RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MS HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 34 22 JANUARY 2013

PAGES 3638 TO 3740

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: <u>realtime@pixie.co.za</u> Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Marikana Commission of Inquiry

1	Page 3638 [PROCEEDINGS ON 22 JANUARY 2013]	1	Page 3640
		1	it the answer to that is clearly no. Did you actually
2	[09:38] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.	2	study the report? Was this report made available to you at
3	Brigadier, you're still under oath. Adv Jele, I take it	3	any stage in the course of your work?
4	you've got some further questions.	4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No. As I say, no I
5	MS JELE: I do indeed, thank you,	5	didn't and right from the beginning I didn't.
6	Chairperson. Good morning, Brigadier, how are you this	6	MS JELE: Brigadier, having established
7	morning?	7	that there is value in considering alternatives in policies
8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Fine, thanks.	8	that are developed across our borders, would you not agree
9	MS JELE: Glad to hear it. Brigadier,	9	that it would be an essential tool for Public Order
10	yesterday we established the value of considering	10	Policing in South Africa if they were to pay close
11	alternatives in policy from various sources, and what I	11	attention to those reports by bodies whose work can at the
12	want to turn to today are sources of information that might	12	very least be respected, that directly deal with the work
13	assist, that are home-grown, essentially, and these are	13	of Public Order Police?
14	specifically reported by the Human Rights Commission that	14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. It's
15	directly deal with situations of use of force by law	15	true that we need to read and look to those recommendation
16	enforcement officials in South Africa. Are there any such	16	and whatever we do as well it will assist us, and we have
17	reports that you are familiar with yourself, Brigadier?	17	done it before as well in different issues where we
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Not at this stage, I	18	developed, and we'll have to definitely look at that. We
19	haven't seen, from the Human Rights Commission no, I	19	can't just go on without doing that. It will help a lot,
20	haven't seen any, except the one you indicated that I must	20	irrespective it's inside the country or outside the
21	go and read last night.	21	country.
22	MS JELE: Which one was that, Brigadier?	22	CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, may I ask you two
23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: The one by the	23	questions at this point? Firstly, would you – or actually
	-	23	address two requests to you. Would you see to it that
24 25	commissioner, Dr J Titus.		
25	MS JELE: That would be his witness	25	copies of all the reports you are now referring to are made
	Daga 2/20		Dage 2441
1	Page 3639	1	Page 3641 available to the Commission, at least three copies because
1	statement, correct, Brigadier?	1	available to the Commission, at least three copies because
2	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja.	2	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I
2 3	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given	2 3	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also
2 3 4	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1.	2 3 4	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard
2 3 4 5	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes.	2 3 4 5	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are
2 3 4 5 6	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me	2 3 4 5 6	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter
2 3 4 5 6 7	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at	2 3 4 5 6 7	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with? BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I didn't.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and naturally to the commissioners as well.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with? BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I didn't. CHAIRPERSON: I asked a double question	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and naturally to the commissioners as well. CHAIRPERSON: According to Commissioner
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with? BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I didn't. CHAIRPERSON: I asked a double question actually. It is my fault. Did you study the report, is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and naturally to the commissioners as well. CHAIRPERSON: According to Commissioner Hemraj suggested in regard to the police, probably if you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with? BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I didn't. CHAIRPERSON: I asked a double question actually. It is my fault. Did you study the report, is the first question, and the second thing, and the answer to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and naturally to the commissioners as well. CHAIRPERSON: According to Commissioner Hemraj suggested in regard to the police, probably if you pass them on to Mr Semenya he will be able to ensure that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	statement, correct, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, that's the one, ja. CHAIRPERSON: That has already been given an exhibit number, WW1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes. MS JELE: Brigadier, you're telling me that in your field of expertise you never even looked at the conclusions of this constitutionally established body in the tragic matter that led to the death of Andries Tatane for example? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I was following that one, yes. I was thinking maybe specifically another one, but I was following that one since it started, occurred, until the disposition. CHAIRPERSON: You say you were following it, but did you actually study the report FS/2011/0009, and did you make the report available to those who were attending courses that you were involved with? BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I didn't. CHAIRPERSON: I asked a double question actually. It is my fault. Did you study the report, is the first question, and the second thing, and the answer to that is you didn't, then I imagine the second question	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	available to the Commission, at least three copies because there are three of us, but I would suspect more because I imagine the evidence leaders would want them too, and also it might be sensible as a precautionary measure, regard being had to the fact that as we speak POP operations are taking place in the Free State, for you to send as a matter of high urgency these reports, copies of these reports to the section of which the witness was previously the head so that they can, if they're not doing so already, they can start taking into consideration in their planning and in their courses the points made in these reports. Are these requests that are capable of being complied with? MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. My attorney will be in a position to assist with the second request that you made. As regards the copies of the reports, they have been emailed, as I understand it, to the evidence leaders and it is hoped that they will be distributed henceforth to all the various parties, and naturally to the commissioners as well. CHAIRPERSON: According to Commissioner Hemraj suggested in regard to the police, probably if you pass them on to Mr Semenya he will be able to ensure that they reach the right address as soon as possible.

22110		13510	
	Page 3642		Page 3644
1	I mentioned yesterday, Brigadier, there were four different	1	correct?
2	themes that I wanted to ask you questions on and we've	2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: You're correct,
3	just, we've dealt with the first thing, the issue of	3	Chairperson, and always with a spontaneous event it is
4	training and policy formulation. The second theme that I'd	4	challenging because it comes up unplanned, no proper
5	like to talk to you about is that of planning. To the	5	information in place. However, as I said, Chairperson, we
6	extent that you were skills development facilitator and to	6	must try by all means to follow procedures. Procedures is
7	the extent that you yourself have experience in Public	7	to establish all necessary information - who are the
8	Order Policing, the manner in which a plan is drawn up in	8	leaders, what is the purpose, everything. Out of that we
9	crowd management situations is, would you not agree,	9	can be able now to deal with the situation. That means the
10	critical to its success?	10	coming up of the plan will come within that position to say
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes.	11	how are we going to deal with the situation. But we'll
12	The plan should be compiled in such a way really that it	12	handle it as significance as all type of issues that come
13	can be achievable and it can achieve actually the goal if	13	out for crowd management issues.
14	it has been compiled, put together. It must be in that	14	MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. One
15	way. Critically it must be analysed and all the necessary	15	imagines that was the intention of the plan that was being
16	factors must be in place to make sure the plan is compiled	16	drawn up and was presented to the JOC by Lieutenant-Colonel
17	properly.	17	Scott at Marikana.
18	MS JELE: And with regard to gatherings	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which one are you
19	that are spontaneous where there might be less opportunity	19	referring ultimately, the date, if I may ask?
20	to plan, I'd like to refer you to then again exhibit R	20	MS JELE: Specifically the plan that was
21	which we were dealing with during the course of yesterday's	21	relating to the three stages and how they would unfold
22	hearings, and specifically refer you to its page 20.	22	during the course of the days from the 15th onwards and the
23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Got it.	23	plan that ended up being implemented on the afternoon of
24	MS JELE: Brigadier, I'd like to make	24	the 16th of August.
25	specific reference to the first and second sentences of the	25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
	Page 3643		Page 3645
1	second paragraph, and I quote – 20, page 20, that,	1	CHAIRPERSON: The gathering on the
2	"Spontaneous public protests on the other hand does not	2	mountain, or koppie, was something that actually was in
3	provide the luxury of planning and sometimes call for	3	existence for several days. Lots of people were there with
4	immediate reaction. Such situations call for sound	4	dangerous weapons. Some of them went home and they came
5	judgment and correct assessment of the situation." Would	5	back the next morning. There was nothing spontaneous about
6	you agree with that assessment?	6	it. The plan that was drawn up wasn't to deal with any
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree.	7	spontaneous incident; it was to disperse and disarm, and
8	MS JELE: As a consequence, Brigadier,	8	there were various stages set out. So I don't understand
9	the fact that a particular gathering was spontaneous does	9	the applicability of the point in relation to spontaneous
10	not make it any less important to make absolutely sure that	10	gatherings. There was some kind of spontaneous movement
11	the plan provides as per the standing order and follows the	11	towards the gap on the afternoon of the 16th, but I'm not
12	national directives and guidelines.	12	sure they can call those spontaneous gathering within the
13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, there are	13	meaning of the point covered on page 20 of exhibit R. So
14	procedures that need to be followed in those issues where a	14	I'm afraid you're going to have to take it more slowly up
15	spontaneous gathering just comes up. However, the	15	to now so that I can follow it, because I'm afraid I'm lost
16	procedure as far as the drawing of the, or drawing up of	16	at the moment now. If you'll forgive me, but that's where
17	the operational plan will have to be followed as it's	17	I am.
18	supposed to be.	18	MS JELE: I'll do that, thank you,
19	CHAIRPERSON: I take it these plans	19	Chairperson. In situations such as that, that unfolded in
20	you're talking about are drawn up before the event. You	20	Marikana – and again I'm acutely aware of the fact that you
	1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 A		
21	scarcely have the luxury of time to draw up a operational	21 22	weren't there, Brigadier – would you not agree that certain
22	plan after a spontaneous gathering has taken place, so	22	events might arise and take the police by surprise, certain
23	you've got to have plans as it were available in the file,	23	developments, certain choices of the protesters, as they go
24	or on the word processor, which could be activated	24 25	about their particular business, that the police will have
25	immediately a spontaneous gathering occurs. Isn't that	25	to deal with as and when they arrive, and it's the fluidity
	RCHIVE FOR JUSTICE		

			1 5
	Page 3646		Page 3648
1	of those situations that requires Public Order Policing's	1	for something. I missed something very important. Please
2	specific attention?	2	tell me what it was.
3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It is normal that it can	3	MR SEMENYA SC: He said Barry White,
4	happen that way. Hence the crowd will start maybe	4	who's a singer, was a singer.
5	peaceful, can end up maybe violent, or something else can	5	CHAIRPERSON: I thought there's a
6	happen. It's normal, it does happen. We're aware of those	6	reference to Gary White MBE who is a gentleman from
7	things most of the time.	7	somewhere in South Africa.
8	MS JELE: With respect specifically to	8	MS JELE: Indeed, Mr White's serious
9	the plan that Lieutenant-Colonel Scott presented, Gary	9	concern relates to the fact that there seems to have been
10	White has a number of concerns and/or difficulties which	10	no, at least from the minutes, discussion, debate,
11	I'd like to address, specifically two that have not as yet	11	challenge, to the presentation made of the plan that had
12	been dealt with in questions posed to you by some of my	12	been drawn up. Would you not deem it appropriate in order
13	colleagues. The first one is the fact that the plan was	13	to make sure that all eventualities are covered and have
14	seemingly being presented by Lieutenant-Colonel Scott, who	14	been dealt with in detail and anticipated, that that kind
15	he himself is not a member of POP. Is that not in and of	15	of debate and discussion take place?
16	itself a deviation in policy that might affect the value,	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I really
17	the format and the content of a plan being drawn up?	17	understand the point that it should be critically analysed
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. It has to	18	during that process, or maybe in another position, but I
19	be actually drawn by somebody from Public Order Policing.	19	was not involved, but I'm not sure if it was not analysed
20	MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, I know we	20	critically as you have indicated. The plan is being
21	call it the Scott plan, but the true evidence is that it	21	compiled based on the information given and the information
22	was a plan drawn by a team, including Public Order	22	given, of course it has to be analysed. So I'm not sure if
23	Policing.	23	it was not done, because I was not there.
24	CHAIRPERSON: We haven't had that	24	MS JELE: I appreciate you weren't there,
25	evidence yet, but that's evidence that – this witness said	25	Brigadier, but in your various positions with SAPS, in your
	· · · · , · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
	Page 3647		Page 3649
1	he gave hearsay on that because he didn't know himself.	1	experience would you for example in formulating training
2	We've had no evidence to that effect. He just said he was	2	manuals and modules not include the obligation and the
3	told that. But the point you make is, I take will be taken	3	value of - and I believe Mr White in our consultations with
4	aboard by Ms Jele and she'll bear it in mind in her further	4	him used the words "rip the plan to shreds in order to put
5	questioning.	5	it back together perfectly again." Would it be your choice
6	[09:58] MS JELE: It indeed from our perspective	6	to advise that such a process be followed to make
7	have not as yet been given in evidence and as indicated	7	absolutely sure that every imaginable scenario has been
8	very clearly at the outset of Gary White's statement, he	8	contemplated?
9	bases his analysis on what evidence is at present available	9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree.
10	from the SAPS.	10	MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. You just
11	CHAIRPERSON: My impression from the	11	mentioned the issue of information and intelligence and you
12	police presentation was that it was Colonel Scott's plan,	12	had established in your evidence-in-chief the fundamental
13	or primarily Colonel Scott's plan and he was the one who	13	value of having adequate information in order precisely to
14	explained it and so on, but anyway, these are matters which	14	plan for how police might deal with a particular event that
15	Mr Semenya has very properly told us will be the subject of	15	required crowd management. I would like to refer you to
16	further evidence, so we mustn't waste time on assumptions	16	page 26 of Gary White's provisional statement. There Gary
17	which may be incorrect at this stage.	17	White looks at the specific exhibits introduced that
18	MS JELE: Indeed, thank you, Chairperson.	18	contain the information that purportedly informed the plan
19	We certainly look forward to hearing that evidence. I'll	19	that was put together at Marikana, these being exhibits
20	turn to the second concern that was expressed by Gary White	20	TT5, TT4, TT3.
21	with respect specifically to the manner in which the plan	21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Sorry, are you reading
22	was dealt with at the JOC meeting.	22	at B or A?
23	MR SEMENYA SC: Not Barry White.	23	MS JELE: Both, Brigadier.
24	MR MAHLANGU: Gary.	24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, alright. Alright.
25	CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, 1 was looking	25	MS JELE: You will notice that Mr White
A	RCHIVE FOR JUSTICE		

	5	1	
	Page 3650		Page 3652
1	specifically characterises the information contained in	1	under the circumstances.
2	these exhibits as being general and not containing much	2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm not sure, Advocate,
3	that he in his experience would expect, specifically	3	here if the information given is that it's 3 000
4	containing views and/or information from senior officers	4	participants, that is mineworkers that were gathered at the
5	and not what is generally known as intelligence. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm not sure, but I	5	koppie at a time that is 6 o'clock, which will be the same
6		6	information as the time goes on. But normally if now the
7	think my answer will be it will depend what information you	7 8	gathering is known, as people were coming most of the time in and out, if that information was obtained to say there
8	need to be able to compile an operational plan in a certain	9	will be so many people coming in, I will agree with it, but
9 10	situation. Looking to the issue of Marikana, there's a specific information you will be in need of to be able to	9 10	if it was not obtained then it will differ on that because
11	compile the operational plan. I'm not sure as Mr Gary	11	obviously if they come, not knowing how many will be, we
12	White, as he indicated that some of the information was not	12	need just to actually see as they are coming in how many
13	there, if maybe he was of the opinion or position to say to	13	are they coming, until we can come up and say roughly in
14	us this information was not there, of which I think it was	14	the midday there are so much. So maybe if it's like at 6
15	going to contribute a lot in a better plan. I was going to	15	o'clock that this information was given, I will have a
16	be happy, but at the moment I'm not sure and I won't be	16	problem, but I'm saying if it was known, information was
17	certain as well because I was not involved with the	17	given, because can be maybe sources who are saying there
18	planning itself of the team, exactly why they opted for	18	will be maybe so many people coming in, but I'm not talking
19	that type of information only to achieve the goal. But	19	on behalf of the author or of the person who gave the
20	what I know very well, no matter the information you have,	20	information. I say normally that's how it goes.
21	how small it is, you must make use of it because it may	21	MS JELE: Which sources would you look to
22	help. So I cannot say this is big, this is small. If I	22	in order to establish how the information that was provided
23	draw the plan I need each and every information. That's	23	at the JOC was compiled? Would you expect certain
24	why we will have information and I will have intelligence	24	officials on the ground to have taken detailed notes that
25	as well to draw my operational plan.	25	might have been compiled to inform that information?
	Page 3651		Page 3653
1	MS JELE: I would like you to have a look	1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally sources we, in
2	at exhibit TT5, if you might, Brigadier, and specifically	2 3	this type of a situation we are actually talking about where there will be other role players involved. Obviously
3 4	at the last page of TT5, which is where Crime Intelligence input at the JOC at noon on the 16th of August is	4	they can give information as well to say there will be so
5	described.	5	many people into that particular gathering, because we talk
6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Got it.	6	about the gathering that was going on and on. Obviously
7	MS JELE: As you can see, Brigadier, it	7	there will be some communication that was taking place now
8	is extremely succinct. It essentially identifies the	8	and maybe somebody could have given something, then can be
9	number of individuals more or less that are on the koppie,	9	some sources, and maybe the leaders or can be normal people
10	that some of them have dangerous weapons, without any	10	as well, they can be able to give that information as well.
11	detail as to how many, which, and that according to	11	But maybe during meetings as well it can be confirmed at
12	information received they declined to surrender these	12	that position as well if it happened.
13	weapons, and that they refused to leave the koppie and the	13	MS JELE: Would you expect senior
14			
	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks	14	officers who might later then need at JOC in order to draw
15		14 15	officers who might later then need at JOC in order to draw up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific
15 16	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks		
	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the	15	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific
16	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM –	15 16	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always
16 17 18 19	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that.	15 16 17	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers
16 17 18 19 20	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the	15 16 17 18 19 20	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they
16 17 18 19 20 21	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the proposition that the fact that there is nearly exactly the	15 16 17 18 19 20 21	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they will rely to the members on the ground to give the
16 17 18 19 20 21 22	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the proposition that the fact that there is nearly exactly the same information at 6AM and then at 12 noon is at the very	15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they will rely to the members on the ground to give the information. That includes the role players as well, if
16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the proposition that the fact that there is nearly exactly the same information at 6AM and then at 12 noon is at the very least an indication that there was fundamentally	 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they will rely to the members on the ground to give the information. That includes the role players as well, if they are part of the meeting. It may happen as well
 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the proposition that the fact that there is nearly exactly the same information at 6AM and then at 12 noon is at the very least an indication that there was fundamentally insufficient up-to-date flow of information to properly	 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they will rely to the members on the ground to give the information. That includes the role players as well, if they are part of the meeting. It may happen as well because normally with intelligence sometimes they will
 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25 	situation is very tense, full stop, and then if one looks at TT3, which supposedly incorporates in the minutes of the meeting the information provided earlier that day at 6AM – sorry, my apologies, Brigadier, that's TT4, and I'm focussing on paragraph 2.1 of TT4. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MS JELE: And I would put to you the proposition that the fact that there is nearly exactly the same information at 6AM and then at 12 noon is at the very least an indication that there was fundamentally	 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	up a plan to have notes that might inform their specific elements of information? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally what happened with crowd management issues, plan or not planned, always the information will be gathered, and senior officers especially sitting in a JOC, taking decisions, always they will rely to the members on the ground to give the information. That includes the role players as well, if they are part of the meeting. It may happen as well

	Page 3654		Page 3656
1	will be with a senior officer to say okay, this information	1	MS JELE: You will note - and that slide
2	now can be given and we can plan upon it, or maybe it can	2	specifically deals with the day of 16 August - that the
3	be reduced to an instruction as well by that particular	3	second point states that there were 630 members of the
4	senior officer in that meeting or that JOC, which is a	4	police deployed on the dayshift.
5	JOCOM meeting.	5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
6	MS JELE: Accepting that there would be a	6	MS JELE: And we're just looking to
7	need for that information to come in to be taken into	7	confirm the reference, but within exhibit L as well there
8	account, there are two issues that I would submit to you,	8	is an assertion that there were around 160-odd of those
9	Brigadier, are raised by the contents of TT4 and the last	9	deployed that were in fact POP members, and we'll just
10	page of TT5 specifically. The first is that in light of	10	confirm the slide reference as soon as we are able.
11	the fact that it is exactly the same information, the	11	Brigadier, my question, in your experience specifically in
12	impression is given that no effort is made to update the	12	crowd management situations, as we confirm that there were
13	information on a regular basis. In your experience, would	13	less than a quarter of the members deployed that were
14	that not be a fundamental flaw?	14	actually specialised in crowd management, does that not
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I won't be sure,	15	seem like a fundamentally insufficient number, and would
16	Advocate, that it can maybe differ or not differ. However,	16	you not expect at the very least POP members to be in the
17	as the figures they go on being the same I will feel really	17	majority of those deployed?
18	maybe something is not okay, but as I've said, always the	18	CHAIRPERSON: The number that you have?
19	growing number of the crowd will change as the day	19	MS JELE: The number that we have of POP
20	progress. You cannot start with 3 000 in the morning,	20	members is 167, if I'm not mistaken. Ms Hardy is assisting
20	obviously it will build up, build up, and become 3 000	20	me in finding the exact slide.
22	midday or whatever day. So I'm saying definitely there	22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, my understanding,
22	will be always some sort of changes into everything, but	22	Advocate, is that on a holding area, which is the reserved
		23 24	holding area 1 and holding area 2, there were some of the
24 25	I'm not sure why it was kept in that amount every time. MS JELE: And the information, regardless	24 25	members of Public Order Policing who were as well posted at
20	MS JEEL. And the information, regardless	23	members of rubic order rolicing who were as well posted at
	Page 3655		Page 3657
1	Page 3655 of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have	1	Page 3657 that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything
1 2	5	1 2	
	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have		that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything
2	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example,	2	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members
2 3	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at	2 3	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking
2 3 4	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is	2 3 4	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be
2 3 4 5	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and	2 3 4 5	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think
2 3 4 5 6	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the	2 3 4 5 6	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side,
2 3 4 5 6 7	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police?	2 3 4 5 6 7	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you. [10:18] MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I'd like	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at a quick search while the witness's answer was being
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you. [10:18] MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I'd like to turn to now a different aspect of the planning theme,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at a quick search while the witness's answer was being interpreted.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you. [10:18] MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I'd like to turn to now a different aspect of the planning theme, and that's the issue of numbers, is I think the best way to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at a quick search while the witness's answer was being interpreted. MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson, I was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you. [10:18] MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I'd like to turn to now a different aspect of the planning theme, and that's the issue of numbers, is I think the best way to describe it, and I would like to turn to exhibit L, being	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at a quick search while the witness's answer was being interpreted. MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson, I was informed that that's how we made that calculation. I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	of what actually happened at Marikana, if you were to have information regularly informing you that say for example, for argument sake there were 50 people on the koppie at 6AM, and what you have is information that that crowd is building up slowly but surely, would that information – and again based on your experience – not be relevant to the planning of the intervention by the Public Order Police? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will affect the plan most of the time of course, and at the same time we'll have to adjust, or try to adapt to the situation. That's how it should be every time. You need to adapt to the situation and see whether the personnel you've got are still able to deal with the situation or not. All this type of things you need to adjust, but you cannot on continuous basis, otherwise before the end of the day you'll have five operational plan in place but the only thing is to say how do you adapt to make sure that your plan is flexible, address the problem before you. [10:18] MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I'd like to turn to now a different aspect of the planning theme, and that's the issue of numbers, is I think the best way to describe it, and I would like to turn to exhibit L, being the SAPS presentation, and specifically to slide 131. 131,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	that position as a reserve, with the purpose if anything happened they can be called in and reinforce the members who were actually before the situation where it was taking place, the access. So your question is will it be appropriate with the number you are talking about. I think with the presence of those members on the other side, always can be easy to call them up and reinforce those members maybe if they have problem or they get pressure whenever the situation goes otherwise. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Jele, I found the numbers, I think. MS JELE: I'm grateful to you, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: If you start at 137, there are 45 POP members. If you go on to 139, there are 53. If you go on to 142, there are 8, and if you go on to 144, there's 70. If you add those numbers up you get 176. There may be others, but those are the ones that I found at a quick search while the witness's answer was being interpreted. MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson, I was informed that that's how we made that calculation. I'm obviously slightly dyslexic, 176, not 167.

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

1	Page 3658		Page 3660
1	exercise dealing with 3 000 people at noon and presumably a	1	the ratio should be, but we do not have something that
2	thousand in the morning, 176 POP members was rather a small	2	speaks to the ratio of personnel, SAPS, per Regulation of
3	number of POP people to be involved? Now that's the point	3	Gatherings Act that says how many members should be per the
4	I take it that's being made. Do you agree with it?	4	situation or per participants that are participating in
5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, Chairperson, if I	5	that particular gathering or march. But normally we really
6	can answer the question directly I will say no -	6	have to make sure that we have sufficient members that will
7	CHAIRPERSON: You don't have to say if I	7	actually be able to deal with the situation at hand.
8	answer directly, just answer all the questions directly,	8	Looking to 3 000, yes really, as I've said with the number
9	you'll save a lot of time. What's the direct answer to the	9	we got it can be, not be sufficient to deal with the
10	question?	10	situation. We'll have to look to the situation and be able
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I said no, but I would	11	to have, but normally what tells us, or tells me most of
12	like to say something, Chairperson. If there was 176	12	the time, is the type of threat because the threat means a
13	before the access, meaning where the pressure is, and there	13	lot. You can have 3 000 marchers and who's marching, ZCC
14	were other members, as I'm told that there were other	14	people, I make an example, the church, 3 000, do you need 3
15	members on the holding areas, that's the part I was trying	15	000 police officials for that type of a march? No, the
16	to explain, and if the situation really becomes of, I mean	16	threat doesn't allow me. I'm making example –
17	tense, that is not going to be handled, those other members	17	CHAIRPERSON: Yes, you're not dealing
18	could be called in. But if it's only that and the	18	with the church militants in that type of –
19	situation becomes out of hand and there's no other members	19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: But maybe can I clean
20	available, I would say no, was not sufficient.	20	this, please, to say I'm saying this with due respect,
21	CHAIRPERSON: The 176 includes 8 who were	21	maybe it can have people from the church's side, but I'm
22	in holding area number 1, that's slide 142, and 70 who were	22	making example to say these are the people always with the
23	at holding area number 2, which is slide 144. If you take	23	bigger group. If they are marching, I cannot just take,
24	the holding area people away, you then get 98. So the	24	because they are 3 000, then I will take 3 000 police
25	question is therefore, regard being had to the number of	25	officials. What will determine the number of police
			·
	Page 3659		Page 3661
1	protesters who were being dealt with, is what was	1	officials for us every time will be the threat at hand,
2	essentially, or should be a POP operation, is it	2	then we're going to say we need so many police officials to
3	appropriate to have only 98 in the sort of main area, with	3	deal with that situation. Always we need to look at that,
4	another 78 in the holding areas, or would you, if you'd	4	but only the Regulation of Gatherings Act talks into
5	been planning it, have arranged for more POP people to be	5	marshals, how many marshals, because we are saying they
6	there? I think that's the question. Is that right?	6	
7			must manage themselves; police must be there to support the
	BRIG MKHWANAZI: As, Chairperson, you	7	situation. Then in that way we don't have any
8	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not	7 8	
8 9	. ,		situation. Then in that way we don't have any
	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not	8	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation.
9	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them.	8 9	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think
9 10	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then –	8 9 10	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there
9 10 11	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question,	8 9 10 11	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country
9 10 11 12	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question.	8 9 10 11 12	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least
9 10 11 12 13	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly.	8 9 10 11 12 13	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or
9 10 11 12 13 14	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the	8 9 10 11 12 13 14	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a
9 10 11 12 13 14 15	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation?	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What normally happens,	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we realised at a later stage it had been sourced
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What normally happens, Chairperson, is that with Public Order Policing, especially	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we realised at a later stage it had been sourced independently. It is a presentation and a collection of
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What normally happens, Chairperson, is that with Public Order Policing, especially if we plan, we've got something on the Regulation of	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we realised at a later stage it had been sourced independently. It is a presentation and a collection of slides submitted to the parliamentary portfolio committee
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: What normally happens, Chairperson, is that with Public Order Policing, especially if we plan, we've got something on the Regulation of Gatherings Act that speaks to the marshals. I may answer	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we realised at a later stage it had been sourced independently. It is a presentation and a collection of slides submitted to the parliamentary portfolio committee on 30th August 2011, copies of which Ms Hardy will be
9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	have said, if you remove them, I'm saying they were not sufficient, as you said if you remove them. MS JELE: Our next question then – CHAIRPERSON: I have another question, before you ask your next question. MS JELE: Certainly. CHAIRPERSON: Regard being had to the fact that we're dealing with, in the midday operation, 3 000 protesters, what sort of ratio of POP members to protesters would you consider appropriate and would you have applied if you'd been in charge of the operation? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What normally happens, Chairperson, is that with Public Order Policing, especially if we plan, we've got something on the Regulation of Gatherings Act that speaks to the marshals. I may answer your question wrong, but I will try to come at the end into	8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	situation. Then in that way we don't have any confrontation. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I think my next question would relate to whether or not there certainly are sufficient POP members in the entire country to have made it feasible at Marikana, at the very least feasible to have what I will submit to you was the best or better scenario, that is a majority of POP members, a majority of individuals whose specialisation is crowd management. In order to deal with the specific issue I would beg leave to hand up a document which sadly we originally thought was part of the SAPS documents and we realised at a later stage it had been sourced independently. It is a presentation and a collection of slides submitted to the parliamentary portfolio committee on 30th August 2011, copies of which Ms Hardy will be handing up at present. Could we perhaps mark it as an

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

		1	
	Page 3662		Page 3664
1	MS PILLAY: Chair, it will be WW4.	1	slide number 6 which details the various POP units and
2	CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.	2	their strength as well as their locations, one sees for
3	MS JELE: Thank you, Ms Pillay. If I may	3	example if one excludes the support numbers, that in
4	also express my gratitude to my colleague, Mr Semenya, in	4	Johannesburg there are 308, in Pretoria 269, in Springs
5	light of the fact that I was under the impression he would	5	256, for example.
6	have had prior possession of this document. I would like -	6	[10:38] And as you turn the pages of the presentation,
7	MR MAHLANGU: What is the document	7	the number of POP individuals in the Eastern Cape, Limpopo,
8	number?	8	KZN, North West, Free State, Western Cape, Mpumalanga,
9	MS JELE: WW4.	9	Northern Cape are detailed, you can see that Brigadier?
10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't have it.	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
11	MS JELE: Apologies, Brigadier, seemingly	11	MS JELE: I would submit to you,
12	you're the one person who was not provided with a copy.	12	Brigadier, that looking at those numbers, in your
13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It makes my work easy.	13	experience would the officials responsible at Marikana not
14	MS JELE: You now have it?	14	have had sufficient crowd management specialists at their
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it, thanks.	15	disposal to call upon to assist them as events unfolded?
16	The exhibit number?	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I agree with that part,
17	MS JELE: WW4, Ms Pillay said. Thank	17	even though yesterday maybe I was told that I answered the
18	you. Brigadier, if you would first turn to slide 5. It's	18 19	question upfront of the next question, but I think I must
19 20	entitled "Background." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it.	20	definitely indicate I really asked to do that, that this is my belief that with Marikana issue, yes, police officials
20	MS JELE: And do you see that it details	20	trained in crowd management, they could have been called as
22	historically the number of forces within SAPS –	22	quick as possible as it is happening even now, however we
23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	23	have other service delivery protests in some other areas,
24	MS JELE: - that were responsible for	24	but some other provinces, yes, they were called in, like
25	crowd management?	25	Mpumalanga, they were called inside here during the process
	5		
	Page 3663		Page 3665
1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	1	as well. Some of them were called after to come and
2	MS JELE: One of the issues is obviously	2	assist.
3	that in '95 seemingly there was a considerable number, 11	3	CHAIRPERSON: While we're busy with that
4	000 members, whose primary function was crowd management.	4	point, Commissioner Hemraj has just drawn to the fact that
5	You can see that.		for the stand of t
6		5	if you look at foot of page – of slide 7, you'll see that
-	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	6	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the
7	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a	6 7	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when
8	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011	6 7 8	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana
8 9	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then	6 7 8 9	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day?
8 9 10	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you	6 7 8 9 10	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.
8 9 10 11	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that?	6 7 8 9 10 11	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding
8 9 10	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	6 7 8 9 10	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas.
8 9 10 11 12	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	6 7 8 9 10 11 12	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding
8 9 10 11 12 13	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was
8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that?
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve changed direction. That seems to be correct.	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, if that is the
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve changed direction. That seems to be correct. MS JELE: I accept that, Chairperson. I	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, if that is the position, Sir.
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve changed direction. That seems to be correct. MS JELE: I accept that, Chairperson. I would submit that combining that with the fact that these 4 000 individuals have crowd management as a secondary function is relevant to at the very least there being a	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, if that is the position, Sir. MS JELE: Brigadier, you did indeed
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve changed direction. That seems to be correct. MS JELE: I accept that, Chairperson. I would submit that combining that with the fact that these 4 000 individuals have crowd management as a secondary function is relevant to at the very least there being a lesser focus on crowd management in terms of staffing at	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, if that is the position, Sir. MS JELE: Brigadier, you did indeed anticipate my next question that was going to be that a great number of support's members were brought in seemingly from as far away as Umtata and the vast majority of them
8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	MS JELE: And seemingly, and this is a SAPS presentation so we can trust their numbers, in 2011 less than half remained. There are 4 343, and even then crowd management is now their secondary function. Do you see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. CHAIRPERSON: In fact the numbers have gone up. In '95 there were 11 000. By 2002 there are 7 327. 2006, 2 595. By 2011 the numbers have gone up again, there's now 4 343. So admittedly they were substantially fewer than they were in '95, but obviously the matter was already receiving attention and the curve changed direction. That seems to be correct. MS JELE: I accept that, Chairperson. I would submit that combining that with the fact that these 4 000 individuals have crowd management as a secondary function is relevant to at the very least there being a	6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	there were 98 POP members in Rustenburg, and that's the number we had outside the holding areas. You remember when did that exercise with the number of POP people at Marikana on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: They were 78 in the holding areas and 98 in what one can call the operational areas. So it looks as if – I'm not sure what the breakdown was between those in the holding areas and those in the operational areas, but it looks as if, from a point of view of numbers, only another 76 or thereabouts were brought in from outside. That seems to be correct. Would you agree with that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay, if that is the position, Sir. MS JELE: Brigadier, you did indeed anticipate my next question that was going to be that a great number of support's members were brought in seemingly

	Page 3666		Page 3668
1	And if one looks at the hundreds of POP members	1	- or in these two provinces for Public Order Policing.
2	available within driving distance of Marikana, the question	2	CHAIRPERSON: The question is more
3	then becomes - and I understand again you were not there -	3	specific than that. The question is asked to you in your
4	but if you were in operational command or if you were	4	capacity as an expert on Public Order Policing, and you're
5	training a particular officer and advising him on what the	5	asked to, as I understood it, to make the assumption that
6	deployment requests to make, would it not have been	6	POP people from Limpopo and Gauteng would have been
7	appropriate, taking into account naturally that forces may	7	available. Obviously if they weren't, then the point would
8	be engaged elsewhere, to ask for POP members close enough	8	fall away, but the question, as I understood it, was the
9	to get there sooner, I imagine that the Umtata or Durban	9	assumption in which the question was asked, and you were
10	NIU members reached there, to be brought forward to assist?	10	then asked, in your capacity as an expert to say, if these
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: If I understand you	11	people were available, the fact that they were not called
12	right, I think Gauteng that is closer, advocate was called	12	and other people with from other disciplines and other
13	in. Mpumalanga as well was called in. I believe those	13	training were called instead was a fundamental flaw in the
14	were the closest provinces that were actually brought in as	14	plan. That's the question were asked and you haven't
15	quick as possible. And your question is will I have to	15	answered that. Perhaps you should do so now.
16	look at that, obvious you need to look closer to safe time	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. Advocate, as you
17	and everything, who can be quicker to come in, looking as	17	said, if they were available, as I indicated from the
18	well to their commitment at their provinces, but I believe	18	beginning, there were other service delivery protest issues
19	Gauteng, who part of this, were called in. Mpumalanga was	19	that were taking place. I'm not sure what was the position
20	called in. I think they were the very closest to be around	20	in Gauteng at that stage, Limpopo as well, however if there
21	here as quick as possible.	21	wasn't anything taking place there, this was going to be
22	CHAIRPERSON: Was anyone called in from	22	the easiest way to have members as quick as possible,
23	your province, the Northern Cape?	23	therefore if they never called them, because there was
24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Only after, Chairperson,	24	nothing happening there, really it can be some sort of a
25	after the 16th.	25	sort of mistake on that.
-			
	Page 3667		Page 3669
1	Page 3667 CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks	1	Page 3669 MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another
1 2	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far	1 2	
	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley		MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over
2	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far	2	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I
2 3	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively?	2 3	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse
2 3 4	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I	2 3 4	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation,
2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after.	2 3 4 5	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly,
2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON:Ja, and I see if one looksat slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite faraway, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberleyarea, I see, that's directly under you.rea, I see, that's directly under you.That's quiteclose, isn't it, comparatively?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, Sir. Iwas called after.MS JELE:Brigadier, could you could you	2 3 4 5 6	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's
2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you	2 3 4 5 6 7	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Advocate, I'm not sure	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring another Public Order Policing from another province, it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I'm not sure with the call up of these members to come and reinforce	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring another Public Order Policing from another province, it will actually cause a problem. We definitely – I don't
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Advocate, I'm not sure with the call up of these members to come and reinforce what decision they took from the JOC hence I was not part	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring another Public Order Policing from another province, it will actually cause a problem. We definitely – I don't think it will happen like that, because even the training
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I'm not sure with the call up of these members to come and reinforce what decision they took from the JOC hence I was not part of the planning or the part of the operation, however	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring another Public Order Policing from another province, it will actually cause a problem. We definitely – I don't think it will happen like that, because even the training itself, members they train together. You call Gauteng and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, and I see if one looks at slide 8, that you had 100 and – Uppington is quite far away, but you had a 128 people – POP people in Kimberley area, I see, that's directly under you. That's quite close, isn't it, comparatively? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. I was called after. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you could you go back to slide 6 of the presentation, that's WW4? If you were to look at the number of POP members that are available in Gauteng and Limpopo, now just on a quick calculation, that's 1 314 members available in Gauteng and Limpopo combined. That's double the total number of individuals who were actually deployed in the end, including the SIU, TIT and so on at Marikana. I would put to you that those resources, if they had been available, and naturally one would hope that we'll have evidence with regard to their availability, a choice being made not to call upon them was a fundamental flaw in the planning and the decision-making of SAPS at the time. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Advocate, I'm not sure with the call up of these members to come and reinforce what decision they took from the JOC hence I was not part	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS JELE: Brigadier, there was another difficulty I think that was raised by bringing so many different units from various specialisations from all over the country, and that's an issue of communication, and I would put it to you that it is invaluable that when diverse units are going to be working in such difficult situation, their ability to communicate with each other smoothly, their ability to, at the very least, know each other's operational commanders in the best case scenario, is crucial to make sure that a plan implemented correctly. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will differ, because why, I work with Public Order Policing. Any member in Public Order Policing, if the platoon arrived, they know exactly who is the operational commander. They will be briefed. They will know exactly what to do. And the platoon commander will know exactly how to do that particular task and communication channels will be given and everybody will be in that particular channel to operate with. And we definitely work in that structured manner and I don't know how it can be a problem to say if you bring another Public Order Policing from another province, it will actually cause a problem. We definitely – I don't think it will happen like that, because even the training

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

			······································
	Page 3670		Page 3672
1	work together. They know exactly how to work, and even if	1	that we must work with the community and, as you indicate,
2	we give scenarios, they know exactly how to handle the	2	that we need to know the leaders and everybody. It's a
3	issues. So I find it difficult to say how they can have a	3	fact, we need to really to work with them, and people who
4	problem. And like if we talk about the integrated	4	can assist in that type of situation is the local police
5	operation where we have other units which are not Public	5	officials who know the area better, as well as knowing the
6	Order Policing, same thing will happen again: we'll be one	6	people as well around that area. It's a lot of things we
7	line of channels – I mean of communication to everybody.	7	need to just to take into consideration, then you can
8	It must be like that.	8	definitely be successful.
9	MS JELE: Brigadier, when I speak of	9	MS JELE: The reality being that in the
10	communication, is it not also relevant whether or not the	10	majority of situations one may not in fact need to bring in
11	specific units brought in can communicate comfortably and	11	so much support from out of town. Would that not be the
12	easy with the community, know the community, and are known	12	case?
13	by the community within which a particular situation	13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will
14	arises?	14	disagree, because, as I've said or indicated from the
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it's true. If	15	beginning, that every situation will differ, or will be
16	you bring members from different provinces, obviously you	16	handled in terms of what is the threat we get - I mean we
17	will need to orientate those members. Those members will	17	have before us, so we cannot definitely say because, yes,
18	have to know the area, understand the area, and if the	18	communities, their NGOs are there, there's no need now to
19	situation demands that there's no time of taking members	19	call anybody to assist. Yes, they are there definitely to
20	around or showing them whatever they should know, at least	20	make our job easy, to assist us, to give us information to
21	there must be somebody from the local area to show the	20	deal with the situation, but public order is still our own
22	members where to go if they have to rush to a certain	22	problem. We have to make sure that we have got sufficient
23	situation. It is a well-known situation that members from	22	members to deal with that specific problem as much as they
23	a different province won't know the place, but they must be	23	are there. We will call them if there is a need.
24	orientated and if it comes to a push as quick as possible,	24	[10:58] MS JELE: Certainly the need to have
25	orientated and in it comes to a push as quick as possible,	25	
	Page 3671		Page 3673
1	then somebody must be with those members to show them	1	sufficient who are specialised in crowd management is a
2	exactly where they must be if they are actually sent to a	2	sentiment expressed also by the minister of police. So he
3	specific place.	3	would agree with you. Chairperson, might I ask if this
4	MS JELE: This is a question in two	4	would be an appropriate time for the adjournment as I will
5	parts, Brigadier. The first is that if I may refer you to	5	be turning to another issue –
6	standing order 360, which is Exhibit SS2, and specifically	6	CHAIRPERSON: I was on the point of
7	to page 3 of Exhibit SS2?	7	asking you in two minutes if an appropriate stage had been
8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: SS2.	8	reached. If you think it is appropriate at this point for
9	MS JELE: I'm looking specifically at	9	the purposes of continuing with your cross-examination
10	clause 3, sub 3, which is on that page.	10	after the adjournment, we will take the tea adjournment
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, it's okay. Standing	11	now.
12	order 262, it's alright, it's fine, we can proceed, I'll	12	[COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
13	manage. We can proceed, Advocate, I think I'll manage.	13	[11:22] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.
14	MS JELE: You know your standing orders,	14	You're still under oath, Brigadier. Ms Jele, you're still
15	I appreciate that Brigadier. This particular section	15	cross-examining?
16	speaks of the need for partnership of the community and of	16	MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson.
17	building positive and constructive relationships with event	17	Brigadier, I'm now going to turn to the third theme that I
18	organisers, community leaders, NGO's, and one would presume	18	had introduced yesterday as the items that I would be
19	also obviously functioning local trade unions. The	19	dealing with, and that is specifically implementation of
20	submission is as follows, if one combines a majority of	20	the plan. Now I will repeat this because I know it bears
21	local police force, whereas the majority of specialised	20	repeating, that you were not there on the day, but your
22	crowd management units, one has the best possible deployed	22	expertise in this field, as well as your responsibility for
22	officers in order to attend to an event as dangerous as	22	training I think will allow you to answer these questions
23	Marikana. Would you agree with that proposition?	23 24	in light of the evidence that you gave in chief. The first
24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree, Advocate,	24 25	issue I'd like to raise with you is the issue of the
	R C H I V E E O R I U S T I C E	20	ISSUE I UTINE TO FOISE WITH YOU IS THE ISSUE OF THE
A	RUNIVE FOR JUSIICE		

1	Page 3674	1	Page 3676
1	briefing of members prior to implementation of a crowd	1	commission of oaths certificate in the middle of page 2.
2	management plan, and I'd like to take you in this respect	2	MS JELE: I now see that, thank you,
3	again to SS2 and to its page 7, and if one has regard to	3 4	Chairperson. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I got it, yes, got it.
4	item 10(1), first of all it obviously confirms that members	-	5 . 5 . 5
5	must be properly briefed before they are deployed to	5	MS JELE: I'm glad to hear that,
6	perform crowd management duties. You see that?	6	Brigadier. I refer, as I mentioned, to the first sentence
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it.	7	of paragraph 3.
8	MS JELE: And I understand that to mean	8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay.
9	each individual member and not just those in command.	9	MS JELE: And that is where it is stated,
10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.	10	"Our commander and Nyala driver were called for briefing by
11	Everybody must have a proper briefing, ja.	11	Brigadier Calitz." Do you see that?
12	MS JELE: And further if one looks at	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
13	10(2)(c), one of the directives is that the operational	13	MR MPOFU: Chairperson, sorry, I'm sorry
14	commander must instruct all commanders or section leaders	14	to interrupt my learned colleague. I just missed the
15	to furnish detailed written plans on their specific tasks.	15	reference in the IPID file of this statement.
16	Do you see that?	16	MS JELE: It's item A497 –
17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	17	MR MPOFU: 497.
18	MS JELE: Now to date we have not had the	18	MS JELE: - at pages 2236, 2237.
19	privilege of seeing such written instructions, and we	19	MR MPOFU: Thank you, got it.
20	certainly hope that we will see them in evidence, but as	20	MS JELE: Brigadier, in this entire
21	regards the briefing of individual members I would like to	21	statement seemingly only the Nyala driver received a
22	take you to, if I may, in the IPID documents - and I'm	22	briefing and not the member making the statement, at the
23	hoping that Ms Pillay will be in a position to assist me;	23	very least according to its contents. Is that not
24	I'm referring specifically to item A497, which is paginated	24	problematic?
25	2236 in the IPID file.	25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally, Advocate, with
	Page 3675		Page 3677
1	-		Tage 3077
	CHAIRPERSON: Will that be an exhibit?	1	Public Order Policing we have a section commander or
2		1 2	Public Order Policing we have a section commander or tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that
	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if		tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that
2	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be –	2	-
2 3	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an	2 3	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've
2 3 4	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to	2 3 4	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which
2 3 4 5	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an	2 3 4 5	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be
2 3 4 5 6	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her	2 3 4 5 6	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit	2 3 4 5 6 7	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant-	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly, Chairperson. If I may refer you to paragraph 3, Brigadier	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 – MR SEMENYA SC: Correct.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly, Chairperson. If I may refer you to paragraph 3, Brigadier	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 – MR SEMENYA SC: Correct. CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181, 182 and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly, Chairperson. If I may refer you to paragraph 3, Brigadier – BRIG MKHWANAZI: I haven't received it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 – MR SEMENYA SC: Correct. CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181, 182 and following. Now I think that the point being made in cross-
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly, Chairperson. If I may refer you to paragraph 3, Brigadier BRIG MKHWANAZI: I haven't received it. MS JELE: Sorry, Brigadier.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 – MR SEMENYA SC: Correct. CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181, 182 and following. Now I think that the point being made in cross- examination is never mind what's in exhibit L; it may be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	MS JELE: I'm not sure at this stage if it is in evidence. I thought it would have to be – CHAIRPERSON: I say is it going to be an exhibit, if it isn't, but I take it if you're going to refer to it then it will have to get an exhibit number, if it hasn't got one already. But perhaps Ms Pillay with her customary efficiency can tell us whether it is an exhibit already. Is it? MS PILLAY: Chair, it hasn't been marked as an exhibit, so it would be WW5. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. How does one describe it? MS JELE: I just handed my document – CHAIRPERSON: How do we describe this document? MS JELE: It is a statement by Warrant- Officer Makola, M-A-K-O-L-A. I cannot ascertain the exact date from it, but hopefully I'll be able to do so shortly, Chairperson. If I may refer you to paragraph 3, Brigadier BRIG MKHWANAZI: I haven't received it. MS JELE: Sorry, Brigadier. CHAIRPERSON: It's dated the 24th of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	tactical commanders. A section commander is the one that is being called and receive briefing, and after they've received the briefing they will go back and brief their sections, or maybe you call the platoon commanders, which is 32 members. The platoon commanders will be called, be briefed, will go back and brief others as well. So it depends what do you have at that time. But from what I'm seeing here it's the section which is eight members, then the section commander is called, is the one that will be briefed and will come and brief the rest of the members to say what needs to be done. So it's correct in this way. MS JELE: My difficulty here, Brigadier, is from this statement - and there are others, I'll refer you to at least one other one – there is no indication of a detailed briefing to the warrant-officer himself. MR SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, might I refer us to exhibit L – CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181 – MR SEMENYA SC: Correct. CHAIRPERSON: Slides 181, 182 and following. Now I think that the point being made in cross- examination is never mind what's in exhibit L; it may be borne out by the statements, the IPID statements to which

		-	
1	Page 3678	1	Page 3680
1	stage but you sounded a warning that this point may not be	1	the Nyala driver outside of the Nyala, but that in and of
2	a good one, if one reads it in the light of those slides.	2	itself would be a problem.
3	MS JELE: If I may then take up Mr Semenya's point and let us go to exhibit L, specifically	3	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the criticism is
4		4	unfair. It does not necessarily follow. The problem may
5	slide 182 for starters, it specifically –	5	be that the statement is incomplete. You cannot –
6	CHAIRPERSON: You're running your cross-	6	CHAIRPERSON: Isn't that an answer the
7	examination. Do what you consider appropriate.	7	witness should give?
8	MS JELE: Indeed, but Mr Semenya is	8	MR SEMENYA SC: Well the witness –
9	always of such great assistance. If one looks at slide 182	9	CHAIRPERSON: A nice direct clear answer
10	of exhibit L, it refers to commanders of the teams being	10	that we expect from the witness?
11	briefed, and it refers to them having briefed their	11	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the witness has
12	officers. The query is that the requirement is that every	12	not been shown the statement, does not have any
13	single member that is part of that particular operation	13	conversation with the witness who's making that statement.
14	ought to be briefed. That is the proper interpretation of	14	That information can't lie within his mind. The
15	the standing order directive, is it not?	15	extrapolation which is being made is that because a witness
16 17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, the way it is written on the standing order 262, Advocate.	16 17	was given a statement – CHAIRPERSON: I've got the point, yes.
17	However, procedurally what we normally do to make sure that	18	Ms Jele, isn't the point this, that this is a hearsay kind
10	everybody understands, gets information properly, because	10	of thing. You're cross-examining him on statements which
20	at the end of the day somebody must be able to ask	20	may not be accurate, may not be complete. Presumably when
20	questions. We spoke about issues of orientation and all	20	the commanders come you can ask them about it. They will
22	that, and if you've got a bigger group, you won't be able	22	either say yes, we did only, in this particular case only
23	to orientate them properly. You need to have a small	23	brief the Nyala driver and not the other people on the
24	number of the commanders which can be easily be orientated,	24	Nyala, but you know, regard being had to the time
25	know exactly the layout of the area, give proper briefing	25	constraints under which we're operating I'm not sure that
	Page 3679		Page 3681
1	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings	1	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this
2	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back	2	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross-
	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's		this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross-examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing
2 3 4	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying,	2	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think
2 3 4 5	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the	2 3 4 5	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this
2 3 4 5 6	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address	2 3 4 5 6	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage.
2 3 4 5 6 7	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself.	2 3 4 5 6 7	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his officers directly, but there are some members that were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members, which in his expert opinion is directly relevant. Now the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his officers directly, but there are some members that were participating in the operation that were not directly	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. <u>MS JELE:</u> If I may – <u>CHAIRPERSON:</u> The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. <u>MS JELE:</u> Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members, which in his expert opinion is directly relevant. Now the challenge for the Human Rights Commission's team in being
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his officers directly, but there are some members that were participating in the operation that were not directly briefed of the details of the strategy ahead, and even if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members, which in his expert opinion is directly relevant. Now the challenge for the Human Rights Commission's team in being able to prepare an expert opinion's provisional statement
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his officers directly, but there are some members that were participating in the operation that were not directly briefed of the details of the strategy ahead, and even if there were some members not so briefed, at the very least	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members, which in his expert opinion is directly relevant. Now the challenge for the Human Rights Commission's team in being able to prepare an expert opinion's provisional statement which is of relevance to the factual evidence being brought
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	to them, then at the same time they can do their drawings as well, they can have their small tactical plan, go back and be able to actually brief the members. Yes, it's correct exactly what the standing order 262 is saying, which as well allows the overall commander, or the operational commander as well, to have everybody, address everybody, but not on specific with the operation itself. But when it goes to the operation, those leaders or the commanders will be called to go in details with them, but he can address everybody with the operation itself, but at the end must be in detail, then the commanders are called forward to come forward and be able to be briefed properly. Otherwise you won't be able to orientate everybody properly. If there's a question you've got a lot of people, it's not going to be easy to have every information properly to everybody given. MS JELE: Brigadier, the difficulty is that while I accept that commanders were briefed, and in certain instances there are affidavits within the IPID file that refer to Captain Kidd certainly having briefed his officers directly, but there are some members that were participating in the operation that were not directly briefed of the details of the strategy ahead, and even if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	this is a profitable line of cross-examination with this witness. It may be a good point, but I suggest you cross- examine witnesses more directly involved with the briefing aspect when they come and give evidence. So I don't think that I can fail to uphold Mr Semenya's objection at this stage. MS JELE: If I may – CHAIRPERSON: The way to do it is to put it shortly to the witness on the basis that if it's correct that they weren't briefed, that's a defect and so on, and leave it at that. Then whether the assumption upon which the question is based is correct or not, is something he can't tell us about anyway. That will have to be followed up with the witnesses directly involved in the briefing or non-briefing, as the case may be. MS JELE: Chairperson, I accept that. I think the difficulty with regard to this specific issue raises a broader one, and that is that one of the aspects of Gary White's expert opinion rests on the lack of evidence precisely of the briefing of individual members, which in his expert opinion is directly relevant. Now the challenge for the Human Rights Commission's team in being able to prepare an expert opinion's provisional statement

		1	
1	Page 3682		Page 3684
1	Semenya refers to, cannot be underemphasised, and it is	1	the helicopter.
2	this particular challenge that we'd have face –	2	CHAIRPERSON: I suggest you look at the
3	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not quarrelling with	3	foot of page 40, top of page 41, before you persist with
4	that, but my point is – and I think it's Mr Semenya's	4	this objection. He said he had a radio. The point is it
5	point; if it isn't his point, it should be – that this is	5	is suggested he didn't use it. So whether that's correct
6	the wrong witness to address these questions to and it's	6	or not, we will discover when he goes in the witness box.
7	wasteful of valuable time - we may have to sit a bit longer	7	But meanwhile I suggest that Adv Jele reformulates the
8	to make up for the time spent on this today - because he's	8	question based upon what is at the foot of page 40, at the
9	not going to help us. The most he can say is they should	9	top of page 41, and then again on the assumption that it's
10	have been briefed; if they weren't, it's a defect. Once	10	correct, get a short answer from the witness and then move
11	you've made that point you can move on to the next one, I	11	on to the next point.
12	would have thought.	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of which exhibit?
13	MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. Then	13	CHAIRPERSON: WW2. Ms Jele is at the
14	perhaps I can ask the brigadier to answer the question as	14	moment cross-examining on the basis of what Mr White says
15	put by yourself.	15	and it's under the heading "Lack of leadership," or
16	CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, you've heard the	16	something. That's page 40 and following.
17	debate between counsel and me –	17	MR SEMENYA SC: That's precisely the
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I did.	18	objection, Chair. If that opinion is based on incorrect
19	CHAIRPERSON: And I'm keen to save time.	19	reading of the evidence, it cannot be put as a proposition
20	So I take it you'd agree that if it's correct that all the	20	of fact that that is a defect that was there. If Mr
21	members weren't briefed, that would have been a defect?	21	White's information is incorrect, he cannot propose to put
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes.	22	it as a matter of fact to this witness that there was the
23	CHAIRPERSON: Whether they were briefed	23	operational commander without radio contact.
24	or not, is a matter you don't know anything about.	24	CHAIRPERSON: He already said he had a –
25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes.	25	I've gone beyond that. What's at the foot of page 40 is he
	D 0/00		D 0/05
1	Page 3683 MS JELE: Brigadier, another issue with	1	Page 3685 did have a radio, but –
2	respect to implementation of the plan is what Gary White	2	MS JELE: Can I perhaps assist,
3	refers to as a lack of leadership, and my question to you,		· · ·
	refers to us a lack of feddership, and my question to you,	3	Chairperson?
4	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management	3 4	Chairperson? CHAIRPERSON: I think your question –
			•
4	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management	4	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question –
4 5	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have	4 5	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written
4 5 6	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in	4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe.
4 5 6 7	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not?	4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question
4 5 6 7 8	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree	4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what
4 5 6 7 8 9	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public	4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether
4 5 7 8 9 10	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are	4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and
4 5 7 8 9 10 11	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and	4 5 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect.
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON:I think your question – MS JELE:MS JELE:It was referenced in a writtenstatement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON:Ja, I think your questionmay have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect.Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not,
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a	4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON:I think your question – MS JELE:MS JELE:It was referenced in a writtenstatement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON:Ja, I think your questionmay have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect.Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else.
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. [11:42] MS JELE: Being in a helicopter without	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and specifically to the fact that he was – and I would refer to
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. [11:42] MS JELE: Being in a helicopter without radio communication may in fact have been a bad decision by	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and specifically to the fact that he was – and I would refer to paragraph 49 of that written statement – he does indeed
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. [11:42] MS JELE: Being in a helicopter without radio communication may in fact have been a bad decision by someone in that position, in your opinion?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and specifically to the fact that he was – and I would refer to paragraph 49 of that written statement – he does indeed confirm he had a radio with him. However –
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: That's correct. [11:42] MS JELE: Being in a helicopter without radio communication may in fact have been a bad decision by someone in that position, in your opinion? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, again the evidence	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and specifically to the fact that he was – and I would refer to paragraph 49 of that written statement – he does indeed confirm he had a radio with him. However – CHAIRPERSON: You put he didn't have a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	Brigadier, is in your experience in crowd management issues, clearly the shape, as well as leaders that have direct access to up-to-date information is essential in order for the police to do their job correctly, is it not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, I agree with the comment. However, I believe especially in Public Order Policing always we have normally people who are trained as platoon commanders, as section commanders, and those are the people who lead and who know exactly what has to be done, especially when the operational commander gives instruction what's supposed to be done at that time. MS JELE: The issue, Brigadier, is that as a consequence the operational commander needs to be in a position to know how events are unfolding in order to be able to make the order you have just mentioned. Does he or she not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. [11:42] MS JELE: Being in a helicopter without radio communication may in fact have been a bad decision by someone in that position, in your opinion?	4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: I think your question – MS JELE: It was referenced in a written statement of General Mpembe. CHAIRPERSON: Ja, I think your question may have been inappropriately phrased in the light of what appears at the foot of page 40. The real point is whether he had a radio or not, it's suggested he didn't use it and your point would be, I take it, that that was a defect. Whether he had a radio or not, whether he used it or not, is a matter that will depend on the evidence. If you put it on a conditional basis then you can get a helpful answer; we won't spend anymore time on it and we can proceed with something else. MS JELE: The evidence that White had in his possession was the written statement provided to us by the SAPS by General Mpembe, and it's in relation to the statements made in that specific written statement and specifically to the fact that he was – and I would refer to paragraph 49 of that written statement – he does indeed confirm he had a radio with him. However –

1	Page 3686 beyond that. Even if he had a radio, it's suggested by Mr	1	Page 3688 proposition is this, this statement at the very least
2	White that he didn't use it and that may or may not be	2	suggests that he was not aware that shots had been fired,
	denied by him, but put the question on the basis that if	3	but seemingly firstly that bodies were down, and secondly
3			the communicating the commands that were necessary and that
4	the statement is correct, would it be a defect. You'll get	4 5	
5	an answer and we can move on. We can't get involved in	5	he himself refers to, required that he return to the JOC,
6	dogfights every 10 minutes on every one of these details,	6	and the question is would a person in his position not be
7	which are in any event conditionally put on the assumption	7	best placed therefore by remaining in the JOC and not
8	that certain evidence will or will not come forward later,	8	making the choice to proceed, as General Mpembe did.
9	not so?	9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, my answer to
10	MS JELE: Brigadier, we've mentioned the	10	this will be, I will actually answer comparing it into two
11	value of having an operational commander in a position	11	type of scenarios where we talk about the sporting events,
12	where he is able to communicate to people on the ground,	12	as well as we talk about this type of operations. On
13	and I do want to refer now specifically to the statement of	13	sporting events we are definitely saying that a person must
14	General Mpembe, if you would look at it, please. Page 21	14	be in the VOC, or in the JOC. That is the overall
15	of the statement, as at paragraph 49 and following.	15	commander, the operational commander, all these people must
16	CHAIRPERSON: Again it's not something	16	be there to assist each other to take a decision. However,
17	that we have, so it will have to be an exhibit at some	17	in that position it's easy for them, they are in the VOC,
18	stage, but let's not waste time further on it. I see Ms	18	the stadium or the field is right in front of them. They
19	Pillay is going to show it to the witness on her laptop.	19	can be able to see whatever is happening. They can as well
20	The witness can give the answer and we can get the document	20	take decision. But coming to this type of an operation, I
21	in due course.	21	would say it's not safe to say should you be there in the
22	MS JELE: Perhaps I might then read from	22	JOC, not have a chance to see exactly what is happening,
23	these paragraphs in order to assist, Chairperson.	23	however it's important to have communication, of which at
24	CHAIRPERSON: May I suggest that	24	the moment I cannot say whether General Mpembe could at
25	certainly from now on and certainly after the lunch	25	that time be able to hear or to see what was happening, but
1	Page 3687	1	Page 3689
1	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to	1	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said
2	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that	2	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that
2 3	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to	2 3	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear
2 3 4	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of	2 3 4	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be
2 3 4 5	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment.	2 3 4 5	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had
2 3 4 5 6	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that	2 3 4 5 6	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available,	2 3 4 5 6 7	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz instruct members to get out of the Nyalas and effect	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I will limit mine to those that have not yet been answered,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz instruct members to get out of the Nyalas and effect arrests. I instructed the pilot to return me to the JOC to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I will limit mine to those that have not yet been answered, Brigadier. The first is to your knowledge did anybody come
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz instruct members to get out of the Nyalas and effect arrests. I instructed the pilot to return me to the JOC to make sure that the medical personnel at hand were enough to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I will limit mine to those that have not yet been answered, Brigadier. The first is to your knowledge did anybody come to Potchefstroom with a document prepared for the purpose
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz instruct members to get out of the Nyalas and effect arrests. I instructed the pilot to return me to the JOC to make sure that the medical personnel at hand were enough to attend to those said to be lying on the ground and to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I will limit mine to those that have not yet been answered, Brigadier. The first is to your knowledge did anybody come to Potchefstroom with a document prepared for the purpose of a presentation to be made at Potchefstroom?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	adjournment, if you're still busy, in future if you want to ask questions based on documents you should make sure that they are before us, or that Ms Pillay has copies to distribute, because otherwise we waste an awesome amount of time. But anyway, proceed as you propose for the moment. MS JELE: We had indeed been assured that these documents would at the very least be made available, but thank for that, Chairperson. As regards paragraph 49, General Mpembe specifically states, "Both Brigadier Tsiloane and I took along our handheld radios and we could follow the communication on the SAPS radio. The Protea Coin helicopter flew above three SAPS helicopters. I could see groups of people dispersing from the koppie and moving in a north and north-westerly direction. I could also see the arrival of, and engagement by, the water canons at koppie 3. As the helicopter flew around the area I looked at the protesters who may have been regrouping. I then heard Lieutenant-Colonel Vermaak reporting over the radio that there were bodies down. It was not clear where." Now paragraph 50, "Soon thereafter I heard Brigadier Calitz instruct members to get out of the Nyalas and effect arrests. I instructed the pilot to return me to the JOC to make sure that the medical personnel at hand were enough to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	if he got communication he can be able to hear what is said because if a person gives information to the JOC that somebody has been injured or what position, he can hear from his radio at the same time. That means it can be communicated to everybody. So I'm not sure what had happened in this position, hence I was not there. But I'm saying it's not fixed to say you must just be there, but you can orientate yourself as an overall commander to see what is happening because it's easy in a situation in a stadium where you see everything in front of you, but in this type of a situation it is challenging that you can't see anything, but as you flew and check, but if you got communication it's easy to be able to see. If communication is not there, it becomes a problem because decisions must be taken. MS JELE: Thank you, Brigadier. I now turn to the last issue that I would hope to cover with yourself in cross-examination. That's the issue of debriefing. I appreciate that you've already been asked a number of questions on the meeting at Potchefstroom and I will limit mine to those that have not yet been answered, Brigadier. The first is to your knowledge did anybody come to Potchefstroom with a document prepared for the purpose

		I	
1	Page 3690	1	Page 3692
1	Advocate, hence the question came, was that for me to be	1	is exhibit L, is really talking to the police function
2	there, there was a purpose. People were there for nine days. However, I was there for three days and our purpose	2	properly.
3		3	MS JELE: Brigadier, if I could refer you
4	was simple why we were there, we're just focussing only	4	now to paragraph 6 of your original statement, SS1 –
5	into that. There's no time whereby myself I check if	5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Got it.
6	somebody got any document or anything in his or her	6	MS JELE: The paragraph indicates that
7	possession because when we arrive there people were divided	7	you at the time would be responsible for supervising and
8	into groups and to compile the information for the	8	monitoring the training, to ensure not only that policies
9	submission for the Commission. Ours was only to come	9	and standards are being implemented and followed, but also
10	together and look to the final product.	10	to compile a report with recommendations - I presume where
11	MS JELE: You've mentioned these groups	11	shortcomings had been observed.
12	before. Is there any chance, Brigadier, that you recall	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
13	how the groups were separated? Was it by theme perhaps or	13	MS JELE: As you indicated to us
14	by specialisation? Do you remember the distinction made	14	yesterday, your choices with regard to any further action
15	for each group and perhaps the number of those groups?	15	after shortcomings have been reports, depend to a great
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I didn't check	16	deal upon the instructions you receive. Is that not
17	whether they were actually put in accordance with their	17	correct?
18	expertise. However, as I've said, they were there for nine	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, there I was
19	days. We came only for three days. Already they were in	19	referring where we were talking about the ministry policy,
20	their groups. So as we said starting everything was only	20	that there division HRD, Human Resource Development, they
21	that they will have to break up into their groups. But	21	are actually the people who can come up with the
22	whether they were in their expertise, like to say maybe	22	instruction to say what needs to be done, and when there is
23	Special Task Force alone, National Intervention alone,	23	a need an invitation is given to us as well, we'll
24	Public Order Policing alone, I didn't check on that part at	24	participate. However, I can initiate, but they are the
25	all. But I presume that it should be maybe they were	25	people who can actually come forward and say no, this can
1	Page 3691 mixed. It can be possible as well, because they were all	1	Page 3693 be done or not be done.
2	working together to be able to get the situation going, but	2	
2	working together to be able to get the situation going, but I didn't check on that.	2	MS JELE: In the process of supervising
3	I didn't check on that.		MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and
3 4	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least	2 3 4	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned
3 4 5	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in?	2 3 4 5	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling
3 4 5 6	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we	2 3 4 5 6	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I
3 4 5 6 7	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was	2 3 4 5 6 7	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example.
3 4 5 6 7 8	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not?
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS JELE:In the process of supervisingand monitoring the training to make sure that policies andstandards are being implemented and followed, you mentionedduring your evidence-in-chief that this includes compilingreports and recommendations as a result of events – Ibelieve you made reference to Ellis Park for example.BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, yes.MS JELE:And such processes internal tothe SAPS are part of the practice and in the long termviewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, arethey not?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct.MS JELE:That's correct.MS JELE:That's correct.
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS JELE:In the process of supervisingand monitoring the training to make sure that policies andstandards are being implemented and followed, you mentionedduring your evidence-in-chief that this includes compilingreports and recommendations as a result of events – Ibelieve you made reference to Ellis Park for example.BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, yes.MS JELE:And such processes internal tothe SAPS are part of the practice and in the long termviewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, arethey not?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct.MS JELE:To your knowledge, have anydebriefings, as one world call to the solutions of events
3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS JELE:In the process of supervisingand monitoring the training to make sure that policies andstandards are being implemented and followed, you mentionedduring your evidence-in-chief that this includes compilingreports and recommendations as a result of events – Ibelieve you made reference to Ellis Park for example.BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, yes.MS JELE:And such processes internal tothe SAPS are part of the practice and in the long termviewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, arethey not?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct.MS JELE:To your knowledge, have anydebriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of eventsever informed amended training to mate sure or sure or processes information
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS JELE:In the process of supervisingand monitoring the training to make sure that policies andstandards are being implemented and followed, you mentionedduring your evidence-in-chief that this includes compilingreports and recommendations as a result of events – Ibelieve you made reference to Ellis Park for example.BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, yes.MS JELE:And such processes internal tothe SAPS are part of the practice and in the long termviewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, arethey not?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct.MS JELE:To your knowledge, have anydebriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of eventsever informed amended training tormats or been incorporatedinto forms of upgraded training:
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MS JELE:In the process of supervisingand monitoring the training to make sure that policies andstandards are being implemented and followed, you mentionedduring your evidence-in-chief that this includes compilingreports and recommendations as a result of events – Ibelieve you made reference to Ellis Park for example.BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct, yes.MS JELE:And such processes internal tothe SAPS are part of the practice and in the long termviewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, arethey not?BRIG MKHWANAZI:That's correct.MS JELE:To your knowledge, have anydebriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of eventsever informed amended training formats or been incorporatedinto forms of upgraded training:I12:02]BRIG MKHWANAZI:It really happened most
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training: [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – 1 believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself that needs to be submitted for the Commission. As I've	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – 1 believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where police officials were killed and we came up with a change
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself that needs to be submitted for the Commission. As I've said from the beginning as well was that we were there	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where police officials were killed and we came up with a change and we came up with a document, we call it TST, which is
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself that needs to be submitted for the Commission. As I've said from the beginning as well was that we were there sitting together with the group after everything has been	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where police officials were killed and we came up with a change and we came up with a document, we call it TST, which is tactical training for the members to say what type of
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself that needs to be submitted for the Commission. As I've said from the beginning as well was that we were there sitting together with the group after everything has been finalised. Mostly what we look at was the issue of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where police officials were killed and we came up with a change and we came up with a document, we call it TST, which is tactical training for the members to say what type of training we can give to those members. Definitely it
3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	I didn't check on that. MS JELE: Brigadier, can you at least tell me what group you were in? BRIG MKHWANAZI: We were, as I've said we were about seven or eight, ourselves, and our leader was Major-General Geldenhuys from Legal Services and ourselves, we're just only eight of us in that group only with specific task to say as soon as everything is finalised we'll come together, join the group and look to the product, the final product. That's all. MS JELE: Brigadier, could you describe that specific task to the extent that it was relevant to the proceedings before this Commission? What was that specific task you just referred to? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, our task was to look to issues of policies. Especially we look as well to national instruction, to standing orders, and to see everything is in place properly with the document itself that needs to be submitted for the Commission. As I've said from the beginning as well was that we were there sitting together with the group after everything has been	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS JELE: In the process of supervising and monitoring the training to make sure that policies and standards are being implemented and followed, you mentioned during your evidence-in-chief that this includes compiling reports and recommendations as a result of events – I believe you made reference to Ellis Park for example. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MS JELE: And such processes internal to the SAPS are part of the practice and in the long term viewed as – from your opinion – beneficial to the SAPS, are they not? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. MS JELE: To your knowledge, have any debriefings, as one would call them, or analyses of events ever informed amended training formats or been incorporated into forms of upgraded training? [12:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It really happened most of the time. If something happened - if I may make an example, we have one such situation is Jeppestown where police officials were killed and we came up with a change and we came up with a document, we call it TST, which is tactical training for the members to say what type of

	Page 3694		Page 3696
1	and definitely find out how actually the incident happened,	1	[VIDEO SHOWN]
2	and out of that we can come up with a plan to say how	2	MS JELE: - at this stage.
3	members can be trained to avoid the situation to happen	3	CHAIRPERSON: We must give the
4	again.	4	interpreter an opportunity to interpret the key section. I
5	MS JELE: And indeed this process being	5	don't know if he has the text in front of him.
6	followed by SAPS internally would be beneficial in the long	6	MS JELE: I would like to assist him. I
7	term regardless of the conclusions and/or additional	7	do have a copy of what we have transcribed, perhaps that
8	conclusions that a commission such as this one might come	8	might be of assistance to him.
9	to, would it not?	9	CHAIRPERSON: May I suggest you give him
10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally the most of the	10	the transcript so that he can interpret to those in the
11	issues I'm actually talking about is whereby the Commission	11	auditorium who would understand it better if it were
12	is not going to be involved. That's why we come up with	12	interpreted into isiXhosa and I don't know whether he has
13	our own recommendation and we can move forward and come up	13	to interpret it into Sesotho as well.
14	with some programme and make sure that we train members, we	14	MS PILLAY: Chairperson, while the
15	make some changes, but at the same time if it comes from	15	interpreter is being given the document, that clip hasn't
16	the side of the Commission, we can consolidate as well the	16	been given an Exhibit number as yet. So if I could ask
17	recommendations by the Commission and come up with a	17	that that be marked WW5 and the clip involved is SAPS
18	programme. That's why I made an example with Ellis Park as	18	external hard drive -
19	well, that it contributed a lot into that and we managed to	19	CHAIRPERSON: Hang on, I thought the
20	come up with a better change.	20	statement by Warrant Officer Makola -
21	MS JELE: I suppose as a precursor for	21	MS PILLAY: I apologise, Chair, it's WW6.
22	such a process the SAPS would have to appreciate at the	22	CHAIRPERSON: WW6, and what do we call
23	outset, as indicated in paragraph 57 of my colleague, Mr	23	it? The video clip?
24	Semenya's opening statement, that if needs be changes need	24	MS PILLAY: It's the National
25	to be made. That acknowledgement and that appreciation at	25	Commissioner's speech.
	Page 3695		Page 3697
1	Page 3695 the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider	1	Page 3697 CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner
1 2		1 2	
	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider		CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner
2	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that?	2	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech.
2	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do	2	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest
2 3 4	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything.	2 3 4	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS
2 3 4 5	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very	2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it
2 3 4 5 6	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance.	2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.
2 3 4 5 6 7	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – Extended to the speecific
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.Do we know the date onCHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she started speaking, but anyway that's something we can be sorted out later.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.CHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can besorted out later.MS PILLAY:Well, we can try and -
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.CHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can besorted out later.MS PILLAY:Well, we can try and -CHAIRPERSON:WW6 is a video clip of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.CHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can besorted out later.MS PILLAY:Well, we can try and -CHAIRPERSON:WW6 is a video clip of theNational Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she started speaking, but anyway that's something we can be sorted out later. MS PILLAY: Well, we can try and – CHAIRPERSON: WW6 is a video clip of the National Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose we can say.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the Commissioner – the National Commissioner, Chairperson.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.CHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can besorted out later.MS PILLAY:Well, we can try and -CHAIRPERSON:WW6 is a video clip of theNational Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose wecan say.MS PILLAY:MS PILLAY:Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the Commissioner – the National Commissioner, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: I see. On what date?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON:National Commissionerspeech.MS PILLAY:And the pathway for the restof the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPSvideo\post event\0036XVID.CHAIRPERSON:Do we know the date onwhich the speech was made, because we can then identify itas National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day.Do we know the date?MS PILLAY:We don't have the specificdate -CHAIRPERSON:It sounded as if the datewas mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before shestarted speaking, but anyway that's something we can besorted out later.MS PILLAY:Well, we can try and -CHAIRPERSON:WW6 is a video clip of theNational Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose wecan say.MS PILLAY:Yes.MS JELE:I was informed by my legal
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the Commissioner – the National Commissioner, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: I see. On what date? MS JELE: I'm not sure of the dates, but	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she started speaking, but anyway that's something we can be sorted out later. MS PILLAY: Well, we can try and – CHAIRPERSON: WW6 is a video clip of the National Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose we can say. MS PILLAY: Yes. MS JELE: I was informed by my legal team, Chairperson, that it's dated 20 August. Perhaps the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask MS Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the Commissioner – the National Commissioner, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: I see. On what date? MS JELE: I'm not sure of the dates, but it is certainly post the event, it is at memorial for	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she started speaking, but anyway that's something we can be sorted out later. MS PILLAY: Well, we can try and – CHAIRPERSON: WW6 is a video clip of the National Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose we can say. MS PILLAY: Yes. MS JELE: I was informed by my legal team, Chairperson, that it's dated 20 August. Perhaps the SAPS can just confirm that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the outset would need to be there otherwise why consider make any changes at all. Would you accept that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Of course really I do agree that there will be changes after the Commission. With the recommendation, we will definitely have to come up with some sort of changes in our programmes and everything. Obviously the recommendation by the Commission will be very much of great assistance. MS JELE: Before I ask you my next question, I would like to ask Ms Pillay to assist. We had indicated yesterday that we wish to have a specific video shown, and I'm hoping that she was in position to queue it. MS PILLAY: - is ready with the video. MS JELE: The video sourced from the SAPS hard drive and we've indicated its precise location and the list of documents that we've provided to the SAPS. CHAIRPERSON: Before we see it, what does it show broadly, what's it supposed to indicate? MS JELE: There's a speech by the Commissioner – the National Commissioner, Chairperson. CHAIRPERSON: I see. On what date? MS JELE: I'm not sure of the dates, but	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: National Commissioner speech. MS PILLAY: And the pathway for the rest of the parties, Chair, is SAPS external hard drive\SAPS video\post event\0036XVID. CHAIRPERSON: Do we know the date on which the speech was made, because we can then identify it as National Commissioner's speech on such and such a day. Do we know the date? MS PILLAY: We don't have the specific date – CHAIRPERSON: It sounded as if the date was mentioned in the beginning by a voiceover before she started speaking, but anyway that's something we can be sorted out later. MS PILLAY: Well, we can try and – CHAIRPERSON: WW6 is a video clip of the National Commissioner's speech post-Marikana, I suppose we can say. MS PILLAY: Yes. MS JELE: I was informed by my legal team, Chairperson, that it's dated 20 August. Perhaps the

	-	1	
1	Page 3698		Page 3700
1	MS JELE: Thank you, Chairperson. It	1	let us remember that the pain that everybody is feeling is
2	sounded like something like that. Perhaps Mr Semenya can	2	felt by all of us but all we did was to do our job and to
3	take instructions and help us. We must give this – your	3	do it in the manner that we are trained in. That we know
4	transcript to the transcribers and they've already - I take	4	it should be done responsibly, caringly and focusing on
5	it they've already recorded the soundtrack of this video,	5	that which is our core responsibility. Thank you.
6	but still it will have to be on the transcript of the	6	CHAIRPERSON: Thank you very much, Mr
7	proceedings what was said in the speech.	7	Mahlangu. You want to ask some questions based upon the
8	MS JELE: Fortunately that was prepared	8	speech of the National Commissioner to you?
9	for us is an electronic copy, so we'd be in a position to	9	MS JELE: To the extent that it relates
10	send it through to the evidence leaders for that purpose.	10	to issues of debriefing and learning lessons from a full
11	CHAIRPERSON: Before we interpret it,	11	appreciation of events that might have taken place, whether
12	really do we know in what languages he must interpret this	12	it's in the death of Andries Tatane, Ellis Park or
13	speech? Obviously isiXhosa. Are there people here – I	13	Marikana, would it not be appropriate not to, at the very
14	don't know if they can understand my English, but are there	14	least, wait until a process such as any kind of debriefing,
15	people here who would like it to be interpreted into	15	even internal, is made before making a judgment call before
16	Sesotho as well?	16	one's own members about the quality of the work that was in
17	MR MAHLANGU: There doesn't seem to be	17	fact given. In terms of the value of debriefing and the
18	anyone.	18	place of debriefing, Brigadier, is my question, would you
19	CHAIRPERSON: Do they want it interpreted	19	not wait until after you have had an opportunity to apply
20	into Tswana – into Setswana?	20	your mind to what took place before coming to conclusions
21	MR MAHLANGU: May I then start?	21	about a description of the manner in which this particular
22	CHAIRPERSON: - if you'd read it now to	22	work took place?
23	us in English, because I had difficulty in hearing it	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I want to
24	clearly when the video was being shown. So if you could	24	indicate that really as much as I can have my own feeling
25	read it to us, please, I'd be grateful.	25	in how it should be done, but I would like to request that
	· · ·		
	Page 3699		Page 3701
1	MR MAHLANGU: Yes. Speech by the	1	I don't comment on this please.
2	National Commissioner, "Good morning." She says, "Is this	2	
3		~	CHAIRPERSON: Advocate Jele, I was going
Ιĭ	on? Alright. Good morning. Grateful for God for giving	3	to ask you the same question. I can understand the
4	on? Alright. Good morning. Grateful for God for giving us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to		0 0
		3	to ask you the same question. I can understand the
4	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to	3 4	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the
4 5	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few	3 4 5	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a
4 5 6	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from	3 4 5 6	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make
4 5 6 7	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to	3 4 5 6 7	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer
4 5 6 7 8	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us	3 4 5 6 7 8	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any
4 5 6 7 8 9	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us
4 5 7 8 9 10	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves
4 5 7 8 9 10 11	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a	3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be,	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says –
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being responsible. [12:22] You were making sure that contend to lead your oath of ensuring that South Africans are safe and that you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner says, whatever he says is it going to help us to say what we will have to say in due course about that speech? It will be dealt with in arguments by the parties, but isn't
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being responsible. [12:22] You were making sure that contend to lead your oath of ensuring that South Africans are safe and that you equally a citizen of this country and safety starts with	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner says, whatever he says is it going to help us to say what we will have to say in due course about that speech? It will be dealt with in arguments by the parties, but isn't the matter really for evidence from a witness. Is it a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being responsible. [12:22] You were making sure that contend to lead your oath of ensuring that South Africans are safe and that you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner says, whatever he says is it going to help us to say what we will have to say in due course about that speech? It will be dealt with in arguments by the parties, but isn't
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being responsible. [12:22] You were making sure that contend to lead your oath of ensuring that South Africans are safe and that you equally a citizen of this country and safety starts with	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner says, whatever he says is it going to help us to say what we will have to say in due course about that speech? It will be dealt with in arguments by the parties, but isn't the matter really for evidence from a witness. Is it a
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	us the sun today. I trust that you have had time just to brief because that is all you could do for the first few days. Did you get time to brief?" The answer coming from the crowd is No. "I did not hear you. Did you get time to brief?" Again a No. "I think first and foremost let us just be grateful that we still have," and then it's inaudible here, "time just to brief." It goes on to say, "I am here really to say to all of you stay strong. I'll start there by just saying stay strong. We recognise, as a leadership and as this country, that all you are going through very tough and trying times and very challenging times. I come before you to say trying as it may be, mourning as we are, let us take note of the fact that whatever happened represents the best of responsible policing. You did what you did because you were being responsible. [12:22] You were making sure that contend to lead your oath of ensuring that South Africans are safe and that you equally a citizen of this country and safety starts with you. So for you – so for that I just want once more to	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to ask you the same question. I can understand the question and why you ask it, but with great respect to the witness, is his answer going to help us very much? It's a matter upon which we may well be called upon to make comments and possibly make a finding, but is any answer that he gives, and I say this with – not that I mean any disrespect to him, something that's really going to help us to formulate such comments as we're going to make ourselves and it puts him in a very embarrassing position. Unless he says wholeheartedly he agrees with every word the minister says – the commissioner says, sorry. And he doesn't go that far then it could be very embarrassing, he might receive all sorts of repercussions for himself. I wonder whether it's a question that you really wish to persist in or wish to press as far as the witness, whatever he says – I'm getting it wrong. In relation to what the commissioner says, whatever he says is it going to help us to say what we will have to say in due course about that speech? It will be dealt with in arguments by the parties, but isn't the matter really for evidence from a witness. Is it a matter in which his expertise which justifies him to give

	Page 3702		Page 3704
1	evidence even if Mr Semenya - and then the question can be	1	MS JELE: Indeed, the title is – I'm
2	asked of her.	2	referring to the file – the pdf file that's electronic, but
3	MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, this is	3	shooting incident report. Do you have it Brigadier?
4	another example of the difficulties we had faced under	4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it thank you.
5	these circumstances. I sincerely look forward to further	5	MS JELE: You will notice that it's put
6	evidence from SAPS with respect to the events at	6	together by Captain Govender.
7	Potchefstroom and any other debriefing process that did or	7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, it's
8	did not take place so that we might ask pertinent questions	8	inquiry.
9	at that stage.	9	MS JELE: And the office of the station
10	CHAIRPERSON: I'm told by Mr Semenya, he	10	commander at Marikana Police Station.
11	conceded as I understand it, the review envisaged in the	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
12	standing order hadn't taken place. He conceded that. So	12	MS JELE: You will also see it is dated
13	we don't need to spend any more time on that. The	13	17 August 2012.
14	relevance of your question relates to the comments made by	14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
15	the commissioner in the absence of such a debriefing and	15	MS JELE: It is also addressed to the
16	review process, but that's more for a matter of argument.	16	provincial commissioner as well as the cluster commander,
17	Alternatively a matter to ask her about when she gives	17	Rustenburg Cluster.
18	evidence. If she gives evidence.	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
19	MS JELE: Chairperson, certainly we	19	MS JELE: Significantly, Brigadier, you
20	accept that Potchefstroom is the process seemingly that the	20	will see that in the first paragraph reference is made not
21	location at which and these 9 days are the time at which	21	only to the shooting incident of 16 August 2012, but also
22	certain amount of analysis have been made and we do look	22	to the fact that it involved and I quote "unknown members
23	forward to having evidence in that respect. To the extent	23	of the SAPS".
24	that this is the only evidence that we had at present of	24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
25	any statement relating to the specific functions of the	25	MS JELE: If I were to scroll down to
1	Page 3703 Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would	1	Page 3705 paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who
1 2		1 2	5
	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would		paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who
2	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for	2	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they
2	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand	2 3	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a
2 3 4	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties.	2 3 4	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative.
2 3 4 5	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this	2 3 4 5	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
2 3 4 5 6	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on	2 3 4 5 6	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question?	2 3 4 5 6 7	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called. MS PILLAY: Shooting report is the title	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would like to comment properly as you asked me the questions and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called. MS PILLAY: Shooting report is the title in the file.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would like to comment properly as you asked me the questions and I understand as I'm seeing from the beginning this side, it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called. MS PILLAY: Shooting report is the title in the file. MS JELE: Would it be WW7, Ms Pillay?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would like to comment properly as you asked me the questions and I understand as I'm seeing from the beginning this side, it shows unknown members of the SAPS and it goes down as it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called. MS PILLAY: Shooting report is the title in the file. MS JELE: Would it be WW7, Ms Pillay? MS PILLAY: Yes, WW7.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would like to comment properly as you asked me the questions and I understand as I'm seeing from the beginning this side, it shows unknown members of the SAPS and it goes down as it indicating that it would be provided this time to the legal
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Brigadier in terms specifically of what focus would recommendations in going future. That's was the reason for the showing of this particular video clip, but I understand the chairperson's difficulties. CHAIRPERSON: The commissioner made this speech on the 20th of August which is before the Potchefstroom process took place in any event. But in the circumstances I take it you don't press – don't insist on the witness giving the answer to the question? MS JELE: I don't, no, Chairperson. Thank you. I would now like to turn and I'm hoping my colleagues will be happy with me considering the time, to the last document I'd like to refer you to, Brigadier. It's the shooting report compiled by Govender and sufficient copies for both the evidence leader, yourself and the commissioners were provided to Ms Pillay by Ms Hardy yesterday. CHAIRPERSON: Ms Pillay – what's it called. MS PILLAY: Shooting report is the title in the file. MS JELE: Would it be WW7, Ms Pillay?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	paragraph 1.2, it's indicated that once these members who were involved in the incident had been identified, they will be informed, for example, of their right to consult a legal representative. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MS JELE: In your experience, such a shooting incident report would only refer to those facts that are available at the time it was drafted would it not, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Can you repeat your question please? MS JELE: Captain Govender would only write anything in this report that he knows and has been established at that time, would he not? For example if he has not had the opportunity to identify the members involved in the shooting incident, he therefore coincidentally also would not have had an opportunity to discuss these incidents with them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, advocate, I would like to comment properly as you asked me the questions and I understand as I'm seeing from the beginning this side, it shows unknown members of the SAPS and it goes down as it

	Page 3706	1	Page 3708
1	everything, I can be able to understand what he was this	1	officials acted in self defence. When you have had
2	thing all about. Here we talk about Marikana, now we are	2	opportunity to review incidents such as this, would you not
3	at a police station. This matter that brought us here, it is a provincial issue which ended becoming a national	3 4	consider it inappropriate to come to such a conclusion
4 5	issue. So for me really to have comment to a station issue	4 5	having not so much as identified members involved? CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya has indicated he
6	now because it was – it started in a cluster, it has moved	6	wishes to say something.
7	to provincial, moved to a national. Now I've got this	7	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the opinion of
8	statement now, I must comment in this way. It gives me a	, 8	this witness about an opinion of another witness is
9	problem really. I don't understand how we end up in this	9	entirely unhelpful.
10	position. I'm not sure. So I can't comment properly into	, 10	CHAIRPERSON: I'm inclined to uphold that
11	this document. Because really, with due respect, Advocate,	11	objection unless you can argue to the contrary. It's a
12	it's my first time now to see strictly a letter from the	12	matter obviously we'll have to decide and again I say,
13	station and we have been engaging here with an issue which		without any disrespect to the Brigadier, whatever he says
14	is a national issue Marikana and I believe if it is a	14	will be his opinion. It's not necessarily a matter in
15	statement by the member, the member will be in a position	15	which he has any special expertise. His opinion will take
16	to answer the question here why it was still unknown. For	16	the matter no further than that of other people. We will
17	me to come forward now and criticise these and say how it	17	ultimately be called upon to make a finding and we will
18	was supposed to be – really I feel strongly that it's	18	have the benefit of argument from counsel but I'm not sure
19	uncalled for. It will be difficult.	19	that anything that he may say on the point will assist us
20	MS JELE: Perhaps we shall have the	20	one way or another in coming to the conclusion which we may
21	opportunity during the preferring of SAPS' evidence to	21	be asked to come to.
22	establish the true context of this document but what I	22	MS JELE: Again, the difficulty of when
23	would like to ask you at this specific stage, since you	23	what evidence has been preferred, chairperson, to the
24	were at one time responsible for looking into – for my	24	excepts that SAPS provided this document among the bundles
25	present purposes, Brigadier, if I might ask you to just	25	of documents that they provided, the assumption we made and
	Page 3707		Page 3709
1	Page 3707 read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of	1	Page 3709 it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was
1 2	8	1 2	5
	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of		it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was
2	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass	2	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in
2 3	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at	2 3	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this
2 3 4	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed	2 3 4	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going
2 3 4 5	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was	2 3 4 5	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that,
2 3 4 5 6	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have	2 3 4 5 6	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis Park and Marikana, would you not consider it entirely	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be in a position to comment, at the very least, on their place
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis Park and Marikana, would you not consider it entirely inappropriate for anyone whether or not this particular	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis Park and Marikana, would you not consider it entirely inappropriate for anyone whether or not this particular document, accepting that it reflects the conclusions of an	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be in a position to comment, at the very least, on their place value or on his opinion thereof, I accept the chairperson's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis Park and Marikana, would you not consider it entirely inappropriate for anyone whether or not this particular document, accepting that it reflects the conclusions of an individual who may or may not festify, but seemingly does	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be in a position to comment, at the very least, on their place value or on his opinion thereof, I accept the chairperson's – [12:42] CHAIRPERSON: Marginally that may be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	read the paragraph at 2.1.1 entitled a short description of the incident without unnecessary repetition of other facts. Can you see that? It is a paragraph that reads "on Thursday, 2012-08-16, from approximately 7 there was a mass gathering of striking Lonmin employees at a koppie at Middlekraal near Village, Wonderkop. The group was armed with dangerous weapons and firearms. The group was identified to be violent and in the past few days have murdered, assaulted and brutally attacked several other persons. They were given a warning to hand over all weapons and to disperse from the area they were gathered at. At 15:45 the police officials took action to disperse the mob. The mob charged the police officials with firearms and dangerous weapons. The police officials acted in self defence. In the process several persons were killed and injured". You saw that paragraph, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I see it, ja. MS JELE: Brigadier, in your previous position being responsible for reporting and providing recommendations as a result of events such as, again, Ellis Park and Marikana, would you not consider it entirely inappropriate for anyone whether or not this particular document, accepting that it reflects the conclusions of an	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	it might be an incorrect assumption, I accept that, was that this is a document that they took into account in assessing the events of Marikana themselves and in preparing for this event and to the extent – CHAIRPERSON: - I don't know how this witness's answer to the question you've asked him is going to help us. I mean there are a number of questions that, in my mind, occur from a perusal of this document and one of the issues may be that initially there was a failure by the police to indicate that there already were two scenes or two phases of what happened and this document may well afford some support for that suggestion. But that's a matter that can be looked at, at the appropriate time, but I'm not sure, with respect, the Brigadier's going to help us one way or another. MS JELE: I suppose, Chairperson, I had assumed that the Brigadier, having participated on his examination in chief in formulating the recommendations and the lessons for the future that we have been discussing, that he would have come across some of the documents and be in a position to comment, at the very least, on their place value or on his opinion thereof, I accept the chairperson's

-			
	Page 3710		Page 3712
1 I would have thought that mor		1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, maybe if
2 those lines can be asked of oth		2	I may explain, what I mean on that is that when we talk
3 possibly, but I don't propose to		3	about well-organised marches or gathering, it's where we
4 with this particular question. I	suggest you move on to	4	will have to ensure that the organisers' proper
5 the next question.		5	consultation with the communities around where the whole
	ciate that, Chairperson,	6	event they will take place, they are informed, they know
7 and in that case might I state t		7	what is happening. If there shops or whatever, we know
8 for the Brigadier. What we wo		8	exactly how to deal with that, meaning business people
9 dealt with in the upcoming mee	•	9	there, they are involved, they know that there will be a
10 when we might expect the furt	her evidence that seemingly is	10	march and if anything happens how to assist on that to make
11 relevant.		11	sure there are no looting or anything. So that's how we
	'ou don't have to make a	12	actually - here.
13 speech at this point. Thank yo		13	MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier,
14 MR NCONGWANE SC:	Chair, it's me Chair on	14	for that clarification, and what is specifically on record
15 behalf of the Bapo Ba Mogale r	5 5	15	from your examination and throughout the course of your
	ou indicated to me	16	testimony is that there would be opening of dialogue or
17 yesterday that you -		17	discussions with the leaders of march, not so?
18 MR NCONGWANE SC:	That's correct, Chair.	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
	Put yourself on record, in	19	MR NCONGWANE SC: And largely there will
20 case you're not on record. Has	•	20	be involved discussions with the community, not so?
21 representation by your client –		21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally there are
22 MR NCONGWANE SC:		22	leaders that lead in that particular march or in that
	5	23	gathering. Obviously there will be some interaction.
24 then proceed with your question	-	24	MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, you must be
25 there anyone else who wants t	o ask questions as well? And	25	well aware that predominantly the community around
	Page 3711		Page 3713
1 I suggest possibly – I take it M	r Tip won't mind if you sit	1	Wonderkop is a traditional community?
2 next to him, you'll then be able	to see the witness better	2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got that
3 and he'll be able to see you bet	tter. You will be the last	3	information.
4 cross-examiner, will you?		4	MR NCONGWANE SC: Invariably this
5 MR NCONGWANE SC:	Thank you, Mr Chairman	5	traditional community would have traditional leaders.
6 and the commissioners. My na	me is Tami Ncongwane. I'm	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I agree with that. It
7 appearing on behalf of the roya	al family of Bapo Ba Mogale.	7	should be like that.
8 I'm assisted by Karabo Kgoroea	adira – Advocate Karabo	8	MR NCONGWANE SC: Those traditional
9 Kgoroeadira and Advocate Lizzy	y Boloyi-Mere. And we are	9	leaders, Brigadier, will fall within the category of the
10 also assisted by the attorneys,	Mr Kgomo – Obakeng Kgomo,	10	leaders you've referred to which, or i.e. the leaders with
11 as well as Elson Kgaka. Good o	day, Brigadier.	11	whom dialogues or discussions would be opened with them?
12 BRIG MKHWANAZI:	Good day.	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Normally, as I said,
13 MR NCONGWANE SC:	Brigadier, I'm	13	there will be leaders for that particular group or people
14 obviously going to exhaust you	any further than it's	14	who are going to march and obviously will be some questions
15 necessary. The issue on which	I intend to question you,	15	asked if all people involved knows about that particular
16 Brigadier, is quite limited, and i	it relates to the	16	march that is going to take place. Obviously they can be
17 involvement of local community	y as one of your techniques	17	on board sometime, or it can happen that they can be
18 that are to be used by the POP		18	informed. That's how it goes.
19That particular issue, Br	igadier, you'll recall	19	MR NCONGWANE SC: If I understand your
20 it has already been canvassed I		20	testimony well, Brigadier, the leaders you're referring to
21 Lawyers for Human Rights, and	the nub of its relevance when	21	with whom negotiations will be held, would also include the
		22	traditional leaders?
22 it was canvassed is when you r	eadily admitted that indeed	22	li autional leauers?
it was canvassed is when you rthe local community must be in	1 1 - 11 4	22 23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will explain
23 the local community must be in24 management control strategies	nvolved in the crowd		
23 the local community must be in	that are perceived by the	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, I will explain

1	Page 3714		Page 3716
1	we work in accordance with that; that we will have a	1	then, Brigadier, in the event – let's accept or
2	meeting, as I said, it must be well planned march or a	2	hypothetically accept that it did not happen, would you
3	gathering. If it's well planned, we'll have leaders who	3	then agree that this would amount to a fundamental omission
4	will be leading that particular march. Obviously, we will	4	of one of your vital considerations in the implementation
5	look to other people as well who can be involved, attached,	5	by the POP of its plan?
6	depending where the march will be. We will ask questions	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will be maybe making a
7	on that, as I made an example about business people around	7	mistake if I can say yes again or no into that question,
8	the area where the march will take place or the gathering	8	because, as I've said, I'm not sure, hence this matter
9	will be to make sure everybody understands what's going to	9	started from the cluster, building up provincially and
10	happen at that particular time.	10	nationally as well. I'm not sure what had happened there.
11	It's obvious if definitely it has to go to that	11	If I can now come up and say they never done or they did,
12	extent that the leaders in the community at that level,	12	as you say now maybe let's say they never done, I don't
13	traditionally if there's a need that they can be involved	13	think it would be fair for me to come up and say, yes, they
14	or informed, they will be informed, if it comes to that	14	never done, if they never done, they did wrong.
15	position.	15	CHAIRPERSON: No, no, I'm sorry,
16	MR NCONGWANE SC: Have you established as	16	Brigadier, I don't think that's the question. The question
17	to whether in this particular case, taking into the events	17	is if – what counsel wants to know is that if they made no
18	that led to the shooting on the 16th of August, have you	18	attempt to involve the traditional leaders in the area,
19	established as to whether the traditional leaders might	19	would that be an omission. I think – obviously you don't
20	have played a positive role in assisting the quelling of	20	know whether they did or they didn't, but he says if they
21	the insurrection?	21	didn't, would be an omission. I think that's the question.
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, really I haven't	22	Is that correct?
23	established that. Since we started with this whole	23	MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr
24	situation, I couldn't maybe have any situation whereby I	24	Chairman.
25	find out whether they were involved or whether is there any	25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Chairperson, I do agree
1	Page 3715	1	Page 3717
1	contribution they made into this, I didn't find out.	1	or understand, but I have a problem with this type of
2	MR NCONGWANE SC: Well, Brigadier, from	2	question, because at the end of the day it's like I concede
	your evidence and from the documentation made available by	3 4	and really I have a problem on that. I cannot just say
4	SAPS, it's explicit that there was no attempt at all to	4	was it was going to be like that I'm soving clearly the
1 h	implement a vital consideration of the stops that inter		yes, it was going to be like that. I'm saying clearly the
5	implement a vital consideration of the steps that, inter	5	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national.
6	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the	5 6	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a
6 7	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that	5 6 7	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with
6 7 8	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition?	5 6 7 8	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be
6 7 8 9	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be	5 6 7 8 9	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really
6 7 8 9 10	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it	5 6 7 8 9 10	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed,
6 7 8 9 10 11	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were
6 7 8 9 10 11 12	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done,	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede
6 7 8 9 10 11	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was	5 6 7 8 9 10 11	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it.
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well,
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know. Presumably there will be other witnesses called by SAPS who were directly involved to whom you can address that	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well, living in hostels or in shacks in the vicinity. What
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know.	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well, living in hostels or in shacks in the vicinity. What allegiance they owed, if any, to the local traditional
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know. Presumably there will be other witnesses called by SAPS who were directly involved to whom you can address that question if he tells you he doesn't know. He was in	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well, living in hostels or in shacks in the vicinity. What
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	 alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know. Presumably there will be other witnesses called by SAPS who were directly involved to whom you can address that question if he tells you he doesn't know. He was in Kimberley at the time. 	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well, living in hostels or in shacks in the vicinity. What allegiance they owed, if any, to the local traditional leaders and what contact they had with them, what influence
6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	alia, to be taken by the POP in the involvement of the traditional community at Wonderkop. Do you accept that proposition? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Advocate, it would be difficult for me to say yes or no. I'm not sure, hence it may happen that maybe it was done, but from my side I never established that part, but it may happen that it was done, but I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. I cannot definitely say it was not done. I'm not sure about it. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, just the proposition I make to you, which a submission will be made to the Commission, that there was no attempt at all. CHAIRPERSON: He doesn't know. Presumably there will be other witnesses called by SAPS who were directly involved to whom you can address that question if he tells you he doesn't know. He was in Kimberley at the time. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman,	5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	matter started from the cluster, provincial to national. I'm not sure what happened around that. If there was a need that the traditional leaders must be informed with what is taking place within the area, they will be informed. I think so. If they were not informed, really somebody will come forward and say they were not informed, but for me to sit here and say it was wrong if they were not informed, tomorrow I concede. I cannot concede something I don't know. I was not part of that. I don't know about it. CHAIRPERSON: Now, there are factors as well of course, because according to the evidence many, if not all of the rock drill operators were migrant labourers from – in most cases from Pondoland, in some cases from Lesotho and a few other neighbouring territories as well, living in hostels or in shacks in the vicinity. What allegiance they owed, if any, to the local traditional leaders and what contact they had with them, what influence the local traditional leaders had over them, these are all

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

	Page 3718		Page 3720
1	to know the answer to, before you could even begin to	1	CHAIRPERSON: I can't say -
2	comment on the question that's being asked. Is that	2	MR MADLANGA SC: What I will do,
3	correct?	3	Chairman, is to talk to them again and ask them to arrange
4	[13:02] BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't have really any	4	that other room. Then at twenty five past I will indicate
5	information on that.	5	to colleagues whether we are going there or whether the
6	CHAIRPERSON: Do you have more questions?	6	venue is somewhere else.
7	And if so is it appropriate for us to take the lunch	7	CHAIRPERSON: Otherwise we will have to
8	adjournment or is there a couple of questions you want to	8	have the meeting here.
9	ask it and it would be the end of your cross-examination,	9	MR MADLANGA SC: Yes.
10	you can ask them now but if you are going to be longer then	10	CHAIRPERSON: Obviously closed.
11	you can resume after the lunch adjournment.	11	MR MADLANGA SC: Yes.
12	MR NCONGWANE SC: Chair, I think the	12	CHAIRPERSON: The members of the public
13	question might take a little bit more say to about 10 to 15	13	won't be able to be present. Alright, at this point we
14	minutes and I would suggest that it would perhaps be better	14	will adjourn, take the lunch adjournment. We will resume
15	that we all be fortified.	15	at some time after 2 o'clock when the meeting to which I
16	CHAIRPERSON: That sounds sensible. We	16	have referred to, has taken place.
17	will now take the adjournment, the lunch adjournment. At	17	[COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]
18	half past 1 there will be a meeting between the	18	[15:18] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes. I
19	Commissioners, the evidence leaders and representatives of	19	apologise to those who've been waiting for the, those in
20	the parties, in the, it's the room next door, nearby which	20	the auditorium who were waiting for the Commission to
21	Mr Madlanga will be able to indicate to the parties. I	21	continue. We had a meeting, a very important meeting, with
22	don't know how long the meeting will be, it's to consider	22	the representatives of the parties to chart the way forward
23	the way forward particularly in the light of the extension	23	and work out ways of making sure that the Commission works
24	of the period of operation of the commission, but as soon	24	efficiently and makes maximum use of the time available.
25	as it's, the meeting is completed we will then resume in	25	That's the reason for the delay, but I apologise to those
			······
	Page 3719		Page 3721
1	Page 3719 the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness	1	Page 3721 who've been waiting all this time.
1 2		1 2	
_	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness		who've been waiting all this time.
2	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this?	2	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were
2	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after	2	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very
2 3 4	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this?	2 3 4	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was
2 3 4 5	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will.	2 3 4 5	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time.
2 3 4 5 6	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness -	2 3 4 5 6	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under
2 3 4 5 6 7	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has	2 3 4 5 6 7	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	 who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	 who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you Commissioners, may I request colleagues to be here in the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and I'm doing this in order to ascertain if we share the same
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you Commissioners, may I request colleagues to be here in the auditorium at twenty five past 1 instead of going to that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and I'm doing this in order to ascertain if we share the same understanding by what you mean as a community in this
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you Commissioners, may I request colleagues to be here in the auditorium at twenty five past 1 instead of going to that room? When I requested the administrative staff to arrange for that room, they said that the Commissioners has indicated that we would meet here and that the room would	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and I'm doing this in order to ascertain if we share the same understanding by what you mean as a community in this particular circumstances. Brigadier, around Wonderkop, which is the Marikana area popularly known, there are migrant workers residing around the area from other
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you Commissioners, may I request colleagues to be here in the auditorium at twenty five past 1 instead of going to that room? When I requested the administrative staff to arrange for that room, they said that the Commissioners has indicated that we would meet here and that the room would just be cleared, that is the auditorium would just be	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and I'm doing this in order to ascertain if we share the same understanding by what you mean as a community in this particular circumstances. Brigadier, around Wonderkop, which is the Marikana area popularly known, there are
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	the auditorium with the cross-examination of the witness and his re-examination. I don't know how long that will take. Mr Tip, you are going to call the witness after this? MR TIP SC: Yes, I will. CHAIRPERSON: Is your witness - MR TIP SC: After the re-examination has been done. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, yes, obviously. MR TIP SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: And we don't know how long that will be. But your witness is ready with bat in hand and padded and so on, ready to face such bowling as he may have to face? MR TIP SC: Yes, he is ready for any bowling at all, Chair, yes. CHAIRPERSON: Right. MR MADLANGA SC: Through you Commissioners, may I request colleagues to be here in the auditorium at twenty five past 1 instead of going to that room? When I requested the administrative staff to arrange for that room, they said that the Commissioners has indicated that we would meet here and that the room would	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	who've been waiting all this time. I apologise to those in the auditorium who were waiting for us to resume. We had a lengthy but very profitable meeting. You were one of those who was inconvenienced and had to wait for a long time. I apologise to you also. I remind you, you're still under oath, and you're going to cross-examine, continue your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, when we adjourned your evidence, which I appreciate, is that you were not aware whether the traditional community was consulted or not. Correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, I indicated that I never have an opportunity to get that part to say whether they were actually part of the process that was taking place. MR NCONGWANE SC: Let me just piggyback on your indication that the community must be involved, and I'm doing this in order to ascertain if we share the same understanding by what you mean as a community in this particular circumstances. Brigadier, around Wonderkop, which is the Marikana area popularly known, there are migrant workers residing around the area from other

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

1	Page 3722	1	Page 3724
1	MR NCONGWANE SC: There are families of	1	the 9th and the 16th of August last year – there were in
2	those migrant workers as well, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	2	the past violent incidents that occurred around Wonderkop.
3		3	Are you aware of that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I have been briefed that
4	MR NCONGWANE SC: And then there's an	4	
5	indigenous traditional community.	5	there were some other issues that took place prior the
6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.	6	11th, that took place. I'm not sure if we'll be talking
7	MR NCONGWANE SC: My understanding, and	7	about the same thing. MR NCONGWANE SC: Evidence will be led in
8	in fact those are my instructions, are that all of those	8 9	
9	would form part of the traditional community in its		this Commission that there were instances of unrest in
10	entirety. Do you dispute that?	10	August 2011. Did you hear anything about that?
11	MR MAHLANGU: Do I understand, the	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I may not be sure. As I
12	migrant workers together with the indigenous, with the	12	said, I heard there were some before, but I'm not sure
13	local people forming – you say they form one community?	13	about the date precisely to say which one we may actually
14 15	CHAIRPERSON: That is to say they form an	14	refer to, but I know there were some other incident that
15	indigenous community, is that correct? Or traditional	15	took place prior the 11th.
16	community.	16	MR NCONGWANE SC: And the evidence would
17	MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr	17	also be to an indication that those unrests also would
18	Chairman.	18	refer to ones which occurred on the 7th of March 2012, and
19	CHAIRPERSON: Indigenous?	19	the 10th of July 2012. Are you aware of those?
20	MR NCONGWANE SC: Indigenous community,	20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Are we talking about
21	that's right.	21	2012?
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: According to	22	MR NCONGWANE SC: Correct, 2012.
23	information, yes.	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It may happen that maybe
24	MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, may I just	24	it can be one of those, but I can't say yes or no, but I
25	correct just one understanding? My learned junior has just	25	heard that there were some of the incidents that took
		1	
1	Page 3723	1	Page 3725
1	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the	1	place, unrest, before that.
2	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the	2	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this
2 3	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the	2 3	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It
2 3 4	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants.	2 3 4	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they
2 3	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking?	2 3	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I
2 3 4 5	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes.	2 3 4 5	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the
2 3 4 5 6 7	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa	2 3 4 5 6	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression
2 3 4 5 6	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people?	2 3 4 5 6 7	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be reference to the subjects, those people who are allegiant	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or indirectly then it's relevant. I'm just saying to you, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be reference to the subjects, those people who are allegiant to the Bapo Ba Mogale Royal Family. Do you understand	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or indirectly then it's relevant. I'm just saying to you, the mere fact that there was unrest doesn't in itself per se
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be reference to the subjects, those people who are allegiant to the Bapo Ba Mogale Royal Family. Do you understand that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or indirectly then it's relevant. I'm just saying to you, the mere fact that there was unrest doesn't in itself per se lead to a finding of relevance, but I'm not saying it's not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be reference to the subjects, those people who are allegiant to the Bapo Ba Mogale Royal Family. Do you understand that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or indirectly then it's relevant. I'm just saying to you, the mere fact that there was unrest doesn't in itself per se lead to a finding of relevance, but I'm not saying it's not irrelevant, I'm just saying when you tender the evidence
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	brought it to my attention that my question regarding the indigenous community in fact is with reference to the indigenous traditional community. Put it differently, the indigenous inhabitants. CHAIRPERSON: Is that Tswana speaking? MR NCONGWANE SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: As opposed to the isiXhosa and Sesotho speaking people? MR NCONGWANE SC: That will be so. CHAIRPERSON: It will also be siSwati as well, by anyway. The Sesotho and isiXhosa [inaudible] are migrant labourers. Your question relates to the Setswana people who owe allegiance to the royal family for whom you appear. Is that right? MR NCONGWANE SC: That's correct, Mr Chairman. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: And that would be reference to the subjects, those people who are allegiant to the Bapo Ba Mogale Royal Family. Do you understand that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that. MR NCONGWANE SC: Now I don't know if	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	place, unrest, before that. CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that this evidence will be relevant. You say it will be led. It will only be led if you satisfy me it's relevant. If they will definitely involve the rock drill operators, I probably won't allow it, but anyway, carry on in the meanwhile. I don't want to give you the false impression that the evidence will necessarily be admitted – it may not be. I understand there'd been unrest in the area. Whether in the past, whether it relates to the rock drill operators and their particular grievances which are the subject of the present inquiry, is not clear, but please bear that in mind when you continue with your cross-examination. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, we're of the view that the relevancy would in fact be covered by the term of reference which provides for events or factors that may directly or indirectly have led to – CHAIRPERSON: If it led directly or indirectly then it's relevant. I'm just saying to you, the mere fact that there was unrest doesn't in itself per se lead to a finding of relevance, but I'm not saying it's not irrelevant, I'm just saying when you tender the evidence you'll have to satisfy us that it's relevant and we may or

Page 3726	Page 372
1 it's not self-evident that it's relevant I just ask you to	1 planned gatherings, marches, always will have proper
2 bear that in mind with the questions you ask.	2 identification of the role players who're supposed to be
3 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.	3 part and be notified. So if it never happened really, I
4 We'll make sure we keep that at the forefront of our	4 won't have an idea on that why, hence really I was not
5 forehead. Brigadier, we know that from your evidence and	5 there definitely into a lot of these things.
6 from the standing orders that community involvement is	6 MR NCONGWANE SC: That tendency,
7 paramount in the implementation of your POP, not so?	7 Brigadier, from the members of the POP was maintained
8 BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. In all	8 throughout from the 9th until the occurrence of the fatal
 9 issues of policy, community must be involved. 	9 shooting on the 16th. Any comment on that?
10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Now you may not be in a	10 CHAIRPERSON: The witness has already
11 position to give a positive answer to my next question,	11 said over and over again, he doesn't know anything about
12 because my next question is that during those unrests which	12 this. He can't comment on it. So what's the point of
13 I've referred to earlier, there was a consistent and	13 continuing to asking him questions about something he
14 systematic disregard of any required negotiation with the	14 already said he knows nothing about? You may well have a
15 traditional community. Do you know anything about that?	15 witness who does know something about it to whom you ca
16 And that will be by the other units of the police service.	16 ask the question, but I understand why you want to ask the
17 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't have a knowledge	17 questions, why you contend they're relevant, but it doesn't
18 of that. What I know is that there is a cluster with the	18 help to ask questions of a witness who's not able to answer
19 station; if we talk about issues that emanate within the	19 them because he doesn't know.
20 community, the station definitely will have to involve the	20 MR NCONGWANE SC: Well, Mr Chair, the
21 members or the role, the main role players of the community	21 witness has only given an answer only in respect of the
22 if there is a need into that. But for me to say it was	22 date of the 9th.
23 done or not done, I cannot say really. I would say maybe	23 CHAIRPERSON: I hear what you say, you
24 they can be in a better position to indicate whether they	24 understand the point that's being made that over this whole
25 have neglected that part. I'm not sure about it.	25 period their traditional leaders weren't involved in any
25 have neglected that part. This hot sure about it.	
Page 3727	Page 372
1 MR NCONGWANE SC: Well, I put it to you	1 way in attempts to resolve the issues. Do you know
2 that it did not happen.	2 anything about that?
3 CHAIRPERSON: What's the point of putting	3 [15:38] BRIG MKHWANAZI: I have no knowledge,
4 to him it didn't happen if he doesn't know anything about	4 Chairperson.
5 it? If he says it did happen you could then put it to him	
	5 MR NCONGWANE SC: Brigadier, as is
o il gigni, pul il ne says ne goesn't know anything about	3
 6 it didn't, but if he says he doesn't know anything about 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 	6 required by your standing orders the traditional
7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it?	6 required by your standing orders the traditional7 community's contention is that there would've been of
7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it?8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests.
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that,
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZ1: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 16 answer one way or the other. 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that.
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 16 answer one way or the other. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier.
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 16 answer one way or the other. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. 18 Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of -
 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please proceed to your next question. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a witness is called. But my only point is it's no use putting it to this witness because he can't give you an answer one way or the other. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect,
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 16 answer one way or the other. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. 18 Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of -
 7 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? 8 I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please 9 proceed to your next question. 10 MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is 11 purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. 12 CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the 13 question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a 14 witness is called. But my only point is it's no use 15 putting it to this witness because he can't give you an 16 answer one way or the other. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. 18 Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about 19 this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect,
 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please proceed to your next question. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a witness is called. But my only point is it's no use putting it to this witness because he can't give you an answer one way or the other. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the traditional leaders of the traditional community at 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect, 20 no. These are the dangerous sweeping statements that are
 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please proceed to your next question. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a witness is called. But my only point is it's no use putting it to this witness because he can't give you an answer one way or the other. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the traditional leaders of the traditional community at Wonderkop regarding the events that occurred from the 9th 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect, 20 no. These are the dangerous sweeping statements that are 21 made by counsel that the community's consultation would'vertee
 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please proceed to your next question. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a witness is called. But my only point is it's no use putting it to this witness because he can't give you an answer one way or the other. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the traditional leaders of the traditional community at Wonderkop regarding the events that occurred from the 9th of August. You dispute that? 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect, 10 no. These are the dangerous sweeping statements that are 21 made by counsel that the community's consultation would've 22 had a huge assistance to the operation and they're not told
 it, what's the point of putting anything to him about it? I think that's an unnecessary waste of time, but please proceed to your next question. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chairman, it is purely with a view to argue it at a later stage. CHAIRPERSON: Certainly you can put the question to a witness who's able to deal with it, if such a witness is called. But my only point is it's no use putting it to this witness because he can't give you an answer one way or the other. MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. Brigadier, you probably again might not know anything about this. There has been a systematic exclusion of the traditional leaders of the traditional community at Wonderkop regarding the events that occurred from the 9th of August. You dispute that? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: I'm not in a position 	 6 required by your standing orders the traditional 7 community's contention is that there would've been of 8 future systems had they been given an opportunity by havin 9 doors opened for them for the dialogue to be put in place 10 regarding those unrests. 11 BRIG MKHWANAZ1: I do not dispute that, 12 Advocate. The only thing I'm saying I'm not having a clear 13 answer if they were supposed to be involved why they were 14 not involved. I have a hope that those were involved with 15 the planning and everything. They are in a better position 16 to answer on that. 17 MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Brigadier. 18 Mr Chair, that's the end of - 19 MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. With respect, 10 no. These are the dangerous sweeping statements that are 11 made by counsel that the community's consultation would've 12 had a huge assistance to the operation and they're not told 23 one detail about how what assistance it is and how huge it

-			
	Page 3730		Page 3732
1	able to deal with the point because he doesn't know	1	the community could've done which they were not permitted
2	anything about it anyway. So I suggested to counsel that	2	to do because the police didn't approach them. I take it
3	he ask the questions of where witness come we can deal with	3	you agree to all that, do you?
4	it.	4	MR NCONGWANE SC: That is so, Mr
5	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, if the proposition	5	Chairman. That's the correct.
6	is correct that the consultation of the community as	6	CHAIRPERSON: Now Mr Semenya is concerned
7	counsel is purporting to assert would have hugely changed	7	that because you put the allegation without any supporting
8	the circumstances that we are about. We need to know what	8	detail that the witness wasn't able to answer. The fact
9	those are. What assistance was available that the police	9	that you put the question it could go out into the world as
10	ignored. To just leave a sweeping statement like that is	10	the statement potentially damaging to his client unless you
11	very hurtful.	11	give some detail at this stage of what you say the
12	CHAIRPERSON: And that but the problem is	12	community could've done. I will give you an opportunity to
13	even if he puts the full detail, the witness will say I	13	indicate briefly what it is that you say your clients
14	know nothing about that. I can't answer one or the other.	14	could've done to deal with the problem and any - in other
15	But you've made your point which you can possibly deal with	15	words the particulars that Mr Semenya has requested.
16	in re-examination as well but your complaint is that	16	MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, I take it
17	counsel for the royal family hasn't given the necessary	17	that requires a response to that objection and which to cut
18	detail.	18	it to the chase, Mr Semenya has got the response right
19	MR SEMENYA SC: Correct, Chair.	19	within his own clients in the sense that there's a
20	CHAIRPERSON: The royal family are a	20	requirement to negotiate with the traditional leaders.
21	party to these proceedings. They were permitted to	21	CHAIRPERSON: What paragraph of the
22	participate and in terms of the meeting we had earlier	22	standing order are you referring to? The reason I asked
23	today, they have to indicate by the 25th what witnesses	23	you this is I couldn't see it but maybe it's there and I
24	they would like to call and by the 1st they have to give	24	missed it.
25	statements of what the witnesses will say. Now the	25	MR NCONGWANE SC: It's Exhibit SS2, Mr
20	statements of what the withesses will say. Now the	20	
	Page 3731		Page 3733
1	Page 3731 information that you seek will be available in that way. I	1	Page 3733 Chair, the standing order –
1 2	information that you seek will be available in that way. I	1 2	Chair, the standing order –
	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a		Chair, the standing order –
2	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full	2	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd
2 3	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no	2 3	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where
2 3 4	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and	2 3 4	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity
2 3 4 5 6	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get	2 3 4 5	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area?
2 3 4 5 6 7	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you	2 3 4 5 6 7	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the
2 3 4 5 6	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the	2 3 4 5 6	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross-	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub-
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross-examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross-examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross-examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, two points I would put to you. The one is I take it you're going to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262. CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph 14 is headed
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross-examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, two points I would put to you. The one is I take it you're going to give us notice by the 25th of what witnesses you propose to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262. CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph 14 is headed first member at the scene of unforeseen spontaneous
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, two points I would put to you. The one is I take it you're going to give us notice by the 25th of what witnesses you propose to call and by the 1st of February you will give us full	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262. CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph 14 is headed first member at the scene of unforeseen spontaneous gathering and it's only got two sub-paragraphs. So maybe
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, two points I would put to you. The one is I take it you're going to give us notice by the 25th of what witnesses you propose to call and by the 1st of February you will give us full statements of what your witnesses will say. I take it that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262. CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph 14 is headed first member at the scene of unforeseen spontaneous gathering and it's only got two sub-paragraphs. So maybe you're referring to some other standing order, but it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	information that you seek will be available in that way. I don't think it necessary for counsel to ask a question of a witness who knows nothing about it to then give full details of the matter by which the witness says he has no knowledge, but you will certainly get that knowledge and get that information by the 1st of February when you get the statement from the royal family. But saying what you said, you've indicated that the, I take it, that the allegation that has been put by counsel is not accepted by your client. Is that correct? MR SEMENYA SC: No, Chair. The cross- examination is predicated on saying there are – standing order 262 which requires you to engage with the community. Our community was not engaged. Had it been engaged it would have been of huge assistance and to leave it there. I'm not able to answer in what respect the police were remiss in not engaging with people who on, our argument later will show they were not part of the problem or part of the solution. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, two points I would put to you. The one is I take it you're going to give us notice by the 25th of what witnesses you propose to call and by the 1st of February you will give us full	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Chair, the standing order – CHAIRPERSON: Yes, SS2 is standing order general 262 of the South African Police, it's heading crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations. Now where in this standing order do we find a reference of necessity to liaise with the traditional leaders of the area? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's page 16, but the reference is not traditional leaders but it's referenced to leaders of community, Mr Chair, but – CHAIRPERSON: Page 16, my copies has only got 11 pages. What page are you – what paragraph are you referring to? MS PILLAY: Isn't it paragraph 3, sub- paragraph 3 that you're looking at, Counsel? CHAIRPERSON: Are you referring to the reference in para 33A to positive and constructive relationships to be built with event organisers, community leaders and non-governmental organisations? MR NCONGWANE SC: It's paragraph 14.1 of the standing order, G262. CHAIRPERSON: Paragraph 14 is headed first member at the scene of unforeseen spontaneous gathering and it's only got two sub-paragraphs. So maybe

		1	
1	Page 3734	1	Page 3736
1	order General 262 unless you're referring as I've said to the reference to in 33A to community leaders. You were	1	CHAIRPERSON: At one point you corrected
2	-	2	yourself and you said you had spoken to your junior and
3	asked to provide details of what you say the traditional	3	your junior had drawn your attention to something and you then reformulated your question and I understood the
4	leaders could've done and why - to prevent the problem and	4	
5	why it was remiss of the police not to consult with them or	5	reformulated question excluded the migrant labourers from
6	deal with them at all and you've given me – attempted to	6	the indigenous community. As I say if I misunderstood you,
7	give me references in the standing order which don't say	7	I apologise but that misunderstanding, if it did exist,
8	that, but you don't have to refer to the standing order,	8	doesn't help us in respect of the information that Mr
9	just tell me so that Mr Semenya has it on record what you	9	Semenya says he's entitled to get from you in order to
10	say your clients could've done which the police didn't ask	10	correct what he says is an unfortunate misleading and
11	them to do which led to the trouble. You must understand	11	potentially damaging suggestion in relation to his client.
12	that the way this commission works is counsel put	12	So ignore the misunderstanding between you and me for the
13	propositions to witnesses. For understandable reason, and	13	moment if there was one and just concentrate on giving the
14	I'm not criticising at all, the media then reports what's	14	point – answering the point that Mr Semenya raised.
15	put by counsel. Sometimes it turns out what was put by	15	MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, our
16	counsel can't be substantiated and counsel in fact	16	submission stemming from the evidence that will be led is
17	sometimes has to withdraw what was put, but in the	17	that the subjects of the traditional leadership around the
18	meanwhile a lot of damage is being done because the	18	community who have allegiance to that traditional
19	unsubstantiated statement that was put is all over the	19	leadership would have been in a position to be more willing
20	world and that's why Mr Semenya raises the point.	20	to listen to the traditional leaders if they had an
21	MR NCONGWANE SC: Well, Chair, in its	21 22	opportunity to communicate with them.
22	endeavour to promote public peace one will expect the	22	CHAIRPERSON: No, that isn't the point.
23 24	police to engage the traditional committee and our – CHAIRPERSON: The question asked is what	23 24	The point is the people who were on the koppie, who were
24 25	·	24 25	carrying the dangerous weapons, who were involved in the
20	could, in this particular case, the traditional community	20	police operation, who were also involved in what amounts to
	Page 3735		Page 3737
1	Page 3735 and its traditional leaders have done if the police had	1	Page 3737 a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill
1 2	Page 3735 and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom	1 2	
	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had		a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill
2	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom	2	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority
2 3	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are	2 3	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from
2 3 4	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the	2 3 4	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not
2 3 4 5	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant	2 3 4 5	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct
2 3 4 5 6	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community,	2 3 4 5 6	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local
2 3 4 5 6 7	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have	2 3 4 5 6 7	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do it. You said you had spoken to your junior and the light of what she put to you, you changed it and you excluded the migrant labourers. If I misunderstood you on that I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting as they did and – but Mr Semenya – you put effectively the contrary proposition and Mr Semenya says well what do you say your traditional – Setswana speaking traditional
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do it. You said you had spoken to your junior and the light of what she put to you, you changed it and you excluded the migrant labourers. If I misunderstood you on that I apologise, but I'm pretty clear that's what you said.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting as they did and – but Mr Semenya – you put effectively the contrary proposition and Mr Semenya says well what do you say your traditional – Setswana speaking traditional leaders could've done to prevent the trouble that arose
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do it. You said you had spoken to your junior and the light of what she put to you, you changed it and you excluded the migrant labourers. If I misunderstood you on that I apologise, but I'm pretty clear that's what you said. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, I think the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting as they did and – but Mr Semenya – you put effectively the contrary proposition and Mr Semenya says well what do you say your traditional – Setswana speaking traditional leaders could've done to prevent the trouble that arose between this group of migrant labourers on the one hand and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do it. You said you had spoken to your junior and the light of what she put to you, you changed it and you excluded the migrant labourers. If I misunderstood you on that I apologise, but I'm pretty clear that's what you said. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, I think the brigadier understood it to be meaning all inclusive to form	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting as they did and – but Mr Semenya – you put effectively the contrary proposition and Mr Semenya says well what do you say your traditional – Setswana speaking traditional leaders could've done to prevent the trouble that arose between this group of migrant labourers on the one hand and Lonmin and the police on the other. That's the point, is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24 25	and its traditional leaders have done if the police had consulted them to prevent 3 000 rock drillers, most of whom come from Pondoland and Lesotho and other place who are migrant labourers in the area and you yourself said the indigenous community does not include the migrant labourers. So what could the traditional community, particular to leaders, the royal family and others, have done to bring the dispute between the migrant labourer rock drill operators and the mining company to a peaceful conclusion? MR NCONGWANE SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. May I just start by making a correction on the statement that the Chairman made which appears arise out of a misunderstanding from what I said earlier. What I have proposed to the brigadier is that the traditional community would also include the migrant labourers. CHAIRPERSON: I'm sorry, I thought I understood you to say that initially and then you will do it. You said you had spoken to your junior and the light of what she put to you, you changed it and you excluded the migrant labourers. If I misunderstood you on that I apologise, but I'm pretty clear that's what you said. MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, I think the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	a wage dispute with their employer were rock drill operators and according to the evidence, the vast majority of them came from the Eastern Cape and some came from Lesotho and I think some came from Swaziland. It's not suggested, as I understand it, if I'm wrong you can correct me, but it's not suggested that there were any of the local people who were working as rock drill operators – I understood in fact from something I read that one of the complaints of your client was that the local people weren't given an opportunity to work at the mine in that way. But anyway that's a side issue. The point is if this is a – almost like a bubble of migrant labourers who are living in a Setswana speaking community but they are themselves come from a different group, they are as a unity, the people in the bubble, involved in a dispute with their employer and they take certain action. It's not self evident that the local traditional leaders to whom they owe no allegiance would be able to do anything to restrain them from acting as they did and – but Mr Semenya – you put effectively the contrary proposition and Mr Semenya says well what do you say your traditional – Setswana speaking traditional leaders could've done to prevent the trouble that arose between this group of migrant labourers on the one hand and

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

			in or inquiry Rustenbul
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3738 [15:58] MR NCONGWANE SC: Mr Chair, what we say is in fact, Mr Chair, there were members of the Tswana community around Wonderkop who also died at the shooting incident and who are, who were the miners at Lonmin. Although predominantly the people who are employed as miners at Lonmin are from other areas, Pondoland and the like, migrant labourers the traditional community as Bapo ba Mogale does have a fair number of people also employed at the mine and some of those people have actually died in unrest incidents that have occurred prior to the shooting of the 16th. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Ncongwane, did they die in the period from the 9th to the 16th of August? MR NGONGWANE SC: That is correct. CHAIRPERSON: They did?	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3740 this evidence, Mr Chair. MR SEMENYA SC: That's okay, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Are - MR NCONGWANE SC: I do, Chair. I don't know we are going to sit until when. CHAIRPERSON: Sorry, I know it's difficult to predict how long the questions and the answers will be but, how long do you think it would be? MR NCONGWANE SC: I would be surprised if I'm less than an hour. CHAIRPERSON: Well in that event I think we should take the adjournment. So the commission will adjourn until 9:30 tomorrow morning. I'm sorry Brigadier, that you have to come back again. I take it as a Brigadier you're not getting meaningful witness fees so we are
16 17 18 19	MR NGONGWANE SC: Yes. And these are incidences that are in fact the traditional core and the values of that community as a traditional community which are incidents which do not only happen once, they happen as	16 17 18 19	inconveniencing you for another day, I'm sorry about that but I'm afraid it's one of these things that happen. [COMMISSION ADJOURNED]
20 21 22 23	a chain of incidents which do not only happen once, they happen as a chain of incidents of unrest. The vital partner in terms of the standing orders and the evidence of the Brigadier there, we say the traditional leaders should have been involved at least in attempting to mediate the situation.	20 21 22 23	
24 25	CHAIRPERSON: Anything you want to add about that? Anything you want to add? Or is that it, is	24 25	· · ·
1 2 3	Page 3739 that what you are putting? MR NCONGWANE SC: I beg your pardon, Mr Chair?		
4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: Is there anything you want to add or is that what you are putting in response to Mr Semenya's query?		
7 8 9	MR NCONGWANE SC: That is what I'm putting to Mr - CHAIRPERSON: It sounds to me -		
10 11 12	MR NCONGWANE SC: Otherwise it would amount to me taking the stand. I don't wish to do that. CHAIRPERSON: No, I'm just asking, give		
13 14 15 16	details of what submission you put. It sounds to me as if you are substantially withdrawing the major part of what you put to the Brigadier. What was put to the Brigadier was that if the traditional authority had been given the		
16 17 18 19	was that if the traditional authority had been given the opportunity to do something, they could have made all the difference. I understand you now to modify that and to say that they could have at least done something which may well		
20 21 22	have assisted. Is that a fair summary? So you have restricted what you initially put, which I think goes quite fair to meet Mr Semenya's objection, is that correct?		
	MR NCONGWANE SC: Well as reformulated, Mr Chair, I would agree. It might be a correct reflection of that until, it will remain as one of those hanging until		

				Page
A	adjust 3655:10,14	analysed 3642:15	3687:16 3707:11	attached 3714:5
ability 3669:7,8	administrative 3719:21	3648:17,19,22	3714:8 3716:18	attacked 3707:9
able 3641:22 3644:9	admit 3725:24	analyses 3693:15	3717:8 3721:22,23	attempt 3715:4,17
3650:8,10 3653:10	admitted 3711:22	analysis 3647:9	3725:9 3733:6 3735:4	3716:18
3655:12 3656:10	3725:8	3702:22	areas 3658:15 3659:4	attempted 3734:6
3660:7,10 3675:19	admittedly 3663:16	Andries 3639:9	3664:23 3665:7,12,12	attempting 3738:23
3678:20,22 3679:3,12	Adv 3638:3 3684:7	3700:12	3665:14,15 3738:6	attempts 3729:1
3679:13 3681:23	advise 3649:6	and/or 3646:10 3650:4	argue 3708:11 3727:11	attend 3671:23 3687:2
3683:18 3686:12	advising 3666:5	3694:7	argument 3655:3	attending 3639:18,25
3688:19,25 3689:1,13	advocate 3648:16	answer 3639:22 3640:1	3702:16 3708:18	attention 3639:25
	3652:2 3654:16	3650:7 3657:19	3731:17	3640:11 3646:2
3691:2 3706:1 3711:2	3656:23 3666:12	3658:6,8,8,9 3659:22	arguments 3701:21	3663:18 3723:1
3711:3 3718:21	3667:21 3668:16	3673:23 3680:6,9	arises 3670:14	3736:3
3720:13 3727:13	3669:11 3670:15	3682:14 3684:10	armed 3707:6	attorney 3641:14
3728:18 3730:1	3671:13,25 3672:13	3685:15 3686:5,20	arose 3737:22	attorneys 3711:10
3731:16 3732:8	3676:25 3678:17	3688:9,10 3699:6	arrange 3719:21	auditorium 3696:11
3737:18	3688:9 3690:1,16	3701:5,7 3703:9	3720:3	3719:1,20,24 3720:2
aboard 3647:4	3692:18 3700:23	3706:16 3709:6	arranged 3659:5	3719:1,20,24 3720.2
absence 3702:15	3701:2 3705:19		arrested 3687:25	
absolutely 3643:10		3718:1 3726:11		August 3644:24 3651:4
3649:7	3706:11 3711:8,9	3727:16 3728:18,21	arrests 3687:22	3656:2 3661:22
accept 3663:20 3679:18	3713:23 3715:9	3729:13,16 3730:14	arrival 3687:15	3675:25 3697:22
3681:16 3695:2	3729:12	3731:16 3732:8	arrive 3645:25 3690:7	3703:6 3704:13,21
3702:20 3709:1,22	affect 3646:16 3655:8	answered 3664:17	arrived 3669:13	3714:18 3724:1,10
3715:7 3716:1,2	affidavits 3679:19	3668:15 3689:21,25	ascertain 3675:18	3727:22 3738:13
accepted 3731:9	afford 3709:12	answering 3736:14	3721:19	author 3652:19
accepting 3654:6	afraid 3645:14,15	answers 3740:7	asked 3639:20 3664:19	authority 3739:16
3707:23	3740:17	anticipate 3665:22	3668:3,5,9,10,14	availability 3667:18
access 3657:4 3658:13	Africa 3638:16 3640:10	anticipated 3648:14	3689:19 3702:2	available 3639:17
3683:6	3648:7	anybody 3672:19	3705:20 3708:21	3640:2 3641:1
account 3654:8 3666:7	African 3733:3	3689:22	3709:6 3710:2	3643:23 3647:9
3709:2	Africans 3699:21	anymore 3685:15	3713:15 3718:2	3658:20 3666:2
accurate 3680:20	afternoon 3644:23	anyway 3647:14	3732:22 3734:3,24	3667:11,12,17 3668:
achievable 3642:13	3645:11	3681:13 3687:5	asking 3673:7 3728:13	3668:11,17 3687:7
	agree 3640:8 3642:9	3697:14 3723:11	3739:12	3705:8 3715:3
achieve 3642:13 3650:19	3643:6,7 3645:21	3725:6 3730:2	aspect 3655:20 3681:4	3720:24 3730:9
	3646:18 3649:9	3737:11	aspects 3681:18	3731:1
acknowledgement	3652:9 3658:4	apologies 3651:17	assaulted 3707:9	avoid 3694:3
3694:25	3664:16 3665:17	3662:11	assert 3730:7	avoided 3729:24
Act 3659:22 3660:3	3671:24,25 3673:3	apologise 3696:21	assertion 3656:8	aware 3645:20 3646:6
3661:4 3713:25	3682:20 3683:8	3720:19,25 3721:2,6	asserts 3707:25	3688:2 3712:25
acted 3707:14 3708:1	3695:4 3713:6	3735:22 3736:7		3721:11 3723:24
acting 3737:18			assessing 3709:3	
action 3692:14 3707:12	3715:25 3716:3,25	appear 3723:14	assessment 3643:5,6	3724:3,19
3737:16	3732:3 3739:24	appearing 3711:7	assist 3638:13 3640:16	awesome 3687:4
activated 3643:24	agrees 3701:12	appears 3685:9	3641:14 3664:15	A497 3674:24 3676:16
acutely 3645:20	ahead 3679:23	3735:13	3665:2 3666:10	
adapt 3655:10,11,17	alia 3715:6	applicability 3645:9	3672:4,19,20 3674:23	B
add 3657:17 3738:24	allegation 3731:9	applied 3659:18	3685:2 3686:23	B 3649:22
3738:25 3739:5	3732:7	apply 3700:19	3688:16 3695:10	ba 3710:15 3711:7
additional 3694:7	allegiance 3717:21	appreciate 3648:24	3696:6 3708:19	3723:20 3738:8
address 3640:24	3723:13 3736:18	3671:15 3689:19	3712:10	back 3645:5 3649:5
3641:23 3646:11	3737:17	3694:22 3710:6	assistance 3678:9	3667:9 3677:4,7
3655:18 3679:6,10	allegiant 3723:19	3715:24 3721:10	3695:8 3696:8	3679:2 3740:14
3682:6 3715:20	allow 3660:16 3673:23	appreciation 3694:25	3729:22,23 3730:9	Background 3662:19
addressed 3704:15	3710:3 3725:6	3700:11	3731:15	bad 3683:22
	allows 3679:5	approach 3732:2	assisted 3711:8,10	Bapo 3710:15 3711:7
adequate 3649:13	alright 3649:24,24	appropriate 3648:12	3739:20	3723:20 3738:7
adjourn 3720:14	3671:12 3697:24	3651:25 3657:5	assisting 3656:20	Barry 3647:23 3648:3
	3699:3 3720:13	3659:3,17 3666:7	3714:20	based 3648:21 3655:6
3740:13		3673:4,7,8 3678:7	assists 3693:25	3681:12 3684:8,18
adjourned 3721:10		JUIJ. 4 ,1,0 JU/0.1	assists 3093.23 assumed 3709:17	3687:2 3700:7
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18	Alternatively 3702:17	3700.13 3700.12		<u> </u>
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4	alternatives 3638:11	3700:13 3709:13 3718:7		
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4 3673:10,10 3687:1	alternatives 3638:11 3640:7	3718:7	assumption 3668:5,9	bases 3647:9
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4	alternatives 3638:11 3640:7 amended 3693:16	3718:7 approximately 3707:4	assumption 3668:5,9 3681:11 3684:9	bases 3647:9 basis 3654:13 3655:14
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4 3673:10,10 3687:1	alternatives 3638:11 3640:7 amended 3693:16 amount 3654:24	3718:7 approximately 3707:4 area 3656:23,24,24	assumption 3668:5,9 3681:11 3684:9 3686:7 3708:25	bases 3647:9 basis 3654:13 3655:14 3681:9 3684:14
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4 3673:10,10 3687:1 3718:8,11,17,17	alternatives 3638:11 3640:7 amended 3693:16 amount 3654:24 3687:4 3702:22	3718:7 approximately 3707:4 area 3656:23,24,24 3658:22,23,24 3659:3	assumption 3668:5,9 3681:11 3684:9 3686:7 3708:25 3709:1	bases 3647:9 basis 3654:13 3655:14 3681:9 3684:14 3685:14 3686:3
adjourned 3721:10 3740:18 adjournment 3673:4 3673:10,10 3687:1 3718:8,11,17,17 3720:14 3740:12 ADJOURNS 3673:12 3720:17	alternatives 3638:11 3640:7 amended 3693:16 amount 3654:24	3718:7 approximately 3707:4 area 3656:23,24,24	assumption 3668:5,9 3681:11 3684:9 3686:7 3708:25	bases 3647:9 basis 3654:13 3655:14 3681:9 3684:14

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				D
				Page
3726:2	build 3654:21,21	certificate 3676:1	3735:22	commanders 3669:9
bears 3673:20	building 3655:5	chain 3738:20	cleared 3719:24,25	3674:14 3677:2,5,6
becoming 3706:4	3671:17 3716:9	Chair 3662:1 3675:10	clearly 3640:1 3647:8	3678:10,24 3679:9,11
beg 3661:17 3739:2	built 3733:17	3680:3,11 3683:24	3683:5 3698:24	3679:18 3680:21
beginning 3640:5	bundles 3708:24	3684:18 3696:21	3717:4	3683:11,11
3668:18 3672:15	business 3645:24	3697:4 3708:7	client 3710:21,21	commands 3688:4
3691:22 3697:13	3712:8 3714:7	3710:14,14,18	3731:10 3732:10	comment 3683:9
3705:21 3727:25	busy 3665:3 3687:1	3718:12 3719:16	3736:11 3737:9	3701:1 3705:20
behalf 3652:19 3710:15		3722:24 3725:14	clients 3732:13,19	3706:5,8,10 3709:21
3711:7	C	3727:17 3728:20	3734:10	3718:2 3728:9,12
belief 3664:20	calculation 3657:22	3729:18,19 3730:5,19	clip 3696:15,17,23	comments 3701:7,10
believe 3649:3 3666:13	3667:12	3731:11 3732:16	3697:17 3703:3	3702:14
3666:18 3683:9	Calitz 3676:11 3687:20	3733:1,9 3734:21	close 3640:10 3666:8	commission 3638:2,14
3693:7 3706:14	call 3643:3,4 3645:12	3735:23 3736:15	3667:5	3638:19 3641:1
beneficial 3693:11	3646:21 3657:7	3738:1,2 3739:3,24	closed 3720:10	3673:12,12,13 3676:1
3694:6	3664:15 3665:12	3740:1,2,4	closer 3666:12,16	3690:9 3691:15,21
benefit 3708:18	3667:19,22 3669:24	Chairman 3711:5	closest 3666:14,20	3694:8,11,16,17
best 3655:21 3661:13	3669:25 3672:19,24	3715:23,25 3716:24	cluster 3704:16,17	3695:4,7 3715:17
3669:9 3671:22	3677:5 3693:15,22	3720:3 3722:18	3706:6 3716:9 3717:5	3718:24 3720:17,17
3688:7 3699:17	3696:22 3700:15	3723:16 3726:3	3726:18	3720:18,20,23 3724:9
better 3650:15 3661:14	3719:3 3730:24	3727:10 3732:5	Coin 3687:12	3734:12 3740:12,18
3672:5 3694:20	3731:23	3735:11,13	coincidentally 3705:17	commissioner 3638:24
3696:11 3711:2,3	called 3657:2 3658:18	chairperson's 3709:22	colleague 3641:25	3641:20 3665:4
3718:14 3726:24	3664:21,24,25 3665:1	chairperson's 3703:4	3662:4 3676:14	3695:20,20 3697:1
3729:15	3666:12,13,19,20,22	challenge 3648:11	3694:23	3699:2 3700:8
beyond 3684:25 3686:1	3667:7 3668:11,13,23	3681:22 3682:2	colleagues 3646:13	3701:13,18,24
big 3650:22	3676:10 3677:3,6,10	challenges 3699:25	3703:12 3719:19	3702:15 3703:5
bigger 3660:23 3678:22	3679:9,11 3701:6	challenging 3644:4	3720:5	3704:16
bit 3682:7 3718:13	3703:19 3708:17	3689:11 3699:14	collection 3661:20	commissioners 3641:19
board 3713:17	3715:19 3727:14	chance 3688:22	Colonel 3647:12,13	3703:16 3711:6
bodies 3640:11 3687:19	canons 3687:15	3690:12 3705:25	combined 3667:13	3718:19 3719:19,22
3688:3	canvassed 3711:20,22	change 3654:19	combines 3671:20	Commissioner's
body 3639:8	can't 3640:19 3677:25	3693:21 3694:20	combining 3663:21	3696:25 3697:8,18
Boloyi-Mere 3711:9	3680:14 3681:13	3710:20	come 3644:10,12	Commission's 3681:22
borders 3640:8	3686:5 3689:11	changed 3663:19	3652:11,13 3654:7	commitment 3666:18
borne 3677:24	3720:1 3724:24	3730:7 3735:20	3659:23 3665:1	committee 3661:21
bowling 3719:13,16	3727:15 3728:12	changes 3654:23	3666:17 3667:22	3734:23
box 3684:6	capable 3641:12	3694:15,24 3695:2,4	3669:25 3677:11	communicate 3669:7
break 3690:21	capacity 3668:4,10	3695:6	3679:12 3680:21	3670:11 3686:12
breakdown 3665:13	Cape 3664:7,8,9	channel 3669:18	3681:4 3686:8	3736:21
brief 3677:4,7,11	3666:23 3669:25	channels 3669:17	3689:22 3690:9	communicated 3689:5
3679:3 3680:23	3737:3	3670:7	3691:11 3692:21,25	communicating 3688:4
3699:5,6,8,10	Captain 3679:20	characterises 3650:1	3694:2,8,12,13,17,20	communication 3653:7
briefed 3669:15 3674:5	3704:6 3705:12	charge 3659:18	3695:5 3699:15	3669:4,17 3670:7,10
3677:7,11 3678:11,11	caringly 3700:4	charged 3707:13	3706:17 3708:3,21	3683:22 3687:11
3678:14 3679:12,18	carry 3725:6	chart 3720:22	3709:20 3716:11,13	3688:23 3689:1,13,14
3679:20,23,24	carrying 3736:24	chase 3732:18	3717:10 3730:3	communities 3672:18
3681:10 3682:10,21	case 3669:9 3672:12	check 3689:12 3690:5	3735:3 3737:13	3712:5
3682:23 3724:4	3680:22 3681:15	3690:16,24 3691:3	3740:14	community 3670:12,12
briefing 3674:1,11,21	3710:7,20 3714:17	checking 3691:25	comes 3643:15 3644:4	3670:13 3671:16,18
3676:10,22 3677:3,4	3734:25	chief 3673:24 3709:18	3670:25 3694:15	3672:1 3711:17,23
3677:16 3678:25	cases 3717:18,18	choice 3649:5 3667:18	3714:14 3715:25	3712:20,25 3713:1,5
3679:25 3681:3,14,20	category 3713:9	3688:8	comfortably 3670:11	3712:20,25 3713:1,5
briefly 3732:13	cause 3669:22	choices 3645:23	coming 3644:10 3652:7	3721:11,18,20 3722::
Brigadier's 3709:14	certain 3645:21,22,23	3692:14	3652:9,12,13,18	3722:9,13,15,16,20
bring 3669:20 3670:16	3650:8,17 3652:23	church 3660:14,18	3688:20 3699:6	3723:2,3 3726:6,9,15
3672:10 3735:8	3670:22 3679:19	church's 3660:21	3700:20 3708:20	3726:20,21 3727:20
bringing 3669:2	3686:8 3702:22	circumstances 3652:1	command 3666:4	3730:6 3731:13,14
broader 3681:18	3737:16	3702:5 3703:8	3674:9	3732:1,12 3733:9,17
	certainly 3641:24	3721:21 3730:8	commander 3669:14	3734:2,25 3735:5,6
nroadly thys ix	3647:19 3659:13	citizen 3699:22	3669:16 3674:14	3735:15,25 3736:6,18
		CITIZCII 3077.44		3737:13 3738:3,7,18
brought 3665:16,23		clarification 3712.14	36/61036/712700	
brought 3665:16,23 3666:10,14 3670:11	3661:11 3672:25	clarification 3712:14	3676:10 3677:1,2,10 3679:5 6 3683:13 16	
brought 3665:16,23 3666:10,14 3670:11 3681:24 3706:3	3661:11 3672:25 3674:20 3679:20	clause 3671:10	3679:5,6 3683:13,16	3738:18
3681:24 3706:3 3723:1	3661:11 3672:25 3674:20 3679:20 3686:25,25 3695:23	clause 3671:10 clean 3660:19	3679:5,6 3683:13,16 3684:23 3686:11	3738:18 community's 3729:7,21
brought 3665:16,23 3666:10,14 3670:11 3681:24 3706:3	3661:11 3672:25 3674:20 3679:20	clause 3671:10	3679:5,6 3683:13,16	

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

Page 3

comparing 3688:10	
compile 3650:8,11	1
3690:8 3692:10	
compiled 3642:12,14	
3642:16 3648:21	
3652:23,25 3703:14	
compiling 3693:5	
complaint 3730:16	
complaints 3737:9	
complete 3680:20	
completed 3718:25	
complied 3641:12	
concede 3717:2,12,12	
conceded 3702:11,12	Ì
concentrate 3736:13	
concern 3647:20	
3648:9	
concerned 3732:6	
concerns 3646:10	
conclusion 3708:3,20	
3735:10	`
conclusions 3639:8	6
3694:7,8 3700:20	0
3707:23	
conditional 3685:14	
conditionally 3686:7	
confirm 3656:7,10,12	
3685:23 3697:23	
confirmed 3653:11	
confirms 3674:4	
confrontation 3661:8	
consequence 3643:8	
3683:16	
consider 3659:17	
3678:7 3695:1	
3707:21 3708:3	
3718:22	
considerable 3663:3	
consideration 3641:10	
3672:7 3715:5	
considerations 3716:4	
considering 3638:10	(
3640:7 3703:12	(
consistent 3726:13	(
consolidate 3694:16	
constitutionally 3639:8	(
constraints 3680:25	
constructive 3671:17	(
3733:16	
consult 3705:3 3734:5	(
consultation 3712:5	
3729:21 3730:6 consultations 3649:3	
consultations 3649:3 consulted 3721:12	
3735:2	,
contact 3684:23	
3717:22	
contain 3649:18	
3731:25	
contained 3650:1	
containing 3650:2,4	1
contemplated 3649:8	a.
contend 3699:20	7
3728:17	T
content 3646:17	l
contention 3729:7	
	120

contents 3654:9 3676:23 context 3706:22 continue 3720:21 3721:7 3725:13 continuing 3673:9 3728:13 continuous 3655:14 contrary 3708:11 3737:20 contribute 3650:15 contributed 3694:19 contribution 3715:1 control 3711:24 conversation 3680:13 copies 3640:25 3641:1 3641:7,15 3661:22 3687:3 3703:15 3733:10 copy 3662:12 3696:7 3698:9 core 3700:5 3738:17 correct 3639:1,5 3640:14 3642:11 3643:5 3644:1,2,25 3663:19 3665:17 3667:6 3674:10 3677:12,20 3678:16 3679:4 3681:9,12 3682:20,22,25 3683:8 3683:20 3684:5,10 3686:4 3692:12,17 3693:8,13 3710:18 3712:1,18 3716:22,23 3718:3 3721:12,24 3722:2,6,15,17,25 3723:15 3724:22 3726:8 3730:6,19 3731:10 3732:5 3736:10 3737:5 3738:14 3739:22,24 corrected 3736:1 correction 3735:12 correctly 3669:10 3683:7 couldn't 3714:24 3732:23 could've 3732:1,12,14 3734:4,10 3737:22 counsel 3682:17 3708:18 3716:17 3729:21 3730:2.7.17 3731:2,9 3733:14 3734:12,15,16,16 count 3701:24 country 3640:20,21 3661:11 3669:4 3699:13,22,25 couple 3718:8 course 3640:3 3642:21 3644:22 3648:22 3655:9 3686:21 3695:3 3701:20 3712:15 3717:16 courses 3639:18,25 3641:11

cover 3689:17 covered 3645:13 3648:13 3725:15 Crime 3651:3 critical 3642:10 critically 3642:15 3648:17,20 criticise 3706:17 criticising 3734:14 criticism 3680:3 cross 3677:22 3678:6 3681:2 3731:11 cross-examination 3673:9 3681:1 3689:18 3718:9 3719:1 3721:8 3725:13 cross-examine 3721:7 cross-examiner 3711:4 cross-examining 3673:15 3680:19 3684:14 crowd 3642:9 3644:13 3646:4 3649:15 3653:18 3654:19 3655:4 3656:12,14 3661:15 3662:25 3663:4,10,22,24 3664:14,21 3671:22 3673:1 3674:1,6 3683:4 3699:7 3711:23 3733:3 crucial 3669:10 curve 3663:18 customary 3675:8 cut 3732:17 D damage 3734:18 damaging 3732:10 3736:11 dangerous 3645:4 3651:10 3671:23 3707:7,14 3729:20 3736:24 date 3644:19 3674:18 3675:19 3695:21 3697:6.9.11.12.25 3724:13 3728:22 dated 3675:24 3697:22 3704:12 dates 3695:22 day 3651:16 3654:19 3654:22 3655:15 3656:2 3665:9 3673:21 3678:20 3697:8 3711:11,12 3717:2 3740:16 days 3644:22 3645:3 3690:3,3,19,19 3699:6 3702:21 3707:8 dayshift 3656:4 deal 3638:15 3640:12 3644:9,11 3645:6,25 3649:14 3655:13

3660:7.9 3661:3.16 3672:21.23 3692:16 3712:8 3715:24 3727:13 3730:1,3,15 3732:14 3734:6 dealing 3642:21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:17 3673:19 deals 3656:2 dealt 3642:3 3646:12 3647:22 3648:14 3659:1 3701:21 3710:9 death 3639:9 3700:12 debate 3648:10,15 3682:17 debriefing 3689:19 3700:10,14,17,18 3702:7,15 debriefings 3693:15 decide 3708:12 decision 3667:23 3683:22 3688:16,20 decisions 3653:20 3689:15 decision-making 3667:20 declined 3651:12 **deem** 3648:12 defect 3681:10 3682:10 3682:21 3684:20 3685:11 3686:4 defence 3707:15 3708:1 definitely 3640:18 3654:22 3664:19 3669:19,22 3672:8,17 3672:19 3688:13 3693:24 3694:1 3695:5 3714:11 3715:13 3725:5 3726:20 3728:5 delay 3720:25 delivery 3664:23 3668:18 demands 3670:19 demonstrations 3733:4 denied 3686:3 depend 3650:7 3685:13 3692:15 depending 3714:6 3725:24 depends 3677:8 deployed 3656:4,9,13 3656:17 3667:14 3671:22 3674:5 deployment 3666:6 describe 3655:22 3675:13,15 3691:13 described 3651:5 description 3700:21 3707:1 detail 3648:14 3651:11 3679:11 3729:23 3730:13,18 3732:8,11 detailed 3652:24 3664:9 3674:15

3677:16 details 3662:21 3664:1 3679:9.23 3686:6 3731:4,25 3734:3 3739:13 **determine** 3660:25 developed 3640:8,18 development 3642:6 3692:20 developments 3645:23 deviation 3646:16 dialogue 3712:16 3729:9 dialogues 3713:11 didn't 3639:19,23 3640:5,5 3647:1 3684:5 3685:10,24 3686:2 3690:16,24 3691:3 3715:1 3716:20,21 3727:4,6 **die** 3738:12 died 3738:3,9 differ 3652:10 3654:16 3654:16 3669:11 3672:15 difference 3739:18 different 3640:17 3642:1 3655:20 3667:25 3669:3 3670:16,24 3737:14 differently 3723:3 difficult 3669:6 3670:3 3706:19 3715:10 3740:7 difficulties 3646:10 3702:4 3703:4 difficulty 3669:2 3677:13 3679:17 3681:17 3698:23 3708:22 direct 3658:9 3680:9 3683:6 direction 3663:19 3687:14 directive 3678:15 directives 3643:12 3674:13 directly 3638:15 3640:12 3658:6.8.8 3667:4 3679:21,22 3681:3,14,21 3715:20 3725:17,18 disagree 3672:14 disarm 3645:7 disciplines 3668:12 discover 3684:6 discuss 3705:18 discussing 3709:19 discussion 3648:10,15 discussions 3712:17.20 3713:11 disperse 3645:7 3707:11,12 dispersing 3687:13 disposal 3664:15 disposition 3639:14

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

I II S T I

ARCHIVE

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				Page
dispute 3722:10	drive 3695:15 3696:18	3659:20 3683:9,13	examine 3681:3	3645:20 3646:13
3727:22 3729:11	driver 3676:10,21	3691:18 3713:24	example 3639:10	3648:9 3651:21
3735:8 3737:1,15	3680:1,23	essential 3640:9 3683:6	3649:1 3655:2	3654:11 3656:9
disregard 3726:14	drive\SAPS 3697:4	essentially 3638:13	3660:14,16,22 3664:3	3659:15 3662:5
		-		
disrespect 3701:9	driving 3666:2	3651:8 3659:2	3664:5 3681:25	3663:13,21 3665:4,25
3708:13	due 3660:20 3686:21	establish 3644:7	3693:7,20 3694:18	3668:11 3672:3,10
distance 3666:2	3701:20 3706:11	3652:22 3706:22	3702:4 3705:3,14	3683:22 3684:20,22
distinction 3690:14	Durban 3666:9	established 3638:10	3714:7	3685:21 3699:16
distribute 3687:4	duties 3674:6	3639:8 3640:6	excepts 3708:24	3700:17 3704:22
distributed 3641:18	dyslexic 3657:23	3649:12 3705:14	excluded 3735:20	3722:8 3723:2
diverse 3669:5		3714:16,19,23	3736:5	3725:15,20 3732:8
divided 3690:7	Ε	3715:12	excludes 3664:3	3734:16 3737:8
division 3692:20	earlier 3651:16	event 3643:20 3644:3	exclusion 3727:19	3738:2,17
document 3661:17	3726:13 3730:22	3649:14 3671:17,23	exercise 3658:1 3665:8	factors 3642:16
3662:6,7 3675:14,16	3735:14	3686:7 3695:23	exhaust 3711:14	3717:15,25 3725:16
3686:20 3689:23	easiest 3668:22	3703:7 3709:4 3712:6	exhibit 3639:4 3642:20	facts 3705:7 3707:2
3690:6 3691:20,25	easily 3678:24	3716:1 3733:17	3645:13 3651:2	factual 3681:24
3693:22 3696:15	Eastern 3664:7 3737:3	3740:11	3655:22 3656:7	fail 3681:5
3703:13 3706:11,22	easy 3657:7 3662:13	events 3645:22 3664:15	3661:24 3662:16	failure 3709:9
3707:23 3708:24	3670:12 3672:20	3683:17 3688:11,13	3671:6,7 3675:1,5,6,8	fair 3716:13 3738:8
3709:2,8,11	3679:15 3688:17	3693:6,15 3700:11	3675:11 3677:18,23	3739:20,22
documentation 3715:3	3689:9,13	3702:6 3707:20	3678:4,10 3684:12	fall 3668:8 3713:9
documents 3661:18	effect 3647:2 3687:21	3709:3 3714:17	3686:17 3692:1	falls 3639:24
3674:22 3687:2,7	effectively 3737:19	3723:25 3725:16	3696:16 3732:25	false 3725:7
3695:16 3708:25	efficiency 3675:8	3727:21	exhibits 3649:17,19	familiar 3638:17
3709:20	efficiently 3720:24	eventualities 3648:13	3650:2	families 3722:1
doesn't 3660:16	effort 3654:12	event\0036XVID	exist 3736:7	family 3710:15 3711:7
3698:17 3701:13	eight 3677:9 3691:7,9	3697:5	existence 3645:3	3723:13,20 3730:17
3715:18,21 3725:20	either 3680:22	everybody 3669:18	expect 3650:3 3652:23	3730:20 3731:7
3727:4,6 3728:11,17	electronic 3698:9	3670:7 3672:2	3653:13 3656:16	3735:7
3728:19 3730:1	3704:2	3674:11 3678:19	3680:10 3710:10	far 3643:16 3665:24
3733:25 3736:8	elements 3653:16	3679:6,7,10,13,16	3734:22	3667:2 3675:25
dogfights 3686:6	Ellis 3693:7 3694:18	3689:5 3700:1 3714:9	expedition 3709:25	3701:14,17 3703:25
doing 3640:19 3641:9	3700:12 3707:20	evidence 3641:3,17	experience 3642:7	3733:25
3721:19	Elson 3711:11	3646:21,25,25 3647:2	3649:1 3650:3	fatal 3728:8
don't 3645:8 3658:7	emailed 3641:16	3647:7,9,16,19	3651:25 3654:13	fault 3639:21
3661:7 3662:10	emanate 3726:19	3667:18 3673:24	3655:6 3656:11	feasible 3661:12,13
3669:20,22 3679:25	embarrassing 3701:11	3674:20 3675:3	3664:13 3683:4	February 3731:6,23
3681:4 3682:24	3701:14	3681:4,20,24,25	3705:6	feel 3654:17 3706:18
3696:5,12 3697:10	employed 3738:5,8	3683:24 3684:19	expert 3668:4,10	feeling 3700:1,24
3698:14 3701:1	employees 3707:5	3685:13,17 3686:8	3681:19,21,23	fees 3740:15
3702:13 3703:8,8,10	employer 3737:1,15	3698:10 3701:22,24	expertise 3639:7	felt 3700:2
3706:9 3709:5 3710:3	endeavour 3734:22	3701:25 3702:1,6,18	3673:22 3690:18,22	fewer 3663:17
3710:12 3716:12,16	ended 3644:23 3706:4	3702:18,23,24	3701:23 3708:15	field 3639:7 3673:22
3716:19 3717:13,13	endured 3699:24,25	3703:15 3706:21	explain 3658:16 3712:2	3688:18
3723:23 3725:7	enforcement 3638:16	3708:23 3710:10	3713:23	figures 3654:17
3726:17 3731:2				-
	engage 3731:13	3715:3 3717:16	explained 3647:14	file 3643:23 3674:25
3734:7,8	3734:23	3718:19 3721:10	explicit 3715:4	3676:15 3679:19
door 3718:20	engaged 3666:8	3724:8,16 3725:3,8	express 3662:4	3703:21 3704:2,2
doors 3729:9	3731:14,14	3725:22 3726:5	expressed 3647:20	final 3690:10 3691:12
double 3639:20	engagement 3687:15	3736:16 3737:2	3673:2	finalised 3691:10,24
3667:13	engaging 3706:13	3738:21 3740:1	extension 3718:23	find 3670:3 3694:1
	3731:17	evidence-in-chief	extent 3642:6,7	3714:25 3715:1
Dr 3038:24		3649:12 3693:5	3691:14 3700:9	3733:5
Dr 3638:24 drafted 3705:8			0071111010017	
drafted 3705:8	English 3698:14,23		3702.23 3700.4	finding 3656.01 2701.7
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8	evident 3737:16	3702:23 3709:4	
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18	3714:12	3708:17 3725:21
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18	3714:12 external 3696:18	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18	3714:12 external 3696:18	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6 3646:17,19,22	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9 entirety 3722:10	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2 3678:25 3679:4	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15 extremely 3651:8	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25 3646:13 3654:10
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6 3646:17,19,22 3648:12 3665:4	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9 entirety 3722:10 entitled 3662:19 3707:1	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2 3678:25 3679:4 3683:12 3688:22	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15 extremely 3651:8 F	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25 3646:13 3654:10 3662:18 3671:5
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6 3646:17,19,22 3648:12 3665:4 3736:3	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9 entirety 3722:10 entitled 3662:19 3707:1 3736:9	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2 3678:25 3679:4 3683:12 3688:22 3712:8	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15 extremely 3651:8 <u>F</u> face 3682:2 3719:13,14	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25 3646:13 3654:10 3662:18 3671:5 3673:24 3674:4
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6 3646:17,19,22 3648:12 3665:4 3736:3 drill 3717:17 3725:5,10	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9 entirety 3722:10 entitled 3662:19 3707:1 3736:9 envisaged 3702:11	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2 3678:25 3679:4 3683:12 3688:22 3712:8 examination 3677:23	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15 extremely 3651:8 F face 3682:2 3719:13,14 faced 3702:4	fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25 3646:13 3654:10 3662:18 3671:5 3673:24 3674:4 3676:6 3689:22
drafted 3705:8 draw 3639:24 3643:21 3650:23,25 3653:14 drawing 3643:16,16 drawings 3679:1 drawn 3642:8 3643:20 3644:16 3645:6 3646:17,19,22 3648:12 3665:4 3736:3	English 3698:14,23 ensure 3641:22 3692:8 3712:4 ensuring 3699:21 entire 3661:11 3676:20 entirely 3707:21 3708:9 entirety 3722:10 entitled 3662:19 3707:1 3736:9	evident 3737:16 exact 3656:21 3675:18 exactly 3650:18 3651:21 3654:11 3669:14,15,16 3670:1 3670:2 3671:2 3678:25 3679:4 3683:12 3688:22 3712:8	3714:12 external 3696:18 3697:4 extrapolation 3680:15 extremely 3651:8 <u>F</u> face 3682:2 3719:13,14	3708:17 3725:21 fine 3638:8 3671:12 firearms 3707:7,14 fired 3688:2 first 3639:22 3642:3,25 3646:13 3654:10 3662:18 3671:5 3673:24 3674:4

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				Page 5
firstly 3640:23 3688:3	functioning 3671:19	3737:10 3739:16	3660:7 3661:1,17	3665:4
fishing 3709:25 3710:3	functions 3702:25	gives 3683:13 3689:2	3687:23 3707:10	henceforth 3641:18
five 3655:15 3719:20	fundamental 3649:12	3701:8 3702:17,18	3719:12 3737:23	he'll 3711:3
3720:4	3654:14 3667:19	3706:8	handed 3675:14	he's 3682:8
fixed 3689:7	3668:13 3716:3	giving 3699:3 3703:9	handheld 3687:10	high 3641:7
flaw 3654:14 3667:19	fundamentally 3651:23	3736:13	handing 3661:23	historically 3662:22
3668:13	3656:15	glad 3638:9 3676:5	handle 3644:12 3670:2	holding 3656:23,24,24
flew 3687:12,16	furnish 3674:15	go 3638:21 3640:19	handled 3658:17	3658:15,22,23,24
3689:12	further 3638:4 3647:4	3645:23 3654:17	3672:16	3659:4 3665:7,11,14
flexible 3655:17	3647:16 3674:12	3657:15,16,16 3667:9	Hang 3696:19	home 3645:4
flow 3651:24	3686:18 3692:14	3670:22 3677:4,7	hanging 3739:25	home-grown 3638:13
fluidity 3645:25	3702:5 3708:16	3678:4 3679:2,9	happen 3646:4,6,6	hope 3667:17 3674:20
focus 3663:24 3703:1	3710:10 3711:14	3693:25 3701:13	3653:23 3669:23	3689:17 3710:8
focusing 3700:4	future 3687:1 3703:2	3710:3 3714:11	3670:6 3694:3	3729:14
focussed 3710:1	3709:19 3729:8	3732:9	3713:17 3714:10	hoped 3641:17
focussing 3651:18		goal 3642:13 3650:19	3715:11,12 3716:2	hopefully 3675:19
3690:4	G	God 3699:3	3724:23 3727:2,4,5	hoping 3674:23
follow 3644:6 3645:15	gap 3645:11	goes 3652:6,20 3657:9	3738:19,19 3740:17	3695:12 3703:11
3680:4 3687:11	Gary 3646:9 3647:8,20	3679:8 3684:6	happened 3653:12,17	hostels 3717:20
followed 3643:14,17	3647:24 3648:6	3699:10 3705:22	3655:1 3657:2 3689:6	hour 3740:10
3649:6 3681:13	3649:16,16 3650:11	3713:18 3739:21	3693:18,19 3694:1	HRD 3692:20
3692:9 3693:4 3694:6	3681:19 3683:2	going 3644:11 3645:14	3699:17 3709:11	huge 3729:22,23
following 3639:11,13	gathered 3652:4	3650:15,15 3653:6	3716:10 3717:6	3731:15
3639:15 3677:22	3653:19 3707:11	3658:17 3661:2	3727:25 3728:3	hugely 3730:7
3684:16 3686:15	gathering 3643:9,15,22	3665:22 3668:21	happening 3664:22	Human 3638:14,19
follows 3643:11	3643:25 3645:1,12	3669:6 3673:17	3668:24 3688:19,22	3681:22 3692:20
3671:20	3652:7 3653:5,6	3675:4,5 3679:15	3688:25 3689:9	3711:21
foot 3665:5 3684:3,8,25	3660:5 3707:5 3712:3	3682:9 3686:19	3712:7	hundreds 3666:1
3685:9	3712:23 3713:25	3691:2 3694:12	happens 3659:19	hurtful 3730:11
force 3638:15 3671:21	3714:3,8 3733:23	3699:13 3701:2,5,9	3712:10	hypothetically 3716:2
3690:23	gatherings 3642:18	3701:10,19,25 3703:2	happy 3650:16 3703:12	hypothetically 5710.2
forces 3662:22 3666:7	3645:10 3659:22	3709:6,14 3711:14	hard 3695:15 3696:18	I
forefront 3726:4	3660:3 3661:4 3728:1	3713:14,16 3714:9	3697:4	idea 3728:4
forehead 3726:5	3733:4	3717:4 3718:10	Hardy 3656:20	identification 3728:2
foremost 3699:8	Gauteng 3666:12,19	3719:3,20 3720:5	3661:22 3703:17	identified 3705:2
forgive 3645:16	3667:11,12 3668:6,20	3721:7 3731:21	hasn't 3675:7,10	3707:8 3708:4
form 3722:9,13,14	3669:24	3740:5	3696:15 3730:17	identifies 3651:8
3735:24	Geldenhuys 3691:8	good 3638:6 3678:2	haven't 3638:19,20	identify 3697:7
format 3646:17	general 3650:2 3683:25	3681:2 3699:2,3	3646:24 3668:14	3705:15
formats 3693:16	3685:6,19 3686:14	3711:11,12	3675:22 3714:22	ignore 3736:12
forming 3722:13	3687:9 3688:8,24	Govender 3703:14	head 3641:8	ignored 3730:12
forms 3693:17	3733:3 3734:1	3704:6 3705:12	headed 3733:21	imaginable 3649:7
formulate 3701:10	generally 3650:5	grateful 3657:12	heading 3684:15	imagine 3639:23
formulating 3649:1	gentleman 3648:6	3698:25 3699:3,9	3703:24 3733:3	3641:3 3666:9
3709:18	getting 3701:18	gratitude 3662:4	hear 3638:9 3676:5	imagines 3644:15
formulation 3642:4	3740:15	great 3665:23 3678:9	3688:25 3689:1,3	immediate 3643:4
fortified 3718:15	give 3653:4,10,21	3692:15 3695:8	3699:7 3721:25	immediately 3643:25
Fortunately 3698:8	3670:2 3672:20	3701:4	3723:17,22 3724:10	implement 3715:5
forward 3647:19	3678:25 3680:7	grievances 3725:11	3728:23	implementation
3666:10 3679:12,12	3681:4 3686:20	ground 3652:24	heard 3682:16 3687:18	3673:19 3674:1
3686:8 3692:25	3693:24 3696:3,9	3653:21 3686:12	3687:20 3724:12,25	3683:2 3716:4 3726:7
3694:13 3702:5,23	3697:25 3698:3	3687:24	hearing 3647:19	implemented 3644:23
3706:17 3715:25	3701:23,25,25 3725:7	group 3660:23 3678:22	3698:23	3669:10 3692:9
3717:10 3718:23	3726:11 3727:15	3690:15 3691:5,9,11	hearings 3642:22	3693:4
3720:22	3730:24 3731:3,22,23	3691:23 3707:6,7	hearsay 3647:1	important 3643:10
found 3657:10,18	3732:11,12 3734:7	3713:13 3737:14,23	3680:18	3648:1 3688:23
four 3642:1	3739:12	groups 3687:13 3690:8	held 3713:21	3720:21
Free 3641:6 3664:8	given 3639:3 3647:7	3690:11,13,15,20,21	helicopter 3683:21	impression 3647:11
friend 3711:20	3648:21,22 3652:3,15	growing 3654:19	3684:1 3687:12,16	3654:12 3662:5
front 3688:18 3689:10	3652:17 3653:8	guidelines 3643:12	helicopters 3687:12	3725:7
3696:5		G262 3733:20	help 3640:19 3650:22	inappropriate 3707:22
5070.5	3654:2.12 3669:17			
220 \ [0.59]	3654:2,12 3669:17 3679:16,25 3680:16		3682:9 3698:3 3701:5	3708:3
FS/2011/0009 3639:16	3679:16,25 3680:16	<u> </u>	3682:9 3698:3 3701:5	3708:3 inappropriately 3685:8
FS/2011/0009 3639:16 full 3651:14 3700:10	3679:16,25 3680:16 3692:23 3696:15,16		-	3708:3 inappropriately 3685:8 inaudible 3699:10
FS/2011/0009 3639:16	3679:16,25 3680:16 3692:23 3696:15,16 3700:17 3707:10	Н	3682:9 3698:3 3701:5 3701:9,19 3709:7,14 3728:18 3736:8	inappropriately 3685:8
FS/2011/0009 3639:16 full 3651:14 3700:10 3730:13 3731:3,23	3679:16,25 3680:16 3692:23 3696:15,16	H hadn't 3702:12	3682:9 3698:3 3701:5 3701:9,19 3709:7,14	inappropriately 3685:8 inaudible 3699:10

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				Page
incident 3645:7 3694:1	3654:7,11,13,25	3648:19 3650:17	3698:25	keep 3726:4
3703:25 3704:3,21	3655:2,4,5 3672:20	3653:3 3658:3 3681:3	I'll 3645:18 3647:19	kept 3654:24
3705:2,7,16 3707:2	3678:19 3679:15	3681:14 3686:5	3671:12,13 3675:19	key 3696:4
3724:14 3738:4	3680:14 3683:6	3694:12 3696:17	3677:14 3699:11	Kgaka 3711:11
incidents 3705:18	3684:21 3689:2	3704:22 3705:2,16	I'm 3645:11,14,15,15	Kgomo 3711:10,10
3708:2 3724:2,25	3690:8 3713:3 3718:5	3708:4 3711:23	3645:20 3647:25	Kgoroeadira 3711:8,9
3738:10,19,20	3722:23 3731:1,6	3712:9,20 3713:15	3648:19,22 3650:6,11	Kidd 3679:20
inclined 3708:10	3736:8	3714:5,13,25 3715:20	3650:16 3651:17	killed 3693:21 3695:24
include 3649:2 3713:21	informed 3649:18	3721:18 3726:9	3652:2,16,18 3654:22	3707:16
3735:5,16	3657:22 3693:16	3728:25 3729:13,14	3654:24 3656:20	Kimberley 3667:3
includes 3653:22	3697:21 3705:3	3729:14 3736:24,25	3657:12,22 3658:14	3715:22
3658:21 3693:5	3712:6 3713:18	3737:15 3738:23	3659:8 3660:16,20,21	kind 3645:10 3648:14
including 3646:22	3714:14,14 3717:7,9	involvement 3711:17	3665:13 3667:21	3680:18 3700:14
3667:15	3717:9,10,12	3715:6 3726:6	3668:19 3671:9	know 3646:20 3647:1
inclusive 3735:24	informing 3655:2	IPID 3674:22,25	3673:17 3674:22,24	3650:20 3669:8,13,15
incomplete 3680:5	inhabitants 3723:4	3676:15 3677:24	3675:2 3676:5,13	3669:16,20 3670:1,2
inconvenienced 3721:5	initially 3709:9	3679:19	3677:8 3680:25	3670:12,18,20,24
inconveniencing	3735:18 3739:21	irrelevant 3725:22	3682:3,19 3685:25	3671:14 3672:2,5
3740:16	initiate 3692:24	irrespective 3640:20	3689:5,6 3694:11	3673:20 3678:25
incorporated 3693:16	injured 3689:3 3707:16	isiXhosa 3696:12	3695:12,22 3711:6,8	3680:24 3682:24
incorporates 3651:15	input 3651:4	3698:13 3723:7,11	3711:13 3715:10,13	3683:12,17 3696:5,12
incorrect 3647:17	inquiry 3704:8 3725:12	isn't 3643:25 3667:5	3715:14 3716:8,10,15	3697:6,9 3698:12,14
3684:18,21 3709:1	inside 3640:20 3664:25	3675:5 3680:6,18	3717:4,6 3721:19	3700:3 3707:25
independently 3661:20	insist 3703:8	3682:5 3701:21	3724:6,12 3725:2,19	3709:5 3712:6,7,9
indicate 3664:19	instances 3679:19	3736:22	3725:21,22,25	3715:18,21 3716:17
3672:1 3695:18	3724:9	issue 3642:3 3649:11	3726:25 3727:23,24	3716:20 3717:13,14
3700:24 3709:10	instruct 3674:14	3650:9 3655:21	I've 3654:18 3660:8	3717:24 3718:1,22
3718:21 3720:4	3687:21	3661:16 3664:20	3662:15 3672:14	3719:2,11 3723:23
3726:24 3730:23	instructed 3687:22	3669:4 3673:5,25,25	3680:17 3684:25	3724:14 3726:5,15,18
3732:13	instruction 3654:3	3681:17 3683:1,15	3689:25 3690:18	3727:4,6,18 3728:11
indicated 3638:20	3683:14 3691:19	3689:17,18 3691:24	3691:6,21 3713:2	3728:15,19 3729:1
3647:7 3648:20	3692:22	3706:4,5,5,13,14	3716:8 3726:13 3727:25	3730:1,8,14 3740:5,6
3650:12 3668:17	instructions 3674:19 3692:16 3698:3	3711:15,19 3737:11 issues 3640:17 3643:14	i.e 3713:10	knowing 3652:11 3672:5
3672:14 3692:13 3694:23 3695:11,15	3722:8	3644:12,13 3653:18	i.e 5/15:10	knowledge 3689:22
3705:1 3708:5	insufficient 3651:24	3654:8 3663:2	J	3693:14 3726:17
3710:16 3719:23	3656:15	3668:18 3670:3	J 3638:24	3729:3 3731:5,5
3721:13 3731:8	insurrection 3714:21	3678:21 3683:5	ja 3639:2,2 3656:22	known 3650:5 3652:7
indicates 3692:6	integrated 3670:4	3691:18 3694:11	3667:1 3671:11	3652:16 3670:12
indicating 3705:23	intelligence 3649:11	3700:10 3709:9	3674:11 3682:18	3721:22
indication 3651:23	3650:5,24 3651:3	3724:5 3726:9,19	3685:7 3691:17	knows 3705:13 3713:15
3677:15 3710:9	3653:24	3729:1	3705:19 3707:17,17	3728:14 3731:3
3721:18 3724:17	intend 3711:15	item 3674:4,24 3676:16	3721:13	koppie 3645:2 3651:9
indigenous 3722:5,12	intention 3644:15	items 3673:18	JANUARY 3638:1	3651:13 3652:5
3722:15,19,20 3723:2	inter 3715:5	it's 3640:14,20 3643:17	Jeppestown 3693:20	3655:3 3687:13,16
3723:3,4 3735:5	interaction 3712:23	3645:25 3646:6	job 3672:20 3683:7	3707:5 3736:23
3736:6	internal 3693:9	3652:3,14 3658:18	3700:2	KZN 3664:8
indirectly 3725:17,19	3700:15	3662:18 3670:15	JOC 3644:16 3647:22	
individual 3674:9,21	internally 3694:6	3671:11,12,12 3672:2	3651:4 3652:23	L
3681:20 3707:24	interpret 3696:4,10,13	3672:6 3675:24	3653:14,20 3654:4	L 3655:22 3656:7
	3698:11,12	3676:16 3677:9,12	3667:23 3687:22	3677:18,23 3678:4,10
individuals 3651:9	202011,12	-		3692:1
individuals 3651:9 3661:15 3663:22	interpretation 3678:14	3679:3,15 3681:9	3688:5,7,14,22	5092:1
		3679:3,15 3681:9 3682:4,6,10,20	3688:5,7,14,22 3689:2	labourer 3735:8
3661:15 3663:22	interpretation 3678:14			
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15	3682:4,6,10,20	3689:2	labourer 3735:8
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18 invaluable 3669:5	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4 3717:2 3725:4,19,21 3725:23,25 3726:1,1	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19 junior 3722:25 3735:19	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15 languages 3698:12
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1 3650:4,7,10,12,14,19	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18 invaluable 3669:5 Invariably 3713:4 invitation 3692:23	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4 3717:2 3725:4,19,21	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19 junior 3722:25 3735:19 3736:2,3 justifies 3701:23	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15 languages 3698:12 laptop 3686:19
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1 3650:4,7,10,12,14,19 3650:20,23,24 3651:12,16,22,24 3652:3,6,8,15,16,20	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18 invaluable 3669:5 Invariably 3713:4 invitation 3692:23 involve 3716:18 3725:5	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4 3717:2 3725:4,19,21 3725:23,25 3726:1,1 3727:14 I'd 3642:4,20,24	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19 junior 3722:25 3735:19 3736:2,3 justifies 3701:23 K	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15 languages 3698:12 laptop 3686:19 largely 3712:19 law 3638:15 Lawyers 3711:21
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1 3650:4,7,10,12,14,19 3650:20,23,24 3651:12,16,22,24 3652:3,6,8,15,16,20 3652:22,25 3653:4,10	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18 invaluable 3669:5 Invariably 3713:4 invitation 3692:23 involve 3716:18 3725:5 3726:20	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4 3717:2 3725:4,19,21 3725:23,25 3726:1,1 3727:14 I'd 3642:4,20,24 3646:11 3655:19	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19 junior 3722:25 3735:19 3736:2,3 justifies 3701:23 <u>K</u> Karabo 3711:8,8	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15 languages 3698:12 laptop 3686:19 largely 3712:19 law 3638:15 Lawyers 3711:21 layout 3678:25
3661:15 3663:22 3664:7 3667:14 3695:24 influence 3717:22 inform 3651:25 3652:25 3653:15 information 3638:12 3644:5,7 3648:21,21 3649:11,13,18 3650:1 3650:4,7,10,12,14,19 3650:20,23,24 3651:12,16,22,24 3652:3,6,8,15,16,20	interpretation 3678:14 interpreted 3657:20 3696:12 3698:15,19 interpreter 3696:4,15 interrupt 3676:14 intervention 3655:7 3690:23 introduced 3649:17 3673:18 invaluable 3669:5 Invariably 3713:4 invitation 3692:23 involve 3716:18 3725:5	3682:4,6,10,20 3684:9,15 3685:10,19 3686:1,16 3688:17,21 3688:23 3689:7,9,13 3696:21,24 3697:22 3699:9 3710:14 3711:14 3712:3 3714:3,11 3715:4 3717:2 3725:4,19,21 3725:23,25 3726:1,1 3727:14 I'd 3642:4,20,24	3689:2 JOCOM 3654:5 Johannesburg 3664:4 join 3691:11 judgment 3643:5 3700:15 July 3724:19 junior 3722:25 3735:19 3736:2,3 justifies 3701:23 K	labourer 3735:8 labourers 3717:17 3723:12 3735:4,6,16 3735:21 3736:5 3737:12,23 3738:7 lack 3681:19 3683:3 3684:15 languages 3698:12 laptop 3686:19 largely 3712:19 law 3638:15 Lawyers 3711:21

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Email: realtime@mweb.co.za

-				Page
3712:22 3725:21	3737:6,9,17	manage 3661:6	meeting 3647:22	misleading 3736:10
leader 3691:7 3703:15	location 3695:15	3671:13,13	3651:16 3653:23	missed 3648:1 3676:14
leaders 3641:3,17	3702:21	managed 3694:19	3654:4,5 3689:20	3732:24
3644:8 3653:9	locations 3664:2	management 3642:9	3710:9 3714:2	mistake 3668:25
3671:18 3672:2	long 3693:10 3694:6	3644:13 3649:15	3718:18,22,25 3720:8	3716:7
3674:14 3679:8	3718:22 3719:2,11	3653:18 3656:12,14	3720:15,21,21 3721:4	mistaken 3656:20
3683:5 3698:10	3721:5 3740:7,8	3661:16 3662:25	3730:22	misunderstanding
3712:17,22 3713:5,9	longer 3682:7 3718:10	3663:4,10,22,24	meetings 3653:11	3735:14 3736:7,12
3713:10,10,13,20,22	Lonmin 3707:5	3664:14,21 3671:22	member 3646:15	misunderstood
3714:3,12,19 3716:18	3737:24 3738:4,6	3673:1 3674:2,6	3669:12 3674:9	3735:21 3736:6
3717:7,22,23 3718:19	look 3640:15,18	3683:4 3711:24	3676:22 3678:13	mixed 3691:1
3727:20 3728:25	3647:19 3651:1	3733:4	3706:15,15 3733:22	mob 3707:13,13
3732:20 3733:6,8,9	3652:21 3660:10	manner 3642:8	members 3653:21	modify 3739:18
3733:18 3734:2,4	3661:3 3665:5	3647:21 3669:19	3656:3,9,13,16,20,25	modules 3649:2
3735:1,7 3736:20	3666:16,16 3667:10	3700:3,21	3657:2,6,8,15 3658:2	Mogale 3710:15 3711:7
3737:17,22 3738:22	3684:2 3686:14	manuals 3649:2	3658:14,15,17,19	3723:20 3738:8
leadership 3683:3	3690:10 3691:11,17	march 3660:5,15	3659:16 3660:3,6	moment 3645:16
3684:15 3699:13	3691:18,24 3702:5,22	3712:10,17,22	3661:11,14 3663:4	3650:16 3684:14
3736:17,19	3714:5 3733:25	3713:14,16 3714:2,4	3665:6,23 3666:1,8	3687:5 3688:24
leading 3714:4	looked 3639:7 3687:16	3714:6,8 3724:18	3666:10 3667:10,12	3736:13
learned 3676:14	3709:13	marchers 3660:13	3667:22,25 3668:22	monitoring 3692:8
3711:20 3722:25	looking 3647:25 3650:9	marches 3712:3 3728:1	3669:24 3670:16,17	3693:3
learning 3700:10 leave 3651:13 3661:17	3656:6 3660:8 3664:12 3666:17	marching 3660:13,23 Marginally 3709:24	3670:17,19,22,23 3671:1 3672:23	morning 3638:6,7 3645:5 3654:20
		Marginany 3709:24 Marikana 3644:17		
3681:11 3730:10 3731:15	3671:9 3706:24 3733:14	3645:20 3649:19	3674:1,4,21 3677:6,9 3677:11 3679:3,21,24	3658:2 3699:2,3 3740:13
led 3639:9 3714:18	looks 3649:17 3651:14	3650:9 3655:1	3681:20 3682:21	mountain 3645:2
3724:8 3725:3,4,17	3665:13,15 3666:1	3661:12 3664:13,20	3687:21 3693:23,24	mourn 3699:25
3725:18 3734:11	3667:1 3674:12	3665:8 3666:2	3693:25 3694:3,14	mourning 3699:16
3736:16	3678:9	3667:15 3671:24	3700:16 3704:22	move 3682:11 3684:10
legal 3691:8 3697:21	looting 3712:11	3700:13 3704:10	3705:1,15,22 3707:25	3685:25 3686:5
3705:4,23	lost 3645:15	3706:2,14 3707:21	3708:4 3720:12	3694:13 3710:4
lengthy 3721:3	lot 3640:19 3650:15	3709:3 3721:22	3726:21 3728:7	moved 3706:6,7
Lesotho 3717:19	3658:9 3660:13	mark 3661:23	3738:2	movement 3645:10
3735:3 3737:4	3667:25 3672:6	marked 3675:10	memorial 3695:23	moving 3687:13
lesser 3663:24	3679:14 3693:25	3696:17	mentioned 3642:1	Mpembe 3683:25
lessons 3700:10	3694:19 3728:5	marshals 3659:22,25	3649:11 3676:6	3685:6,19 3686:14
3709:19	3734:18	3659:25 3661:5,5	3683:18 3686:10	3687:9 3688:8,24
letter 3706:12	Lots 3645:3	mass 3707:4	3690:11 3693:4	MPOFU 3676:13,17,19
let's 3686:18 3697:24	lunch 3686:25 3718:7	matter 3639:9 3641:6	3697:13	Mpumalanga 3664:8
3716:1,12	3718:11,17 3720:14	3650:20 3663:18	mere 3725:20	3664:25 3666:13,19
level 3714:12	luxury 3643:3,21	3682:24 3684:22	midday 3652:14	murdered 3707:9
liaise 3733:6	lying 3687:24	3685:13 3701:6,22,23	3654:22 3659:15	mustn't 3647:16
lie 3680:14		3702:16,17 3706:3	middle 3676:1	M-A-K-O-L-A 3675:18
Lieutenant-Colonel	M	3708:12,14,16	Middlekraal 3707:6	
3644:16 3646:9,14	Madlanga 3718:21	3709:13 3713:24	migrant 3717:17	N
3687:18	3719:18 3720:2,9,11	3716:8 3717:5 3731:4	3721:23 3722:2,12	name 3711:6
light 3654:10 3662:5	Mahlangu 3647:24	matters 3647:14	3723:12 3735:4,5,8	national 3643:12
3673:24 3678:2	3662:7 3698:17,21	3717:24	3735:16,21 3736:5	3690:23 3691:19
3685:8 3718:23	3699:1 3700:7	maximum 3720:24	3737:12,23 3738:7	3695:20 3696:24
3735:19	3722:11	MBE 3648:6	militants 3660:18	3697:1,8,18 3699:2
limit 3689:21	main 3659:3 3726:21	mean 3658:16 3670:7	mind 3647:4 3677:23	3700:8 3706:4,7,14
limited 3711:16	maintained 3728:7	3672:16 3674:8	3680:14 3700:20	3717:5
Limpopo 3664:7	major 3657:25 3739:14	3701:8 3709:7 3712:2	3709:8 3711:1	nationally 3716:10
3667:11,13 3668:6,20	majority 3656:17	3721:20 3723:25	3725:13 3726:2	naturally 3641:19
line 3670:7 3681:1	3661:14,15 3665:24	meaning 3645:13	mine 3689:21 3737:10	3666:7 3667:17
lines 3710:2	3671:20,21 3672:10	3658:13 3712:8	3738:9 minora 2728:4 6	Ncongwane 3710:14,18
hot 2605.16	3737:2	3735:24	miners 3738:4,6 mineworkers 3652:4	3710:22 3711:5,6,13
list 3695:16			I HIDEWORKERS 3652.4	3712:13,19,24 3713:4
listen 3736:20	Major-General 3691:8	meaningful 3740:15		2712.0 10 2714.16
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22	means 3644:6,9	mining 3735:9	3713:8,19 3714:16
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13 living 3717:20 3737:12	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22 3676:22 3680:13	means 3644:6,9 3660:12 3689:4	mining 3735:9 minister 3673:2	3715:2,15,23 3716:23
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13 living 3717:20 3737:12 Lizzy 3711:9	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22 3676:22 3680:13 3688:8 3699:20	means 3644:6,9 3660:12 3689:4 measure 3641:4	mining 3735:9 minister 3673:2 3701:12	3715:2,15,23 3716:23 3718:12 3721:9,17
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13 living 3717:20 3737:12 Lizzy 3711:9 local 3670:21 3671:19	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22 3676:22 3680:13 3688:8 3699:20 3700:15 3716:6	means 3644:6,9 3660:12 3689:4 measure 3641:4 media 3734:14	<pre>mining 3735:9 minister 3673:2 3701:12 ministry 3692:19</pre>	3715:2,15,23 3716:23 3718:12 3721:9,17 3722:1,4,7,17,20,24
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13 living 3717:20 3737:12 Lizzy 3711:9 local 3670:21 3671:19 3671:21 3672:4	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22 3676:22 3680:13 3688:8 3699:20 3700:15 3716:6 3720:23 3735:12	means 3644:6,9 3660:12 3689:4 measure 3641:4 media 3734:14 mediate 3738:23	<pre>mining 3735:9 minister 3673:2 3701:12 ministry 3692:19 minutes 3648:10</pre>	3715:2,15,23 3716:23 3718:12 3721:9,17 3722:1,4,7,17,20,24 3723:6,9,15,18,23
listen 3736:20 little 3718:13 living 3717:20 3737:12 Lizzy 3711:9 local 3670:21 3671:19	Major-General 3691:8 making 3660:16,22 3676:22 3680:13 3688:8 3699:20 3700:15 3716:6	means 3644:6,9 3660:12 3689:4 measure 3641:4 media 3734:14	<pre>mining 3735:9 minister 3673:2 3701:12 ministry 3692:19</pre>	3715:2,15,23 3716:23 3718:12 3721:9,17 3722:1,4,7,17,20,24

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

				Page 8
3727:17 3728:6,20	north-westerly 3687:14	3707:12,13,14 3708:1	orders 3671:14	3660:4
3729:5,17 3731:20	note 3656:1 3699:16	okay 3649:24 3654:1	3691:19 3726:6	participate 3692:24
3732:4,16,25 3733:7	notes 3652:24 3653:15	3654:18 3665:19	3729:6 3738:21	3730:22
3733:19 3734:21	notice 3649:25 3704:5	3668:16 3671:11	organisations 3733:18	participated 3709:17
3735:11,23 3736:15	3731:22	3676:8 3740:2	organisers 3671:18	participating 3660:4
3738:1,12 3739:2,7	notified 3728:3	omission 3716:3,19,21	3712:4 3733:17	3679:22
3739:10,23 3740:4,9	nub 3711:21	once 3682:10 3699:23	orientate 3670:17	particular 3643:9
near 3707:6	number 3639:4	3705:1 3738:19	3678:23 3679:13	3645:24 3649:14
nearby 3718:20	3646:10 3651:9	ones 3657:18 3724:18	3689:8	3653:5 3654:3 3660:5
nearly 3651:21	3654:19 3656:15,18	one's 3700:16	orientated 3670:25	3666:5 3669:17,18
necessarily 3680:4	3656:19 3657:5	onwards 3644:22	3678:24	3670:13 3671:15
3708:14 3725:8	3658:3,22,23,25	opened 3713:11 3729:9	orientation 3678:21	3678:13 3680:22
necessary 3642:15	3660:8,25 3662:8,16	opening 3694:24	original 3692:4	3682:2 3700:21
3644:7 3688:4	3662:22 3663:3	3712:16	originally 3661:18	3703:3 3707:22
3711:15 3730:17	3664:1,7 3665:7,8,23	operate 3669:18	other's 3669:8	3710:4 3711:19
3731:2 nonossity 2722:5	3667:10,13 3675:6	operating 3680:25 operation 3659:2,15,18	ought 3678:14	3712:22 3713:13,15
necessity 3733:5 need 3640:15 3643:14	3678:24 3689:20 3690:15 3696:16	3667:24 3670:5	outset 3647:8 3694:23 3695:1	3714:4,10,17 3721:21 3725:11 3734:25
3650:8,10,23 3652:12	3709:7 3738:8		outside 3640:20 3665:7	3725.11 5754.25 3735:7
3653:14 3654:7	numbers 3655:21	3678:13 3679:7,8,10 3679:22 3688:20	3665:17 3680:1	
3655:11,14 3660:14	3657:11,17 3663:8,13	3718:24 3729:22	overall 3679:5 3688:14	particularly 3718:23 particulars 3732:15
3651:2,3 3666:16	3663:15 3664:3,12	3718:24 3729:22	3689:8	parties 3641:18 3697:4
3670:17 3671:16	3665:16	operational 3643:17,21	owe 3723:13 3737:17	3701:21 3718:20,21
3672:2,3,7,10,18,24	Nyala 3676:10,21	3650:8,11,25 3655:16	owed 3717:21	3720:22
3672:25 3678:23	3680:1,1,23,24	3665:12,15 3666:4	o'clock 3652:5,15	partner 3738:20
3692:23 3694:24	Nyalas 3687:21	3669:9,14 3674:13	o'clock 3720:15	partnership 3671:16
3695:1 3702:13	1 (yalas 5007.21	3679:6 3683:13,16	U CIUCK 5720.15	parts 3671:5
3713:25 3714:13	0	3684:23 3686:11	P	party 3730:21
3717:7 3726:22	oath 3638:3 3673:14	3688:15	padded 3719:13	pass 3641:22
3730:8	3699:21 3721:7	operations 3641:5	page 3642:22 3643:1	pathway 3697:3
needs 3677:12 3683:16	oaths 3676:1	3688:12	3645:13 3649:16	pay 3640:10
3691:21 3692:22	Obakeng 3711:10	operators 3717:17	3651:3 3654:10	pdf 3704:2
3694:24	objection 3681:5	3725:5,10 3735:9	3665:5 3671:7,10	peace 3734:22
neglected 3726:25	3684:4,18 3708:11	3737:2,7	3674:3 3676:1 3684:3	peaceful 3646:5 3735:9
negotiate 3732:20	3732:17 3739:22	opinion 3650:13	3684:3,8,9,16,25	people 3639:25 3645:3
negotiation 3726:14	obligation 3649:2	3681:19,21 3683:23	3685:9 3686:14	3652:7,9,18 3653:5,9
negotiations 3713:21	observed 3692:11	3684:18 3693:11	3733:7,10,11	3655:3 3658:1,3,24
neighbouring 3717:19	obtained 3652:8,10	3701:24 3708:7,8,14	pages 3664:6 3676:18	3659:5 3660:14,21,22
never 3639:7 3668:23	obvious 3666:16	3708:15 3709:22	3733:11	3665:8 3667:3,3
3677:23 3715:11	3714:11	opinion's 3681:23	paginated 3674:24	3668:6,11,12 3672:3
3716:11,12,14,14	obviously 3652:11	opportunity 3642:19	pain 3700:1	3672:6 3679:15
3721:14 3728:3	3653:3,6 3654:21	3696:4 3700:19	para 3733:16	3680:23 3683:10,12
NFTF 3665:25	3657:23 3663:2,17	3705:15,17 3706:21	paragraph 3643:1	3686:12 3687:13
NGONGWANE	3668:7 3670:16	3708:2 3721:14	3651:18 3675:20	3688:15 3690:2,7
3738:14,16	3671:19 3674:4	3729:8 3732:12	3676:7 3685:22	3692:21,25 3698:13
NGOs 3672:18	3695:7 3698:13	3736:21 3737:10	3686:15 3687:8,20	3698:15 3708:16
NGO's 3671:18	3708:12 3711:14	3739:17	3692:4,6 3694:23	3710:2 3712:8
nice 3680:9	3712:23 3713:14,16	opposed 3723:7	3704:20 3705:1	3713:13,15 3714:5,7
night 3638:21	3714:4 3716:19	opted 3650:18	3707:1,3,16 3732:21	3722:13 3723:8,13,19
nine 3690:2,18	3719:9 3720:10	order 3640:9,13 3642:8	3733:11,13,14,19,21	3731:17 3736:23
NIU 3665:25 3666:10	occur 3709:8	3643:11 3646:1,19,22	paragraphs 3686:23	3737:7,9,14 3738:5,8
non-briefing 3681:15	occurred 3639:13	3648:12 3649:4,13	paramount 3726:7	3738:9
non-governmental	3724:2,18 3727:21	3652:22 3653:14	pardon 3739:2	perceived 3711:24
3733:18	3738:10	3655:7 3656:25	Park 3693:7 3694:18	perfectly 3649:5
noon 3651:4,22 3658:1	occurrence 3728:8	3659:20 3661:16	3700:12 3707:21	perform 3674:6
normal 3646:3,6	occurs 3643:25	3668:1,4 3669:12,13	parliamentary 3661:21	period 3718:24
3653:9	office 3704:9	3669:21 3670:6	part 3653:23 3658:15	3728:25 3738:13
normally 3652:6,20	officer 3654:1,4 3666:5	3671:6,12,23 3672:21	3661:18 3664:16	permitted 3730:21
3653:1,17,24 3659:19	3675:18 3696:20	3677:1 3678:15,17	3666:19 3667:23,24	3732:1
3660:5,11 3676:25	officers 3650:4 3653:14	3679:4 3683:7,10,17	3678:13 3690:24	persist 3684:3 3701:16
3678:18 3683:10	3653:19 3671:23	3683:18 3686:23	3693:10 3710:21	person 3652:19
3694:10 3712:21	3678:12 3679:21	3690:24 3702:12	3715:12 3717:13	3662:12 3688:6,13
3713:12	officials 3638:16	3721:19 3731:13	3721:14,15 3722:9	3689:2
north 3664:8 3687:14	3652:24 3660:15,25	3732:22 3733:1,2,5	3726:25 3728:3	personnel 3655:12
Northern 3664:9	3661:1,2 3664:13,20	3733:20,24 3734:1,7	3731:18,18 3739:14	3660:2 3687:23
3666:23 3669:25	3672:5 3693:21	3734:8 3736:9	participants 3652:4	persons 3707:10,15
ARCHIVE FO				

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

jj			1 5	_
				Page
perspective 3647:6	3673:6,8 3677:22	positions 3648:25	prior 3662:6 3674:1	3659:1,16,17 3687:17
pertinent 3702:8	3678:1,4 3680:17,18	positive 3671:17	3723:25 3724:5,15	protests 3643:2
perusal 3709:8	3681:2 3682:4,5,5,11	3714:20 3726:11	3738:10	3664:23
phases 3709:11	3684:4,11 3685:9,11	3733:16	privilege 3674:19	provide 3643:3 3734:3
phrased 3685:8	3708:19 3710:13	possession 3662:6	probably 3641:21	provided 3651:16
piggyback 3721:17	3720:13 3727:3,7,14	3685:18 3690:7	3725:6 3727:18	3652:22 3662:12
Pillay 3661:25 3662:1,3	3728:12,24 3730:1,15	possible 3641:23	problem 3652:16	3685:18 3695:16
3662:17 3674:23	3734:20 3736:1,14,14	3661:24 3664:22	3655:18 3657:8	3703:16 3705:23
3675:7,10 3686:19	3736:22,23 3737:11	3666:15,21 3668:22	3669:20,22 3670:4	3708:24,25
3687:3 3695:10,13	3737:24	3670:25 3671:22	3672:22,23 3680:2,4	provides 3643:11
3696:14,21,24 3697:3	points 3641:11 3731:20	3691:1	3689:14 3705:24	3725:16
3697:10,16,20	police 3640:13 3641:21	possibly 3701:7 3710:3	3706:9 3717:1,3	providing 3707:19
3703:16,18,20,22,23	3645:22,24 3647:12	3711:1 3730:15	3729:24 3730:12	province 3666:23
3733:13	3649:14 3655:7	post 3695:23	3731:18 3732:14	3669:21 3670:24
pilot 3687:22	3656:4 3660:15,24,25	posted 3656:25	3734:4	provinces 3664:24
place 3641:6 3642:16	3661:2,6 3664:20	post-Marikana	problematic 3676:24	3666:14,18 3668:1
3643:22 3644:5	3671:21 3672:4	3697:18	procedurally 3678:18	3670:16 3721:24
3648:15 3653:7	3673:2 3683:7 3692:1	Potchefstroom 3689:20	procedure 3643:16	provincial 3704:16
3655:16 3657:4	3693:21 3704:10	3689:23,24 3702:7,20	procedures 3643:14	3706:4,7 3717:5
3668:19,21 3670:24	3706:3 3707:12,13,14	3703:7	3644:6,6	provincially 3716:9
			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	
3671:3 3691:20	3707:25 3709:10	potentially 3732:10	proceed 3671:12,13	provisional 3649:16
3700:11,18,20,22	3726:16 3730:9	3736:11	3685:16 3687:5	3681:23
3702:8,12 3703:7	3731:16 3732:2	practice 3693:10	3688:8 3710:24	provisionally 3697:25
3709:21 3712:6	3733:3 3734:5,10,23	precautionary 3641:4	3727:9	public 3640:9,13
3713:16 3714:8	3735:1 3736:25	precise 3695:15	proceedings 3638:1	3642:7 3643:2 3646:
3717:8 3720:16	3737:24	precisely 3649:13	3691:15 3698:7	3646:19,22 3655:7
3721:16 3724:5,6,15	policies 3640:7 3691:18	3681:20 3684:17	3730:21	3656:25 3659:20
3725:1 3729:9 3735:3	3692:8 3693:3	3724:13	process 3648:18 3649:6	3668:1,4 3669:12,13
			-	
placed 3688:7	policing 3640:10	precursor 3694:21	3664:25 3693:2	3669:21 3670:5
plan 3642:8,12,16,20	3642:8 3646:19,23	predicated 3731:12	3694:5,22 3695:24	3672:21 3677:1
3643:11,17,22	3656:25 3659:20	predict 3740:7	3700:14 3702:7,16,20	3683:9 3690:24
3644:10,15,20,23	3668:1,4 3669:12,13	predominantly	3703:7 3707:15	3720:12 3734:22
3645:6 3646:9,13,17	3669:21 3670:6	3712:25 3738:5	3721:15	purely 3727:11
3646:21,22 3647:12	3677:1 3683:10	preferred 3708:23	processes 3687:25	purportedly 3649:18
3647:13,21 3648:11	3690:24 3699:18	preferring 3706:21	3693:9	purporting 3730:7
3648:20 3649:4,14,18	Policing's 3646:1	prepare 3681:23	processor 3643:24	purpose 3644:8 3657:1
	-	3687:25		3689:23 3690:2,3
3650:8,11,15,23,25	policy 3638:11 3642:4		product 3690:10	
3651:25 3653:15,18	3646:16 3692:19	prepared 3689:23	3691:12,12	3698:10
3654:2 3655:8,16,17	3726:9	3698:8	profitable 3681:1	purposes 3673:9
3659:21 3668:14	Pondoland 3717:18	preparing 3709:4	3721:4	3706:25
3669:10 3673:20	3735:3 3738:6	presence 3657:6	programme 3694:14	push 3670:25
3674:2 3679:2 3683:2	POP 3641:5 3646:15	present 3647:9 3661:23	3694:18	put 3642:14 3649:4,19
3694:2 3716:5	3656:9,16,19 3657:15	3702:24 3706:25	programmes 3695:6	3651:20 3667:16
planned 3653:18	3657:25 3658:2,3	3720:13 3725:12	progress 3654:20	3669:5 3681:8
3714:2,3 3728:1	3659:2,5,16 3661:11	presentation 3647:12	promote 3734:22	3682:15 3684:19,21
-		-	-	,
planning 3641:10	3661:14 3664:1,7	3648:11 3655:23	proper 3644:4 3674:11	3685:13,24 3686:3,7
3642:5 3643:3	3665:6,8,25 3666:1,8	3661:20 3663:8	3678:14,25 3712:4	3690:17 3704:5
3650:18 3655:7,20	3667:3,10 3668:6	3664:6 3667:9	3728:1	3710:19,23 3723:3
3659:5 3667:20,24	3711:18,25 3715:6	3689:24	properly 3642:17	3727:1,5,12 3729:9
3729:15	3716:5 3726:7 3728:7	presented 3644:16	3647:15 3651:24	3731:9,21 3732:7,9
plans 3643:19,23	popularly 3721:22	3646:9,14	3674:5 3678:19,23	3734:12,15,15,17,19
3674:15	portfolio 3661:21	press 3701:17 3703:8	3679:12,14,16	3735:20 3737:19
platoon 3669:13,16	posed 3646:12	pressure 3657:8	3691:20 3692:2	3739:13,15,15,21
-	-	-		
3677:5,6 3683:11	position 3641:14	3658:13	3705:20 3706:10	puts 3701:11 3730:13
nigved 3 / 1/1+2/1	3644:10 3648:18	presumably 3658:1	propose 3684:21	putting 3727:3,7,15
		3680:20 3715:19	3687:5 3710:3	3739:1,5,8
players 3653:3,22	3650:13 3653:12		2721.00	
	3650:13 3653:12 3657:1 3665:20	presume 3671:18	3731:22	
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2		presume 3671:18 3690:25 3692:10	proposed 3735:15	Q
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23	3690:25 3692:10	proposed 3735:15	
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21	quality 3700:16
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8 point 3640:23 3645:9	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9 3701:11 3706:10,15	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2 3737:22	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16 3730:5 3737:20	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13 quelling 3714:20
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8 90int 3640:23 3645:9 3645:13 3647:3 3647:3 3647:3	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9 3701:11 3706:10,15 3707:19 3709:21	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2 3737:22 previous 3707:18	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16 3730:5 3737:20 propositions 3734:13	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13 quelling 3714:20 query 3678:12 3739:6
please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8 point 3640:23 3645:9 3645:13 3647:3 3648:17 3656:3	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9 3701:11 3706:10,15 3707:19 3709:21 3714:15 3726:11,24	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2 3737:22 previous 3707:18 previously 3641:8	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16 3730:5 3737:20 propositions 3734:13 Protea 3687:11	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13 quelling 3714:20
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8 90int 3640:23 3645:9 3645:13 3647:3 3647:3 3647:3	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9 3701:11 3706:10,15 3707:19 3709:21	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2 3737:22 previous 3707:18	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16 3730:5 3737:20 propositions 3734:13	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13 quelling 3714:20 query 3678:12 3739:6
players 3653:3,22 3726:21 3728:2 please 3648:1 3660:20 3686:14 3698:25 3701:1 3705:11 3725:12 3727:8 90int 3640:23 3645:9 3645:13 3647:3 3648:17 3656:3	3657:1 3665:20 3668:19 3674:23 3683:17,23 3686:11 3688:6,17 3689:3,6 3695:12 3698:9 3701:11 3706:10,15 3707:19 3709:21 3714:15 3726:11,24	3690:25 3692:10 Pretoria 3664:4 pretty 3735:22 prevent 3734:4 3735:2 3737:22 previous 3707:18 previously 3641:8	proposed 3735:15 proposition 3651:21 3671:24 3684:19 3688:1 3715:8,16 3730:5 3737:20 propositions 3734:13 Protea 3687:11	quality 3700:16 quarrelling 3682:3 quarter 3656:13 quelling 3714:20 query 3678:12 3739:6 question 3639:20,22,23

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

				Page 10
3659:6,10,11,12,23	3684:19	3677:25 3692:19	report 3639:16,17,21	3708:2
3661:10 3663:25	reads 3675:25 3678:2	3704:2 3713:20	3639:24 3640:2,2	re-examination 3719:2
3664:18,18 3665:22	3707:3	3732:22 3733:12,15	3692:10 3703:14,20	3719:7 3730:16
3666:2,15 3668:2,3,8	ready 3695:13 3719:12	3733:24 3734:1	3704:3 3705:7,13	right 3640:5 3641:23
3668:9,14 3671:4	3719:13,15	refers 3678:10,11	reported 3638:14	3659:6 3666:12
3679:14 3681:12	real 3685:9	3682:1 3683:3 3688:5	reporting 3687:18	3688:18 3705:3
3682:14 3683:3	realised 3661:19	reflection 3739:24	3707:19	3709:25 3719:17
3684:8 3685:4,7	reality 3672:9	reflects 3707:23	reports 3638:17	3722:21 3723:14
3686:3 3688:6 3690:1	really 3642:12 3648:16	reformulated 3736:4,5	3640:11,25 3641:7,7	3727:25 3732:18
3695:10 3700:18	3654:17 3658:16	3739:23	3641:11,16 3692:15	Rights 3638:14,19
3701:3,4,16 3702:1	3660:5,8 3664:19	reformulates 3684:7	3693:6 3734:14	3681:22 3711:21
3702:14 3703:9	3668:24 3672:3	refused 3651:13	representation 3710:21	rip 3649:4
3705:11 3706:16	3692:1 3693:18	regard 3641:4,21	representative 3705:4	rock 3717:17 3725:5,10
3709:6 3710:4,5,24	3695:3 3698:12	3642:18 3658:25	representatives	3735:2,8 3737:1,7
3711:15 3715:21	3699:11 3700:24	3659:14 3667:18	3705:24 3718:19	role 3653:3,22 3713:24
3716:7,16,16,21	3701:9,16,22,24	3674:3 3680:24	3720:22	3714:20 3726:21,21
3717:2 3718:2,13	3705:25 3706:5,9,11	3681:17 3692:14	represents 3699:17	3728:2
3723:1,12 3726:11,12	3706:18 3714:22	regarding 3723:1	request 3641:15	room 3718:20 3719:21
3727:9,13 3728:16	3717:3,9 3718:4	3727:21 3729:10	3700:25 3719:19	3719:22,23 3720:4
3731:2 3732:9	3726:23 3727:24	regardless 3654:25	requested 3719:21	roughly 3652:13
3734:24 3736:4.5	3728:3,4	3694:7	3732:15	royal 3710:15 3711:7
questioning 3647:5	reason 3703:2 3720:25	regards 3641:15	requests 3640:24	3723:13,20 3730:17
questions 3638:4	3732:22 3734:13	3674:21 3687:8	3641:12 3666:6	3730:20 3731:7
3640:23 3642:2	recall 3690:12 3711:19	regrouping 3687:17	required 3649:15	3735:7
3646:12 3658:8	receive 3677:3 3692:16	regular 3654:13	3688:5 3726:14	running 3678:6
3673:23 3678:21	3701:15	regularly 3655:2	3729:6	rush 3670:22
3682:6 3687:2	received 3651:12	Regulation 3659:21	requirement 3678:12	Rustenburg 3665:6
3689:20 3700:7	3675:22 3676:21	3660:2 3661:4	3732:20	3704:17
3702:8 3705:20	3677:4	3713:25	requires 3646:1	5704.17
3709:7 3710:1,7,25	receiving 3663:18	reinforce 3657:2,7	3731:13 3732:17	<u> </u>
3713:14 3714:6	recognise 3699:12	3667:22	reserve 3657:1	sadly 3661:17 3695:24
3718:6,8 3726:2	recommendation	relate 3661:10	reserved 3656:23	safe 3666:16 3688:21
3728:13,17,18 3730:3	3640:15 3694:13	relates 3648:9 3700:9	residing 3721:23	3699:21
3740:7	3695:5,7	3702:14 3711:16	resolve 3729:1	safety 3699:22
queue 3695:12	recommendations	3723:12 3725:10	Resource 3692:20	sake 3655:3
quick 3657:19 3664:22	3692:10 3693:6	3733:25	resources 3667:16	SAPS 3647:10 3648:25
3666:15,21 3667:11	3694:17 3703:2	relating 3644:21	respect 3646:8 3647:21	3655:23 3660:2
3668:22 3670:25	3707:20 3709:18	3702:25	3660:20 3674:2	3661:18 3662:22
quicker 3666:17	record 3710:19,20,23	relation 3645:9	3683:2 3701:4 3702:6	3663:8,25 3667:20
quite 3667:2,4 3711:16	3712:14 3734:9	3685:19 3701:18	3702:23 3706:11	3685:19 3687:11,12
3739:21	recorded 3698:5	3736:11	3702:23 3700:11	3693:10,11 3694:6,22
quote 3643:1 3704:22	reduce 3653:25	relationships 3671:17	3729:19 3731:16	3695:14,16 3696:17
quote 5045.1 5704.22	reduced 3653:25	3733:17	3736:8	3697:4,23 3702:6
R	3654:3	relevance 3681:24	respected 3640:12	3704:23 3705:22
R 3642:20 3645:13	refer 3642:20,22	3702:14 3711:21	respond 3657:24	3706:21 3708:24
radio 3683:22,25	3649:15 3671:5	3702:14 3711:21 3725:21	response 3732:17,18	3713:24 3715:4,19
3684:4,23 3685:1,10	3675:6,20 3676:6	relevancy 3725:15	3739:5	satisfy 3725:4,23,24
3685:12,23,25 3686:1	3677:14,18 3679:20	relevancy 3723:13 relevant 3655:6	responsibility 3673:22	sausry 3723:4,23,24 save 3658:9 3682:19
3687:11,18 3689:4	3679:25 3685:21	3663:23 3670:10	3700:5	save 3038.9 3082.19 saw 3707:16
radios 3687:10	3686:13 3692:3	3681:21 3691:14	responsible 3662:24	saw 3707:16 saying 3652:16,17
raise 3673:25	3703:13 3705:7	3710:11 3717:25	3664:13 3692:7	3654:22 3659:8
raised 3654:9 3669:2	3724:14,18 3734:8	3725:3,4,19,23,25	3699:17,19 3706:24	3660:20 3661:5
3736:14	reference 3642:25	3726:1 3728:17	3707:19	3679:4 3685:25
raises 3681:18 3734:20	3648:6 3656:7,10	rely 3653:21	responsibly 3700:4	3688:13 3689:7
ranging 3723:25	3676:15 3693:7	remain 3739:25	rest 3677:11 3697:3	3699:12 3717:4
ratio 3659:16 3660:1,2	3704:20 3723:2,19	remained 3663:9	restrain 3737:18	3725:19,21,22,25
ratio 3639:16 3660:1,2 reach 3641:23	3725:16 3733:5,8,16	remaining 3688:7	restricted 3739:21	3729:12 3731:7,12
reached 3666:10	3734:2	remember 3665:7	rests 3681:19	says 3660:3 3684:14
3673:8	referenced 3685:5	3690:14 3700:1	result 3693:6 3707:20	3699:2 3701:12,13,13
reaction 3643:4	3733:8	remind 3721:6	resume 3718:11,25	3701:17,19,19
read 3638:21 3640:15	5755:8 references 3734:7	remiss 3731:17 3734:5	3720:14 3721:3	3708:13 3716:20
3686:22 3698:22,25	referred 3691:16	remove 3659:8,9	resumes 3638:2	3708:13 3716:20 3727:5,6 3729:25
3705:25 3707:1	3713:10 3720:16	repeat 3673:20 3705:10	3673:12,13 3720:17	3727:5,6 3729:25 3731:4 3736:9,10
3737:8	3726:13	repeat 3673:20 3705:10 repeating 3673:21	3720:18	3737:20
readily 3711:22	referring 3640:25	repercussions 3701:15	return 3687:22 3688:5	scarcely 3643:21
reading 3649:21	3644:19 3674:24	repetition 3707:2	review 3702:11,16	scenario 3649:7
reading 5049.21	8 1115TLCF	1 cpcuuoli 5707.2	1010W 3702.11,10	SCCIIALIU JU47./
		-	•	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				Page
3661:14 3669:9	send 3641:6 3698:10	3661:3,7 3669:6	specialisations 3669:3	3731:12 3732:22
scenarios 3670:2	senior 3650:4 3653:13	3670:13,19,23,23	specialised 3656:14	3733:1,2,5,20,24,25
3688:11	3653:19 3654:1,4	3672:4,15,21 3689:9	3671:21 3673:1	3734:7,8 3738:21
scene 3733:22	sense 3732:19	3689:11 3691:2	specialists 3664:14	start 3641:10 3646:4
scenes 3709:10	sensible 3641:4	3693:20 3694:3	specific 3642:25 3646:2	3654:20 3657:14
Scott 3644:17 3646:9	3718:16	3714:24,24 3738:23	3649:17 3650:10	3659:24 3698:21
3646:14,21	sent 3671:2	situations 3638:15	3653:15 3661:16	3699:12 3735:12
Scott's 3647:12,13	sentence 3676:6	3642:9 3643:4	3668:3 3670:11	started 3639:13
scroll 3704:25	sentences 3642:25	3645:19 3646:1	3671:3 3672:23	3697:14 3706:6
se 3725:20	sentiment 3673:2	3656:12 3672:10	3674:15 3679:7	3714:23 3716:9
search 3657:19	separated 3690:13	SIU 3667:15	3681:17 3685:20	3717:5
second 3639:22,23,24	serious 3648:8	skills 3642:6	3691:10,14,16	starters 3678:5
3641:14 3642:4,25	service 3664:23	slide 3655:23 3656:1,10	3695:11 3697:10	starting 3690:20
3643:1 3647:20	3668:18 3726:16	3656:21 3658:22,23	3702:25 3706:23	starts 3699:22
3656:3	Services 3691:8	3662:18 3664:1	specifically 3638:14	state 3641:6 3664:8
secondary 3663:10,22	Sesotho 3696:13	3665:5 3667:2,9	3639:12 3642:22	3705:24 3710:7
secondly 3688:3	3698:16 3723:8,11	3678:5,9	3644:20 3646:8,11	stated 3676:9
section 3641:8 3671:15	set 3645:8	slides 3661:21 3677:19	3647:21 3650:1,3	statement 3639:1
3674:14 3677:1,2,9	Setswana 3698:20	3677:21 3678:2	3651:2 3654:10	3647:8 3649:16
3677:10 3683:11	3723:12 3737:13,21	slightly 3657:23	3655:23 3656:2,11	3675:17 3676:15,21
3696:4			-	-
207011	seven 3691:7	slowly 3645:14 3655:5	3671:6,9 3673:19	3676:22 3677:14
sections 3677:5	shacks 3717:20	small 3650:21,22	3674:24 3678:4,5	3680:5,12,13,16
see 3640:24 3651:7,19	shape 3683:5	3658:2 3678:23	3685:21 3686:13	3681:23 3685:6,18,2
3652:12 3655:12	share 3721:19	3679:2	3687:9 3703:1	3685:22 3686:4,13,1
3656:5 3662:20,21,23	she'll 3647:4	smoothly 3669:7	3712:14	3688:1 3692:4
3663:1,5,11,12	she's 3677:25	solution 3731:19	speech 3695:19	3694:24 3696:20
3664:9,10 3665:5	shooting 3703:14,20,25	somebody 3646:19	3696:25 3697:2,7,8	3702:25 3706:8,15
3667:1,4 3674:6,7,16	3704:3,21 3705:7,16	3653:8 3670:21	3697:18 3698:7,13	3730:10 3731:7
3674:17,20 3675:25	3714:18 3728:9	3671:1 3678:20	3699:1 3700:8	3732:10 3734:19
3676:2,11,12 3686:18	3738:3,10	3689:3 3690:6	3701:20 3703:6	3735:12
3687:13,14 3688:19	shops 3712:7	3717:10	3710:13	statements 3677:24,24
3688:22,25 3689:8,10	short 3684:10 3707:1	soon 3641:23 3656:10	spend 3685:15 3702:13	3680:19 3685:20
3689:12,13 3691:19	shortcomings 3692:11	3687:20 3691:10	spent 3682:8	3729:20 3730:25
3695:17,21 3703:25	3692:15	3718:24	spoke 3678:21	3731:24,25
3704:7,11,12,14,18	shortly 3675:19 3681:9	sooner 3666:9	spoken 3735:19 3736:2	states 3656:3 3687:9
3704:20,24 3705:5	shot 3707:25	sorry 3647:25 3649:21	spontaneous 3642:19	station 3704:9,10
3706:12 3707:3,17	shots 3688:2	3651:17 3675:23	3643:2,9,15,22,25	3706:3,5,13 3726:19
3711:2,3 3732:23	show 3670:21 3671:1	3676:13,13 3701:13	3644:3 3645:5,7,9,10	3726:20
seeing 3674:19 3677:9	3686:19 3695:18	3716:15 3735:17	3645:12 3733:22	stay 3699:11,12
3705:21	3731:18	3740:6,13,16	sporting 3688:11,13	stemming 3736:16
seek 3731:1		sort 3654:23 3659:3,16	Springs 3664:4	steps 3715:5
	showing 3670:20	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
seemingly 3646:14	3703:3	3668:24,25 3695:6	SS1 3692:4	stop 3651:14 3677:25
3662:11 3663:3,7	shown 3680:12 3695:12	sorted 3697:15	SS2 3671:6,7,8 3674:3	strategies 3711:24
3665:23 3676:21	3696:1 3698:24	sorts 3701:15	3732:25 3733:2	strategy 3679:23
3688:3 3702:20	shows 3705:22	sound 3643:4 3709:25	stadium 3688:18	strength 3664:2
3707:24 3710:10	shreds 3649:4	sounded 3678:1	3689:10	strictly 3706:12
seen 3638:19,20	side 3657:6 3660:21	3697:12 3698:2	staff 3719:21	striking 3707:5
sees 3664:2	3694:16 3705:21	sounds 3718:16 3739:9	staffing 3663:24	strong 3699:11,12
self 3707:15 3708:1	3715:11 3737:11	3739:13	stage 3638:18 3640:3	strongly 3706:18
3737:16	significance 3644:12	soundtrack 3698:5	3647:17 3661:19	structured 3669:19
self-evident 3726:1	Significantly 3704:12	sourced 3661:19	3668:20 3673:7	study 3639:16,21
Semenya 3641:22,25	simple 3690:4	3695:14	3675:2 3678:1 3681:6	3640:2
3646:20 3647:15,23	sincerely 3702:5	sources 3638:11,12	3681:25 3686:18	sub 3671:10 3733:13
3648:3 3662:4	singer 3648:4,4	3652:17,21 3653:1,9	3696:2 3702:9	subject 3647:15
3677:17,20 3678:8	single 3678:13	South 3638:16 3640:10	3706:23 3710:2	3725:11
3680:3,8,11 3682:1	Sir 3665:20 3667:6	3648:7 3699:21	3717:24 3725:25	subjects 3723:19
3683:24 3684:17	siSwati 3723:10	3733:3	3727:11 3732:11	3736:17
3698:2 3702:1,10	sit 3682:7 3711:1	speak 3641:5 3670:9	stages 3644:21 3645:8	submission 3671:20
5070.2 5702.1,10	3717:11 3740:5	speaking 3697:14	stand 3739:11	3690:9 3715:16
3708:5,7 3729:19		3723:5,8 3737:13,21	standards 3692:9	3736:16 3739:13
3708:5,7 3729:19	sitting 3653:20 3691:23		3693:4	submit 3654:8 3661:13
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11	sitting 3653:20 3691:23 situation 3643:5 3644:9	speaks 3659.22.25	1071.4	
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11 3732:6,15,18 3734:9	situation 3643:5 3644:9	speaks 3659:22,25 3660:2 3671:16		
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11 3732:6,15,18 3734:9 3734:20 3736:9,14	situation 3643:5 3644:9 3644:11 3650:9	3660:2 3671:16	standing 3643:11	3663:21 3664:11
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11 3732:6,15,18 3734:9 3734:20 3736:9,14 3737:19,20,25 3740:2	situation 3643:5 3644:9 3644:11 3650:9 3651:14 3653:2	3660:2 3671:16 special 3690:23	standing 3643:11 3671:6,11,14 3678:15	3663:21 3664:11 submitted 3661:21
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11 3732:6,15,18 3734:9 3734:20 3736:9,14 3737:19,20,25 3740:2 Semenya's 3678:4	situation 3643:5 3644:9 3644:11 3650:9 3651:14 3653:2 3655:10,11,13 3657:3	3660:2 3671:16 special 3690:23 3708:15	standing 3643:11 3671:6,11,14 3678:15 3678:17 3679:4	3663:21 3664:11 submitted 3661:21 3691:21
3708:5,7 3729:19 3730:5,19 3731:11 3732:6,15,18 3734:9 3734:20 3736:9,14 3737:19,20,25 3740:2	situation 3643:5 3644:9 3644:11 3650:9 3651:14 3653:2	3660:2 3671:16 special 3690:23	standing 3643:11 3671:6,11,14 3678:15	3663:21 3664:11 submitted 3661:21

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

Rustenburg

				Dama 1
	1		1	Page 1
substantiated 3734:16	systematic 3726:14	testify 3707:24	3655:21 3657:5,11	3717:7,21,23 3721:11
sub-paragraphs	3727:19	testimony 3712:16	3659:6,24 3661:9	3722:5,9,15 3723:3
3733:23	systems 3729:8	3713:20	3664:18 3666:12,20	3726:15 3727:20,20
success 3642:10	5,5001115 0 / 2,510	text 3696:5	3669:2,23 3671:13	3728:25 3729:6
successful 3672:8	T	thank 3638:5 3641:13	3673:8,23 3677:22,25	3732:20 3733:6,8
succinct 3651:8	tactical 3677:2 3679:2	3641:25 3644:14	3681:4,17 3682:4	3734:3,23,25 3735:1
sufficient 3658:20	3693:23	3645:18 3647:18	3685:4,7 3699:8	3735:6,15,25 3736:17
3659:9 3660:6,9	take 3638:3 3639:25	3649:10 3655:19	3716:13,16,19,21	3736:18,20 3737:17
3661:11 3664:14	3643:19 3645:14,22	3657:21 3661:9	3717:9 3718:12	3737:21,21 3738:7,17
3672:22 3673:1	3647:3 3648:15	3662:2,3,17 3673:16	3727:8 3731:2	3738:18,22 3739:16
3703:15	3658:4,23 3660:23,24	3675:12 3676:2,19	3735:23 3737:4	traditionally 3714:13
suggest 3681:2 3684:2	3672:7 3673:10	3682:13 3687:8	3739:21 3740:8,11	tragic 3639:9
3684:7 3686:24	3674:2,22 3675:5	3689:16 3695:25	thinking 3639:12	train 3669:24,25
3696:9 3710:4 3711:1	3678:3 3682:20	3698:1 3699:24	third 3673:17	3694:14
3718:14	3685:11 3688:16,20	3700:5,6 3703:11	thought 3648:5	trained 3664:21
suggested 3641:21	3698:3,4 3699:16	3704:4 3710:13	3661:18 3675:3	3683:11 3694:3
3684:5 3685:10	3701:24 3702:8	3711:5 3712:13	3682:12 3696:19	3700:3
3686:1 3730:2 3737:5	3703:8 3708:15	3715:23 3726:3	3710:1 3735:17	training 3642:4 3649:1
3737:6	3711:1 3712:6	3727:17 3729:17	thousand 3658:2	3666:5 3668:13
suggestion 3709:12	3713:16 3714:8	3735:11	threat 3660:12,12,16	3669:23 3673:23
3736:11	3717:24 3718:7,13,17	thanks 3638:8 3662:15	3661:1 3672:16	3692:8 3693:3,16,17
suggests 3688:2	3719:3 3720:14	that's 3639:2 3640:14	three 3641:1,2 3644:21	3693:23,24
summary 3739:20	3731:8,21,24 3732:2	3642:11 3644:25	3687:12 3690:3,19	transcribed 3696:7
sun 3699:4	3732:16 3737:16	3645:16 3646:25	Thursday 3707:4	transcribers 3698:4
supervising 3692:7	3740:12,14	3650:23 3651:17	time 3643:21 3646:7	transcript 3696:10
3693:2	taken 3643:22 3647:3	3652:20 3655:10,21	3647:16 3652:5,6,7	3698:4,6
support 3661:6 3664:3	3652:24 3654:7	3657:22 3658:3,4,15	3654:24 3655:9,9,11	trouble 3734:11
3672:11 3709:12	3689:15 3700:11	3658:22 3659:6	3658:9 3660:12	3737:22
supporting 3732:7	3702:12 3715:6	3665:6 3667:4,4,6,9	3661:1 3666:16	true 3640:15 3646:21
support's 3665:23	3720:16	3667:12,13,25,25	3667:20 3670:19	3667:25 3670:15
support \$ 3003.23 suppose 3694:21	talk 3642:5 3653:5	3668:14 3669:4	3673:4 3677:8 3679:1	3706:22
3697:18 3702:3		3674:10 3678:16		trust 3641:24 3663:8
3709:16	3670:4 3688:11,12 3706:2 3712:2 3720:3	3681:10 3682:22	3680:24 3682:7,8,19	3699:4
	3726:19		3683:14 3685:15	
supposed 3643:18		3683:8,20 3684:5,16	3686:18 3687:5	try 3644:6 3655:10
3683:14 3695:18	talking 3643:20	3684:17 3689:18	3688:25 3689:4	3659:23 3697:16
3706:18 3728:2	3652:18 3653:2	3691:12 3692:12	3690:5 3692:7	trying 3658:15 3699:14
3729:13	3657:5 3692:1,19	3693:8,13 3694:12,18	3693:19 3694:15	3699:15
supposedly 3651:15	3694:11 3724:6,20	3697:14 3710:18,22	3699:4,6,7,10	Tsiloane 3687:10
sure 3642:16 3643:10	talks 3661:4	3712:1,11,18 3713:18	3702:13,21 3703:12	TST 3693:22
3645:12 3648:13,19	Tami 3711:6	3716:16,21,23 3718:2	3705:8,14,23 3706:12	Tswana 3698:20
3648:22 3649:7	task 3669:17 3690:23	3720:25 3722:6,17,21	3706:24 3709:13	3723:5 3738:2
3650:6,11,16 3652:2	3691:10,14,16,17	3723:15 3726:8	3714:10 3715:22	TT3 3649:20 3651:15
3654:15,24 3655:17	tasks 3674:15	3727:8 3728:24	3720:15,24 3721:1,5	TT4 3649:20 3651:17
3660:6 3665:13	Tatane 3639:10	theme 3642:4 3655:20	3727:8	3651:18 3654:9
3667:21 3668:19	3700:12	3673:17 3690:13	times 3699:14,15	TT5 3649:20 3651:2,3
3669:10 3672:22	tea 3673:10	themes 3642:2	Tip 3711:1 3719:3,5,7	3654:10
3675:2 3678:18	team 3646:22 3650:18	thereabouts 3665:16	3719:10,15	turn 3638:12 3647:20
3680:25 3687:2,23	3681:22 3697:22	thereof 3709:22	TIT 3665:25 3667:15	3655:20,22 3662:18
3689:5 3693:3	teams 3678:10	there'd 3725:9	title 3703:20 3704:1	3664:6 3673:17
3694:14 3695:22	techniques 3711:17	there's 3648:5 3650:9	Titus 3638:24	3689:17 3703:11
3699:20 3706:10	tell 3648:2 3675:8	3657:17 3658:19	today 3638:12 3682:8	turning 3673:5
3708:18 3709:14	3681:13 3691:5	3663:16 3670:19	3699:4 3730:23	turns 3663:25 3734:15
3712:11 3713:25	3734:9	3672:18 3679:14	told 3647:3,15 3658:14	twenty 3719:20 3720:4
3714:9 3715:10,13,14	telling 3639:6	3690:5 3695:19	3664:17 3702:10	two 3640:22,24
3716:8,10 3717:6	tells 3660:11,11	3714:13 3722:4	3729:22	3646:11 3654:8
3720:23 3724:6,11,12	3715:21	they're 3641:9 3728:17	tomorrow 3717:12	3668:1 3671:4 3673:7
3725:2 3726:4,25	tendency 3728:6	they've 3677:3 3698:4	3740:13	3688:10 3709:10,11
3727:24	tender 3725:22	3698:5	tool 3640:9	3731:20 3733:23
surely 3655:5	tense 3651:14 3658:17	thing 3639:22 3642:3	top 3684:3,9	type 3644:12 3650:19
surprise 3645:22	term 3693:10 3694:7	3655:16 3670:6	total 3667:13	3653:2 3655:13
surprised 3740:9	5725.10	3680:19 3706:2	tough 3699:14	3660:12,15,18 3672:4
surrender 3651:12	terminologies 3691:25	3724:7 3729:12	town 3672:11	3688:11,12,20
suspect 3641:2	terms 3663:24 3672:16	things 3646:7 3655:13	trade 3671:19	3689:11 3693:23
Swaziland 3737:4	3700:17 3703:1	3672:6 3728:5	traditional 3713:1,5,5	3717:1
sweeping 3729:20	3730:22 3738:20	3740:17	3713:8,22 3714:19	
3730:10	territories 3717:19	think 3650:7,14	3715:7 3716:18	U
ARCHIVE FO	R LUSTICE		1	1

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

Rustenburg

				Page 1
ultimately 3644:19	valuable 3682:7	weapons 3645:4	3729:25 3730:3,13	3673:14,14 3675:5
3708:17	value 3638:10 3640:7	3651:10,13 3707:7,11	3731:3,4 3732:8	3678:6 3680:19
Umtata 3665:24 3666:9	3646:16 3649:3,13	3707:14 3736:24	3740:15	3687:1 3710:20
uncalled 3706:19	3686:11 3700:17	well-known 3670:23	witnesses 3681:3,14	3713:20 3721:6,7
underemphasised	3709:22	well-organised 3712:3	3715:19 3730:23,25	3723:24 3740:15
3682:1	values 3738:18	went 3645:4	3731:22,24 3734:13	you've 3638:4 3643:23
understand 3641:16	various 3638:11	weren't 3645:21	witness's 3657:19	3655:12 3678:22
3645:8 3648:17	3641:18 3645:8	3648:24 3668:7	witness's 3709:6	3679:14 3682:11,16
3666:3,11 3670:18	3648:25 3664:1	3681:10 3682:10,21	wonder 3701:15	3689:19 3690:11
3674:8 3696:11	3669:3	3728:25 3737:9	Wonderkop 3707:6	3709:6 3713:10
3698:14 3701:3	vast 3665:24 3737:2	West 3664:8	3713:1 3715:7	3730:15 3731:8
3702:11 3703:3	venue 3720:6	Western 3664:8	3721:21 3724:2	3734:6
3705:21 3706:1,9	Vermaak 3687:18	we'd 3682:2 3698:9	3727:21 3738:3	
3713:19 3717:1	vicinity 3717:20	we'll 3640:18 3644:11	won't 3650:16 3654:15	Z
3722:11 3723:20	video 3695:11,13,14	3655:9 3656:9	3670:24 3678:22	ZCC 3660:13
3725:9 3728:16,24	3696:1,23 3697:17	3660:10 3667:17	3679:13 3685:15	
3734:11 3737:5	3698:5,24 3703:3	3670:6 3691:11	3711:1 3725:6 3728:4	0
3739:18	video\post 3697:5	3692:23 3714:3	word 3643:24 3701:12	000 3652:3 3654:20,21
understandable	view 3665:15 3725:15	3715:24 3724:6	words 3649:4 3732:15	3658:1 3659:16
3734:13	3727:11	3726:4	work 3640:3,11,12	3660:8,13,14,15,24
understanding 3656:22	viewed 3693:11	we're 3646:6 3656:6	3662:13 3669:12,19	3660:24 3663:4,14,22
3721:20 3722:7,25	views 3650:4	3659:15 3661:2	3670:1,1 3672:1,3	3735:2
understands 3678:19	Village 3707:6	3665:3 3680:25	3700:16,22 3714:1	09:38 3638:2
3714:9	violent 3646:5 3707:8	3690:4 3691:9	3720:23 3737:10	09:58 3647:6
understood 3668:5,8	3724:2	3725:14	workers 3721:23	
3735:18,24 3736:4	vital 3715:5 3716:4	we've 3642:2,3 3647:2	3722:2,12	1
3737:8	3738:20	3659:21,24 3686:10	working 3669:6 3691:2	1 3656:24 3658:22
unfair 3680:4	VOC 3688:14,17	3695:15,16	3737:7	3667:12 3718:18
unfold 3644:21	voiceover 3697:13	we'll 3708:12	works 3720:23 3734:12	3719:20
unfolded 3645:19	W	we're 3701:10	world 3732:9 3734:20	1st 3730:24 3731:6,23
3664:15		what's 3658:9 3677:23	would've 3729:7,21	1.2 3705:1
unfolding 3683:17	wage 3737:1	3683:14 3684:25	write 3705:13	10 3686:6 3718:13
unforeseen 3733:22	wait 3700:14,19 3721:5	3695:18 3714:9	writing 3653:25,25	10th 3724:19
unfortunate 3736:10 unhelpful 3708:9	waiting 3720:19,20 3721:1,3	3727:3,7 3728:12 White 3646:10 3647:20	written 3674:15,19	10(1) 3674:4 10(2) (a) 2674:12
unions 3671:19	want 3638:12 3641:3	3647:23 3648:3,6	3678:17 3685:5,18,20 3685:22	10(2)(c) 3674:13 10:18 3655:19
units 3664:1 3669:3,6	3686:13 3687:1	3649:3,17,25 3650:12	wrong 3659:23 3682:6	10:38 3664:6
3670:5,11 3671:22	3698:19 3699:23	3683:2 3684:14	3685:25 3701:18	10:58 3672:25
3726:16	3700:7,23 3718:8	3685:17 3686:2	3716:14 3717:11	10.36 5672.25 100 3667:2
unity 3737:14	3725:7 3728:16	White's 3647:8 3648:8	3737:5	11 3663:3,14 3733:11
unknown 3704:22	3738:24,25 3739:4	3649:16 3681:19	WW1 3639:4	11th 3724:6,15
3705:22 3706:16	wanted 3642:2	3684:21	WW2 3684:13	11:22 3673:13
unnecessary 3707:2	wants 3710:25 3716:17	wholeheartedly	WW4 3662:1,9,17	11:42 3683:21
3727:8	warning 3678:1	3701:12	3667:9	12 3651:22
unplanned 3644:4	3707:10	who're 3728:2	WW5 3675:11 3696:17	12:02 3693:18
unrest 3724:9 3725:1,9	Warrant 3675:17	who's 3648:4 3660:13	WW6 3696:21,22	12:22 3699:20
3725:20 3738:10,20	3696:20	3680:13 3727:13	3697:17	12:42 3709:24
unrests 3724:17	warrant-officer	3728:18	WW7 3703:22,23	128 3667:3
3726:12 3729:10	3677:16	who've 3720:19 3721:1		13:02 3718:4
unsubstantiated	wasn't 3645:6 3668:21	willing 3736:19	Y	131 3655:23,23
3734:19	3732:8	wish 3695:11 3701:16	year 3724:1	137 3657:14
upcoming 3710:9	waste 3647:16 3686:18	3701:17 3739:11	yesterday 3638:10	139 3657:15
update 3654:12	3687:4 3727:8	wishes 3708:6	3642:1 3664:17	14 3733:21
upfront 3664:18	wasteful 3682:7	withdraw 3734:17	3673:18 3692:14	14.1 3733:19
upgraded 3693:17	water 3687:15	withdrawing 3739:14	3695:11 3703:17	142 3657:16 3658:22
uphold 3681:5 3708:10	way 3642:12,15 3646:4	witness 3638:25 3641:8	3710:17	144 3657:16 3658:23
Uppington 3667:2	3655:21 3659:24	3646:25 3680:7,8,10	yesterday's 3642:21	15 3718:13
	3661:7 3668:22	3680:11,13,15 3681:2	you'd 3659:4,18	15th 3644:22
up-to-date 3651:24			3682:20 3698:22	15:18 3720:18
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6	3677:12 3678:16	3681:9 3682:6 3684:6		
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7	3681:8 3706:8	3684:10,22 3686:19	you'll 3645:16 3655:15	15:38 3729:3
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7 use 3638:15 3650:21	3681:8 3706:8 3708:20 3709:15	3684:10,22 3686:19 3686:20 3701:5,17,22	you'll 3645:16 3655:15 3658:9 3665:5 3686:4	15:38 3729:3 15:45 3707:12
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7 use 3638:15 3650:21 3684:5 3685:10	3681:8 3706:8 3708:20 3709:15 3718:23 3720:22	3684:10,22 3686:19 3686:20 3701:5,17,22 3703:9 3708:8,8	you'll 3645:16 3655:15 3658:9 3665:5 3686:4 3711:2,19 3725:23	15:38 3729:3 15:45 3707:12 15:58 3738:1
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7 use 3638:15 3650:21 3684:5 3685:10 3686:2 3720:24	3681:8 3706:8 3708:20 3709:15 3718:23 3720:22 3727:16 3729:1	3684:10,22 3686:19 3686:20 3701:5,17,22 3703:9 3708:8,8 3711:2 3715:25	you'll 3645:16 3655:15 3658:9 3665:5 3686:4 3711:2,19 3725:23 you're 3638:3 3639:6	15:38 3729:3 15:45 3707:12 15:58 3738:1 16 3656:2 3704:21
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7 use 3638:15 3650:21 3684:5 3685:10	3681:8 3706:8 3708:20 3709:15 3718:23 3720:22 3727:16 3729:1 3731:1 3734:12	3684:10,22 3686:19 3686:20 3701:5,17,22 3703:9 3708:8,8 3711:2 3715:25 3719:1,3,6,12	you'll 3645:16 3655:15 3658:9 3665:5 3686:4 3711:2,19 3725:23 you're 3638:3 3639:6 3643:20 3644:2	15:38 3729:3 15:45 3707:12 15:58 3738:1 16 3656:2 3704:21 3733:7,10
up-to-date 3651:24 3683:6 urgency 3641:7 use 3638:15 3650:21 3684:5 3685:10 3686:2 3720:24	3681:8 3706:8 3708:20 3709:15 3718:23 3720:22 3727:16 3729:1	3684:10,22 3686:19 3686:20 3701:5,17,22 3703:9 3708:8,8 3711:2 3715:25	you'll 3645:16 3655:15 3658:9 3665:5 3686:4 3711:2,19 3725:23 you're 3638:3 3639:6	15:38 3729:3 15:45 3707:12 15:58 3738:1 16 3656:2 3704:21

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

RealTime Transcriptions

3714:18 3724:1 497 3676:17 3728:9 378:11,13 5 167 366:20 367:23 5 3737:04:13 53 3657:12 3365:12,1 53 3657:15 33658:12,1 53 3657:15 33658:12,1 53 3657:15 33658:12,1 53 3657:15 33651:13 53 3657:15 23 3662:13 3677:19,21 53 3657:15 33663:13 677:13 3678:59 6 6 6352:5,14 3664:1 3663:13 3677:13 336554 33652:23 3637:12 336554 33652:23 3637:17 336554 33652:33 667:12 33657:17 368:22 2013 366:12 3663:14 70 3677:13 738:22 2013 366:12 3663:14 70 3677:13 738:22 2013 666:12 53 667:18 3702:11 3724:10 78 3659:14 3658:11 213 686:14 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 913 686:1 9 31 682:2 3665:1	Page
107 3565:20 3657:23 5 3662:18 17 3704:13 50 3655:3 3687:20 17 3704:13 53 3657:15 17 3704:12 53 3657:15 182 3677:21 3678:59 5 3663:15 182 3677:21 3678:59 6 2 6 3 3652:3 3657:23 6679 3692.4 3 3657:4 3657:3 6407:3657.3 3 3651:13 3676:1 3 5654 20 3642:22 3643:1,1 7 21 3631:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707.4 20 3642:22 3663:1,1 70 363:15 3655.2 3063:15 3676:1 70 3657.17 3658:22 73 3704:1 3724:18 7 3004:32 3731:24 76 3655.16 3724:10 78 3659.4 3665:11 3704:21 3724:18,19 3657:16 3658:21 3704:21 3724:18,19 3657:12 3663:13 3704:21 37376:18 9 3704:21 3737:18 9 3733:33 3734:1 9 303 576:16 3733:13.3 3733:33 3734:1 9:30 3740:13 223 3676:17 93 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 3657:6 3057:16 3733:13,14 37352:3 36657:	
17 3704:13 50 3655:12 3657:15 3658:12.21 57 3694:23 3658:12.21 57 3694:23 2 565 3053:15 59 3663:15 2 6 365:12 3657:16 3720:15 57 3694:23 3720:15 3657:13 3692:4 365:13 3697:22 3657:16 3720:15 53 555:4 365:13 3697:22 3656:63 2.1.1 3707:1 7 2002 3663:14 70 3657:17 3685:22 3045:13 3697:22 3656:15 3045:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707:4 2002 3663:14 70 3657:17 3685:22 3042:1 377:41:81:9 73 3659:4 3665:11 2012 307:52:5 3704:13 3707:4 3704:21 377:41:81:9 3657:16 3658:21 2013 308:1 9 223 3637:12 374:13 3774:13 370:22 374:13 2677:13 373:33 373:16 373:13 374:13 2677:13 373:33 373:14 374 373:33 373:14 374 373:33 373:14 374 365:23 36:5:16 3655:6 3045:33 36:	
176 5357:17,23 3658:2 53 3657:15 3658:12.21 53 3637:15 181 3677:19.21 595 3663:15 23 3656:24 3658:23 3667:19 3692:4 3 3655:15 3676:1 3702:15 3 3655:13 3676:1 3702:15 3 3655:14 630 3656:3 21 3651:18 3 630 3656:3 20 3642:22 3643:1,1 7 7 3665:15 3676:1 3674:3 3707.4 2006 3663:15 761 3565:5 3006 3663:15 70 3671:18 3665:1 2012 3663:14 71 3724:18 70 3657:15 3665:11 73 3667:2 2013 3661:22 3663:14 71 3524:18 3704:21 3724:18,19 3667:2 21 3686:14 9 3704:21 372:18,19 3667:2 21 3686:14 9 223 3676:18 3702:1 3665:23 3731:12 95 3663:11 21 3686:14 9 223 3676:18 3702:21 3665:24 3670:28 3663:31.41,17 3665:33 333 333:33 333:33 363:34.43 365:23 3654:4 9 3065:23 3731:13 3663:34.41,17 3663:34 14,17	
3688:12.21 \$7.3694:23 81:3677:19.21 \$95.3663:15 23656:24:3658:23 \$663:15 3663:15:3676:1 \$6.6 3720:15 \$3655:4 370:15 \$3655:4 365:15:3676:1 \$6.30:3656:3 21.13:07:1 \$63:3656:3 21.13:07:1 \$63:3656:3 21.13:07:1 \$63:566:5 30:365:15 \$66:55 30:365:14 \$70:365:16 70:365:15 \$36:56:16 77:36:35:15 \$36:56:16 78:36:9:43:365:11 \$72:41:10 37:42:10:22:36:37:41:13 \$36:57:16 37:24:10:22:36:38:16 \$73:72:21 21:13:36:12:23:36:38:16 \$70:72:1 37:24:13:12:33:37:34:13 \$36:71:6 37:24:13:12:33:37:34:13 \$73:28:82:23:73:8:13 9:37:02:21 \$70:22:1 21:3 68:61:4 \$9 9:3 70:22:1 \$72:82:82:23:33:8:13 22:3 63:74:25:3 67:61:8 \$374:1:3:77:21 37:33:3 37:34:1 \$73:38:13:37:33:13 365:1:13 \$95:3663:3:14,17 365:1:10:37:33:13:13 \$95:3665:6:12 <tr< td=""><td></td></tr<>	
181 3677:19.21 182 3677:19.21 2 3653:15 3663:15 3677:19.22 3663:15 3677:19.24 3663:15 3677:19.24 3663:15 3657:4 303 3653:14 20.3642:22 3643:1,1 3645:13 3607:2 2001 3654:4 30063:16 70 2002 3663:15 7 3663:15 2001 3651:4 3724:10 76 3724:10 78 3724:10 78 3724:12 3708:12 3724:12 3708:13 3724:12 3708:14 3724:12 3708:13 3724:12 3708:13 3724:12 3708:13 3724:12 3708:13 3724:12 3708:13 3724:13 3728:18 323 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 <	
182 3677:21 3678:59 6 2 3653:13 3676:1 3643 3663:13 3667:2 3700:15 3653:13 3676:1 3643 3656:3 21.1 3707:1 3655:1 3655:3 2003 364:22 3643:1,1 3663:53 3665:3 3724:18 2004 3703:6 707:4 7063:15 3665:5 2002 3663:14 70:3672:17 3658:22 3674:3 3707:4 70:365:14 70:3672:17 3658:22 3674:3 3707:4 70:365:15 3724:10 3655:1 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3675:25 3704:13 37057:16 3658:21 3667:2 3667:2 2012 3675:24 3667:2 3667:2 3667:2 2013 3638:1 9 3702:21 3722:13 3724:12 3676:18 9:3722:13 3728:82 23738:13 95 223 6367:42 3676:18 9:3722:13 3728:82 23738:13 95 370:42 373:12 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3734:13 3657:12 3676:17 9:3 6635:1 36635:1 36635:1 36635:1 360:23 3657:17:10:10 36658:24 3659:3 36635:61/2 36635:61/2 36635:61/2 20 3664:4 3 36635:61/2 </td <td></td>	
0 6 23656:24 3658:23 3667:19 3692:4 3663:15 3676:1 3657:4 3720:15 3655:4 21 3651:18 630 3656:3 21 3651:18 630 3656:3 20 3642:22 3643:1,1 7 73663:15 3677:4 200 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2002 3663:15 70 3655:16 7274:10 73 3653:12 2012 3675:25 3704:13 7 704:10 73 3655:14 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3657:16 3658:1 9 3704:21 3724:18,19 7 3667:20 22 3668:1 223 368:1 9 323 3734:13 9 3735:23 3654:29,21 36657:16 3658:1 3659:3 3	
2 6 3652:5,14 3664:1 3667:9 3692:4 2 365:42 3658:23 3653:15 3676:1 3607:9 3692:4 3720:15 3655:3 21.1 3707:1 3655:3 200 3663:15 3607:22 3655:4 3045:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707.4 200 3663:14 7 3645:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707.4 200 3663:14 70 3657.17 3658:22 201 3661:22 3663:15 70 3657.17 3658:22 201 3661:22 3663:15 78 3659:4 3665:11 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 9 3704:21 3724:18,19 9 3704:21 3724:18,19 9 3704:21 3724:18,19 9 3704:21 3724:18,19 9 3704:21 3727:13 378:13 213 368:14 9 9 3702:21 9 223 3638:1 9:30 3740:13 224 3671:23 3654:20,21 36655:3 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3667:16 3733:13,14 3735:2	
2 3656:24 3658:23 3667:9 3692:4 3 667:9 3692:4 6AM 3651:16,22 3 720:15 3555:4 21 3651:18 3607:22 6AM 3651:16,22 3 645:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707.4 20 3642:22 3643:1,1 7 3 645:13 3697:22 3674:3 3707.4 2006 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2011 3661:22 3663:8,15 76 3665:16 3724:10 73 3657:17 3658:22 2012 3675:25 3704:13 8 3724:21 3724:18,19 8 3724:21 3724:18,19 8 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9:3072:21 9 3702:21 95 36633:14,17 98 3652:3 373:12 95 3663:3,14,17 98 3652:3 373:12 95 3663:3,14,17 98 3652:3 373:12 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 367:14 373:3 374:1 263 364:16 78 367:23 367:17 3665:6,12 3663:16 78 3663:16 78 3664:4 34 314 36	
3663:15 3676:1 6AM 3651:16,22 3720:15 630 365:4 2.1 3651:18 630 365:63 2.1 3707:1 7 30452:23 3643:1,1 7 3645:13 3697:22 7 3663:15 3665:5 301 367:22 3643:1,1 7 3645:13 3697:22 7 3663:15 3665:16 2002 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2002 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2013 363:12:22 36334:15 73 3659:4 3665:11 2012 367:52 3704:13 73 3659:4 3665:11 2013 3638:1 9 21 3686:14 9 3722:12 3667:2 21 3686:14 9 3722:12 37367:18 3723:23 373:16 9:303740:13 3265:23 3734:1 9:302:21 326 3649:16 26 26 3649:16 26 26 3649:16 3665:6.12 3655:4.13 3665:6.12 3656:6.12 3665:6.12 3656:6.12 3665:6.12 3656:6.12 3665:6.12 3656:6.12 3665:6.12 3658:1 3659:15 3666:6.12 3667:12	
3720:15 3655:4 2.1 3651:18 630 3656:3 2.1 3707:1 7 20 3642:22 3643:1,1 7 7 3663:15 3665:5 3674:3 3707:4 2000 3663:14 7th 3724:18 70 2000 3663:15 76 3665:16 3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3663:15 76 3665:16 3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3675:25 3704:13 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3724:12.22 36363:1 2013 3638:1 9 3702:21 213 368:14 9 3702:21 223 6364:25 376:18 3724:52 636:18 3728:8,22 3738:13 223 6364:25 3665:6,12 3733:3 3734:1 3655:3 3659:15 3660:24 3659:15 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 96 3663:14 3733:3 3734:1 75:2 3061:26 3730:15 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 308 366:43 314 3673:12 314 3667:12 314 3673:12 334 3733:16 3734:2 34	
2.1 3651:18 630 3656:3 2.1.1 3707:1 7 200 364:22 3643:1,1 7 3645:13 3697:22 7 2002 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2002 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2013 3661:22 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2011 3661:22 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2012 3675:25 3704:13 78 3659:16 3742:1 3724:18,19 78 3659:13 3744:1 3724:12,122 8 3657:16 3658:21 2012-08-16 3707:4 3667:2 21 368:1 9 21 368:14 9 9 3704:21 3724:18 9 3704:21 3727:21 3667:13 326 3574:25 3676:18 9th 3724:1 3727:21 327 367:618 9:3 3053:3,14,17 9:52 3664:4 9:3 365:23 3064:20,21 3655:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3656:4:4 3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3665:20 3076:7 3665:6,12 367:13 331:3,14 4 3667:12 3676:13 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 33 33A 3733:16 3734:2 4 <	
2.1.1 3707:1 7 20 3642:22 3643:1.1 3607:22 3045:13 3607:22 3674:3 3707:4 2002 3663:15 3674:3 3707:4 2002 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2011 3661:22 3663:8,15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2012 3675:25 3704:13 73 3659:13 665:11 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3657:16 3658:21 3704:21 3707:4 3667:2 2013 3638:1 9 21 368:14 9 3702:22 3638:1 9 3702:21 91 3724:21,22 9th 3724:1 3727:21 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 3705:24 9th 3724:1 3727:21 30 3740:13 3731:13 3728:8,22 3738:13 3735:3 3734:1 9th 3658:24 3659:3 26 3664:4 3655:6,12 30 3659:15 3665:6,12 30 3740:1 9th 3731:13 3735:2 30th 3661:22 30th 3661:22 30th 3661:22 30th 3661:22 30th 367:12 30th 3661:22 30th 367:12 30th 3661:22 30th 367:12 30th 3661:24 314 3667:12 30th 3	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	
3645:13 3697:22 7 3663:15 3665:5 2001 3703:6 3674:3 3707:4 2002 3663:14 70 3657:17 3658:22 2011 3661:22 3663:8,15 70 3657:17 3658:22 3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3675:25 3704:13 78 3659:4 3665:11 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 2013 3638:1 9 21 3686:14 9 22 3638:1 9 3702:21 22 3638:1 9 3702:21 22 36367:425 3676:18 3724:13 3727:21 3733:3 373:13 374:1 33658:1 3659:3 266 3649:16 95 3663:31,41,77 269 3664:4 93 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 98 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 98 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 98 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 93 3663:24 3671:7 10,10 367:20 3676:7 3667:16 3733:13,14 373:3 373:13 373:13,714 34 3667:12 308 3664:4 34 3667:12 308 3664:4 3734:373:15 3734:2 323 367:6 333A 3733:16 3734:2	
20th 3703:6 3674:3 3707:4 2002 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2003 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2011 3661:22 3663:8,15 76 3665:16 3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3675:25 3704:13 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3724:21,22 8 3657:16 3658:21 2012-08-16 3707:4 9 21 3686:14 9 22 3638:1 9 223 6376:18 9th 3724:1 3727:21 3728:82,23 3738:13 9:30 3740:13 223 6364:4 9 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 25th 3730:23 3731:23 95 3663:3,14,17 263 364:5 98 3658:24 3659:3 266 364:6 9 3 3652:3 3654:20,211 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3667:12 3667:12 373:3 373:13,14,14,24 3667:12 3667:12 3667:12 373:3 373:16 373:13,14 373:3:10,477:4 375:2: 308 308 364:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 333 373:16 3734:2 333 373:16 3734:2 43	
2002 3663:14 7th 3724:18 2006 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 37124:10 70 3657:17 3658:22 2012 3675:25 3704:13 76 3665:16 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3657:16 3658:21 3667:2 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 9 3702:21 9th 3724:1 3727:21 9 3704:21 3728:8,22 3738:13 95 3663:3,14,17 95 3664:3 98 3658:24 3659:3 262 3649:16 3665:6,12 262 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 30452:3 3054:20.21 3665:6,12 3057:20 3076:7 3733:13 3734:1 3057:20 3076:7 367:20 3076:7 3087:16 3733:13,14 3733:13 3734:1 303 3059:16 3043733:16 3734:2 303 3059:16	
2006 3663:15 70 3657:17 3658:22 2011 3661:22 36638.15 76 3665:16 3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 2012 3675:25 3704:13 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3724:10.22 8 2013 363:1 9 213 368:14 9 213 368:14 9 213 368:14 9 223 638:1 9 2236 367:12 3676:18 9:30 3740:13 3704:22 37 3676:18 9:30 3740:13 3728:12 37376:18 9:30 3740:13 3730:23 3731:22 9:30 3740:13 3733:3 3734:1 9:30 3653:14,417 3657:12 3678:17 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:12 3658:1 3659:15 3664:4 308:16 3733:13,14 3733:13,14 3735:2 90:14 3661:22 308 363:44 3644 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 32 3677:6 333.13,134,3733:16 3734:2 333 A 3733:16 3734:2 4	
2011 3661:22 3663:8,15 3724:10 76 3665:16 3724:10 78 3665:4 3724:11 78 3655:4 3665:11 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3774:21,22 8 3657:16 3658:21 3012-08-16 3707:4 3667:2 2013 3638:1 9 213 658:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 93702:21 9th 3724:1 3727:21 93703:23 3731:22 95 3663:3,14,17 95 3663:3,14,17 95 36653:3,14,17 96 3664:5 98 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 3657:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3665:16 733:13,14 3735:2 3664:4 3634 37033:16 3734:2 3663:9,16 3733:16 3734:2 3663:9,16 3633,16 3734:2 3663:9,16	
3724:10 78 3659:4 3665:11 9012 3675:25 3704:13 8 3704:21 3724:18,19 8 3724:21,22 8 9013 3638:1 9 13 368:14 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 3702:21 94:13 727:21 3724:1 3727:21 3726:23 3731:22 95 3663:33,14,17 95 3663:33,14,17 98 3655:24 3659:3 3665:6.12 3665:6.12 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6.12 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6.12 3655:1 3659:15 3665:6.12 3665:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 901 3664:4 14 143 3667:12 23677:6 23 3671:6 3733:13,14 14 3651:16 3733:16 3734:2 3651:2 363 373:16 3734:2 3651:2	
3704:21 3724:18,19 3724:21,22 8 8 3657:16 3658:21 3667:2 9 3702:21 9 9 22 3638:1 9 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:21 9 3702:31 9 3702:31 9 3702:31 9 3702:31 9 3702:31 9 3702:31 93 3733:373:1:3 93 3652:3 3654:20.21 3660:4:4 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 367:16 3733:13,14 3733:2 3734:1 90 3667:12 90 3667:12 90 3667:12 91 3667:12 92 3667:12 93 3667:12 93 3667:12 943 3663:16 </td <td></td>	
3724:21,22 8 3657:16 3658:21 2012.08-16 3707:4 3667:2 2013.3638:1 3657:16 3658:21 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 22 3638:1 9 3702:21 9th 372:11 3727:21 376:32 3731:22 376:32 22 36 367:42 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3658:24 3659:3 366:31:12 3678:17 3665:6.12 366:31:31:4:17 9:36 365:6.12 366:31:31:4:17 9:36 365:6.12 366:31:31:4:17:10:10 3657:10 3733:13.14 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:13 373:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 373:3:3 373:1:13 3733:1:13 3	
2012-08-16 3707:4 3667:2 2013 3638:1 9 11 3686:14 9 22 3638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9 223 638:1 9:30 3740:13 3733:2 3731:22 95 3663:3,14,17 98 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 3662:3 3654:4 3665:6,12 3665:4 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3666:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 90h 3664:4 14 3735:2 90h 3664:4 3141 3667:12 10 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 90h 3664:4 14 343 3733:16 3734:2 14 353.4 3733:16 3734:2 14 363.4 3733:16 3734:2 14 363.4 3733:16 3734:2 14	
2013 $3638:1$ 9 21 $3686:14$ 9 22 $3638:1$ 9 $3702:21$ 223 $6374:25$ $3676:18$ 9th $3724:1$ $3727:21$ 3728:8,22 $3738:13$ 95 $3663:3,14,17$ 95 $3663:3,14,17$ 95 $3663:3,14,17$ 95 $3664:5$ 98 $358:24$ $3659:3$ 26 $3649:16$ 3665:6,12 26 $3649:16$ 98 $358:24$ $3659:3$ 26 $3649:16$ 3665:6,12 362 $3671:12$ $3678:17$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:6,12$ 3652:3 $3654:20,21$ $3665:15$ 3667:10 $3733:3,14,14,24$ $3667:16$ $3733:13,114$ $3735:2$ 30th $3661:22$ $308 3664:4$ 323 $373:16$ $3734:2$ $433 3663:9,16$	
9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9 9	
2 3638:1 9 3702:21 223 6 3674:25 3676:18 9th 3724:1 3727:21 3706:18 3728:8,22 3738:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:5 3664:5 9s 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 9s 3658:24 3659:3 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 3658:1 3659:15 3665:6,12 36652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3667:17,10,10 3667:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 90th 3661:22 90th 3661:22 90th 3661:22 90th 3661:22 90th 3661:22 373:15,373:16,3734:2 43 3663:9,16 43 3663:9,16	
2236 3674:25 3676:18 9th 3724:1 3727:21 2237 3676:18 3728:8,22 3738:13 224th 3675:24 9:30 3740:13 953 0563:3,14,17 95 3663:3,14,17 95 3663:3,14,17 98 3658:24 3659:3 3679:4 3731:13 3665:6,12 3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3652:3 3654:20,21 3665:6,12 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3679:16 37733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 327 3663:15 333 3734:2 333 373:16 3734:2 33663:9,16	
227 3676:18 3728:8,22 3738:13 9:30 3740:13 9:30 3740:13 9:5th 3731:22 95 3663:3,14,17 9:6 364:5 9:8 3658:24 3659:3 366:3 364:5 3665:6,12 3665:6,12 36:2 3679:4 3731:13 3655:6,12 36:3 3733:3 3734:1 3665:6,12 36:9 3664:4 36659:15 3665:15 36:0 3659:15 3660:212 3679:4 36:12 36:12 36:12 36:12 9:30:33:13,14,14,24 36:12 36:12 36:12 9:30:33:13,14,14,24 36:12 36:12 36:12 9:30:30:15 36:12 36:12 36:12 9:30:30:15 37:33:13,14 37:33:13,14 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16 37:33:16	
24th 3675:24 9:30 3740:13 25th 3730:23 3731:22 95 3663:3,14,17 256 3664:5 98 3658:24 3659:3 26 3649:16 3665:6,12 262 3671:12 3678:17 3665:6,12 3679:4 3731:13 3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4 3658:1 3659:15 3658:1 3659:15 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3673:13,14 3735:2 3664:4 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3673:13,14 3735:2 3664:4 314 3667:12 3664:4 314 3667:12 3677:6 327 3663:15 334 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16 433 663:9,16	
25th 3730:23 3731:22 95 3663:3,14,17 256 3664:5 98 3658:24 3659:3 263 649:16 3665:6,12 262 3671:12 3678:17 3665:6,12 3679:4 3731:13 3665:6,12 3733:3 3734:1 3665:6,12 269 3664:4 3658:13 3659:15 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3667:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 323 3677:6 327 3663:15 334 3733:16 3734:2 333 4 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
2256 3664:5 98 3658:24 3659:3 26 3649:16 3665:6,12 262 3671:12 3678:17 3665:6,12 3733:3 3734:1 3665:6,12 269 3664:4 3665:6,12 3 3552:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 3237 3663:15 323 3677:6 327 3663:15 323 3663:9,16 7334:2	
26 3649:16 3665:6,12 262 3671:12 3678:17 3679:4 3731:13 3679:4 3731:13 3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4	
262 3671:12 3678:17 3679:4 3731:13 3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4 3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:24 3659:15 3660:24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 343 3663:9,16	
3679:4 3731:13 3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4 3 3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3733:3 3734:1 269 3664:4 3 3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
269 3664:4 3	
3 3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3 3652:3 3654:20,21 3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3658:1 3659:15 3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3660:8,13,14,14,24 3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3660:24 3671:7,10,10 3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3675:20 3676:7 3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3687:16 3733:13,14 3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
3735:2 30th 3661:22 308 3664:4 314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
0th 3661:22 08 3664:4 14 3667:12 2 3677:6 27 3663:15 3A 3733:16 3734:2 43 3663:9,16	
3608 3664:4 114 3667:12 12 3667:6 127 3663:15 13A 3733:16 3734:2 143 3663:9,16	
314 3667:12 32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
32 3677:6 327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
327 3663:15 33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
33A 3733:16 3734:2 343 3663:9,16	
343 3663:9,16	
4	
3663:9,16,21	
40 3684:3,8,16,25	
3685:9	
41 3684:3,9	
45 3657:15	
49 3685:22 3686:15	
3687:8	

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119