 MR MPOFU: Now do you think that for
 16 people like us sitting on the podium who are learned people
 17 you know with many degrees, for us to be able to understand
 18 the truth, it might be important to put ourselves in the
 19 shoes of somebody like you.
 20 MR PHATSHA: The question is not clear.
 21 MR MPOFU: Do you accept that for us to
 22 get to the truth, to the real truth one of the things we
 23 have to do is to try and understand these events from the
 24 point of view of somebody like you.
 25 MR PHATSHA: Yes.

Page 5813

1 MR MPOFU: Now you've already testified
 2 that you only have effectively one year of schooling.
 3 MR PHATSHA: Yes, Sir.
 4 MR MPOFU: And that you've been a rock
 5 driller for 30 years.
 6 MR PHATSHA: Yes.
 7 MR MPOFU: One of the things that some of
 8 us here might have found to be even irritating is the fact
 9 that you wanted questions to be repeated, can you explain
 10 how your, what your sense of hearing is like from the 30
 11 years of working as rock drill operator?
 12 MR PHATSHA: I am quite hard of hearing,
 13 Sir, presently.
 14 MR MPOFU: Yes and Mr Zokwana I think it
 15 was, I think it was Mr Zokwana who gave us an example of an
 16 old man that he knows who was also a rock driller for a
 17 long time and Zokwana said that old man told him, Mr
 18 Zokwana that he now has to read the lips of his wife at
 19 home instead of listening to her.
 20 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.
 21 MR MPOFU: Now the gist of what I'm
 22 asking you and I'm only a few questions away, is whether
 23 you would agree with me that in examining this issue of the
 24 Marikana massacre would you agree with me that we don't
 25 have a right to judge you by our own middle class

Page 5814

1 standards.

2 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, I don't understand

3 the relevance.

4 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, I don't want to

5 stop you. Whether he thinks that or not is with respect

6 neither here nor there. It's certainly a point you can

7 make in argument.

8 MR MPOFU: Thank you.

9 CHAIRPERSON: The point you've made about

10 he's been hard of hearing after 30 years of rock drilling

11 is a factor we have to bear in mind as well.

12 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

13 CHAIRPERSON: With respect to him his

14 answer to the question you want to ask him, if this is

15 going to help, it may well be we come to a similar

16 conclusion ourselves, assisted thereto by argument from

17 you.

18 MR MPOFU: Thank you.

19 CHAIRPERSON: I don't think it's

20 necessary to ask him.

21 MR MPOFU: I accept that, Chairperson.

22 Yes okay I'll ask specific questions and maybe I'll just

23 use myself. Look for somebody like me it might be a

24 strange thing for people to be washing in a group, a large

25 group. What is the normal method by which people wash in

Page 5815

1 the compounds?

2 MR PHATSHA: What happens is in the

3 compounds people actually queue, they stand in a queue to

4 go and wash in the change house, it is the washing room

5 because some of them are very small.

6 MR MPOFU: Again for somebody like me who

7 has high walls and alarm systems I might find it strange

8 that you keep sharp weapons in your shack for protection,

9 but what are the dangers that one might face in the

10 conditions where you live?

11 MR PHATSHA: The position is, Mr

12 Chairperson, in the shack settlement where we stay

13 sometimes a whistle is blown and the blowing of a whistle

14 indicates something has happened, either there's a theft

15 taking place or some other crimes is being committed and we

16 keep these weapons because we do not know what it is that

17 the perpetrator or the other person has.

18 MR MPOFU: And also you might want to

19 tell the commission how it feels for you, following from

20 the question you were asked by Mr Ntsebenza under cross-

21 examination to have, to abandon an organisation to which

22 you have contributed part of your salary for 30 years?

23 MR PHATSHA: I feel very much hurt, Sir,

24 because all the money that I've contributed towards this

25 organisation hasn't benefited me in any way.

Page 5816

1 MR MPOFU: Finally in that line of

2 questioning. I think on two occasions you in explaining

3 the, your change of unions. You said that it is because

4 the NUM had shot at you and there were, it was explained to

5 you by us that you were not shot. You remember that?

6 [11:59] MR PHATSHA: I remember that, yes.

7 MR MPOFU: And yesterday, in the same

8 vein, you said that you had, after the kraal incident you

9 had to go to die where the others were dying.

10 MR PHATSHA: I remember that.

11 MR MPOFU: And once again, it was

12 explained to you that you are alive.

13 MR PHATSHA: I remember that, yes.

14 MR MPOFU: Can you explain to the

15 Commission why it is that you felt that if one of your

16 colleagues was shot, if the other one had died, that it was

17 you who was being shot and who had died.

18 MR PHATSHA: If the question would be

19 repeated.

20 MR MPOFU: Can you explain to the

21 Commission why it is that on those two occasions, let's

22 start with the one where, of the shooting, why you said, I

23 left the NUM because they shot at me, meaning you, Mr

24 Phasha, and why you felt that they were shooting at you

25 when we know that the bullets went through somebody else's

Page 5817

1 flesh.

2 MR PHATSHA: It's because the place, the

3 direction in which I was running, was closed, I had to turn

4 back, and I was then injured. I then decided I would run

5 to the place where the others are dying, in order to go and

6 die there, but I did not die, Mr Chairperson, through the

7 grace of the Almighty, I was saved.

8 CHAIRPERSON: That's not really an answer

9 to the question, but I think what counsel is trying to make

10 to you, is it's a basic principle of trade unionism, and

11 various other forms of activity, than an injury to one is

12 an injury to all. So I take it that you felt your

13 colleagues were killed, while engaging in the enterprise in

14 which you were engaged, it was as if you had been killed as

15 well, and if your colleagues were attacked in similar

16 circumstances, it was in effect an attack on you, in

17 accordance with this basic principle, an injury to one is

18 an injury to all. Is that the point you were trying to

19 make, Mr Mpofo?

20 MR MPOFU: Chair, yes, you stole the

21 words right from my mouth. That was exactly the next

22 proposition, thank you, Chairperson.

23 MR PHATSHA: That is exactly what I am

24 saying.

25 MR MPOFU: Thank you, I am indebted to Mr

Page 5818

1 Chairperson. Now, I put something to Mr Zokwana about a
 2 tendency maybe to take people like you or other RDOs for
 3 granted or to undermine their intelligence, and I want to
 4 ask you about two answers that you gave yesterday, or
 5 rather to clarify. Did –

6 MR TIP SC: Sorry, Mr Chair, this must be
 7 put properly, the questions were raised with Mr Zokwana,
 8 and Mr Zokwana entirely distanced himself from the idea
 9 that –

10 MR MPOFU: Yes.

11 MR TIP SC: - NUM was an organisation in
 12 fact belittles people in the –

13 MR MPOFU: Absolutely.

14 MR TIP SC: - the position of RDOs. So
 15 that must be put before questions about it are raised.

16 CHAIRPERSON: You've now put that on
 17 record. He says he is going to ask the witness about, to
 18 answers he gave, to clarify the answers he gave. That
 19 clearly is something that can appropriately be done in re-
 20 examination, once the introductory remarks that you
 21 disagree with, have been rectified. Please carry on, Mr
 22 Mpofo.

23 MR MPOFU: Thank you. In fairness to Mr
 24 Tip and Mr Zokwana, Mr Zokwana did agree with me and did
 25 not associate himself with that conduct. But the issue

Page 5819

1 really I want to ask you, Mr Phasha, is that you know, we
 2 know that the employer, that is to say you were waiting
 3 for, had taken the attitude that they were not going to
 4 speak to you, to your group, unless, if you had disarmed.
 5 We know that. But the question is, did the employer ever
 6 convey that message to you, to the group?

7 MR PHATSHA: Never heard that.

8 MR MPOFU: Secondly –

9 MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson, it should be
 10 borne in mind various communiqué were distributed even up
 11 to the 16th of August. I will deal with it at the relevant
 12 point.

13 CHAIRPERSON: You can deal with it, as
 14 part of your case, but I mean I am not sure whether any
 15 communiqués were ever distributed by carrier pigeon or
 16 anything else on the koppie, and the point being made I
 17 think, is that on the koppie didn't know that. And he says
 18 they didn't. You obviously may wish to challenge that. If
 19 you want to ask further questions following on the re-
 20 examination on this point, I will allow you to do so.
 21 Alternatively, you may wish to lead evidence on it, but
 22 it's a perfectly permissible question and so I shall allow
 23 Mr Mpofo to proceed.

24 MR MPOFU: Mr Phasha, do you know what a
 25 communiqué is, and if you do, did you ever receive it?

Page 5820

1 MR PHATSHA: I never received any such.

2 MR MPOFU: Thank you. Now, similarly we
 3 know that the police had taken the attitude that they were
 4 going to move to the so-called technical phase which meant
 5 unsettling and disarming and arresting some of the people
 6 in your group, but did anybody from the police ever care to
 7 say that to you, as a group, before the barbed wire was
 8 pulled?

9 MR PHATSHA: Nobody, I never heard that.

10 MR MPOFU: When the barbed wire was being
 11 pulled, would it have been clear to you what was going to
 12 happen next, whether you were going to be shot at,
 13 arrested, assaulted, or given food?

14 MR PHATSHA: Just repeat the question,
 15 Sir.

16 MR MPOFU: Okay, I will simplify it.
 17 When the barbed wire as being pulled –

18 COURT: Or just to put the question on
 19 the basis, when the barbed wire was pulled, what did you
 20 think was going to happen? What did you think the police
 21 were going to do? Previously you gave a whole series of
 22 alternatives, which might well be regarded as leading, but
 23 it's better to put it in the way I suggest, I would say.

24 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I am
 25 indebted to the Chairperson. Okay, I will ask it in even a

Page 5821

1 more open-ended way. When the barbed wire was being pulled
 2 by the Nyalas, did you have any idea what the intention of
 3 the police was? No, no, sorry, that's not the question.

4 MR MAHLANGU: The question is?

5 MR MPOFU: The question is not what did
 6 he think was going to happen, the question is whether did
 7 he know or not know what the intention of the police was?

8 MR PHATSHA: I did not know what was
 9 intended by these people.

10 MR MPOFU: Okay, now, finally, I know
 11 that you don't want us to talk about Mr X.

12 MR PHATSHA: Even now, Sir.

13 MR MPOFU: Yes, but please forgive me,
 14 you've already testified that the things that Mr X is going
 15 to say are things that you either don't know or you deny.

16 MR PHATSHA: Even now, yes.

17 MR MPOFU: But there is something that I
 18 think is important which you said, your evidence – or
 19 rather, you were asked about, you were told that the so-
 20 called group of warriors called itself "Makaraba." Do you
 21 remember that?

22 MR PHATSHA: I remember that, yes.

23 MR MPOFU: And you said more than once to
 24 the Commission that the only Makaraba you know is a
 25 protective hat that you wear in the mine, is that correct?

Page 5822

1 MR PHATSHA: It is so, yes.
 2 MR MPOFU: So if Mr X, the off chance
 3 that Mr X is correct on at least one thing, would you
 4 describe the Makaraba that you know, as a tool of attack or
 5 a tool of defence?
 6 MR PHATSHA: The Makaraba we use, this
 7 protective helmet, is actually intended as an instrument to
 8 use so that the rocks don't cause us injuries when they
 9 fall on our heads.
 10 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I
 11 have nothing further.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: You indicated that you had
 13 a difficulty in relation to the point about communiqué.
 14 Did you want to ask any further questions on that limited
 15 point?
 16 MR MOTAU SC: No, Chair, I will deal with
 17 it together with the other outstanding aspects, thanks.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Phatsha, you
 19 are excused.
 20 MR PHATSHA: I thank you, Mr Chairperson,
 21 thank you very much.
 22 [NO FURTHER QUESTIONS – WITNESS EXCUSED]
 23 CHAIRPERSON: You can go, Ms Barnes.
 24 MS BARNES: Just before the next witness
 25 is called, I was hoping for permission to place something

Page 5823

1 on record.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: Well, it depends what it
 3 is, I suppose, but you better wait until the – sorry, Ms
 4 Barnes, you were going to say something before that
 5 handshake ceremony took place.
 6 MS BARNES: Chair, it relates to Mr Gavin
 7 Hartford, and an incorrect impression that appears to have
 8 been created in the Commission regarding his relationship
 9 with certain of the parties. I just need to explain what
 10 happened and correct it, and I would like to do that by
 11 reading a very short statement into the record, if I may.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Please proceed.
 13 MS BARNES: Thank you, Chair. "The AMCU
 14 team wishes to make this statement in order to correct an
 15 erroneous impression that has been created in the
 16 Commission regarding Mr Gavin Hartford. On the 24th of
 17 January 2013 in the course of cross-examining Mr Eric
 18 Gcilitshana, Adv Barnes, who is myself, on behalf of the
 19 AMCU team introduced as an exhibit an article Mr Gavin
 20 Hartford entitled "The Mining Industry Strike, what are the
 21 causes and what are the resolutions?" In the course of
 22 introducing the article, there was an exchange between
 23 myself and the Chairperson of the Commission in terms of
 24 which the Chairperson asked where the article came from,
 25 and I then answered as follows, this appears from the

Page 5824

1 transcript, "Chair, I am afraid I am not entirely sure
 2 where this article was published. We are planning to call
 3 Mr Gavin Hartford as a witness in phase 2 so I am sure he
 4 will tell us. He will then be able to confirm the contents
 5 of the article." Mr Gavin Hartford is an independent
 6 expert witness whose paper was submitted in order to
 7 provide analytical context for understanding the events
 8 that led up to the Marikana shooting. He specifically does
 9 not represent any organisations involved in the proceedings
 10 of the Farlam Commission. He was in fact never intended to
 11 be called as a witness for the AMCU team and was only
 12 intended to be called as a witness for the families team if
 13 required. This was stated by the families team in its
 14 opening statement.
 15 [12:19] I did not intend to convey in my exchange with
 16 the chairperson, that has been referred to earlier, that Mr
 17 Hartford was to be called by the AMCU team or that he was
 18 working in any way for AMCU. I intended to convey that Mr
 19 Hartford was to be called as a witness for the families
 20 team and that I would, if necessary, ask him about the
 21 authenticity of his article." Thank you, Chairperson.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, that then makes
 23 clear what you intended, I take it from the beginning to
 24 make clear. Mr Mpofo.
 25 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson.

Page 5825

1 Chairperson, I am ready to call my next witness, however as
 2 I indicated on Friday between the two witnesses I was
 3 intending to move a certain application. I see that it's a
 4 little bit too early even for an early lunch because I
 5 would have suggested just to use that natural break to get
 6 my ducks in a row, but also to confer with Mr Ntsebeza on
 7 the issue of the application. If the chairperson is so
 8 inclined, could we just ask for a – maybe a longish break
 9 which may incorporate a lunch. It is just so that we don't
 10 waste too much time.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: I was intending – we will
 12 take a half hour lunch adjournment.
 13 MR MPOFU: Can we make it an hour,
 14 Chairperson, please. I know you are trying to make up the
 15 time for Friday.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, I am. Alright, well
 17 we will take the – we will adjourn now until half past one.
 18 MR MPOFU: Thank you, very much.
 19 CHAIRPERSON: The commission will now
 20 adjourn.
 21 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
 22 [13:35] CHAIRPERSON: Commission resumes. Mr
 23 Mpofo, are you going to address us?
 24 MR MPOFU: Yes thank you very much,
 25 Chairperson, and I'm indebted to the Chairperson and the

1 Commission for the extra time. Chairperson, as indicated
 2 last week I am going to be moving an application to the
 3 Commission in terms of the amended regulations in respect
 4 of the issue of the venue of the Commission. Just to put
 5 the landscape, Chairperson, I'm bringing this application
 6 essentially the applicants are the law firms which have
 7 instructed me which I spelt out at the beginning of the
 8 Commission and if one likes the second applicant would be
 9 the Social Economic Rights Institute, SERI which supports
 10 the application and Mr Ntsebeza will address some of the
 11 issues once I've finished. But essentially, Chairperson,
 12 the application is not opposed so the other parties would
 13 range from - these are parties who support or parties who
 14 are indifferent and that was a specific condition that we
 15 put for ourselves when we dealt with this. It's quite a
 16 very difficult and tricky situation and I'll explain it now
 17 Chairperson. The issue really was that we agreed that we
 18 would only move this application if it got the support of
 19 all the parties to different degrees.

20 CHAIRPERSON: I understand you to say
 21 that some of the parties support the application, others
 22 effectively abide but they don't depose. Can you perhaps
 23 tell us firstly who are the applicants? Let's get that on
 24 record. Who are those who support the application and who
 25 are those who abide? Perhaps I should say at this point as

1 you know from the regulations any decision to move the
 2 venue of the Commission has to be made by the Minister of
 3 Justice and myself in consultation with each other.

4 MR MPOFU: That's correct.

5 CHAIRPERSON: On I think the phrase is
 6 "reasonable grounds shown" and I think that's the phrase of
 7 the regulation. But clearly when you've finished the
 8 application and some of your colleagues may also wish to
 9 comment, they may wish to say something the proceedings
 10 will be - what you say will be transcribed and I will then
 11 have to arrange a meeting with the Minister and he and I
 12 will then have to go through it together and see if can
 13 come to a common mind on what should be done. But it's
 14 important that what is said be as full as possible because
 15 that's what the Minister is really going to see.

16 MR MPOFU: That will be the application.
 17 Thank you, yes Chairperson. Chairperson unfortunately I'm
 18 not in a position readily, I will do so to give you a full
 19 list but what I will do before the ruling is out is to do a
 20 kind of roll call or alternatively the parties will
 21 indicate their positions. But what I know -

22 CHAIRPERSON: What we should do, we will
 23 get the transcript ready tomorrow morning I think so what
 24 you can do is you could write a letter to the Secretary of
 25 the Commission which can then be annexed to the transcript

1 so that that'll be among the documents which will be put
 2 before the Minister and which he and I will consider in due
 3 course.

4 MR MPOFU: Thank you Chairperson. Thank
 5 you Chairperson but what I can say positively is that the
 6 main applicants are the parties represented by myself and
 7 Mr Ntsebeza and we will address you directly. And I think
 8 what I can also say Chair is that the - what we broadly
 9 refer to as the "victim parties" are bringing this
 10 application and the common thing between them is not so
 11 much the victimhood as such more than - the real basis of
 12 the application are economic factors which I will outline
 13 which are common to both. And that, Chairperson, is
 14 exactly where the paradox of the application lies because
 15 after all we would have understood that this venue among
 16 other things would have been chosen to benefit what we
 17 would call the victim parties. But it was a question of
 18 weighing the one advantage over the other and that enabled
 19 us to get the instructions to make application for the
 20 relocation.

21 Chairperson and Commission, you will recall that
 22 last year I think in October the applicant parties raised
 23 repeatedly in this forum the issue of the lack of funding
 24 for what I will broadly term the "victim parties." This of
 25 course was at the time when we all thought the Commission

1 would finish in January. As matters stand now there has
 2 already been one extension of the Commission, currently to
 3 the end of May 2013 and I should think that those of us who
 4 are now participating in the Commission I would quite
 5 frankly not be optimistic that we will even meet that
 6 second deadline. So that even the current extension to May
 7 looks like - it's clear, more than probable that a further
 8 extension, at least one more will be necessitated. And
 9 that, Chairperson and Commissioners, is not without the
 10 constant urging on from the bench and making sure that time
 11 is not wasted. It just so happens that something of this
 12 magnitude invariably develops a life of its own and I've no
 13 doubt that considerations of fairness and other positive
 14 issues like that are what really drives the Commissioners
 15 you know allowing for time, sometimes reluctantly so. And
 16 I think this is one of the things that you yourself
 17 Chairperson said from day one which was the balance between
 18 giving the parties the opportunity to ventilate and achieve
 19 the objectives of the Commission on the one hand. And on
 20 the other acting with the requisite expeditiousness. Now
 21 against that background Chairperson we are then faced with
 22 the reality of a Commission which might run well into the
 23 second half of the year. And the ability of the victim
 24 parties to be represented and we would like to assume that
 25 everyone agrees that those parties are essential to the

<p style="text-align: right;">Page 5830</p> <p>1 quest for truth that this Commission is all about because 2 after all without the voice of the victims then we would 3 have only one version and that would be unlikely to extract 4 the truth that the country needs.</p> <p>5 Now then comes the issue of the hard economy. 6 This venue is, apart from the fees that the lawyers have to 7 forego, those who are not getting paid, the venue itself 8 lends itself to extra costs on top of that cost of foregone 9 fees. And some of the costs are even less tangible, just 10 the travelling time you know the ability to be able to use 11 some of that time for consultation and to use the scarce 12 resources that the lawyers are using effectively to 13 subsidise their participation here and if those resources 14 are also going to be depleted by travelling, accommodation 15 and all the other intangible costs that I've made mention 16 of then of course what that means in pure economic terms is 17 that the point at which those resources will run out will 18 happen much faster than if those costs were less than they 19 are. As it is, Chairperson, I can hazard an unscientific 20 guess that says even for the team which I represent which 21 is probably of the main team, the cheapest team so to speak 22 to run because it is understaffed already but the cost can 23 - and not less in the order of R50 000 per day, a very 24 conservative estimate. And again I'm not sure but some of 25 the teams that have almost an equal or even a less</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 5832</p> <p>1 to move the application that this Commission be moved to a 2 venue that is closer to the Pretoria/Johannesburg area. We 3 do understand that our learned colleagues in the evidence 4 leaders team have want to inform them of the application 5 made, thankfully some pre-emptive practical arrangements or 6 at least investigations around some of the practical issues 7 that will ensue should the application be successful. I 8 can just say that the preference of the parties on this 9 side of the table would be obviously a venue in the centre 10 of town so that it might be easier for free movement and 11 more repeat movement and cheaper movement, but obviously 12 that's a matter that we cannot be too prescriptive about. 13 I can mention that some of my colleagues have made specific 14 suggestions and that's a matter that we could - that might 15 be dealt with between ourselves as colleagues with the 16 evidence leaders.</p> <p>17 [13:55] Then, Chairperson, finally if I can mention the 18 issue, there are certain conditions that apply to what I've 19 referred to generally as the victim parties. Which we also 20 think might be resolved in the period between now and the 21 conclusion of the consultations that I've referred to. 22 Pertaining the Chairperson and the Minister and once again 23 we've managed to whittle down those conditions to really 24 one issue. Which is the issue of transportation and the 25 mobility of the affected parties or interested parties</p>
<p style="text-align: right;">Page 5831</p> <p>1 responsibility you know who probably go four or five times 2 of that amount and I don't have to tell the Chairperson 3 about the amount of work that is involved in dealing with 4 hundreds and hundreds of victims. I think that kind of 5 requirement has been amply demonstrated just by what we've 6 been required and have been able to do up to now. I think 7 I can safely say that we have probably or arguably one of 8 the hardest jobs to do with the least resources.</p> <p>9 Now we understand, Chair, and of course parties 10 will speak for themselves, but for all the parties and even 11 including the evidence leaders some of the other costs that 12 I've mentioned apart from the issue of foregoing fees and 13 so on are applicable across the board and eventually those 14 costs will be borne by the tax payers generally. To sum up 15 those costs. And therefore, Chairperson, this is where we 16 have this issue of wanting to go along with the good 17 intention of being within the proximity of the communities 18 that are directly affected but when they were faced with 19 the Hobson's choice obviously their choice is to continue 20 with the representation and maybe make their own 21 contribution by going quietly to rally the extra mile. And 22 that's why, Chairperson, we would like to move the 23 application for - given the pre-conditions that you've 24 mentioned of you yourself as Chairperson and the Minister 25 having to consult each other in terms of the regulations,</p>	<p style="text-align: right;">Page 5833</p> <p>1 between now, rather between here or where they currently 2 live and the new venue, should there be one.</p> <p>3 We would like, Mr Chairperson, we'll speak for 4 the families that come far away, obviously would simply 5 like their status to be maintained wherever the venue is. 6 But for the parties that I represent which include the, 7 some of the injured people, the arrested people and 8 obviously the broader community that has an interest in 9 this matter which has been attending any way, the issue of 10 the provision of transport would become quite important. 11 As matters stand already people have to travel from the 12 kind of greater Wonderkop area to Rustenburg.</p> <p>13 So what would happen is that the travelling time 14 would simply be increased and as matters stand, 15 Chairperson, we are engaging particularly with our 16 colleagues from Lonmin because currently Lonmin kindly 17 offers a bus service between that area and the venue of 18 this commission now. So we'd like, what I would broadly 19 define as the state parties which would include the 20 department and various role-players maybe to come to the 21 parties by supplementing the Lonmin transport and Lonmin 22 has not, I must put on record yet committed that if the 23 venue had changed they would extend the current transport 24 service but I'm, having had dealings with them I'd be very 25 surprised if that is not extended and then so in the same</p>

1 spirit we will, we would and in the letter that the
2 Chairperson has referred to be maybe more specific about
3 what kind of supplementary transport the state parties
4 might provide in order to meet this condition of
5 transporting the people.

6 Thank you, Chairperson, the only issue really
7 that I'd like to end is that we make this application as I
8 say almost reluctantly because we know it was meant to
9 serve our, the constituencies that we represent. But the
10 reality is that if we are going to achieve the higher goal
11 of running a commission that is likely to achieve it's
12 intended results then we have no option but to take this
13 move and we hope that the Chairperson will in the same
14 spirit receive a sympathetic ear should the Chairperson be
15 inclined to initiate the consultations with the Minister
16 and that in due course would then be told of the outcome.
17 Thank you, Chairperson.

18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofo. Mr
19 Ntsebeza, I understand you're also going to make
20 submissions in regard to this application?

21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes that is so, Mr
22 Chairman.

23 CHAIRPERSON: Proceed.

24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, our
25 position is as the representatives of the families and

1 we were at the commission.

2 Which was a bit of an iron glove because unless
3 one has no serious consideration for one's reputation you
4 can't be here if you have not an enormous amount of work in
5 preparation. So a lot of work as the commission knows from
6 the commission's own preparations for this matter to be on
7 top of the thing one has to be putting a lot of preparation
8 and that is why as I submitted in previous occasions, when
9 I was raising this question Tim Bruinders whose senior
10 counsel for AMCU and I and all the other counsel spent
11 virtually the whole of September donating our time pro bono
12 because that was preparation that we were doing for a full
13 month, a number of hours without being here and therefore
14 it was unpaid work.

15 Our own view Chairman and members of the
16 commission had always been that this be a commission of
17 inquiry and one therefore that had been established at the
18 State President's instance and not being a litigation.
19 There would be a budget for the commission and out of that
20 budget there would be provision made for legal costs of the
21 commission and we cited at the beginning for instance
22 precedence in the United Kingdom, like when there was a
23 commission of inquiry of this nature in the Bloody Sunday
24 Commission in the Northern Ireland, into events in Northern
25 Ireland where all the parties that participated in that

1 especially now that Chair is going to be approaching the
2 Minister of Justice it is important for us to let even the
3 ministry of justice and constitutional development
4 appreciate where we come from so that the commission also
5 is assisted in articulating the reasons that should be
6 persuasive to the minister giving his consent in
7 consultation with the Chair for the venue to be moved from
8 where it is and in our humble and respectful submission the
9 point to start at would be to say who is it that are
10 instructing the families team.

11 Counsel, representing the family and there are
12 only three of us, Adv Nicole Lewis, Adv Motloeny, Tholoana
13 Motloeny and I. I'm instructed by a non governmental
14 organisation called the Socio Economic Rights Institute,
15 SERI for short. In the nature of things even as we were
16 instructed this NGO told us in specific terms that it was
17 going to fundraise in order for us to be able to be paid
18 for our services. We were told also in very, in no
19 uncertain terms that we may never even be paid because the
20 pertinent question of getting paid would depend on whether
21 or not they have fundraised sufficiently and properly and
22 one of the conditions was that even if they do raise
23 resources sufficient to engage us as counsel we would be
24 paid for appearances at a commission and would not be paid
25 for preparations and anything else other than for days that

1 commission were funded at taxpayer's expense as is the case
2 here with some parties.

3 So our sense was that and it is important that
4 the Chairman is going to be meeting with the Minister of
5 Justice and Constitutional Development. Our sense
6 therefore is that this is something that should be funded
7 by the state because it is done at its instance and the
8 state should in fact be very keen on the equality of arms
9 principle. If it is good enough for the state to make sure
10 that some of the state parties, as my learned friend
11 indicates, are able to be afforded representation at senior
12 counsel level, junior counsel level, senior junior counsel
13 level all around then on the principle of equality of arms
14 that kind of representation should also be extended to the
15 families as what we sought to convey through the Ministry
16 of Justice.

17 Now that having been said, when we were indicated
18 to that endeavours would be made for the Legal Aid Board to
19 support us our stance was that, we are sitting so that no
20 one wants to look a gift horse in the mouth. It is, it was
21 a misunderstanding of the principle on which we were
22 proceeding and that is why whilst we were not and when I
23 say we, I am talking about those who are instructed by
24 SERI, whilst we were not going to close our eyes to an
25 offer from the Legal Aid Board and we were quite grateful

1 for that from what I'm told by those who run SERI we were
2 still of the view that the principal is being missed here.

3 We would like you, Chair, to convey to the
4 Ministry and the State that it's unfortunate that the
5 configuration of the support for the families and what my
6 learned friend calls the victim parties here seems to be
7 dealing with them as though they were Cinderellas and they
8 were not entitled to the same benefits and those that are
9 here who are funded by the state at state expense and it is
10 very unfortunate and if it assists for the Ministry to
11 reconsider their position with respect to funding then it
12 will all go well because I can promise you now at the end
13 of these proceedings I will come back to this issue that
14 the victims in this commission, the commissioners were
15 being made to undertake in the very difficult task of
16 presiding in a commission where there clearly was no
17 equality of arms.

18 What is now the position with the families, the
19 families are still represented by SERI but SERI was given
20 some funding by the Legal Aid Board and as I said I don't
21 want to give, look a gift horse in the mouth, and that
22 funding was up to only January this year which was the time
23 that was originally intended with the time during which the
24 commission would be sitting. The distance of where the
25 commission was sitting from where SERI's head office is,

1 being Johannesburg, is not an important Chair, it is quite
2 a significant distance, it's no less than two hours drive
3 and it's not a kind of distance that you want to commuting
4 to and fro the scene of venue and therefore even in the
5 first period as early as November we were being
6 communicated to by those who instruct us that it might be
7 difficult for them to stay the course on the basis on which
8 they had engaged us.

9 So we always be reminded that we are engaged here
10 on a basis where we may not be able to be kept to represent
11 the families for as long as it would be ideal for us to do
12 so. For instance, I was told that the Legal Aid Board, the
13 main funder for SERI for this matter was only going to be
14 able to pay for my fees on a basis which is two thirds what
15 I usually charge but it could also be happening for only 30
16 days of the commission. So I had to cut my costs, I mean
17 according to the cloth that we have, on a daily basis I
18 count okay how many times have I been to the commission,
19 it's getting closer to thirty, do I need to be there and
20 that's the basis on which I've been here having to make a
21 choice as to whether it is absolutely necessary when there
22 are transcripts and all those things for me to be here
23 because each day I'm here is eroding into the 30 days that
24 the Legal Aid Board was prepared to fund the case.
25 [14:15] We were quite concerned when even last year in

1 consultation with the arrested and injured It was the view
2 that the venue must move closer to where counsel and legal
3 representatives are. When that was put to us and we
4 consulted with our clients our clients were disinclined to
5 accept that on the basis that the venue of where the
6 happenings, I mean the venue is where everything happened,
7 the families were staying here and a whole range of other
8 things and the commission recalls at that stage there was
9 not even support for them to be here from wherever they are
10 in the far flung areas of our country and beyond and there
11 have been no arrangements for transportation and for their
12 boarding and lodging. Fortunately we are now past that
13 kind of hurdle.

14 So we are now in a position, Chair, happily where
15 the stability at the level at which the Ministry is
16 supporting us and I wouldn't like to be tripping in my own
17 ankles by making a submission that we should suggest that
18 we are not cognisant of the fact that a lot of support has
19 come. We are now in a situation where the families from
20 wherever they are from the far flung areas of the country
21 stay here at reasonably good accommodation, they stay at a
22 hotel and only two families stay in the informal
23 settlements because that's where they are settled.

24 So the position would be that those families
25 would remain where they are except that the two families

1 who are, who stay in the settlements would as the families
2 who in any event are staying at a hotel here in Rustenburg
3 there would have to be an arrangement for their
4 transportation to and from the venue which is going to be
5 nearer to Johannesburg or which is going to be as near to
6 Pretoria as I understand the proposition is.

7 So that's, the families once it was explained to
8 them that for those kinds of economic reasons, not only
9 from the point of view of trying to keep the legal team as
10 long as it is possible to do so in the circumstances of
11 their funding, but that there would be no transportation
12 costs for the legal team, there would be no boarding and
13 lodging costs for the legal team, we'll stay at our homes,
14 it then made sense to them if we said we are going to
15 engage the Ministry of Justice for purposes only of making
16 sure that the transportation which they are being afforded
17 from where they are, the hotel and the informal settlement
18 to this venue would continue as before accept as my learned
19 friend it would now be over a longer distance. But if it
20 can be guaranteed then they are quite happy to persuade, to
21 be persuaded that it is in their interests that the venue
22 must be shifted. Chair, I'm having -

23 CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, if I can just
24 understand you. I understand those people who live at
25 Marikana, live in the informal settlement? What you're

Page 5842

1 suggesting is instead of being transported either the
 2 assistance of Lonmin or some other way to Rustenburg they
 3 would then be, they would, if the application succeeds be
 4 transported to Johannesburg or Pretoria or wherever,
 5 whatever the other venue would be. I take it that the
 6 families who come from places such as Pondoland and so
 7 forth would then, instead of be coming from Pondoland to OR
 8 Tambo and then onto Rustenburg would instead be
 9 accommodated in Johannesburg or Pretoria, is that correct?
 10 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Chair I misrepresented
 11 the position. I've just been instructed that actually all
 12 families other than the two who are in the, two families in
 13 the informal settlements, the remainder of them would be
 14 going to hotel accommodation closer to the venue if the
 15 application succeeds.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: Transport costs would be in
 17 effect be reduced because presumably the distance they'd
 18 have to transported from OR Tambo to a hotel in the
 19 vicinity of the new venue would obviously be substantially
 20 less than the distance between OR Tambo and Rustenburg?
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Indeed, Chair.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: So in actual fact there
 23 would be a saving?
 24 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Yes. We would like the
 25 commission, Chair, to the extent that the Commission Chair

Page 5843

1 will be consulting with the Minister of Justice to also be
 2 aware that when once the commission sought an extension of
 3 their life, if I may call it that, to May this year SERI
 4 began almost immediately to engage the Legal Aid Board to
 5 find out if they are quite ready to give support of the
 6 nature that they had given to this point to the families,
 7 for the representation of the families and my instruction
 8 is that that engagement has started but whether it is going
 9 to bear any successful result is going to be a matter of
 10 time.
 11 It might be important for the Ministry to get
 12 that information. So whilst we were quite happy to
 13 associate ourselves with the other victims who was getting
 14 even the Legal Aid Board funding that our lawyers are
 15 getting we do make the point, Chair and Commissioners, that
 16 we are quite happy with the efforts that the department has
 17 done but we still say it would still be better if they
 18 apply their minds properly to the equality of arms
 19 principle that I articulated. But then so far as the
 20 application, this application is concerned, even in the
 21 interim, if the conditions for the families remain and it
 22 is just a question of changing venues the families no
 23 longer oppose a move from Pretoria to Johannesburg.
 24 CHAIRPERSON: You mean a move to Pretoria
 25 or Johannesburg.

Page 5844

1 MR NTSEBEZA SC: To Pretoria. Ja, well
 2 not to make a fine point of it I'm told by my instructing
 3 attorney here that we have no instructions to talk about
 4 Johannesburg, we've got instructions to talk about
 5 Pretoria. There are no objection to the commission moving
 6 to Gauteng, whether it's the south or the north of Gauteng.
 7 CHAIRPERSON: Anything further you wish
 8 to say?
 9 MR NTSEBEZA SC: No nothing, Mr Chair.
 10 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpfu, you want to add
 11 something before the -
 12 MR MPOFU: Yes Chair -
 13 CHAIRPERSON: Other representatives of
 14 the other parties to say whatever they wish to say?
 15 MR MPOFU: Yes, yes before they do,
 16 Chair. If I may just for the record since this is an oral
 17 application to place certain matters on the record.
 18 Firstly very briefly, Chair, is that the, some of the
 19 things that you might have to convey include the fact that
 20 the timing of this application is deliberately made at
 21 least on our part at this stage when at least the first
 22 batch of the victim witnesses have testified and at the
 23 point at which we are just about to call the last of that
 24 first batch. So there's some of the measures that we have
 25 deliberately taken to try and ameliorate any negative

Page 5845

1 effects of such a move.
 2 Secondly Chair, I was reminded by my learned
 3 colleague Mr Ntsebeza on the issue of fundraising we are
 4 indeed pursuing alternatives, we're not just sitting on our
 5 laurels and indeed on our part for the first part of the,
 6 of the original segment we did manage to get some funding
 7 which was not advocate but as Mr Ntsebeza said you don't
 8 look a gift horse in the mouth which has since dried up.
 9 So since the beginning of this year we are back to square
 10 one. I think it's important that we do disclose that and
 11 we just haven't had the permission to get, to name the
 12 funder but it's not a big success.
 13 The third issue Chair, is also to just to place
 14 on record that on least on our team we are now down to one
 15 advocate and so one doesn't even have the latitude to take
 16 days off and on a serious note, Chairperson, all of us, as
 17 former practitioners I'm sure that I don't have to bore you
 18 but what that would entail -
 19 CHAIRPERSON: Not a former practitioner
 20 but my two colleagues are still very much practitioners.
 21 MR MPOFU: They are still -
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Least the wrong impression
 23 be created by what you're saying.
 24 MR MPOFU: Just so long as the commission
 25 has been going, Chair, we become former practitioners and

1 I'm sure any practitioner current or former would
 2 appreciate the difficulties of being in that situation.
 3 The fourth or rather the third issue is, was about the
 4 practical considerations, I think it's the fourth. On top
 5 of everything that we have said, Chair, to be quite frank
 6 this venue has also added to the woes of, and the costs in
 7 the sense that one has had all, some of these unfortunate
 8 stop starts, if it's not the plumbing, it's the electricity
 9 and so on.

10 So those are some of the considerations that we,
 11 we don't want to belabour but which we hope the
 12 Chairperson, might mention as impeding in any event the
 13 fast progress of the commission and that I can say,
 14 Chairperson, speaking for myself and I'm sure also from my
 15 other colleagues that despite all these problems at this
 16 stage of the commission for us, you know pulling out is not
 17 an option.

18 We have come this far so we need really is just
 19 assistance to be met halfway so that we can complete the
 20 mission because we are at this stage you know
 21 professionally and maybe even emotionally invested in the
 22 commission and we are going to see it through. Either the
 23 hard way or if at least some of the issues we have raised
 24 and some of the issues raised by my learned colleague, Mr
 25 Ntsebeza can be attended to hopefully in not such a hard

1 way.
 2 And therefore, Chairperson, in closing all I'm
 3 saying is that the, just going back to the, what I've
 4 called the paradox of the application it is that the people
 5 that we represent effectively have taken the stance that
 6 the pursuit of the truth is paramount and whether that
 7 truth is going to be pursued here or in Jo'burg or in
 8 Pretoria, the pursuit of the truth is what we, given this
 9 difficult trench is what we would hope to facilitate and we
 10 hope that this move will broadly speaking, for the reasons
 11 that I've mentioned earlier, facilitate that objective.

12 Thank you Chairperson.

13 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mpofo.
 14 Before I ask the leader, the evidence leaders to make such
 15 comments as he wishes to make. Are there any of the
 16 representatives of the parties who wish to say something in
 17 regards to the application? I see Mr Semenya is moving his
 18 finger to his microphone button as was Mr Tip. But he got
 19 in first. Mr Tip first then Mr Semenya then whoever else
 20 wishes to say something.

21 MR TIP SC: Chairperson, Commissioners,
 22 the National Union of Mine Workers supports the
 23 application. It does so as one of the principal parties
 24 identified in the terms of reference and that position has
 25 been taken up pursuant to a concerted number of

1 consultations with the management structures of the NUM
 2 nationally, regionally and here in Rustenburg and it is the
 3 joint view of all those parties.

4 The essence of the support lies in this that as
 5 the duration of this commission and it's hearings has been
 6 extended and we'll continue to run for some time, the
 7 question of costs has become of great concern to the NUM
 8 and any arrangement that can significantly reduce those
 9 costs will be greatly welcomed by them and it is for that
 10 reason that it supports this move.

11 Essentially the question of costs arises in this
 12 that having a team based, having to travel to Rustenburg
 13 involves principally accommodation costs. Travel costs are
 14 not of great consequence but to accommodate us here is a
 15 cost. In order for essential administrative matters to be
 16 attended properly it has been necessary to make an
 17 arrangement of the correspondent firm of attorneys in
 18 Rustenburg to have dedicated space made available to us for
 19 the purpose of consultations, for storage of materials and
 20 the like and that too has turned out to be a significant
 21 cost.

22 If we were to relocate to Johannesburg or
 23 Pretoria as the case may be, then that sort of cost will
 24 disappear instantly. The NUM is mindful also of a slightly
 25 less direct but no less important area where costs and

1 convenience intersect and it has regard thereto the fact
 2 that it's team will be, especially its counsel and of
 3 course its attorneys, all of whom are based in Johannesburg
 4 will have considerably more flexibility in the arrangement
 5 of their time if they, if the hearing is in the region of
 6 Pretoria or Johannesburg and with that will come the
 7 capacity to deal with matters that really need to be dealt
 8 with on an ongoing basis such as administration and even
 9 the possibility of trying to resurrect a few briefs which
 10 otherwise remain entirely dormant for so long as I am in
 11 Rustenburg.

12 [14:35] That is, it's not unimportant to the NUM because
 13 it does also take some pressure off its team in that way,
 14 and more importantly perhaps, it adds an important element
 15 of convenience and flexibility in terms of the management
 16 of information and we are very mindful here of the fact
 17 that the number of topics that are scheduled to fall within
 18 phase 2 will require attention very shortly and in a fairly
 19 demanding way. There will be a taxing programme, a vast
 20 amount of information to be process, and doing that sort of
 21 work from offices that are located in Johannesburg or
 22 Pretoria, rather than trying to straddle those offices and
 23 one in Rustenburg, will make a very large difference to the
 24 way it can be done, and that inevitably will translate also
 25 into a more effective cost component.

Page 5850

1 So we have of course discussed with our clients
 2 the question of participation as observers of the persons
 3 who presently come and attend here, as well as the access
 4 to members of the structures and the leadership of the NUM.
 5 Those matters will all be managed with great comfort, and
 6 of course the head office and the important structures are
 7 in Johannesburg and Pretoria, or rather in Johannesburg,
 8 and there too in respect of phase 2 matters that will
 9 facilitate interaction between us and our clients in a very
 10 significant way. So for all those reasons we are happy to
 11 support what we consider to be a timely application.
 12 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya?
 13 MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, subject to a
 14 conversation about the modalities of timing, etcetera, we
 15 abide the decision of the Commission. Mr Mpofo, however,
 16 predictably on a matter quite tangential and not germane to
 17 this application, is hinting that he's not calling the
 18 fourth witness. It's a matter we'll discuss –
 19 CHAIRPERSON: He said of the first batch;
 20 he said the last witness of the first batch.
 21 MR SEMENYA SC: Yes, there was –
 22 CHAIRPERSON: There is, of course, a
 23 hint, I suppose, but it's no more than that.
 24 MR SEMENYA SC: I don't want him to go as
 25 though I didn't hear him.

Page 5851

1 CHAIRPERSON: I think he knows that you
 2 hear him.
 3 MR MPOFU: Chairperson, no thank you. Mr
 4 Semenya and I have worked together for such a long time, he
 5 thinks I'm dropping hints when I'm not. Chair, while I'm
 6 on the podium, I might as well mention that the, like Mr
 7 Ntsebeza has also been slipped a note from his attorneys
 8 that indicates that Pretoria would be the first choice for
 9 various reasons, including the shorter distance obviously
 10 that the people would have to travel.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Motau, you wish to say
 12 something on behalf of Lonmin?
 13 MR MOTAU SC: Yes, Chair and members of
 14 the Commission, we also abide the decision. What I need to
 15 add is I only learned for the first time today from my
 16 learned friend Mr Mpofo that there were discussions between
 17 himself and my leader, Adv Burger, regarding
 18 transportation. I haven't had an opportunity to follow
 19 that up, but I will liaise with him in that respect.
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Those altruistic remarks
 21 that he made regarding the possibility or probability of
 22 Lonmin continuing to assist as far as transportation is
 23 concerned, is something that we can bear in mind.
 24 MR MOTAU SC: Yes, Chair, and I'm quite
 25 happy that Mr Mpofo did not allude to that as constitution

Page 5852

1 a collusion of some sort.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: Any other party
 3 representative wish to say something, apart from Ms Barnes
 4 who's turned her microphone on?
 5 MS BARNES: Yes, thank you, Chair. We'd
 6 also like to as the AMCU team express our support for the
 7 application. We understand the reasons for it, which I
 8 think has been well articulated here today, but provided of
 9 course that the conditions are met and those are
 10 essentially that there is sufficient transport to transport
 11 community members from here to presumably Pretoria, and
 12 I'll get to that further in a moment, and however much
 13 transportation is required needs to be provided. Just to
 14 indicate that we have taken instructions on a move to
 15 Pretoria, because we understood that that is what is
 16 mooted, and it may be that if it is a move to Johannesburg
 17 that is contemplated, then that may well change. I have
 18 indications that my instructions may well be different if
 19 it were to be a move to Johannesburg, but certainly –
 20 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, you support an
 21 application for a removal to Pretoria –
 22 MS BARNES: We do support it.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: But you don't express any
 24 opinion, certainly don't provide any support for an
 25 application for removal to Johannesburg. Would that be a

Page 5853

1 fair summary of what you're saying?
 2 MS BARNES: That's right, Chair. That's
 3 it, Chair, provided the conditions are met.
 4 MS MAITE: Yes, Chair, I'm representing
 5 the Department of Minerals in this regard. I would just
 6 like to mention that the Department, I've taken
 7 instructions that we'll be abiding by the decision of the
 8 Commission. Thank you, Chair.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: At least you must put your
 10 name on record because I don't if the transcribers know
 11 you.
 12 MS MAITE: Thank you, Chair. It is my
 13 first time. I'm Lerato Maite, surname is M-A-I-T-E.
 14 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.
 15 MS MASEVHE: Well, Chairperson, on behalf
 16 of the Monene Family, Takalani Masevhe, we will be abiding
 17 the decision of the Commission.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much.
 19 MR GUMBI: Yes, Chairperson, on behalf of
 20 POPCRU, Lepaaku and Lieutenant Baloyi, we'll abide by the
 21 decision of the Commission.
 22 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Mr Power, I see
 23 you've turned your microphone on.
 24 MR POWER: Thank you, Chairperson,
 25 Commissioners, on behalf of the Legal Resources Centre we

Page 5854

1 would like to support the application, as long as the
 2 relevant arrangements are made for transportation.
 3 CHAIRPERSON: Adv Nkosi Thomas, your
 4 client has his office in Pretoria, but –
 5 MS THOMAS SC: Indeed, Chairperson.
 6 CHAIRPERSON: What is his attitude to the
 7 application?
 8 MS THOMAS SC: I associate myself with
 9 what my learned friend Mr Semenya has said in relation to
 10 the position of the police.
 11 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Madlanga, as the chief
 12 evidence leader, do you wish to say anything about the
 13 application?
 14 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, I've been
 15 deputed to deal with this. The evidence leaders support
 16 this application. As the Commissioners will know, during
 17 December last year we submitted a memorandum to the
 18 Commission in which we set out why in our view the
 19 Commission should move from Rustenburg to a venue, a
 20 suitable venue in Gauteng. I'm not going to repeat all of
 21 that now; the Commissioners have the memorandum. I do wish
 22 and need to say that it's not a matter of lawyers' fees.
 23 Lawyers' fees have to be paid or foregone wherever the
 24 Commission sits. The move of the Commission, as Mr Tip has
 25 pointed out, may generate some flexibility which will

Page 5855

1 result in some saving of costs, but the lawyers' fees for
 2 the main part, whether, as I say, whether paid or foregone,
 3 are paid or foregone whether the Commission sits here, in
 4 Gauteng, or anywhere else.
 5 But the reasons why we, in brief the reasons why
 6 we support the application are the following. Firstly, a
 7 move will increase the efficiency of the Commission, which
 8 will as a result of the saving of the extensive travelling
 9 time which is involved, will be able to sit more effective
 10 hours. The Commission is under severe time restraints and
 11 anything which will increase the efficiency of the
 12 Commission, we submit should be very seriously considered.
 13 Secondly, the moving of the Commission will
 14 result in the saving of a significant amount of public
 15 money with regard to the accommodation of the team for the
 16 evidence leaders, with the accommodation of staff members
 17 of the department who are out there, and with travel costs
 18 and subsistence costs which are involved in members of the
 19 department working out of Rustenburg. So there will be a
 20 significant saving of public money if the Commission moves
 21 its venue.
 22 Thirdly, as has been pointed out by some of the
 23 parties, the present location has the result that some of
 24 the parties are incurring very substantial expenses through
 25 the Commission sitting in Rustenburg, and that is an

Page 5856

1 obstacle to the effective participation of all of the
 2 parties. It's obviously in the public interest that all of
 3 the parties should be able to participate as effectively as
 4 possible and anything which removes constraints should be,
 5 in our view, supported.
 6 Finally, we submit that it is possible to achieve
 7 all of this without compromising the ability of the members
 8 of the Marikana community who wish to observe the
 9 proceedings, to do so, and a move can be achieved without a
 10 compromise, or a material compromise of that principle. So
 11 in short we say that a move will improve the efficiency of
 12 the Commission; it will save significant public money, and
 13 it will make it more effective for non-State parties to
 14 participate effectively, which is necessary in the
 15 interests of justice and the interests of the Commission
 16 doing its work effectively, and for those reasons we
 17 support the application.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Mr
 19 Budlender. Once the proceedings of this afternoon have
 20 been transcribed, I shall arrange a meeting with the
 21 Minister so that we can consider the application. One
 22 aspect that will require consideration will be the
 23 availability of suitable premises in Pretoria. I
 24 understand that officials in the Department of Justice, in
 25 collaboration with officials in the Department of Public

Page 5857

1 Works, are already engaged on that exercise, and I'm
 2 assured that the results of their investigations will be
 3 available fairly soon, and as soon as that information is
 4 to hand I will then, as I say, arrange a meeting with the
 5 Minister and we will consider all the points that have been
 6 raised, and he will be provided with a transcript of
 7 everything that's been said this afternoon, together with
 8 the extra letters, or letter that Mr Mpofo has promised.
 9 So thank you very much for the submission that's been made,
 10 and I assure you the matter will be dealt with in the
 11 manner that I've explained.
 12 MR MPOFU: Thank you very much,
 13 Chairperson and Commissioners, on behalf of all my
 14 colleagues.
 15 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ntsebeza, I understand
 16 you also wish to say something.
 17 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Not very much, Chair.
 18 It's just that, you know, these things go into posterity
 19 and I would like to place myself on record on this aspect,
 20 and it's in reaction to what my learned friend Adv
 21 Budlender has said. I'm not supporting this application
 22 because I'm concerned about lawyers' fees. I just want, if
 23 that remark is intended to convey that, I want this record
 24 to be clear about that. I am in this thing for the number
 25 of days that I have been in it, and that is the extent to

Page 5858

1 which I have been paid, and that's all that I wanted to
 2 say, and I was also mentioning it in the context of
 3 emphasising what I consider is a constitutional principle
 4 of the equality of arms. The snide remark that this is not
 5 about lawyers' fees is inappropriate in the context of this
 6 application. I just wanted to make that very clear.
 7 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, I'd like to
 8 clarify. It was not intended as a snide remark, and if it
 9 was taken as such I apologise for it, but there was a good
 10 deal of discussion of the problem of lawyers' fees, which
 11 is a real problem, and I wouldn't for a moment deny that.
 12 All I'm saying is that a move or no move will not address
 13 the problem of a lawyer's fees. It doesn't really arise as
 14 a matter for consideration. It was not intended as a snide
 15 remark.
 16 CHAIRPERSON: I can see from his reaction
 17 that Mr Ntsebeza accepts that what you intended on the one
 18 hand, and what you did not intend on the other. So as far
 19 as posterity is concerned, there will be no problem on that
 20 score.
 21 MR NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, I'm - the
 22 democrat and I accept the debate.
 23 MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, the problem is
 24 that for some of us posterity comes closer and closer at an
 25 alarming rate.

Page 5859

1 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, that's true. One
 2 other thing I think we should say, and that is I'm, I don't
 3 want to prejudge the application, I'm endeavouring to keep
 4 an open mind and as I'm sure the Minister will, in the
 5 light of what's put before us, but if the application is
 6 successful, I think it's only appropriate to say that the
 7 Municipality of Rustenburg have treated us very well.
 8 They've made these facilities available to us. They've
 9 gone out of their way to assist us in all sorts of ways.
 10 It wasn't their fault there's a problem with the
 11 electricity and the water, but they've given us these
 12 facilities free of charge and it's a tremendous
 13 contribution that the municipality has made, obviously in
 14 the interests of, the international interests and the
 15 interests of the achieving of the Terms of Reference of the
 16 Commission, and the desire that as a result of its work
 17 there will be truth, restoration and justice, and I could
 18 see from the way some people reacted they weren't aware of
 19 the magnificent gesture which the Municipality of
 20 Rustenburg has made, and I'm sure you'll all agree with me
 21 that whatever may happen to the application, already
 22 there's a tremendous debt of gratitude that we owe to them.
 23 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chairperson. I'm
 24 sure all of us would agree with you, Chairperson. Can I
 25 just make a request that -

Page 5860

1 CHAIRPERSON: If it is to suggest that we
 2 take the tea adjournment now -
 3 MR MPOFU: That is -
 4 CHAIRPERSON: And that you call your
 5 witness next, but presumably you'd like to gather your
 6 thoughts and have a cup of tea before we start. I think
 7 it's going to be Mr Mzoxolo Magidiwana, is that correct?
 8 MR MPOFU: That is correct, Chairperson.
 9 CHAIRPERSON: Well, you can get him in
 10 position at the witness table when we resume after the tea
 11 adjournment has been taken.
 12 MR MPOFU: Thank you, Chair.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will now
 14 adjourn for tea.
 15 [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
 16 [15:15] CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofo, I take it the
 17 gentleman who's now at the witness table is Mr Mzoxolo -
 18 MR MPOFU: That's correct -
 19 CHAIRPERSON: - Magidiwana. Is that
 20 correct?
 21 MR MPOFU: That's more than correct,
 22 Chair.
 23 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Magidiwana, would you
 24 stand up, please? Are you prepared to take the oath, or do
 25 you wish to affirm?

Page 5861

1 MR MAGIDIWANA: I will take an oath.
 2 CHAIRPERSON: Would you swear that the
 3 evidence you'll give before this Commission will be the
 4 truth, the whole truth, and nothing but the truth? Please
 5 raise your right hand and say, "I swear, so help me God."
 6 MZOXOLO MAGIDIWANA: [The witness is
 7 sworn in].
 8 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Magidiwana,
 9 you may be seated. I see there's a statement that you have
 10 put before us. I take it, it will be exhibit EEE1. Is
 11 that correct, Ms Pillay?
 12 MS PILLAY: That's correct, Chair.
 13 CHAIRPERSON: And we also have what looks
 14 like a, or what is a criminal docket and it's pages 1547
 15 to, I don't know what the last number is, but presumably it
 16 comes from IPID, does it?
 17 MR MPOFU: Yes.
 18 CHAIRPERSON: So presumably this will be
 19 exhibit EEE2.
 20 MR MPOFU: EEE2, Chairperson.
 21 CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you. Please
 22 proceed, Mr Mpofo.
 23 EXAMINATION BY MR MPOFU: Thank you very
 24 much, Chairperson and Commissioners. This, Mr Magidiwana
 25 would, for the record, be our fourth witness. Good

Page 5862

1 afternoon, Mr Magidiwana.
 2 MR MAGIDIWANA: Good afternoon, Sir.
 3 MR MPOFU: Right, as the Chairperson has
 4 already indicated, we are going to be dealing mainly with
 5 EEE1, which is the statement that you made to your lawyers.
 6 Have you got it in front of you?
 7 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, Sir, I have it.
 8 MR MPOFU: Right, I'll take you through
 9 the statement. Some of the parts I will read and get you
 10 to confirm, and some of the parts I might ask you to put
 11 things in your own words.
 12 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is fine, Sir.
 13 MR MPOFU: According to your statement
 14 you are 24 years old; you were born in Kanya Village,
 15 Elliotdale in the Eastern Cape.
 16 MR MAGIDIWANA: That is so, Sir.
 17 MR MPOFU: Okay, and what is not in your
 18 statement is you were born on the 3rd of September 1988,
 19 which means that during the time of the incident that you
 20 are about to testify about of the 16th of August, you were
 21 23?
 22 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so.
 23 MR MPOFU: Right, you obtained employment
 24 at Lonmin in 2011, and you indicate in your statement that
 25 you got that employment through the TEBA Recruitment

Page 5863

1 outlet, which is situated in Wonderkop. Is that so?
 2 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.
 3 MR MPOFU: And at that time you were
 4 staying with a relative in Nkaneng settlement, looking for
 5 work, and this current employment is your first job. Is
 6 that so?
 7 MR MAGIDIWANA: Exactly, Sir.
 8 MR MPOFU: Okay, and at Lonmin you work
 9 in the engineering department, but more specifically the
 10 area is called general tramming and transport. Is that
 11 correct?
 12 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, general tramming and
 13 transport.
 14 MR MPOFU: And your salary is about R4
 15 000 a month, and if you include the sleep-out allowance
 16 which is over 1 000, you said the total is over 5 000 but
 17 less than R6 000. Is that the position?
 18 MR MAGIDIWANA: Exactly, Sir.
 19 MR MPOFU: And that is your net salary?
 20 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, it is my net salary.
 21 MR MPOFU: Okay, then you said that on or
 22 about the 10th or 11th of August you got wind of the fact
 23 that the RDOs had taken a decision to down tools and to go
 24 on strike.
 25 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.

Page 5864

1 MR MPOFU: Where did you hear about this?
 2 MR MAGIDIWANA: I heard about that at
 3 Nkaneng as I was from my place of employment.
 4 MR MPOFU: Right, then you say that
 5 although this was according to your information essentially
 6 an RDO strike, they had asked other workers to join the
 7 strike, presumably in sympathy with them.
 8 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, I heard that they
 9 asked other employees to also join in the strike.
 10 MR MPOFU: You've also indicated that you
 11 also heard from some of the workers who said they had been
 12 stopped from going to work.
 13 MR MAGIDIWANA: I heard about that, Sir,
 14 but I don't know who stopped them from going to work.
 15 MR MPOFU: Right, in any event, after
 16 getting those messages you decided to stop going to work.
 17 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.
 18 MR MPOFU: And at this point can I ask
 19 you whether you yourself supported the action of the RDOs?
 20 MR MAGIDIWANA: I supported very much the
 21 actions of the RDOs because those people work very hard.
 22 MR MPOFU: Right. Well, although you
 23 yourself are not an RDO, what can you tell the Commission
 24 about your own experience of the hard work that they do, as
 25 you have just said?

Page 5865

1 MR MAGIDIWANA: Thank you, Sir, for that.
 2 I will tell you, Sir, because you are here, you don't know
 3 about this. You are an advocate; you are too far.
 4 MR MPOFU: True.
 5 MR MAGIDIWANA: We look at those people
 6 who are RDO as though they are fools. Even there at the
 7 station they are clumsy, filled with the machine oil, or he
 8 gets wet. Perhaps he finished working at about 10 o'clock
 9 and he knocks off at 1 o'clock, half past 1, being
 10 completely wet even in his body. Tell me then, Sir, if a
 11 person works like that day after day, is he healthy?
 12 MR MPOFU: So as you supported the strike
 13 – well, firstly, we've already established that this is
 14 your first job. Had you ever experienced a strike in your
 15 life, or been part of one?
 16 MR MAGIDIWANA: I never, Sir.
 17 MR MPOFU: Right, you say that at some
 18 stage you wanted to go to the Eastern Cape, but you decided
 19 rather to stay at home in case the strike could be resolved
 20 sooner rather than later. What were you fearing would
 21 happen if you had taken that step and the strike was
 22 resolved sooner or later?
 23 MR MAGIDIWANA: It was to lose my first
 24 job.
 25 MR MPOFU: Right, so when you say you

Page 5866

1 stayed at home, because your next statement then talks
2 about the 15th when you heard something, can we then assume
3 that that includes the subsequent days, 11, 12, 13, 14 and
4 15?
5 MR MAGIDIWANA: Can you repeat, Sir?
6 MR MPOFU: Yes, I'm saying did you stay
7 at home until a certain message was passed to you on the
8 15th of August?
9 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, Sir, I asked from a
10 passerby whose name was Lucky, but I do not see him
11 anymore.
12 MR MPOFU: Yes, what did Lucky tell you?
13 Sorry, is this now on the evening of the 15th?
14 MR MAGIDIWANA: Ja, the 15th.
15 MR MPOFU: And what did Lucky tell you?
16 MR MAGIDIWANA: He said to me, when I
17 asked him as to what was happening there, he said, "Mr
18 Mathunjwa arrived there in a Nyala and so as employees we
19 told him to come back tomorrow in the morning." It is at
20 that time that I said I personally will wake up tomorrow
21 and go there and find out what is happening.
22 MR MPOFU: Alright, and when you say
23 waking up and finding out what is happening, that would be
24 the following day, the 16th. What did you do then on the
25 16th? What's the first thing you did in the morning in line

Page 5867

1 with that decision?
2 MR MAGIDIWANA: When I woke up in the
3 morning on the 16th I first proceeded to the kraal.
4 MR MPOFU: What was the purpose of that?
5 MR MAGIDIWANA: I went to check the cow.
6 MR MPOFU: Okay, and according to your
7 statement thereafter – sorry, where is your cow being kept?
8 You know there are kraals that we have dealt with here.
9 Can you explain to the Commission in which kraal your cow
10 is kept?
11 MR MAGIDIWANA: The one that has a shanty
12 which is surrounded by a fence, the shanty which is
13 surrounded by a wire fence.
14 MR MPOFU: Sorry, Chairperson, if you go
15 to exhibit L208 and 205 – no sorry, I think I'm going to
16 confuse you. Let's go to 208. Is that the shack that you
17 refer to, the one in L208 in front of which one can see a
18 part of a kraal?
19 MR MAGIDIWANA: This is exactly the one,
20 Sir.
21 MR MPOFU: Okay, now after the kraal,
22 according to your statement you then proceeded to the
23 koppie and joined the crowd. Before this, had you been
24 part of that crowd at all?
25 MR MAGIDIWANA: It was my first day there

Page 5868

1 on that day.
2 MR MPOFU: And in relation to the number
3 of people, we know that eventually there were about 3000
4 people there. When you arrived in the morning, just to
5 check how early it might have been, were there already that
6 number of people or were there fewer at that stage?
7 [15:35] MR MAGIDIWANA: They were many, but not
8 too many, because I woke up early in the morning and went
9 there.
10 MR MPOFU: Right, now we know that you
11 spent, or rather, according to your instructions to us you
12 spent the rest of the morning there, and the next thing
13 that you deal with in your statement is that after Mr
14 Mathunjwa's first address – and once again we know the time
15 for that – you felt hungry and went home to eat.
16 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.
17 MR MPOFU: And shortly after you
18 returned, Mr Mathunjwa also returned to give his second
19 address. Is that correct?
20 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir, and
21 further, I was also there.
22 MR MPOFU: If the Commission can just
23 bear with me. Okay, I don't know if – I thought my
24 attorney was up there – if you'd be able to display number
25 4, the picture in number 4. Item number 4. We had pre-

Page 5869

1 arranged certain things to be shown. It's exhibit GG2, I
2 think. Okay, we'll move on to something, we'll come back
3 to that, but essentially the – oh, it is there. No, I
4 didn't think it was there, thank you. Thank you,
5 Chairperson. Yes, no sorry, I didn't realise it had been
6 put – I think the people are more efficient than – you see
7 in that picture that Bishop Seoka is talking to the
8 leadership of the people at the koppie. Is that correct?
9 MR MAGIDIWANA: I see it, Sir.
10 MR MPOFU: Yes, now in relation to that,
11 when did you go to have your lunch?
12 MR MAGIDIWANA: I left whilst he was
13 still talking to them, and when I left I went towards the
14 direction of the police officers and there were many of
15 them, and at that time I was carrying the stick.
16 MR MPOFU: Yes, Chairperson, I'm sorry,
17 this is my fault. Having intended to use this as a
18 reference point, I've now misplaced – there is some
19 independent confirmation of when the bishop got there.
20 I'll deal with it tomorrow, just to link the two points.
21 Okay, Mr Magidiwana, Mr Mathunjwa's second address, in
22 general what did it entail as far as you remember?
23 MR MAGIDIWANA: He said, "Employees,
24 where I am coming from it's very tough. No attention is
25 paid to me and it has been decided that you are going to be

Page 5870

1 killed. The situation is not good. I'm asking you to go
2 to your places of residence." By then he was kneeling
3 down.
4 MR MPOFU: Right, and what was the
5 response of the workforce, or rather, the protesters?
6 MR MAGIDIWANA: They said, "Here we are
7 not going to leave before the employer comes and gives us
8 an answer, because all we want is money and further that we
9 are not fighting."
10 MR MPOFU: Okay, before we go on, can I
11 just ask you, starting – I'm sorry to take you back.
12 Starting with the time you spent there before you went to
13 lunch, where were you sitting within the crowd that was at
14 the koppie or koppies?
15 MR MAGIDIWANA: I was sitting in front,
16 Sir.
17 MR MPOFU: Yes, and when Mr Mathunjwa's
18 second address occurred after you had come back from lunch,
19 where did you sit?
20 MR MAGIDIWANA: Even at that time I was
21 still sitting in front.
22 MR MPOFU: Yes, when you got there did
23 anyone tell you where to sit or where not to sit?
24 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, Sir, there's no such
25 a thing.

Page 5871

1 MR MPOFU: And your own observation in
2 relation to where people sat, was it regulated in any
3 manner?
4 MR MAGIDIWANA: No, no person was
5 regulating. A person sat wherever he felt he should sit.
6 MR MPOFU: Right, now according to your
7 statement then within a few minutes of Mr Mathunjwa's
8 departure you noticed that the police were quickly, as you
9 put it, rapidly fencing you in from the direction of the
10 residential area. Did you observe this while you were
11 seated there?
12 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir, I observed
13 it whilst I was still sitting.
14 MR MPOFU: And you say that since you
15 were sitting in the front, you then dashed in the direction
16 of Nkaneng. What did you intend to do by doing that?
17 MR MAGIDIWANA: My intention was to go
18 home where I am staying.
19 MR MPOFU: Well, why did you suddenly
20 want to go home? Why did you want to do that at that
21 particular time?
22 MR MAGIDIWANA: It was because of seeing
23 that we were being surrounded by wire.
24 MR MPOFU: Right, then you say that at
25 some stage you were close to one of the Nyalas that was

Page 5872

1 dragging the barbed wire, which outpaced you and you were
2 not able to access the road to Nkaneng just in front of the
3 small kraal. Can you explain to the Commission just that
4 particular episode about trying to go to Nkaneng near the
5 kraal, the small kraal?
6 MR MAGIDIWANA: Whilst the other
7 employees were standing and singing a song, and not in a
8 hurry, and they were walking towards the road, there were
9 others who had already passed. They had already reached
10 that road and were walking towards Nkaneng. When we
11 arrived near the kraal the Nyala was deploying the barbed
12 wire. When it realised that we were about to pass there,
13 then it moved quicker so that it could close that gap
14 because it realised that we wanted to pass there. We then
15 turned around the kraal and I was in front. Then when I
16 appeared, it was at that time that the teargas was
17 released. They were released. Even before reaching the
18 road, then the shots were fired.
19 MR MPOFU: Okay, right, we'll get there,
20 but when you say you went around the kraal, what was your
21 intention?
22 MR MAGIDIWANA: It was at the time we
23 wanted to run to Nkaneng and we realised that it was indeed
24 very bad.
25 MR MPOFU: And how were you going to go

Page 5873

1 to Nkaneng?
2 MR MAGIDIWANA: We were going to go to
3 Nkaneng. There is the path that comes from Marikana which
4 leads to that place. That is the path, the road on which
5 we were going to go down.
6 MR MPOFU: Yes, and is that the same road
7 that had been blocked by the hippo that had the fence that
8 you testified about?
9 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes, it was that road
10 which was blocked by an Nyala with the barbed wire.
11 MR MPOFU: Okay, now you've already
12 testified about the next step. You heard bullets. Were
13 you yourself hit?
14 MR MAGIDIWANA: I was not hit, Sir.
15 MR MPOFU: No, that's not what he said.
16 MR HANABE: Oh, I'm sorry.
17 MR MAGIDIWANA: I was hit.
18 MR MPOFU: Yes, thank you. And sorry,
19 according to paragraph 15 of your statement you say that
20 the gap that you took between the, or rather that you've
21 just described, was the only gap open to you, to that
22 group. Is that correct?
23 MR MAGIDIWANA: That is the only one,
24 Sir.
25 MR MPOFU: Right, and then you say that

1 as soon as the group emerged from the other side of the
2 kraal, you were met with more rapid gunfire and you were
3 hit on your leg and you stumbled and fell behind the other
4 workers who had been shot, including Mr Noki.

5 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir. I fell
6 alongside Noki.

7 MR MPOFU: Okay, we will come back and
8 I'll take you through some pictures and some footage, but I
9 want us to just do the broad landscape of the statement
10 first. Is that okay?

11 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is okay, Sir.

12 MR MPOFU: Yes, according to your
13 statement you then, the gunfire stopped for a while and you
14 say, this part I'd like you to say in your own words.

15 Between that what you've described as the first gunfire and
16 when you testify that you were shot again, can you explain
17 in your own words to the Commission what happened?

18 MR MAGIDIWANA: As we were lying there
19 after being shot and there was this thing which was blue
20 smoke, called the blue smoke, I heard that there were
21 footsteps, or strikes of something approaching. They were
22 talking whilst they were shooting. As they were shooting,
23 all the people were lying down, all of them. It was then
24 that I was hit by then a second one on my left side.

25 MR HANABE: He's pointing to the rib cage

1 and then he hit me again on my right side on the rib cage.
2 He then asked me about things I did not know. He asked,
3 "Where are those firearms which were taken on the 13th?
4 Where is the 'inyanga'?" I said I know nothing about those
5 things. It was then that I made myself to a bad luck and
6 that was a reason for me to be hit. He was saying, "You
7 are lying. You are going to tell the truth." He was
8 saying that, hitting me on my lower part, and the other one
9 hit me then on my testicles. It was then that I said, "It
10 is better then you finish me off and just kill me," but the
11 other one who was speaking in isiZulu stopped him.

12 MR MPOFU: Thank you for that. Yes,
13 before that you said in your statement that one of the
14 policemen said, when you asked to be finished, to be
15 killed, that there would be no further need to do that
16 because you were going to die anyway. Can you testify
17 about that?

18 MR MAGIDIWANA: He said it doesn't make
19 any difference, I'm going to die on the way.

20 MR MPOFU: Yes, and then can you tell the
21 Commission about your evidence, or rather your statement
22 that the policemen there were busy laughing or joking
23 around and taking pictures with their cell phones, and you
24 say that others were kicking the bodies. Did you observe
25 this yourself?

1 on his left side.
2 [15:55] MR MPOFU: And sorry, Mr Magidiwana, it's
3 my fault. When you say the second one, can we assume that
4 the first one is the one you referred to in paragraph 16,
5 which had hit your leg?

6 MR MAGIDIWANA: It hit me on my thigh.

7 MR MPOFU: Yes, okay. So you were still
8 telling us that the second one got in on your body.

9 MR MAGIDIWANA: Yes.

10 MR MPOFU: Yes, and can you tell us what,
11 if any other bullets hit you, where they hit you?

12 MR MAGIDIWANA: I was hit with several
13 bullets.

14 MR MPOFU: Yes, can you explain, describe
15 to the Commission where all the bullets hit you.

16 MR MAGIDIWANA: The other one hit me on
17 my left arm.

18 MR HANABE: But with a hand,
19 Commissioner, he's pointing at the left elbow, the side of
20 the elbow.

21 MR MAGIDIWANA: And after that they
22 passed and hit the others. When they came back, they
23 realised I was still alive. The other one asked a
24 question, "Why are you still alive?" It was then that that
25 other one then hit me with the other two on my right thigh

1 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir, I observed
2 it.

3 MR MPOFU: Jumping to paragraph 22, and I
4 think you've already, you said one policeman showed you
5 some mercy and said to the others, "This is a child," and
6 then he made a telephone call and thereafter three
7 ambulances arrived. Is that the policeman that you had
8 referred to who was Zulu-speaking?

9 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.

10 MR MPOFU: And then according to your
11 statement, the last thing you remember was being carried to
12 one of those ambulances, after which you lost
13 consciousness.

14 MR MAGIDIWANA: It is so, Sir.

15 MR MPOFU: And before we get to the stage
16 where you regained your consciousness, Chairperson, could
17 we start on that point tomorrow?

18 CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will adjourn
19 until 9:30 tomorrow morning.

20 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]

21 .
22 .
23 .
24 .
25 .

<p style="text-align: center;">A</p> <p>abandon 5815:21 abide 5826:22,25 5850:15 5851:14 5853:20 abiding 5853:7,16 ability 5829:23 5830:10 5856:7 able 5776:7 5782:13 5786:13 5791:10 5794:23 5807:10 5808:22 5812:17 5824:4 5830:10 5831:6 5835:17 5837:11 5839:10,14 5855:9 5856:3 5868:24 5872:2 absolutely 5810:10 5818:13 5839:21 accept 5783:9 5797:3 5810:2,22 5812:21 5814:21 5840:5 5841:18 5858:22 accepts 5858:17 access 5783:22 5784:13 5790:2,8,13 5794:13 5801:21 5850:3 5872:2 accessible 5797:16,18 5797:19 accessing 5798:24 accommodate 5848:14 accommodated 5842:9 accommodation 5830:14 5840:21 5842:14 5848:13 5855:15,16 accurate 5783:13 achieve 5829:18 5834:10,11 5856:6 achieved 5856:9 achieving 5859:15 acting 5829:20 action 5792:2 5864:19 actions 5864:21 activity 5817:11 actual 5842:22 add 5844:10 5851:15 added 5846:6 address 5825:23 5826:10 5828:7 5858:12 5868:14,19 5869:21 5870:18 addressing 5807:16 adds 5849:14 adjourn 5825:17,20 5860:14 5877:18 ADJOURNED 5877:20 adjournment 5807:19 5807:23 5825:12 5860:2,11 ADJOURNS 5807:24 5825:21 5860:15 administration 5849:8 administrative 5848:15</p>	<p>admitted 5781:11 Adv 5774:16 5783:19 5787:9 5823:18 5835:12,12 5851:17 5854:3 5857:20 advantage 5828:18 advise 5782:16 advised 5782:10,12 advocate 5771:8 5845:7,15 5865:3 affirm 5860:25 afforded 5837:11 5841:16 afraid 5824:1 African 5773:25 5776:15 5800:12 afternoon 5856:19 5857:7 5862:1,2 agree 5774:4 5776:24 5777:5 5779:8 5780:24 5786:10 5805:7 5813:23,24 5818:24 5859:20,24 agreed 5777:5 5779:13 5826:17 agrees 5777:14 5829:25 Aid 5837:18,25 5838:20 5839:12,24 5843:4,14 alarm 5815:7 alarming 5858:25 alive 5816:12 5875:23 5875:24 allow 5819:20,22 allowance 5863:15 allowing 5829:15 allude 5851:25 Almighty 5817:7 alongside 5789:21 5874:6 alright 5793:3 5795:16 5798:23 5803:14 5825:16 5866:22 alternatively 5819:21 5827:20 alternatives 5820:22 5845:4 altruistic 5851:20 ambulances 5877:7,12 AMCU 5770:6,15,23 5823:13,19 5824:11 5824:17,18 5836:10 5852:6 ameliorate 5844:25 amended 5826:3 ammunition 5810:25 amount 5781:3 5831:2 5831:3 5836:4 5849:20 5855:14 amply 5831:5 analytical 5824:7 ankles 5840:17 annexed 5827:25 answer 5776:19 5803:6 5803:7 5804:4 5811:4 5811:16 5814:14</p>	<p>5817:8 5870:8 answered 5823:25 answering 5773:12 answers 5818:4,18,18 anybody 5779:22 5781:13 5808:19 5820:6 anymore 5866:11 anyway 5800:21 5806:10 5876:16 apart 5783:23 5784:5 5784:11 5800:24 5801:20 5830:6 5831:12 5852:3 apologies 5771:23 apologise 5858:9 apparently 5807:15 appearances 5835:24 appeared 5872:16 appears 5823:7,25 applicable 5831:13 applicant 5826:8 5828:22 applicants 5826:6,23 5828:6 application 5825:3,7 5826:2,5,10,12,18,21 5826:24 5827:8,16 5828:10,12,14,19 5831:23 5832:1,4,7 5834:7,20 5842:3,15 5843:20,20 5844:17 5844:20 5847:4,17,23 5850:11,17 5852:7,21 5852:25 5854:1,7,13 5854:16 5855:6 5856:17,21 5857:21 5858:6 5859:3,5,21 applied 5792:4 apply 5832:18 5843:18 opposed 5826:12 appreciate 5776:12 5786:4 5812:13 5835:4 5846:2 approaching 5835:1 5874:21 appropriate 5801:1 5859:6 appropriately 5818:19 ARBITRATION 5807:24,24 area 5773:3,4 5776:14 5801:12 5804:3 5812:1 5832:2 5833:12,17 5848:25 5863:10 5871:10 areas 5840:10,20 arguably 5831:7 argue 5770:17 5779:5 argument 5814:7,16 arises 5848:11 arm 5778:2 5789:13 5875:17 arms 5837:8,13 5838:17 5843:18 5858:4</p>	<p>arrange 5827:11 5856:20 5857:4 arranged 5869:1 arrangement 5841:3 5848:8,17 5849:4 arrangements 5832:5 5840:11 5854:2 arrested 5820:13 5833:7 5840:1 arresting 5820:5 arrival 5780:11 arrive 5789:24 arrived 5866:18 5868:4 5872:11 5877:7 arrows 5796:25 article 5823:19,22,24 5824:2,5,21 articulated 5843:19 5852:8 articulating 5835:5 ascertain 5809:8 ashamed 5779:17 asked 5798:3 5799:24 5808:21 5811:5,6,11 5811:13,23 5815:20 5821:19 5823:24 5864:6,9 5866:9,17 5875:23 5876:2,2,14 asking 5780:24 5791:22 5798:10,18 5805:18 5809:9,18,19 5813:22 5870:1 aspect 5856:22 5857:19 aspects 5822:17 assaulted 5820:13 assist 5809:4 5851:22 5859:9 assistance 5781:22 5842:2 5846:19 assisted 5814:16 5835:5 assists 5838:10 associate 5774:12 5818:25 5843:13 5854:8 assume 5797:7 5829:24 5866:2 5875:3 assumed 5783:9 assure 5857:10 assured 5857:2 attack 5770:18 5792:11 5817:16 5822:4 attacked 5817:15 attacking 5791:24,25 5792:1,7,12 attend 5850:3 attended 5846:25 5848:16 attending 5833:9 attention 5775:6 5849:18 5869:24 attitude 5819:3 5820:3 5854:6 attorney 5844:3 5868:24 attorneys 5848:17</p>	<p>5849:3 5851:7 August 5771:12 5803:18 5808:23,23 5819:11 5862:20 5863:22 5866:8 authenticity 5824:21 availability 5805:24 5856:23 available 5808:19 5848:18 5857:3 5859:8 aware 5843:2 5859:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">B</p> <p>back 5772:22 5776:16 5776:22 5782:6 5794:6,10,15 5797:13 5817:4 5838:13 5845:9 5847:3 5866:19 5869:2 5870:11,18 5874:7 5875:22 background 5829:21 backside 5776:17 bad 5872:24 5876:5 balance 5829:17 Baloyi 5853:20 barbed 5785:11 5789:9 5789:11 5790:7,17 5792:9,15 5795:19 5796:20 5797:1,5,6 5820:7,10,17,19 5821:1 5872:1,11 5873:10 Barnes 5822:23,24 5823:4,6,13,18 5852:3,5,22 5853:2 based 5848:12 5849:3 basic 5817:10,17 basis 5820:19 5828:11 5839:7,10,14,17,20 5840:5 5849:8 batch 5844:22,24 5850:19,20 bear 5809:15,18 5814:11 5843:9 5851:23 5868:23 began 5843:4 beginning 5798:21 5824:23 5826:7 5836:21 5845:9 behalf 5772:20 5823:18 5851:12 5853:15,19 5853:25 5857:13 belabour 5806:11 5846:11 believe 5780:2 belittles 5818:12 bench 5829:10 beneath 5778:2 benefit 5795:17 5828:16 benefited 5815:25 benefits 5838:8 bent 5786:1,8 better 5801:8 5820:23</p>
--	---	--	--	---

<p>5823:3 5843:17 5876:10 beyond 5812:11 5840:10 big 5805:13,20 5806:4 5845:12 bishop 5869:7,19 bit 5825:4 5836:2 bitterly 5810:13 blanket 5774:7 5775:3 5775:8,8,11,16 5776:23 5777:12,23 5778:1,6 5779:23 5788:19 5789:12,17 blankets 5810:9,24 blind 5776:1,4,8,10 5778:23 blockage 5788:2,6,9 blocked 5787:17 5873:7,10 Bloody 5836:23 blowing 5815:13 blown 5815:13 blue 5874:19,20 board 5831:13 5837:18 5837:25 5838:20 5839:12,24 5843:4,14 boarding 5840:12 5841:12 bodies 5876:24 body 5865:10 5875:8 bono 5836:11 bore 5845:17 born 5862:14,18 borne 5819:10 5831:14 break 5825:5,8 brief 5855:5 briefly 5844:18 briefs 5849:9 bringing 5826:5 5828:9 broad 5874:9 broader 5833:8 broadly 5828:8,24 5833:18 5847:10 brother 5781:20 Bruinders 5836:9 buckets 5808:17 budget 5836:19,20 Budlender 5854:14 5856:19 5857:21 5858:7,23 build 5803:3 bulletins 5793:25 bullets 5792:18 5810:19,25 5816:25 5873:12 5875:11,13 5875:15 bump 5771:22 bumping 5772:7,13 5783:10 bumps 5772:10 bundle 5788:12 bureau 5809:8,12 Burger 5851:17 bus 5833:17 bush 5802:20 5803:1,3</p>	<p>5803:5 bushes 5803:6,11 busy 5876:22 button 5847:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">C</p> <hr/> <p>cage 5874:25 5876:1 call 5782:14 5824:2 5825:1 5827:20 5828:17 5843:3 5844:23 5860:4 5877:6 called 5794:25 5807:10 5821:20,20 5822:25 5824:11,12,17,19 5835:14 5847:4 5863:10 5874:20 calling 5850:17 calls 5838:6 canons 5791:14,23,25 5792:19 can't 5776:6 5783:11 5836:4 capacity 5849:7 Cape 5862:15 5865:18 card 5781:22 care 5820:6 carefully 5796:14 carried 5877:11 carrier 5819:15 carry 5793:25 5818:21 carrying 5781:22 5869:15 case 5819:14 5837:1 5839:24 5848:23 5865:19 casual 5806:12 cattle 5803:3 cause 5773:20 5796:19 5796:19 5797:4 5822:8 causes 5812:12 5823:21 causing 5771:14 cell 5876:23 centre 5832:9 5853:25 ceremony 5823:5 certain 5774:11 5809:1 5823:9 5825:3 5832:18 5844:17 5866:7 5869:1 certainly 5814:6 5852:19,24 certainty 5809:25 CHAIPERSON 5801:5 chair 5770:8,10,16,21 5771:5,10 5772:17 5773:1 5776:11 5778:14 5782:5,12,16 5782:20 5783:5,7 5792:22 5807:2 5808:3 5810:2,8 5814:2 5817:20 5818:6 5822:16 5823:6,13 5824:1 5828:8 5831:9 5835:1 5835:7 5838:3 5839:1</p>	<p>5840:14 5841:22 5842:10,21,25,25 5843:15 5844:9,12,16 5844:18 5845:2,13,25 5846:5 5850:13 5851:5,13,24 5852:5 5853:2,3,4,8,12 5854:14 5857:17 5858:7,23 5860:12,22 5861:12 Chairman 5772:21 5781:9 5782:1 5834:22,24 5836:15 5837:4 5858:21 challenge 5819:18 chance 5803:8 5822:2 change 5815:4 5816:3 5852:17 changed 5833:23 changing 5843:22 chanting 5789:20 charge 5839:15 5859:12 Chaskalson 5782:24 Chaskalson's 5782:14 5782:23 cheaper 5832:11 cheapest 5830:21 check 5867:5 5868:5 checking 5791:21 chest 5776:13,23 chief 5854:11 child 5877:5 choice 5831:19,19 5839:21 5851:8 chosen 5828:16 Cinderellas 5838:7 circle 5795:21 circumstances 5817:16 5841:10 cited 5836:21 clan 5773:4 clarify 5782:20 5800:4 5818:5,18 5858:8 class 5813:25 clear 5785:6 5787:20 5800:20 5812:20 5820:11 5824:23,24 5829:7 5857:24 5858:6 cleared 5800:19 clearer 5786:17 5796:22 5801:12 clearly 5785:4 5799:22 5818:19 5827:7 5838:16 client 5854:4 clients 5840:4,4 5850:1 5850:9 clip 5782:21 5783:2 close 5785:8 5792:9 5837:24 5871:25 5872:13 closed 5788:3 5817:3 closely 5775:2 5786:1 closer 5786:12,17</p>	<p>5801:3 5832:2 5839:19 5840:2 5842:14 5858:24,24 closing 5785:11 5847:2 cloth 5839:17 clothing 5774:21 clumsy 5865:7 cognisant 5840:18 coils 5789:8,11 cold 5808:25 5809:5,10 5810:13 collaboration 5856:25 colleague 5773:13 5787:9 5811:12 5845:3 5846:24 colleagues 5816:16 5817:13,15 5827:8 5832:3,13,15 5833:16 5845:20 5846:15 5857:14 collusion 5852:1 colour 5775:15 5776:1 5776:4,8,9,14,18,19 5776:21,21 5778:23 5779:1,10 colours 5775:20,21 5776:7,8 come 5773:14,20 5774:5 5790:11 5814:15 5827:13 5833:4,20 5835:4 5838:13 5840:19 5842:6 5846:18 5849:6 5850:3 5866:19 5869:2 5870:18 5874:7 comes 5807:12 5830:5 5858:24 5861:16 5870:7 5873:3 comfort 5850:5 coming 5791:14 5792:4 5798:12 5800:13 5842:7 5869:24 comment 5827:9 comments 5847:15 Commissioner 5774:17 5783:21 5784:4,11,16 5784:21,25 5785:3,7 5785:12,16,20 5786:4 5786:11,16,21 5787:2 5787:5,8,11,19,23 5788:5 5789:18,23 5790:1,6,12,16,24 5798:3 5799:18 5800:2 5875:19 commissioners 5781:10 5782:1 5829:9,14 5838:14 5843:15 5847:21 5853:25 5854:16,21 5857:13 5861:24 commission's 5836:6 commitments 5772:23 committed 5815:15 5833:22 COMMISSIONER</p>	<p>5785:24 common 5773:20 5779:13,19 5796:19 5796:19 5797:4 5827:13 5828:10,13 communicated 5839:6 communiqué 5819:10 5819:25 5822:13 communiqués 5819:15 communities 5831:17 community 5833:8 5852:11 5856:8 commuting 5839:3 compilation 5782:23 complete 5846:19 completely 5865:10 completeness 5793:7 component 5849:25 compound 5804:15 compounds 5815:1,3 compromise 5856:10 5856:10 compromising 5856:7 concern 5848:7 concerned 5772:23 5839:25 5843:20 5851:23 5857:22 5858:19 concerted 5847:25 conclusion 5814:16 5832:21 condition 5810:10 5826:14 5834:4 conditions 5809:2,7,14 5809:18 5815:10 5832:18,23 5835:22 5843:21 5852:9 5853:3 conduct 5818:25 confer 5825:6 configuration 5838:5 confirm 5791:16 5824:4 5862:10 confirmation 5869:19 conflicting 5809:13 confuse 5867:16 consciousness 5877:13 5877:16 consent 5835:6 consequence 5848:14 conservative 5830:24 consider 5783:17 5809:3 5828:2 5850:11 5856:21 5857:5 5858:3 considerably 5849:4 consideration 5836:3 5856:22 5858:14 considerations 5829:13 5846:4,10 considered 5811:7,15 5855:12 constant 5829:10 constituencies 5834:9 constitution 5851:25 constitutional 5835:3</p>
--	--	--	---	---

<p>5837:5 5858:3 constraints 5856:4 consult 5783:15,15 5831:25 consultation 5827:3 5830:11 5835:7 5840:1 consultations 5832:21 5834:15 5848:1,19 consulted 5840:4 consulting 5783:12,16 5843:1 contacted 5781:16 contemplated 5852:17 content 5783:3 contents 5824:4 context 5824:7 5858:2 5858:5 continue 5831:19 5841:18 5848:6 continuing 5851:22 continuum 5792:6 contributed 5815:22,24 contribution 5831:21 5859:13 convenience 5849:1,15 conversation 5850:14 convey 5819:6 5824:15 5824:18 5837:15 5838:3 5844:19 5857:23 copy 5795:15,17 corner 5801:15 correct 5774:14 5783:10 5791:5,21 5792:10 5799:5 5803:1 5821:25 5822:3 5823:10,14 5827:4 5842:9 5860:7 5860:8,18,20,21 5861:11,12 5863:11 5868:19 5869:8 5873:22 correspondent 5848:17 cost 5830:8,22 5848:15 5848:21,23 5849:25 costs 5830:8,9,15,18 5831:11,14,15 5836:20 5839:16 5841:12,13 5842:16 5846:6 5848:7,9,11 5848:13,13,25 5855:1 5855:17,18 couldn't 5782:25 5809:22 counsel 5780:22 5817:9 5835:11,23 5836:10 5836:10 5837:12,12 5837:12 5840:2 5849:2 count 5839:18 country 5830:4 5840:10,20 couple 5772:25 5773:11 course 5783:15</p>	<p>5795:11 5823:17,21 5828:3,25 5830:16 5831:9 5834:16 5839:7 5849:3 5850:1 5850:6,22 5852:9 COURT 5820:18 covers 5801:11 cow 5867:5,7,9 crawl 5770:18 5771:2 5771:16 created 5823:8,15 5845:23 crimes 5815:15 criminal 5861:14 cross 5770:3 5772:19 5782:1 5798:15 5803:15 5815:20 cross-examination 5770:7,22 5782:3,7,9 5783:18 cross-examine 5783:11 cross-examining 5823:17 crowd 5867:23,24 5870:13 cup 5860:6 current 5829:6 5833:23 5846:1 5863:5 currently 5780:3 5829:2 5833:1,16 cut 5802:20 5803:2,7 5805:20 5839:16</p>	<p>5867:8 debate 5858:22 debt 5859:22 December 5780:9 5854:17 decide 5810:13 decided 5817:4 5864:16 5865:18 5869:25 decision 5827:1 5850:15 5851:14 5853:7,17,21 5863:23 5867:1 dedicated 5848:18 deducted 5781:3 deduction 5781:7 deems 5786:3 defeated 5803:21 defence 5822:5 define 5833:19 degrees 5812:17 5826:19 deliberately 5844:20 5844:25 demanding 5849:19 demands 5790:11,23 democrat 5858:22 demonstrated 5831:5 deny 5791:25 5821:15 5858:11 department 5833:20 5843:16 5853:5,6 5855:17,19 5856:24 5856:25 5863:9 departure 5871:8 depend 5835:20 Depending 5805:23 depends 5823:2 depicted 5785:21 5791:4,17 5792:20 depleted 5830:14 deployed 5790:8,18 deploying 5872:11 depose 5826:22 deputed 5854:15 describe 5822:4 5875:14 described 5794:6 5873:21 5874:15 description 5793:9 desire 5859:16 despite 5846:15 detail 5811:8 development 5835:3 5837:5 develops 5829:12 didn't 5819:17,18 5850:25 5869:4,5 die 5816:9 5817:6,6 5876:16,19 died 5773:21 5816:16 5816:17 difference 5776:6 5849:23 5876:19 different 5776:18,19 5800:3 5802:12</p>	<p>5806:13 5809:13 5826:19 5852:18 differently 5806:7 difficult 5802:13 5826:16 5838:15 5839:7 5847:9 difficulties 5775:19 5846:2 difficulty 5772:15 5775:17 5822:13 direct 5771:23 5848:25 directed 5798:6 direction 5772:6 5797:10 5800:1,8,9 5800:17 5802:15 5804:16 5817:3 5869:14 5871:9,15 directly 5783:23 5828:7 5831:18 disagree 5818:21 disappear 5848:24 disarm 5811:6,13 disarmed 5811:8,15 5819:4 disarming 5820:5 disburse 5792:7 disclose 5845:10 discuss 5850:18 discussed 5804:3 5850:1 discussion 5858:10 discussions 5851:16 disinclined 5840:4 display 5868:24 distance 5792:13 5838:24 5839:2,3 5841:19 5842:17,20 5851:9 distanced 5818:8 distinct 5805:8 distributed 5819:10,15 docket 5861:14 documents 5828:1 doesn't 5775:8 5845:15 5858:13 5876:18 doing 5772:12 5836:12 5849:20 5856:16 5871:16 donating 5836:11 don't 5773:22 5776:7,9 5779:16 5780:2 5799:21 5809:6,12 5811:1 5813:24 5814:2,4,19 5821:11 5821:15 5822:8 5825:9 5838:20 5845:7,17 5846:11 5850:24 5852:23,24 5853:10 5859:2 5861:15 5864:14 5865:2 5868:23 dormant 5849:10 doubt 5778:9 5829:13 dragging 5872:1 drawing 5775:5 drawn 5798:21</p>	<p>dressed 5810:18 dresses 5810:20 dried 5845:8 drill 5813:11 driller 5813:5,16 drilling 5814:10 drive 5839:2 drivers 5783:12 drives 5782:25 5829:14 driving 5772:5 dropping 5851:5 ducks 5825:6 due 5828:2 5834:16 duly 5782:19 dungarees 5778:5 5789:11 duration 5848:5 duty 5779:18 dying 5816:9 5817:5 D-E 5771:6</p>
D				
<p>5783:10 5791:5,21 5792:10 5799:5 5803:1 5821:25 5822:3 5823:10,14 5827:4 5842:9 5860:7 5860:8,18,20,21 5861:11,12 5863:11 5868:19 5869:8 5873:22 correspondent 5848:17 cost 5830:8,22 5848:15 5848:21,23 5849:25 costs 5830:8,9,15,18 5831:11,14,15 5836:20 5839:16 5841:12,13 5842:16 5846:6 5848:7,9,11 5848:13,13,25 5855:1 5855:17,18 couldn't 5782:25 5809:22 counsel 5780:22 5817:9 5835:11,23 5836:10 5836:10 5837:12,12 5837:12 5840:2 5849:2 count 5839:18 country 5830:4 5840:10,20 couple 5772:25 5773:11 course 5783:15</p>	<p>daily 5839:17 damage 5771:14 dangers 5815:9 dashed 5871:15 day 5773:19,21 5778:10 5783:9 5793:25 5803:22 5809:11 5829:17 5830:23 5839:23 5865:11,11 5866:24 5867:25 5868:1 days 5835:25 5839:16 5839:23 5845:16 5857:25 5866:3 DDD 5778:11 DDD6.4 5778:12 De 5770:8,22,25 5771:5 5771:5,8,10,19,23 5772:1,7,12,17 dead 5777:18 deadline 5829:6 deal 5783:17 5806:2 5812:6 5819:11,13 5822:16 5849:7 5854:15 5858:10 5868:13 5869:20 dealing 5831:3 5838:7 5862:4 dealings 5833:24 dealt 5794:4 5802:24 5826:15 5832:15 5849:7 5857:10</p>	<p>debate 5858:22 debt 5859:22 December 5780:9 5854:17 decide 5810:13 decided 5817:4 5864:16 5865:18 5869:25 decision 5827:1 5850:15 5851:14 5853:7,17,21 5863:23 5867:1 dedicated 5848:18 deducted 5781:3 deduction 5781:7 deems 5786:3 defeated 5803:21 defence 5822:5 define 5833:19 degrees 5812:17 5826:19 deliberately 5844:20 5844:25 demanding 5849:19 demands 5790:11,23 democrat 5858:22 demonstrated 5831:5 deny 5791:25 5821:15 5858:11 department 5833:20 5843:16 5853:5,6 5855:17,19 5856:24 5856:25 5863:9 departure 5871:8 depend 5835:20 Depending 5805:23 depends 5823:2 depicted 5785:21 5791:4,17 5792:20 depleted 5830:14 deployed 5790:8,18 deploying 5872:11 depose 5826:22 deputed 5854:15 describe 5822:4 5875:14 described 5794:6 5873:21 5874:15 description 5793:9 desire 5859:16 despite 5846:15 detail 5811:8 development 5835:3 5837:5 develops 5829:12 didn't 5819:17,18 5850:25 5869:4,5 die 5816:9 5817:6,6 5876:16,19 died 5773:21 5816:16 5816:17 difference 5776:6 5849:23 5876:19 different 5776:18,19 5800:3 5802:12</p>	<p>dressed 5810:18 dresses 5810:20 dried 5845:8 drill 5813:11 driller 5813:5,16 drilling 5814:10 drive 5839:2 drivers 5783:12 drives 5782:25 5829:14 driving 5772:5 dropping 5851:5 ducks 5825:6 due 5828:2 5834:16 duly 5782:19 dungarees 5778:5 5789:11 duration 5848:5 duty 5779:18 dying 5816:9 5817:5 D-E 5771:6</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">E</p> <p>ear 5834:14 earlier 5824:16 5847:11 early 5808:23 5825:4,4 5839:5 5868:5,8 earshot 5804:1 easier 5790:13,19,21 5832:10 easily 5809:8 Eastern 5862:15 5865:18 easy 5790:2,8 eat 5868:15 economic 5826:9 5828:12 5830:16 5835:14 5841:8 economy 5830:5 EEE1 5861:10 5862:5 EEE2 5861:19,20 effect 5792:2 5817:16 5842:17 effective 5849:25 5855:9 5856:1,13 effectively 5799:19 5812:5 5813:2 5826:22 5830:12 5847:5 5856:3,14,16 effects 5845:1 efficiency 5855:7,11 5856:11 efficient 5869:6 effort 5792:7 efforts 5843:16 either 5810:5 5815:14 5821:15 5842:1 5846:22 elaborate 5811:4 elbow 5875:19,20 elc 5806:8 electricity 5846:8 5859:11 element 5849:14 elevated 5797:24 Elliotdale 5862:15</p>

<p>else's 5816:25 emerged 5874:1 emotionally 5846:21 emphasising 5858:3 employees 5864:9 5866:18 5869:23 5872:7 employer 5789:24 5790:5,11,22 5794:11 5819:2,5 5870:7 employment 5862:23 5862:25 5863:5 5864:3 enabled 5828:18 enclosed 5792:14 enclosure 5792:2 endeavouring 5806:20 5859:3 endeavours 5837:18 engage 5835:23 5841:15 5843:4 engaged 5817:14 5839:8,9 5857:1 engagement 5843:8 engaging 5817:13 5833:15 engineering 5863:9 English 5776:15 enormous 5836:4 ensue 5832:7 entail 5845:18 5869:22 entering 5792:1 enterprise 5817:13 entire 5784:25 entirely 5818:8 5824:1 5849:10 entitled 5823:20 5838:8 entrance 5784:1,2,5,12 5785:22 5786:23 5787:5 5790:2 entrances 5784:5,12 episode 5872:4 equal 5830:25 equality 5837:8,13 5838:17 5843:18 5858:4 Eric 5823:17 eroding 5839:23 erroneous 5823:15 especially 5835:1 5849:2 essence 5848:4 essential 5829:25 5848:15 essentially 5826:6,11 5848:11 5852:10 5864:5 5869:3 establish 5773:8 5812:11 established 5782:21 5836:17 5865:13 estimate 5830:24 etcetera 5850:14 evening 5866:13 event 5841:2 5846:12 5864:15</p>	<p>events 5812:23 5824:7 5836:24 eventually 5831:13 5868:3 everybody 5777:14 5779:19 5797:17 everybody's 5777:5 evidence 5771:13 5773:12 5782:13 5783:10 5794:1 5800:12 5802:20 5805:12 5809:13 5819:21 5821:18 5831:11 5832:3,16 5847:14 5854:12,15 5855:16 5861:3 5876:21 exactly 5779:11 5796:22,23,24 5801:7 5817:21,23 5828:14 5863:7,18 5867:19 examination 5770:4 5803:15 5815:21 5818:20 5819:20 5861:23 examine 5772:20 examining 5813:23 example 5813:15 exchange 5823:22 5824:15 excuse 5800:25 excused 5822:19,22 exercise 5857:1 exhibit 5771:24 5774:17,18 5778:11 5788:12 5823:19 5861:10,19 5867:15 5869:1 exhibits 5782:22 expeditiousness 5829:20 expense 5837:1 5838:9 expenses 5855:24 experience 5809:19 5864:24 experienced 5865:14 expert 5824:6 explain 5803:24 5804:2 5805:11,11 5811:8,16 5813:9 5816:14,20 5823:9 5826:16 5867:9 5872:3 5874:16 5875:14 explained 5816:4,12 5841:7 5857:11 explaining 5816:2 express 5852:6,23 extend 5833:23 extended 5833:25 5837:14 5848:6 extension 5829:2,6,8 5843:2 extensive 5855:8 extent 5772:10 5842:25 5857:25 extra 5806:24 5826:1</p>	<p>5830:8 5831:21 5857:8 extract 5830:3 extreme 5789:4 eye 5812:12 eyes 5837:24</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">F</p> <hr/> <p>face 5815:9 faced 5829:21 5831:18 facilitate 5847:9,11 5850:9 facilities 5859:8,12 fact 5775:20 5779:7 5781:20 5796:21 5797:5 5801:10 5806:16 5811:23 5813:8 5818:12 5824:10 5837:8 5840:18 5842:22 5844:19 5849:1,16 5863:22 factor 5814:11 factors 5828:12 factually 5783:12 fair 5775:25 5806:16 5806:23 5853:1 fairly 5849:18 5857:3 fairness 5818:23 5829:13 fall 5822:9 5849:17 familiar 5800:21 families 5772:20 5773:18 5824:12,13 5824:19 5833:4 5834:25 5835:10 5837:15 5838:5,18,19 5839:11 5840:7,19,22 5840:24,25 5841:1,7 5842:6,12,12 5843:6 5843:7,21,22 family 5835:11 5853:16 far 5804:5 5833:4 5840:10,20 5843:19 5846:18 5851:22 5858:18 5865:3 5869:22 Farlam 5824:10 fashion 5809:19 fast 5846:13 faster 5830:18 fault 5859:10 5869:17 5875:3 fearing 5865:20 FEBRUARY 5770:1 feel 5815:23 feels 5810:21 5815:19 fees 5830:6,9 5831:12 5839:14 5854:22,23 5855:1 5857:22 5858:5,10,13 fell 5772:11 5874:3,5 felt 5816:15,24 5817:12 5868:15 5871:5 fence 5784:17,19,22,24 5785:1,2 5801:16</p>	<p>5867:12,13 5873:7 fenced 5801:12,13 fencing 5871:9 fetch 5808:11 fetching 5808:12,16 fewer 5868:6 fight 5811:17 fighting 5811:19 5870:9 filled 5865:7 finally 5816:1 5821:10 5832:17 5856:6 find 5782:25 5801:1 5809:11 5815:7 5843:5 5866:21 finding 5866:23 finds 5783:1 fine 5794:2,3 5844:2 5862:12 finger 5847:18 finish 5829:1 5876:10 finished 5782:7 5826:11 5827:7 5865:8 5876:14 fire 5798:5,6 firearms 5876:3 fired 5791:15,16 5792:18,19 5793:10 5793:12 5803:22 5872:18 firing 5788:10 5792:6 5802:3 firm 5848:17 firms 5826:6 first 5774:11 5795:18 5798:24 5805:11 5839:5 5844:21,24 5845:5 5847:19,19 5850:19,20 5851:8,15 5853:13 5863:5 5865:14,23 5866:25 5867:3,25 5868:14 5874:10,15 5875:4 firstly 5826:23 5844:18 5855:6 5865:13 fit 5786:3 five 5795:4,5 5831:1 flesh 5772:16 5817:1 flexibility 5849:4,15 5854:25 flung 5840:10,20 follow 5773:15 5851:18 following 5815:19 5819:19 5855:6 5866:24 follows 5823:25 food 5820:13 fools 5865:6 foot 5795:24 5796:2 footage 5794:12 5874:8 footsteps 5874:21 force 5792:6 forefront 5789:13 forego 5830:7 foregoing 5831:12 foregone 5830:8</p>	<p>5854:23 5855:2,3 forgive 5821:13 former 5845:17,19,25 5846:1 forms 5800:3 5817:11 forth 5842:7 Fortunately 5840:12 forum 5828:23 forward 5791:15 5792:4 found 5813:8 four 5795:4 5797:6 5831:1 fourth 5846:3,4 5850:18 5861:25 frame 5794:19 frank 5846:5 frankly 5829:5 free 5832:10 5859:12 freely 5800:5 Friday 5825:2,15 friend 5837:10 5838:6 5841:19 5851:16 5854:9 5857:20 fro 5839:4 front 5771:13 5776:22 5786:19 5789:1,2,4 5795:12 5796:1,12 5797:11 5798:25 5801:4 5806:4,5 5862:6 5867:17 5870:15,21 5871:15 5872:2,15 full 5827:14,18 5836:12 fund 5839:24 funded 5837:1,6 5838:9 funder 5839:13 5845:12 funding 5828:23 5838:11,20,22 5841:11 5843:14 5845:6 fundraise 5835:17 fundraised 5835:21 fundraising 5845:3 further 5783:18 5819:19 5822:11,14 5822:22 5829:7 5844:7 5852:12 5868:21 5870:8 5876:15 future 5809:15</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">G</p> <hr/> <p>gap 5792:9 5800:25 5801:20 5806:5 5872:13 5873:20,21 garment 5775:3,9 gas 5793:1 gather 5860:5 gathering 5811:25 Gauteng 5780:11 5844:6,6 5854:20 5855:4 Gavin 5823:6,16,19 5824:3,5</p>
---	--	--	---	---

<p>Gcilitshana 5823:18 general 5799:25 5863:10,12 5869:22 generally 5831:14 5832:19 generate 5854:25 gentleman 5773:2 5860:17 geography 5800:5 germane 5850:16 gesture 5859:19 getting 5788:2 5830:7 5835:20 5839:19 5843:13,15 5864:16 GG2 5869:1 gift 5837:20 5838:21 5845:8 gist 5813:21 give 5827:18 5838:21 5843:5 5861:3 5868:18 given 5797:9 5820:13 5831:23 5838:19 5843:6 5847:8 5859:11 gives 5870:7 giving 5829:18 5835:6 glove 5836:2 go 5771:24 5776:7 5777:1 5780:1 5782:5 5784:10 5786:22 5787:15 5788:3 5794:25 5796:21 5798:1,14 5799:4 5800:10,19 5805:5 5808:20 5812:11 5815:4 5816:9 5817:5 5822:23 5827:12 5831:1,16 5838:12 5850:24 5857:18 5863:23 5865:18 5866:21 5867:14,16 5869:11 5870:1,10 5871:17,20 5872:4,25 5873:2,5 goal 5834:10 God 5861:5 goes 5772:10 5784:1 going 5770:17 5771:11 5771:21 5772:19 5787:16 5794:3,6,10 5794:10,20,22 5796:17 5799:20 5802:10 5805:8 5807:20 5809:15 5812:4,6,7 5814:15 5818:17 5819:3 5820:4,11,12,20,21 5821:6,14 5823:4 5825:23 5826:2 5827:15 5830:14 5831:21 5834:10,19 5835:1,17 5837:4,24 5839:13 5841:4,5,14 5842:14 5843:8,9 5845:25 5846:22</p>	<p>5847:3,7 5854:20 5860:7 5862:4 5864:12,14,16 5867:15 5869:25 5870:7 5872:25 5873:2,5 5876:7,16 5876:19 good 5772:21 5793:18 5831:16 5837:9 5840:21 5858:9 5861:25 5862:2 5870:1 governmental 5835:13 grace 5817:7 granted 5818:3 grateful 5837:25 gratitude 5859:22 great 5848:7,14 5850:5 greater 5833:12 greatly 5848:9 green 5774:7,12,19,20 5775:2,9,10,12,21 5776:23 5777:11,22 5778:6 5779:23 5789:12 greet 5798:14 grenades 5791:15 5792:5,18 ground 5806:2 5807:10 grounds 5827:6 group 5770:17 5785:18 5785:25 5786:7 5789:20 5790:2,8,17 5790:18 5791:3,7 5792:7 5794:23 5798:4 5805:21 5806:8 5807:16 5812:5 5814:24,25 5819:4,6 5820:6,7 5821:20 5873:22 5874:1 grouping 5805:9,10,19 groupings 5805:3,8 5806:1,13 groups 5806:3,4 guaranteed 5841:20 guess 5830:20 guilty 5778:23 GUMBI 5853:19 gunfire 5874:2,13,15 gunshots 5804:2</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">H</p> <p>half 5825:12,17 5829:23 5865:9 halfway 5846:19 HANABE 5873:16 5874:25 5875:18 hand 5771:17 5829:19 5857:4 5858:18 5861:5 5875:18 handshake 5823:5 hanging 5772:16 happen 5792:19 5820:12,20 5821:6 5830:18 5833:13</p>	<p>5859:21 5865:21 happened 5771:1,11 5791:17 5794:9,17 5811:14 5815:14 5823:10 5840:6 5874:17 happening 5794:13 5839:15 5866:17,21 5866:23 happenings 5840:6 happens 5815:2 5829:11 happily 5840:14 happy 5841:20 5843:12 5843:16 5850:10 5851:25 hard 5782:25 5795:15 5813:12 5814:10 5830:5 5846:23,25 5864:21,24 hardest 5831:8 Hartford 5823:7,16,20 5824:3,5,17,19 hasn't 5815:25 hat 5821:25 haven't 5775:20 5782:15 5845:11 5851:18 hazard 5830:19 head 5838:25 5850:6 heads 5822:9 healthy 5793:21 5865:11 hear 5774:2 5850:25 5851:2 5864:1 heard 5774:10 5803:21 5803:23,25 5819:7 5820:9 5864:2,8,11 5864:13 5866:2 5873:12 5874:20 hearing 5804:1 5813:10,12 5814:10 5849:5 hearings 5848:5 heavy 5810:9 helmet 5822:7 help 5798:3 5814:15 5861:5 Hemraj 5783:19,21 5784:4,11,16,21,25 5785:3,7,12,16,20,24 5786:4,11,16,21 5787:2,5,8 5789:18 5789:23 5790:1,6,12 5790:16,24 5799:18 5800:2 he's 5773:21 5810:5 5814:10 5850:17 5874:25 5875:19 hide 5772:15 high 5815:7 higher 5834:10 hill 5772:15 hint 5850:23 hinting 5850:17 hints 5851:5</p>	<p>hippo 5771:13,15,15,17 5771:20 5772:5,13 5788:23,25,25 5789:4 5873:7 hit 5873:13,14,17 5874:3,24 5875:5,6 5875:11,11,12,15,16 5875:22,25 5876:1,6 5876:9 hitting 5876:8 Hobson's 5831:19 home 5813:19 5865:19 5866:1,7 5868:15 5871:18,20 homes 5841:13 hope 5834:13 5846:11 5847:9,10 hopefully 5846:25 hoping 5822:25 horse 5837:20 5838:21 5845:8 horseshoe 5795:24 5796:2 hospital 5781:12,14 hospitalised 5781:10 hot 5809:5,10 hotel 5840:22 5841:2 5841:17 5842:14,18 hour 5825:12,13 hours 5794:18 5836:13 5839:2 5855:10 house 5815:4 humble 5835:8 hundreds 5831:4,4 hungry 5868:15 hurdle 5840:13 hurry 5872:8 hurt 5815:23</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">I</p> <p>idea 5788:2 5818:8 5821:2 ideal 5839:11 identified 5779:6 5847:24 identify 5776:8 5779:3 5791:5,11 5794:19 identity 5773:14 immediately 5799:10 5799:11 5843:4 impediment 5787:20 5787:24 impeding 5846:12 important 5783:18 5811:3 5812:18 5821:18 5827:14 5833:10 5835:2 5837:3 5839:1 5843:11 5845:10 5848:25 5849:14 5850:6 importantly 5849:14 impression 5787:12,13 5792:23 5823:7,15 5845:22 improve 5856:11</p>	<p>inappropriate 5858:5 inaudible 5771:3,7,9 incident 5793:8,8,10 5811:14 5816:8 5862:19 inclined 5825:8 5834:15 include 5833:6,19 5844:19 5863:15 includes 5866:3 including 5792:5 5831:11 5851:9 5874:4 incorporate 5825:9 incorrect 5823:7 increase 5855:7,11 increased 5833:14 incurring 5855:24 indebted 5817:25 5820:25 5825:25 independent 5824:5 5869:19 indicate 5772:1 5827:21 5852:14 5862:24 indicated 5779:6 5822:12 5825:2 5826:1 5837:17 5862:4 5864:10 indicates 5771:17 5815:14 5837:11 5851:8 indication 5778:19 indications 5852:18 indifferent 5826:14 indulge 5773:1 indulged 5770:12 indulgence 5812:7 Industry 5823:20 inevitably 5849:24 inform 5832:4 informal 5783:21 5787:14,20,24 5788:7 5840:22 5841:17,25 5842:13 information 5771:4 5797:10 5843:12 5849:16,20 5857:3 5864:5 initially 5779:5 initiate 5834:15 injured 5780:8 5781:9 5817:4 5833:7 5840:1 injuries 5822:8 injury 5817:11,12,17 5817:18 inquiry 5836:17,23 inspection 5800:19 instance 5836:18,21 5837:7 5839:12 instantly 5848:24 Institute 5826:9 5835:14 instruct 5839:6 instructed 5826:7 5835:13,16 5837:23</p>
---	---	---	--	---

<p>5842:11 instructing 5835:10 5844:2 instruction 5843:7 instructions 5828:19 5844:3,4 5852:14,18 5853:7 5868:11 instrument 5822:7 intangible 5830:15 intelligence 5818:3 intend 5824:15 5858:18 5871:16 intended 5784:3 5786:22 5821:9 5822:7 5824:10,12,18 5824:23 5834:12 5838:23 5857:23 5858:8,14,17 5869:17 intending 5825:3,11 intention 5770:18 5821:2,7 5831:17 5871:17 5872:21 interaction 5850:9 interest 5833:8 5856:2 interested 5832:25 interests 5841:21 5856:15,15 5859:14 5859:14,15 interim 5843:21 international 5859:14 interrupt 5809:7 intersect 5849:1 introduce 5773:1 introduced 5823:19 introducing 5823:22 introductory 5818:20 invariably 5829:12 invested 5846:21 investigate 5776:10 investigations 5832:6 5857:2 involved 5824:9 5831:3 5855:9,18 involves 5848:13 inyanga 5876:4 IPID 5861:16 Ireland 5836:24,25 iron 5836:2 irritating 5813:8 isiZulu 5876:11 isn't 5772:4 5779:22 5780:16 issue 5782:6 5783:17 5794:4 5802:19 5803:15 5805:2 5809:10 5810:16,17 5813:23 5818:25 5825:7 5826:4,17 5828:23 5830:5 5831:12,16 5832:18 5832:24,24 5833:9 5834:6 5838:13 5845:3,13 5846:3 issues 5812:5,10 5826:11 5829:14 5832:6 5846:23,24</p>	<p>Item 5868:25 it's 5772:3,3 5774:17 5775:7,13 5777:22 5779:1,8,13 5784:18 5797:23 5798:22 5801:9 5809:10 5814:6,19 5817:2,10 5819:22 5820:23 5825:3 5834:11 5838:4 5839:2,3,19 5844:6 5845:10,12 5846:4,8,8 5848:5 5849:2,12 5850:18,23 5854:22 5856:2 5857:18,20 5859:6,12 5860:7 5861:14 5869:1,24 5875:2 I'd 5811:4 5833:24 5834:7 5858:7 5874:14 I'll 5771:5 5774:23 5814:22,22 5852:12 5862:8 5869:20 5874:8 I'm 5770:14 5771:5,8 5771:11,25 5773:5,16 5774:16 5777:20 5778:10 5809:1,18,19 5812:4,6,7 5813:21 5813:22 5833:24 5835:13 5838:1 5839:23 5841:22 5844:2 5845:17 5846:1,14 5847:2 5851:5,5,5,24 5853:4 5853:13 5854:20 5857:1,21,22 5858:12 5858:21 5859:2,3,4 5859:20,23 5866:6 5867:15 5869:16 5870:1,11 5873:16 5876:19 I've 5779:6 5797:9 5815:24 5832:18,21 5839:20 5842:11 5847:3,11 5853:6 5854:14 5857:11 5869:18</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">J</p> <p>ja 5773:17 5799:23 5806:10 5809:17 5844:1 5866:14 January 5823:17 5829:1 5838:22 job 5863:5 5865:14,24 jobs 5831:8 Johannesburg 5839:1 5841:5 5842:4,9 5843:23,25 5844:4 5848:22 5849:3,6,21 5850:7,7 5852:16,19 5852:25 join 5864:6,9 joined 5867:23 joint 5848:3</p>	<p>joking 5876:22 Jo'burg 5847:7 judge 5813:25 Jumping 5877:3 junior 5837:12,12 juniors 5778:10 justice 5827:3 5835:2,3 5837:5,16 5841:15 5843:1 5856:15,24 5859:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">K</p> <p>Kanya 5862:14 Karel 5781:20 keen 5837:8 keep 5815:8,16 5841:9 5859:3 kept 5792:3,3 5839:10 5867:7,10 key 5812:10 kicking 5876:24 kill 5876:10 killed 5773:19 5817:13 5817:14 5870:1 5876:15 kind 5774:21 5785:17 5795:20 5801:3 5827:20 5831:4 5833:12 5834:3 5837:14 5839:3 5840:13 kindly 5833:16 kinds 5841:8 Kingdom 5836:22 kneeling 5870:2 knife 5802:20 knives 5803:3,7 knocks 5865:9 know 5773:18,21 5774:1,2 5776:1 5780:2 5781:13 5793:5 5796:13 5797:15 5802:25 5803:11 5804:1 5806:21 5807:5 5810:16 5811:1 5812:10,17 5815:16 5816:25 5819:1,2,5 5819:17,24 5820:3 5821:7,7,8,10,15,24 5822:4 5825:14 5827:1,21 5829:15 5830:10 5831:1 5834:8 5846:16,20 5853:10 5854:16 5857:18 5861:15 5864:14 5865:2 5867:8 5868:3,10,14 5868:23 5876:2,4 knowing 5774:6 knowledge 5800:4 known 5773:14,20 5774:5 knows 5813:16 5836:5 5851:1 koppie 5772:6 5794:7</p>	<p>5797:23 5805:9,10,21 5805:21 5806:4 5808:8 5819:16,17 5867:23 5869:8 5870:14 koppies 5805:4,12 5806:2,6 5870:14 kraal 5771:12 5772:6 5784:1,2,8,9,18 5787:18 5788:4,6,9 5795:5,24 5796:2,13 5797:12 5798:7,12,21 5799:4,9,11 5800:25 5801:16 5802:3 5803:5,6 5816:8 5867:3,9,18,21 5872:3,5,5,11,15,20 5874:2 kraals 5799:20 5800:1 5800:6 5802:25,25 5803:1,3,11 5867:8</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">L</p> <p>L 5771:24 lack 5828:23 landscape 5826:5 5874:9 language 5773:2,25 5776:15 5800:12 large 5814:24 5849:23 largely 5806:20 latitude 5845:15 laughing 5876:22 laurels 5845:5 law 5826:6 lawyer 5781:21 lawyers 5830:6,12 5843:14 5854:22,23 5855:1 5857:22 5858:5,10 5862:5 lawyer's 5858:13 lead 5786:25 5800:9 5819:21 leader 5847:14 5851:17 5854:12 leaders 5782:13 5831:11 5832:4,16 5847:14 5854:15 5855:16 leadership 5850:4 5869:8 leading 5820:22 leads 5784:8,20 5873:4 learned 5781:20 5811:11 5812:16 5832:3 5837:10 5838:6 5841:18 5845:2 5846:24 5851:15,16 5854:9 5857:20 leave 5799:3 5806:1 5870:7 led 5824:8 left 5780:21 5788:1 5789:4,13 5800:11 5816:23 5869:12,13</p>	<p>5874:24 5875:1,17,19 leg 5874:3 5875:5 legal 5781:22 5836:20 5837:18,25 5838:20 5839:12,24 5840:2 5841:9,12,13 5843:4 5843:14 5853:25 lends 5830:8 Lepaaku 5853:20 Lerato 5853:13 lethal 5792:5 letter 5827:24 5834:1 5857:8 letters 5857:8 let's 5777:1 5798:1,2 5798:23 5799:3 5801:2 5810:15 5816:21 5867:16 let's 5794:4 5805:11 5806:1 5826:23 level 5837:12,12,13 5840:15 Lewis 5835:12 liaise 5851:19 lies 5828:14 5848:4 Lieutenant 5853:20 life 5829:12 5843:3 5865:15 light 5859:5 likes 5826:8 limited 5822:14 line 5783:24 5785:4,9 5785:10 5786:12,22 5787:3,15 5788:25 5789:10 5795:5,18 5796:1,3 5797:17 5799:8 5816:1 5866:25 lined 5785:14 5786:19 lines 5795:10 link 5869:20 lips 5813:18 list 5827:19 listening 5773:16 5813:19 litigation 5836:18 little 5779:20 5825:4 live 5810:25 5815:10 5833:2 5841:24,25 locate 5782:13 located 5849:21 location 5855:23 lodging 5840:12 5841:13 long 5780:15 5794:7,14 5813:17 5839:11 5841:10 5845:24 5849:10 5851:4 5854:1 longer 5841:19 5843:23 longish 5825:8 Lonmin 5833:16,16,21 5833:21 5842:2 5851:12,22 5862:24 5863:8 look 5775:1,23 5776:13</p>
---	--	---	--	--

5776:22 5777:17 5785:17 5788:11 5789:8,14 5795:14,25 5795:25 5796:13 5801:2 5806:10,10,12 5807:15 5814:23 5837:20 5838:21 5845:8 5865:5 looked 5785:24 looking 5771:25 5777:20 5782:15,22 5791:2 5795:2 5806:22 5863:4 looks 5789:6,12 5829:7 5861:13 lose 5865:23 lost 5877:12 lot 5771:14 5809:13 5836:5,7 5840:18 loved 5780:20 lower 5876:8 loyal 5780:25 5781:22 loyalty 5780:19 luck 5876:5 Lucky 5866:10,12,15 lunch 5825:4,9,12 5869:11 5870:13,18 lying 5777:18 5794:25 5874:18,23 5876:7 L192 5777:2,2 L198 5789:19 L206 5779:4 L206 5785:17 L208 5777:19 5867:15 5867:17 L26 5774:17	Maite 5853:4,12,13 Makaraba 5821:20,24 5822:4,6 making 5806:11 5829:10 5840:17 5841:15 Mambush 5770:17 5773:14,20,25 5774:11 5777:5,15 5778:9,15,19 5779:3 5779:6,7 5787:11 5788:18 man 5773:4 5774:2,7 5774:11 5778:5 5789:17 5813:16,17 manage 5845:6 managed 5832:23 5850:5 management 5848:1 5849:15 manner 5781:9 5786:3 5857:11 5871:3 map 5772:2,3 march 5803:18 Marikana 5796:9 5807:12 5813:24 5824:8 5841:25 5856:8 5873:3 marked 5795:6 Masevhe 5853:15,16 massacre 5813:24 material 5856:10 materials 5848:19 Mathunjwa 5807:16 5866:18 5868:18 Mathunjwa's 5868:14 5869:21 5870:17 5871:7 matter 5806:21 5810:13 5832:12,14 5833:9 5836:6 5839:13 5843:9 5850:16,18 5854:22 5857:10 5858:14 matters 5829:1 5833:11,14 5844:17 5848:15 5849:7 5850:5,8 mean 5772:8 5779:13 5790:12 5819:14 5839:16 5840:6 5843:24 meaning 5816:23 means 5830:16 5862:19 meant 5820:4 5834:8 measured 5801:17 measurement 5801:17 measures 5844:24 medical 5793:25 meet 5829:5 5834:4 meeting 5827:11 5837:4 5856:20 5857:4 member 5780:3,3,5,8 5780:10,15,25 5781:22	members 5781:17 5792:4 5836:15 5850:4 5851:13 5852:11 5855:16,18 5856:7 membership 5781:4,7 memorandum 5854:17 5854:21 mention 5830:15 5832:13,17 5846:12 5851:6 5853:6 mentioned 5831:12,24 5847:11 mentioning 5858:2 mercy 5877:5 message 5819:6 5866:7 messages 5864:16 met 5846:19 5852:9 5853:3 5874:2 method 5814:25 methods 5792:5 metres 5795:6,23 5801:16 microphone 5810:5 5847:18 5852:4 5853:23 mid 5808:23 middle 5813:25 mile 5831:21 mind 5809:15,18 5814:11 5819:10 5827:13 5851:23 5859:4 mindful 5848:24 5849:16 minds 5843:18 mine 5821:25 5847:22 Minerals 5853:5 miners 5773:19 Mining 5823:20 minister 5827:2,11,15 5828:2 5831:24 5832:22 5834:15 5835:2,6 5837:4 5843:1 5856:21 5857:5 5859:4 ministry 5835:3 5837:15 5838:4,10 5840:15 5841:15 5843:11 minutes 5871:7 misplaced 5869:18 misrepresented 5842:10 missed 5838:2 mission 5846:20 mistake 5779:13,16,19 5798:23 5810:6,7 mistakenly 5774:13 misunderstanding 5837:21 misunderstood 5793:4 mobility 5832:25 modalities 5850:14 Mojapelo 5800:2 moment 5852:12	5858:11 Monene 5853:16 money 5815:24 5855:15,20 5856:12 5870:8 month 5836:13 5863:15 mooted 5852:16 morning 5772:21 5793:18,19 5794:14 5827:23 5866:19,25 5867:3 5868:4,8,12 5877:19 Motau 5782:5,10,12,22 5783:4 5819:9 5822:16 5851:11,13 5851:24 Motau's 5803:15 Motloenya 5835:12,13 mountain 5785:4,13 5786:14,18 5794:10 5811:25 mouth 5817:21 5837:20 5838:21 5845:8 move 5820:4 5825:3 5826:18 5827:1 5831:22 5832:1 5834:13 5840:2 5843:23,24 5845:1 5847:10 5848:10 5852:14,16,19 5854:19,24 5855:7 5856:9,11 5858:12,12 5869:2 moved 5832:1 5835:7 5872:13 movement 5802:15 5832:10,11,11 moves 5855:20 moving 5794:6 5826:2 5844:5 5847:17 5855:13 municipality 5859:7,13 5859:19 muti 5810:25 Mzoxolo 5860:7,17 5861:6 M-A-I-T-E 5853:13	necessary 5783:16 5814:20 5824:20 5839:21 5848:16 5856:14 nessitated 5829:8 neck 5777:12 need 5823:9 5839:19 5846:18 5849:7 5851:14 5854:22 5876:15 needs 5830:4 5852:13 negative 5844:25 neither 5814:6 net 5863:19,20 never 5819:7 5820:1,9 5824:10 5835:19 5865:16 new 5833:2 5842:19 NGO 5835:16 Nicole 5835:12 Nkanduli 5773:25 5774:2 Nkaneng 5783:22 5784:8 5801:3,21 5807:12 5811:24 5812:2 5863:4 5864:3 5871:16 5872:2,4,10 5872:23 5873:1,3 Nkosi 5854:3 Noki 5789:8,15 5874:4 5874:6 non 5835:13 non-State 5856:13 normal 5814:25 north 5844:6 northern 5801:2 5836:24,24 Nortje 5788:17 note 5845:16 5851:7 notice 5777:4,7 noticed 5871:8 November 5839:5 Nsangwe 5773:5 Ntsebenza 5815:20 Ntsebeza 5772:21,25 5773:7,10,17,24 5774:3,9,15,19,23 5775:1,7,12,15,18,23 5776:2,5,11,16,20 5777:1,4,7,11,14,17 5777:21 5778:1,4,8 5778:14,18,22 5779:2 5779:12,18 5780:1,7 5780:12,14,18,23 5781:2,8,13,16,19,25 5825:6 5826:10 5828:7 5834:19,21,24 5842:10,21,24 5844:1 5844:9 5845:3,7 5846:25 5851:7 5857:15,17 5858:17 5858:21 NUM 5780:3,4,6,8,10 5780:15,19,21,25 5781:4,14,17,21,22 5804:7 5816:4,23
<hr/> M <hr/> machine 5865:7 Madlanga 5854:11 Magidiwana 5860:7,19 5860:23 5861:1,6,8 5861:24 5862:1,2,7 5862:12,16,22 5863:2 5863:7,12,18,20,25 5864:2,8,13,17,20 5865:1,5,16,23 5866:5,9,14,16 5867:2,5,11,19,25 5868:7,16,20 5869:9 5869:12,21,23 5870:6 5870:15,20,24 5871:4 5871:12,17,22 5872:6 5872:22 5873:2,9,14 5873:17,23 5874:5,11 5874:18 5875:2,6,9 5875:12,16,21 5876:18 5877:1,9,14 magnificent 5859:19 magnitude 5829:12 MAHLANGU 5780:20 5797:18 5800:13 5821:4 main 5828:6 5830:21 5839:13 5855:2 maintained 5833:5				<hr/> N <hr/> n 5786:6 Nalani 5773:4 Naleni 5773:4 name 5773:5 5845:11 5853:10 5866:10 National 5847:22 nationally 5848:2 natural 5825:5 nature 5835:15 5836:23 5843:6 near 5841:5 5872:4,11 nearer 5798:13 5799:7 5841:5 nearest 5812:1,3 necessarily 5811:24

<p>5818:11 5848:1,7,24 5849:12 5850:4 number 5777:23 5781:4 5785:8 5791:11 5795:1 5805:5 5836:13 5847:25 5849:17 5857:24 5861:15 5868:2,6,24,25,25 Nyala 5772:2 5783:10 5788:23 5789:9,21 5790:17 5792:8,8 5793:11,12 5795:4 5866:18 5872:11 5873:10 Nyalas 5783:8,12 5792:13 5795:4,5,18 5795:18,19,21 5796:25 5797:6 5821:2 5871:25</p>	<p>5799:23 5802:12 5804:6,7 5806:16 5810:15 5814:22 5820:16,25 5821:10 5839:18 5862:17 5863:8,21 5867:6,21 5868:23 5869:2,21 5870:10 5872:19 5873:11 5874:7,10,11 5875:7 old 5813:16,17 5862:14 once 5783:1 5802:7 5816:11 5818:20 5821:23 5826:11 5832:22 5841:7 5843:2 5856:19 5868:14 one's 5836:3 ongoing 5849:8 open 5859:4 5873:21 opening 5800:7 5824:14 open-ended 5821:1 operator 5813:11 opinion 5852:24 opportunity 5829:18 5851:18 oppose 5843:23 optimistic 5829:5 option 5799:20 5800:1 5834:12 5846:17 oral 5844:16 order 5787:13 5792:4 5810:19 5817:5 5823:14 5824:6 5830:23 5834:4 5835:17 5848:15 organisation 5780:15 5815:21,25 5818:11 5835:14 organisations 5824:9 original 5845:6 originally 5838:23 outcome 5834:16 outlet 5863:1 outline 5828:12 outpaced 5872:1 outstanding 5782:6 5822:17 owe 5859:22 owed 5780:19 o'clock 5865:8,9</p>	<p>parallel 5771:18 paramount 5847:6 part 5770:18 5785:18 5786:7 5791:3 5797:17 5799:4 5815:22 5819:14 5844:21 5845:5,5 5855:2 5865:15 5867:18,24 5874:14 5876:8 participate 5856:3,14 participated 5836:25 participating 5829:4 participation 5830:13 5850:2 5856:1 particular 5783:1,2 5809:11 5810:18 5871:21 5872:4 particularly 5833:15 parties 5823:9 5826:12 5826:13,13,19,21 5827:20 5828:6,9,17 5828:22,24 5829:18 5829:24,25 5831:9,10 5832:8,19,25,25 5833:6,19,21 5834:3 5836:25 5837:2,10 5838:6 5844:14 5847:16,23 5848:3 5855:23,24 5856:2,3 5856:13 parts 5862:9,10 party 5852:2 pass 5772:10 5872:12 5872:14 passage 5774:4 5792:16 passed 5771:22 5866:7 5872:9 5875:22 passerby 5866:10 path 5873:3,4 pay 5839:14 payers 5831:14 people 5771:21 5772:8 5772:13 5773:18,21 5774:6 5776:3 5783:10,16 5789:2 5791:17 5792:20 5794:5,22 5795:13,17 5796:6,8,12,15,16 5797:7,11,19,22,24 5798:12 5803:10 5805:19 5806:2,7 5807:9 5808:7,11,12 5808:15 5810:9,18 5811:23 5812:16,16 5814:24,25 5815:3 5818:2,12 5820:5 5821:9 5833:7,7,11 5834:5 5841:24 5847:4 5851:10 5859:18 5864:21 5865:5 5868:3,4,6 5869:6,8 5871:2 5874:23 perfectly 5819:22</p>	<p>period 5832:20 5839:5 permissible 5819:22 permission 5822:25 5845:11 perpetrator 5815:17 person 5772:9 5773:14 5777:8,9,22 5778:19 5779:5,9,16 5781:18 5786:2 5789:3,4 5805:4 5810:20,24 5815:17 5865:11 5871:4,5 personally 5866:20 persons 5850:2 persuade 5841:20 persuaded 5841:21 persuasive 5835:6 Pertaining 5832:22 pertinent 5835:20 Phalo 5773:6 phase 5820:4 5824:3 5849:18 5850:8 Phasha 5787:12 5790:25 5793:18 5796:11,19 5798:19 5808:6 5810:17 5816:24 5819:1,24 phones 5876:23 photo 5778:15 photograph 5772:4 5779:7,21,21 5789:5 5791:6,13,18 5792:9 5806:22 5807:6 phrase 5827:5,6 picket 5803:13 picking 5803:20 picture 5774:16 5775:1 5789:13 5791:9 5796:22 5797:4 5805:20 5807:15 5868:25 5869:7 pictures 5796:24 5802:24 5874:8 5876:23 piece 5772:16 pigeon 5819:15 Pillay 5782:20 5861:11 5861:12 place 5774:11 5783:13 5784:13,15 5792:15 5792:20 5794:7 5800:5,21 5801:13 5815:15 5817:2,5 5822:25 5823:5 5844:17 5845:13 5857:19 5864:3 5873:4 placed 5783:8 places 5842:6 5870:2 planning 5824:2 please 5770:9,15 5785:17 5788:11 5789:19 5818:21 5821:13 5823:12 5825:14 5860:24 5861:4,21</p>	<p>plumbing 5846:8 plural 5811:14 podium 5812:16 5851:6 point 5779:20 5780:2 5786:12 5789:10 5790:16 5792:24 5804:19 5806:11,19 5809:16 5810:1 5812:24 5814:6,9 5817:18 5819:12,16 5819:20 5822:13,15 5826:25 5830:17 5835:9 5841:9 5843:6 5843:15 5844:2,23 5864:18 5869:18 5877:17 pointed 5854:25 5855:22 pointing 5777:23 5874:25 5875:19 points 5783:22 5784:6 5784:12 5806:25 5857:5 5869:20 police 5770:19 5783:23 5784:15 5785:4,13 5786:13,15,22 5787:3 5787:6,15,17 5788:8 5788:9 5791:13,21 5792:2,12,14,17,25 5793:11,12 5794:25 5797:17 5798:4,7 5799:8,11,14 5811:6 5811:12 5820:3,6,20 5821:3,7 5854:10 5869:14 5871:8 policeman 5877:4,7 policemen 5785:8 5786:12,18 5876:14 5876:22 policing 5792:4 Pondoland 5842:6,7 POPCRU 5853:20 position 5782:21 5786:17 5801:8 5815:11 5818:14 5827:18 5834:25 5838:11,18 5840:14 5840:24 5842:11 5847:24 5854:10 5860:10 5863:17 positions 5827:21 positive 5829:13 positively 5828:5 possibility 5849:9 5851:21 possible 5791:4 5793:11 5794:18 5812:9 5827:14 5841:10 5856:4,6 posterity 5857:18 5858:19,24 post-mortem 5778:15 Power 5853:22,24 practical 5832:5,6 5846:4</p>
O				
<p>oak 5776:15 oath 5770:3 5808:1,4 5860:24 5861:1 object 5770:15 objection 5844:5 objective 5847:11 objectives 5812:10 5829:19 observation 5806:21 5871:1 observe 5787:7 5793:14 5806:21 5856:8 5871:10 5876:24 observed 5871:12 5877:1 observers 5850:2 obstacle 5856:1 obtained 5862:23 obviously 5791:3 5795:14 5805:20 5819:18 5831:19 5832:9,11 5833:4,8 5842:19 5851:9 5856:2 5859:13 occasions 5816:2,21 5836:8 occur 5782:17 occurred 5870:18 October 5828:22 offer 5837:25 offered 5781:21 offers 5833:17 office 5804:7 5838:25 5850:6 5854:4 officers 5869:14 offices 5849:21,22 officials 5856:24,25 oh 5795:11 5800:15 5801:6 5869:3 5873:16 oil 5865:7 okay 5795:13 5796:18 5798:13,18,22 5799:3</p>	<p>pages 5861:14 paid 5830:7 5835:17,19 5835:20,24,24 5854:23 5855:2,3 5858:1 5869:25 pair 5778:5 paper 5824:6 paradox 5828:14 5847:4 paragraph 5873:19 5875:4 5877:3 paragraphs 5791:23</p>	<p>P</p>	<p>period 5832:20 5839:5 permissible 5819:22 permission 5822:25 5845:11 perpetrator 5815:17 person 5772:9 5773:14 5777:8,9,22 5778:19 5779:5,9,16 5781:18 5786:2 5789:3,4 5805:4 5810:20,24 5815:17 5865:11 5871:4,5 personally 5866:20 persons 5850:2 persuade 5841:20 persuaded 5841:21 persuasive 5835:6 Pertaining 5832:22 pertinent 5835:20 Phalo 5773:6 phase 5820:4 5824:3 5849:18 5850:8 Phasha 5787:12 5790:25 5793:18 5796:11,19 5798:19 5808:6 5810:17 5816:24 5819:1,24 phones 5876:23 photo 5778:15 photograph 5772:4 5779:7,21,21 5789:5 5791:6,13,18 5792:9 5806:22 5807:6 phrase 5827:5,6 picket 5803:13 picking 5803:20 picture 5774:16 5775:1 5789:13 5791:9 5796:22 5797:4 5805:20 5807:15 5868:25 5869:7 pictures 5796:24 5802:24 5874:8 5876:23 piece 5772:16 pigeon 5819:15 Pillay 5782:20 5861:11 5861:12 place 5774:11 5783:13 5784:13,15 5792:15 5792:20 5794:7 5800:5,21 5801:13 5815:15 5817:2,5 5822:25 5823:5 5844:17 5845:13 5857:19 5864:3 5873:4 placed 5783:8 places 5842:6 5870:2 planning 5824:2 please 5770:9,15 5785:17 5788:11 5789:19 5818:21 5821:13 5823:12 5825:14 5860:24 5861:4,21</p>	<p>plumbing 5846:8 plural 5811:14 podium 5812:16 5851:6 point 5779:20 5780:2 5786:12 5789:10 5790:16 5792:24 5804:19 5806:11,19 5809:16 5810:1 5812:24 5814:6,9 5817:18 5819:12,16 5819:20 5822:13,15 5826:25 5830:17 5835:9 5841:9 5843:6 5843:15 5844:2,23 5864:18 5869:18 5877:17 pointed 5854:25 5855:22 pointing 5777:23 5874:25 5875:19 points 5783:22 5784:6 5784:12 5806:25 5857:5 5869:20 police 5770:19 5783:23 5784:15 5785:4,13 5786:13,15,22 5787:3 5787:6,15,17 5788:8 5788:9 5791:13,21 5792:2,12,14,17,25 5793:11,12 5794:25 5797:17 5798:4,7 5799:8,11,14 5811:6 5811:12 5820:3,6,20 5821:3,7 5854:10 5869:14 5871:8 policeman 5877:4,7 policemen 5785:8 5786:12,18 5876:14 5876:22 policing 5792:4 Pondoland 5842:6,7 POPCRU 5853:20 position 5782:21 5786:17 5801:8 5815:11 5818:14 5827:18 5834:25 5838:11,18 5840:14 5840:24 5842:11 5847:24 5854:10 5860:10 5863:17 positions 5827:21 positive 5829:13 positively 5828:5 possibility 5849:9 5851:21 possible 5791:4 5793:11 5794:18 5812:9 5827:14 5841:10 5856:4,6 posterity 5857:18 5858:19,24 post-mortem 5778:15 Power 5853:22,24 practical 5832:5,6 5846:4</p>

<p>practitioner 5845:19 5846:1 practitioners 5845:17 5845:20,25 pre 5868:25 precedence 5836:22 precise 5794:8 predictably 5850:16 preference 5832:8 prefix 5812:9 prejudge 5859:3 premises 5856:23 preparation 5836:5,7 5836:12 preparations 5835:25 5836:6 prepared 5839:24 5860:24 prescriptive 5832:12 present 5803:16,17 5855:23 presented 5778:18 presently 5813:13 5850:3 President's 5836:18 presiding 5838:16 pressure 5849:13 presumably 5842:17 5852:11 5860:5 5861:15,18 5864:7 Pretoria 5841:6 5842:4 5842:9 5843:23,24 5844:1,5 5847:8 5848:23 5849:6,22 5850:7 5851:8 5852:11,15,21 5854:4 5856:23 Pretoria/Johannesbu... 5832:2 prevent 5792:1 previous 5836:8 Previously 5820:21 pre-conditions 5831:23 pre-emptive 5832:5 principal 5838:2 5847:23 principally 5848:13 principle 5817:10,17 5837:9,13,21 5843:19 5856:10 5858:3 pro 5836:11 probability 5851:21 probable 5829:7 probably 5782:16 5830:21 5831:1,7 problem 5803:8 5858:10,11,13,19,23 5859:10 problems 5793:21 5846:15 proceed 5770:9 5790:19 5793:16 5819:23 5823:12 5834:23 5861:22 proceeded 5867:3,22 proceeding 5800:17</p>	<p>5804:15 5837:22 proceedings 5770:1 5824:9 5827:9 5838:13 5856:9,19 process 5794:5 5796:20 5849:20 professionally 5846:21 programme 5849:19 progress 5782:16 5846:13 promise 5838:12 promised 5857:8 properly 5818:7 5835:21 5843:18 5848:16 proposition 5770:13 5817:22 5841:6 protection 5815:8 protective 5821:25 5822:7 protesters 5801:25 5870:5 protestors 5791:24 5792:1,3,8 5793:10 provide 5824:7 5834:4 5852:24 provided 5852:8,13 5853:3 5857:6 provision 5833:10 5836:20 proximity 5831:17 public 5792:4 5855:14 5855:20 5856:2,12,25 published 5824:2 pulled 5796:21 5797:6 5820:8,11,17,19 5821:1 pulling 5797:1 5846:16 pure 5830:16 purpose 5848:19 5867:4 purposes 5841:15 pursuant 5847:25 pursued 5847:7 pursuing 5845:4 pursuit 5847:6,8 put 5770:13 5773:12 5793:6 5796:18 5798:13 5800:25 5802:12 5803:8 5804:6 5812:18 5818:1,7,15,16 5820:18,23 5826:4,15 5828:1 5833:22 5840:3 5853:9 5859:5 5861:10 5862:10 5869:6 5871:9 putting 5836:7</p>	<p>5812:20 5814:14 5815:20 5816:18 5817:9 5819:5,22 5820:14,18 5821:3,4 5821:5,6 5828:17 5835:20 5836:9 5843:22 5848:7,11 5850:2 5875:24 questioned 5794:25 5799:18,25 5808:7 questioning 5816:2 questions 5770:7 5771:1,11 5772:18,24 5773:1,11,12,13 5783:20 5787:10 5791:22 5794:4 5798:2 5808:2 5809:9 5809:15 5812:5,8 5813:9,22 5814:22 5818:7,15 5819:19 5822:14,22 queue 5815:3,3 quick 5802:19 quicker 5872:13 quickly 5871:8 quietly 5831:21 quite 5792:13 5804:5 5805:2 5809:22 5811:3 5813:12 5826:15 5829:4 5833:10 5837:25 5839:1,25 5841:20 5843:5,12,16 5846:5 5850:16 5851:24</p> <p style="text-align: center;">R</p> <p>rain 5798:5 raise 5835:22 5861:5 raised 5818:7,15 5828:22 5846:23,24 5857:6 raising 5836:9 rally 5831:21 ran 5787:18 range 5826:13 5840:7 rank 5804:8,12,20,21 5804:24 ranks 5804:11 rapid 5874:2 rapidly 5871:9 rate 5858:25 RDO 5864:6,23 5865:6 RDOs 5818:2,14 5863:23 5864:19,21 reached 5801:25 5802:4,7,14 5804:14 5804:20,24 5807:18 5872:9 reaching 5802:5 5872:17 reacted 5859:18 reaction 5857:20 5858:16 read 5791:22 5792:16 5793:9 5813:18 5862:9</p>	<p>readily 5827:18 reading 5823:11 ready 5793:16 5825:1 5827:23 5843:5 real 5810:17 5812:22 5828:11 5858:11 realise 5869:5 realised 5872:12,14,23 5875:23 reality 5829:22 5834:10 really 5775:22 5806:19 5806:20,22 5807:5 5810:23 5817:8 5819:1 5826:17 5827:15 5829:14 5832:23 5834:6 5846:18 5849:7 5858:13 rear 5789:9,9 reason 5780:21 5788:3 5809:9 5848:10 5876:6 reasonable 5827:6 reasonably 5840:21 reasons 5779:6 5835:5 5841:8 5847:10 5850:10 5851:9 5852:7 5855:5,5 5856:16 recall 5778:20 5783:16 5828:21 recalls 5782:24 5840:8 receive 5819:25 5834:14 received 5820:1 recognise 5789:16 reconsider 5838:11 record 5771:4 5783:8,8 5783:13 5810:8 5818:17 5823:1,11 5826:24 5833:22 5844:16,17 5845:14 5853:10 5857:19,23 5861:25 recorded 5782:19 Recruitment 5862:25 rectified 5818:21 red 5776:21 5778:1 reduce 5848:8 reduced 5842:17 refer 5828:9 5867:17 reference 5847:24 5859:15 5869:18 referred 5774:6 5824:16 5832:19,21 5834:2 5875:4 5877:8 referring 5778:13 5783:2 regained 5877:16 regard 5834:20 5849:1 5853:5 5855:15 regarded 5820:22 regarding 5823:8,16 5851:17,21 regards 5847:17</p>	<p>region 5849:5 regionally 5848:2 regulated 5871:2 regulating 5871:5 regulation 5827:7 regulations 5826:3 5827:1 5831:25 relate 5792:17 related 5792:17 relates 5823:6 relation 5798:11 5804:3 5808:17 5822:13 5854:9 5868:2 5869:10 5871:2 relationship 5823:8 relative 5863:4 relatives 5773:19 released 5872:17,17 relevance 5814:3 relevant 5791:23 5819:11 5854:2 relocate 5848:22 relocation 5828:20 reluctantly 5829:15 5834:8 remain 5840:25 5843:21 5849:10 remainder 5842:13 remaining 5792:9 remark 5857:23 5858:4 5858:8,15 remarks 5818:20 5851:20 remember 5778:15,21 5799:20 5802:21 5803:18,19 5808:8,24 5809:22 5810:19 5816:5,6,10,13 5821:21,22 5869:22 5877:11 remembering 5809:5 reminded 5839:9 5845:2 removal 5852:21,25 removes 5856:4 repeat 5799:21 5811:9 5820:14 5832:11 5854:20 5866:5 repeated 5813:9 5816:19 repeatedly 5828:23 represent 5770:23 5773:18 5824:9 5830:20 5833:6 5834:9 5839:10 5847:5 representation 5831:20 5837:11,14 5843:7 representative 5852:3 representatives 5770:15 5834:25 5840:3 5844:13 5847:16 represented 5828:6 5829:24 5838:19</p>
--	--	--	---	---

<p>representing 5835:11 5853:4 reputation 5836:3 request 5859:25 require 5849:18 5856:22 required 5809:25 5824:13 5831:6 5852:13 requirement 5831:5 requisite 5829:20 reserve 5782:8 reserving 5782:18 residence 5870:2 residential 5812:1 5871:10 resolutions 5823:21 resolved 5832:20 5865:19,22 resources 5830:12,13 5830:17 5831:8 5835:23 5853:25 respect 5814:5,13 5826:3 5838:11 5850:8 5851:19 respectful 5835:8 respond 5790:23 responded 5790:11 response 5870:5 responsibility 5831:1 rest 5868:12 restoration 5859:17 restraints 5855:10 result 5843:9 5855:1,8 5855:14,23 5859:16 results 5834:12 5857:2 resume 5860:10 resumes 5770:2 5807:24,25 5825:21 5825:22 5860:15 resurrect 5849:9 returned 5868:18,18 revert 5783:1 RE-EXAMINAION 5793:17 re-examination 5793:16 re-examine 5782:4 re-examines 5783:19 rib 5874:25 5876:1 right 5771:17 5778:2 5793:23 5795:8 5796:5 5799:3 5801:23 5804:7 5810:12 5813:25 5817:21 5853:2 5861:5 5862:3,8,23 5864:4,15,22 5865:17 5865:25 5868:10 5870:4 5871:6,24 5872:19 5873:25 5875:25 5876:1 rights 5782:8,19 5826:9 5835:14 road 5784:3,8,19 5786:25 5787:2,6,19</p>	<p>5788:2 5796:6,10,12 5797:11,16,24 5798:2 5798:7,7,10,11,11,13 5798:15,19,21,24 5799:9,13,14,16 5800:9 5801:4,21 5802:1,4,5,7,14 5804:13 5807:11 5872:2,8,10,18 5873:4,6,9 rock 5813:4,11,16 5814:10 rocks 5805:24 5822:8 role-players 5833:20 roll 5827:20 room 5815:4 root 5812:12 round 5779:19 rounds 5791:16 5792:6 row 5825:6 rubber 5791:15 5792:6 5792:18 5810:19,25 ruling 5827:19 run 5771:14 5797:13 5800:5,8,8 5817:4 5829:22 5830:17,22 5838:1 5848:6 5872:23 running 5771:17,18,18 5772:14,15 5797:7,11 5797:12 5800:1 5802:10 5817:3 5834:11 Rustenburg 5833:12 5841:2 5842:2,8,20 5848:2,12,18 5849:11 5849:23 5854:19 5855:19,25 5859:7,20 R4 5863:14 R50 5830:23 R6 5863:17</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">S</p> <hr/> <p>safely 5831:7 sake 5793:7 salary 5781:3,7 5815:22 5863:14,19 5863:20 sat 5806:7 5871:2,5 save 5802:10 5856:12 saved 5817:7 saving 5842:23 5855:1 5855:8,14,20 saw 5778:5 saying 5786:5 5789:25 5798:24 5799:1,24 5802:13 5808:16 5817:24 5845:23 5847:3 5853:1 5858:12 5866:6 5876:6,8 says 5818:17 5819:17 5830:20 scaree 5830:11 scared 5771:14,19 scene 5786:6 5839:4</p>	<p>scheduled 5849:17 school 5775:21 5776:7 schooling 5813:2 score 5858:20 screen 5795:9 se 5809:19 seated 5861:9 5871:11 second 5826:8 5829:6 5829:23 5868:18 5869:21 5870:18 5874:24 5875:3,8 Secondly 5819:8 5845:2 5855:13 Secretary 5827:24 section 5789:9,10 sections 5807:11 see 5775:6 5776:25 5777:2,3,10,13,21,24 5777:25 5778:3,5,7 5778:17,22 5783:12 5785:7,13 5786:13,20 5788:16,17,19,24 5791:5,6,8,20 5792:20 5793:3 5795:3,6,7,16,21,22 5796:1,2,4,6,11,25 5797:2,11,24 5801:2 5801:4,5,8 5802:23 5802:24 5805:8,19,22 5806:3,19 5807:7,10 5812:12 5825:3 5827:12,15 5846:22 5847:17 5853:22 5858:16 5859:18 5861:9 5866:10 5867:17 5869:6,9 seeing 5806:25 5871:22 seek 5812:6 seen 5782:24 5795:19 sees 5807:6 segment 5845:6 select 5806:8 semantics 5803:21 Semenya 5770:10,11 5770:12,16,21 5773:13 5774:16 5778:18 5783:5,7 5799:19 5800:2 5806:14 5810:4,6,8 5811:5,12 5814:2 5847:17,19 5850:12 5850:13,21,24 5851:4 5854:9 semi 5795:20 senior 5836:9 5837:11 5837:12 sense 5810:24 5813:10 5837:3,5 5841:14 5846:7 sent 5808:11,20 Seoka 5869:7 separate 5806:12 5807:11 separators 5806:5 September 5836:11 5862:18</p>	<p>SERI 5826:9 5835:15 5837:24 5838:1,19,19 5839:13 5843:3 series 5820:21 serious 5836:3 5845:16 seriously 5855:12 SERI's 5838:25 serve 5834:9 service 5833:17,24 services 5835:18 set 5812:4 5854:18 settled 5840:23 settlement 5783:22,23 5784:6,6,13,16,20,22 5785:1,22,22 5786:23 5787:1,14,20,24 5788:7 5790:3,9,14 5790:19 5796:9,17 5797:14 5802:11,17 5808:14 5812:2 5815:12 5841:17,25 5863:4 settlements 5840:23 5841:1 5842:13 severe 5855:10 shack 5784:20,21,23 5796:9,16 5801:4,5,7 5801:9 5802:16 5808:14 5815:8,12 5867:16 shanties 5808:13 shanty 5867:11,12 sharp 5815:8 shifted 5841:22 shirt 5778:9,24,25 5789:12 shoes 5812:19 shooting 5792:14,17 5799:8 5811:6,14 5816:22,24 5824:8 5874:22,22 short 5823:11 5835:15 5856:11 shorter 5851:9 shortly 5849:18 5868:17 shot 5777:19 5798:4 5799:11 5816:4,5,16 5816:17,23 5820:12 5874:4,16,19 shots 5793:10,12 5801:24,24 5803:22 5803:25 5804:1 5872:18 show 5774:15 5795:15 5810:9 showed 5877:4 showing 5786:6 shown 5774:16 5788:12 5827:6 5869:1 shows 5794:13 5810:11 5810:12 side 5771:17 5779:11 5798:7,8,13,16,20 5799:15 5801:2,3 5804:15,23 5832:9</p>	<p>5874:1,24 5875:1,19 5876:1 sight 5774:6 significant 5839:2 5848:20 5850:10 5855:14,20 5856:12 significantly 5848:8 similar 5779:10 5788:19 5814:15 5817:15 similarly 5820:2 simplify 5820:16 simply 5780:24 5799:24 5833:4,14 singing 5789:20 5794:5 5794:7,10,10 5872:7 single 5781:18 SIPETE 5808:5 sir 5773:4 5774:1,25 5779:8 5787:2,22 5789:14 5793:19 5794:9 5800:11,14 5811:1,10 5813:3,13 5815:23 5820:15 5821:12 5862:2,7,12 5862:16 5863:2,7,18 5863:25 5864:13,17 5865:1,2,10,16 5866:5,9 5867:20 5868:16,20 5869:9 5870:16,24 5871:12 5873:14,24 5874:5,11 5877:1,9,14 sit 5806:8,9 5855:9 5870:19,23,23 5871:5 sits 5854:24 5855:3 sitting 5805:3 5812:16 5837:19 5838:24,25 5845:4 5855:25 5870:13,15,21 5871:13,15 situated 5863:1 situation 5807:14 5826:16 5840:19 5846:2 5870:1 six 5806:12 sleep-out 5863:15 sleeves 5775:14 slide 5771:24 5774:17 5777:2 5785:17,21 5786:6 5788:12,18 5789:19,19 5791:3,4 5791:23 5792:20 5793:7 5795:1,15 5796:16,21 5801:1 5805:5 slightly 5786:1,8 5848:24 slipped 5851:7 small 5796:13 5805:13 5806:5 5815:5 5872:3 5872:5 smaller 5805:21 smoke 5874:20,20 snide 5858:4,8,14 Social 5826:9</p>
--	---	---	--	---

<p>Socio 5835:14 somebody 5774:20 5812:19,24 5814:23 5815:6 5816:25 son 5773:6 song 5872:7 soon 5857:3,3 5874:1 sooner 5865:20,22 sorry 5771:3 5787:12 5787:13,22 5798:11 5798:22 5806:18 5818:6 5821:3 5823:3 5841:23 5866:13 5867:7,14,15 5869:5 5869:16 5870:11 5873:16,18 5875:2 sort 5808:23 5848:23 5849:20 5852:1 sorts 5859:9 sought 5837:15 5843:2 south 5844:6 so-called 5797:17 5820:4 space 5848:18 speak 5795:25 5806:3 5819:4 5830:21 5831:10 5833:3 speaking 5846:14 5847:10 5876:11 specific 5814:22 5826:14 5832:13 5834:2 5835:16 specifically 5811:13 5824:8 5863:9 spelt 5826:7 spent 5836:10 5868:11 5868:12 5870:12 spirit 5834:1,14 spot 5786:14 sprayed 5801:24 spraying 5791:14,24,25 5792:25 5805:15 spring 5808:25 square 5845:9 stability 5840:15 stadium 5804:8,10,15 5804:18,20,22,23 staff 5855:16 stage 5772:13 5782:17 5785:20 5786:9 5790:1,7,13,18 5793:13 5796:5,20 5805:19 5840:8 5844:21 5846:16,20 5865:18 5868:6 5871:25 5877:15 stance 5837:19 5847:5 stand 5801:3 5815:3 5829:1 5833:11,14 5860:24 standards 5814:1 standing 5785:8 5787:6 5792:12 5799:12,13 5872:7 start 5782:9 5792:12 5794:4 5798:23</p>	<p>5816:22 5835:9 5860:6 5877:17 started 5779:3 5780:10 5788:10 5791:14,23 5791:25 5792:14,25 5794:14 5797:7 5801:24 5802:3 5843:8 starters 5805:10 starting 5870:11,12 starts 5846:8 state 5833:19 5834:3 5836:18 5837:7,8,9 5837:10 5838:4,9,9 stated 5824:13 statement 5803:17 5823:11,14 5824:14 5861:9 5862:5,9,13 5862:18,24 5866:1 5867:7,22 5868:13 5871:7 5873:19 5874:9,13 5876:13,21 5877:11 station 5865:7 status 5833:5 stave 5810:19 stay 5789:18 5815:12 5839:7 5840:21,21,22 5841:1,13 5865:19 5866:6 stayed 5866:1 staying 5840:7 5841:2 5863:4 5871:18 step 5774:24 5865:21 5873:12 stick 5869:15 stole 5817:20 stood 5785:10 stop 5792:7 5806:19 5807:3 5814:5 5846:8 5864:16 stopped 5780:21 5800:16 5864:12,14 5874:13 5876:11 storage 5848:19 straddle 5849:22 straight 5784:7,20 5802:16 5810:16 strange 5814:24 5815:7 strike 5823:20 5863:24 5864:6,7,9 5865:12 5865:14,19,21 strikers 5791:14 5793:12 5798:6 5807:16 strikes 5874:21 structures 5848:1 5850:4,6 stumbled 5874:3 stun 5791:15 5792:5,18 subject 5850:13 subjecting 5792:25 submission 5835:8 5840:17 5857:9 submissions 5834:20 submit 5855:12 5856:6</p>	<p>submitted 5824:6 5836:8 5854:17 subscription 5781:4 subsequent 5866:3 subsistence 5830:13 subsistence 5855:18 substantial 5855:24 substantially 5842:19 succeeds 5842:3,15 success 5845:12 successful 5832:7 5843:9 5859:6 suddenly 5871:19 sufficient 5835:23 5852:10 sufficiently 5835:21 suggest 5775:2 5776:21 5777:8 5779:4 5804:4 5820:23 5840:17 5860:1 suggested 5810:17,18 5825:5 suggesting 5779:20 5842:1 suggestions 5832:14 suitable 5807:19 5854:20 5856:23 sum 5831:14 summary 5853:1 Sunday 5836:23 supplementary 5834:3 supplementing 5833:21 support 5826:13,18,21 5826:24 5837:19 5838:5 5840:9,18 5843:5 5848:4 5850:11 5852:6,20,22 5852:24 5854:1,15 5855:6 5856:17 supported 5856:5 5864:19,20 5865:12 supporting 5840:16 5857:21 supports 5826:9 5847:22 5848:10 suppose 5823:3 5850:23 sure 5770:14 5804:17 5809:22 5819:14 5824:1,3 5829:10 5830:24 5837:9 5841:16 5845:17 5846:1,14 5859:4,20 5859:24 surname 5853:13 surprised 5833:25 surrounded 5784:2,9 5784:15,17,19,22,24 5867:12,13 5871:23 sweat 5861:2,5 sweat 5789:12 sweater 5775:3,4 5776:24 5777:8,9,23 5778:6,10,24 5779:23 sworn 5861:7 sympathetic 5834:14</p>	<p>sympathy 5864:7 systems 5815:7 s.u.o 5808:5</p> <hr/> <p style="text-align: center;">T</p> <hr/> <p>table 5832:9 5860:10 5860:17 Takalani 5853:16 take 5774:24 5775:3 5791:4 5792:3,10 5794:7 5799:19,25 5807:19,22 5817:12 5818:2 5824:23 5825:12,17 5834:12 5842:5 5845:15 5849:13 5860:2,16,24 5861:1,10 5862:8 5870:11 5874:8 taken 5791:13 5797:4 5819:3 5820:3 5844:25 5847:5,25 5852:14 5853:6 5858:9 5860:11 5863:23 5865:21 5876:3 talk 5798:2 5805:8 5821:11 5844:3,4 talking 5779:21 5795:23 5798:5 5837:23 5869:7,13 5874:22 talks 5866:1 Tambo 5842:8,18,20 tangential 5850:16 tangible 5830:9 task 5838:15 tax 5831:14 taxi 5804:8,11,12,20,21 5804:24 taxing 5849:19 taxpayer's 5837:1 tea 5807:23 5860:2,6 5860:10,14 team 5783:15 5823:14 5823:19 5824:11,12 5824:13,17,20 5830:20,21,21 5832:4 5835:10 5841:9,12,13 5845:14 5848:12 5849:2,13 5852:6 5855:15 teams 5830:25 tear 5791:15 5792:5,18 5793:1 teargas 5872:16 TEBA 5862:25 technical 5820:4 telephone 5877:6 tell 5776:6 5781:19 5806:14,15 5811:24 5815:19 5824:4 5826:23 5831:2 5864:23 5865:2,10 5866:12,15 5870:23 5875:10 5876:7,20 telling 5875:8</p>	<p>tendency 5818:2 term 5828:24 terms 5823:23 5826:3 5830:16 5831:25 5835:16,19 5847:24 5849:15 5859:15 testicles 5876:9 testified 5796:7 5813:1 5821:14 5844:22 5873:8,12 testify 5862:20 5874:16 5876:16 thankfully 5832:5 thanks 5822:17 that's 5776:23 5780:16 5782:1 5785:21 5796:9 5799:23 5802:11 5810:13 5817:8 5821:3 5839:20 5840:23 5841:7 5853:2,2 5857:7,9 5858:1 5859:1 5860:18,21 5861:12 5873:15 theft 5815:14 thereto 5814:16 5849:1 there's 5773:10 5774:20 5776:8 5815:14 5844:24 5859:10,22 5861:9 5870:24 they'd 5842:17 they've 5859:8,8,11 thigh 5875:6,25 thing 5774:10 5803:21 5814:24 5822:3 5828:10 5836:7 5857:24 5859:2 5866:25 5868:12 5870:25 5874:19 5877:11 things 5807:11 5812:22 5813:7 5821:14,15 5828:16 5829:16 5835:15 5839:22 5840:8 5844:19 5857:18 5862:11 5869:1 5876:2,5 think 5770:3 5773:2 5775:15 5776:7,9 5779:15 5797:5,10 5799:18 5803:5,7,16 5805:5 5807:18,20 5808:16 5810:15 5811:3 5812:9,15 5813:14,15 5814:19 5816:2 5817:9 5819:17 5820:20,20 5821:6,18 5827:5,6 5827:23 5828:7,22 5829:3 5826:4,6 5832:20 5845:10 5846:4 5851:1 5852:8 5859:2,6 5860:6 5867:15 5869:2,4,6 5877:4</p>
---	---	--	--	---

<p>thinking 5810:21 thinks 5786:3 5814:5 5851:5 third 5845:13 5846:3 Thirdly 5855:22 thirds 5839:14 thirty 5839:19 Tholoana 5835:12 Thomas 5854:3,5,8 thorn 5803:2,6 thought 5774:3 5828:25 5868:23 thoughts 5860:6 three 5795:4 5797:5 5802:25 5805:12 5835:12 5877:6 Tim 5836:9 time 5774:4,11,24 5775:4 5782:6 5783:1 5784:1 5792:9 5794:9 5794:11,23 5796:23 5796:23 5798:25 5808:22,23 5813:17 5825:10,15 5826:1 5828:25 5829:10,15 5830:10,11 5833:13 5836:11 5838:22,23 5843:10 5848:6 5849:5 5851:4,15 5853:13 5855:9,10 5862:19 5863:3 5866:20 5868:14 5869:15 5870:12,20 5871:21 5872:16,22 timely 5850:11 times 5794:9,18,19 5831:1 5839:18 timing 5844:20 5850:14 Tip 5781:21 5818:6,11 5818:14,24 5847:18 5847:19,21 5854:24 today 5793:20 5851:15 5852:8 Tokota 5787:9,11 5798:3 TOKOTO 5787:19,23 5788:5 told 5774:17 5778:10 5781:9 5785:17 5786:21 5789:19 5791:13 5813:17 5821:19 5834:16 5835:16,18 5838:1 5839:12 5844:2 5866:19 tomorrow 5827:23 5866:19,20 5869:20 5877:17,19 tool 5822:4,5 tools 5863:23 top 5777:22 5809:4 5830:8 5836:7 5846:4 topic 5807:21 topics 5849:17 total 5863:16</p>	<p>totally 5781:6 tough 5869:24 town 5832:10 trade 5817:10 trammig 5863:10,12 transcribed 5827:10 5856:20 transcribers 5853:10 transcript 5824:1 5827:23,25 5857:6 transcripts 5839:22 translate 5849:24 transport 5833:10,21 5833:23 5834:3 5842:16 5852:10,10 5863:10,13 transportation 5832:24 5840:11 5841:4,11,16 5851:18,22 5852:13 5854:2 transported 5842:1,4 5842:18 transporting 5834:5 travel 5833:11 5848:12 5848:13 5851:10 5855:17 travelling 5830:10,14 5833:13 5855:8 treated 5859:7 trees 5803:2 tremendous 5859:12 5859:22 trench 5847:9 tricky 5826:16 tripping 5840:16 true 5791:19,20 5801:23 5859:1 5865:4 truth 5812:11,18,22,22 5830:1,4 5847:6,7,8 5859:17 5861:4,4,4 5876:7 try 5772:1 5812:12,23 5844:25 trying 5785:21 5801:1 5817:9,18 5825:14 5841:9 5849:9,22 5872:4 turn 5788:6 5817:3 turned 5787:17 5788:4 5788:9 5802:2 5810:5 5848:20 5852:4 5853:23 5872:15 two 5795:4 5805:3,10 5806:1,1,3,4,13 5816:2,21 5818:4 5825:2 5839:2,14 5840:22,25 5842:12 5842:12 5845:20 5869:20 5875:25</p>	<p>5777:16 5783:14 5784:4 5790:6 5799:22 5805:16,17 5810:1 5812:14,17,23 5814:2 5826:20 5831:9 5832:3 5834:19 5841:6,24,24 5852:7 5856:24 5857:15 understanding 5824:7 understood 5790:15 5793:4 5828:15 5852:15 undertake 5838:15 unduly 5809:7 unfortunate 5838:4,10 5846:7 unfortunately 5827:17 unimportant 5849:12 Union 5847:22 unionism 5817:10 unions 5816:3 United 5836:22 unpaid 5836:14 unravel 5779:18 unscientific 5801:17 5830:19 unsettling 5820:5 urging 5829:10 use 5796:10 5806:5 5810:24 5814:23 5822:6,8 5825:5 5830:10,11 5869:17 usually 5839:15</p>	<p>view 5812:24 5836:15 5838:2 5840:1 5841:9 5848:3 5854:18 5856:5 village 5773:5 5862:14 virtually 5780:15 5836:11 visible 5783:25 5785:5 5785:15 5796:15 5797:23 visited 5781:14 voice 5830:2 volley 5798:5 5801:24 Vos 5770:8,22,25 5771:5,6,8,10,19,23 5772:1,7,12,17 V-O-S 5771:6</p>	<p>5787:17 5796:18 5797:12 5798:14 5800:25 5801:21 5802:13 5804:6 5810:18,20 5815:25 5820:23 5821:1 5824:18 5833:9 5842:2 5846:23 5847:1 5849:13,19,24 5850:10 5859:9,18 5876:19 ways 5859:9 weapons 5815:8,16 wear 5821:25 wearing 5774:5,20,22 5775:13 5777:9,9,22 5778:9,24 5779:9,10 5779:22,24 5788:20 5789:17,17 5809:4,4 wears 5776:24 weather 5808:24 5809:2,7,8,12,14,18 5810:10,11,12 week 5809:12 5826:2 weighing 5828:18 welcomed 5848:9 went 5770:18 5771:1 5771:12,16 5779:2 5794:23 5799:9 5804:23 5816:25 5867:5 5868:8,15 5869:13 5870:12 5872:20 weren't 5859:18 wet 5865:8,10 we'd 5833:18 5852:5 we'll 5833:3 5841:13 5848:6 5850:18 5853:7,20 5869:2,2 5872:19 we're 5772:23 5845:4 we've 5832:23 5844:4 5865:13 we're 5791:2 5793:23 we've 5807:18 5831:5 whatsoever 5788:6 what's 5777:2 5859:5 5866:25 whilst 5800:17 5802:18 5837:22,24 5843:12 5869:12 5871:13 5872:6 5874:22 whistle 5815:13,13 white 5777:9 5778:6,9 5778:9,24 5779:1,22 5779:24 5789:12 whittle 5832:23 who's 5852:4 5860:17 wife 5813:18 wind 5863:22 winter 5808:25 wire 5784:2,9 5785:11 5789:9,11 5790:7,17 5792:10,15 5795:19 5796:20 5797:1,5,6 5798:9,17,21,25,25</p>
W				
V				
U				

<p>5800:17 5820:7,10,17 5820:19 5821:1 5867:13 5871:23 5872:1,12 5873:10 wish 5782:3 5819:18,21 5827:8,9 5844:7,14 5847:16 5851:11 5852:3 5854:12,21 5856:8 5857:16 5860:25 wished 5790:18 wishes 5782:4 5787:10 5823:14 5847:15,20 witness 5770:13 5772:24 5782:3 5783:17 5800:12,20 5806:14,22 5808:2 5809:9,16,20 5818:17 5822:22,24 5824:3,6 5824:11,12,19 5825:1 5850:18,20 5860:5,10 5860:17 5861:6,25 witnesses 5809:14 5825:2 5844:22 woes 5846:6 woke 5867:2 5868:8 Wonderkop 5833:12 5863:1 won't 5770:15 wood 5802:20 5803:11 word 5782:23 5803:16 5803:17 words 5773:5 5787:21 5798:13 5803:20 5817:21 5862:11 5874:14,17 work 5831:3 5836:4,5 5836:14 5849:21 5856:16 5859:16 5863:5,8 5864:12,14 5864:16,21,24 worked 5851:4 workers 5847:22 5864:6,11 5874:4 workforce 5870:5 working 5813:11 5824:18 5855:19 5865:8 works 5857:1 5865:11 wouldn't 5840:16 5858:11 wouldn't 5790:21 wound 5772:16 wrapped 5776:23 write 5827:24 wrong 5845:22</p>	<p>years 5780:16,18,25 5781:5,7,23 5813:5 5813:11 5814:10 5815:22 5862:14 yellow 5776:15 5795:5 5795:10 5796:1,3 yesterday 5771:13 5778:16 5785:25 5786:6,22 5787:12,13 5789:20 5792:24 5816:7 5818:4 young 5773:3 you'd 5785:16 5860:5 5868:24 you'll 5777:4 5859:20 5861:3 you're 5770:3 5772:22 5776:8 5778:12 5808:1 5809:15 5834:19 5841:25 5845:23 5853:1 you've 5785:17 5799:17 5800:11 5811:2 5813:1,4 5814:9 5818:16 5821:14 5853:23 5864:10 5873:11,20 5874:15 5877:4</p>	<p>15:35 5868:7 15:40 5796:24 5797:16 15:55 5875:2 1547 5861:14 16 5875:4 16th 5771:12 5773:19 5783:9 5794:5 5819:11 5862:20 5866:24,25 5867:3 188 5805:5,6,19 19 5783:8,12 190 5807:15 191 5795:1 5796:23 194 5771:24 197 5796:21,22,24 198 5788:12,14,15 5791:3 5792:21 1982 5780:13 1988 5862:18 199 5791:23 5793:7</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">2</p> <p>2 5796:25 5824:3 5849:18 5850:8 20 5801:16 2011 5862:24 2013 5770:1 5823:17 5829:3 205 5867:15 206 5779:7,9 5786:6 208 5801:5,8,8,11,12 5867:16 209 5801:2 22 5877:3 23 5862:21 24 5862:14 24th 5823:16 26 5770:1 5774:17,18</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">3</p> <p>3 5796:25 3rd 5862:18 30 5780:16,18,25 5781:23 5813:5,10 5814:10 5815:22 5839:15,23 3000 5868:3</p>
<p style="text-align: center;">X</p> <p>X 5821:11,14 5822:2,3</p> <p style="text-align: center;">Y</p> <p>year 5780:10 5813:2 5828:22 5829:23 5838:22 5839:25 5843:3 5845:9 5854:17</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">Z</p> <p>Zokwana 5813:14,15 5813:17,18 5818:1,7 5818:8,24,24 Zulu-speaking 5877:8</p> <p style="text-align: center;">0</p> <p>000 5830:23 5863:15,16 5863:16,17 09:32 5770:2 09:52 5778:17</p> <p style="text-align: center;">1</p> <p>1 5777:2,23 5796:25 5863:16 5865:9,9 10 5865:8 10th 5863:22 10:12 5787:16 10:32 5796:8 10:52 5803:4 11 5866:3 11th 5803:18 5863:22 11:00 5794:14 11:39 5807:25 11:59 5816:6 12 5866:3 12:19 5824:15 13 5866:3 13th 5876:3 13:35 5825:22 13:55 5832:17 14 5866:3 14:15 5839:25 14:35 5849:12 15 5866:4 5873:19 15th 5866:2,8,13,14 15:15 5860:16</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">4</p> <p>4 5792:8 5796:25 5868:25,25,25</p> <p style="text-align: center;">5</p> <p>5 5863:16 50 5795:6,23</p> <p style="text-align: center;">6</p> <p>6.4 5778:11</p> <p style="text-align: center;">9</p> <p>9:30 5877:19</p>	<p style="text-align: center;">5</p>	