RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MS HEMRAJ SC



HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: <u>realtime@pixie.co.za</u> Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



	Page 3400		Page 3402
1	[PROCEEDINGS ON 20 DECEMBER 2012]	1	notice that when Minister Steve Tshwete was appointed
2	[09:31] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission resumes.	2	Minister of Safety & Security in 1999, he made a statement,
3	Brigadier, you're still under oath. Mr Bizos, you're still	3	which I am going to read to you. "We are going to deal
4	cross-examining.	4	with criminals as bulldogs deal with a bull." Did that
5	MR BIZOS SC: Yes. Brigadier, I want to	5	come to your notice?
6	read to you the first paragraph of the background of the	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember that.
7	standing orders. "The purpose of this order is to regulate	7	MR BIZOS SC: Did you think that that
8	crowd management during gatherings and demonstrations in	8	statement was consistent with the provisions of the order
9	accordance with the democratic principles of the	9	that, well, 262? Is it consistent or inconsistent with the
10	Constitution, and acceptable international standards."	10	provisions of that order?
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir.	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's difficult for me to
12	MR BIZOS SC: You accept the validity of	12	question my senior's comment. This was the comment from
13	that duty that you had to perform in accordance with the	13	his side. It was not like an instruction, but it was a
14	principles envisaged in that standing order?	14	comment, and for me to question that is not a, is not my
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree.	15	call as a junior person.
16	MR BIZOS SC: And this is what you taught	16	MR BIZOS SC: Do I understand you to say
17	your pupils who were trained how to manage crowds?	17	that you feel obliged to take account of whatever any
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.	18	person in authority, be it political or in the police, is
19	MR BIZOS SC: Did any of your pupils or	19	binding on you?
20	learners raise any objection to this principle during your	20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never actually thought
21	training sessions?	21	in that way that such a comment I must actually look at it
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Not in my presence.	22	in this fashion. However, my point is this is my senior
23	MR BIZOS SC: And you made it clear to	23	person, he's actually talking about this position that he
24	all and sundry during your training sessions that they must	24	would like to see us dealing with crime in that position,
25	be following all their orders in relation to crowd	25	and for me to question that is not possible.
	As and E	Xir	12th
	Page 3401	100	Page 3403
1	Page 3401 Page 3401	- Ge	Page 3403 MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this
1 2			Page 3403
	management control?		MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this
2	management control? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior	2	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was
2 3	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are	2 3	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach
2 3 4	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are presented by me. Not all classes are presented by me.	2 3 4	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe?
2 3 4 5	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are presented by me. presented by me. Not all classes are presented by me. Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe I	2 3 4 5	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior
2 3 4 5 6	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are presented by me. Not all classes are presented by me. Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe I can be around, or I can present myself, but in my presence	2 3 4 5 6	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior
2 3 4 5 6 7	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me. Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.	2 3 4 5 6 7	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question was	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3403 MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	management control?Maybe, SeniorBRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3403 MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	management control?Maybe, SeniorBRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3403 MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are presented by me. Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe I can be around, or I can present myself, but in my presence I did exactly explain to people as you are saying. MR BIZOS SC: No, the question was whether in your classes any objection was offered to the principles that are in the standing orders. BRIG MKHWANAZI: No. MR BIZOS SC: We have already established	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders were	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?"
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	management control?Maybe, SeniorBRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:Yes.MR BIZOS SC:Now you read newspapers.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	management control?Maybe, SeniorBRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:Yes.MR BIZOS SC:Now you read newspapers.The people that you trained read newspapers, listen to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how we're going to deal with crime, and the standing order is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:Yes.MR BIZOS SC:Now you read newspapers.The people that you trained read newspapers, listen to theradio, and they are informed citizens of the land, as one	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how we're going to deal with crime, and the standing order is totally talking about crowd management. It's the two
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	management control?BRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Not all classes are presented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:Yes.MR BIZOS SC:Now you read newspapers.The people that you trained read newspapers, listen to theradio, and they are informed citizens of the land, as onewould expect of police officers.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how we're going to deal with crime, and the standing order is totally talking about crowd management. It's the two different things. So can I move the comment in regard to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	management control?Maybe, SeniorBRIG MKHWANAZI:Maybe, SeniorCounsellor, I must explain that not all classes arepresented by me.Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe Ican be around, or I can present myself, but in my presenceI did exactly explain to people as you are saying.MR BIZOS SC:No, the question waswhether in your classes any objection was offered to theprinciples that are in the standing orders.BRIG MKHWANAZI:No.MR BIZOS SC:We have already establishedearlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders wereinspired by the transformation of the functions of thepolice from the apartheid years.BRIG MKHWANAZI:MR BIZOS SC:Now you read newspapers.The people that you trained read newspapers, listen to theradio, and they are informed citizens of the land, as onewould expect of police officers.BRIG MKHWANAZI:BRIG MKHWANAZI:I think so, they do read	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how we're going to deal with crime, and the standing order is totally talking about crowd management. It's the two different things. So can I move the comment in regard to crime prevention into crowd management and say is it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	management control? Maybe, Senior BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe, Senior Counsellor, I must explain that not all classes are presented by me. Some classes can be presented by somebody else, or maybe I can be around, or I can present myself, but in my presence I did exactly explain to people as you are saying. MR BIZOS SC: No, the question was whether in your classes any objection was offered to the principles that are in the standing orders. BRIG MKHWANAZI: No. MR BIZOS SC: We have already established earlier on, but merely as a reminder that these orders were inspired by the transformation of the functions of the police from the apartheid years. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you read newspapers. The people that you trained read newspapers, listen to the radio, and they are informed citizens of the land, as one would expect of police officers. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I think so, they do read newspapers –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MR BIZOS SC: Do you agree that this statement by the then Minister of Safety & Security was inconsistent with the standing orders that you had to teach and observe? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I said, Senior Counsel, it's not my platform to question my senior person's comment. He's my senior person by far; he's making a comment. For me to go back and start checking whether is he correct or not, it's not my call. MR BIZOS SC: The people that you taught are intelligent people, concerned about the nature of their duty. Did any of them ask you, "What does the minister mean? You tell us these are the orders but this is what the minister says. How can we reconcile the two?" BRIG MKHWANAZI: I never have any question, unless if there was something wrong with the comment by the minister. The minister's comment is how we're going to deal with crime, and the standing order is totally talking about crowd management. It's the two different things. So can I move the comment in regard to crime prevention into crowd management and say is it inconsistent or consistent to the standing order?

	Page 3404		Page 3406
1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: If I remember very well,	1	MR BIZOS SC: In its plain meaning is if
2	during our cross-examination I believe from senior counsel	2	someone points a firearm at a policeman, points a firearm
3	from leading evidence side, if I'm not correct, maybe I	3	at a policeman, the policeman is entitled to kill him.
4	would be wrong, there was a question to say people gather,	4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, it will
5	but not to say they have committed any crime, or they are	5	depend to the situation. I cannot sit here and say yes. I
6	criminals or what. We agreed to that to say people coming	6	can definitely have a problem to say if a person points a
7	together in a crowd doesn't mean that they are criminals.	7	firearm to a police official, what is the reason, why it is
8	Yes, during the course of the event anything can happen	8	like that. To –
9	within the crowd. Of course we'll have to take steps, but	9	MR BIZOS SC: Would you agree –
10	crowd management in gathering situation, definitely we are	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: If it is, the main
11	not going there to face criminals, but we are there because	11	purpose is to shoot to a police official, of course the
12	we have to make sure that the gathering or the crowd	12	police official will have to do something. Then I will
13	management, the march is taking place peacefully. If it	13	agree in that position, but it's a little bit a problem to
14	turns otherwise, it turns otherwise, of course it can	14	me that a person can just point a firearm to a person, then
15	happen in that way. But to say you're going there now, the	15	a police must shoot to that person. But I don't get it,
16	whole notion will be crime prevention. That's why we are	16	but I'm saying if the, really the intention is there to say
17	saying crowd, I mean Public Order Policing's task is, as a	17	that something was going to happen, obviously a police
18	primary is crowd management. If there are, there's no	18	official will have to defend himself from that type of a
19	crowd management to manage on the day, obviously they will	19	situation. I will agree on that.
20	go to the secondary function, which is crime prevention.	20	MR BIZOS SC: Assume the statement to
21	But we don't say both of them is one thing, as it actually	21	have been made in the way that I have read to you. Do you
22	define here in paragraph 1, is crowd management situation,	22	agree that as it stands it's not within the spirit of the
23	and we are talking about the comment of the minister that	23	standing orders to the police, whether it's in relation to
24	is definitely talking to the crime prevention situation.	24	crowd control or whether it is merely a question of safety?
25	cannot now to say if I'm there now it, was this asked or	25	Is the mere pointing of a firearm a crime which entitles
		Etc.	IT-HV.
	PO 1		
	Page 3405	100	Page 3407
1	Page 3405 whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my	- Ge	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person
1 2		2	Page 3407
-	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my		Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person
2	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should	2	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm?
2 3	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should guestion the minister's comment. He's senior person. He	2	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday
2 3 4	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to	2 3 4	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were
2 3 4 5	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that.	2 3 4 5	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that
2 3 4 5 6	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the
2 3 4 5 6 7	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002,	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers."	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to you so that we can expedite the proceedings, please.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to actually deal with whatever situation is before him or her.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to you so that we can expedite the proceedings, please. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, the question is,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to actually deal with whatever situation is before him or her. MR BIZOS SC: With the statement as it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to you so that we can expedite the proceedings, please. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, the question is, did you hear, or did you come to learn that that statement	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to actually deal with whatever situation is before him or her. MR BIZOS SC: With the statement as it stands, is it consistent or inconsistent with police
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to you so that we can expedite the proceedings, please. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, the question is, did you hear, or did you come to learn that that statement was made by the minister, if it was made?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to actually deal with whatever situation is before him or her. MR BIZOS SC: With the statement as it stands, is it consistent or inconsistent with police behaviour, be it for crowd control or any self-defence
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	whatever, but if it was asked I was going to have my comment. But in this position I never thought I should question the minister's comment. He's senior person. He has indicated what he would like to see. We will have to abide ourselves to that. MR BIZOS SC: After the death of Minister Tshwete, Mr Charles Nqakula who took over from him in 2002, is recorded as having said, "Anyone who points a firearm at police will be killed by police officers." BRIG MKHWANAZI: Maybe if I may ask – MR BIZOS SC: Did that come to your notice? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I may ask where it came from? Media or where was the comment – MR BIZOS SC: I'm asking you to assume that it was published as having been said by the minister. Can you please make that assumption? I know that you are reluctant to make assumptions, but let's get on by you accepting the assumptions as an assumption when I put it to you so that we can expedite the proceedings, please. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, the question is, did you hear, or did you come to learn that that statement	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3407 the policeman to impose a death sentence on the person pointing the firearm? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, yesterday you read me the definition for self-defence. When we were reading there, there wasn't a passage that indicates that if it is a crowd management a police official would do the following, or whoever will do the following; if it's crime prevention, so and so will do the following. The definition was clear to all of us what is the meaning of that, and really, it's clear. It's a situation, no matter it's crowd management or no crowd management, it's for the person who's pointed with a firearm, depending to the situation, I've said what is the situation, will actually be the person who looks to necessity, self or private defence. That is the position. For me here to say it will be in line with the standing order general 262, it will be totally not appropriate because even the definition there doesn't talk about all this. It's a definition, straightforward, talking about a situation where one has to actually deal with whatever situation is before him or her. MR BIZOS SC: With the statement as it stands, is it consistent or inconsistent with police

	Page 3408		Page 3410
1	policeman should behave, please tell us whether you	1	not there are clear policies as to how the police should
2	consider it consistent or inconsistent.	2	behave vis-à-vis the citizen, whether he's a striker or a
3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I have said	3	demonstrator or a common-law criminal –
4	clearly when we talk about issues of this nature it depends	4	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, you can argue
5	to the situation before a person. It's for a person to	5	that at the appropriate time –
6	decide to the situation because it's the person's life	6	MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
7	versus another person, and a decision would be taken in	7	CHAIRPERSON: And presumably Mr Semenya
8	that split of second to say what has to be done. For me	, 8	will address us also on the same point. It may not be
9	now to say is it in line or not in line with the standing	9	entirely the argument, but we'll wait to see when the
10	order is difficult because we talk about self or private	10	argument stage is reached.
11	defence in this position.	11	MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, it gets worse.
12	[09:51] MR BIZOS SC: But you're teaching them.	12	Deputy Minister, now Minister of Mineral Resources,
13	You are a teacher on police conduct. If you were asked,	13	Minister Nqakula's deputy, Susan Shabangu is reported to
14	Brigadier, we've read the standing order, we've read the	14	have said, "You must kill the bastards (criminals) if they
14	minister's statement, whom are we to follow?	14 15	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
			threaten you or the community. You must not worry about
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Senior Counsel, we read	16	the regulations. I want no warning shots. You have one
17	paragraph 1. Paragraph 1 is talking to lot of different	17	shot and it must be a kill shot. I want to assure the
18	things that actually regulate, that says how we must manage	18	police commissioners and policemen and women from these
19 20	the situation, and the example you are giving me, it goes	19 20	areas that they have permission to kill these criminals. I
20	straight to individual, to say the individual is confronted	20	will not tolerate any pathetic excuses for you not being
21	by a person who just points a firearm. My point is it will	21	able to deal with crime. You have been given guns. Now
22	depend what is the situation and the person will have to	22	use them. If criminals dare to threaten the police or the
23	take action in the way that is suitable at that moment, but to say is it consistent to the standing order that talks	23	livelihood or lives of innocent men and women, children,
24 25	to suy is it consistent to the standing order that takes	24	then they must be killed." Did that statement come to your attention?
25	about lot of different things, is totally difficult for me	25	allention
	HS and a la	n 1	(· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
	Page 2400	m	Page 3/11
1	to say in that position.	i ge	Page 3411
1 2			Page 3411
	to say in that position.		Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about
2	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of	2	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about
2 3	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether	2 3	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about it. CE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it?
2 3 4	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've	2 3 4	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.
2 3 4	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make.	2 3 4 5	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday
2 3 4 5 6	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes.	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you
2 3 4 5 6 7	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill"
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official
2 3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to – MR BIZOS SC: Yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not about that. That's why I said the term "shoot," to me it's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: - in this forum to deal	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not about that. That's why I said the term "shoot," I remember very
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: - in this forum to deal with that in more detail.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not about that. That's why I said the term "shoot." I remember very well I said it's too deep and it's difficult for me to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: - in this forum to deal with that in more detail. MR BIZOS SC: I will leave it at that and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not about that. That's why I said the term "shoot," to me it's very deep if you're going to say "shoot." I remember very well I said it's too deep and it's difficult for me to handle that part to say shoot, shoot, because Counsellor,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	to say in that position. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, in the light of paragraph 11(7) of the standing orders, I wonder whether there's any point in you taking this point – I think you've made the point that you're setting out to make. MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: It may well be more profitable to move on to something else. The elaboration that you're going through now is, I can understand possibly why you want to do it, but I don't know if it's going to help us much further. So you've made your point. I suggest you move on – MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman – CHAIRPERSON: At this point it's consistent with paragraph 11(7). I understand the point, the minister's statement, if it was as simply as you quoted it, clearly couldn't stand without substantial qualification, but it's not really for him to – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: - in this forum to deal with that in more detail. MR BIZOS SC: I will leave it at that and we will leave it for argument that there is an unfortunate,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3411 BRIG MKHWANAZI: First time to hear about its TICE MR BIZOS SC: First time you hear it? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR BIZOS SC: Now you told us yesterday that the word "kill" is hardly ever used by you, and you refused to answer any questions in which the word "kill" was used, and the word "shoot," it's not in your vocabulary. You remember that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember very well, Counsellor, when I spoke about the word "shoot," which the counsellor was very much referring to it that police must shoot, and my problem was I cannot teach a police official to shoot, shoot to people. You know to carry the firearm is not about killing people or shooting people. Then I said I have a problem with the term "shoot at all the time." We teach people, or we advise our members how they must work, but not to teach them to shoot people. It's not about that. That's why I said the term "shoot," to me it's very deep if you're going to say "shoot." I remember very well I said it's too deep and it's difficult for me to handle that part to say shoot, shoot, because Counsellor, you were very much on a point to say police must shoot,

	Page 3412		Page 3414
1	to shoot people. Police are there to protect communities.	1	problem with that. I'm saying I cannot comment. This is
2	MR BIZOS SC: Are you saying that the	2	my senior person. A rank is not a big deal of course, but
3	spirit that you spoke about yesterday and repeated today is	3	I cannot answer to that part and say it was wrong or right.
4	reflected in the statement of the minister and deputy	4	This is the minister's comment.
5	minister? She doesn't seem to be shy to use the word	5	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Bizos, I'm inclined to
6	"shoot" over and over again.	6	think that you've taken this point as far as you need take
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Senior Counsel, I have	7	it. You've got a basis for an argument to present –
8	indicated from the first question where you spoke about the	8	MR BIZOS SC: Thank you.
9	first minister in the police, and my point was I'm not in	9	CHAIRPERSON: You can go on all morning
10	the position to question my senior's comment, and moreover,	10	asking the questions and getting the answer –
11	that is a comment. If maybe it can be an instruction to	11	MR BIZOS SC: It will be the same one.
12	the police by the Minister of Minerals, that's what I heard	12	CHAIRPERSON: But I'm not sure that we're
13	you were saying, you know it's a total different thing for	13	going to be any further forward than we are now. So I'm
14	me, but this is in media, is a comment, and I'm not in a	14	not saying it's a good point; I'm not saying it's a bad
15	position really to comment on that to say was the person	15	point, but I think whatever the point is, you've made it.
16	correct, is it in line with what I have said. I'm talking	16	Shall we move on to the next point?
17	about my opinion here to say the word "shoot, shoot," for	17	MR BIZOS SC: Just one further question.
18	me it's deep. If I can go outside here and talk in that	18	Would you agree that that sort of statement would confuse
19	fashion and teach people in that fashion, really I will	19	the members of the police force in the execution of their
20	have a difficulty to say how the job will be done, you	20	duties, especially, "You must not worry about the
21	know. So I have a problem on that, but I cannot question	21	regulations?" Who is the minister to say to the police –
22	my senior's comment and sit here and say the minister was	22	CHAIRPERSON: That passage is the deputy
23	wrong, the minister was right. I cannot question that.	23	minister, as far as I know. The passage you're reading
24	I'm not in that position, unless if I have received that	24	now, he was talking about the minister.
25	prior, I can make consultation with whoever and have a	25	MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
	As and a (11.2	1 septe
	Page 3413	100	Page 3415
1	Page 3413 clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you	(fl)	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic
1 2		4	Page 3415
	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you		CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic
2	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a	2	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications
2 3	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just	2 3	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would
2 3 4	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's	2 3 4	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different.
2 3 4 5	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are	2 3 4 5	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was,
2 3 4 5 6	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources –
2 3 4 5 6 7	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning behind that, and if I had a chance to question that some	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards. Don't worry about the regulations," short summary, it went
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning behind that, and if I had a chance to question that some other way round, I could have come back with an answer and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards. Don't worry about the regulations," short summary, it went further than that. What counsel wants to know from you is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning behind that, and if I had a chance to question that some other way round, I could have come back with an answer and say this is how I feel, because the meaning of this, it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards. Don't worry about the regulations," short summary, it went further than that. What counsel wants to know from you is do you think, regard being had to your knowledge and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning behind that, and if I had a chance to question that some other way round, I could have come back with an answer and say this is how I feel, because the meaning of this, it means exactly what you mean. You know, we take this thing,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards. Don't worry about the regulations," short summary, it went further than that. What counsel wants to know from you is do you think, regard being had to your knowledge and experience, that that statement if it had come to the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	clear indication what was the meaning, because maybe if you can ask the person who said those words, he's got a different meaning of that thing. I cannot myself just interpret that and say this is the meaning, it means it's not in line with my belief or with what our books are saying, and everything. I cannot comment on that. That is the minister talking. I'm just a brigadier. I don't question that. MR BIZOS SC: Brigadier, I would appeal to you to please have regard to the situation that we are in. You are a witness before an important commission. What is right and what is wrong cannot depend on a matter of rank. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsel, I do understand very well before I came here, that I must give my input and I have made it clear, I will give my input where it is definitely due to. At this position I'm saying the minister had spoken, I don't know what was the meaning behind that, and if I had a chance to question that some other way round, I could have come back with an answer and say this is how I feel, because the meaning of this, it means exactly what you mean. You know, we take this thing, we read it and we think the minister means this, and you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3415 CHAIRPERSON: A very short, cryptic little statement which probably even had qualifications when the minister said it which weren't reported, I would like to think, but you're now putting something different. A longer statement by the deputy minister, as she then was, now the Minister of Mineral Resources – MR BIZOS SC: Yes. CHAIRPERSON: That statement goes much further than what the minister said, that said never mind the regulations, you just shoot. Now that's a different statement by a different person, and I don't think the witness understands that you're talking about that. So anyway, we discussed this point before. I understand the question you want to ask the witness, let me ask it. That statement the deputy minister made, that you never heard of before, you said? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: Saying, "Kill the bastards. Don't worry about the regulations," short summary, it went further than that. What counsel wants to know from you is do you think, regard being had to your knowledge and experience, that that statement if it had come to the notice of members of the police force, particularly

r		r	
	Page 3416		Page 3418
1	persuaded them to do things that were not really in line	1	let's focus on the mission, the purpose of the mission.
2	with the standing order? Would that be – I think that's	2	You indicated that the operation plan must have a mission
3	what counsel wants to know. Am I right?	3	and that the mission cannot be chopped and changed. You
4	MR BIZOS SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman,	4	recall that?
5	yes.	5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Chairperson, as you say	6	MR MMUSI: Would that be the case even in
7	do I think it can bring confusion, to me again it goes back	7	instances where the circumstances of the operation changes?
8	to the same answer, but I'll put it in a different way to	8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: The operational plan
9	say if really it comes to the person's attention, it can	9	will have a mission for a certain operation. Where people
10	cause some confusion somehow, but I haven't heard any	10	are going to gather or going to march, it is an operational
11	question around it.	11	plan that we're going to do the following. The mission
12	CHAIRPERSON: You said it hadn't come to	12	will be maybe to escort the participants or to monitor the
13	your attention, so you can't deal with it at all in that	13	participants at a certain place, and whatever happens
14	way, but you've given the answer I think Mr Bizos wanted,	14	there, it will need maybe to be identified under the
15	so perhaps he'll move on to the next point, if we let him.	15	operational concept, and whatever comes there, it is a
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It can cause a	16	threat that we need to deal with it, but it is not a
17	confusion, of course. But further explaining as well to	17	mission. It is a threat.
18	say it's important to understand exactly the logic, or the	18	[10:11] Our mission, stay bolder, why we are there, we
19	meaning, the meaning behind of the message given. You	19	are there to do the following, but whatever comes out there
20	know, you are saying something, how many times I ask you to	20	we need to deal with it when we come to that situation.
21	ask me again because I don't want to take the first meaning	21	For an example, if we escort these people and it happens
22	of what I think you are saying. So it's important to	22	people are throwing dustbin around the street, you don't
23	understand exactly what was the meaning behind it, but I	23	have to go back now and say to the mission, change the
24	agree, if it landed to somebody it can definitely cause	24	mission because they are throwing dustbin now. The mission
25	some confusion. I agree on that, Chair.	25	as a whole is to escort the people. However, there are
	As and a la	11.25	/ refu
	Page 3417	10	Page 3419
1	MR BIZOS SC: Although we have similar	1	some things that are happening during that process, let's
2	quotes to put to the witness, I don't think that any useful one	2	deal with that and make sure that the march proceeds
3	purpose will be served. We will accept at this stage, but	3	properly.
4	we'll argue that this witness's failure to respond to	4	MR MMUSI: So you can never have an
5	legitimate questions about police training and his role in	5	operational plan without a mission?
6	it is something that we'll question in argument and we'll	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: A well-planned operation
7	argue, and we hope that there will be other witnesses who	7	always will have a mission, unless if it is a spontaneous
8	may have better answers to the questions that we have.	8	event, especially in issues of gathering and a march. If
9	With that closing remark I will conclude my cross-	9	it is a spontaneous, obviously you will get to that as
10	examination and give an hour to the Commission to carry on.	10	quick as possible and deal with that situation, but you
11	CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bizos, that	11	will follow some other processes to make sure that you
12	last gift is appreciated. I take it, it doesn't have to be	12	gather everything properly, you do some other issues to
13	disclosed in any register. I think the next counsel to	13	make sure you deal with the situation. However, a well-
14	cross-examine is, if there is any cross-examination, is	14	planned operation, well organised, people putting their
15	from Lonmin. Is that correct? Do you have any questions?	15	notice, there will be an operational plan with a mission,
16	MR MOTAU SC: Chair, members of the	16	then it will be, actually be handled.
17	Commission, I'd indicated earlier that we spoke about the	17	MR MMUSI: Let's have a look at the new
18	sequence and Mr Mmusi on behalf of the injured and arrested	18	SS3, document SS3. You've got it?
19		19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: SS3, that is annexure
	was going to be next in line.	20	for Thursday, this ana?
20	CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry, Mr Mmusi, if I	20	for Thursday, this one?
20 21	CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry, Mr Mmusi, if I was told that I'd forgotten and I apologise. If I wasn't,	21	MR MMUSI: The new SS3 –
20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry, Mr Mmusi, if I was told that I'd forgotten and I apologise. If I wasn't, I withdraw my apology. Anyway, Mr Mmusi, you've got some	21 22	MR MMUSI: The new SS3 – CHAIRPERSON: Hold on. This is what the
20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry, Mr Mmusi, if I was told that I'd forgotten and I apologise. If I wasn't, I withdraw my apology. Anyway, Mr Mmusi, you've got some questions in cross-examination, have you, for the witness,	21 22 23	MR MMUSI: The new SS3 – CHAIRPERSON: Hold on. This is what the new SS3 looks like.
20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: - I'm sorry, Mr Mmusi, if I was told that I'd forgotten and I apologise. If I wasn't, I withdraw my apology. Anyway, Mr Mmusi, you've got some	21 22	MR MMUSI: The new SS3 – CHAIRPERSON: Hold on. This is what the

20th December 2012

	Page 3420		Page 3422
1	CHAIRPERSON: The old one was replaced by	1	next aspect –
2	this one. It's a much thicker bundle of documents and the	2	MS HEMRAJ SC: Let me just help you, Mr
3	heading is, "South African Police Service, Rustenburg POP	3	Mmusi. If you look at the old SS3, if you look at page
4	contingency plan," and it goes on and it's dated the 10th of	4	1723 –
5	August 2012. Have you got it now?	5	MR MMUSI: I look at page?
6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it now, thank	6	MS HEMRAJ SC: 1723.
7	you.	7	MR MMUSI: The 10th.
8	CHAIRPERSON: It's numbered with letters	8	MS HEMRAJ SC: That's also dealing with
9	that Mr Bizos will recognise at the foot of the page, it's	9	the plan of the 10th of August.
10	the Greek letters for page, and they start with, but it's	10	CHAIRPERSON: You see, SS3, the new one,
11	got other unnumbered pages thereafter. I don't know which	11	contains the old documents, but some extra ones. So, but
12	page counsel wants to refer you to, but he'll have to tell	12	in the original SS3 there was a copy of the document with
13	us.	13	which the new SS3 starts, namely the plan for the 10th of
14	MR MMUSI: Now the first page, the	14	August, but unfortunately page 2 is missing, but it's not a
15	document tells you that this is the plan for the 10th of	15	problem because if you look at the original one you will
16	August 2012. You see that?	16	find it's near the back of the bundle, you'll find it
17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, yes.	17	there. That's what we're telling you. So you don't have
18	MR MMUSI: Now the document proceeds	18	to move on to the next point; you can deal with this point.
19	right through to page 7. If you can take your time and	19	MS HEMRAJ SC: And page 2 of that old
20	tell me where you would see the mission of this plan in the	20	document has got "Mission" right at the top of it.
21	document.	21	MR MMUSI: I'll move to the next point
22	MS HEMRAJ SC: Mr Mmusi, exactly which	22	because I intend completing this point with the further
23	document are you referring to in SS3? Can you just -	23	points I'm moving to.
24	MR MMUSI: The first document. If you	24	CHAIRPERSON: We won't tell you how to
25	look at SS3 –	25	cross-examine. You cross-examine the way you want to do.
		Eir.	11-HV
			(m) m
	Page 3421	m	Page 3423
1	Page 3421 MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665?	i qe	Page 3423
1 2			Page 3423
	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665?		Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as
2	MS HEMRAJ SC:On page 1665?MR MMUSI:Yes, and then you, it's seven or an anti-anti-anti-anti-anti-anti-anti-anti-	2	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how
2 3	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven on pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th.	2 3	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day?
2 3 4	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven on pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out	2 3 4	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure
2 3 4 5	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look	2 3 4 5	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not
2 3 4 5 6	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document.	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that,
2 3 4 5 6 7	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven on pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the –
2 3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUS1: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUS1: I see what the commissioner is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUS1: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUS1: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUS1: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUS1: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this document. That's what you're been told.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Still crowd management.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this document. That's what you're been told. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, what I will do now,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Would
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this document. That's what you're been told. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, what I will do now, I will move to the next aspect because the original SS3	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven apages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this document. That's what you're been told. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, what I will do now, I will move to the next aspect because the original SS3 speaks of the operational plan of the 16th. This one is the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Would I therefore be correct to say the number of POP members deployed to deal with crowd management as at that stage
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	MS HEMRAJ SC: On page 1665? MR MMUSI: Yes, and then you, it's seven or pages. They talk to the plan of the 10th. MS HEMRAJ SC: Yes, can I just point out to you that page 2 is missing from there, and if you look at the old SS3 you might find page 2 in that document. CHAIRPERSON: You're quoting page 7, is that right? MS HEMRAJ SC: No, he's quoting from page 1 to 7. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, but which page are you referring to specifically at the moment? MR MMUSI: I see what the commissioner is referring to. CHAIRPERSON: What she's telling you is in the new SS3 page 2 is missing. It's not a train smash because it's still there in the original SS3, if you didn't throw it away, but if you're referring us now to page 2 you have to find it in the original SS3, but if you're referring us to any of the other pages you can use this document. That's what you're been told. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, what I will do now, I will move to the next aspect because the original SS3	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3423 MR MMUSI: Now let's focus on the plan as it was on the 16th. According to information you have, how many POP members were deployed on the day? BRIG MKHWANAZI: On the 16th I'm not sure how many members, but I heard there were around – I'm not sure, it should be 80 something, I'm not sure about that, really. I'm subject to correction. I'm not sure how many members were – I'm not sure - Public Order Policing. MR MMUSI: We agree that the operation had not yet gone past the crowd management stage. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: With the – MR MMUSI: Let me just – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Which date are we referring to? MR MMUSI: On the 16th. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: Immediately prior to the implementation of stage 3 the operation as at that stage had not gone past crowd management. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management. Wa MMUSI: Still crowd management. MR MMUSI: Still crowd management.

	Page 3424		Page 3426
1	commander and the overall commander?	1	MR MMUSI: The action zone you'll see – I
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It will be incorrect,	2	don't know what you mean by the action zone, but look at
3	because as I've indicated, I'm not sure how many members	3	the top part of the -
4	were. Maybe if you can indicate to me how many members of	4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Action area, neutral
5	Public Order Policing were there, then I can be able to say	5	area, central point, okay, I see that. I see that, yes.
6	whether was it proportionate or not proportionate on the	6	MR MMUSI: Yes.
7	day. At this stage I have said clearly I'm not sure how	7	CHAIRPERSON: - answer quickly by looking
8	many they were there. I just estimated and I'm saying I'm	8	at task. Look two paragraphs up under "Task, deployment of
9	subject to correction. If you can indicate to me then I	9	the Nyalas with the barbed wire trailers" -
10	can be in a position, look into the situation you are	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, ja.
11	giving me, I can be able to say were those members	11	CHAIRPERSON: So that's where they were.
12	sufficient to deal with the situation. If not, extra	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. Ja, I see now
13	members should have been called in. I can be able maybe to	13	these are the members who are deployed with the barbed
14	answer on that.	14	wire, who are 53 in total, and on the other side it's for
15	MR MMUSI: Let's do that. Look at	15	monitoring, they are 45.
16	exhibit L and look at slide 135.	16	MR MMUSI: Yes.
17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it.	17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, for monitoring only,
18	MR MMUSI: Yes, now at slide 135 and the	18	and this side it's 53 for barbed wire deployment in a front
19	following slides we are told of the deployment on the 16th,	19	before the participants, creating a neutral zone at the
20	correct? Just a moment, please.	20	back. That is my understanding there.
21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Slide 135?	21	MR MMUSI: Yes.
22	MR MMUSI: 135. Exhibit L.	22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Because it says in the
23	CHAIRPERSON: 135 is headed "Operational	23	slide 137, "Monitor the atmosphere around the gathering
24	deployment briefing," and then if you look at the various	24	crowd and provide feedback to the JOC." That is 45, and on
25	slides from 136 and following, setting out the various	25	that other side, "Deploy the Nyala with the barbed wire,"
	As / and & (.	χų.	1 style
		-	
	Page 3425	100	Page 3427
1	Page 3425 teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr	i qe	Page 3427
1 2		·	Page 3427
	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr	·	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them.
2	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column	2	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of,
2 3	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll	2 3	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or
2 3 4	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going	2 3 4	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area.
2 3 4 5	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it	2 3 4	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk
2 3 4 5 6	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already.	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair.	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh,
2 3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group."	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative."
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP on slide 139, it's 53 POP members.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP on slide 139, it's 53 POP members. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP on slide 139, it's 53 POP members. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MR MMUSI: Now that would be POP that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide is the one that we referred to earlier on of 45 POP
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP on slide 139, it's 53 POP members. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MR MMUSI: Now that would be POP that would have been deployed as according to the plan that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide is the one that we referred to earlier on of 45 POP members, it's Pappa 10. You see that? It will also be at
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	teams and then if you perform the exercise, which I hope Mr Mmusi has done already for us, you look at the column "personnel" in each of these designation slides, you'll find how many people were there, but I hope he's not going to ask you to do it for us because I trust he's done it already. MR MMUSI: I've done that already, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Alright, well tell us the answer so we don't waste time. MR MMUSI: Now look at slide 137. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. I've got it. MR MMUSI: It tells you that 45 POP members had been deployed, and if you look at on the top of page, it says "Designation, monitoring group." BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide you have TRT members, there's no POP, and then you find POP on slide 139, it's 53 POP members. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I see that. MR MMUSI: Now that would be POP that would have been deployed as according to the plan that would be deployed to the neutral area. Is that correct?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3427 those are in front, 53 of them. MR MMUSI: Now you had a total of, according to the plan, 98 POP members at least in the, or around the neutral area. BRIG MKHWANAZI: In total, if we talk about POP there, it would be 98. 98, yes. MR MMUSI: Now if we go back to slide 136, if I can just take you through the slides quickly, because I need to be fair to you because of the questions that I need to ask thereafter. Slide 136 tells you that this is Pappa 1, it will be controlled by Colonel McIntosh, and the task. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes Sir, that, "Engage in dialogue with the representative." MR MMUSI: It will be at the neutral area. Look, let's look to the action area, it says neutral area, yes. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR MMUSI: And then the following slide is the one that we referred to earlier on of 45 POP members, it's Pappa 10. You see that? Slide -

1	Page 3428	1	Page 3430
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: 53.	1 2	his opinion as an expert in Public Order Policing as to the adequacy or otherwise in the plan. So it's not fair to say
2 3	MR MMUSI: Slide 138 –	2	to him "you had." He didn't have any at all; he wasn't
3 4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: 138, okay.	4	there. Just bear that in mind, please.
4 5	MR MMUSI: 138, you have TRT members also	4 5	MR MMUSI: Point taken, Chair. I did not
6	at the neutral area. You see that?	6	intend – ja. Now you are an expert. How would 98 POP
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	7	members handle a crowd of 3 000 or so, or more, of strikers
, 8	MR MMUSI: Now slide 139, if you page	8	on that particular day? Is it possible, according to the
9	through, slide 139 –	9	training is it possible that 98 members would be in a
9 10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	9 10	position to handle this crowd of this magnitude?
11	MR MMUSI: That's the one we referred to	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It is possible.
12	earlier, 53 POP members and designation neutral area. You	12	MR MMUSI: How so?
12	see that?	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will explain. We look
13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	14	to our mission on the 16th is to disperse, encircle, disarm,
14 15		14	and arrest. That is the mission. We explained from the
	5		· · · · · ·
16	members, they are at the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	16	questions that came from the evidence team as well as to
17 18		17 10	last counsellor who was asking me, that before anything was
19	MR MMUSI: The following slide you've got NIU, which is also at the holding area in Charlie 6.	18 19	going to be done there, people were going to be given a warning and some of them were going to evacuate on their
20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	20	own and people were going to be dispersed into smaller
20 21	MR MMUSI: Now slide 142 you have Charlie	20	groups, or manageable groups, and be, at that stage be
21	2 at holding area with eight POP members.	22	disarmed and be arrested, and go further, we got 78 members
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	23	that are placed in reserve, 70 on the other side, eight on
23 24	MR MMUSI: These are the reserves,	24	the other side, in total it's 78. Those members, I said
24 25	correct?	24	right from the beginning that their main task is three
20	conect?	23	
	Page 2/20	~	Page 3431
1	Page 3429 BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.	- Ge	Page 3431 things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to
1 2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.	1	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to
	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you	1 2 3	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and	2	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring
2 3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you	2 3	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and
2 3 4	BRIG MKHWANAZI:Correct.MR MMUSI:If you jump to slide 144 youhave Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine andTRT in the holding area.You see that?	2 3 4	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring
2 3 4 5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it?	2 3 4 5	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd
2 3 4 5 6	BRIG MKHWANAZI:Correct.MR MMUSI:If you jump to slide 144 youhave Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine andTRT in the holding area.You see that?BRIG MKHWANAZI:What slide is it?MR MMUSI:144.	2 3 4 5 6	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them
2 3 4 5 6 7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144?	2 3 4 5 6 7	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT -	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to focus on that. Now we agree as at this stage that the plan	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option that was going to be utilised. In that way it was
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to focus on that. Now we agree as at this stage that the plan on the 16th, according to what we have seen you had 98 POP	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option that was going to be utilised. In that way it was achievable.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to focus on that. Now we agree as at this stage that the plan on the 16th, according to what we have seen you had 98 POP members who had been stationed in the neutral area with the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option that was going to be utilised. In that way it was achievable. MR MMUSI: That would be achievable if
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to focus on that. Now we agree as at this stage that the plan on the 16th, according to what we have seen you had 98 POP members who had been stationed in the neutral area with the responsibility of crowd management, handling 3 000 or so	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option that was going to be utilised. In that way it was achievable. MR MMUS1: That would be achievable if the police follow procedure, by first warning the people,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MMUSI: If you jump to slide 144 you have Charlie 3 and you have 70 POP members and Canine and TRT in the holding area. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What slide is it? MR MMUSI: 144. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 144? MR MMUSI: Yes, Sir. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see personnel 57 TRT - oh, 70 POP, yes, holding area, ja. MR MMUSI: So they are the reserves. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, that's what I'm here. MR MMUSI: In holding area 2? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's right. [10:31] MR MMUSI: If we can just jump the, the following slide is LCRC and something – I don't want to focus on that. Now we agree as at this stage that the plan on the 16th, according to what we have seen you had 98 POP members who had been stationed in the neutral area with the responsibility of crowd management, handling 3 000 or so strikers. You see that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	things, is to relieve members, is to reinforce, and is to arrest. These 78, if you call in as an operational commander, you see now the situation demands that you bring some other members, you'll bring other members as well, and I went further, I said if you give a warning to the crowd gathered in that particular koppie and then some of them leave, it gives another opportunity. I even further said when they deployed the barbed wire, on my understanding is that some of the people as well were moving. So they were not even stopped from being moving away from the koppie as well. So this was going to be achievable with the members we got. You know, to talk about proportionality, it doesn't mean if participants are 50 and you must have 50 members as well to deal with the situation. You know, we are dealing with people here whom we talk with them. If you talk with them, some of them disperse on their own. That was the technique that was going to be, or an option that was going to be utilised. In that way it was achievable. MR MMUSI: That would be achievable if the police follow procedure, by first warning the people, correct?

20th	December 2012 Marikana Comm	ISSIO	n of Inquiry Rustenburg
1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Page 3432 complete the deployment of the barbed wire they will then give the warning, because the purpose of deploying the barbed wire was not to encircle the people in the koppie, but was to protect the media, other people, and SAPS. So as they were deploying the barbed wire, in that meantime then people breached the barbed wire, then they couldn't go further with warning the people so that they can move on their own. But what I'm told is that at the same time when the barbed wire was deployed, they were able to have, there were people who were able to move on their own without being interfered to. MR MMUSI: Now the deployment of the barbed wire, would I be correct to say in a strike situation when the police deployed a barbed wire, that triggers a movement in one way or the other with the protesters? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I spoke, I think yesterday, if not yesterday, that the purpose of the barbed wire is to protect the structures, that people may not get in, damage the property, whatever, if the march is going to pass that particular structure. I said normally we deployed the barbed wire prior to that. However, on the day, on the 16th it was totally different because the barbed wire was deployed for another purpose, of which it was done	1 2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 24	Page 3434 repeating material that was covered yesterday. I don't want to stop you entirely because I take it you're actually using this to move to another point, but what he said was the purpose was to protect the neutral area and those in it. As far as he sees it, based on his experience, because he wasn't there, that sort of situation isn't like sending a lion or a pack of dogs or whatever at protesters to disperse them, and the idea was, or he would have done it, as I understand his evidence, give a warning about what was going to happen thereafter, after the barbed wire was in place. What went wrong was that while the barbed wire was being deployed, the people breached it, they tried to breach it twice, unsuccessfully. They breached it the third time and that's when the firing started. We know that something happened before, that the final incident happened before it was planned to because we heard that long ago when we heard the evidence of the helicopter went into the air at a time when it was effectively too late. But that's the evidence that he's giving. So it doesn't help, with respect, to put it slightly differently. I'm not suggesting for a moment you're doing it deliberately, but I'm trying to help you so that you can get to the point that you want to make. MR MMUSI: But Mr Chair, I appreciate
	wire was deployed for another purpose, of which it was done	24	
25	in the presence of the people and all that. I answered	25	that, but that is exactly the piece of evidence I'm taking
1 2	that question, I think yesterday. MR MMUSI: You see, I understand that to	4 4 2 1	
3	mean yes to my question.	3	CHAIRPERSON: I thought you
4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Repeat your question.	4	misunderstood. You understand very well, but you're trying
5	MR MMUSI: In a strike situation, when	5	to change -
6 7	the police start to deploy a barbed wire, assume in the circumstances similar to this, that would trigger the	6 7	MR MMUSI: Perhaps let me do it differently. For what purpose to the police use a barbed
8	movement of the protesters in one way or the other?	8	wire, in general?
9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: My answer to that is	9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I –
10	that the purpose of the barbed wire is deployed prior to	10	MR MAHLANGU: Mr Chairperson, if I may
11	that. Now it was deployed at this moment for another	11	say, the recorders here are fighting me for interfering
12	purpose. Therefore for me to say it will trigger or not	12	with the records, but it's the counsel who doesn't give me
13	trigger, I don't have an experience of that, because a	13	a chance and –
14 15	barbed wire is not an animal. It's like, you know you don't bring a lion, then people will jump. This is not	14 15	CHAIRPERSON: May I say to the recorders,
16	about that. It's just an equipment.	15 16	if you want to fight with anybody, please fight with counsel and not the interpreter.
17	MR MMUSI: Let's look at the purpose of	17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, maybe you
18	the barbed wire, take it step by step. It does happen that	18	said in general, I'm correct, what is the purpose of the
19	the police deploy a barbed wire to arrest the target,	19	barbed wire?
20	correct?	20	MR MMUSI: Yes.
21	CHAIRPERSON: The evidence is, it appears	21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. Ja what normally,
22	from the documents that the purpose of the barbed wire was	22	as I've said, the purpose of the barbed wire, we utilise it
23	to protect the police who were there in the neutral area	23	for the purpose of protecting the structures. As I've
24	and the media who were slightly behind. That was the	24 25	said, if people are going to be channelled to a certain
25	purpose, and he explained yesterday - I mean you're	25	direction, you will deploy the barbed wire to protect a

		1	
	Page 3436		Page 3438
1	certain structure. I made an example, I think yesterday,	1	MR MMUSI: Now according to information
2	about Shell House, if normally used to be IFP marching in	2	you've been given, what triggered the move of the
3	Johannesburg, if they're going to pass next to Shell House	3	protesters at scene 1 when the barbed wire was being
4	in those previous years where we were still anticipating	4	deployed?
5	some threat around that area, we will deploy the barbed	5	MR SEMENYA SC: I don't understand the
6	wire around the structure. We will have police official as	6 7	question, Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Well, perhaps the witness
7 8	well to ensure that if there's a space where they can maybe breach, we place them to protect, to make sure nobody goes	8	CHAIRPERSON: Well, perhaps the witness understands the question; let's ask him. Do you understand
9	through. The purpose is to protect structures. You deploy	9	the question, Brigadier? He asks you -
10	into that. You deploy it for the purpose of channelling	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I can try to answer,
11	spectators to a certain direction.	11	Sir.
12	MR MMUSI: And then in protest actions,	12	CHAIRPERSON: Sorry?
13	what is the purpose of the barbed wire?	13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I can try to answer.
14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's, if we talk about a	14	CHAIRPERSON: Alright, try to answer,
15	march it can be a protest, it can be a march, it's protest,	15	let's see from your answer whether you understood the
16	it's going to be a protest march. It is a protest march	16	question.
17	and maybe your question will be if it is a gathering where	17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, my answer
18	people are sitting in one place, maybe what can be the	18	would be one –
19	purpose around that position, it will definitely depend, as	19	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, that can't help me
20	I have said, it will depend to the operational commander on	20	unless I understand what the question is so that I can
21	the day to say how they can utilise it. Then it will come	21	follow the answer as well.
22	to their decision, operational commander, overall	22	CHAIRPERSON: Well, I've never ever heard
23	commander, to look to the situation and say how they can	23	you have to explain the question to every person, every
24	utilise it. You need to do your assessment. We spoke	24	counsel present so that they can understand what's going
25	about threat assessment to say what can be the threat in	25	on, but anyway, but I don't mean to be unkind, I understand
	A3 1	1	to have
	Page 3437	10	Page 3439
1	this situation, do we have a problem with this and that.	192	where you're coming from. Mr Mmusi, the question isn't
2	As I've said, the deployment of the barbed wire there was	2	001102
3	only just to protect media, other people who come in, which	3	problems understanding it and I'm not entirely sure I
4 5	are VIP or whatever, as well as the police. That was that.	4 5	understand it correctly either. So have another go at putting it clearly. Bear in mind the audience that you're
6	There wasn't only to encircle people or anything; it was only for that purpose.	6	addressing the question to, and make it clear so we can
7	MR MMUSI: Has it ever happened in your	7	understand it, okay?
8	experience that the police used the barbed wire as an aid	8	MR MMUSI: Perhaps I should start by
9	to effect arrest?	9	explaining the question to Mr Semenya. It is evidence that
10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I don't recall any	10	the barbed wire was deployed and then soon after the barbed
11	incident using a barbed wire to arrest people, because	11	wire was deployed in a men soon after the ballbed wire was deployed, the protesters started to move from
12	people, maybe if you, they are sitting already, you take	12	scene 1 - koppie 1, from koppie 1. Now this is an expert
13	the barbed wire, you put it around, definitely you're going	13	who has been given particular information which I'm not
14	to have a stampede into that, because always people will	14	privy to. I'm asking him according to information that he
15	seek for the position to run out if it's that position. So	15	has been given, when the barbed wire was deployed, what
16	on that day it was not that purpose to encircle the koppie.	16	triggered the move of the protestors from Koppie 1, that's
17	It was only to protect those people on the other side,	17	the question.
18	that's all.	18	[10:51] CHAIRPERSON: He can't know the answer to
19	MR MMUSI: I'm not asking on that	19	that. The most he can tell you is what based on his
20	particular day. I'm asking in your experience as a police	20	expertise and experience, what he thinks the probable cause
21	officer, have you never experienced a situation where a	21	was of the movement forward, he can't tell you from his own
	barbed wire is used as an aid by police officers to effect	22	knowledge, when you call your own clients they can perhaps
22	Salbea Mile is asea as all all sy period effects to effect		
22 23	arrest?	23	tell us why they did what they did, but he can't answer
		23 24	tell us why they did what they did, but he can't answer directly. The most he can do is give his opinion as to why
23	arrest?		

	Page 3440		Page 3442
1	for you. Can you answer now, Brigadier?	1	CHAIRPERSON: You've put your, what
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't have an answer.	2	amounts to your case at this point, and you haven't now,
3	CHAIRPERSON: Cross-examination, Mr	3	now the witness obviously can't comment on that because he
4	Mmusi.	4	wasn't there. The most he can say, I suppose, is
5	MR MMUSI: Sir, I put it to you that what	5	consistent with what he's seen on the video and the
6	caused the protestors to move from koppie 1 was the	6	information that's been given to him. Is that correct,
7	deployment of the barbed wire.	7	Brigadier?
8	CHAIRPERSON: May I ask you, you're	8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir.
9	appearing for some of the people who are there who moved	9	CHAIRPERSON: Ja. Now having established
10	forward, I take it, are you going lead evidence from them	10	that, you're now going to put your main questions to
11	as to what caused them to move forward?	11	establish the points you've been busy with since you
12	MR MMUSI: Yes, yes.	12	started.
13	CHAIRPERSON: Because why don't you put	13	MR MMUSI: Yes Chair. You stated that
14	then, that my case will be and my witnesses will say this	14	when POP members dispersed the crowd, they should make
15	and this and he can comment. It's not appropriate just to	15	allowance.
16	phrase the question the way you're doing in these	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm just putting my
17	circumstances.	17	understanding.
18	MR MMUSI: Counsellor, if it is a fact I	18	MR MMUSI: For people to go to places of
19	have no problem but it never came to my attention. Seeing	19	residence, go to places where they can catch transport to
20	that the witness has answered, I need to make a follow-up	20	go home, do I understand you correctly to be saying that?
21	question. Would the fact that the protestors moved from	21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: On my answer I think I
22	koppie 1 immediately after the deployment of the	22	gave, I think not yesterday, days before that, that if you
23	protestors, immediately after the deployment of the barbed	23	give a warning, Counsellor, you will give it twice to give
24	wire, would that not be consistent with ordinary reaction	1.4	a chance to the bystanders as well to be able to move away
25	of protestors when the barbed wire is deployed?	25	from where the situation is and giving a chance as well to
		tere.	11-414
	HS my a la		
	Page 3441		Page 3443
1	Page 3441 CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is	er Gl	Page 3443
1 2		·	Page 3443
	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is	·	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to
2	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of	2	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport
2 3	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first	2 3	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is
2 3 4	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I	2 3 4	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible.
2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with	2 3 4 5	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the
2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in	2 3 4 5	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit
2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer.	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUS1: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Will you please orientate me, please?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUS1: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUS1: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: I see that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUS1: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUS1: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: I see that. MR MMUS1: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed wire was about to close the gap between itself and the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down towards the right you see forward holding area 1.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed wire was about to close the gap between itself and the kraal. And some ran quickly before the Nyala could close	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down towards the right you see forward holding area 1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed wire was about to close the gap between itself and the kraal. And some ran quickly before the Nyala could close the gap going around the kraal.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down towards the right you see forward holding area 1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: I see that. MR MMUSI
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed wire was about to close the gap between itself and the kraal. And some ran quickly before the Nyala could close the gap going around the kraal. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear the information	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down towards the right you see forward holding area 1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Towards the left is STF and NIU.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: I'm not sure that issue is clear. I'm not sure what the ordinary behaviour of protestors is in these circumstances. Shouldn't you first establish that before you proceed to ask this question? I think I know where you're going but I don't think, with respect, you put it quite as clearly as would be fair in the circumstances to enable the witness to answer. MR MMUSI: Evidence will be led that when the police started to deploy the barbed wire the protestors assumed that they were now being surrounded and they started to leave koppie 1. And they left in various directions. Others left in the direction of Nkaneng. Others left towards Marikana. Others left towards K4. All those being places where they reside. Do you have a comment at this stage? BRIG MKHWANAZI: - hear from you. MR MMUSI: And that a group that left in the direction of Nkaneng realised that Nyala with a barbed wire was about to close the gap between itself and the kraal. And some ran quickly before the Nyala could close the gap going around the kraal. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear the information from you, Sir.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3443 those people who have been given a warning to be able to move where they want to go, depending where their transport is, they will move to those places and go home if that is possible. MR MMUSI: Now, I want us to focus on the location of the neutral area. Look at slide 77 of exhibit L. Now do you see where the neutral area is? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Will you please orientate me, please? MR MMUSI: If you look at the blue and green icons, you see them, on the middle of the page next to the informal settlement. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Now if you look on top of the page you see that there would be NIU and other officers deployed there. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: If you look further down towards the right you see forward holding area 1. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. MR MMUSI: Towards the left is STF and NIU. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.

1	Page 3444 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	1	Page 3446 further. The police, when they stationed the neutral area
1			
2	MR MMUSI: And we have evidence that	2	at the entrance, I want to believe, of Nkaneng, in your
3	there were also mounted police and those would be towards	3	understanding of the purpose of crowd management would the
4	the direction of the top left of this particular slide,	4	position of the neutral area be consistent with the crowd
5	according to -	5	management principles?
6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.	6	MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, no policemen were
7	MR MMUSI: And down in the same	7	positioned at the entrance of Nkaneng.
8	direction, towards the bottom, you would have K9.	8	CHAIRPERSON: I think Mr Semenya is
9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm not sure you spoke	9	correct.
10	about K9 on the reserve on top and you said is it holding	10	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, that's not how I
11	area 2, you are talking about that, that's K9 as well	11	understand it. What I understand is that by the kraal,
12	there?	12	that's the entrance towards the informal settlement.
13	MR MMUSI: No, K9 would be slightly	13	That's where the neutral area was, and in the neutral area
14	above. Holding area number 1. Yes, holding area 2,	14	you had the police stationed there. Now I'm exploring this
15	forward holding area 2 towards the left.	15	aspect that the crowd management principles are that when
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that, Counsellor,	16	you disperse the crowd you should create environment for
17	but I'm not sure as you are explaining I will follow that.	17	them to leave to places of residence. Now if you look at
18	MR MMUSI: What I'm trying to show you is	18	the location of the neutral area, in my view it goes
19	that at the time when the barbed wire was being deployed,	19	against this, that's what I –
20	the protestors had been surrounded by the police.	20	CHAIRPERSON: No, you don't give us your
21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Chairperson, we went	21	view; you give us your submissions.
22	past this point a little earlier. Slide 77 is not how the	22	MR MMUSI: Yes.
23	formation was when the barbed wire was deployed.	23	CHAIRPERSON: The point you're making is
24	CHAIRPERSON: It's now 11 o'clock, it's	24	that by rendering the neutral area inaccessible to the
25	time for tea. I suggest we take the, Mr Bizos promised to	25	strikers, they were also prevented from going into the
	All and the first	1. 2.	I State Ke
	Page 3445	er 20	Page 3447
1	Page 3445 end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I	er Ge	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal
1 2		1	Page 3447
	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which	1 2 3	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it?
2	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to	2	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point,
2 3	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which	23	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it?
2 3 4	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to	2 3 4	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly.
2 3 4	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too	2 3 4	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr
2 3 4 5 6	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on
2 3 4 5 6 7	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUS1: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the police, Mr Semenya, when he did an opening statement at the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and secondly, I don't know that we've got a clear photograph
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the police, Mr Semenya, when he did an opening statement at the commencement of this Commission, this is what he said.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and secondly, I don't know that we've got a clear photograph here which illustrates what you want. It may be that, if
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUS1: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the police, Mr Semenya, when he did an opening statement at the commencement of this Commission, this is what he said. "The implementation of this measure was preceded by the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and secondly, I don't know that we've got a clear photograph here which illustrates what you want. It may be that, if you look during the lunch adjournment at the videos, you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the police, Mr Semenya, when he did an opening statement at the commencement of this Commission, this is what he said. "The implementation of this measure was preceded by the deployment of barbed wire to send a message that the armed	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and secondly, I don't know that we've got a clear photograph here which illustrates what you want. It may be that, if you look during the lunch adjournment at the videos, you may find a video clip which clearly demonstrates what you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	end at about tea time, he actually ended before that. I suggest we take the tea adjournment now. During that time you can look and see whether there is another slide which perhaps illustrates more clearly the point you want to make. I think Mr Semenya is right, you're choosing too early a slide for the purpose of the point you're trying to make. So while we have tea, you look for the slide and we'll resume in about 15 minutes time. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [11:23] CHAIRPERSON: The Commission will resume. Brigadier, I have to remind you, you're still under oath. Mr Mmusi, have you found the slide which will illustrate the point you want to make and we won't listen to an objection from Mr Semenya? If so, I suggest you proceed with your cross-examination. MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I will defer that to a later stage when I found the correct slide. At the moment I'll proceed. Brigadier, the senior counsel for the police, Mr Semenya, when he did an opening statement at the commencement of this Commission, this is what he said. "The implementation of this measure was preceded by the deployment of barbed wire to send a message that the armed protesters may not cross the police line."	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3447 informal settlement because the entrance to the informal settlement was being blocked. I think that's your point, is it? MR MMUSI: Exactly. CHAIRPERSON: I think that's right, Mr Semenya. I don't think he's suggesting it was done on purpose, but he's suggesting that that was the effect of what was done. MR SEMENYA SC: That's not the objective evidence, Chair. The entrance to that informal settlement is quite wide, and that's in the veld there where the event happened. Perhaps we can look at slide 116. CHAIRPERSON: What Commissioner Hemraj suggests to me is that I should refer you, Mr Mmusi, to slide 215. Mr Mmusi, is it possible if we move on to something else for the moment? I think I understand the point you're wanting to make. The difficulties we have are, (1), I don't think that the brigadier was there, and secondly, I don't know that we've got a clear photograph here which illustrates what you want. It may be that, if you look during the lunch adjournment at the videos, you may find a video clip which clearly demonstrates what you want, the point you want to make, alternatively shows if

		1	
	Page 3448		Page 3450
1	the moment, it will be helpful. It may be, I don't know,	1	MR MMUSI: I'll rephrase, Mr Chair. The
2	it may be your cross-examination is so planned that you've	2	neutral area was stationed in the direction leading to the
3	got to make this point first, but I'm not a party to, or	3	entrance of the informal settlement. Do you see that?
4	privy to the planning of your cross-examination, so I can't	4	MR SEMENYA SC: Objection. That's also
5	help you with it.	5	not correct, Chair, and slide 215 makes the point that the
6	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, perhaps something	6	journalists would have been to the left of that dirt road
7	that could be of assistance to us, the record of	7	going to Nkaneng. That would have been the neutral zone.
8	proceedings, page 1463, I found a passage where Mr	8	That's not to the entrance of the settlement.
9	Bruinders got a concession from Warrant Officer Thamae that	9	MR MMUSI: I'll proceed. Would I be
10	that particular dirt road leads into the informal	10	correct to say that the police when handling crowd
11	settlement. So it was on that particular basis that I put	11	management have to station the neutral area in a manner
12	this as –	12	that does not defeat the purpose of the operation?
13	CHAIRPERSON: I think the way forward	13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I hear your
14	will be to read the passage to which you're referring to	14	question very well. However, I explained before when we
15	the witness, and then based upon the concession that was	15	were talking about a neutral zone, or a neutral area, I
16	obtained from the warrant officer – what was Mr Thamae's	16	think the question came from the counsellor who was busy
17	rank again? I forgot.	17	with me before, I explained clearly that a neutral area or
18	MR MMUSI: Warrant Officer.	18	a neutral zone, only it's purpose will be the position
19	CHAIRPERSON: Based upon that concession	19	where the operational commander will be able to exercise
20	then you can put a question to the witness, and it may be	20	his freedom of action, and the position where it should be
21	that Mr Semenya will then withdraw his objection. Let's	21	and everything, it will be determined by him because he's
22	see whether you can do it that way.	22	the person who's actually in charge of the operation there.
23	MR MMUSI: Yes, it is the transcript of	23	For me it's difficult hence I was not even in that position
24	the 15th of November. Mr Bruinders says to Warrant Officer	24	to say on the day where it was, was it in right position or
25	Thamae, "No, please Warrant Officer," it's at page 1463 -	25	not in the right position, definitely I cannot have a good
	As and Street	\mathcal{K} ir	/ ity ke
	Page 3449	100	Page 3451
1	Page 3449 CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier	Ge.	Page 3451
1	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier	4	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an
	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read	·	Page 3451
2	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read one the passage to him.	2	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the
2 3	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it	2 3	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to
2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He	2 3 4	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the
2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to	2 3 4 5	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances
2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUS1: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes."	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the informal settlement.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look to say they're at their residence or what. You can do it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the informal settlement. MR SEMENYA SC: Objection. That's not	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look to say they're at their residence or what. You can do it inside the CBD, whatever place the situation is.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the informal settlement. MR SEMENYA SC: Objection. That's not the entrance of the informal settlement, Chair. That	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look to say they're at their residence or what. You can do it inside the CBD, whatever place the situation is. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at the 16th. It
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the informal settlement. MR SEMENYA SC: Objection. That's not the entrance of the informal settlement, Chair. That evidence which was given through Mr Bruinders is that that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUS1: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look to say they're at their residence or what. You can do it inside the CBD, whatever place the situation is. MR MMUS1: Now let's look at the 16th. It would have been normal and expected for the protesters when
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: And of course the brigadier hasn't got the page in front of him, so you have to read the passage to him. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair, I thought it was for the purpose of other legal representatives. He says, "No, please Warrant Officer, we don't want to go to the left of that photograph. I want to keep you to the right of the kraal. Do you understand?" Warrant Officer then answers, "If you go straight you go to the position of that body." Then Mr Bruinders says, "We've been through this before. If you want to go, I want you to go, take the path towards the dirt road. Yes, you've got that. Now that dirt road, I'll make it easier for you, that dirt road leads into the informal settlement, not so?" Warrant Officer says, "If you go that direction, yes." CHAIRPERSON: Now you've read the passage, now put the question. MR MMUSI: Brigadier, the point where the neutral area was stationed was at the entrance of the informal settlement. MR SEMENYA SC: Objection. That's not the entrance of the informal settlement, Chair. That	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3451 comment on that. That one definitely it's an issue with an operational commander to see where he place it, because the purpose is to be able to exercise his freedom of action to say who must do what job at that time. That's all. MR MMUSI: Let's move on. When the police dispersed the protesters, under normal circumstances the protesters would usually run towards the residential area. Is that not correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you have said, in a normal situation, normally we do have different types of marches. It's either others are in town, in the city, in the CBD, others can be in residential. It will depend where you are, and if you talk about residential it can happen people are marching right inside their area of residence. So it's always like that. If you have to disperse them it will be exactly the position to say which direction do you disperse them so that you can actually deal with the situation. That's all, but in a normal situation we don't only deal with marches whereby we look to say they're at their residence or what. You can do it inside the CBD, whatever place the situation is. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at the 16th. It

	Page 3452		Page 3454
1	People will have to disperse, obviously a person will go	1	the one that counsel has put to you. They also allege that
2	where he or she stays. There's no ways that a person will	2	Nyalas were actually driven there and driven over the
3	run somewhere where a totally different person will run to	3	bodies of the people who were still alive, as I understand
4	where he stays or maybe run to the place where there's taxi	4	it. Now my understanding also is the police deny that, but
	rank, what, it depend where you are. But on the 16th, as	5	the question that's being put to you is if the evidence
5			
6	you say, obviously they will definitely look to the place	6	that is led by Mr Mmusi establishes the facts that he's put
7	where they will reach their residence as quick as possible.	7	to you, what is your comment, and I will be surprised to
8	MR MMUSI: Now seeing that the operation	8	hear you say that that was proportionate force and minimum
9	had not gone beyond crowd management stage, the police	9	force and so on. I imagine you would concede very readily
10	should have foreseen that these protesters, when dispersed	10	that if that's what happened, it can't be defended and is
11	will run into the residential area.	11	clearly inappropriate. Would that be fair? The real
12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you've said, that's	12	question is whether those facts are correct, but if they're
13	correct. The operational commander will look at that.	13	correct, I take it you would concede that that wasn't
14	Those are the basics. It will have to be like that.	14	minimum force? Shooting a man who is injured, lying on the
15	MR MMUSI: I know you were not the	15	ground, driving a Nyala over him, that can't be minimum
16	operational commander on the day, but the operational	16	force, can it?
17	commander should have had this in mind, you say?	17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, it cannot.
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's normal, it must be	18	CHAIRPERSON: Very well. Is that the
19	like that.	19	point you wanted to make, Mr Mmusi, or have I anticipated
20	MR MMUSI: So it's a yes?	20	the point you wanted to make?
21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: As you wish really, yes.	21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, it cannot be that
22	CHAIRPERSON: Having got that concession,	22	position, really, but as I'm hearing from you now, I
23	the wise cross-examiner doesn't ask the question again	23	couldn't have that type of information before definitely
24	because sometimes he loses the concession he got already.	24	coming here that such situation took place on that day,
25	[11:43] MR MMUSI: I didn't foresee him saying	25	that people were actually shot while they were lying down
	As 1 and 15 (.	2.12	1/stl Va
	Page 3453		Page 3455
1	Page 3453 anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force,	- Ge	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas
1 2		40	Page 3455
	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force,		Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas
2	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting	2	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right
2 3	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been	2 3	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really
2 3 4	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them	2 3 4	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my
2 3 4 5	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again.	2 3 4 5	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it
2 3 4 5 6	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my
2 3 4 5 6 7	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or –	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 -
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation, Counsellor, I have no comment.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for expert opinion.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation, Counsellor, I have no comment. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm just trying	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for expert opinion. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't see how
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation, Counsellor, I have no comment. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm just trying to cut this short. From the statements that we've been	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for expert opinion. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't see how an expert can be expected to give expert testimony in
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation, Counsellor, I have no comment. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm just trying to cut this short. From the statements that we've been given, taken by IPID, it appears that some of the surviving	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for expert opinion. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't see how an expert can be expected to give expert testimony in regard to the allegations you've made. You said what your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	anything other than yes, Mr Chair. Now minimum force, evidence will be led that after the eight-second shooting at scene 1, police approached the protesters that had been shot and lying on the ground, searching them, checking them one by one, and checking if they are dead, and those that were not dead they were shot again. CHAIRPERSON: Evidence you're going to lead or – MR MMUSI: Yes, yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: I understood the way you put the question was that that was the evidence already, but what you're saying is your case is, and you will lead evidence to prove that that's what happened? MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Yes, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Okay, now that's clear. MR MMUSI: Now assuming that this is going to be the evidence, I now want to invite your opinion as an expert. BRIG MKHWANAZI: On that situation, Counsellor, I have no comment. CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm just trying to cut this short. From the statements that we've been	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3455 helpless, and I haven't heard a situation that the Nyalas were driving on top of them, and definitely I hear right here, but if you say is it still minimum force, then really it cannot be minimum force, but I cannot have a clear opinion to say what can I say in that situation, but my point is just to say it cannot be that way. That's how it should be. MR MMUSI: Now evidence would be led also that at scene 2 the protesters who had run from scene 1 - from koppie 1, I'm sorry, hiding in scene 2, whilst they were hiding the police shot at them and they, the protesters, made an agreement to come out of their hiding place, raising their arms as a sign of surrender. The police shot at those protesters, nevertheless. This evidence would be led. MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, these are not questions calling for an expert opinion. These are questions which ought properly to be put to witnesses who can countenance them or confirm them. They're not for expert opinion. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't see how an expert can be expected to give expert testimony in

	Page 3456		Page 3458
1	response, but I think that subject to what you're going to	1	have already stated, be consistent with the teachings of
2	say, Mr Semenya is right. This is not really a matter to	2	the police with regard to crowd management?
3	put to an expert because he can't really give expert	3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will have a problem to
4	evidence about it, that I can see, but isn't that so?	4	answer your question directly, because I think here we need
5	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I have a differing	5	to be clear what situation we're having now, and if we
6	view.	6	still go on talking about crowd management and having
7			another situation, we need to be sure exactly who was where
	5	7	5
8	views, but I'm happy to hear your submissions.	8	at that stage, because my last understanding was that we
9	MR MMUSI: Yes, the way I understand the	9	were at the position where the barbed wire was deployed,
10	evidence is that this was crowd management. Now a level	10	where we spoke about 98 members of Public Order Policing
11	higher would be crime prevention. I have not yet evidence	11	that were at that position. Now people, Chairperson, have
12	that now the police were dealing with crime prevention.	12	moved to another place. Now who's there now? You know, it
13	Now this is an expert who knows about crowd management, as	13	cannot be crowd management and crowd management, and I
14	at that stage the police were still dealing with crowd	14	don't get it in that way. I want to understand alright
15	management. So the questions and the evidence and the	15	that position.
16	versions that I'm putting are informed by this particular	16	CHAIRPERSON: Okay, we've moved on now.
17	background.	17	We've moved on from koppie 1. We're now at koppie 2, which
18	CHAIRPERSON: You've put the evidence	18	is scene 2.
19	that will be led. Now I suggest you reformulate your	19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir.
20	question in a way which avoids Mr Semenya's objection, and	20	CHAIRPERSON: The eight-second shooting
21	that you then proceed.	21	has happened. There are a lot of bodies lying all over the
22	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I respect your	22	place, people who ran back to koppie 2, and police who
23	guidance, but I do not understand the objection, really,	23	followed them, and what is put to you is that the people
24	because unless Mr Semenya just substantiates his objection,	24	who ran to koppie 2 hid among the bushes – koppie 3, sorry,
25	then I would understand, but I don't understand it.	25	koppie 3 – hid among the bushes. They ran to koppie 2
25	then I would understand, but I don't understand it.	23	copple 5 – The among the busiles. They fail to copple 2
	As and S (.	11.2	/ style
	An I and a Come	64	1 st fa
1	Page 3457	er de	Page 3459
1	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care	4	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and
2	CHAIRPERSON:Mr Semenya, would you careto help your learned friend?Look, he's obviously trying	2	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and
2 3	CHAIRPERSON:Mr Semenya, would you careto help your learned friend?Look, he's obviously tryingto make a point that he considers important.I don't want	2 3	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and
2 3 4	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he	2 3 4	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed.
2 3 4 5	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to	2 3 4 5	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir.
2 3 4 5 6	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at,
2 3 4 5 6 7	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and they stood up and held their hands up in surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident, but anyway, let him ask the question. It can't do any harm. Carry on, Mr Mmusi.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to interrupt you. I don't think counsel is interested in which policemen there were, if it was National Intervention
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident, but anyway, let him ask the question. It can't do any harm. Carry on, Mr Mmusi. MR MMUSI: Now Brigadier, against that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to interrupt you. I don't think counsel is interested in which policemen there were, if it was National Intervention Unit people, POP people, Canine people –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident, but anyway, let him ask the question. It can't do any harm. Carry on, Mr Mmusi. MR MMUSI: Now Brigadier, against that background I gave you, which is going to be the evidence of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to interrupt you. I don't think counsel is interested in which policemen there were, if it was National Intervention Unit people, POP people, Canine people – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Whoever –
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident, but anyway, let him ask the question. It can't do any harm. Carry on, Mr Mmusi. MR MMUSI: Now Brigadier, against that background I gave you, which is going to be the evidence of my clients, I now want to proceed to ask you the following	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to interrupt you. I don't think counsel is interested in which policemen there were, if it was National Intervention Unit people, POP people, Canine people – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Whoever – CHAIRPERSON: Whatever.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Semenya, would you care to help your learned friend? Look, he's obviously trying to make a point that he considers important. I don't want to stifle him, prevent him from doing it. Obviously he must do it correctly, but explain the point you want to make so to enable him to reformulate his question and make the point he wants to make without offending against the basic rules that you're seeking to defend. MR SEMENYA SC: I don't know if I'll manage to be more lucid, Chair. The objection is, this is an expert witness, not an eyewitness. For that reason he cannot be invited to elicit an expert opinion on a factual premise of that kind. CHAIRPERSON: It sounds as if he's going to be asked whether in the light of the fact, if the facts that have been put to him are correct, whether that would be a legitimate form of what, crowd control or crowd management or whatever. The answer may be self-evident, but anyway, let him ask the question. It can't do any harm. Carry on, Mr Mmusi. MR MMUSI: Now Brigadier, against that background I gave you, which is going to be the evidence of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3459 first and then went to koppie 3, hid among the bushes, and they then decided that the game is up, they surrender, and what is suggested is that they were then killed. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I understand, Sir. CHAIRPERSON: They were then shot at, some of them killed and some injured, and what he wants to know from you is whether if that's true, the police who did that, allegedly, acted in accordance with the principles of crowd management that they're taught in their courses. I would have thought the answer is self-evident, but perhaps you can give it to us. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you exactly, because what was, my question is who of the members were there? Are we still, are we having crowd management? Remember we've got different discipline. That's a thing I want to know exactly. We have different – CHAIRPERSON: Brigadier, I'm sorry to interrupt you. I don't think counsel is interested in which policemen there were, if it was National Intervention Unit people, POP people, Canine people – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Whoever –

	Daga 2440		Dogo 2442
1	Page 3460 were there and that's what they did, would that be in	1	Page 3462 CHAIRPERSON: Quite right, at 237 –
2	accordance with what they learned at the Police College or	2	MR MMUSI: Where we are, I want to know –
3	at any training course that you were coordinator	3	CHAIRPERSON: Hang on, hang on. At 237
4	responsible for. I would have thought your answer is	4	there is a picture, a water canon firing into the bushes.
5	obvious, but please give us the answer, obvious or not	5	There's also a picture at 235 which shows two water canon,
6	obvious.	6	one on the right with blue water and one on the left with
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I do understand,	7	what looks like ordinary water, or perhaps white water. I
8	Chairperson, if you speak in that way. Where I have a	8	suppose it's a fair question, which of the two is counsel
9	confusion was he's talking about crowd management, because	9	referring to –
10	if you talk about crowd management, it's totally a	10	MR MMUSI: The one I'm referring to is
11	different thing, Counsellor, not to say I'm disrespecting -	11	the one with a water canon on the right flashing water,
12	CHAIRPERSON: No, no, I understand you.	12	blue-coloured water, and then there's another one on the
13	That's not crowd management according to any of the books	13	left where I think the direction is southern part.
14	on crowd management, is it?	14	CHAIRPERSON: That's 235 that you're
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No.	15	referring to.
16	CHAIRPERSON: It's just behaviour of a	16	MR MMUSI: Now earlier on we traversed
17	totally other kind, and he wants to know whether that's -	17	the part where we were talking about the location of
18	well, let him rephrase his question. I've done my best for	18	various units. Now when you look at the picture it says,
19	him, but let him carry on himself.	19	"The photo show the police members from forward holding
20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: No, I can answer in that	20	area 2 converging on koppie 3 from two direction, north-
21	- If it is that way I can answer. Ja, I don't know if the	21	west and south-west." Now we've already identified that in
22	counsellor, it's fine.	22	forward holding area 2 there were POP members.
23	CHAIRPERSON: Well, give the answer first and then if he doesn't like the answer he'll follow up.	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
24 25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Thank you. Counsellor,	24 25	MR MMUSI: Now what you see on this particular picture, the spraying of water at koppie 3,
23	DITO MICHWANAZI. HIAIR you. Coursenor,	23	particular picture, the spraying of water at toppie 5,
			and Annually Michael
	Page 3461		Page 3463
1	Page 3461 if you talk about police official coming to a situation and	4	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with
1 2		4	Page 3463
	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and	1 2 3	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with
2	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting.	2	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management?
2 3	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the	23	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's
2 3 4	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L,	2 3 4	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using
2 3 4 5	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there,	2 3 4	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUS1: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Ja, correct.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUS1: So it is consistent with crowd management?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUS1: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi –	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUS1: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUS1: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: It's part of the minimum
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUS1: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Ja, correct. MR MMUS1: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: 236, yes. MR MMUS1: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUS1: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUS1: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUS1: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUS1: Now threat analysis, how important is threat analysis?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water. MR MMUSI: Yes, I don't know why mine	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUS1: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Ja, correct. MR MMUS1: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZ1: 236, yes. MR MMUS1: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUS1: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how important is threat analysis? [12:03] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's important,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water. MR MMUSI: Yes, I don't know why mine says 236.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how important is threat analysis? [12:03] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's important, Counsellor because it assists the planner or the planners
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water. MR MMUSI: Yes, I don't know why mine says 236. CHAIRPERSON: We now know what the number	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe 1, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how important is threat analysis? [12:03] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's important, Counsellor because it assists the planner or the planners to be able to put or to compile an operational plan in a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	if you talk about police official coming to a situation and people raising hands, surrendering themselves, and shooting at them, and your question is, is it still in line with the training that is given to the members, my answer will be no, it's not like that. MR MMUSI: Now let's look at exhibit L, slide 236, to check who was there. Are you there, Brigadier? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, correct. MR MMUSI: 236. BRIG MKHWANAZI: 236, yes. MR MMUSI: You see the water canons flashing the water, spraying the water, I think – CHAIRPERSON: - in 235, Mr Mmusi – MR MMUSI: 235. CHAIRPERSON: You can see the water canon on 235, the one on the left firing what looks like white water, and the one on the right shooting what looks like blue water. MR MMUSI: Yes, I don't know why mine says 236. CHAIRPERSON: We now know what the number is, so carry on with your question.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3463 which we now know as scene 2, would that be consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, Counsellor, is that usage of water canon is the minimum force. Having the people at that position, maybe I, that's my opinion to say maybe they wanted to get people out using the water, easily getting them out themselves because if you spray water, obvious a person will come out. I don't see anything wrong with that. MR MMUSI: So it is consistent with crowd management? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of minimum force, of course. MR MMUSI: Should I understand that to be a yes? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's part of the minimum force, Counsellor. MR MMUSI: Now threat analysis, how important is threat analysis? [12:03] BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's important, Counsellor because it assists the planner or the planners to be able to put or to compile an operational plan in a proper way.

	Page 3464		Page 3466
1	there was certain information that was given to you, were	1	document of course which we have which is TT5 which was the
2	the police aware or at least been told that the protestors	2	relevant criminal information and inputs given by Brigadier
3	might attack them?	3	Engelbrecht and then later by Colonel Isaacs. The last
4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm not sure, Counsellor	4	page being the information that was given at noon on the
5	because unless if we go back and check from the operational	5	16th by Colonel Isaacs. Perhaps those are two documents
6	plan if under threat analysis, attack is it forming part of	6	which can be put before the witness and you can then with a
7	it or not. But on my understanding is that there must be	7	minimum of time wastage, put the points to him that you
8	threat analysis in that position. But for me as a person	8	want to put to him, and elicit the opinions from him that
9	who was not there, I cannot go back to a person and say,	9	you are seeking.
10	tell me, did you identify attackers, did you identify this,	10	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I'll proceed to the
11	and come back and say, Counsellor, yes, they did identify	11	next aspect. I think I got what I wanted out of that
12	that. The only thing we can go here, I can answer as I	12	particular exercise. Brigadier, what is your understanding
13	answered from the previous counsellors to say they never	13	when an area is declared a security zone, what does that
14	identify the breaching of the barbed wire, hence as well	14	mean?
15	it's not indicated here after we have gone through it.	15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: My understanding, I will
16	That's how I can actually have an opinion. But in this	16	talk really on what I understand if it is a security zone,
17	manner it's very difficult for me.	17	I believe is where really whenever somebody come in that
18	MR MMUSI: So the police were not aware	18	position or in that area will maybe need to be escorted in
19	that the protestors may attack them on the 16th, according	19	because something has been identified that maybe a person,
20	to information you've been given?	20	his life can be in danger or whatever if you walk through
20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I said clear	20	on his or her own, or maybe we can put some search point
22	right now, I said if maybe we can check the operational	22	and all those type of things, those are my understanding
23	plan, whether it was identified or not. I only made an	23	around that position.
23	example of the answer I've given before whereby I was asked	23	MR MMUSI: Now the information you were
24 25	if the breaching was part of the identified threat analysis	24	given and the information that we have, I would want to
20	If the breaching was part of the identified threat analysis	23	given and the information that we have, I would want to
	David 24/E	100	Dans 24/7
1	Page 3465	Ge	Page 3467
1	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that.	2	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the
2	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can	2	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that?
2 3	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I	2 3	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will
2 3 4	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified,	2 3 4	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six.
2 3 4 5	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't	2 3 4 5	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly,
2 3 4 5 6	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now.	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used
2 3 4 5 6 7	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told isn't relevant, presumably. If this is in fact an accurate statement of the current information at the time that we're	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it clear, condoning off in a sense of surrounding the koppie with the barbed wire, would these six barbed wire have been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told isn't relevant, presumably. If this is in fact an accurate	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it clear, condoning off in a sense of surrounding the koppie
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told isn't relevant, presumably. If this is in fact an accurate statement of the current information at the time that we're	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it clear, condoning off in a sense of surrounding the koppie with the barbed wire, would these six barbed wire have been
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told isn't relevant, presumably. If this is in fact an accurate statement of the current information at the time that we're concerned with, then it might be helpful to proceed with	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it clear, condoning off in a sense of surrounding the koppie with the barbed wire, would these six barbed wire have been sufficient for the police to encircle koppie 1?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	on that day, and I have given an answer as well into that. So I'm saying to this one as well, if we can check, I can be in a position to answer your question properly. I cannot just say it was identified or it was not identified, unless we look to the plan of which both of us we haven't danced with now. CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I don't want to interrupt you and I don't know at what stage of the operation you are busy with at the moment. But if you look at SS3, the new one, the fuller one, you'll see five pages from the end is a section headed "Operation Platinum. Lonmin Mine, Marikana 16 August 2012, Stage 3" and there's then what looks like a slide or a possible slide headed "Current Information" and then over the page is "Risk Assessment" and then Stage 3, Mission. I don't know whether that's the passage that you're referring to, because that certainly contains the information which, this will be relevant for us. Whether it was given to the Brigadier at the time, I don't know, but what he was told isn't relevant, presumably. If this is in fact an accurate statement of the current information at the time that we're concerned with, then it might be helpful to proceed with your cross-examination based on that document.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3467 believe the same, there were about eight barbed wire on the 16th at the disposal of the police. Do you know that? MR SEMENYA SC: Chair, the evidence will be that there were six. CHAIRPERSON: The question accordingly, Mr Mmusi, and carry on. There were six vehicles to be used for barbed wire deployment. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The information I got, Chairperson, there were six barbed wire in that particular place. MR MMUSI: Now have you been to Marikana at scene 1 where the incidents took place, at the koppie, specifically at the koppie? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, after a late stage, yes, I have a chance just to visit to the place, yes. MR MMUSI: Now the six barbed wires that were at the disposal of the police, in your own understanding, would they have been sufficient for the cordoning off of the koppie, koppie 1? Let me make it clear, condoning off in a sense of surrounding the koppie with the barbed wire, would these six barbed wire have been sufficient for the police to encircle koppie 1? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I know your

	Page 3468		Page 3470
1	the koppie itself?	1	were given, correct?
2	MR MMUSI: Yes, yes.	2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I think the information
3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: And you want to know	3	came from the side of the evidence team that people were
4	from me if the six barbed wire was going to be sufficient	4	leaving at night and my point was I got that information as
5	and all that?	5	well, not that I gave it.
6	MR MMUSI: Yes.	6	MR MMUSI: You would not dispute if I say
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Truly speaking, I'm not	7	cordoning off koppie 1 and koppie 2 which was a meeting
8	sure.	8	place for the strikers, was a plausible thing to do prior
9	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, if you look at	9	to the 16th August 2012.
10	197, slide 197, you can see that was four, the barbed wire	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: You mean the 15th?
11	had been deployed by four of the Nyalas and one can see	11	MR MMUSI: Say the 13th, the 14th, the
12	from that, more or less what the length of each barbed wire	12	15th.
13	section was. I wouldn't report myself looking at the	13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm looking at one
14	picture that you could coral, as it were, the whole koppie	14	position that, because on the 15th already before the close
15	with that but perhaps I misread the picture, but let's see	15	of the afternoon there was already an agreement that
16	what the Brigadier says.	16	tomorrow arms will be laid down at 9:30 then I think maybe
17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it, ja, I've got	17	it was going to depend to the situation to say was it going
18	it. I'm not sure. It cannot, from there to there, from	18	to be a conducive exercise that the police should embark
19	there to here, that's why I'm saying I'm not sure because	19	on. Remember from the beginning I indicated strongly that
20	I'm not sure how big the place is.	20	when we talk about negotiations at least there must be
21	MR MMUSI: Should we proceed, Mr Chair?	21	trust to the two parties, how the police can agree on the
22	Now looking at the scene of koppie 1, what I'm trying to	22	other side and at the same time they close the koppie.
23	probe from you through your understanding of deployment of	23	MR MMUSI: The POP members in crowd
24	barbed wire as a means of crowd management, is that would	24	management in situations similar to the situation of
25	the deployment of those six barbed wires have been	25	Marikana should be impartial, correct?
	During hours Barris	100	Date 2471
1	Page 3469 sufficient to cordon off koppie 1 or the police would have	GR.	Page 3471 BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
2	needed more or just give us an estimate? HIVE FOR		MR MMUSI: Now the police had problem
3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, looking to	3	with ammunition the protestors had in their possession,
4	the position of the barbed wire, we see now, I would say	4	correct?
5	this was not going to be sufficient and at the same time	5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's always the case, it
6	I'm having a problem to say the circumference of the koppie	6	will be like that. Yes, there will be a concern if
7	itself, how big it is I'm not sure, maybe if you can help	7	protestors are armed, it will be a problem really. Let's
8	me with that, how big it is, looking to this, then I can be	8	put it in the context of the activities of 13 August 2012,
9	in a position to say maybe we can maybe be in need of so	9	General Mpembe was seen on the video speaking to the
10	many Nyalas to be able to do that job, whether six was not	10	protestors telling the protestors, your gathering is
11	going to be possible, but looking to what we see now in	11	illegal, I have a problem with the things, the weapons
12	front, at 197, I don't know whether it can be able to fit	12	you're carrying because they're illegal. You saw that
13	the space, unless you've got a clear picture how big the	13	video?
14	koppie it is, the circumference of the koppie itself	14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
15	because we talk about going around, how big it is, then how	15	MR MMUSI: The protestors on the other
16	many Nyalas we can need on that. Can six Nyalas definitely	16	hand were saying to General Mpembe, escort us to the
17	be able to deal with that if you're going to utilise them	17	mountain where we will hand over the ammunition to
18	in -	18	yourselves but please bring our employer, on the video.
19	MR MMUSI: Let's do it differently. The	19	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mmusi, I'm sorry, that's
20	police considered the gathering of the strikers at koppie 1	20	not quite correct. My understanding was that they talked
21	and koppie 2 illegal, correct?	21	about the spears and the pangas, assegais, not ammunition.
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding,	22	And there was no suggestion, as far as I can recall that
23	hence procedures were not followed.	23	they were in possession at that stage of firearms.
24 25	MR MMUSI: At night the protestors would leave to go to their homes according to information you	24 25	Firearms were in fact obtained after the engagement with the police later than day, but there was no question of
10			

1	Page 3472 having ammunition, it was handing over the weapons, the	1	Page 3474 Breytenbach, are you not?
2	spears, assegais and pangas, I think.	2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir.
3	MR MMUSI: My apologies, Mr Chair, I	3	MR TIP SC: You in fact worked together
4	exactly meant that. I apologise, thank you. You said the	4	for some time at the National Training facility for all
5	role of the negotiator, when you were asked by the evidence	5	units, including POP.
6	leader, you give and take. You remember that piece of	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That is correct, Sir,
7	evidence where you say when you mediate, you obviously give	7	even though he was in human resource development, I was in
8	and take, that kind of evidence.	8	another office, operational response services.
9	[12:23] BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I	9	MR TIP SC: I understand that fully,
10	remember well, it was a comment from the side of the	10	Brigadier. He, Brig Breytenbach has given evidence in
11	evidence team, that negotiation is part of give and take,	11	these proceedings. I think you are aware of that.
12	and I agreed on that. I never said in that way. I agreed	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir.
13	on that.	13	MR TIP SC: I just want to read to you,
14	MR MMUSI: According to information you	14	two questions and answers that were given in the course of
15	were given, were there any steps taken by the police to	15	his evidence, and then I'll ask you whether that accords
16	attempt to bring the employer to address the protesters,	16	with your understanding. For cross reference purposes, Mr
17	because that was the only request from their part.	17	Chair, that's at page 1619 to 1620 of the transcript. They
18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, even – I am	18	are fairly brief. Brigadier, I'll read them out, if you
19	not sure at what stage we are talking about, but on my	19	need me to repeat, just say so, but I think they'll be
20	understanding, I couldn't get, I haven't got information to	20	familiar to you. The cross-examiner firstly put this
21	say from the employer who was brought in but I know there	21	question to him, "Would it be correct to think that there
22	were a lot of interaction with the employer and employees	22	is an important interface between training and the
23	as well, but I haven't got information to say were they	23	operations divisions of the police service?"
24	brought together to talk with the participants at the	24	MR HANABE: Can you repeat the question,
25	koppie or what position, I haven't actually received that	25	but a bit slowly?
	Deninka home Vient	100	to wave
1	Page 3473	Ge.	Page 3475 MR TIP SC: I will do that. "Would I be
2	MR MMUSI: Mr Chair, I am wrapping up, I o R		
		2	correct to think that there is an important interface
3			correct to think that there is an important interface between training and the operations divisions of the police
3 4	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else.	2 3 4	between training and the operations divisions of the police
	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening,	3	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?"
4	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else.	3 4	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?"
4 5	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object.	3 4 5	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and?
4 5 6	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross-	3 4 5 6	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In
4 5 6 7	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair.	3 4 5 6 7	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question,
4 5 6 7 8	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms	3 4 5 6 7 8	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions,
4 5 6 7 8 9	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the	3 4 5 6 7 8 9	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations –
4 5 7 8 9 10	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.
4 5 7 8 9 10	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of	3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a
4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary.	3 4 5 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination.	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The only problem is I don't know whom to call on next. Are you	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research and compile the training modules which is then presented to
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The only problem is I don't know whom to call on next. Are you next, Mr Tip?	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research and compile the training modules which is then presented to the forth and back process between operational people and
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The only problem is I don't know whom to call on next. Are you next, Mr Tip? CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR TIP SC: I'd be	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research and compile the training modules which is then presented to the forth and back process between operational people and the curriculum developers." Again, Brigadier, let me
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The only problem is I don't know whom to call on next. Are you next, Mr Tip? CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR TIP SC: I'd be very pleased to go next. Brigadier, I am going to take up	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research and compile the training modules which is then presented to the forth and back process between operational people and the curriculum developers." Again, Brigadier, let me pause, you followed the reply given by Brig Breytenbach?
4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	am just checking with my attorney if there's anything else. CHAIRPERSON: I saw what was happening, and I didn't object. MR MMUSI: That will be my cross- examination, Mr Chair. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Mmusi. Ms Lewis, are you going to cross-examine on behalf of the families, or is your colleague going to do so? MS LEWIS: Mr Chair, we don't have any questions at present, but we are still in the process of consulting with our expert, so we would also like to reserve our right to recall this witness when we convene in January if necessary. I am not sure that it will be necessary. CHAIRPERSON: There's an arrangement between the parties as to the order of cross-examination. It wasn't disclosed to me, but that's not a problem. The only problem is I don't know whom to call on next. Are you next, Mr Tip? CROSS-EXAMINATION BY MR TIP SC: I'd be	3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	between training and the operations divisions of the police service?" MR HANABE: The training and? MR TIP SC: The operations divisions. In other words, Brigadier, you are on top of the question, there's an important interface, there are two divisions, training and operations – BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. MR TIP SC: - and there has to be connection. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR TIP SC: And Brig Breytenbach responded as follows, "The process that is followed when a need is identified for training is that such a need by the operational units would be raised with our curriculum development and research fraternity." I'll pause there, so that you can interpret. "And they would do the research and compile the training modules which is then presented to the forth and back process between operational people and the curriculum developers." Again, Brigadier, let me

	Dogo 2474		Page 3478
1	Page 3476 the following question to Brig Breytenbach, "Would it	1	August. Correct? Now you gave a fairly lengthy account in
2	therefore be so that the overview that you presented to us	2	which you dealt with the possibility of weapons being among
2	in exhibit Q," I will just interpose, exhibit Q was an	3	a crowd and what POPS members should do, and whether they
	exhibit that set out in summary form some of the training	4	should have equivalent weapons and so on, I am not going to
4	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		
5	material. There is not need for us to go into any detail	5	go into the detail, but subject to your guidance, Mr Chair,
6	on that, "but that the overview presented in that exhibit,	6	it may be fair if you have a moment just to read through
7	reflects the current state of the approach to training, the	7	that portion, just to refresh your memory on what you gave,
8	use of equipment in conjunction with operations." And Brig	8	on the evidence which you gave at the time. And then I
9	Breytenbach's answer to that was "that is correct." So	9	will come –
10	that the effect of those two questions and answers was that	10	CHAIRPERSON: I think indicate to him the
11	there is an important connection in the functioning of the	11	exact page and line references for the passage that you
12	police service that there should be a proper interface	12	want him to read so that he can read it quickly.
13	between operational needs and the training that is given to	13	MR TIP SC: Yes, thank you, I'll do that.
14	the police members, who must perform the operations. You	14	It's the passage that begins on page 2884 at line 20, and
15	would agree with that, I think.	15	it continues through to page 2885 at line 20. I am not
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	16	going to deal with that passage, I am going to deal with
17	MR TIP SC: And it follows does it not	17	the two questions that follow, but as I said, just to put
18	that officers who are involved with the planning and	18	you entirely in context with what you testified to at the
19	implementation of operations should be fully aware of the	19	time, have a look at that answer of yours. I think it
20	nature of the training that is given to the various units	20	looks as though you've got to the end of that answer.
21	they intend to deploy.	21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I got it.
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It is correct.	22	MR TIP SC: Then I am going to draw your
23	MR TIP SC: Now, I want to take you back	23	attention particularly to page 2885 line 21, where Mr
24	to a portion of your own evidence, which you gave last	24	Ngolwana then poses another question to you, and he does it
25	Wednesday, Brigadier, some time back, but I've made - just	25	in the following way, "I am going to put the question
	45/	\mathcal{K} ir	
	Page 3477	11	Page 3479
1	Page 3477	in Ge	Page 3479
1	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the	40	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS
2	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at	2	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just
2 3	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886.	·	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at
2 3 4	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir.	2 3 4	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana
2 3 4 5	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to	2 3 4 5	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their
2 3 4 5 6	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with
2 3 4 5 6 7	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZ1: Counsellor, I remember
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right- hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a hill, many of whom armed with pangas, assegais, spears an	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5, shotgun nine millimetre which is a side firearm. However,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a hill, many of whom armed with pangas, assegais, spears an R5 rifle, possibly a pistol, is such a crowd, a crowd of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5, shotgun nine millimetre which is a side firearm. However, with our task or their task they are doing you will find
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a hill, many of whom armed with pangas, assegais, spears an R5 rifle, possibly a pistol, is such a crowd, a crowd of the sort with which POPS is trained to deal?" Now although	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5, shotgun nine millimetre which is a side firearm. However, with our task or their task they are doing you will find that maybe one or two members are issued with R5, and most
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a hill, many of whom armed with pangas, assegais, spears an R5 rifle, possibly a pistol, is such a crowd, a crowd of the sort with which POPS is trained to deal?" Now although that questions was posed in a fairly hypothetical manner,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5, shotgun nine millimetre which is a side firearm. However, with our task or their task they are doing you will find that maybe one or two members are issued with R5, and most of the time, they carry shotgun. And if they are actually
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	to assist you, and the Commission, we've made copies of the relevant page which just for the record is to be found at the transcript pages 2884, 2885 and 2886. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir. MR TIP SC: I am not, I don't propose to read all of this again onto the record, Brigadier, but if you would have a look at page 2884, that's the top right-hand quarter of the page. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see it. MR TIP SC: And you will recall that at that stage your evidence was being led by my learned friend, Mr Ngolwana on behalf of the SAPS, do you recall that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember. MR TIP SC: And he posed the following question to you, "Given your extensive experience in POPS and the training of POPS if you were given a set of facts, that says you have a group of between a thousand and I think it is three-and-a-half or 4 000 people planted on a hill, many of whom armed with pangas, assegais, spears an R5 rifle, possibly a pistol, is such a crowd, a crowd of the sort with which POPS is trained to deal?" Now although	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3479 slightly differently, or in a brief fashion, does POPS training prepared POPS to deal with the situation I just gave you," and your answer follows, you said, "No, not at all." And over the page at 2886, lines 1 to 4, Mr Ngolwana repeated in effect this question, he said, "Is their training adequate to deal with people who are armed with pangas, assegais, R5, pistol and spears," and your answer was "no, no." Now Brigadier, that appears to us to be quite significant evidence that you gave, because what it conveys is that POPS per se and the training given to POPS members and implicitly the equipment with which they are ordinarily – which they ordinarily carry into crowd management situations, does not suffice to deal with a crowd of the kind there described. Does that fairly reflect the thrust of your evidence there? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I remember very well the question, my point was clear as it indicate at paragraph 11, in 2885 whereby I indicate that public order policing, yes, they got R5, they are trained in R5, shotgun nine millimetre which is a side firearm. However, with our task or their task they are doing you will find that maybe one or two members are issued with R5, and most

	Page 3480		Page 3482
1	what's the name, the scenario was given to me, it will	1	the type of intervention we must administer then it will
2	become a challenge for the, because they've got rubber in	2	actually compel us to go step by step to make sure that we
3	their position most of the time, and as a result they will	3	look to the life of the people and all that, then public
4	have to change to a nine millimetre, and if they do that,	4	order will be limited to a certain position before
5	sometimes you have to shot with one hand or maybe eliminate	5	administering R5s and all that, you need to think first of
6	or do whatever you do with one hand, which will at the same	6	easy method to deal with the problem.
7	time will be challenge, because you will have what's a	7	MR TIP SC: Brigadier, thank you for that
8	name, a shotgun in your possession, you can be inaccurate	8	answer which I'm confident I followed and perhaps I can
9	and you will shoot a wrong person in that position.	9	just re-state it very briefly. A POP unit will be trained
10	Therefore always it become a challenge. Yes, they are	10	and capable to deal with a variety of situations but there
11	trained into R5, but with the type of a job we deal with	11	will come a point where the situation overruns its capacity
12	the crowd, we want to use the what's a name, the minimum	12	to deal with it. Or put even differently again, then you
13	force, we want to use less lethal weapon or less lethal	13	can answer, it can deal with a situation up to a certain
14	option and if you are going to actually now use rubber, at	14	point but after that point POP can no longer deal with the
15	the same time you need to change, it always become a	15	situation.
16	challenge in that position. That's what I tried to	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree,
17	actually to put down when I was answering my question.	17	Counsellor, into that that really it will come to a
18	MR TIP SC: Thank you, Brigadier, you've	18	situation whereby you need to get other unit to assist to
19	reflected the evidence that you gave on last Wednesday,	19	deal with the situation if it goes above that position.
20	quite accurately and I appreciate that. I don't propose to	20	MR TIP SC: And it is at this moment that
21	enter into any debate with you on the nuances that	21	the important interface between training capacity and
22	different situations may present, you'll be happy to hear.	22	operational needs comes back into the picture, doesn't it?
23	[12:43] BRIG MKHWANAZI: We can proceed. No	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I would say the
24	problem.	24	expertise, Sir.
25	MR TIP SC: It's really not necessary for	25	MR TIP SC: And in particular what is
	45 1 14	1.15	/ 1 v C [Lu
	Page 3481	10	Page 3483
1	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to	(qe	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation
2	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that	2	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and
2 3	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can	2 3	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing
2 3 4	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in	2 3 4	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and
2 3 4 5	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to	2 3 4 5	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute
2 3 4 5 6	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are
2 3 4 5 6 7	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular situation, I would say the only thing what we have is that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember. MR TIP SC: And you were good enough to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular situation, I would say the only thing what we have is that there is a part public order policing must play in a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember. MR TIP SC: And you were good enough to do that and you came back on Friday morning and you
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular situation, I would say the only thing what we have is that there is a part public order policing must play in a certain situation and when the situation becomes difficult,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember. MR TIP SC: And you were good enough to do that and you came back on Friday morning and you identified four topics that you felt could constitute areas
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular situation, I would say the only thing what we have is that there is a part public order policing must play in a certain situation and when the situation becomes difficult, obviously we need to look to other means to say how to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember. MR TIP SC: And you were good enough to do that and you came back on Friday morning and you identified four topics that you felt could constitute areas of learning in respect of the event and areas where further
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	the point that I want to make. The point that I want to make is just this that on the strength of the evidence that you've given and confirmed today, at the very least one can confidently deduce that there are serious limitations in respect of the capacity of the POP unit of whatever size to deal with a difficult crowd situation, a situation such as the one that was described to you by my learned friend, Mr Ngalwana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I understand the question as you indicate the training they got, it may sometime not be equally or proportionate to the situation we have on the 16th. However, my answer will be to say normally how we look at is to say we should start from a certain position to arrive to a certain position. What I mean before you administer force and all those things you must be able at least to say you have actually done everything that is in place, talking about negotiations, all the steps must be in place. To say the public order policing is not trained to deal with a particular situation, I would say the only thing what we have is that there is a part public order policing must play in a certain situation and when the situation becomes difficult,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3483 essential in the planning phase in respect of an operation of the kind that is contemplated in your evidence and before this commission is that the officers who are dealing with the preparation of plans, the approval of plans and the implementation of plans must have a very acute understanding of the limitations of various units that are to be used and in this instance, in particular, the limitations that are associated with POP. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I will agree with you. MR TIP SC: Now I want to couple some questions to that answer and this really deals with the second aspect that I wanted to take up with you briefly today. You will recall that last Thursday at the conclusion of the proceedings there was some discussion about your position as an expert, your familiarity with the events at Marikana, and the Chairman requested you to overnight, to think about what lessons could be drawn from the experience at Marikana. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do remember. MR TIP SC: And you were good enough to do that and you came back on Friday morning and you identified four topics that you felt could constitute areas

20th December 2012

	Page 3484		Page 3486
1	MR TIP SC: One of those four is	1	utilise, not only to rely on teargas only if actually means
2	particularly relevant to the topics I'm dealing with and	2	are finished you can't do another thing, that's how it come
3	that was your suggestion that there should be further	3	up.
4	research, both nationally and internationally in the	4	MR TIP SC: If I follow you correctly,
5	availability of further non-lethal weaponry options that	5	these are discussions that you are having with your officer
6	could be potentially deployed in the management of crowd	6	colleagues in the Northern Cape subsequent to you taking up
7	situations in this country.	7	the position of operational head in that province?
8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.	8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir.
9	MR TIP SC: And as I understood the	9	MR TIP SC: In a context of debriefing
10	formulation that you gave to that topic, that proposal for	10	events in that province?
11	research was that you were addressing a perceived gap	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
12	between what POP was equipped to manage and what it should	12	MR TIP SC: Now Brigadier, the, if I may
13	be equipped to manage, and that gap is the gap between	13	say that that's positive, but what is not necessarily
14	using the existing non-lethal weaponry and the recourse,	14	positive is that it is confined to your province.
15	the resort to live ammunition.	15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes. But I'm prepared
16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.	16	to take it forward in future.
17	MR TIP SC: It's an important subject,	17	MR TIP SC: Well I'm glad to hear that,
18	Brigadier, and I just want to ask you firstly whether that	18	if I may take the liberty to say so, but what is, there are
19	was the first occasion that, the evening of the 13th,	19	two things of importance, Brigadier, that we need to be
20	Thursday evening, was that the first occasion that you	20	clear about. The Marikana shootings of 16 August have not
21	identified that need as something that should be addressed?	21	themselves triggered any kind of debate of that sort
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Truly speaking,	22	amongst the senior officers of the South African Police
23	Counsellor, it was not the first time, it's something we	23	Service, is that correct?
24	have been looking at it, thinking of it because I'm	24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I will not
25	involved with crowd management as a provincial head and we	25	be sure and I cannot answer yes or no because we've got two
		· · ·	(- vi)
		100	
1	Page 3485	10	Page 3487
1	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we	GR.	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not
2	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and	2	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or
2 3	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly	2 3	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I
2 3 4	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed.	2 3 4	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work
2 3 4 5	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten	2 3 4 5	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all.
2 3 4 5 6	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and a when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is
2 3 4 5 6 7	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and a when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and a when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and a when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am I and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it up to the head office and sit with the people in head	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will be nothing at this stage that need to come to us as what
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it up to the head office and sit with the people in head office in our meetings, then that's where I can actually	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will be nothing at this stage that need to come to us as what we're supposed to implement.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it up to the head office and sit with the people in head office in our meetings, then that's where I can actually put my point in place. But as you say, how long and when,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will be nothing at this stage that need to come to us as what we're supposed to implement. MR TIP SC: Again what I gather from that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it up to the head office and sit with the people in head office in our meetings, then that's where I can actually put my point in place. But as you say, how long and when, it's a thing we have been talking with it most of the time really because we have issues on service delivery that challenges us. We talk about it and we look and we say we	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will be nothing at this stage that need to come to us as what we're supposed to implement. MR TIP SC: Again what I gather from that is that there has not been any communication from the national office to your office to say, we have encountered, we have identified a serious problem in respect of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	are dealing with crowds every day. It's something that we talk about at my own level at Northern Cape where am J and when definitely come the situation as well, I felt strongly that these need to be addressed. MR TIP SC: Brigadier, can you enlighten the commission a bit about the pedigree, if I may use that word, of those discussions, in other words for how long have discussions of that kind been taking place amongst senior officers of the police, and in what circumstances? BRIG MKHWANAZI: As I've said I'm a provincial head for operational response services, I'm dealing with crowd management. I have public order policing reporting under me and when we meet these type of situations always we'll have some sort of debriefing to issues whereby we look and say what went wrong, what went right and all that to say we need to explore and look to these type of things. But for me at that provincial level, I can't take a final decision, it's only that if I take it up to the head office and sit with the people in head office in our meetings, then that's where I can actually put my point in place. But as you say, how long and when, it's a thing we have been talking with it most of the time really because we have issues on service delivery that	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3487 levels, the provincial as well as head office. I'm not sure whether they did have any meeting at this stage or discussing all issues and all that, but as far as I know, I haven't seen a meeting of this nature, except the work session I attended in Potchefstroom, that's all. MR TIP SC: What I gather from that is that if there have indeed been any discussions at the national level, it certainly hasn't percolated down to your important office at a provincial level. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't say yes because why, normally such type of meetings, only what we'll hear will be the outcome of the meeting if there is an instruction that need to be given to us, to say this actually emanates from this type of a meeting, then it will be something on writing or whatever, then what instruction we need to follow, then we'll follow. And discussion of this nature, maybe if there isn't anything that need to come to us, they can be the discussions, maybe there will be nothing at this stage that need to come to us as what we're supposed to implement. MR TIP SC: Again what I gather from that is that there has not been any communication from the national office to your office to say, we have encountered,

	Page 3488		Page 3490
1	2012 at Marikana, there's been nothing of that kind?	1	MR TIP SC: And in the course of that the
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I will go	2	chairperson made this observation, we would require
3	back to my answer, same answer to say if definitely there	3	assistance from people such as you who are experts in the
4	is an instruction, it will be given to us if there are	4	field of the public order policing and then we adjourned.
5	discussions that need our intervention. However, if you	5	Now you remember that?
6	talk about maybe talking about the situation at Marikana,	6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I remember.
7	obviously all of us we are actually keeping informed and as	7	MR TIP SC: The particular point that
8	a result as the situation was going on, some of us we have	8	flows from that I'd like to raise with you is that there
9	assisted after everything with members to deploy to deal	9	are two ways in which expert assistance from the side of
10	with the situation to make sure that the situation turned	10	the police can be placed before the commission. The one is
11	peacefully in Marikana as a whole. We have been informed,	11	that experts such as yourself come and give evidence and
12	we have been part of everything, but what I'm referring at	12	they are cross-examined and various concessions and points
13	is the instruction that says this is what we need to look	13	are established in that way. That as we know is a fairly
14	at, this is what we need to start implementing. We haven't	14	time consuming way and it is subject to the particular
15	received that because the only time I can be informed, if	15	qualifications and approach of the experts and the
16	there is something that need to be taken care of.	16	particular qualifications and skills of the cross-examining
17	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Tip, it's now 1 o'clock.	17	counsel. You with me thus far?
18	Is it convenient to take the adjournment at this time?	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, Sir.
19	MR TIP SC: It would be, Mr Chair.	19	MR TIP SC: Now the other way is that the
20	CHAIRPERSON: May I ask the other counsel	20	police themselves should have undertaken a major debriefing
21	representatives here whether there's anyone who wishes to	21	exercise in respect of the shootings of the 16th of August
22	cross-examine after Mr Tip's cross-examined? Yes, are you	22	and should themselves have generated views in respect of
23	the only one or are there others as well? I know certain	23	aspects that had been well done and aspects that had not
24	parties have reserved their rights and explained why but I	24	been well done.
25	just wanted to know for the purposes of planning ahead.	25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: A -
	His I and a la		/ ve le
	Page 2490	~	Dage 2401
1	Page 3489 Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half	in Ge	Page 3491
1	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half	4	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you
1 2 3	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The	1 2 3	MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as
2	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half	2	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you
2 3	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1.	2 3	MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission
2 3 4	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just	2 3 4	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L
2 3 4 5	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES]	2 3 4 5	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You
2 3 4 5 6	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still?
2 3 4 5 6 7	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately before we adjourned. The chairperson had made it clear to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is that that commission is favoured with the benefit of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately before we adjourned. The chairperson had made it clear to you that he hoped that in due course the commission's	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is that that commission is favoured with the benefit of concerted expert analysis conducted by the police
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately before we adjourned. The chairperson had made it clear to you that he hoped that in due course the commission's findings would be an important source document for training	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is that that commission is favoured with the benefit of concerted expert analysis conducted by the police themselves. And the second is that the police themselves
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately before we adjourned. The chairperson had made it clear to you that he hoped that in due course the commission's findings would be an important source document for training in respect of how difficulties of this nature could be	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is that that commission is favoured with the benefit of concerted expert analysis conducted by the police themselves. And the second is that the police themselves will already have begun to learn lessons from what went
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Thank you. Would it be in order if we adjourn until half past 1 or would that inconvenience too many people? The commission will adjourn until half past 1. [COMMISSION ADJOURNS COMMISSION RESUMES] [13:38] MR TIP SC: Mr Chair. Brigadier, just before the lunch adjournment you had indicated that aside from the question of formal letters or other written communications, there had been discussions amongst the police regarding this question of for instance the gap in the armaments or weaponry of POP. Do you remember that we were at that point? BRIG MKHWANAZI: What I indicated, Counsellor, was that in my own province where am I, we always discuss these issues and I'm looking forward as well to take it forward to head office if I've got a chance. MR TIP SC: Well let us turn immediately to that question because we also consider it a very important one. Brigadier you remember that in the course of the discussions late on Thursday last week, immediately before we adjourned. The chairperson had made it clear to you that he hoped that in due course the commission's findings would be an important source document for training	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3491 MR TIP SC: Let me just add and then you can respond if you would. And that in the course and as part of a presentation such as the one that this commission has received in the form of Exhibit L, that Exhibit L would've contained precisely that kind of content. You with me still? BRIG MKHWANAZI: I'm with you, Counsellor, only one thing is that I'm not sure with the debriefing as I have said or indicated that was it held on a provincial level or it was held on head office side. I'm not sure about it. However as you say, your feeling or maybe your indication is that the Exhibit L should contain maybe the issues regarding debriefing and all that. Again, I don't dispute it because I'm not sure whether should it be that direction or not about that. MR TIP SC: And why I suggest that something like that ought to have been and perhaps ought still to be done is that it contains potentially at least twofold advantage. The first, as I've indicated already is that that commission is favoured with the benefit of concerted expert analysis conducted by the police themselves. And the second is that the police themselves

		I	
	Page 3492		Page 3494
1	As I've said, I can't dispute that. As you say it can	1	mountain. And I want to ask you merely this and here I do
2	maybe formulate a document that will assist you are saying.	2	put the question to you on the basis of your expertise and
3	However I'm not sure why they took this direction they took	3	experience of, as a trainer and also of course of your
4	to come up with this type of a submission. I'm not sure	4	responsibilities now as an operations head and that is that
5	about that.	5	as a proposition, the prospect of a reproduction of that
6	MR TIP SC: That's entirely	6	situation underlines the urgency of the South African
7	understandable, Brigadier, and I'm not requiring you to	7	Police Service attending to shortcomings and what happened
8	respond in any depth. It's a topic that it's appropriate	8	on the 16th of August so that those shortcomings are not
9	to put – to ventilate through your evidence. Can I just	9	going to reoccur.
10	add none of what I have said in any way of course implies	10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, seeing to
11	that ultimately it will be the commission's findings that	11	the situation you are showing me, it is true that something
12	are those that are to be given action and heeded in further	12	need to be done to make sure that it doesn't actually
13	training and operational steps. I want lastly to give some	13	repeat itself and at the same time to look to the issues as
14	real content to the penultimate statement that I made which	14	the chairperson last time requested me to come up to say
15	is that the police really should already have been learning	15	how are we going to actually deal with other issues as one
16	lessons from that happened and that is through regard to a	16	of our lesson learned and maybe what I can actually
17	press report from yesterday's Star which I'd hand up as an	17	indicate is that I'm not sure at this stage, as far as head
18	exhibit if I may, Mr Chair. Ms Pillay will tell us in a	18	office is concerned, with the plan to say what need to be
19	moment what the number is.	19	done looking to the situation that took place as well. As
20	MS PILLAY: Chair, it's Exhibit DB1.	20	I have indicated at this stage, I haven't seen anything on
21	MR TIP SC: Thank you. Brigadier, I'm	21	writing or maybe heard about, but I'm very sure that there
22	going to – it's a copy of a report that appeared in the	22	must be – there will be something that will actually come
23	Star, as I indicated, yesterday morning under the headline	23	forward to address the issue even though maybe I may not
24	Lonmin faces threat of another wage strike and I'm going to	24	know what is happening at this stage. But as I spoke about
25	just read the first four paragraphs to you. The remainder	25	the issues of less lethal options and all that, something
		1	le have
	Page 3493	10	Page 3495
1	of the report details the grievances and the ongoing	1	must come as quick as possible. I do agree on that.
2	complaints that workers have. But the first four		MR TIP SC: Thank you, Brigadier. Thank
3	paragraphs are, in our respectful view, of real consequence	3	you, Mr Chair.
4	and I may just put on record that we've taken an	4	CHAIRPERSON: Mr Motau, I think you're
5	instruction and that the content that we see here is borne	5	going to cross-examine on behalf of Lonmin, is that
6	out by my instructions as a real topic and a real concern.	6	
7	I'm going to read it, the first paragraph. "Miners at the	7	CROSS-EXAMINATION MR MOTAU SC: Thank
8	Lonmin Mine in Marikana, North West, have threatened to	8	very Chain and meanshans of the computivity Drivedian aread
9	down tools and "roturn to the mountain" ofter mine becase	0	you, Chair and members of the commission. Brigadier, good
10	down tools and "return to the mountain" after mine bosses	9 10	afternoon.
10	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase.	10	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon.
11	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their	10 11	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you?
11 12	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended	10 11 12	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well,
11 12 13	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that	10 11 12 13	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks.
11 12 13 14	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money	10 11 12 13 14	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can
11 12 13 14 15	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike	10 11 12 13 14 15	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were
11 12 13 14 15 16	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are	10 11 12 13 14 15 16	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip.
11 12 13 14 15 16 17	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill	 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it.
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now,	 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star
11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that
 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of the complaints that the rock drill operators have or	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that article and put a number of questions to you, correct?
 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of the complaints that the rock drill operators have or whether any of them are justified in respect of Lonmin's	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that article and put a number of questions to you, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes.
 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of the complaints that the rock drill operators have or whether any of them are justified in respect of Lonmin's conduct, my only concern is that one has here a clear	 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that article and put a number of questions to you, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: You will see that that
 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of the complaints that the rock drill operators have or whether any of them are justified in respect of Lonmin's conduct, my only concern is that one has here a clear indication of at least some potential of the Marikana	 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23 	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that article and put a number of questions to you, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: You will see that that paragraph has a response by Lonmin. If you go to the last
 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 	alleged reneged on their promise of a 22% pay increase. The miners also accused the employers of breaching their promise of a 22% once off bonus payment after they ended their protracted strike in August. They alleged that Lonmin had "unfairly and fraudulently" deducted the money paid as a bonus. "If they don't pay us, we will strike again in January and go back to that mountain. They are taking us for granted" said Tolokele Dlunga, a rock drill operator who has worked at Lonmin for 8 years. Now, Brigadier, I'm not in any way concerned with the content of the complaints that the rock drill operators have or whether any of them are justified in respect of Lonmin's conduct, my only concern is that one has here a clear	10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	afternoon. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Good afternoon. MR MOTAU SC: How are you? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Trying to do well, thanks. MR MOTAU SC: Let's see how far you can try. Brigadier, just the last exhibit that you were referred to by my learned friend, Mr Tip. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: The article in the Star newspaper, he read the first four paragraphs of that article and put a number of questions to you, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: You will see that that

	Page 3496		Page 3498
1	MR MOTAU SC: And it says, just to read	1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I hear that, Sir.
2	it for the benefit of the record, Lonmin spokeswoman, Sue	2	MR MOTAU SC: Right, Brigadier, let me
3	Vey, denied that the company had reneged on its promise.	3	return to the aspects that I intend to deal with you. I'd
4	She said the current wage structure was part of an amended	4	like to firstly start with discussing certain aspects
5	deal signed by the workers union in September. Do you see	5	emanating from standing order 262 which is Annexure SS,
6	that? And it proceeds to say the main features of the	6	sorry – ja. Annexure SS2.
7	agreement included a signing of bonus of R2 000 and average	7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it, Sir.
8	raise in the overall package of between 11 and 22% for all	8	MR MOTAU SC: I gathered from your
9	employees falling between categories 3 to 8, she said.	9	evidence and correct me if I'm wrong, that the operation
10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	10	such as the one in Marikana is the kind of an operation to
11	MR MOTAU SC: She blamed the media for	11	which the standing order was applicable. Am I correct?
12	reporting on the 22% increase and she concludes by saying	12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
13	"in the absence of any context, this figure is misleading	13	MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to
14	and has contributed to widespread confusion." Yes, now	14	page 6 of 11, paragraph 8.1. You will see the heading is
15	these questions that were posed to you by Mr Tip, they were	15	the appointment of the CJOC.
16	in the context of lessons which should be learned in the	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, Sir.
17	light of the possible impending situation that may	17	MR MOTAU SC: You will see that in terms
18	eventuate in January.	18	of paragraph 8(1) the standing order provides that the
19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir.	19	divisional, provisional or area commissioner must ensure
20	MR MOTAU SC: And you recall it was also	20	that the CJOC is designated and that he or she, the CJOC,
21	in the context that the commission is supposed to be of	21	is conversant with this order and relevant legislation and
22	some assistance in terms of it's recommendations arising	22	well trained to take responsibility for the operation.
23	out of these proceedings.	23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
24	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I agree.	24	MR MOTAU SC: And we do know that the
25	MR MOTAU SC: Would you be opposed to the	25	CJOC is the commander of the joint operational centre.
	As and a la	24	1 set to
	Page 3497	10	Page 3499
1	idea of the commission talking or expressing its views in	44	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
2	respect of the responsibilities on the part of the unions, $\mathbf{O} \in \mathbb{R}$	2	USTIME MOTAUSC: And we will see that the
3	particularly in circumstances where a wage deal has been	3	thrust of 8.1 is that such a person will take the
4	signed by the unions?	4	responsibility for the operation.
5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, if I	5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.
6	understand you well, your point is will it be acceptable to	6	MR MOTAU SC: Then you will see in terms
7	our side as SAPS to see your input as well. Am I correct?	7	of 8.2 that once designated the CJOC gets to be in overall
8	MR MOTAU SC: Well the union's input as	8	command of the specific operation for which he or she has
9	well given that – remember there was a situation, we had	9	been designated. With emphasis being in the words in
10	this ordeal. There was a peace accord which was signed,	10	overall command of the specific operation.
11	there was a wage deal agreement which was signed by the	11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. He's an
12	unions.	12	overall commander.
13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Ja, right.	13	MR MOTAU SC: And you will also see from
14	MR MOTAU SC: That's the context within	14	that that the CJOC once designated becomes responsible for
15	which I'm asking you the question.	15	all actions which are taken. Correct?
16		16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct.
17	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. Ja. It will be		
~ ~	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe	17	MR MOTAU SC: And in respect of the
18	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be	17 18	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that
19	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see	17 18 19	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and
19 20	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see why it is this position, then I can be in a position to	17 18 19 20	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and coordinated actions for the duration of an operation.
19 20 21	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see why it is this position, then I can be in a position to make proper deduction to say will I be in a position to	17 18 19 20 21	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and coordinated actions for the duration of an operation. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir.
19 20 21 22	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see why it is this position, then I can be in a position to make proper deduction to say will I be in a position to accept whatever comes up in this position.	17 18 19 20 21 22	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and coordinated actions for the duration of an operation. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: And if you look at 9.2 it
19 20 21 22 23	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see why it is this position, then I can be in a position to make proper deduction to say will I be in a position to accept whatever comes up in this position. [13:58] MR MOTAU SC: Except I must just indicate	17 18 19 20 21 22 23	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and coordinated actions for the duration of an operation. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: And if you look at 9.2 it stipulates that for purposes of preplanning there are
19 20 21 22	difficult, Counsellor, as I have said that yesterday maybe I said there's always two side of the story and I will be happy to say maybe if this comes in both side and we see why it is this position, then I can be in a position to make proper deduction to say will I be in a position to accept whatever comes up in this position.	17 18 19 20 21 22	preplanning of the operations paragraph 9.1 tells us that the appointed CJOC is responsible for the well planned and coordinated actions for the duration of an operation. BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: And if you look at 9.2 it

	Page 3500		Page 3502
1	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, yes.	1	that exhibit, if I can just ask you to turn to page 001702.
2	MR MOTAU SC: I'm only going to focus on	2	MR BUDLENDER SC: Chair, may I just
3	sub 3 which prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC.	3	interject for a moment please. The old one is not an
4	You see that?	4	Exhibit. So if it's going to be used it will need to be
5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that, yes.	5	put in separately. It's been replaced by the new one. So
6	MR MOTAU SC: And you'll agree with me	6	if the witness has the new one, it may -
7	that's a peremptory provision –	7	CHAIRPERSON: No, the only change between
8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.	8	the old one and the new is that the old one has got a
9	MR MOTAU SC: - that the CJOC enjoys no	9	complete set of the operational – of the contingency plan
10	discretion in that regard.	10	of the 10th of August and whereas the one before us lacks at
11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.	11	least one page. But that's the only difference as far as
12	MR MOTAU SC: In fact I'm just going to	12	I'm aware. Is that correct, Mr Semenya?
13	put to you part of what appears in the statement of General	13	MR MOTAU SC: Well –
14	Mbombo. I don't have to give it to you. I don't think it	14	CHAIRPERSON: If you are going to quote a
15	will be an issue. And in fact if I'm misrepresenting what	15	missing page then all we have to do is tear that missing
16	is contained there, representatives of SAPS will be quick	16	page out of the original one and insert it.
17	to jump in. In paragraph 7 and 8 of General Mbombo's	17	MR MOTAU SC: Chair and members of the
18	statement, she states that on the 12th of August 2012 she	18	commission, I had also indicated that for purposes of the
19	gave instructions to Brigadier Calitz to set up or activate	19	record, I am going to give the page reference in terms of
20	a JOC. Do you know about that?	20	the new SS3 so that there should be no confusion and I was
21	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's my first time I	21	going to proceed to do that.
22	hear.	22	CHAIRPERSON: Ja, you're going to have
23	MR MOTAU SC: But I take it that you have	23	difficulty with some of the later documents, but never
24	no reason to dispute the correctness of what I'm putting to	24	mind. Do your best.
25	you?	25	MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier -
	Page 3501	110	Page 3503
1	Page 3501 BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason	(Re	Page 3503
1 2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason	2	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate
			Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate
2	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the	2	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan
2 3	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement.	2	MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So
2 3 4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm	2 3 4	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an
2 3 4 5	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time.	2 3 4 5	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's
2 3 4 5 6	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document.
2 3 4 5 6 7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay.	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay,
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one.	2 1 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 111 12 13 14	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you -
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old	2 1 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 111 12 13 14 15	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them.	2 1 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. MR MOTAU SC: You just tell me which one you have.	2 1 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment. CHAIRPERSON: - I suppose we must say
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. MR MOTAU SC: You just tell me which one you have. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got both.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment. CHAIRPERSON: - I suppose we must say this is the amended contingency plan dated the 13th of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. MR MOTAU SC: You just tell me which one you have. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got both. MR MOTAU SC: Well let's take the old one	2 (3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment. CHAIRPERSON: - I suppose we must say this is the amended contingency plan dated the 13th of August, is that right?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. MR MOTAU SC: You just tell me which one you have. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got both. MR MOTAU SC: Well let's take the old one and then I'll give reference for purposes of the record -	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment. CHAIRPERSON: - I suppose we must say this is the amended contingency plan dated the 13th of August, is that right? MR MOTAU SC: Chair, I'm not looking at
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I don't see the reason of course but I was going to be happy if I was seeing the statement. MR MOTAU SC: Well, Brigadier, I'm putting it to you in this fashion so that we can save time. So then I'm asking you to accept that what I'm putting to you is indeed correct. Well I'm indebted to Ms Pillay. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that. Yes, I see it, Sir. MR MOTAU SC: Having regard to that, may I then ask you to turn to Exhibit SS3. For the purposes of what I want to ask you, you can use either of them. I will give you references in both documents even if you use the old one, even if you use the new one. BRIG MKHWANAZI: The new one or the old one? Are you referring to the new one, Counsellor - MR MOTAU SC: Any of them. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Okay. MR MOTAU SC: You just tell me which one you have. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got both. MR MOTAU SC: Well let's take the old one	2 (3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3503 MS PILLAY: Chair, if I may just indicate Just to clear matters up, Exhibit U is the contingency plan of 10th of August. It's the first part of the old SS3. So if you want to refer to that document, it is already an exhibit and then we can refer to the new SS3 in it's current form for anything else related to that document. CHAIRPERSON: Yes, thank you, Ms Pillay, that will solve the problem. MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, I think let's just simplify matters. Can we just – can I just ask you to look at the new SS3. BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, I've got it. MR MOTAU SC: May I ask you to turn to page 001679 and please give me an indication once you - BRIG MKHWANAZI: 166 or 167? MR MOTAU SC: 1679 as I could make out. You will see it starts at the top with the words Joint Operational Centre (JOC). BRIG MKHWANAZI: Just a moment. CHAIRPERSON: - I suppose we must say this is the amended contingency plan dated the 13th of August, is that right?

20th December 2012

Marikana Commission of Inquiry

	Page 3504		Page 3506
1	Sir.	1	the JOC and two, activating it at the scene of an incident
2	MR MOTAU SC: Yes, Chair. The	2	or event. Because that in fact – in doing that they'll be
3	chairperson's description is correct. So you will see	3	complying with the standing order.
4	under the heading physical location, it states that the JOC	4	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.
5	will be positioned at Middlekraal Rescue Centre, is that	5	MR MOTAU SC: And if the scene of an
6	correct?	6	incident or event as defined by the standing order happens
7	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct, yes.	7	to be fitted with cameras, you'll also agree that there's
8	MR MOTAU SC: And if you turn to page	8	nothing untoward if the police use those cameras in running
	, , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , , ,	9	the JOC.
9 10	001676, paragraph 3.2.1, you will note from there that the Middlekraph Deceue Control is situated at the Lenmin Mine	9 10	BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's correct. We have
10	Middlekraal Rescue Centre is situated at the Lonmin Mine.		
11	See that?	11	been working like that, especially in sporting events, it
12	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I see that.	12	has been like that because there are cameras as well.
13	MR MOTAU SC: Now may I then ask you to	13	MR MOTAU SC: And in fact if the party
14	go back to Exhibit SS2?	14	that is responsible for the scene of an incident or event
15	BRIG MKHWANAZI: I've got it.	15	were to refuse either to allow the police to set up a JOC
16	MR MOTAU SC: You will see on page 1,	16	there or to use that equipment, one could validly view that
17	paragraph 2, you have a definition section. Do you see	17	as an obstruction to the work that the police need to do.
18	that?	18	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Counsellor, I won't go
19	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes.	19	to a yes answer, but in my experience we never have a
20	MR MOTAU SC: And against the letter J,	20	situation whereby really we'll be denied an access unless
21	over the page, on page 2 of that document –	21	otherwise maybe a situation demands otherwise, but normally
22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: Page 2, okay.	22	we used to have definitely a support to be able to utilise
23	MR MOTAU SC: - you will find the	23	whatever equipment or structure to be able to deal with the
24	definition of a JOC –	24	situation at hand.
25	BRIG MKHWANAZI: - which is defined to	25	MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, let me go to a
	Diminthe house trave	100	e have
1	Page 3505	in de	Page 3507
1	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for	4	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that
2	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the	2	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in
2 3	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of	2 3	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their
2 3 4	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that?	2 3 4	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming,
2 3	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about	2 3 4 5	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information,
2 3 4 5 6	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E.	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J.	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct?
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding,	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding, yes.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct. MR MOTAU SC: And you would expect
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Now having regard to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct. MR MOTAU SC: And you would expect parties such as the unions and management to provide
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Now having regard to the provisions of the standing order, will you agree with me	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct. MR MOTAU SC: And you would expect parties such as the unions and management to provide assistance in among other things the information that I've
2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	mean the joint operational centre that is activated and for the purposes of my questions, the important words are the ones that are to follow. That is activated at the scene of an incident or event. You see that? BRIG MKHWANAZI: You are talking about paragraph E. MR MOTAU SC: No, paragraph J. BRIG MKHWANAZI: J, okay. MR MOTAU SC: Right. So if one looks at the standing order, remember we said it gives no discretion to the CJOC but it prescribes that the CJOC must activate a JOC. And we see that not only does the standing order prescribe that a JOC must be activated or established, it also tells us where such a JOC should be established. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: And it's common cause, the scene of an incident or event for purposes of this commission, we're talking about Marikana and Lonmin. Lonmin Mine. Is that correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: That's my understanding, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Now having regard to the	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3507 separate but related aspect. You'll agree with me that when the police approach an incident such as the one in Marikana, for the purposes of implementing their operational plan which we've already defined as disarming, dispersing and arresting, they would require information, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct, yes. MR MOTAU SC: Part of the information which they would require would be for example the nature of the dispute. In other words what is the source of conflict, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Yes, correct. MR MOTAU SC: And they would also require the identity of the parties which are in dispute, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: Correct. MR MOTAU SC: And in the context of the issue that we're dealing with, they would require to be shown the layout of the area, for example where the koppie is situated, correct? BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct. MR MOTAU SC: And you would expect parties such as the unions and management to provide

		Page 3508		Page 3510
l	1	the name but it will depend who can be able to avail the	1	it's the fault of the person who drafted the document.
	2	information. Because I'm saying that coming to this type	2	MR MMUSI SC: I didn't get that, Mr
	3	of a situation obviously would be meeting held of which	3	Chair.
	4	different role players must definitely play a role on that,	4	CHAIRPERSON: It wasn't your fault –
l	5	irrespective they are in dispute or not in dispute but they	5	MR MMUSI SC: Yes.
l	6	must be part of that type of a meeting. Then it's where	6	CHAIRPERSON: - it was the fault of the
	7	all issues of this nature can be disclosed as well.	7	person who drafted that document.
	8	MR MOTAU SC: Brigadier, let me just make	8	MR MMUSI SC: Precisely.
	9	myself very clear. I was not confining the role players,	9	CHAIRPERSON: Alright. Well that's now
	10	only to the unions and management. I was saying in the	10	on record. Mr Tip, the arrangement were that you were
	11	context of what we're dealing with and given the examples	11	going to lead a witness in chief when this evidence was
	12	of the type of information which I had indicated that would	12	over, well there are two problems about that. The first is
	13	be required, one would not exclude the possibility that the	13	the witness isn't finished and secondly, we did indicate
	14	unions and management would be such role players would	14	that we would carry on until 12 tomorrow. Is there any
	15	provide this information which the police would require.	15	likelihood that you would've finished leading the witness's
	16	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.	16	evidence in chief by then?
	17	MR MOTAU SC: And the reason thereof,	17	MR TIP SC: No, Mr Chair, there's no
	18	Brigadier, is quite obvious because the police would	18	likelihood at all and we would respectfully ask for the
	19	require such information for purposes of being able to plan	19	indulgence that he be called in the new session.
l	20	properly and in deciding what appropriate intervention	20	CHAIRPERSON: Well in the circumstances
	21	measures should be implemented. Correct?	21	we won't be able to proceed this year and the proceedings
	22	BRIG MKHWANAZI: It's correct.	22	of the commission will have to stand adjourned until the
	23	MR MOTAU SC: And having regard to that,	23	21st of January next year. I would say that the commission
l	24	you'll agree with me then that there is or there would be	24	expects those parties who have reserved cross-examination
	25	nothing untoward on the part of management cooperating in	25	to be ready to proceed with their cross-examination at
ļ		As and to (2.15	/ Style
ļ				
		Page 3509	100	Page 3511
	1	Page 3509 that particular process of sharing information with the	in all	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears
	1 2		·	Page 3511
		that particular process of sharing information with the	·	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears
	2	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution.	2	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am
	2 3	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree.	2 3	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then
	2 3 4	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of	2 3 4	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The
	2 3 4 5	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions.	2 3 4 5	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on
	2 3 4 5 6	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've	2 3 4 5 6	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg
	2 3 4 5 6 7	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or	2 3 4 5 6 7	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights	2 3 4 5 6 7 8	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record. CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to ask further	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record. CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to ask further questions based on it?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record. CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to ask further questions based on it? MR MMUSI SC: No.	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record. CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to ask further questions based on it? MR MMUSI SC: No. CHAIRPERSON: You just want to explain	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.
	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	that particular process of sharing information with the relevant role players in order to seek or find a solution. BRIG MKHWANAZI: I do agree. MR MOTAU SC: Chairperson and members of the commission, those are our questions. CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. I think we've indicated that all other persons who are going to – or parties going to ask questions have reserved their rights until next year when they've studied the transcripts and consulted the experts and so on. Is that correct? Mr Semenya, since you won't be able to re-examine yet because you can only do that at the end of the cross-examination. MR SEMENYA SC: Indeed, Chair. MR MMUSI SC: Mr Chair, just one aspect. Earlier on when I cross-examined and I put to the witness that there were 8 razor wire available, I was corrected to say there were 6. That I had taken in Exhibit TT3, that's the only aspect that I wanted to put on record. CHAIRPERSON: Do you want to ask further questions based on it? MR MMUSI SC: No. CHAIRPERSON: You just want to explain where your erroneous information came from?	2 3 4 5 6 7 8 9 10 11 12 13 14 15 16 17 18 19 20 21 22 23	Page 3511 09:30 on the morning of the 21st of January. There appears to be an application we should start at 10 o'clock. I am prepared to accede to that application on the basis we then resume after lunch at 13:30 on the 31st of January. The commission will therefore stand adjourned until 10 am on the 21st of January here at Pacific Centre in Rustenburg unless otherwise advised. It remains to me on behalf of my fellow commissioners and myself to extend our best wishes to all concerned. Those who are in auditorium and have been listening the proceedings and those who participated as parties or as counsel of attorneys, all the best for the festive season. Travel safely, come back safely and we will proceed then next year. Thank you very much.

				Page 351
	ADJOURNS 3445:9	3438:21 3439:18,23	3449:19 3450:2,11,15	assuming 3453:16
<u>A</u>	3489:4	3440:1,2 3441:7	3450:17 3451:8,14,24	assumption 3405:17,19
abide 3405:5	administer 3481:15	3442:21 3457:18	3452:11 3462:20,22	assumption 3405:18
able 3410:21 3424:5,11	3482:1	3458:4 3459:11	3466:13,18 3498:19	3405:19
3424:13 3432:9,10	administering 3482:5	3460:4,5,20,21,23,24	3507:18	assure 3410:17
3442:24 3443:1	advantage 3491:19		areas 3410:19 3483:22	
3450:19 3451:3		3461:4 3464:12,24	3483:23	atmosphere 3426:23
3463:22 3469:10,12	advise 3411:17	3465:1,3 3467:24		attack 3464:3,6,19
3469:17 3473:24	advised 3511:7	3476:9 3478:19,20	argue 3410:4 3417:4,7	attackers 3464:10
3481:16 3506:22,23	African 3420:3	3479:3,7 3481:12	argument 3409:23	attempt 3472:16
3508:1,19 3509:11	3486:22 3494:6	3482:8,13 3483:11	3410:9,10 3414:7	attended 3487:5
3510:21	afternoon 3470:15	3486:25 3488:3,3	3417:6	attending 3494:7
absence 3496:13	3495:9,10	3506:19	arising 3496:22	attention 3410:25
accede 3511:3	ago 3434:17	answered 3432:25	armaments 3489:10	3416:9,13 3440:19
accept 3400:12 3417:3	agree 3400:15 3403:1	3440:20 3464:13	armed 3445:22 3471:7	3478:23
3497:22 3501:6	3406:9,13,19,22	answering 3480:17	3477:20 3479:6	attorney 3473:3
acceptable 3400:10	3414:18 3416:24,25	answers 3417:8 3449:9	arms 3455:13 3470:16	attorneys 3511:11
3497:6	3423:9 3429:18	3474:14 3476:10	arrangement 3473:17	audience 3439:5
accepting 3405:19	3470:21 3476:15	anticipated 3454:19	3510:10	auditorium 3511:9
access 3506:20	3482:16 3483:9	anticipating 3436:4	arrest 3430:15 3431:2	August 3420:5,16
accord 3497:10	3495:1 3496:24	anybody 3435:15	3433:19 3437:9,11,23	3422:9,14 3465:12
accords 3474:15	3500:6 3505:15,23	anyway 3415:13	arrested 3417:18	3470:9 3471:8 3478:1
account 3402:17	3506:7 3507:1	3417:22 3438:25	3430:22	3486:20 3487:25
3423:25 3478:1	3508:24 3509:3	3439:25 3457:19	arresting 3507:5	3490:21 3491:24
accurate 3465:20	agreed 3404:6 3472:12	apartheid 3401:15	arrive 3481:14	3493:13 3494:8
accurately 3480:20	3472:12	apologies 3472:3	article 3495:18,20	3500:18 3502:10
accused 3493:11	agreement 3455:12	apologise 3417:21	aside 3489:6	3503:3,22
achievable 3431:11,19	3470:15 3496:7	3472:4	asked 3404:25 3405:1	authority 3402:18
3431:20	3497:11	apology 3417:22	3408:13 3457:15	avail 3508:1
acted 3459:9	ahead 3488:25	appeal 3413:9	3464:24 3472:5	availability 3484:5
action 3408:23 3425:24	aid 3437:8,22	appeared 3492:22	asking 3405:15	available 3509:16
	air 3434:18	appearing 3440:9	3414:10 3430:17	average 3496:7
3425:25 3426:1,2,4	alive 3454:3	appears 3433:21	3437:19,20 3439:14	avoids 3456:20
3427:16 3450:20	allegation 3453:25,25	3453:23 3479:8	3461:25 3497:15	aware 3464:2,18
3451:3 3492:12	allegations 3455:23	3500:13 3511:1	3501:6	3474:11 3476:19
actions 3436:12	allege 3453:25 3454:1	applicable 3498:11	asks 3438:9	3502:12
3499:15,20	alleged 3493:10,13	application 3511:2,3	aspect 3421:23 3422:1	5502.12
activate 3500:3,19	allegedly 3459:9	appointed 3402:1	3445:25 3446:15	B
3505:11	allow 3506:15	3499:19	3466:11 3483:12	back 3403:8 3413:20
activated 3505:1,3,13	allowance 3442:15	appointment 3498:15	3497:24 3507:1	3416:7 3418:23
activating 3505:25	alright 3425:8 3438:14	appreciate 3434:24		
3506:1	3458:14 3510:9	3480:20	3509:14,18	3422:16 3426:20
activities 3471:8			aspects 3473:24	3427:7 3458:22
acute 3483:5	alternatively 3447:23	appreciated 3417:12	3490:23,23 3498:3,4	3464:5,9,11 3475:21
add 3491:1 3492:10	amended 3496:4	approach 3476:7	assegais 3471:21	3476:23,25 3482:22
address 3410:8	3503:21	3490:15 3507:2	3472:2 3477:20	3483:21 3488:3
3472:16 3494:23	ammunition 3471:3,17	approached 3453:3	3479:7	3493:16 3504:14
addressed 3484:21	3471:21 3472:1	appropriate 3407:17	assessment 3436:24,25	3511:12
3485:4 3489:24	3484:15	3410:5 3440:15	3465:15	background 3400:6
addressing 3439:6	amounts 3442:2	3492:8 3508:20	assist 3477:1 3482:18	3456:17 3457:22
3484:11	analysis 3463:18,19	approval 3483:4	3492:2	bad 3414:14
adequacy 3430:2	3464:6,8,25 3491:21	area 3425:22 3426:4,5	assistance 3448:7	barbed 3426:9,13,18
adequate 3479:6	animal 3433:14	3427:4,16,16,17,22	3490:3,9 3496:22	3426:25 3431:8,25
adjourn 3489:1,3	annexure 3419:19	3427:24 3428:6,12,16	3507:23	3432:1,3,5,6,9,13,14
adjourned 3489:20	3498:5,6	3428:19,22 3429:4,10	assisted 3488:9	3432:18,22,23 3433:6
3490:4 3510:22	answer 3407:24 3411:7	3429:14,20 3433:23	assists 3463:21	3433:10,14,18,19,22
3511:5,14	3413:20 3414:3,10	3434:4 3436:5 3443:6	associated 3483:8	3434:10,11 3435:7,19
adjournment 3445:2	3416:8,14 3424:14	3443:7,19,25 3444:11	assume 3405:15	3435:22,25 3436:5,13
•	3425:9 3426:7 3433:9	3444:14,14,15 3446:1	3406:20 3433:6	3437:2,8,11,13,22
3447:21 3488:18 3489:6	3425:9 3426:7 3433:9 3438:10,13,14,15,17	3444:14,14,15 3446:1 3446:4,13,13,18,24	3406:20 3433:6 assumed 3441:10	3437:2,8,11,13,22 3438:3 3439:10,10,15

			-	Page 3513
3440:7,23,25 3441:9	3462:6	3463:3,12,16,20	Bruinders 3448:9,24	certainly 3465:17
3440.7,23,23 3441.9 3441:18 3444:19,23	blue-coloured 3462:12	3464:4,21 3466:15	3449:10,23	3487:8
3445:22 3458:9	bodies 3454:3 3458:21	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	BUDLENDER 3502:2	Chair 3416:25 3417:16
		3467:8,14,23 3468:3	bull 3402:4	
3464:14 3467:1,7,9	body 3449:10	3468:7,17 3469:3,22		3417:25 3421:22
3467:16,21,21 3468:4	bolder 3418:18	3470:2,10,13 3471:1	bulldogs 3402:4	3425:7 3430:5
3468:10,12,24,25	bonus 3493:12,15	3471:5,14 3472:9,18	bundle 3420:2 3422:16	3434:24 3438:6,19
3469:4 based 3434:5 3439:19	3496:7 books 3413:5 3460:13	3473:25 3474:2,6,10	bushes 3458:24,25 3459:1 3462:4	3442:13 3445:16
		3474:12 3475:10,13		3446:6,10 3447:10
3448:15,19 3465:23	borne 3493:5	3475:14,23,24 3476:1	busy 3442:11 3450:16	3448:6 3449:4,22
3509:20 basic 3457:8	bosses 3493:9	3476:8,16,22 3477:4	3465:9	3450:1,5 3453:1,9,14
basics 3452:14	bottom 3444:8 breach 3434:13 3436:8	3477:9,14 3478:21	bystanders 3442:24	3455:16 3456:5,22
		3479:16 3480:23	<u> </u>	3457:10 3466:10
basis 3414:7 3448:11	breached 3432:6	3481:9 3482:16,23	Calitz 3500:19	3467:3 3468:21
3494:2 3511:3	3434:12,13	3483:9,19,25 3484:8		3472:3 3473:2,7,11
bastards 3410:14	breaching 3464:14,25	3484:16,22 3485:10	call 3402:15 3403:9	3474:17 3478:5
3415:18 bear 3430:4 3439:5	3493:11 Breytenbach 3474:1,10	3486:8,11,15,24	3431:2 3439:22	3488:19 3489:5
	Breytenbach 3474:1,10 3475:14,23 3476:1	3487:10 3488:2	3453:24 3473:20	3492:18,20 3495:3,8 3502:2,17 3503:1,23
beat 3415:25	3475:14,23 3476:1 Breytenbach's 3476:9	3489:12,25 3490:6,18	called 3424:13 3510:19	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
beginning 3430:25	e	3490:25 3491:7,25	calling 3455:17	3504:2 3509:13,14
3470:19 begins 3478:14	brief 3474:18 3479:1	3494:10 3495:10,12	cameras 3506:7,8,12	3510:3,17 Chairman 3400:13
	briefing 3424:24	3495:17,21,25	Canine 3429:3 3459:21	Chairman 3409:13
begun 3491:23 behalf 3417:18 3473:9	briefly 3482:9 3483:12 Brig 3400:11 15 18 22	3496:10,19,24 3497:5 3497:13,16 3498:1,7	canon 3461:16 3462:4	3416:4 3483:16
	Brig 3400:11,15,18,22	· · · · · ·	3462:5,11 3463:4 canons 3461:12	chairperson 3400:2 3405:21,25 3409:2,7
3477:12 3495:5 3511:7	3401:2,11,16,21,24	3498:12,16,23 3499:1		
behave 3408:1 3410:2	3402:6,11,20 3403:5 3403:15 3404:1	3499:5,11,16,21	can't 3405:25,25	3409:14,20 3410:4,7
behaviour 3407:23	3405:10,13,24 3406:4	3500:1,5,8,11,21	3416:13 3438:19	3414:5,9,12,22
3441:2 3460:16	3406:10 3407:3	3501:1,8,15,18,21,24 3503:12,15,19,25	3439:18,21,23 3442:3 3448:4 3454:10,15	3415:1,8,18 3416:6 3416:12 3417:11,20
belief 3413:5	3408:3,16 3411:1,4	35 04:7, 1 2,15,19,22	3456:3 3457:19	3410:12 3417.11,20 3419:22 3420:1,8
believe 3404:2 3446:2	3411:10 3412:7	3504:25 3505:5,8,15	3485:18 3486:2	3421:7,11,15 3422:10
3466:17 3467:1	3413:14 3415:17	3505:20 3506:4,10,18		3422:24 3424:23
benefit 3491:20 3496:2	3416:6,16 3418:5,8	3507:7,12,15,20,25	capable 3482:10 capacity 3481:5	3425:8 3426:7,11
best 3460:18 3502:24	3419:6,19,24 3420:6	3508:16,22 3509:3	3482:11,21	3429:24 3433:21
3511:8,11	3420:17 3423:4,12,14	brigadier 3400:3,5	Cape 3485:2 3486:6	3435:3,10,14 3438:7
better 3417:8	3423:17,21 3424:2,17	3405:21 3408:14	care 3457:1 3488:16	3438:12,14,22
beyond 3435:1 3452:9	3424:21 3425:11,15	3410:11 3413:7,9	carry 3411:14 3417:10	3439:18 3440:3,8,13
big 3414:2 3468:20	3425:19,23 3426:4,10	3417:25 3438:9	3457:20 3460:19	3441:1 3442:1,9
3469:7,8,13,15	3426:12,17,22 3427:5	3440:1 3442:7	3461:23 3467:6	3444:21,24 3445:10
binding 3402:19	3427:13,18,23 3428:2	3445:11,18 3447:18	3479:12,23 3510:14	3446:8,20,23 3447:5
bit 3406:13 3474:25	3428:4,7,10,14,17,20	3449:1,18 3453:21	carrying 3471:12	3447:13 3448:13,19
3485:6	3428:23 3429:1,5,7,9	3457:21 3459:18	case 3418:6 3440:14	3449:1,16 3452:22
Bizos 3400:3,5,12,16	3429:12,15,23	3461:8 3465:19	3442:2 3453:12	3453:7,10,15,21
3400:19,23 3401:8,12	3430:11,13 3431:23	3466:2,12 3468:16	3471:5	3454:18 3455:21
3401:17,23,25 3402:7	3432:17 3433:4,9	3473:23 3474:10,18	catch 3442:19	3456:7,18 3457:1,14
3402:16 3403:1,10,23	3435:9,17,21 3436:14	3475:7,22 3476:25	categories 3496:9	3458:11,16,20 3459:6
3405:6,11,15 3406:1	3437:10,24 3438:10	3477:6 3479:8	cause 3416:10,16,24	3459:18,23,25 3460:8
3406:9,20 3407:21	3438:13,17 3440:2	3480:18 3482:7	3439:20 3505:16	3460:12,16,23
,_ ~ ~ ~ ~ ~ / ·	3441:16,22 3442:8,16	3484:18 3485:5	caused 3440:6,11	3461:14,16,22 3462:1
3408:12 3409:2.6.13			CBD 3451:12,21	3462:3,14 3465:7,25
3408:12 3409:2,6,13 3409:19,22 3410:4,6		3486:12,19 3489:5.18		
3409:19,22 3410:4,6	3442:21 3443:8,13,17	3486:12,19 3489:5,18 3492:7,21 3493:19		3467:5,9 3468:9
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6	3492:7,21 3493:19	central 3426:5	3467:5,9 3468:9 3471:19 3473:4,8,17
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18	3471:19 3473:4,8,17
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14 3417:1,11 3420:9	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21 3453:19 3454:17,21	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9 3506:25 3508:8,18	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6 certain 3418:9,13	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2 3494:14 3495:4
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14 3417:1,11 3420:9 3444:25 3465:24	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21 3453:19 3454:17,21 3458:3,19 3459:5,13	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9 3506:25 3508:8,18 bring 3416:7 3431:3,4	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6 certain 3418:9,13 3435:24 3436:1,11	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2 3494:14 3495:4 3502:7,14,22 3503:7
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14 3417:1,11 3420:9 3444:25 3465:24 blamed 3496:11	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21 3453:19 3454:17,21 3458:3,19 3459:5,13 3459:22,24 3460:7,15	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9 3506:25 3508:8,18 bring 3416:7 3431:3,4 3433:15 3471:18	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6 certain 3418:9,13 3435:24 3436:1,11 3464:1 3481:14,14,22	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2 3494:14 3495:4 3502:7,14,22 3503:7 3503:20 3509:4,6,19
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14 3417:1,11 3420:9 3444:25 3465:24 blamed 3496:11 blocked 3447:2	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21 3453:19 3454:17,21 3458:3,19 3459:5,13 3459:22,24 3460:7,15 3460:20,25 3461:9,11	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9 3506:25 3508:8,18 bring 3416:7 3431:3,4 3433:15 3471:18 3472:16	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6 certain 3418:9,13 3435:24 3436:1,11 3464:1 3481:14,14,22 3482:4,13 3488:23	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2 3494:14 3495:4 3502:7,14,22 3503:7 3503:20 3509:4,6,19 3509:22,25 3510:4,6
3409:19,22 3410:4,6 3410:11 3411:3,5 3412:2 3413:9 3414:5 3414:8,11,17,25 3415:7 3416:4,14 3417:1,11 3420:9 3444:25 3465:24 blamed 3496:11	3442:21 3443:8,13,17 3443:20,23 3444:1,6 3444:9,16,21 3445:24 3450:13 3451:9,25 3452:12,18,21 3453:19 3454:17,21 3458:3,19 3459:5,13 3459:22,24 3460:7,15	3492:7,21 3493:19 3495:2,8,15 3498:2 3500:19 3501:4 3502:25 3503:9 3506:25 3508:8,18 bring 3416:7 3431:3,4 3433:15 3471:18	central 3426:5 centre 3498:25 3503:18 3504:5,10 3505:1 3511:6 certain 3418:9,13 3435:24 3436:1,11 3464:1 3481:14,14,22	3471:19 3473:4,8,17 3478:10 3488:17,20 3489:20 3490:2 3494:14 3495:4 3502:7,14,22 3503:7 3503:20 3509:4,6,19

				Page 3514
chairperson's 3504:3	close 3441:19,20	commissioners	3476:11	3428:25 3429:1,12
challenge 3480:2,7,10	3470:14,22	3410:18 3511:8	consequence 3493:3	3431:22 3432:13
3480:16	closing 3417:9	commission's 3489:21	consider 3408:2	3433:20 3435:18
challenges 3485:24	colleague 3473:10	3492:11	3489:17	3442:6,8 3444:6
chance 3413:19	colleagues 3486:6	committed 3403:24,25	considered 3469:20	3445:17 3446:9
3435:13 3442:24,25	College 3460:2	3404:5	considers 3457:3	3450:5,10 3451:8
3467:15 3489:15	Colonel 3427:11	common 3505:16	consistent 3402:8,9	3452:13 3454:12,13
change 3418:23 3435:5	3466:3,5	common-law 3410:3	3403:22 3407:22,25	3457:16 3461:9
3480:4,15 3502:7	column 3425:2 3495:24	communication	3408:2,24 3409:15	3462:23 3469:21
changed 3418:3	come 3401:25 3402:5	3487:22	3440:24 3442:5	3470:1,25 3471:1,4
changes 3418:7	3405:11,22 3410:24	communications	3446:4 3458:1 3463:1	3471:14,20 3474:2,6
channelled 3435:24	3413:20,25 3415:22	3489:8	3463:10	3474:12,21 3475:2,13
channelling 3436:10	3416:12 3418:20	communities 3412:1	constables 3415:24	3475:24 3476:9,22
charge 3450:22	3436:21 3437:3	community 3410:15	constitute 3483:22	3478:1 3483:25
Charles 3405:7	3455:12 3463:8	company 3496:3	Constitution 3400:10	3484:8,16 3486:8,11
Charlie 3428:19,21	3464:11 3466:17	compel 3482:2	consultation 3412:25	3486:23 3489:25
3429:3	3478:9 3482:11,17	compile 3463:22	consulted 3509:10	3490:18 3495:6,20,21
check 3461:7 3464:5,22	3485:3 3486:2	3475:20	consulting 3473:13	3496:19 3497:7
3465:2	3487:18,19 3490:11	complaints 3493:2,20	consuming 3490:14	3498:9,11,12,23
checking 3403:8	3492:4 3494:14,22	complete 3432:1	contain 3491:12	3499:1,5,11,15,16,21
3453:4,5 3473:3	3495:1 3511:12	3502:9	contained 3491:5	3500:8,11 3501:7
chief 3510:11,16	comes 3416:9 3418:15	completing 3422:22	3500:16	3502:12 3504:3,6,7
children 3410:23	3418:19 3482:22	comply 3505:24	contains 3422:11	3505:19 3506:4,10
choosing 3445:5	3497:19,22	complying 3506:3	3465:17 3491:18	3507:6,7,11,12,14,15
chopped 3418:3	coming 3404:6 3439:1	concede 3454:9,13	contemplated 3483:2	3507:19,20,24
circumference 3469:6	3454:24 3461:1	concept 3418:15	content 3491:5 3492:14	3508:16,21,22
3469:14	3508:2	concern 3471:6 3493:6	3493:5,19	3509:10
circumstances 3418:7	command 3499:8,10	3493:22	context 3471:8 3478:18	corrected 3509:16
3433:7 3435:2	commander 3424:1,1	concerned 3403:11	3486:9 3496:13,16,21	correction 3423:7
3440:17 3441:3,7	3431:3 3436:20,22,23	3465:22 3493:19	3497:14 3507:16	3424:9 3429:24
3451:6 3485:9 3497:3	3450:19 3451:2	3494:18 3511:9	3508:11	correctly 3439:4
3510:20	3452:13,16,17	concerted 3491:21	contingency 3420:4	3442:20 3457:5
citizen 3410:2	3498:25 3499:12 R C	concession 3448:9,15	3502:9 3503:2,21	3486:4
citizens 3401:19	commencement	3448:19 3452:22,24	continues 3478:15	correctness 3500:24
city 3451:11	3445:20	concessions 3490:12	contributed 3496:14	couldn't 3409:17
CJOC 3498:15,20,20	comment 3402:12,12	conclude 3417:9	control 3401:1 3406:24	3432:6 3454:23
3498:25 3499:7,14,19	3402:14,21 3403:7,8	concludes 3496:12	3407:23 3457:17	3472:20
3499:25 3500:3,9	3403:17,17,20	conclusion 3483:14	controlled 3427:11	counsel 3403:6 3404:2
3505:11,11	3404:23 3405:2,3,14	condoning 3467:20	convene 3473:14	3408:16 3412:7
clarity 3467:24	3412:10,11,14,15,22	conducive 3470:18	convenient 3488:18	3413:14 3415:20
classes 3401:3,4,5,9	3413:6 3414:1,4	conduct 3408:13	converging 3462:20	3416:3 3417:13
clear 3400:23 3407:9	3440:15 3441:15	3457:24 3493:22	conversant 3498:21	3420:12 3435:12,16
3407:10 3410:1	3442:3 3451:1	conducted 3491:21	conveys 3479:10	3438:24 3445:18
3413:1,16 3439:2,6	3453:20 3454:7	confident 3482:8	cooperating 3508:25	3454:1 3459:19
3441:2 3447:19	3472:10 3491:24	confidently 3481:4	coordinated 3499:20	3462:8 3488:20
3453:15 3455:4	commission 3400:2 3409:24 3413:11	confined 3486:14	coordinator 3460:3	3490:17 3511:11
3458:5 3464:21 3467:20 3469:13		<pre>confining 3508:9 confirm 3455:19</pre>	copies 3477:1	counsellor 3401:3
	3417:10,17 3445:9,9 3445:10 20 3477:1	confirmed 3481:3	copy 3422:12 3492:22	3405:13 3406:4
3479:17 3486:20 3487:25 3489:20	3445:10,20 3477:1 3483:3 3485:6 3489:3	conflict 3507:11	coral 3468:14 cordon 3467:25 3469:1	3407:3 3408:3
3493:22 3503:2	3489:4,4 3490:10	confronted 3408:20	cordoning 3467:19	3411:11,12,22 3430:17 3435:17
	3491:3,20 3495:8	confuse 3414:18	3470:7	3438:17 3440:18
3508.9		confused 3415:25	correct 3400:11,18	3438:17 3440:18 3442:23 3444:16
3508:9 clearly 3408:4 3409:17	3/06.21 3/07.1		COLLECT 3400.11,10	J444.10
clearly 3408:4 3409:17	3496:21 3497:1 3502:18 3505:18		3403.9 3404.3	3450.13 16 3451.25
clearly 3408:4 3409:17 3424:7 3439:5 3441:6	3502:18 3505:18	confusion 3416:7,10,17	3403:9 3404:3 3411:25 3412:16	3450:13,16 3451:25 3453:20 3460:11 22
clearly 3408:4 3409:17 3424:7 3439:5 3441:6 3445:4 3447:22	3502:18 3505:18 3509:5 3510:22,23	confusion 3416:7,10,17 3416:25 3460:9	3411:25 3412:16	3453:20 3460:11,22
clearly 3408:4 3409:17 3424:7 3439:5 3441:6 3445:4 3447:22 3450:17 3454:11	3502:18 3505:18 3509:5 3510:22,23 3511:5,14	confusion 3416:7,10,17 3416:25 3460:9 3496:14 3502:20	3411:25 3412:16 3415:17 3417:15	3453:20 3460:11,22 3460:25 3463:4,17,21
clearly 3408:4 3409:17 3424:7 3439:5 3441:6 3445:4 3447:22	3502:18 3505:18 3509:5 3510:22,23	confusion 3416:7,10,17 3416:25 3460:9	3411:25 3412:16	3453:20 3460:11,22

				Page 3515
3479:16 3481:9	3423:10,20,21,22,24	3485:12 3507:17	depends 3408:4	3481:6,22 3497:17
3482:17 3484:23	3426:24 3429:21	3508:11	deploy 3426:25 3433:6	difficulties 3447:17
3486:24 3487:10	3430:7,10 3431:5	deals 3483:11	3433:19 3435:25	3489:23
3488:2 3489:13	3442:14 3446:3,4,15	dealt 3478:2	3436:5,9,10 3441:9	difficulty 3412:20
3491:8,25 3494:10	3446:16 3450:10	death 3405:6 3407:1	3476:21 3488:9	3502:23
3497:5,17 3501:16	3452:9 3456:10,13,14	debate 3480:21	deployed 3423:3,24	direction 3435:25
3506:18	3457:17,17 3458:2,6	3486:21	3425:13,21,22	3436:11 3441:12,18
counsellors 3464:13	3458:13,13 3459:10	debriefing 3485:14	3426:13 3431:8,24	3444:4,8 3449:15
countenance 3455:19	3459:15 3460:9,10,13	3486:9 3490:20	3432:9,14,22,24	3450:2 3451:17
country 3484:7	3460:14 3463:2,10	3491:9,13	3433:10,11 3434:12	3462:13,20 3491:15
couple 3483:10	3468:24 3470:23	DECEMBER 3400:1	3438:4 3439:10,11,15	3492:3
course 3404:8,9,14	3477:21,21 3478:3	decide 3408:6	3440:25 3443:16	directions 3441:12
3406:11 3414:2	3479:12,14,25	decided 3459:2	3444:19,23 3458:9	directly 3439:24
3416:17 3449:1	3480:12 3481:6	deciding 3508:20 decision 3408:7	3468:11 3484:6	3458:4
3460:3 3463:13 3466:1 3474:14	3484:6,25 3485:12 crowds 3400:17	3436:22 3485:18	deploying 3432:2,5 deployment 3424:19,24	dirt 3448:10 3449:12 3449:13,13,24 3450:6
3477:24 3489:18,21	3403:24 3485:1	declared 3466:13	3426:8,18 3432:1,12	disarm 3430:14
3490:1 3491:2	cryptic 3415:1	deduce 3481:4	3437:2 3440:7,22,23	disarmed 3430:22
3490:1 3491:2 3492:10 3494:3	current 3465:14,21	deducted 3493:14	3445:22 3467:7	disarming 3507:4
3501:2	3476:7 3496:4 3503:6	deduction 3497:21	3468:23,25	discipline 3459:16
courses 3459:10	curriculum 3475:17,22	deep 3411:20,21	depth 3492:8	disclosed 3417:13
covered 3434:1	cut 3453:22	3412:18	deputy 3410:12,13	3473:19 3508:7
create 3446:16		defeat 3450:12	3412:4 3414:22	discretion 3500:10
creating 3426:19	D	defence 3407:15	3415:5,15	3505:10
crime 3402:24 3403:18	damage 3432:20	3408:11	described 3479:14	discuss 3489:14
3403:21 3404:5,16,20	danced 3465:6	defend 3406:18 3457:8	3481:7	3497:24
3404:24 3406:25	danger 3466:20	defended 3454:10	description 3504:3	discussed 3415:13
3407:7 3410:21	dare 3410:22	defer 3445:16	designated 3498:20	discussing 3487:3
3456:11,12	date 3423:14	define 3404:22	3499:7,9,14	3498:4
criminal 3410:3 3466:2	dated 3420:4 3503:21	defined 3504:25 3506:6	designation 3425:3,14	discussion 3483:14
criminals 3402:4	day 3404:19 3423:3	3507:4	3428:12	3487:16
3404:6,7,11 3410:14	3424:7 3430:8	definitely 3404:10,24	detail 3409:21 3476:5	discussions 3485:7,8
3410:19,22	3432:23 3436:21 R C	3406:6 3413:17	3478:5	3486:5 3487:7,18
cross 3417:9 3445:23 3473:6 3474:16	3437:16,20 3450:24 3452:16 3454:24	3416:24 3436:19 3437:13 3450:25	details 3493:1 determined 3450:21	3488:5 3489:8,19 disperse 3430:14
cross-examination	3465:1 3471:25	3451:1 3452:6	developers 3475:22	3431:16 3434:8
3404:2 3417:14,23	3485:1	3454:23 3455:2	development 3474:7	3446:16 3451:16,17
3440:3 3445:15	days 3442:22	3469:16 3485:3	3475:18	3452:1
3448:2,4 3465:23	DB1 3492:20	3488:3 3506:22	dialogue 3427:14	dispersed 3430:20
3473:18,22 3495:7	dead 3453:5,6	3508:4	didn't 3421:17 3429:25	3442:14 3451:6,24
3497:25 3509:12	deal 3402:3,4 3403:18	definition 3407:4,9,17	3430:3 3452:25	3452:10
3510:24,25	3407:20 3409:20	3407:18 3504:17,24	3473:5	dispersing 3507:5
cross-examine 3417:14	3410:21 3414:2	deliberately 3434:21	difference 3502:11	disposal 3467:2,17
3422:25,25 3473:9	3416:13 3418:16,20	delivery 3485:23	different 3403:20	dispute 3470:6 3491:14
3488:22 3495:5	3419:2,10,13 3422:18	demands 3431:3	3408:17,25 3412:13	3492:1 3500:24
cross-examined	3423:24 3424:12	3506:21	3413:3,24 3415:4,10	3507:10,14 3508:5,5
3488:22 3490:12	3431:14 3451:18,19	democratic 3400:9	3415:11 3416:8	disrespecting 3460:11
3509:15	3469:17 3473:24	demonstrates 3447:22	3432:23 3451:10	dissatisfied 3493:25
cross-examiner	3477:22 3478:16,16	demonstrations 3400:8	3452:3 3459:16,17	divisional 3498:19
3452:23 3474:20	3479:2,6,13 3480:11	demonstrator 3410:3	3460:11 3480:22	divisions 3474:23
3475:25	3481:6,19,24 3482:6	denied 3496:3 3506:20	3508:4	3475:3,6,8
cross-examining	3482:10,12,13,14,19	deny 3454:4	differently 3434:20	Dlunga 3493:17
3400:4 3490:16 crowd 3400:8,25	3488:9 3494:15	depend 3406:5 3408:22 3413:12 3436:19,20	3435:7 3469:19 3479:1 3482:12	document 3419:18 3420:15 18 21 23 24
3403:19,21,23 3404:7	3496:5 3497:3,11,25 3498:3 3506:23	3451:12 3450:19,20	differing 3456:5	3420:15,18,21,23,24 3421:6,21 3422:12,20
3404:9,10,12,17,18	dealing 3402:24 3422:8	3470:17 3508:1	difficult 3402:11	3465:23 3466:1
3404:19,22 3406:24	3431:15 3456:12,14	depending 3407:12	3408:10,25 3411:21	3489:22 3492:2
3407:6,11,11,23	3483:3 3484:2 3485:1	3443:2	3450:23 3464:17	3503:4,6 3504:21
5.0.00,11,11,20	010010 010112 010011		5.00.20 0.101117	22001.102001.21
				I

$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					Page 3516
documents 3420:2 342:1 343:2 347:1 347:1 5477:125 342:1 343:1 342:1 343:1 342:1 343:1 342:1 343:1 347:1 347:1 3477:12 340:2 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1 347:1	3510:1.7	easy 3482:6	3483:1	3443:6 3461:6 3476:3	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	-				
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		-			
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
3431:13 3438:12 3438:22 atfs:23 3438:22 atfs:23 atfs:31:33 atfs					
3435:12 3452:23 ether 3439:43 3478:1 3479:14 3452:22 3490:13 3440:24 348:22 350:112 3506:11 sevening 348:19,20 expected 3451:23 3478:1 3479:14 3490:24 348:22 360:112 3506:12 sevening 348:419,20 expected 340:20 expected 340:20 3457:4 3479:21 eliminate 3480:5 3447:11 3483:23 3433:13 3434:5 familiarity 3483:15 3407:24 3400:10 embark 3470:18 events 3483:16 3486:10 3477:16 3433:10 far 34037:340:17 3416:21 347:2 3496:9 syocial 349:20 far 34037:340:17 3445:5471:22 3413:7,18 3415:11,19 employee 3472:22 eventuate 3406:18 experiance 3435:21 3457:10:24 3457:10:24 3422:17 342:59 s472:16,21.22 styoin 6333:22 astyoin 3300:63 349:12 350:15 350:15 3433:13,15 3434:1 employer 349:11 344:46:23 4470:16 3452:3 3477:11,2 340:19 34					
3460:24 348:22 3501:12 3206:15 evacunte 340:19 3455:22 3490:13 3494:12 elicit 3457:12 3466.8 event 3404:8 3419.8 expect 8510:24 failing 3496:9 adom 344:12 1340:16 elicit 3457:12 3466.8 event 3404:8 3419.8 expect 8510:24 failing 3496:9 adom 344:21 340:15 emanating 3496:5 3437:11 3434:5 familiar 3473:25 add7:16 3433:18 failing 346:9 adom 7 340:21 3406:15 emanating 3496:5 stop 348:16 346:10 add7:16 3433:18 failing 3475:310 add7:12 3426:21 347:2 add6:21 347:21 add7:16 3433:12 add3:312.1					
$\begin{array}{lllll} \hline 3494:12 \\ \hline 3497:12 \\ \hline 3457:4 & 347:12 \\ \hline 3457:4 & 347:12 \\ \hline 3457:4 & 347:22 \\ \hline 347:12 & 340:21 \\ \hline 347:12 & 347:12 \\ \hline 347:12 & $				-	
$ \begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$				expects 3510:24	
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$					
$\begin{array}{rrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrrr$	0			-	
					÷
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	don't 3404:21 3406:15	0		-	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3413:7,18 3415:11,19		eventuate 3496:18		
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		1 0			
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$		employer 3471:18		-	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					fashion 3402:22
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3426:2 3429:17	employers 3493:11	3434:9,17,19,25	3455:22,22 3456:3,3	3412:19,19 3479:1
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3433:13,15 3434:1	enable 3441:7 3457:6	3439:9 3440:10	3456:13 3457:11,12	3501:5
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3437:10,24 3438:5,25	encircle 3430:14	3441:8 3444:2	3473:13 3483:15	fault 3509:25 3510:1,4
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3440:2,13 3441:5	3432:3 3437:5,16	3447:10 3449:23	3490:9 3491:21	3510:6
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3446:20 3447:6,18,19		3453:2,7,11,13,17		favoured 3491:20
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	3448:1 3449:6		3454:5 3455:8,15,24		features 3496:6
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1 1		
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		00		-	-
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		0			
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		enjoys 3500:9	3474:15 3476:24		
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $				-	
$\begin{array}{cccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccccc$					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $,		8
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	·				
drill 3493:17,20,25 driven 3454:2,2entrance 3446:2,7,12 3447:1,10 3449:19,223425:24 3434:25 3447:4 3451:16exploring 3435:2 3446:143447:22 3479:21 3504:23 3509:2driving 3454:15 3455:2 due 3413:17 3489:21 duration 3499:20 dustbin 3418:22,24 duties 3414:20 duties 3414:20 duties 3414:20 duty 3400:13 3403:12environment 3446:16 equally 3481:11 3473:73472:4 examination 3417:10 3473:7expressing 3497:1 extend 3511:8s492:11 findings 3489:22duties 3414:20 duty 3400:13 3403:12equipment 3433:16 3476:8 3479:11 3506:16,23example 3408:19 3464:24 3507:9,18 equipped 3484:12,13example 3408:19 extend 3508:11 equipped 3484:12,13example 3408:19 extend 3508:11if ine a460:22 findings 3492:21Eguipped 3484:12,13 equipped 3484:12,13 equipped 3484:12,13example 3408:19 excuses 3410:20if ace 3404:11 face 3404:11if ine a405:23 s406:2,7,14,253417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3442:16 3509:15 early 3445:6 early 3445:6astori 846:18 escorted 3466:18 especially 3414:20astori 9313 s406:12 3470:18face 3402:143419:8 3506:113490:213471:24 3474:3if irst 3400:6 3411:1,3 s412:8,9 3416:21					·
driven 3454:2.23447:1,10 3449:19,223447:4 3451:163446:143504:23 3509:2driving 3454:15 3455:23449:25,25 3450:3,83458:7 3459:13,17expressing 3497:1findings 3489:22due 3413:17 3489:21environment 3446:163472:4extend 3511:83492:11duration 3499:20envisaged 3400:14examination 3417:10extensive 3477:16fine 3460:22duties 3414:20equipment 3433:16example 3408:19extreme 3495:243510:13,15duty 3400:13 3403:123476:8 3479:113418:21 3436:1eyewitness 3457:11firearm 3405:8 3406:2					
driving 3454:15 3455:23449:25,25 3450:3,83458:7 3459:13,17expressing 3497:1findings 3489:22due 3413:17 3489:21environment 3446:163472:4extend 3511:83492:11duration 3499:20envisaged 3400:14examination 3417:10extensive 3477:16fine 3460:22dustbin 3418:22,24equipment 3433:16example 3408:19extreme 3495:243510:13,15duty 3400:13 3403:123476:8 3479:113418:21 3436:1eyewitness 3457:11firearm 3405:8 3406:23506:16,233464:24 3507:9,183406:2,7,14,253506:16,233464:24 3507:9,183406:2,7,14,25atise and state an					
due 3413:17 3489:21 duration 3499:20 dustbin 3418:22,24 duties 3414:20 mut 3400:13 3403:12environment 3446:16 envisaged 3400:14 equally 3481:11 equipment 3433:16 3476:8 3479:113472:4 example 3408:19 3418:21 3436:1 3418:21 3436:1 3464:24 3507:9,18 equipmed 3484:12,13 equipmed 3484:12,13 excuses 3410:20 face 3404:11 face 3404:11 face 3404:11 face 3404:11 face 3404:11 face 3404:14 face 3440:18,21 firing 3434:14 3461:17 fact 3440:18,21 firing 3434:14 3461:17 fact 3440:18,21 firing 3434:14 3461:17 firing					
duration 3499:20 dustbin 3418:22,24 duties 3414:20envisaged 3400:14 equally 3481:11 equipment 3433:16 3476:8 3479:11examination 3417:10 3476:8 3479:11extensive 3477:16 example 3408:19 at18:21 3436:1 3464:24 3507:9,18 equipmed 3484:12,13 equipmed 3484:12,13 equipmed 3484:12,13 equipmed 3484:12,13 equipmed 3484:12,13 earlier 3401:13 3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3445:6 early 3445:6 early 3445:6 early 3445:6 earlier 3409:13envisaged 3400:14 example 3408:19 at18:12,21,25 excution 3414:19 exercise 3425:1 store 3406:12 3470:18 3490:21extensive 3477:16 extrem 3495:24 extrem 3495:24 extrem 3495:24 extrem 3495:24 store 3406:2 3411:14 3479:20,25 firearms 3471:23,24 store 3418:12,21,25 execution 3414:19 exercise 3425:1 fact 3440:18,21 store 3492:24 fact 3440:18,21 store 3492:24fine 3460:22 firearms 3471:23,24 store 3492:24 firing 3434:14 3461:17 store 3406:12 3470:18 store 3490:21					
dustbin 3418:22,24 duties 3414:20 duty 3400:13 3403:12equally 3481:11 equipment 3433:16 3476:8 3479:113473:7 example 3408:19 3418:21 3436:1 3464:24 3507:9,18 examples 3508:11extra 3422:11 3424:12 extreme 3495:24 eyewitness 3457:11finished 3486:2 3510:13,15EEequipped 3484:12,13 equipped 3484:12,13 equivalent 3478:4 erroneous 3509:23 3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3471:16exclude 3508:13 excuses 3410:20 exercise 3425:1 3450:19 3451:3 3450:19 3451:3 3450:19 3451:3face 3404:11 faces 3492:24 facility 3474:4 fact 3440:18,21 3457:15 3465:20finished 3486:2 3510:13,15duty 3400:13 3408:213471:16 exercise 3425:1 3466:12 3470:18 3419:8 3506:11extra 3422:11 3424:12 3490:21face 3404:11 face 3404:12finished 3486:2 sith 3406:2 sith 3406:2 sith 3406:2 sith 3406:2duty 340:13exclude 3508:13 exclude 3509:15 early 3445:6 early 3445:6exclude 3508:13 exclude 3450:19 sith 3490:21finished 3486:2 sith 3406:2 sith 3406:12duty 340:14 sith 3406:15sith 3406:					
duties 3414:20 duty 3400:13 3403:12equipment 3433:16 3476:8 3479:11 3506:16,23example 3408:19 3418:21 3436:1 3462:24 3507:9,18extreme 3495:24 eyewitness 3457:113510:13,15 firearm 3405:8 3406:2 3406:2,7,14,25EEequipped 3484:12,13 equivalent 3478:4example 3508:11 exclude 3508:13extude 3508:11 face 3404:11firearm 3405:8 3406:2 3407:2,12 3408:21E3505:6 earlier 3401:13 3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22exclude 3509:23 scort 3418:12,21,25 3471:16exclude 3508:13 execution 3414:19 exercise 3425:1 3450:19 3451:3 3450:19 3451:3face 3404:11 faces 3492:24firearm 3471:23,24 3481:25add:16 3509:15 early 3445:6 easier 3449:13scorted 3466:18 3419:8 3506:113450:19 3451:3 3490:21fact 3440:18,21 3471:24 3474:3first 3400:6 3411:1,3 3412:8,9 3416:21					
duty 3400:13 3403:123476:8 3479:113418:21 3436:1eyewitness 3457:11firearm 3405:8 3406:2Egquipped 3484:12,13examples 3508:11firearm 3405:8 3406:2E 3505:6equivalent 3478:4exclude 3508:13face 3404:11earlier 3401:13erroneous 3509:23exclude 3508:13face 3404:113418:12,31,25exclude 3508:13face 3404:113417:17 3427:20escort 3418:12,21,25exclude 3508:13face 3492:243428:12 3444:223471:16excruses 3425:1facility 3474:43462:16 3509:15escorted 3466:183450:19 3451:3fact 3440:18,21aearly 3445:6especially 3414:203466:12 3470:183457:15 3465:20easier 3449:133419:8 3506:113490:213471:24 3474:3	-				
$ \begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $			-		
Eequipped 3484:12,13 equivalent 3478:4 earlier 3401:13examples 3508:11 exclude 3508:13 exclude 3508:13 face 3404:11F3407:2,12 3408:21 3411:14 3479:20,258 arlier 3401:13 3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3428:12 3444:22 3462:16 3509:15 early 3445:6 early 3445:6 easier 3449:13excupes 3401:20 excupes 3410:20face 3404:11 faces 3492:243407:2,12 3408:21 3411:14 3479:20,256 arlier 3401:13 3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22 3471:16excupes 3410:20 execution 3414:19 exercise 3425:1 3450:19 3451:3 states 3440:18,21face 3404:11 faces 3492:243481:25 firing 3434:14 3461:17 3462:46 arly 3445:6 easier 3449:13especially 3414:20 3419:8 3506:113450:19 3451:3 3490:21fact 3440:18,21 3471:24 3474:33400:6 3411:1,3 3412:8,9 3416:21	unity 5 100.15 5705.12			~J~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~~	
E 3505:6equivalent 3478:4exclude 3508:13face 3404:113411:14 3479:20,25earlier 3401:13erroneous 3509:23excuses 3410:20faced 3479:24firearms 3471:23,243417:17 3427:20escort 3418:12,21,25excution 3414:19faces 3492:243481:253428:12 3444:223471:16exercise 3425:1facility 3474:4firing 3434:14 3461:173462:16 3509:15escorted 3466:183450:19 3451:3fact 3440:18,213462:4early 3445:6especially 3414:203466:12 3470:183457:15 3465:20first 3400:6 3411:1,3easier 3449:133419:8 3506:113490:213471:24 3474:33412:8,9 3416:21	E			F	
earlier 3401:13eroneous 3509:23excuses 3410:20faced 3479:24firearms 3471:23,243417:17 3427:20escort 3418:12,21,25excuses 3410:20faced 3479:24firearms 3471:23,243428:12 3444:223471:16exercise 3425:1facility 3474:4firing 3434:14 3461:173462:16 3509:15escorted 3466:183450:19 3451:3fact 3440:18,213462:4early 3445:6especially 3414:203466:12 3470:183457:15 3465:20first 3400:6 3411:1,3easier 3449:133419:8 3506:113490:213471:24 3474:33412:8,9 3416:21	E 3505:6			face 3404:11	
3417:17 3427:20 3428:12 3444:22escort 3418:12,21,25 3471:16execution 3414:19 exercise 3425:1faces 3492:24 facility 3474:43481:25 firing 3434:14 3461:173462:16 3509:15 early 3445:6 easier 3449:13escorted 3466:18 3419:8 3506:113450:19 3451:3 3466:12 3470:18fact 3440:18,21 3457:15 3465:203462:4 first 3400:6 3411:1,3 3412:8,9 3416:21					
3428:12 3444:22 3462:16 3509:153471:16exercise 3425:1 3466:18facility 3474:4 fact 3440:18,21firing 3434:14 3461:17 3462:4early 3445:6 easier 3449:13especially 3414:20 3419:8 3506:113450:19 3451:3 3466:12 3470:18fact 3440:18,21 3457:15 3465:20 3471:24 3474:3firing 3434:14 3461:17 3462:4					
3462:16 3509:15 early 3445:6 easier 3449:13escorted 3466:18 especially 3414:203450:19 3451:3 3466:12 3470:18fact 3440:18,21 3457:15 3465:20 3471:24 3474:33462:4 first 3400:6 3411:1,3 3412:8,9 3416:21					
early 3445:6especially 3414:203466:12 3470:183457:15 3465:20first 3400:6 3411:1,3easier 3449:133419:8 3506:113490:213471:24 3474:33412:8,9 3416:21					
easier 3449:13 3419:8 3506:11 3490:21 3471:24 3474:3 3412:8,9 3416:21				-	
	easier 3449:13				
	easily 3463:7				

				Page 3517
3431:25 3441:3	forum 3409:20	3432:2 3434:9	3440:10 3441:5,21	3506:6
3448:3 3459:1	forward 3414:13	3435:12 3439:24	3442:10 3446:25	happy 3456:8 3480:22
3460:23 3482:5	3439:21 3440:10,11	3442:23,23,23	3450:7 3453:7,17	3497:19 3501:2
3484:19,20,23	3443:19,25 3444:15	3446:20,21 3455:22	3456:1 3457:14,22	harm 3457:20
3491:19 3492:25	3448:13 3462:19,22	3455:25 3456:3	3468:4 3469:5,11,15	hasn't 3449:2 3487:8
3493:2,7 3495:19	3486:16 3489:14,15	3459:12 3460:5,23	3469:17 3470:17,17	haven't 3416:10
3500:21 3503:3	3494:23	3469:2 3472:6,7,11	3473:9,10,23 3478:4	3419:24 3442:2
3510:12	found 3445:12,17	3490:11 3492:13	3478:16,16,22,25	3455:1 3465:5
firstly 3474:20 3484:18	3448:8 3477:2	3500:14 3501:13,23	3480:14 3488:8	3472:20,23,25 3487:4
3498:4	four 3468:10,11	3502:19 3503:14	3492:22,24 3493:7	3488:14 3494:20
fit 3469:12	3483:22 3484:1	given 3410:21 3416:14	3494:9,15 3495:5	head 3484:25 3485:11
fitted 3506:7	3492:25 3493:2	3416:19 3430:18	3500:2,12 3501:2	3485:19,19 3486:7
five 3465:10	3495:19	3431:24 3438:2	3502:4,14,19,21,22	3487:1 3489:15
flashing 3461:13	fraternity 3475:18	3439:13,15 3442:6	3509:7,8 3510:11	3491:10 3494:4,17
3462:11	fraudulently 3493:14	3443:1 3449:23	good 3414:14 3447:24	headed 3424:23
flows 3490:8	freedom 3450:20	3453:23 3461:4	3450:25 3483:20	3465:11,13
focus 3418:1 3423:1	3451:3	3463:25 3464:1,20,24	3495:8,10	heading 3420:3
3429:18 3443:5	Friday 3483:21	3465:1,18 3466:2,4	granted 3493:17	3498:14 3504:4
3500:2	friend 3457:2 3477:12	3466:25 3470:1	Greek 3420:10	headline 3492:23
follow 3408:15 3419:11	3481:7 3495:16	3472:15 3474:10,14	green 3443:11	hear 3405:22 3411:1,3
3431:21 3438:21	front 3426:18 3427:1	3475:23 3476:13,20	grievances 3493:1	3441:16,22 3444:16
3444:17 3460:24	3449:2 3469:12	3477:16,17 3479:10	ground 3453:4 3454:15	3445:24 3450:13
3478:17 3486:4	fuller 3465:10	3480:1 3481:3	group 3425:14 3441:17	3454:8 3455:2 3456:8
3487:16,16 3499:25	fully 3474:9 3476:19	3487:13 3488:4	3477:18	3480:22 3486:17
3505:3	function 3404:20	3492:12 3497:9	groups 3430:21,21	3487:12 3491:25
followed 3458:23	functioning 3476:11	3508:11	guidance 3456:23	3498:1 3500:22
3469:23 3475:15,23	functions 3401:14	gives 3431:7 3505:10	3478:5	heard 3412:12 3415:15
3482:8	further 3409:11	giving 3408:19 3424:11	guns 3410:21	3416:10 3423:5
following 3400:25	3414:13,17 3415:9,20	3429:25 3434:19	reef fa	3434:16,17 3438:22
3407:7,7,8 3418:11	3416:17 3422:22	3442:25	time H	3455:1 3494:21
3418:19 3424:19,25	3430:22 3431:5,7	glad 3486:17	hadn't 3416:12	hearing 3454:22
3425:16 3427:19,25	3432:7 3443:18,24	go 3403:8 3404:20	half 3489:1,3	heeded 3492:12
3428:18 3429:17	3446:1 3483:23	3412:18 3414:9	HANABE 3474:24	held 3459:3 3491:9,10
3457:23 3476:1	3484:3,5 3491:24	3418:23 3427:7	3475:5	3508:3
3477:15 3478:25	3492:12 3509:19	3430:22 3432:6	hand 3471:16,17	helicopter 3434:17
follows 3475:15	future 3486:16	3439:4 3442:18,19,20	3477:8 3480:5,6	help 3409:11 3422:2
3476:17 3479:3		3443:2,3 3449:6,9,9	3492:17 3506:24	3434:20,22 3438:19
follow-up 3440:20	G	3449:11,11,15 3452:1	handing 3472:1	3448:5 3457:2 3469:7
foot 3420:9	game 3459:2	3458:6 3464:5,9,12	handle 3411:22 3430:7	helpful 3448:1 3465:22
force 3414:19 3415:23	gap 3441:19,21	3469:25 3473:23	3430:10	helpless 3455:1
3415:24 3453:1	3484:11,13,13 3489:9	3476:5 3478:5 3482:2	handled 3419:16	Hemraj 3420:22
3454:8,9,14,16	gather 3404:4 3418:10	3488:2 3493:16	handling 3429:21	3421:1,4,9 3422:2,6,8
3455:3,4 3463:5,13	3419:12 3487:6,21	3495:23 3504:14	3450:10	3422:19 3447:13
3463:17 3480:13	gathered 3431:6	3506:18,25	hands 3457:25 3459:3	he'll 3416:15 3420:12
3481:15	3498:8	goes 3408:19 3415:8	3461:2	3460:24
foresee 3452:25	gathering 3404:10,12	3416:7 3420:4 3436:8	hang 3462:3,3	he's 3402:23 3403:7,7
foreseen 3452:10	3419:8 3426:23	3446:18 3482:19	happen 3404:8,15	3405:3 3410:2 3413:2
forgot 3448:17	3436:17 3469:20	going 3402:3,3 3403:18	3405:24 3406:17	3421:9 3425:4,5
forgotten 3417:21	3471:10	3404:11,15 3405:1	3433:18 3434:10	3434:19 3442:5
form 3457:17 3476:4	gatherings 3400:8	3406:17 3409:9,10	3451:14	3447:6,7 3450:21
3491:4 3503:6	general 3407:16 3435:8	3411:20 3414:13	happened 3434:15,16	3454:6 3457:2,14
formal 3489:7	3435:18 3471:9,16	3417:19 3418:10,10	3437:7 3439:25	3460:9
formation 3444:23	3500:13,17	3418:11 3425:4	3447:12 3453:13	hid 3458:24,25 3459:1
formed 3477:25	generated 3490:22	3430:18,18,19,20	3454:10 3458:21	hiding 3455:10,11,12
forming 3464:6	getting 3414:10 3463:7	3431:11,17,18	3492:16 3494:7	higher 3456:11
formulate 3492:2	gift 3417:12	3432:20 3434:10	happening 3419:1	hill 3477:20
formulation 3484:10 forth 3475:21	give 3413:15,16 3417:10 3431:5	3435:24 3436:3,16 3437:13 3438:24	3473:4 3494:24 happens 3418:13,21	Hold 3419:22 holding 3428:16,19,22
101 UI 34/3.21	3417.10 3431.3	5+57.15 5450.24	nappens 3410.13,21	notuning 3420.10,19,22
L	I	1	I	I

				Page 3518
3429:4,10,14 3443:19	inappropriate 3454:11	input 3413:15,16	3403:19 3406:13,22	3424:3,17 3425:7,11
3443:25 3444:10,14	incident 3434:15	3497:7,8	3406:23 3407:7,10,10	3425:15 3435:22,23
3444:14,15 3462:19	3437:11 3505:4,17	inputs 3466:2	3407:11,11,18 3408:5	3437:2 3438:22
3462:22	3506:1,6,14 3507:2	insert 3502:16	3408:6 3409:10,14,18	3439:25 3460:18
home 3442:20 3443:3	incidents 3467:12	inside 3451:14,21	3411:8,18,19,21,21	3464:24 3468:17
homes 3469:25	inclined 3414:5	inspired 3401:14	3412:13,18 3413:4,24	3476:25 3485:10
hope 3417:7 3425:1,4	included 3496:7	instance 3483:7 3489:9	3414:14,14 3416:18	
3473:24	including 3474:5	instances 3418:7	3416:22 3420:2,4,8,9	J
hoped 3489:21	inconsistent 3402:9	instruction 3402:13	3420:10 3421:2,16,17	J 3504:20 3505:7,8
hour 3417:10	3403:3,22 3407:22	3412:11 3487:13,15	3422:14,16 3425:18	ja 3425:23 3426:10,10
House 3436:2,3	3408:2	3488:4,13 3493:5	3426:14,18 3427:21	3426:12,17 3427:23
human 3474:7	inconvenience 3489:2	instructions 3493:6	3430:2,24 3433:14,16	3429:10 3430:6
hypothetical 3477:23	incorrect 3424:2	3500:19	3435:12 3436:14,15	3435:21 3442:9
	increase 3493:10	intelligent 3403:11	3436:16 3437:15	3459:24 3460:21
I	3496:12	intend 3422:22 3430:6	3440:15 3444:24,24	3461:9 3467:14
icons 3443:11	indebted 3501:7	3476:21 3498:3	3448:25 3450:18,23	3468:17 3497:13,16
idea 3434:8 3497:1	indicate 3424:4,9	intention 3406:16	3451:1,11,15 3452:18	3498:6 3502:22
identified 3418:14	3478:10 3479:17,18	3431:25	3452:20 3460:10,16	January 3473:15
3462:21 3464:23,25	3481:10 3494:17	interaction 3472:22	3460:22 3461:5	3493:16,24 3496:18
3465:4,4 3466:19	3497:23 3503:1	interested 3456:7	3462:8 3463:12,16,20	3510:23 3511:1,4,6
3475:16 3483:22	3510:13	3459:19	3464:15,17 3471:5	job 3412:20 3451:4
3484:21 3487:24	indicated 3405:4	interface 3474:22	3478:14 3480:25	3469:10 3480:11
3507:24	3412:8 3417:17	3475:2,8 3476:12	3484:17,23 3485:1,18	JOC 3426:24 3500:3
identify 3425:25	3418:2 3424:3	3482:21	3485:22 3488:17	3500:20 3503:18
3464:10,10,11,14	3464:15 3470:19	interfered 3432:11	I'd 3417:17,21 3473:22	3504:4,24 3505:12,13
identity 3507:14	3489:6,12 3491:9,19	interfering 3435:11	3498:3	3505:14 3506:1,9,15
IFP 3436:2	3492:23 3494:20	interject 3502:3	I'll 3416:8 3422:21	Johannesburg 3436:3
illegal 3469:21 3471:11	3502:18 3508:12	international 3400:10	3445:18 3449:13	joint 3498:25 3503:17
3471:12	3509:7	internationally 3484:4	3450:1,9 3457:9	3505:1
illustrate 3445:12	indicates 3407:5	interpose 3476:3	3466:10 3474:15,18	journalists 3450:6
illustrates 3445:4	indicating 3467:25	interpret 3413:4	3475:18 3478:13	jump 3429:2,16
3447:20	indication 3413:1	3475:19	I'm 3404:3,25 3405:15	3433:15 3463:24
imagine 3454:9	3491:12 3493:23 R C	interpreter 3435:16 U S	3406:16 3409:24	3500:17
immediately 3423:18	3503:14	interrupt 3459:19	3412:9,14,16,24	junior 3402:15 3415:24
3440:22,23 3489:16	individual 3408:20,20	3465:8	3413:7,17 3414:1,5	justified 3493:21
3489:19	indulgence 3510:19	intervene 3481:24	3414:12,13,14	K
impartial 3470:25	informal 3443:12	intervention 3459:20	3417:20 3422:23	
impending 3496:17	3446:12 3447:1,1,10	3482:1 3488:5	3423:4,5,6,7,7,8	keep 3449:7
implement 3487:20	3448:10 3449:14,20	3508:20	3424:3,7,8,8 3425:23	keeping 3488:7
implementation	3449:22,24 3450:3	invite 3453:17	3429:12 3432:8	kill 3406:3 3410:14,17
3423:19 3445:21	information 3423:2	invited 3457:12	3434:20,22,25 3435:1	3410:19 3411:6,7
3476:19 3483:5	3431:24 3438:1	involved 3455:24	3435:1,18 3437:19,20	3415:18
implemented 3508:21	3439:13,14 3441:22	3476:18 3484:25	3439:3,13,14 3441:1	killed 3405:9 3410:24
implementing 3488:14	3442:6 3454:23	IPID 3453:23	3441:2 3442:16	3459:4,7
3507:3	3463:25 3464:1,20	irrespective 3508:5	3444:9,17,18 3446:14	killing 3411:15
implicitly 3479:11	3465:14,17,21 3466:2	Isaacs 3466:3,5	3448:3 3453:21	kind 3457:13 3460:17
implies 3492:10	3466:4,24,25 3467:8	isn't 3434:6 3439:1	3454:22 3455:10	3472:8 3479:14
importance 3486:19	3469:25 3470:2,4	3456:4 3465:20	3456:8,16 3459:13,18	3483:2 3485:8
important 3413:11	3472:14,20,23 3473:1	3487:17 3510:13	3460:11 3461:25	3486:21 3488:1
3416:18,22 3457:3	3507:5,8,23 3508:2	issue 3435:1 3441:1 3451:1 3494:23	3462:10 3464:4 3465:2 3468:7 18 19	3491:5 3498:10 know 3405:17 3400:10
3463:19,20 3474:22 3475:2 8 3476:11	3508:12,15,19 3509:1 3509:23	3451:1 3494:23 3500:15 3507:17	3465:2 3468:7,18,19 3468:19,20,22 3469:6	know 3405:17 3409:10
3475:2,8 3476:11	informed 3401:19			3411:14 3412:13,21
2403.31 2404.17	mormed 5401:19	issued 3479:22	3469:7 3470:13	3413:18,22 3414:23 3415:20 3416:3,20
3482:21 3484:17	2156.16 2100.7 11 15	iconoc 2/00.4 2/10.0 17		
3487:9 3489:18,22	3456:16 3488:7,11,15	issues 3408:4 3419:8,12	3471:19 3482:8	
3487:9 3489:18,22 3505:2	informing 3409:24	3485:15,23,25 3487:3	3484:2,24 3485:10,11	3420:11 3426:2
3487:9 3489:18,22 3505:2 impose 3407:1	informing 3409:24 injured 3417:18	3485:15,23,25 3487:3 3489:14 3491:13	3484:2,24 3485:10,11 3486:15,17 3487:1	3420:11 3426:2 3431:12,14 3433:14
3487:9 3489:18,22 3505:2	informing 3409:24	3485:15,23,25 3487:3	3484:2,24 3485:10,11	3420:11 3426:2

				Page 3519
3448:1 3452:15	leave 3409:22,23	listen 3401:18 3445:13	main 3406:10 3430:25	means 3413:4,22,23
3457:9 3458:12	3431:7 3441:11	listening 3511:10	3442:10 3496:6	3468:24 3481:23
3459:8,17 3460:17,21	3446:17 3469:25	little 3406:13 3415:2	major 3490:20	3486:1
3461:20,22 3462:2	leaving 3470:4	3444:22	making 3403:8 3446:23	meant 3472:4
3463:1 3465:8,15,19	led 3441:8 3453:2	live 3484:15	man 3454:14	measure 3445:21
3467:2,23 3468:3	3454:6 3455:8,15	livelihood 3410:23	manage 3400:17	measures 3508:21
3469:12 3472:21	3456:19 3477:11	lives 3410:23	3403:24 3404:19	media 3405:14 3412:14
3473:20 3477:24	left 3441:11,12,13,13	location 3443:6	3408:18 3457:10	3432:4 3433:24
3487:3 3488:23,25	3441:17 3443:21,24	3446:18 3462:17	3484:12,13	3437:3 3496:11
3490:13 3494:24	3444:4,15 3449:7	3504:4	manageable 3430:21	mediate 3472:7
3498:24 3500:20	3450:6 3461:17	logic 3416:18	management 3400:8	meet 3485:13
knowledge 3415:21	3462:6,13	long 3434:17 3485:7,21	3401:1 3403:19,21,23	meeting 3470:7 3487:2
3439:22	legal 3449:5	longer 3415:5 3482:14	3404:10,13,18,19,22	3487:4,12,14 3508:3
knows 3456:13	legislation 3498:21	Lonmin 3417:15	3407:6,11,11 3423:10	3508:6
koppie 3431:6,10	legitimate 3417:5	3465:12 3492:24	3423:20,21,22,24	meetings 3485:20
3432:3 3437:16	3457:17	3493:8,14,18 3495:5	3429:21 3446:3,5,15	3487:11
3439:12,12,16 3440:6	length 3468:12	3495:23 3496:2	3450:11 3452:9	members 3411:17
3440:22 3441:11	lengthy 3478:1	3504:10 3505:18,19	3456:10,13,15	3414:19 3415:23,24
3455:10 3458:17,17	lesson 3494:16	Lonmin's 3493:21	3457:18 3458:2,6,13	3417:16 3423:3,5,8
3458:22,24,24,25,25	lessons 3483:17	look 3402:21 3419:17	3458:13 3459:10,15	3423:23 3424:3,4,11
3459:1 3462:20,25	3491:23 3492:16	3420:25 3421:5	3460:9,10,13,14	3424:13 3425:13,17
3467:12,13,19,19,20	3496:16	3422:3,3,5,15	3463:2,11 3468:24	3425:18 3426:13
3467:22 3468:1,14,22	lethal 3480:13,13	3424:10,15,16,24	3470:24 3479:13	3427:3,21,23 3428:5
3469:1,6,14,14,20,21	3494:25	3425:2,10,13 3426:2	3484:6,25 3485:12	3428:12,16,22 3429:3
3470:7,7,22 3472:25	letter 3504:20	3426:8 3427:16,16	3507:22 3508:10,14	3429:20 3430:7,9,22
3507:18	letters 3420:8,10	3430:13 3433:17	3508:25	3430:24 3431:1,4,4
kraal 3441:20,21	3489:7	3436:23 3443:6,10,14	manner 3450:11	3431:11,14 3442:14
3446:11 3449:8	let's 3405:18 3418:1	3443:18 3445:3,7	3464:17 3477:23	3458:10 3459:14
K4 3441:13	3419:1,17 3423:1	3446:17 3447:12,21	march 3404:13	3461:4 3462:19,22
K9 3444:8,10,11,13	3424:15 3427:16	3451:19,22 3452:6,13	3418:10 3419:2,8	3470:23 3476:14
	3433:17 3438:8,15	3457:2 3461:6	3432:20 3436:15,15	3478:3 3479:11,22
L	3441:24 3445:25	3462:18 3465:5,9	3436:16,16	3488:9 3495:8
L 3424:16,22 3443:7	3448:21 3451:5,22	3468:9 3477:7	marches 3451:11,19	3502:17 3509:4
3461:6 3491:4,4,12	3461:6 3463:24	3478:19 3481:13,23	marching 3436:2	memory 3478:7
lacks 3502:10	3468:15 3469:19	3482:3 3485:15,16,24	3451:14	men 3410:23
laid 3470:16	3471:7	3488:13 3494:13	Marikana 3441:13	mere 3406:25
land 3401:19	let's 3495:14 3501:22	3499:22 3503:11	3465:12 3467:11	merely 3401:13
landed 3416:24	3503:9	looking 3426:7 3468:13	3470:25 3477:25	3406:24 3409:24
lastly 3492:13	level 3456:10 3485:2,17	3468:22 3469:3,8,11	3483:16,18 3486:20	3494:1
late 3434:18 3467:14	3487:8,9 3491:10	3470:13 3484:24	3488:1,6,11 3493:8	message 3416:19
3489:19	levels 3487:1	3489:14 3494:19	3493:23 3498:10	3445:22 mathed 3482:6
layout 3507:18 LCRC 3429:17	Lewis 3473:9,11	3503:23	3505:18 3507:3	method 3482:6 middle 3443:11
lead 3440:10 3453:8,12	liberty 3486:18	looks 3407:14 3419:23	material 3434:1 3476:5 matter 3407:10	
	life 3408:6 3466:20	3461:17,18 3462:7 3465:13 3478:20		Middlekraal 3504:5,10
3510:11 leader 3472:6	3482:3 light 3409:2 3457:15	3465:13 3478:20 3505:9	3413:12 3456:2 matters 3503:2 10	millimetre 3479:20 3480:4
	11ght 3409:2 3457:15 3496:17		matters 3503:2,10 Mbombo 3500:14	mind 3415:9 3430:4
leading 3404:3 3450:2 3510:15	likelihood 3510:15,18	loses 3452:24 lot 3408:17,25 3458:21	Mbombo's 3500:17	3439:5 3452:17
leads 3448:10 3449:14	limitations 3481:4	3472:22	McIntosh 3427:11	3502:24
3449:24	3483:6,8	lucid 3457:10	mean 3403:13 3404:7	mine 3461:20 3465:12
learn 3405:22 3491:23	limited 3482:4	lunch 3447:21 3489:6	3404:17 3413:22	3493:8,9 3504:10
learned 3457:2 3460:2	line 3407:16 3408:9,9	3511:4	3426:2 3431:13	3505:19
3477:11 3481:7	3412:16 3413:5	lying 3453:4 3454:14	3433:3,25 3438:25	Mineral 3410:12
3494:16 3495:16	3416:1 3417:19	3454:25 3458:21	3466:14 3470:10	3415:6
3496:16	3445:23 3461:3	0.0.1.200.000.21	3481:15 3505:1	Minerals 3412:12
learners 3400:20	3478:11,14,15,23	Μ	meaning 3406:1 3407:9	miners 3493:7,11
learning 3483:23	lines 3479:4	magnitude 3430:10	3413:1,3,4,18,21,24	minimum 3453:1
3492:15	lion 3433:15 3434:7	MAHLANGU 3435:10	3416:19,19,21,23	3454:8,14,15 3455:3
			•	

				Page 3520
3455:4 3463:4,12,16	3453:19 3454:17,21	3443:18,21,24 3444:2	move 3403:20 3409:8	3450:15,15,17,18
3466:7 3480:12	3458:3,19 3459:5,13	3444:7,13,18 3445:12	3409:12 3414:16	never 3402:20 3403:15
minister 3402:1,2	3459:22,24 3460:7,15	3445:16,25 3446:10	3416:15 3421:23,25	3405:2 3415:9,15
3403:2,12,14,17	3460:20,25 3461:9,11	3446:22 3447:4,14,15	3422:18,21 3432:7,10	3419:4 3437:21
3404:23 3405:6,16,23	3461:24 3462:23	3448:6,18,23 3449:4	3434:3 3438:2	3438:22 3440:19
3410:12,12,13 3412:4	3463:3,12,16,20	3449:18 3450:1,9	3439:11,16 3440:6,11	3464:13 3472:12
3412:5,9,12,22,23	3464:4,21 3466:15	3451:5,22 3452:8,15	3441:24 3442:24	3502:23 3506:19
3413:7,18,23,24,25	3467:8,14,23 3468:3	3452:20,25 3453:9,14	3443:2,3 3447:15	nevertheless 3455:14
3414:21,23,24 3415:3	3468:7,17 3469:3,22	3453:16 3454:6,19	3451:5	new 3419:17,21,23,25
3415:5,6,9,15	3470:2,10,13 3471:1	3455:8,21 3456:5,9	moved 3440:9,21	3421:16 3422:10,13
minister's 3403:17	3471:5,14 3472:9,18	3456:22 3457:20,21	3458:12,16,17	3465:10 3501:14,15
3405:3 3408:15	3474:2,6,12 3475:10	3461:6,10,12,14,15	movement 3432:15	3501:16 3502:5,6,8
3409:16 3414:4	3475:13,24 3476:16	3461:20 3462:2,10,16	3433:8 3439:21	3502:20 3503:5,11,24
minutes 3445:8	3476:22 3477:4,9,14	3462:24 3463:10,14	moving 3422:23 3431:9	3510:19
misleading 3496:13	3478:21 3479:16	3463:18,24 3464:18	3431:10	newspaper 3495:19
misread 3468:15	3480:23 3481:9	3465:7 3466:10,24	Mpembe 3471:9,16	newspapers 3401:17,18
misrepresenting	3482:16,23 3483:9,19	3467:6,11,16 3468:2	• ·	3401:22
3500:15	3483:25 3484:8,16,22	3468:6,9,21 3469:19	N	Ngalwana 3481:8
missing 3421:5,16	3485:10 3486:8,11,15	3469:24 3470:6,11,23	name 3480:1,8,12	Ngolwana 3477:12
3422:14 3502:15,15	3486:24 3487:10	3471:2,15,19 3472:3	3508:1	3478:24 3479:4
mission 3418:1,1,2,3,9	3488:2 3489:12,25	3472:14 3473:2,6,8	national 3459:20	night 3469:24 3470:4
3418:11,17,18,23,24	3490:6,18,25 3491:7	3509:14,21,24 3510:2	3474:4 3487:8,23	nine 3479:20 3480:4
3418:24 3419:5,7,15	3491:25 3494:10	3510:5,8	nationally 3484:4	NIU 3428:15,19
3420:20 3422:20	3495:10,12,17,21,25	modules 3475:20	nature 3403:11 3408:4	3443:15,22
3430:14,15 3465:15	3496:10,19,24 3497:5	moment 3408:23		Nkaneng 3441:12,18
misunderstood 3435:4	3497:13,16 3498:1,7	3421:12 3424:20	3489:23 3507:9	3446:2,7 3450:7
MKHWANAZI	3498:12,16,23 3499:1	3433:11 3434:21	3508:7	non-lethal 3484:5,14
3400:11,15,18,22	3499:5,11,16,21	3445:18 3447:16	near 3422:16	noon 3466:4
3401:2,11,16,21,24	3500:1,5,8,11,21	3448:1 3465:9 3478:6	necessarily 3486:13	normal 3435:2 3451:6
3402:6,11,20 3403:5	3501:1,8,15,18,21,24	3482:20 3492:19	necessary 3473:15,16	3451:10,18,23
3403:15 3404:1	3503:12,15,19,25	3502:3 3503:19,24	3480:25	3452:18
3405:10,13,24 3406:4	3504:7,12,15,19,22	money 3493:14	necessity 3407:14	normally 3432:21
3406:10 3407:3	3504:25 3505:5,8,15	monitor 3418:12 J U S	need 3414:6 3418:14	3435:21 3436:2
3408:3,16 3411:1,4	3505:20 3506:4,10,18	3426:23	3418:16,20 3427:9,10	3451:10 3481:13
3411:10 3412:7	3507:7,12,15,20,25	monitoring 3425:14	3436:24 3440:20	3487:11 3506:21
3413:14 3415:17	3508:16,22 3509:3	3426:15,17	3458:4,7 3466:18	north 3462:20 3493:8
3416:6,16 3418:5,8	Mmusi 3417:18,20,22	morning 3414:9	3469:9,16 3474:19	Northern 3485:2
3419:6,19,24 3420:6	3417:25 3418:6	3483:21 3492:23	3475:16,16 3476:5	3486:6
3420:17 3423:4,12,14	3419:4,17,21 3420:14	3511:1	3480:15 3481:23	note 3504:9
3423:17,21 3424:2,17	3420:18,22,24 3421:2	Motau 3417:16 3495:4	3482:5,18 3484:21	notice 3402:1,5
3424:21 3425:11,15	3421:13,22 3422:3,5	3495:7,11,14,18,22	3485:4,16,25 3486:19	3405:12 3415:23
3425:19,23 3426:4,10	3422:7,21 3423:1,9	3496:1,11,20,25	3487:13,16,17,19	3419:15
3426:12,17,22 3427:5	3423:13,16,18,22	3497:8,14,23 3498:2	3488:5,13,14,16	notion 3404:16
3427:13,18,23 3428:2	3424:15,18,22 3425:2	3498:8,13,17,24	3494:12,18 3502:4	November 3448:24
3428:4,7,10,14,17,20	3425:7,10,12,16,20	3499:2,6,13,17,22	3506:17	Nqakula 3405:7
3428:23 3429:1,5,7,9	3426:1,6,16,21	3500:2,6,9,12,23	needed 3469:2	Nqakula's 3410:13
3429:12,15,23	3427:2,7,15,19,25	3501:4,10,17,19,22	needs 3476:13 3482:22	nuances 3480:21
3430:11,13 3431:23	3428:3,5,8,11,15,18	3501:25 3502:13,17	negotiation 3472:11	number 3423:23
3432:17 3433:4,9	3428:21,24 3429:2,6	3502:25 3503:9,13,16	negotiations 3470:20	3444:14 3461:22
3435:9,17,21 3436:14	3429:8,11,14,16	3503:23 3504:2,8,13	3481:17	3492:19 3495:20
3437:10,24 3438:10	3430:5,12 3431:20	3504:16,20,23 3505:7	negotiator 3472:5	numbered 3420:8
3438:13,17 3440:2	3432:12 3433:2,5,17	3505:9,16,22 3506:5	neutral 3425:22 3426:4	Nyala 3426:25 3441:18
3441:16,22 3442:8,16	3434:24 3435:6,20	3506:13,25 3507:8,13	3426:19 3427:4,15,16	3441:20 3454:15
3442:21 3443:8,13,17	3436:12 3437:7,19	3507:16,21 3508:8,17	3427:22,24 3428:6,12	Nyalas 3426:9 3454:2
3443:20,23 3444:1,6	3438:1 3439:1,8	3508:23 3509:4	3429:20 3433:23	3455:1 3468:11
3444:9,16,21 3445:24	3440:4,5,12,18	mountain 3471:17	3434:4 3443:6,7	3469:10,16,16
3450:13 3451:9,25	3441:8,17,24 3442:13	3493:9,16 3494:1	3446:1,4,13,13,18,24	
3452:12,18,21	3442:18 3443:5,10,14	mounted 3444:3	3449:19 3450:2,7,11	0

				Page 3521
oath 3400:3 3445:11	3450:12,22 3452:8	outcome 3487:12	3418:13 3426:19	percolated 3487:8
object 3473:5	3465:9,11 3483:1	outlined 3499:24	3431:13 3472:24	peremptory 3500:7
objection 3400:20	3487:25 3498:9,10,22	outside 3411:25	participated 3511:10	perform 3400:13
3401:9 3445:14	3499:4,8,10,20	3412:18	particular 3430:8	3425:1 3476:14
3448:21 3449:21	operational 3418:8,10	overall 3424:1 3436:22	3431:6 3432:21	permission 3410:19
3450:4 3456:20,23,24	3418:15 3419:5,15	3496:8 3499:7,10,12	3437:20 3439:13	person 3402:15,18,23
3457:10	3421:24,25 3423:25	overnight 3483:17	3444:4 3448:10,11	3403:7 3405:3 3406:6
objective 3447:9	3424:23 3431:2	overruns 3482:11	3456:16 3462:25	3406:14,14,15 3407:1
obliged 3402:17	3436:20,22 3450:19	overview 3476:2,6	3466:12 3467:9	3407:12,14 3408:5,5
observation 3490:2	3451:2 3452:13,16,16	o'clock 3444:24	3481:19,25 3482:25	3408:7,21,22 3412:15
observe 3403:4	3463:22 3464:5,22	3488:17	3483:7 3490:7,14,16	3413:2 3414:2
obstruction 3506:17	3474:8 3475:17,21	o'clock 3511:2	3509:1	3415:11 3438:23
obtained 3448:16	3476:13 3482:22		particularly 3415:23	3450:22 3452:1,2,3
3471:24	3485:11 3486:7	P	3478:23 3484:2	3463:8 3464:8,9
obvious 3460:5,5,6	3492:13 3498:25	Pacific 3511:6	3497:3	3466:19 3479:24
3463:8 3508:18	3502:9 3503:18	pack 3434:7	parties 3470:21	3480:9 3499:3 3510:1
obviously 3404:19	3505:1 3507:4	package 3496:8	3473:18 3488:24	3510:7
	operations 3474:23	page 3420:9,10,12,14	3507:14,22 3509:8	personnel 3425:3
3442:3 3452:1,6	3475:3,6,9 3476:8,14	3420:19 3421:1,5,6,7	3510:24 3511:11	3429:9
3457:2,4 3472:7	3476:19 3494:4	3421:9,11,16,18	party 3448:3 3506:13	persons 3509:7
3481:23 3488:7	3499:18	3422:3,5,14,19	pass 3432:21 3436:3	person's 3403:7 3408:6
3508:3	operator 3493:18	3425:14 3428:8	passage 3407:5	3416:9
	operators 3493:20,25	3443:11,15 3448:8,25	3414:22,23 3448:8,14	persuaded 3416:1
	opinion 3412:17 3430:1	3449:2 3465:14	3449:3,17 3465:16	Petrus 3473:25
offending 3457:7	3439:24 3453:17	3466:4 3474:17	3478:11,14,16	phase 3483:1
offered 3401:9	3455:5,17,20 3457:12	3477:2,7,8 3478:11	path 3449:12	photo 3462:19
office 3474:8 3485:19	3463:6 3464:16	3478:14,15,23 3479:4	pathetic 3410:20	photograph 3447:19
3485:20 3487:1,9,23	opinions 3466:8	3498:14 3502:1,11,15	pause 3475:18,23	3449:7
	opportunity 3431:7	3502:16,19 3503:14	pay 3493:10,15	phrase 3440:16
	opposed 3496:25	3504:8,16,21,21,22	payment 3493:12	physical 3504:4
officer 3437:21 3448:9	option 3431:17 3480:14	pages 3420:11 3421:3	peace 3497:10	physically 3503:24
3448:16,18,24,25	3485:25	3421:20 3465:10	peacefully 3404:13	picture 3462:4,5,18,25
3449:6,8,15 3486:5	options 3484:5 3494:25	H13477:3FOR JUS	3488:11	3468:14,15 3469:13
officers 3401:20 3405:9	ordeal 3497:10	paid 3493:15	pedigree 3485:6	3477:25 3482:22
3437:22 3443:15	order 3400:7,14 3402:8	pangas 3471:21 3472:2	penultimate 3492:14	piece 3434:25 3472:6
3476:18 3483:3	3402:10 3403:18,22	3477:20 3479:7	people 3401:7,18	Pillay 3492:18,20
3485:9 3486:22	3404:17 3407:16	Pappa 3427:11,21	3403:10,11 3404:4,6	3501:7 3503:1,7
official 3406:7,11,12,18	3408:10,14,24 3416:2	paragraph 3400:6	3411:14,15,15,17,18	pistol 3477:21 3479:7
3407:6 3411:13	3423:8 3424:5 3430:1	3404:22 3408:17,17	3412:1,19 3418:9,21	place 3404:13 3418:13
3436:6 3461:1	3458:10 3473:18	3409:3,15 3479:18	3418:22,25 3419:14	3425:24 3434:11
oh 3429:10	3479:19 3481:18,21	3493:7 3495:23	3425:4 3430:18,20	3436:8,18 3451:2,21
okay 3425:11 3426:5	3482:4 3485:12	3498:14,18 3499:18	3431:9,15,21 3432:3	3452:4,6 3454:24
3428:4 3435:21	3489:1 3490:4 3498:5	3500:17 3504:9,17	3432:4,6,7,10,19,25	3455:13 3458:12,22
3439:7 3453:15	3498:11,18,21	3505:6,7	3433:15 3434:12	3467:10,12,15
3458:16 3497:16	3505:10,12,23,25	paragraphs 3426:8	3435:24 3436:18	3468:20 3470:8
3501:18,24 3504:22	3506:3,6 3509:2	3492:25 3493:3	3437:3,5,11,12,14,17	3481:17,18 3485:8,21
	orders 3400:7,25	3495:19,24	3440:9 3442:18	3494:19
old 3420:1 3421:6	3401:10,13 3403:3,13	part 3403:23 3411:22	3443:1 3451:14	placed 3430:23
3422:3,11,19 3501:14	3406:23 3409:3	3414:3 3426:3	3452:1 3454:3,25	3490:10
	ordinarily 3479:12,12	3462:13,17 3463:12	3455:24 3458:11,22	places 3441:14 3442:18
	ordinary 3440:24	3463:16 3464:6,25	3458:23 3459:21,21	3442:19 3443:3
once 3431:25 3493:12	3441:2 3462:7	3472:11,17 3477:25	3459:21 3461:2	3446:17
	organised 3419:14	3481:21 3488:12	3463:5,6 3470:3	plain 3406:1
	orientate 3443:9	3491:3 3496:4 3497:2	3475:21 3477:19	plan 3418:2,8,11
	original 3421:17,19,23	3497:24 3500:13	3479:6 3482:3	3419:5,15 3420:4,15
opening 3445:19	3422:12,15 3502:16	3503:3 3507:8 3508:6	3485:19 3489:2	3420:20 3421:3,24,25
	ought 3455:18 3491:17	3508:25	3490:3	3422:9,13 3423:1
3419:6,14 3423:9,19	3491:17	participants 3418:12	perceived 3484:11	3425:21 3427:3

				Page 352
3429:18 3430:2	police 3401:15,20	3496:15	presented 3401:4,4,5	profitable 3409:8
3463:22 3464:6,23	3402:18 3405:9,9	poses 3478:24	3475:20 3476:2,6	promise 3493:10,12
3465:5 3494:18	3406:7,11,12,15,17	position 3402:23,24	press 3492:17	3496:3
3502:9 3503:2,21	3406:23 3407:6,22	3405:2 3406:13	presumably 3410:7	promised 3444:25
3507:4 3508:19	3408:13 3410:1,18,22	3407:15 3408:11	3465:20	proper 3463:23
planned 3419:14	3411:12,13,23,24,24	3409:1 3412:10,15,24	prevent 3457:4	3476:12 3497:21
3434:16 3448:2	3411:25 3412:1,9,12	3413:17 3424:10	prevented 3446:25	properly 3419:3,12
3497:24 3499:19	3414:19,21 3415:23	3430:10 3436:19	prevention 3403:21	3455:18 3465:3
planner 3463:21	3415:24 3417:5	3437:15,15 3446:4	3404:16,20,24 3407:8	3508:20
planners 3463:21	3420:3 3431:21	3449:9 3450:18,20,23	3456:11,12	property 3432:20
planning 3448:4	3432:14 3433:6,19,23	3450:24,25 3451:16	previous 3436:4	proportionality
3476:18 3483:1	3435:7 3436:6 3437:4	3454:22 3458:9,11,15	3464:13	3431:12
3488:25	3437:8,20,22 3441:9	3463:5 3464:8 3465:3	primary 3404:18	proportionate 3424:6,6
plans 3483:4,4,5	3444:3,20 3445:19,23	3466:18,23 3469:4,9	principle 3400:20	3454:8 3481:11
planted 3477:19	3446:1,14 3450:10	3470:14 3472:25	principles 3400:9,14	proposal 3484:10
platform 3403:6	3451:6 3452:9 3453:3	3480:3,9,16 3481:14	3401:10 3446:5,15	propose 3477:5
Platinum 3465:11	3454:4 3455:11,14	3481:14 3482:4,19	3459:9	3480:20
plausible 3470:8	3456:12,14 3457:24	3483:15 3486:7	prior 3412:25 3423:18	proposition 3494:5
play 3481:21 3508:4	3458:2,22 3459:8	3497:20,20,21,22	3432:22 3433:10	prospect 3494:5
players 3508:4,9,14	3460:2 3461:1	positioned 3446:7	3470:8	protect 3412:1 3432:4
3509:2	3462:19 3464:2,18	3504:5	private 3407:14	3432:19 3433:23
please 3405:17,20	3467:2,17,22 3469:1	positive 3486:13,14	3408:10	3434:4 3435:25
3408:1 3413:10	3469:20 3470:18,21	possession 3471:3,23	privy 3439:14 3448:4	3436:8,9 3437:3,17
3417:24 3424:20	3471:2,25 3472:15	3479:25 3480:8	probable 3439:20	protecting 3435:23
3425:25 3430:4	3474:23 3475:3	possibilities 3483:24	probably 3415:2	protest 3436:12,15,15
3435:15 3443:8,9	3476:12,14 3485:9	possibility 3478:2	probe 3468:23	3436:16,16
3448:25 3449:6	3486:22 3489:9	3508:13	problem 3406:6,13	protesters 3432:16
3460:5 3471:18	3490:10,20 3491:21	possible 3402:25	3411:13,16 3412:21	3433:8 3434:7 3438:3
3502:3 3503:14	3491:22 3492:15	3419:10 3430:8,9,11	3414:1 3422:15	3439:11 3445:23
pleased 3473:23	3494:7 3505:24	3443:4 3447:15	3437:1 3440:19	3451:6,7,23 3452:10
point 3402:22 3406:14	3506:8,15,17 3507:2	3452:7 3465:13	3458:3 3469:6 3471:2	3453:3 3455:9,12,14
3408:21 3409:4,4,5	3508:15,18	3469:11 3495:1	3471:7,11 3473:19,20	3457:25 3472:16
3409:11,14,15 3410:8	policeman 3406:2,3,3	H 13496:17 OR JUS	5100.215102.0	protestors 3439:16
3411:23 3412:9	3407:1 3408:1	possibly 3409:9	3487:24 3503:8	3440:6,21,23,25
3414:6,14,15,15,16	policemen 3410:18	3415:24 3477:21	problems 3439:3	3441:3,9 3444:20
3415:13 3416:15	3446:6 3459:20,25	Potchefstroom 3487:5	3510:12	3464:2,19 3469:24
3421:4 3422:18,18,21	policies 3410:1	potential 3493:23	procedure 3431:21	3471:3,7,10,10,15
3422:22 3426:5	policing 3423:8 3424:5	potentially 3484:6	procedures 3469:23	protracted 3493:13
3430:5 3434:3,22	3430:1 3458:10	3491:18	3499:24	prove 3453:13
3435:1 3442:2	3479:19 3481:19,21	preceded 3445:21	proceed 3417:24	provide 3426:24
3444:22 3445:4,6,13	3485:13 3490:4	precisely 3491:5	3441:4 3445:14,18	3507:22 3508:15
3446:23 3447:2,17,23	Policing's 3404:17	3510:8	3447:25 3450:9	provides 3498:18
3447:24 3448:3	political 3402:18	premise 3457:13	3456:21 3457:23	province 3486:7,10,14
3449:18 3450:5	POP 3420:3 3423:3,23	preparation 3483:4	3465:22 3466:10	3489:13
3454:19,20 3455:6 3457:3 5 7 3466:21	3425:12,17,17,18,20	prepared 3479:2 3486:15 3511:3	3468:21 3480:23	provincial 3484:25
3457:3,5,7 3466:21 3470:4 3479:17	3427:3,6,20 3428:12 3428:22 3429:3,10,19	3486:15 3511:3 preplanning 3499:18	3502:21 3510:21,25 3511:13	3485:11,17 3487:1,9 3491:10
		3499:23		
3481:1,1 3482:11,14 3482:14 3485:21	3430:6 3442:14 3459:21 3462:22	3499:23 prescribe 3505:13	proceeding 3435:1 proceedings 3400:1	provision 3500:7 provisional 3498:19
3482:14 3485:21 3489:11 3490:7	3459:21 3462:22 3470:23 3474:5	prescribes 3500:13	3405:20 3448:8	provisional 3498:19 provisions 3402:8,10
3497:6	3470:25 3474:5 3481:5 3482:9,14	3505:11	3474:11 3483:14	3505:23
pointed 3407:12	3483:8 3484:12	presence 3400:22	3496:23 3510:21	public 3404:17 3423:8
pointing 3406:25	3487:25 3489:10	3401:6 3432:25	3511:10	3424:5 3430:1
3407:2		3437:25	proceeds 3419:2	3458:10 3479:18
points 3405:8 3406:2,2	POPS 3477:16,17,22 3478:3 3479:1,2,10	present 3401:6 3414:7	3420:18 3496:6	3481:18,21 3482:3
3406:6 3408:21	3478.3 3479.1,2,10	3438:24 3473:12	process 3419:1 3473:12	3485:12 3490:4
3400.0 3408.21	portion 3476:24 3478:7	3480:22	3475:15,21 3509:1	published 3405:16
3466:7 3490:12	portion 3470.24 3478.7 posed 3477:15,23	presentation 3491:3	processes 3419:11	pupils 3400:17,19
JT00.7 JT70.12	poscu 37/1.13,23	Presentation 3471.3	PI UCOBCO 3+17.11	Pupus 5700.17,19
		L	l	1

				Page 3523
purpose 3400:7	3460:18 3461:3,23	reading 3407:5	refresh 3478:7	3496:12
3406:11 3417:3	3462:8 3465:3 3467:5	3414:23	refuse 3506:15	representative 3427:14
3418:1 3432:2,18,24	3471:25 3474:21,24	ready 3510:25	refused 3411:7	representatives 3449:5
3433:10,12,17,22,25	3475:7 3476:1	real 3454:11 3492:14	regard 3403:20	3488:21 3500:16
3434:4 3435:7,18,22	3477:16 3478:24,25	3493:3,6,6	3413:10 3415:21	reproduced 3493:24
3435:23 3436:9,10,13	3479:5,17 3480:17	realised 3441:18	3455:23 3458:2	reproduction 3494:5
3436:19 3437:6,16	3481:10 3489:7,9,17	really 3406:16 3407:10	3492:16 3500:10	request 3472:17
3441:24 3445:6	3494:2 3497:15	3409:18 3412:15,19	3501:10 3505:22	requested 3483:16
3446:3 3447:7 3449:5	questions 3411:7	3416:1,9 3423:7	3508:23	3494:14
3450:12,18 3451:3	3414:10 3417:5,8,15	3452:21 3454:22	regarding 3489:9	require 3490:2 3507:5
purposes 3474:16	3417:23 3427:9	3455:3 3456:2,3,23	3491:13	3507:9,13,17 3508:15
3488:25 3499:23	3430:16 3442:10	3466:16,17 3471:7	register 3417:13	3508:19
3501:11,23 3502:18	3455:17,18 3456:15	3480:25 3482:17	regulate 3400:7	required 3508:13
3505:2,17 3507:3	3457:24 3473:12	3483:11 3485:23	3408:18	requires 3403:24
3508:19	3474:14 3476:10	3492:15 3506:20	regulations 3410:16	requiring 3492:7
put 3405:19 3416:8	3477:23 3478:17	reason 3406:7 3457:11	3414:21 3415:10,19	Rescue 3504:5,10
-			reinforce 3431:1	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
3417:2 3434:20	3483:11 3495:20 3496:15 3505:2	3500:24 3501:1 3508:17	related 3503:6 3507:1	research 3475:18,19
3437:13 3440:5,13	3496:15 3505:2	3508:17 recall 3405:25 3418:4		3484:4,11 reserve 3430:23
3441:6 3442:1,10 3448:11,20 3449:17	3509:5,8,20 quick 3419:10 3452:7	3437:10,25 3471:22	relation 3400:25 3406:23	reserve 3430:23 3444:10 3473:14
,	3495:1 3500:16	3437:10,25 3471:22 3473:14 3477:10,12	s406:25 relevant 3409:25	
3453:11 3454:1,5,6		/		reserved 3488:24
3455:18,25 3456:3,18	quickly 3426:7 3427:8	3483:13 3496:20	3465:18,20 3466:2	3509:8 3510:24
3457:16 3458:23	3441:20 3478:12	received 3412:24	3477:2 3484:2	reserves 3428:24
3463:22 3466:6,7,8	quite 3439:2 3441:6	3419:24 3472:25	3498:21 3509:2	3429:11
3466:21 3471:8	3447:11 3462:1	3488:15 3491:4	relieve 3431:1	reside 3441:14
3474:20 3475:25	3471:20 3473:25	recognise 3420:9	reluctant 3405:18	residence 3442:19
3478:17,25 3480:17	3479:9 3480:20	recommendations	rely 3486:1	3446:17 3451:15,20
3482:12 3485:21	3508:18	3496:22	remainder 3492:25	3452:7
3492:9 3493:4 3494:2	quote 3502:14	reconcile 3403:14	remains 3511:7	residential 3451:7,12
3495:20 3500:13	quoted 3409:16	record 3448:7 3477:2,6	remark 3417:9	3451:13,24 3452:11
3502:5 3509:15,18	quotes 3417:2	3493:4 3496:2	remedial 3483:24	resort 3484:15
putting 3415:4 3419:14	quoting 3421:7,9	3501:23 3502:19	remember 3402:6	resource 3474:7
3439:5 3442:16	R	5507.10 5510.10	3404:1 3405:25	Resources 3410:12
3456:16 3500:24		recorded 3405:8	3411:9,10,20 3459:16	3415:6
3501:5,6	radio 3401:19	recorders 3435:11,14	3470:19 3472:6,10	respect 3434:20 3441:6
	raise 3400:20 3490:8	records 3435:12	3477:14 3479:16	3456:22 3481:5
Q	3496:8	recourse 3484:14	3483:19 3489:10,18	3483:1,23 3487:24
qualification 3409:18	raised 3475:17	refer 3420:12 3447:14	3490:5,6 3497:9	3489:23 3490:21,22
qualifications 3415:2	raising 3455:13	3503:4,5	3505:10	3493:21 3497:2
3490:15,16	3457:25 3461:2	reference 3474:16	remind 3445:11	3499:17
quarter 3477:8	ran 3441:20 3458:22	3501:23 3502:19	reminder 3401:13	respectful 3493:3
question 3401:8	3458:24,25	references 3478:11	rendering 3446:24	respectfully 3510:18
3402:12,14,25 3403:6	rank 3413:13 3414:2	3501:13	reneged 3493:10	respond 3417:4 3491:2
3403:16 3404:4	3448:17 3452:5	referred 3427:20	3496:3	3492:8
3405:3,21 3406:24	razor 3509:16	3428:11 3495:16	reoccur 3494:9	responded 3475:15
3407:24 3412:8,10,21	reach 3452:7	referring 3411:12	repeat 3433:4 3474:19	response 3456:1 3474:8
3412:23 3413:8,19	reached 3410:10	3420:23 3421:12,14	3474:24 3494:13	3485:11 3495:23
3414:17 3415:14	reaction 3440:24	3421:18,20 3423:15	repeated 3412:3 3479:5	responsibilities 3494:4
3416:11 3417:6	read 3400:6 3401:17,18	3448:14 3462:9,10,15	repeating 3434:1	3497:2
3433:1,3,4 3436:17	3401:21 3402:3	3465:16 3488:12	rephrase 3450:1	responsibility 3429:21
3438:6,8,9,16,20,23	3406:21 3407:4	3501:16	3460:18	3498:22 3499:4
3439:1,6,9,17,25	3408:14,14,16	reflect 3479:15	replaced 3420:1 3502:5	responsible 3460:4
3440:16,21 3441:4	3413:23 3448:14	reflected 3412:4	reply 3475:23	3499:14,19 3506:14
3448:20 3449:17	3449:2,16 3474:13,18	3480:19	report 3468:13 3492:17	result 3480:3 3488:8
3450:14,16 3452:23	3477:6 3478:6,12,12	reflects 3476:7 3477:24	3492:22 3493:1	resume 3445:8,10
3453:11 3454:5,12	3492:25 3493:7	reformulate 3456:19	reported 3410:13	3511:4
3456:20 3457:6,19	3495:19 3496:1	3457:6	3415:3	resumes 3400:2 3445:9
3458:4 3459:14	readily 3454:9	reformulated 3439:25	reporting 3485:13	3489:4

				Page 3524
return 3493:9 3498:3	says 3403:14 3408:18	3458:18 3463:1	3446:8 3447:6,9	short 3415:1,19
returning 3493:25	3425:14 3426:22	3467:12 3468:22	3448:21 3449:21	3453:22
re-examine 3509:11	3427:16 3448:24	3505:3,17 3506:1,5	3450:4 3455:16	shortcomings 3494:7,8
re-state 3482:9	3449:6,10,15 3459:25	3506:14	3456:2,24 3457:1,9	shortly 3473:25
rifle 3477:21	3461:21 3462:18	se 3479:10	3467:3 3502:12	shot 3410:17,17 3453:4
right 3412:23 3413:12	3468:16 3477:18	search 3466:21	3509:11,13	3453:6 3454:25
3413:25 3414:3	3488:13 3496:1	searching 3453:4	Semenya's 3456:20	3455:11,14 3459:6
3416:3 3420:19	SC 3400:5,12,16,19,23	season 3511:12	send 3445:22	3480:5
3421:8 3422:20	3401:8,12,17,23,25	second 3408:8 3483:12	sending 3434:6	shotgun 3479:20,23
3429:15 3430:25	3402:7,16 3403:1,10	3491:22	senior 3401:2 3402:22	3480:8
3443:19 3445:5	3403:23 3405:6,11,15	secondary 3404:20	3403:5,6,7 3404:2	shots 3410:16
3447:5 3449:8	3406:1,9,20 3407:21	secondly 3447:19	3405:3 3408:16	Shouldn't 3441:3
3450:24,25 3451:14	3408:12 3409:6,13,19	3510:13	3412:7 3414:2	show 3444:18 3462:19
3455:2 3456:2	3409:22 3410:6,11	section 3465:11	3445:18 3485:9	showing 3494:11
3461:18 3462:1,6,11	3411:3,5 3412:2	3468:13 3504:17	3486:22	shown 3507:18
3464:22 3473:14	3413:9 3414:8,11,17	security 3402:2 3403:2	senior's 3402:12	shows 3425:24 3447:23
3477:7 3485:16	3414:25 3415:7	3466:13,16	3412:10,22	3462:5
3495:24 3497:13	3416:4 3417:1,16	see 3402:24 3405:4	sense 3467:20	shy 3412:5
3498:2 3503:22	3420:22 3421:1,4,9	3410:9 3420:16,17,20	sentence 3407:1	side 3402:13 3404:3
3505:9	3422:2,6,8,19 3438:5	3421:13 3422:10	separate 3507:1	3426:14,18,25
rights 3488:24 3509:8	3438:19 3446:6	3425:19 3426:1,5,5	separately 3502:5	3430:23,24 3437:17
Risk 3465:14	3447:9 3449:21	3426:12 3427:12,21	September 3496:5	3470:3,22 3472:10
road 3448:10 3449:12	3450:4 3455:16	3427:22 3428:6,7,13	sequence 3417:18	3479:20 3490:9
3449:13,13,24 3450:6	3457:9 3465:24	3428:14,16,17,23	serious 3481:4 3487:24	3491:10 3497:7,18,19
rock 3493:17,20,25	3467:3 3473:22	3429:4,9,22,23	served 3417:3	sign 3455:13
role 3417:5 3472:5	3474:3,9,13 3475:1,6	3431:3 3433:2	service 3420:3 3474:23	signed 3496:5 3497:4
3508:4,4,9,14 3509:2	3475:11,14,25	3438:15 3443:7,11,13	3475:4 3476:12	3497:10,11
round 3413:20	3476:17,23 3477:5,10	3443:15,17,19,20,23	3485:23 3486:23	significant 3479:9
rubber 3480:2,14	3477:15 3478:13,22	3444:1 3445:3	3494:7	signing 3496:7
rules 3457:8	3480:18,25 3482:7,20	3448:22 3450:3	services 3474:8	similar 3417:1 3433:7
run 3437:15 3451:7,24	3482:25 3483:10,20	3451:2 3455:21	3485:11	3470:24
3452:3,3,4,11 3455:9	3484:1,9,17 3485:5	3456:4 3461:12,16,25	session 3487:5 3510:19	simplify 3503:10
running 3506:8	3486:4,9,12,17	3462:24 3463:9	sessions 3400:21,24	simply 3409:16
Rustenburg 3420:3	3487:6,21 3488:19	3465:10 3468:10,11	set 3476:4 3477:17	Sir 3400:11 3415:17
3511:6	3489:5,16 3490:1,7	3468:15,17 3469:4,11	3500:19 3502:9	3427:13 3429:8
R2 3496:7	3490:19 3491:1,16	3477:4,9 3493:5	3506:15	3438:11 3440:5
R5 3477:21 3479:7,19	3492:6,21 3495:2,7	3495:14,22,25 3496:5	setting 3409:5 3424:25	3441:23 3442:8
3479:19,22 3480:11	3495:11,14,18,22	3496:10 3497:7,19	settlement 3443:12	3458:19 3459:5
R5s 3482:5	3496:1,11,20,25	3498:14,16,17 3499:2	3446:12 3447:1,2,10	3474:2,6,12 3477:4
<u> </u>	3497:8,14,23 3498:2	3499:6,13,25 3500:1	3448:11 3449:14,20	3482:24 3483:25
	3498:8,13,17,24	3500:4,5 3501:1,8,8	3449:22,24 3450:3,8	3486:8 3489:25
safely 3511:12,12	3499:2,6,13,17,22	3503:17 3504:3,11,12	seven 3421:2	3490:18 3496:19
safety 3402:2 3403:2	3500:2,6,9,12,23 3501:4,10,17,19,22	3504:16,17 3505:4,12	Shabangu 3410:13	3498:1,7,16 3499:21
3406:24 SAPS 3432:4 3477:12	3501:25 3502:2,13,17	seeing 3440:19 3452:8	sharing 3509:1	3501:9 3504:1
SAPS 3432:4 3477:12 3497:7 3500:16	3501:25 3502:2,13,17 3502:25 3503:9,13,16	3494:10 3501:2 seek 3437:15 3509:2	Shell 3436:2,3 she's 3421:15	sit 3406:5 3412:22 3485:19
save 3501:5	3502:23 3503:9,13,16	seeking 3457:8 3466:9	shoot 3406:11,15	sits 3429:25
save 3501:5 saw 3471:12 3473:4	3503:25 3504:2,8,15	seen 3429:19 3442:5	3411:8,11,13,14,14	sits 3429:23 sitting 3436:18 3437:12
saw 3471:12 3473:4 saying 3401:7 3404:17	3505:9,16,22 3506:5	3471:9 3487:4	3411:16,18,19,20,22	situated 3504:10
3406:16 3412:2,13	3506:13,25 3507:8,13	3494:20	3411:10,18,19,20,22	3507:19
3413:6,17 3414:1,14	3507:16,21 3508:8,17	sees 3434:5	3412:1,6,17,17	situation 3404:10,22,24
3414:14 3415:18	3508:23 3509:4,13,14	self 3407:14 3408:10	3415:10 3480:9	3406:5,19 3407:10,13
3416:20,22 3424:8	3509:21,24 3510:2,5	self-defence 3407:4,23	shooting 3411:15	3407:13,19,20,24
3442:20 3452:25	3510:8,17	self-evident 3457:18	3453:2 3454:14	3408:5,6,19,22
3453:12 3465:2	scenario 3480:1	3459:11	3457:24 3458:20	3413:10 3418:20
3468:19 3471:16	scene 3438:3 3439:12	Semenya 3410:7	3461:2,18	3419:10,13 3424:10
3492:2 3496:12	3453:3 3455:9,9,10	3438:5,19 3439:2,9	shootings 3486:20	3424:12 3431:3,14
3508:2,10	3455:24 3457:25	3445:5,14,19 3446:6	3490:21	3432:14 3433:5
5500.2,10	0 10012 1 0 107120	5 1 15 15 ,1 1,1 9 5 1 10.0	5170.21	0.100.11.0.100.10
				I [

3434 6 343 6 23 3494 6 Stra 349:117.23 structure 3422:21 344:20 3451 10 345.14 souther 346:21 340.83 320:10 3456:1,63 306:1 3506:23 3451 10 345.17 spent 346:9 structure 3432:19 3456:33 340:1 3456:33 340:1 3451 10 345.22 spent 346:9 structure 3432:19 structure 3432:19 structure 3432:19 3455 10 3456:1 3477:20 34797 structure 3432:13 structure 3432:19 structure 3432:19 3485 31 4386:0 3477:20 34797 structure 3432:13 structure 3432:13 structure 3432:12 3485:14 340:67.17 structure 342:13 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:14 structure 342:12 3497:13 340:72 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:14 3404:51 340:72 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:14 structure 3432:12 structu					Page 3525
3437:12.13 3405:15 3405:16 3405:16 3405:16 3405:15 3405:12 3405:13 3405:13 3405:13 3405:12	3434:6 3436:23	3494:6	Star 3492:17.23	structure 3432:21	3444:20
3451:1018.0.9.21 south-west 3402:21 3433:20 3432:23 3433:6 3439:8 3436:13 3438:14 Succurs 3432:19 Sus an 3410:13 3455:19 3458:15 speak 3400:8 3481:13 3488:14 3435:23 3436:9 3436:13 3470:1724 speak 3400:8 3481:13 3488:14 3435:23 3436:9 3461:13 370:172.4 speak 340:22 sintred 343:112 sub 3500:3 sub 3500:3 sub 3500:3 sub 3500:3 sub 3500:3 3408:23 341:22 3485:13 3486:6,10 3477:120 3470:7 started 3421:13 3508:11 3446:17 3490:14 3446:14 3490:14 3446:13 3480:12 3447:12 3420:19 3438:12 3467:13 3408:22 3437:12 3408:23 340:22 3467:13 3406:23 340:22 3467:13 3406:23 340:22 3467:13 3406:23 340:22 3436:11 3406:23 340:21 3438:14 3442:23 3480:11 3432:23 3470:22 3436:13 340:23 340:22 3436:13 340:23 340:22 3442:13 3458:11 340:23 340:22 3436:13 340:13 348:14 344:23 348:11 344:11 344:11 344:23 348:11 344:23 348:11 344:23 348:11 344:23 348:12 344:11 344:23 340:11 344:23 348:11 344:23 344					
3435: 19 344:24 space 34367 3469:13 3433:6 5439:8 structures 3432:19 Suean 3410:13 3451: 15 3485:14 3488:13 3488:14 3438:12 3438:14 3435:21 3436:6 T 3461: 13 470:17,24 speaking 3468:7 3498:4 351:12 studied 3509:9 T 3488: 10 348:16 3471:29 3443:22 3442:12 3436:13 3436:6 T 3488: 10 348:16 3477:29 3479:27 3442:12 3468:10 3497.5 3406:02 3475:5 3408:02 3413:22 3488: 10 3497:9 3506:20.21,24 specifical 3498:10 stat 3476.7 submissions 3440:21 3441:23 3458:1 3467:13 specifical 3498:11 stat 346:13 3402:2 submissions 3440:21 3441:23 3471:2 3468:10 specifical 3428:7 3406:20 3407:21 substantial 3409:17 3444:23 3441:13 472:6,8,11 3462:10 348:7 spit 3408:8 3410:24 341:23 3406:20 3407:21 substantial 3409:17 3445:23 4477:12 3462:10 348:12 spit 3408:8 3410:13 441:23,8 3410:13 441:23,8 substantial 3409:17 3445:23 4477:13 3462:10 349:11 stati 341:44:13 472:6,8,11 3406:10 3489:12 3446:13 3	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·		,	,	
3455.15 3468.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.12 3481.13 3481.12 3481.13 3481.12 3481.13 3461.13 347.23 3461.13 <th< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></th<>					
3479:224 3481:6.6 3471:9 3484:12 subted 3342:14 sub \$300:3 metrical 3483:24 3481:11:02:22,224 spears 3471:21 3472:2 3442:12 3356:13478:5 3368:23 340:22 3485:3 3488:68,10 3477:19 3496:17 3364:17 3406:14 3414:61 3406:12 3464:17 3406:14 3414:62 3406:12 3486:17 3496:17 specific 34998.10 state 3476:7 submission 3402:1 3477:12 3407:13 3497:9 3506:20:21.24 specific 3496:17 3466:17 3406:22 submission 3402:1 3477:8 3437:12 3477:9 3480:22 specific 342:12 stated 3476:7 submission 3402:1 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:24 3472:23 3486:15 3458:14 3406:24 3472:12 3466:16 21 3477:17 343:11 3406:22 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:23 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3486:15 3488:16 3488:12 3476:13 3476:13 3476:13 3	· · · ·				T
3481:11,20,22,22,4 speaks 341:21,24 3439:11 341:9,11 subject 3423:7 342-9 ske 400:17 340:9 3482:11,315,181:0 spears 347:22 347:22 3442:12 3345:17 340:9 3356:1378:5 3364:17 3490:14 3416:22.9 3488:10 3493:24 specifical 399:8,10 state 3476:7 state 3476:7 submission 3492:4 3447:12 3420:19 3407:13 340:22 specifical 342:12 state 3476:7 submission 3446:21 3477:8 3435:14 3445:3 3477:20 3444:2 437:12 3406:12.3405:12 submission 3446:21 3477:8 3444:2 437:12 3406:12.3405:12 submission 3440:24 3442:249:11 3442:249:11 3445:14 3445:2 349:11 3442:24:12 submission 3440:24 3444:24:24:13 3476:23 3447:12 3445:13 4472:66,11 3447:13 4472:66,11 3457:13 4476:67 3445:13 4472:66,11 3457:13 4376:23 3468:12 3457:13 4376:23 3476:13 4372:13 4376:23 3476:13 4372:13 4376:23 3476:13 4376:13 3466:15 3456:13 43376:26 3445:13 4472:66,11 3456:13 3466:16:13 449:13 3466:16:13 446:12 3446:13 442:12 3446:13 442:12 3446:13 442:12 3446:13 442:12 3446:13 442:					tactical 3483:24
3482:11,13,15,18,19 specific 3499:8,10 3442:12 3456:13478:5 3408:23,3413:22 3485:31,3486:6,810 347:20,3479:7 starte 3476:7 3484:17,490:14 3416:6,21 3497:9,3506:20,21,24 specific 3499:8,10 stated 342:13,348:1 submission 349:24 3427:8,3433:18 3407:9,3506:20,21,24 specific 3490:23 3407:13 3403:2,3405:22 submission 340:24 344:2,3437:12 3488:11,348:13 3406:23,341:21 3408:15,3409:16 3456:13,348:1 3402:24 3427:8,3433:18 3488:11,348:17 spifti 3406:22,341:21 3408:15,3409:16 substantial 3409:17 345:13,323,3476:23 3488:10,449:25 substantial 3409:17 345:11,15,22 suffici 3479:13 suffici 3479:13 3488:11,11,11,11,11,122:8,8 341:11,82,25,8 suffici 3479:13 suffici 3479:13 suffici 3479:13 3461:13,22,24,21,23 spokes 3413:18 spointacous 3419:7,9 3455:22 suffici 3469:1,5 suffici 3479:13 suffici 3479:13 suffici 3469:1,5 suffici 3469:1,					
3488:3 3488:6,8,10 3477:20				0	
3488:10:3493:24 3494:61:19:3496:17 3497:91:30:46:12 3506:3 specific 3499:8,10 3467:13:3407:12 3407:12:3420:19 3407:12:3420:19 3407:12:3420:19 3407:12:3407:12 3407:12:3407:12 3407:12:3407:12 3407:12:3407:12 3407:12:3407:12 3407:12:3407:12 3408:15:3407:16 3407:12:3407:12 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:15:3407:16 3408:12:3412:11 3417:17:342:17 3416:17:342:12 3408:15:3407:16 3408:12:3407:10 3408:12:3407:10 3408:12:3407:10 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3408:12:3407:12 3409:12 34			starts 3422:13 3503:17		3414:6 3416:21
3494,611,19,3496:17 3507:25 stated 342:13,3458:1 submissions 3446:21 3427:83506:20,21,24 3427:83506:20,21,24 3427:8366:20,21,24 3427:83437:12 3508:3 specifically 3421:12 suberquent 3402:23 spitt 3406:22 3467:13 3406:21 3407:12 subsequent 3406:26 3445:23 347:12 3427:13 3480:22 spitt 3406:22 situations 3470:24 subsequent 3406:21 subsequent 3466:21 3445:23 347:12 3488:12 3486:14 spoke 3411:11 3412:38 3410:23 347:12 substantiates 3456:24 3473:23 3476:23 3468:42 3409:10.6 spoke 3411:11 3412:38 3416:12.15,25 Suffice 479:13 3488:12 3488:18 3468:42 3409:16 spoke 3411:11 3412:38 3416:11.31 3459:12 suffice 1424:12 suffice 1424:12 3426:23 3477.10,109 spokeswoman 349:2 statements 3409:25 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3409:12 suggest 3447:14 3453:23 3472:15 suggest 3447:14<					3417:12 3420:19
$\begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$		-			
3508:3 5467:13 3403:2 3405:22 submit 3409:24 3444:10 3444:25 3479:13 3480:22 spirt 3406:22 3412:3 3406:20 3407:14 substantial 3409:17 substantia 3409		specifically 3421:12	statement 3402:2,8	3456:8	
3479:13 3480:22 spirt 3406:22 3412:3 3408:15 3409:16 substantial 3409:17 3454:13 3472-68,11 3482:10 3484:7 spit 3408:8 3410:24 3412:4 substantial 3409:17 3454:13 3472-68,11 3483:14 saft 11 3412:3,8 3414:18 3415:25,8 suc 3406:2 3473:23 3476:23 3468:425 3469:10,16 3417:17 3432:17 3415:11,15,22 suffee 3479:13 3486:16,18 3488:18 3468:425 3409:10,16 spotem 3413:18 3501:3 3467:18,22 3468:4 3499:3 3500:23 3426:23 3477.10,19 spotemous 3419:7.9 3433:22 statements 3409:25 suggest 3409:12 statem 345:19 3491:16 3452:3 530:12 3426:23 347.18,18,21 sporting 3506:14 stationed 3450:11 stationed 3450:11 suggest 3409:12 statem 3409:15 3432:3 530:44 3488:16 3403:4 3429:25,17 3443:6 spray 366:304:14 stationed 3450:11 stationed 3450:11 statem 3450:11 statem 3430:11 3447:53 3472:15 3466:10 3461:1 3449:12 3447:53 3472:15 3466:16 3469:15 3444:32 344:42 statem 3450:11 statem 3450:11 statem 3450:11 statem 3450:14 3447:53 3472:14 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td>submit 3409:24</td> <td></td>				submit 3409:24	
3479:13 3480:22 spirt 3406:22 3412:3 3406:15 3400:16 substantial 3409:17 3545:13 3472:68,11 3482:10 3484:7 spit 3408:8 3410:24 312:42 substantial 3409:17 3454:13 3472:68,11 3482:10 3484:7 spit 3408:8 3410:24 312:42 substantial 3409:17 3453:13 3472:68,11 3485:14 saft:71 3432:17 3411:13,522 suffice 3479:13 3486:16,18 3488:18 3468:42 5469:10,16 spit 3408:44:9 3445:19 3465:21 suffice 3479:13 3486:16,18 3488:18 3468:12 577:10,19 spotsewoman 3496:2 spottameous 3419:7.9 3453:22 suggest 3409:12 statem 3409:25 3426:23 5477:10,19 spottameous 3419:7.9 3453:22 stationed 3429:20 3444:23 345:13 447:14 3432:377:15 3422:5,17 3443:6 stationed 3450:11 stationed 3450:11 suggest 3499:12 states 350:18 350:44 3456:19 3491:16 3452:377:10;19 3452:377:10;19 3452:377:10;19 3456:12 3498:63 509:17 3459:15 3509:17 states 350:18 350:44 3459:12 3472:15 3459:13 3433:112,15;16 3459:13 349:14 3459:13 349:14 3459:13 349:14 3459:13 349:14 3469:15 3471:13 3469:	situations 3470:24	spectators 3436:11	3406:20 3407:21	subsequent 3486:6	3445:2 3449:11
348:10 split 3408:8 3410:24 3412:4 substantiates 345:24 3475:23 3476:23 3485:14 spoke 3411:11 3412:38 3410:24 341:24 substantiates 345:22.8 Sur 3496:2 3485:14 3485:14 3485:14 3485:14 3485:12 Sur 3496:2 3485:12 3485:13 3485:13 3485:14 3490:16 3489:15 3489:15 3489:15 3499:14 340:13.18 3467:18.22 3489:15 3499:15 3500:23 3426:23 1427.71,019 spokeswama 3496:2 statements 3409:25 suggestig 3409:12 3445:21,44 3425:25 3430:5 3453:23 3472:15 3425:23 3427:15 3425:23 3427:15 3425:23 3427:15 3425:23 3427:15 3425:23 3427:15 3425:23 3427:15 3445:21,44 3445:12,14 3455:13,345:14 3445:12,14 3455:13,345:14 3445:12,14 3445:12,14 3455:13,345:12 3445:12,14 3445:12,14 3445:12,14 3445:12,342:12 3449:15 3442:25 3442:15 3441:14 3445:12,14 3445:13,342:12 3449:13 3462:15 3445:12,344:12 3444:13,451:13 3445:12,3444:12 3444:14,14,3445:14 3444:1,14,344:14,345:113 <td>3479:13 3480:22</td> <td></td> <td>3408:15 3409:16</td> <td>-</td> <td>3454:13 3472:6,8,11</td>	3479:13 3480:22		3408:15 3409:16	-	3454:13 3472:6,8,11
3485:14 spoke 3411:11 3412:3.8 3414:18 3415:2.5.8 Sue 3466:2 3433:12 3485:18,18 3463:4.25 3469:10,16 3456:24 3444:9 3445:19 3465:21 suffice 3479:13 3486:16,18 3488:18 3468:4.25 3469:10,16 3456:24 3444:9 3445:19 3465:21 sufficient 3424:12 3489:15 3498:22 sild 3424:16,18.21 spoken 3411:11 3412:38 3412:14 3500:13.18 3466:1,5 3450:12 3425:10,16,18 spoken 3419:7.9 3453:22 statements 3409:25 suggest 3469:1.2 4343:22 3430:5 3425:12,17,343:6 sportanceus 3419:7.9 states 3500:18 350:4.4 stationed 3429:20 3442:5 3445:2,14 3423:23 3472:15 3428:91,51,81.21 sparayin 3461:13 3445:12 3446:13 3450:11 stationed 3429:20 3447:6,7 talk 3407:18 3409:4 3445:12,17 3447:15 3450:23 stay 3452:2 stay 3452:2.4 stay 3452:2.4 stay 3452:4 stay 345:13.13 stay 3452:4 stay 345:13.13 stay 3452:4 stay 345:13.13 stay 342:13.13 stay 342:4 stay 342:13.13	3482:10 3484:7		3410:24 3412:4	substantiates 3456:24	
six 3467:4,6,9,16,21 3417:17,3432:17 3415:11,15,22 suffice 3479:13 3486:16,18,3488:18 3468:4,25,3469:10,16 3436:24,3444:9 3445:19,3465:21 suffice 3479:13 3489:15,3498:22 skills 3490:16 3458:10,3494:24 3492:14,3500:13,18 3467:18,22,3468:4 3499:3,3500:23 3422:52,10,16,18 spokeswama 3496:2 sattements 3409:25 suggest 3409:12 tatemed 3408:7,341:46 3422:22,3428:3,8 sporting 3506:11 state 3500:18,3504:4 state 3500:18,3504:4 state 3456:19,3491:16 states 3460:11 3422:2,317,3443:6 sparay 3463:8 state 3500:18,3504:4 state 3460:11 states 3460:11 states 3460:11 states 3460:11 states 3460:11 states 3460:12 states 3460:12 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:12 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:14 states 3460:12 states 3460:14 states 3460:13 states 3460:14 states 3460:12 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:14 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 states 3460:13 <	3485:14		3414:18 3415:2,5,8	Sue 3496:2	
3468:425 3469:10,16 3436:243444:9 3449:193465:21 sufficient 32424:12 3489:15 3498:22 sile 3490:16 spoken 3413:18 3501:3 3469:1,5 3501:22 sile 3424:16,18,21 spokenswoman 3496:2 statements 3409:25 suggest 344:25 3445:2,14 3423:23 3420:5 3425:10,16,18 sportaneous 3497:9 states 3500:18 3504:4 states 3500:18 3504:4 states 3500:18 3504:4 3455:19 3491:16 3435:23 3472:15 3422:0,16,18 spraying 3461:13 stationed 3429:20 3444:25 3445:2,14 3428:15 3498:4 3499:3 3492:4 3444:12 3444:25 3445:13,67 SS 3498:5 SS 3498:5 SS 3498:5 States 3500:18 3504:4 staggesting 3434:21 3449:13 3409:4,10 3444:12 3444:25 3447:14 3407:18 3409:4,10 staggesting 3434:21 3447:14 3461:13 4409:19 3446:13 3419:23 420:22,52 3448:2 suggesting 3444:24 3442:13 3446:13 3421:6,16:3469:15 3446:13 3421:6,16:17,19,23 34492:13 sufferent 3490:23 suggesting 3444:24 3462:13 3446:13 3421:6,16:7,19,23 3421:6,16				suffice 3479:13	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·
skills 3400:16 spoken 3413:18 3501:3 3469:1,5 3501:22 slide 3424:16,18,21 spokeswoman 3496:2 statements 3409:25 suggest 3409:12 taken 3408:7 341:6 3425:10,16,18 sportaneous sportaneous states 3501:22 states 3444:25 3445:21,4 3423:25 3430:5 3426:10,16,18 sportaneous sportaneous states 3501:1 states 3501:22 3444:25 3445:21,4 3453:23 3472:15 3428:9,15,18,21 spraying 3466:1,14 3446:1,14 3446:1,14 3446:1,14 3446:1,14 3446:1,14 3461:7 3442:13 3427:5 3412:13 3427:5 3412:13 3427:5 3412:13 3427:5 3427:5 3412:13 3427:5 3427:5 3427:5 3427:13 3427:5 3427:13 3427:5 3427:13 3427:13 3427:13 3427:13 3427:13 3427:13 3427:13 3427:14 3436:14 3436:12 3419:14 3436:12<	3468:4,25 3469:10,16	3436:24 3444:9	3445:19 3465:21	sufficient 3424:12	3489:15 3498:22
slide 3424:16,18,21 spokeswoman 3496:2 statements 3409:25 suggest 3409:12 taken 3408:7 3414:6 3426:23 3427:7,10,16,18 sporting 3506:11 3453:22 3453:22 3454:23 3452:14,23 3452:14,23 3452:14,23 3452:14,23 3452:13 3452:12,17 3452:14,33 3451:13 3452:12,17 3452:12 3452:12,17 3446:11,43 3450:12 3447:6,7 talk 3407:18 3484:3 3427:53 3437:22 3466:10 3466:15 34477:14 3436:13 34377:20		3458:10 3494:24	3492:14 3500:13,18	3467:18,22 3468:4	3499:3 3500:23
3425:10,16,18 spontaneous 3419:7.9 3433:22 3443:22 3443:22 3443:22 3443:22 3435:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:23 345:19 345:19 345:19 345:19 345:19 345:12 345:19 345:12 345:19 345:12 345:19 345:12 345:19 346:17 346:17 346:17 346:17 346:17 345:12 349:15 349:15 349:15 340:11 346:17 346:10 342:12.3 346:10 342:16.16,17,19,23 348:22 suitable 348:23 346:10 346:11 343:12.15.16 346:13 346:10 341:12 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:12 347:64 347:020 347:020 347:020 347:020 347:020 347:020 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13 346:13	skills 3490:16	spoken 3413:18	3501:3	3469:1,5	3501:22
3426:23 3427:7,10.19 sporting 3506:11 states 3500:18 350:4: 3456:19 3491:16 3453:23 3472:15 3428:9,15,18,21 spraying 3463:8 spraying 3461:13 station 3450:11 station 3450:11 3488:16 3493:4 3499:15 3509:17 3444:4,22 3445:3,6,7 SS 3498:5 SS 3498:5 3446:1,14 3449:19 3447:6,7 3443:12,15,16 3442:12,15,16 3445:12,17 3447:12 SS 3498:6 3504:14 SS 3498:6 3504:14 stay 3452:2,4 suggestion 3471:22 3412:18 3421:3 346:10 3421:6,16,17,19,26 3432:2,0 stay 3472:15 suggestis 3447:14 346:10 346:11 3425:3 3427:8 346:10 3501:11 step s433:18,18 3422:2 suggestis 3447:14 3456:23 3427:24 3425:3 3427:8 346:10 3451:13 stage 3410:10 3417:3 Step s404:9 3472:15 suffor 3400:24 3485:2,24 3488:6 3479:1 3422:10,19,19,24 stige 3437:14 stage 3402:1 support 3506:22 talked 3471:20 3479:1 3422:16,14 345:1 stop 343:2 suppose 3442:4 346:13 3403:19 3402:23 3479:1 3422:16,14 345:1 stop 343:12 suppose 3442:4 346:28 3403:19 3402:23 suppose 3442:24 3445:13 342:1	slide 3424:16,18,21	spokeswoman 3496:2	statements 3409:25	suggest 3409:12	taken 3408:7 3414:6
3427:22,25 3428:3,8 3428:91,51,8,21 spray 3463:8 spray 3461:13 3429:25,17 3443:6 station 3450:11 3429:25,17 3443:6 suggested 3459:4 3429:20 3488:16 3493:4 3429:15 309:17 3447:15 340:5 3444:4,22 3445:3,6,7 3445:12,17 3447:12 SS2 3498:6 3504:14 SS2 349:18,18,18,18,18,19,12 3461:7 3455:13,13 3461:7 3455:13,13 3461:7 3455:13,13 3461:7 3455:13,13 3462:10 SS2 3499:18,18,18,18,18,18 3420:23,25 stay 3418:18 stay 343:52,2,4 suggestin 3471:22 sutpost 3447:14 stay 343:52,2,4 3427:5 3431:12,15,16 stay 3452:2,4 3425:3 3427:8 3465:10 3501:11 3481:18 3492:13 step 3433:18,18 3482:2 sutpost 3447:14 support 3506:22 support 3506:22 talked 3471:20 still a457:4 3434:20 3444:13 3479:1 stage 3410:10 3417:3 3423:10,19,19,24 stiplates 3499:23 stiplates 3499:23 support 3506:22 suppose 3487:20 talked 3471:20 3407:19 3408:17 smaller 3430:20 3432:21 342:17 3429:18 stiplates 3499:23 suppose 3487:20 3407:19 3408:17 3412:16 3413:7 3442:13 345:12 solve 3503:8 3465:8,12,15 3443:21 3479:12 stog 3434:2 stog 343:23 suppose 3487:20 3407:19 3408:17 3426:17 3472:19 3442:13 3456:14 3458:8 solve 3503:8 3466:8,17,13 3472:19 3479:24 3449:9 3439:3 3441:12 3444:9:17 3458:7 3446:17 3429:13 3459:13 3441:12 solve 3503:8 3466:8,17,317:13 3472:19 3479:24 3449:17 3472:19 3449:9 <	3425:10,16,18		3453:22	3444:25 3445:2,14	3423:25 3430:5
3428:9.15.18.21 spraying 3461:13 stationed 3429:20 suggesting 3434:21 3499:15 3509:17 3429:2.5,17 3443:6 3362:25 3446:1,14 3449:19 3445:2.1 3499:15 3509:17 3444:2.23 2445:3,6,7 SS 3498:5 SS 3498:5 suggesting 3434:21 3499:15 3509:17 3445:12,17 3447:12 SS 3498:5 SS 3498:5 stationed 3429:20 suggesting 3471:22 3427:5 3431:12,15,16 3445:12,17 3447:12 SS 3498:6 3504:14 stay 3418:18 suggesting 3471:24 3456:14 3451:13 3468:10 3419:23 340:22.32 stay 3418:18 stay 318:18 3492:15 summary 3415:19 3466:16 3469:15 3425:3 3427:8 3422:3,10,12,13 step 3472:15 sumdry 3400:24 3485:22 3488:6 slighty 3433:24 350:20 3503:3,5,11 Ster 3437:14 3451:14 staf57:4 3503:20 3403:19 3404:23,24 shy 3474:25 342:7 3429:18 stipulates 3499:23 suppos 342:43462:8 talking 3402:23 3407:19 3408:17 smash 342:16 3445:17 3452:9 stog 3434:2 suppos 3442:43462:8 3407:19 3408:17 smash 342:16 3445:17 3	3426:23 3427:7,10,19	sporting 3506:11	states 3500:18 3504:4	3456:19 3491:16	3453:23 3472:15
3429:2,5,17 3443:6 3462:25 3446:1,14 3449:19 3447:6,7 talk 3407:18 3408:4,10 3444:4,22 3445:3,6,7 SS 3498:5 5304:14 stay 345:2 3483:2 3484:3 342:12,13 3421:13 3447:15 3450:5 SS 3419:18,18,19,21 stay 345:2,2,4 suggestion 3471:22 3484:3 342:75 3431:12,15,16 3468:10 3419:23 3420:23,25 step 3433:18,18 3482:2 suitable 3408:2,3 3460:10 3461:1 3466:16 3469:15 sides 3424:19,25 3422:3,10,12,13 step 343:18,18 3482:2 suitable 3408:2,3 3460:10 3461:1 3485:2,24 suitable 3408:2,3 3460:10 3461:1 3485:2,4 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:1 3485:2,4 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3461:1 3485:2,4 3460:10 3461:2 3460:10 3470:20 3472:24 3466:16 3469:15 3470:20 3472:24 3466:16 3469:15 3470:20 3472:24 3485:2,24 3488:6 support 3400:24 subol 3461:1 3410:2,0 3412:16 3413:7 3488:6 3490:10 340:23 2442:4 3462:8 3403:19 3404:23,24 3463:34441:12 3412:16 3413:7 3488:6 3496:11 3412:16 3413:7 3488:6 3496:11 3412:16 3413:7	3427:22,25 3428:3,8		station 3450:11		3488:16 3493:4
3444:4.22 3445:3,6,7 SS 3498:5 3450:2 stag 3418:18 stag 3418:18 stag 3445:3 3421:5 3431:12,15,16 3447:15 3450:5 SS3 3419:18,18,19,21 stay 3452:24 stag 3452:24 suggestion 3471:22 3461:3 3461:13 3461:7 3465:13,13 3419:23 3420:23,25 stay 3452:24 suggests 3447:14 3436:14 3451:13 3468:10 3421:6,16,17 19,23 3482:2 stay 342:13 suttable 3408:23 3460:10 3461:1 3448:2 3422:3,10,12,13 steps 3404:9 3472:15 staff, 3457:4 3470:20 3472:24 3442:13 3426:10 3501:11 3481:18 3492:13 support 3506:22 talking 3402:23 3479:1 3423:10,19,19,24 stip 3443:21 suppose 3487:20 3403:19 3404:23,24 solution 350:2 3420:13 3420:23 supposed 3487:20 3403:19 3404:23,24 solution 350:2 3455:14 3458:8 stop 3434:2 sup 3434:21 3442:13 342:4 solution 350:2 3455:14 3458:8 stop 3434:2 3442:13 342:4 3415:12 solution 350:2 3455:14 3458:8 stop 3434:2 3442:16 34458:12 3442:13 3423:5		spraying 3461:13	I PACE I LE CEVIL L'ANT	suggesting 3434:21	
3445:12,17 3447:12 SS2 3498:6 3504:14 stay 3418:18 3484:3 3427:5 3431:12,15,16 3447:15 3450:5 SS3 3419:18,18,19,21 stay 3418:18 stay 3422:2,4 suggests 3447:14 3436:11 3435:113 3468:10 3422:6,16,17,19,23 3422:2 summary 3415:19 3460:10 3461:1 3425:3 3427:8 3465:10 3501:11 step 3404:9 3472:15 summary 3415:19 3466:16 3469:15 343:22 3302:20 3503:3,5,11 step 3404:9 3472:15 summary 3400:24 3485:2,2 4348:6 349:23 3479:1 3423:10,19,19,24 stifle 3457:4 3503:20 3403:19 3404:23,24 340wl 3474:25 3426:17 3429:18 stipulates 3499:23 support 3506:22 talked 3471:20 smaller 3430:20 3430:21 3441:15 stod 3459:3 3496:21 3412:16 3413:7 smaller 3430:20 3456:14 3458:8 stop 3434:2 stor 3494:12 3414:12 3412:16 3413:7 solution 3509:2 3456:14 3458:8 stop 3434:10 3423:66,7,8 3424:3,7 3458:6 3460:9 solution 3509:2 3456:14 3458:8 story 3497:18 3423:66,7,8 3424:3,7 3458:6 3460:9 3447:14 3466:17	3429:2,5,17 3443:6		- 11 - Fre / Fre / /		talk 3407:18 3408:4,10
3447:15 3450:5 3461:7 3455:13,13 3461:7 3455:13,13 3468:10SS3 3419:18,18,19,21 step 34320:23,25 step 3433:18,18 3482:2suggests 3447:14 suitable 3408:23 suitable 3408:233436:14 3451:13 3466:10 346:11 3421:6,16,17,19,233432:2 342:23 3422:3,10,12,13step 3404:9 3472:15 step 3404:9 3472:15suitable 3408:23 summary 3415:193466:16 3469:15 3476:4silides 3424:19,25 3422:3,10,12,13342:3,10,12,13 steps 3404:9 3472:15steps 3404:9 3472:15 support 3506:22 support 3401:13 3481:18 support 3402:23 3402:19 3404:23,243403:19 3404:23,24 3403:19 3404:23,24solutin 3509:2 solutin 3509:2 suptot 3503:8 support 3505:8 suppot 3450:17 3470:19 3416:24 3466:17 3477:19 3477:19 3416:24 3466:17 3477:13 3477:19 3477:19 3416:24 3466:17 3477:13 3477:19 3479:14 3409:17 3510:22 strength 3481:2 3457:10 3458:24 3459:10 3459:10 3466:23 3400:16 3455:14 34					
3461:7 3465:13,13 3468:103419:23 3420:23,25step 3433:18.18 3482:2suitable 3408:23 summary 3415:193460:10 3461:13488:103421:6,16,17,19,233482:2summary 3415:193466:16 3469:15slides 3424:19,253422:3,10,12,13steps 3404:9 3472:15sunfary 3400:243485:2,24 3488:6slightly 3433:243502:20 3503:3,5,11Steve 3402:1support 3506:22talked 3471:203434:00 3444:13stage 3410:10 3417:3STF 3428:15 3443:21suppose 3442:4 3462:8talking 3402:233479:13423:10,19,19,24stifle 3457:43503:203403:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253442:17 3429:18stipulates 3499:23suppose 3442:1 341:123414:21 6 3413:7smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83466:14 3458:8storp 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83466:173477:13 3472:193449:93439:3 3441:123446:17 3458:73416:24 3466:173477:13 3472:19straight forward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:13 505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12standirds 3400:10street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243401:10 3403:3,18,22strike 3432:13 3433:5 <td></td> <td>11</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		11			
3468:103421:6,16,17,19,233482:2summary3415:193466:16 3469:15slides 3424:19,253422:3,10,12,13steps 3404:9 3472:153470:20 3472:243470:20 3472:24slightly 3433:243502:20 3503:3,5,11Stevs 3402:13sundry 3400:243485:2,24 3488:6slightly 3433:243502:20 3503:3,5,11Steve 3402:1support 3506:22talking 3402:233477:13423:10,19,19,24stifle 3457:43503:203403:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18stipulates 3499:23suppose 3442:4 3462:83403:19 3404:23,24smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3434:2sur 3404:12 3414:123414:24 3415:12solve 3503:83465:18,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53477:2193449:93425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,2348:6 3497:1 3505:5son 3439:10stamged 3437:143407:193468:20 3469:73488:6 3497:1 3505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3400:10strike 3418:223472:19 3472:19 3472:193468:23 3466:73468:8,18,193455:10 3458:243511:5street 3418:223472:19 3473:153472:12 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 342:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:63407:13 540:223492:23 3493:13,153472:19 3473:153472:12 3				00	
slides $3424:19,25$ $3422:3,10,12,13$ steps $3404:9,3472:15$ $3476:4$ $3470:20,3472:24$ $3425:3,3427:8$ $3455:10,3501:11$ $3481:18,3492:13$ $sundry,3400:24$ $3485:2,24,3488:6$ $slightly 3433:24$ $3502:20,3503:3,5,11$ $Steve,3402:1$ $support,3506:22$ $talked,3471:20$ $3434:20,3444:13$ $stage,3410:10,3417:3$ $STF,3428:15,3443:21$ $support,3506:22$ $talking,3402:23$ $3479:1$ $3423:10,19,19,24$ $stifle,3457:4$ $3503:20$ $3403:19,3404:23,24$ $slowly,3474:25$ $3424:7,3429:18$ $stipulates,3499:23$ $suppose,3442:4,3462:8$ $3407:19,3404:23,24$ $smaller,3430:20$ $3430:21,3441:15$ $stoo,3459:3$ $3496:21$ $3412:16,3413:7$ $smash,3421:16$ $3445:17,3452:9$ $stoo,34359:3$ $3496:21$ $3414:24,3415:12$ $solution,3509:2$ $3456:14,3458:8$ $stooped,3431:10$ $3419:2,11,13,3423:4$ $3444:11,3450:15$ $solve,3503:8$ $3465:8,12,15,3467:14$ $story,3497:18$ $3423:6,6,7,8,3424:3,7$ $3458:6,3460:9$ $solve,3503:8$ $3465:8,12,15,3467:14$ $story,3499:9$ $3439:3,3441:1,2$ $3462:17,3472:19$ $3416:2,43466:17$ $3477:19$ $3449:9$ $3439:3,3441:1,2$ $3462:17,3472:19$ $3479:24$ $3494:17,20,24$ $straightforward$ $3444:9,17,3458:7$ $3488:6,3497:1,3505:18$ $soor,3499:10$ $stamped,3437:14$ $3407:19$ $3464:2,3468:25$ $3488:6,3497:1,3505:18$ $sor,349:10$ $stamded,3400:10$ $strike,342:13,3433:5$ $3482:2,3486:10$ $3427:12,3430:25$					
3425:3 3427:83465:10 3501:113481:18 3492:13sundry 3400:243485:2,24 3488:6slighty 3433:243502:20 3503:3,5,11Steve 3402:1support 3506:22talked 3471:203434:20 3444:13stage 3410:10 3417:3STF 3428:15 3443:21suppose 3442:4 3462:8talking 3402:233479:13423:10.19,19,24stifle 3457:43503:203403:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18stipulates 3499:23supposed 3487:203407:19 3408:17smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7solution 3509:23456:18,12,15 3467:14stopg 3434:2sure 3404:12 3414:123444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73488:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53477:21 3477:19straight forward3449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soory 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5streegt 3418:23467:193442:2 3462:5target 3433:193456:6standing 3400:10strike 3422:13 4343:553492:2 3486:25target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3422:2 3466:253492:2 3466:253492:12 3430:253498:6standards 3400:10strike 3422:2 3468:253482:2 3466:253472:12 3430:253498:6standards 3400:10strike 3429:2234918,					
slightly 3433:243502:20 3503:3,5,11Steve 3402:1support 3506:22talked 3471:203434:20 3444:13stage 3410:10 3417:3STF 3428:15 3443:21suppose 3442:4 3462:8talking 3402:233479:13423:10,19,19,24stifle 3457:43503:203407:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18stipulates 3499:23suppose 3487:203407:19 3404:23,24smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3434:2sure 3404:12 3414:123414:24 3415:12solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8stopped 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stamped 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243459:18 3471:19standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3486:25talks 3408:243498:6standing 3400:10strike 3422:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25stas 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:163492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:253498:6standing 3400:163492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25 <tr<< td=""><td>-</td><td></td><td>-</td><td></td><td></td></tr<<>	-		-		
3434:20 3444:13 3479:1stage 3410:10 3417:3 3423:10,19,19,24STF 3428:15 3443:21 stifle 3457:4suppose 3442:4 3462:8 3503:20talking 3402:23 3403:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18 3430:20stipulates 3499:23 3430:21 3441:15stood 3459:3 stood 3459:3suppose 3487:20 3496:213407:19 3408:17 3419:2,11,13 3423:4smaler 3430:203430:21 3441:15 3445:17 3452:9stood 3459:3 stood 3459:33496:21 3419:2,11,13 3423:43414:24 3415:12 3414:24 3415:12solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8 3465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:18 story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,7 3423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9 3439:3 3441:1,2somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19 3479:24straight 3408:20 3449:93425:23 3436:8 3462:17 3472:193462:17 3472:19 3449:93416:24 3466:17 3479:243477:11 3487:2,19 3499:103449:9 3449:93439:3 3441:1,2 3446:4 3468:8,18,193481:17 3485:22 3505:18 3468:20 3469:7 3468:20 3469:7 3455:10 3458:24 3459:18 3471:19stand ado9:17 3510:22 3490:7,14streegth 3481:2 3492:24 3493:13,153487:2 19 3473:15 3487:2 19 3473:15 3487:2 3486:25talks 3408:24 3472:19 3473:15sort 3409:25 3414:18 3406:21 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,15 3439:223492:4 3493:13,15 3487:2 3486:253427:12 3430:25 3470:193446: 3477:22 3406:23 3407:16 3485:14 3486:213406:10 3403:3,18,22 3430:7 3446:25striker 3429:22 3430:7 3446:253427:12 3430:25 3430:10 3459:103455:14 3446:21 3408:213406:23 3407:16 3435:24 3469:20striker 3429:22 3459:10 </td <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
3479:13423:10,19,19,24stifle 3457:43503:203403:19 3404:23,24slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18stipulates 3499:23supposed 3487:203407:19 3408:17smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3434:2sure 3404:12 3414:123414:24 3415:12solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8stopped 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5son 3439:10stamped 3437:143407:193468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5streegt 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 4308:243459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:253498:6standing 3400:7,143492:223491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213438:14 3486:213406:23 3407:16striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213455:14 3486:213406:23 3407:16striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213455:14 3486:213406:23 34					
slowly 3474:253424:7 3429:18stipulates 3499:23supposed 3487:203407:19 3408:17smaller 3430:203430:21 3441:15stood 3459:33496:213412:16 3413:7smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3434:2sure 3404:12 3414:123414:24 3415:12solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8stopped 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19strog 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:93416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:903423:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:903439:3 3441:1,23488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stamped 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:253434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16striker 3429:223499:43494:12,17,21stay 3430:163435:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:103455:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:103451:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:103451:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:7					<u> </u>
smaller3430:203430:213441:15stood3459:33496:213412:163412:163413:7smash3421:163445:173452:9stop3434:2sure3404:123414:243415:12solution3509:23456:143458:8stopped3431:103419:2,11,133423:43444:113450:15solve3503:83465:8,12,153472:19story3497:183423:6,6,7,83424:3,73458:63460:9somebody3401:53477:133477:193449:93439:33441:1,23462:173472:193416:243466:173477:113487:2,193449:93439:33441:1,23481:173485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,173458:73488:63469:133505:18sorry3417:203438:12stand3409:173510:22street3418:223468:203469:7talks3408:243455:103458:243511:5strength3481:23472:193472:193472:193472:193472:123430:253498:6standards3400:10strike3429:223492:23498:103427:123430:253434:63407:143407:143492:243491:8,11,143492:33479:12,213434:63401:103403:3,18,22strikers3492:223494:12,17,21staght 3400:163434:63406:233407:163436:243492:123492:43492:13 <td< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>					
smash 3421:163445:17 3452:9stop 3434:2sure 3404:12 3414:123414:24 3415:12solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8stopped 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:193498:6standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standards 3400:10striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33472:12 3402:253434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16striker 3410:23492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163435:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:103435:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:103408:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,7<			-		
solution 3509:23456:14 3458:8stopped 3431:103419:2,11,13 3423:43444:11 3450:15solve 3503:83465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stamped 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5strength 3481:23472:19 3473:15target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 343:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2tea 3403:3 341					
solve 3503:83465:8,12,15 3467:14story 3497:183423:6,6,7,8 3424:3,73458:6 3460:9somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:253434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213435:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
somebody 3401:53471:23 3472:19straight 3408:203425:23 3436:83462:17 3472:193416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5strength 3481:23472:19 3473:15target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:253434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213435:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:133459:2,3source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13				, ,	
3416:24 3466:173477:11 3487:2,193449:93439:3 3441:1,23481:17 3485:223479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5strength 3481:23472:19 3473:15target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16striker 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13a452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3surrendering 3461:2tea 344:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13		, ,			
3479:243494:17,20,24straightforward3444:9,17 3458:73488:6 3497:1 3505:5soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5street 3418:223472:19 3473:15target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13	-		-		
soon 3439:10stampede 3437:143407:193464:4 3468:8,18,193505:18sorry 3417:20 3438:12stand 3409:17 3510:22street 3418:223468:20 3469:7talks 3408:243455:10 3458:243511:5street 3418:223472:19 3473:15target 3433:193459:18 3471:19standards 3400:10strike 3432:13 3433:53482:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,83498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
sorry 3417:20 3438:12 3455:10 3458:24 3459:18 3471:19stand 3409:17 3510:22 3511:5street 3418:22 strength 3481:23468:20 3469:7 3472:19 3473:15talks 3408:24 target 3433:193459:18 3471:19 3498:6standards 3400:10 standards 3400:7,14strike 3432:13 3433:5 3492:24 3493:13,153472:19 3473:15 3482:2 3486:25target 3433:19 task 3404:17 3426:8,8sort 3409:25 3414:18 3434:6 3477:223401:10 3403:3,18,22 3406:23 3407:16striker 3410:2 striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:3 3492:24 3494:12,17,213479:21,21 taught 3400:163485:14 3486:21 3485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:3 3416:2 3498:5,11,18 3416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20 3470:8surprised 3454:7 surrender 3455:13 3459:2,3taxi 3452:4 tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,7 teach 3403:3 3411:13				,	
3455:10 3458:24 3459:18 3471:19 3498:63511:5 standards 3400:10 standing 3400:7,14strength 3481:2 3492:24 3493:13,153472:19 3473:15 3482:2 3486:25target 3433:19 task 3404:17 3426:8,8 3427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:18 3434:6 3477:22 3485:14 3486:213401:10 3403:3,18,22 3406:23 3407:16striker 3410:2 striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:3 3430:7 3446:253479:21,21 taught 3400:16sounds 3457:14 source 3489:223406:2 3498:5,11,18 3505:10,12,23,253430:7 3446:25 3470:8surprised 3454:7 3459:2,33403:10 3459:10 taxi 3459:2,3source 3489:22 3507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13		-			
3459:18 3471:19 3498:6standards 3400:10 standing 3400:7,14strike 3432:13 3433:5 3492:24 3493:13,153482:2 3486:25 3487:2 3486:25task 3404:17 3426:8,8 3427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:18 3434:6 3477:223401:10 3403:3,18,22 3406:23 3407:16striker 3410:2 striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:3 3492:4 3494:12,17,213479:21,21 taught 3400:163485:14 3486:21 3485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:3 3408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25 3430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:7 surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10 taxi 3452:4sounds 3457:14 source 3489:223505:10,12,23,25 3507:103470:8 3506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13	Ū.				
3498:6standing 3400:7,143492:24 3493:13,153487:2 3488:103427:12 3430:25sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,7507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
sort 3409:25 3414:183401:10 3403:3,18,22striker 3410:23491:8,11,14 3492:33479:21,213434:6 3477:223406:23 3407:16strikers 3429:223492:4 3494:12,17,21taught 3400:163485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,7507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
3434:6 3477:22 3485:14 3486:213406:23 3407:16 3408:9,14,24 3409:3strikers 3429:22 3430:7 3446:253492:4 3494:12,17,21 surprised 3454:7taught 3400:16 3403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:14 source 3489:22 3507:103416:2 3498:5,11,18 3506:3,63453:24 3469:20 3470:8surprised 3454:7 3453:24 3469:20taught 3400:16 3492:4 3494:12,17,21source 3489:22 3507:103506:3,6strikers 3429:22 3470:8surprised 3454:7 3459:2,3taught 3400:16 surprised 3454:7source 3489:22 3507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13		0			
3485:14 3486:213408:9,14,24 3409:33430:7 3446:25surprised 3454:73403:10 3459:10sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13surrender 3455:13source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
sounds 3457:143416:2 3498:5,11,183453:24 3469:20surrender 3455:13taxi 3452:4source 3489:223505:10,12,23,253470:83459:2,3tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,73507:103506:3,6strongly 3470:19surrendering 3461:2teach 3403:3 3411:13					
source 3489:22 3507:103505:10,12,23,25 3506:3,63470:8 strongly 3470:193459:2,3 surrendering 3461:2tea 3444:25 3445:1,2,7 teach 3403:3 3411:13					
3507:10 3506:3,6 strongly 3470:19 surrendering 3461:2 teach 3403:3 3411:13					
				-	
	South 3420:3 3486:22	stands 3406:22 3407:22			3411:17,18 3412:19

3478:13 3480:183414:6,15 3415:4,113476:17,23 3477:5,10transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253482:7 3489:13415:21 3416:2,7,143477:15 3478:13,223401:143439:4,7 3442:203492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3482:7,20transport 3442:193446:11,11 3447:163503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:93511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:5that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19tried 3434:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:17 3428:53431:8 3439:33433:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22					Page 3526
3408:13 3483:25 3484.816 3463:19 3462:6.825 3503:17 3501:11 3502:1 teaching 3452:1 3482:03 3466:2.8.11 3492:24 topic 3483:22 3484:10 3492:8 3493:6 atr2:11 there's 3404:13 3497.5 there's 3404:14:14 turned 3483:12 3492:24 turned 3402:13 3432:2 3492:24 turned 3483:12 3484:13 3482:2 turned 3402:13 342:2:13 3402:1 turned 3402:13 342:2:13 342:12:13 3413:24 tear 350:15 3447:25 3452:2.4 3477:19 330:24 3402:12 303:14 3472:8 3462:15,20 3466:5 tear 350:15 3473:17 3475.8 throw 3421:18 total 3472:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3474:14 3475.8 3476:12 3475.11 3474:14 3475.8 3476:12 3475.11 3476:14 3475.8 3476:12 3475.11 3476:12 3475.11 3476:12 3475.11 3476:12 3475.12 3489:19 3461:10.17 3470:12 3476.12 3466:19.25 3466:19.25 3420:12.20 3422:21 3451:12 3455:19 3489:19 3411:17 34019 3476:12 3476.12 3476:12 3476.12 3476:12 3476.12 3476:12 3476.12 3476:12 3476.12 </td <td>teacher 3407:25</td> <td>3477:7 3480:16</td> <td>3436:5.25.25 3463:18</td> <td>3475:7 3477:7</td> <td>turn 3489:16 3498:13</td>	teacher 3407:25	3477:7 3480:16	3436:5.25.25 3463:18	3475:7 3477:7	turn 3489:16 3498:13
$ \begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$,		topic 3484:10 3492:8	
			threaten 3410:15,22		
		thereof 3508:17		topics 3483:22 3484:2	turns 3404:14,14
$ \begin{array}{llllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllllll$	3472:11	there's 3404:18 3409:4	three 3430:25 3495:24	total 3412:13 3413:24	twice 3434:13 3442:23
leargas 3486:1	teams 3425:1	3425:17,24 3436:7	three-and-a-half	3426:14 3427:2,5	two 3403:14,19 3426:8
	tear 3502:15	3447:25 3452:2,4	3477:19	3430:24	3462:5,8,20 3466:5
		3462:5,12 3465:12,25	throw 3421:18	totally 3403:19 3407:17	3470:21 3473:24
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	-	3473:3,17 3475:8		3408:25 3411:25	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	tell 3403:13 3408:1				3476:10 3478:17
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	-		U U	-	
$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
	-				
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
$\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$					
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $		·			
$\begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$			· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	• ., •.==	
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $	<i>,</i>				-
$\begin{array}{c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c $					
testified 3478:183408:25 3416:13484:23 3485:223475:3,5,9,16,20Utestimony 3455:223419:1 3431:13490:13 341.15346:22 3471:113494:13,14 3500:213476:4,7,13,20UThamae's 3448:16348:15 3485:173486:19 3505:25346:22 3471:113494:13,14 3500:213477:17 3479:2,6,10U3416:4 3417:113507:23Tip 3473:21,22 3474:33489:22 3492:13underines 3494:6underines 3494:63420:6 3460:25think 3401:21 3402:73475:163474:9,13 3475:1.63474:17 3477:33415:13 3416:18,233472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233475:17,23 3475:1.63474:17 3477:33415:13 3416:18,233422:21 3495:2,2,73416:2,2,113476:17,23 3477:15,10Transcript 3509:93433:2 3434:9 3435:23482:7 3489:1341:6,15 3415:4,113476:17,23 3477:15,20transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253482:7 3489:1341:6,12 3416:2,7,143476:17,23 3477:15,20transformation3438:2,8,20,24,253482:7 3495:2,2,73416:12 3416:2,7,143476:17,23 3477:15,203401:143439:4,7 3442:203511:133436:1 3441:5,53486:4,9,12,17transformation3438:2,3 3454:3 3456:53411:19,25 3412:123446:13 3442:153489:5,16 3490:1,7trager 3432:7,12,133466:16 3446:163411:19,25 3412:123451:13 3462:133499:16 3482:213499:1,6 3482:163466:16 3456:13411:19,25 3412:123451:13 3462:133499:1,6 3482:213499:1,6 3482:213499:1,6 3482:213418:5 3421:213466:11 3470:2,163499:1,6 34			,		types 5451.10
testimony 3455:223419:1 3431:13419:1 3431:1Thamae 3448:9,253466:22 3471:113466:22 3471:11Thamae's 3448:163488:15,18 3490:143419:1 341:15 3485:173419:1 341:15 3485:173419:1 341:15 3485:173419:1 3448:163419:1 3448:19 3505:25Tim 3473:1,22 3474:33410:21 3402:73472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233475:11,14,25transcripts 3509:93476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,3203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:4,7,13,203476:12,13,342:123476:4,7,13,203476:12,12,3437:12,133476:13,442:123476:13,442:12 <tr< td=""><td></td><td>5</td><td></td><td></td><td>U</td></tr<>		5			U
Thamae 3448:9,253466:22 3471:113494:13,14 3500:213477:17 3479:2,6,10ultimately 3492:11Thamae's 3448:163481:15 3485:173496:19 3505:25innes 3416:203481:10 3482:21underlines 3494:63416:4 3417:113507:23thik 3401:21 3402:73473:21,22 3474:33479:13 425:23492:2 3492:13underlines 3494:63472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233474:17 3477:3transcript 3448:233409:9,15 3413:143420:6 3460:25thik 3401:21 3402:73476:17,23 3477:5,10transcript 3482:233415:13 3416:18,233478:13 3480:183414:6,15 3415:4,113476:17,23 3477:5,10transcript 3509:93433:2 343:9 3435:23482:7 3489:13415:21 3416:2,7,143477:15 3478:13,223401:143439:4,7 3442:203492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3482:7,20transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123446:11,11 3447:163503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:2Takef 3511:123456:3,25,25thaks 3495:133442:12,2 3445:53486:4,9,12,17tried 343:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,163490:19 3491:1,163439:16 3486:21triggerd 3438:23481:9 3497:63418:5 3421:213450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,163426:17 3428:53488:133429:4,93442:17 3446:33418:5 3421:213466:11 3470:2,163490:15 3510:10,10,17Trg 3425:17 3428:53488:133429:4,9 <td></td> <td></td> <td>1</td> <td></td> <td></td>			1		
Thamae's 3448:16 thank 3409:13 3414:83481:15 3485:17 3486:19 3505:253501:5 times 3416:203481:10 3482:21 3489:22 3492:13underlines 3494:6 understand 3402:163416:4 3417:11 3420:6 3460:253507:23 think 3401:21 3402:7 3472:4 3473:8think 3401:21 3402:7 3472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:23 3472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:23 3475:11,14,253474:17 3477:3 transcript 3489:22 3492:13 transcript 3448:23 3474:17 3477:33409:9,15 3413:14 3415:13 3416:18,23 3474:9 3475:1,14,253472:4 3473:8 3482:7 3489:13414:6,15 3415:4,11 3415:21 3416:2,7,143475:17,13 2477:5,10 3477:15 3478:13,22transcript 3509:9 transcript 3509:93482:7 3489:1 3492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,13 3416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3482:7,20 3482:17 3433:1transcript 3442:19 3482:25 3483:10,203503:7 3509:6 3511:133432:17 3433:1 3442:21,22 3445:53482:12,5 3483:10,20 3448:12,9,17 3485:53443:2 Travel 3511:123446:11,11 3447:16 3449:8 3454:3 3456:93411:19,25 3412:12 3415:10 3416:23447:12,5,6,16 3442:12,2,6,163489:5,16 3490:1,7 3490:19 3491:1,16trigger 3433:7,12,13 3439:16 3486:21 trigger 3433:7,12,133460:7,12 3463:14 3460:7,12 3463:14 3460:7,12 3463:143429:4,91 3422:8,17 3426:11 3422:12,153466:11 3470:2,16 3442:133499:19 3497:6 3492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21 3439:16 3486:21 trigger 3433:123429:4,9 3428:13 3429:14,19 3437:18 3429:14,19 3437:18 3429:14,19 3437:183475:2 3476:15 3483:133429:4,9344:17 346:3 3442:17 3446:3 3442:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:2 3476:15 3477:19			(A)) RETOINT (R		
thank 3409:13 3414:8 3416:4 3417:11 3420:6 3460:253486:19 3505:25 3507:23times 3416:20 Tip 3473:21,22 3474:3 3475:11,14,253489:22 3492:13 transcript 3448:23 3474:17 3477:3understand 3402:16 3409:9,15 3413:143420:6 3460:25 3472:4 3473:8 3409:4 3413:23think 3401:21 3402:7 3409:4 3413:23stop:1,23 3475:11,14,25stop:1,23 3475:11,14,25stop:1,23 3475:11,14,25stop:1,3489:12 3475:17,23 3477:5,10stop:1,3489:12 3476:17,23 3477:5,10stop:1,3439:13 3475:17,23 3477:5,10stop:1,3439:13 3475:17,23 3477:5,10stop:1,3439:13 3476:17,23 3477:5,10stop:1,3439:14 3439:14,22,20stop:1,3439:14,3439:3435:4 3439:14,22,203482:7 3489:1 3492:21 3495:2,2,7 3409:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,13 3436:1 3441:5,5stop:1,73483:10,20 3482:25 3483:10,20stop:1,13442:19 3443:2stop:1,13442:19 3443:23507:7 509:6 3509:6 3511:13stop:2,163 3436:1 3441:5,5stop:2,163 3482:25 3483:10,20stop:2,163 3489:5,16 3490:1,7 3489:5,16 3490:1,7stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:1,16stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:1,163411:19,25 3412:12 3422:8,17 3426:11 3422:8,17 3426:11 3422:8,17 3426:11stop:2,3476:15 3466:11 3470:2,16stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:1,16stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:1,19,21stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:1,19,21stop:2,163 3490:19 3491:2,153432:13 242:8,17 3426:13 3439:16 3442:6,8 3439:16 3442:6,8stop:2,3476:15 3483:13stop:2,163 3492:4,9stop:2,163 3492:4,9stop:2,173 3428:13 3422:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19stop:2,163 3492:15stop:2,163 3492	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	8-1 (PSA) N		A Designed and the second s	
3416:4 3417:113507:23Tip 3473:21,22 3474:3transcript 3448:233409:9,15 3413:143420:6 3460:25think 3401:21 3402:73474:9,13 3475:1,63474:17 3477:33415:13 3416:18,233472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233475:11,14,25transcript 3509:93433:2 3434:9 3435:43478:13 3480:183414:6,15 3415:4,113476:17,23 3477:5,10transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253482:7 3489:13415:21 3416:2,7,143477:15 3478:13,223401:143439:4,7 3442:203492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:53503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:53511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:53411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,163496:15 3510:10,17trigger 3432:15trigger 3432:15trigger 3432:153439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22				1 - 14 17 1	
3420:6 3460:25 3472:4 3473:8think 3401:21 3402:73474:9,13 3475:1.63474:17 3477:33415:13 3416:18,233472:4 3473:8 3478:13 3480:183409:4 3413:233475:11,14,25transcripts 3509:93433:2 3434:9 3435:43482:7 3489:1 3492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133476:17,23 3477:5,10transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253492:21 3495:2,2,7 3503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13480:18,25 3482:7,203401:143439:4,7 3442:203451:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5transport 3442:193446:11,11 3447:163503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:93511:133436:1 3441:5,53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163456:13 3459:55that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:5,16 3490:1,7trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93411:19,25 3412:123450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,163439:16 3486:213466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:213481:9 3497:63422:8,17 3426:113466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:17 3428:53431:8 3439:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:133429:4,93422:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:133494:113464:7 3466:12,15,223444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19tod 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22 <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>					
3472:4 3473:83409:4 3413:233475:11,14,25transcripts 3509:93433:2 3434:9 3435:43478:13 3480:183414:6,15 3415:4,113476:17,23 3477:5,10transformation3438:5,8,20,24,253482:7 3489:13415:21 3416:2,7,143477:15 3478:13,223401:143439:4,7 3442:203492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3482:7,20transport 3442:193446:11,11 3447:163503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:93511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:5that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19trid 3434:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16triggerd 3438:23481:9 3497:63418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:1 3470:2,163490:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understandable 3492:73439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:133429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22		think 3401:21 3402:7	-	-	-
3482:7 3489:13415:21 3416:2,7,143477:15 3478:13,223401:143439:4,7 3442:203492:21 3495:2,2,73416:22 3417:2,133480:18,25 3482:7,203430:143439:4,7 3442:203503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23446:11,11 3447:163511:133436:1 3441:5,53442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,173443:23458:14,19 3459:511119,25 3412:123446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,193466:16 3474:93466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,163439:16 3486:213466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:213481:9 3497:63422:8,17 3426:113466:11 3470:2,163496:15 3510:10,17113439:16 3486:21113439:16 3442:6,83472:2 3474:11,19,213483:133483:133429:4,93431:8 3439:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,1910d 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	3472:4 3473:8	3409:4 3413:23		transcripts 3509:9	3433:2 3434:9 3435:4
3492:21 3495:2,2,7 3503:7 3509:6 3511:133416:22 3417:2,13 3432:17 3433:1 3432:17 3433:1 3432:17 3433:1 3436:1 3441:5,53480:18,25 3482:7,20 3482:25 3483:10,20 3482:25 3483:10,20transport 3442:19 3443:23446:11,11 3447:16 3449:8 3454:3 3456:93511:13 3436:1 3441:5,53436:1 3441:5,5 3442:21,22 3445:53482:25 3483:10,20 3482:25 3483:10,203443:2 3443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:9 3443:2thanks 3495:13 3411:19,25 3412:123442:21,22 3445:5 3446:8 3447:2,5,6,163486:4,9,12,17 3487:6,21 3488:17,19traversed 3462:16 tried 3434:12 3480:163456:1,3459:5 3466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:2 3415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:1 3450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16 3490:19 3491:1,16triggerd 3438:2 3439:16 3486:21 triggers 3432:153481:9 3497:6 understandable 3492:7 understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:11 3428:11 3429:12,15 3433:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16 3472:2 3474:11,19,21 3477:19 3478:10,19Tip's 3488:22 told 3411:5 3417:21TRT 3425:17 3428:5 3492:103431:8 3439:3 3429:4,93444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	3478:13 3480:18	3414:6,15 3415:4,11	3476:17,23 3477:5,10	transformation	3438:5,8,20,24,25
3503:7 3509:63432:17 3433:13482:25 3483:10,203443:23449:8 3454:3 3456:93511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:5that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19tried 3434:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7tried 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16triggerd 3438:23481:9 3497:63418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203433:16 3442:6,83472:2 3474:11,19,213483:133429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:133429:4,93442:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	3482:7 3489:1	3415:21 3416:2,7,14	3477:15 3478:13,22	3401:14	3439:4,7 3442:20
3511:133436:1 3441:5,53484:1,9,17 3485:5Travel 3511:123456:23,25,25thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:5that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19tried 3434:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7tried 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203433:133472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	3492:21 3495:2,2,7	3416:22 3417:2,13	3480:18,25 3482:7,20	transport 3442:19	
thanks 3495:133442:21,22 3445:53486:4,9,12,17traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:5that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19traversed 3462:163458:14,19 3459:53411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7tried 3434:12 3480:163466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:133429:4,93442:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22		3432:17 3433:1			3449:8 3454:3 3456:9
that's 3400:11 3404:163446:8 3447:2,5,6,163487:6,21 3488:17,19tried 3434:12 3480:163460:7,12 3463:143411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16triggered 3438:23481:9 3497:63418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:17 3428:53431:8 3439:33434:14,19 3437:183472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22			, ,		3456:23,25,25
3411:19,25 3412:123447:18 3448:133489:5,16 3490:1,7trigger 3433:7,12,133466:16 3474:93415:10 3416:23450:16 3456:13490:19 3491:1,16triggerd 3438:23481:9 3497:63418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understandable 3492:73428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203434:14,19 3437:183472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	thanks 3495:13	3442:21,22 3445:5	3486:4,9,12,17	traversed 3462:16	
3415:10 3416:2 3418:5 3421:213450:16 3456:1 3458:4 3459:193490:19 3491:1,16 3492:6,21 3495:2,16triggered 3438:2 3439:16 3486:213481:9 3497:6 understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:11 3428:11 3429:12,153461:13 3462:13 3466:11 3470:2,163496:15 3510:10,17 Tip's 3488:22triggered 3438:2 3439:16 3442:6,83481:9 3497:6 understandable 3492:73434:14,19 3437:18 3439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:15 3475:2 3476:15Tip's 3488:22 3483:13triggers 3432:15 today 3412:3 3481:3 3429:4,93431:8 3439:3 3429:4,93444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22					<i>'</i>
3418:5 3421:213458:4 3459:193492:6,21 3495:2,163439:16 3486:21understandable 3492:73422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understandable 3492:73428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:17 3428:53431:8 3439:33434:14,19 3437:183472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22	,				
3422:8,17 3426:113461:13 3462:133496:15 3510:10,17triggers 3432:15understanding 3426:203428:11 3429:12,153466:11 3470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:17 3428:53431:8 3439:33434:14,19 3437:183472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13tud 3411:5 3417:213494:113444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19tod 3411:5 3417:213494:113494:11			,	22	
3428:113429:12,153466:113470:2,16Tip's 3488:22TRT 3425:173428:53431:83439:33434:14,193437:183472:23474:11,19,21today 3412:33481:33429:4,93442:173446:33439:163442:6,83475:23476:153483:13true 3451:253459:83454:43458:83466:33444:113446:10,123477:193478:10,19told3411:53417:213494:113464:73466:12,15,22					
3434:14,19 3437:183472:2 3474:11,19,21today 3412:3 3481:33429:4,93442:17 3446:33439:16 3442:6,83475:2 3476:153483:13true 3451:25 3459:83454:4 3458:8 3463:33444:11 3446:10,123477:19 3478:10,19told 3411:5 3417:213494:113464:7 3466:12,15,22					_
3439:16 3442:6,8 3475:2 3476:15 3483:13 true 3451:25 3459:8 3454:4 3458:8 3463:3 3444:11 3446:10,12 3477:19 3478:10,19 told 3411:5 3417:21 3494:11 3464:7 3466:12,15,22		,	.		
3444:11 3446:10,12 3477:19 3478:10,19 told 3411:5 3417:21 3494:11 3464:7 3466:12,15,22	-		· ·	<i>'</i>	
r = 3/(16)(3/16)(3/16)(7/5) $r = 3/(3/(5))(3/16)(7/$	3446:13,19 3447:2,5	3482:5 3483:17	3421:21 3424:19	Truly 3468:7 3484:22	3467:18 3468:23
3447:9,11 3495:4 3540:14 3432:8 3464:2 111111111111111111111111111111111111				v	
3450:4,8 3451:4,18 3503:9 3509:6 3465:19 try 3438:10,13,14 3472:20 3474:16	·				
3452:12 3453:13,15 thinking 3484:24 tolerate 3410:20 3467:24 3483:6 3505:20				•	
3454:5,10 3455:6 thinks 3439:20 Tolokele 3493:17 trying 3434:22 3435:4 understands 3415:12	-	0			
3459:8,16 3460:1,13 third 3434:14 tomorrow 3470:16 3444:18 3445:6 3438:8	-			• •	
3460:17 3462:14 thought 3402:20 3510:14 3453:21 3457:2 understood 3438:15					
3463:5 3464:16 3405:2 3435:3 3449:4 tools 3493:9 3468:22 3495:12 3453:10 3484:9		-			
3465:16 3468:19 3459:11 3460:4 top 3422:20 3425:13 Tshwete 3402:1 3405:7 undertaken 3490:20		3459:11 3460:4			
3469:22 3471:14,19 thousand 3477:18 3426:3 3443:14 TT3 3509:17 unfairly 3493:14	3469:22 3471:14,19	thousand 3477:18	3426:3 3443:14		unfairly 3493:14
3473:19 3474:17 threat 3418:16,17 3444:4,10 3455:2 TT5 3466:1 unfortunate 3409:23	3473:19 3474:17	threat 3418:16,17	3444:4,10 3455:2	TT5 3466:1	unfortunate 3409:23

				Page 3527
unfortunately 3422:14	wait 3410:9	ways 3452:2 3490:9	wise 3452:23	3442:22 3492:23
union 3496:5	walk 3466:20	weapon 3480:13	wish 3452:21	3497:17
unions 3497:2,4,12	want 3400:5 3409:10	weaponry 3484:5,14	wishes 3488:21 3511:8	yesterday's 3492:17
3507:22 3508:10,14	3410:16,17 3415:14	3489:10	withdraw 3417:22	you'll 3422:16 3425:3
union's 3497:8	3416:21 3422:25	weapons 3471:11	3448:21	3426:1 3431:4
unit 3459:21 3481:5	3429:17 3434:2,23	3472:1 3478:2,4	witness 3413:11	3465:10 3480:22
3482:9,18	3435:15 3443:2,5	Wednesday 3476:25	3415:12,14 3417:2,23	you're 3400:3,3
units 3462:18 3474:5	3445:4,13 3446:2	3480:19	3438:7 3440:20	3404:15 3408:12
3475:17 3476:20	3447:20,23,23,24	week 3489:19	3441:7 3442:3	3409:5,9 3411:20
3483:6 3487:25	3449:6,7,11,11	well-planned 3419:6	3448:15,20 3457:11	3414:23 3415:4,12
unkind 3438:25	3453:17 3457:3,5,23	went 3415:19 3431:5	3466:6 3473:14	3421:7,18,19,21
unnumbered 3420:11	3458:14 3459:17	3434:11,17 3444:21	3502:6 3509:15	3433:25 3434:2,21
unsuccessfully 3434:13	3462:2 3465:7 3466:8	3459:1 3485:15,15	3510:11,13	3435:4 3437:13
untoward 3505:24	3466:25 3467:24,24	3491:23	witnesses 3417:7	3439:1,5 3440:8,16
3506:8 3508:25	3467:25 3468:3	weren't 3415:3	3440:14 3455:18	3441:5 3442:10
urgency 3494:6	3474:13 3476:23	west 3462:21 3493:8	witness's 3417:4	3445:5,6,11 3446:23
usage 3463:4	3478:12 3480:12,13	we'll 3404:9 3410:9	witness's 3510:15	3447:17 3448:14
use 3410:22 3412:5	3481:1,1 3483:10	3417:4,6,6 3445:8	women 3410:18,23	3453:7,12 3456:1
3421:20 3435:7	3484:18 3492:13	3485:14 3487:12,16	wonder 3409:3	3457:8 3462:14
3476:8 3480:12,13,14	3494:1 3501:12	we're 3403:18 3414:12	won't 3422:24 3445:13	3465:16 3469:17
3485:6 3501:12,13,14	3503:4 3509:19,22	3418:11 3422:17	3487:10	3471:12
3506:8,16	wanted 3416:14	3458:5,17 3465:21	word 3411:6,7,8,11	you've 3409:4,11
useful 3417:2	3454:19,20 3463:6	3487:20	3412:5,17 3485:7	3414:6,7,15 3416:14
usually 3451:7	3466:11 3483:12	we've 3408:14,14	words 3413:2 3475:7	3417:22 3419:18
utilise 3435:22 3436:21	3488:25 3509:18	3447:19 3449:10	3485:7 3499:9	3428:18 3438:2
3436:24 3469:17	wanting 3447:17	3453:22 3458:16,17	3503:17 3505:2	3442:1,11 3448:2
3486:1 3506:22	wants 3415:20 3416:3	3459:16 3462:21	3507:10	3449:12,16 3452:12
utilised 3431:18	3420:12 3457:7	3477:1 3486:25	work 3411:18 3487:4	3455:23 3456:18
	3459:7 3460:17	we'll 3506:20	3506:17	3464:20 3469:13
	warning 3410:16	we're 3505:18 3507:17 3508:11	worked 3474:3 3493:18 workers 3493:2 3496:5	3478:20 3480:18 3481:3
validity 3400:12 validly 3506:16	3430:19 3431:5,21 3432:2,7 3434:9	we've 3493:4 3507:4	working 3506:11	3481:3
variety 3482:10	3442:23 3443:1	3509:6	worry 3410:15 3414:20	Z
various 3424:24,25	warrant 3448:9,16,18	what's 3438:24 3480:1	3415:19	zone 3425:24,25 3426:1
3441:11 3462:18	3448:24,25 3449:6,8	3480:7,12	worse 3410:11	3426:2,19 3450:7,15
3476:20 3483:6	3449:14	whilst 3455:10	wouldn't 3468:13	3450:18 3466:13,16
3490:12	wasn't 3407:5 3417:21	white 3461:17 3462:7	would've 3491:5	3450.10 5400.15,10
vehicles 3467:6	3430:3 3434:6 3437:5	who's 3407:12 3450:22	3510:15	0
veld 3447:11	3442:4 3454:13	3458:12	wrapping 3473:2	000 3429:21 3430:7
ventilate 3492:9	3473:19 3510:4	wide 3447:11	writing 3487:15	3477:19 3496:7
versions 3456:16	wastage 3466:7	widespread 3496:14	3494:21	001676 3504:9
versus 3408:7	waste 3425:9	wire 3426:9,14,18,25	written 3489:7	001679 3503:14
Vey 3496:3	water 3461:12,13,13,16	3431:8,25 3432:1,3,5	wrong 3403:16 3404:4	001702 3502:1
video 3442:5 3447:22	3461:18,19 3462:4,5	3432:6,9,13,14,19,22	3412:23 3413:12,25	09:30 3511:1
3471:9,13,18	3462:6,7,7,11,11,12	3432:24 3433:6,10,14	3414:3 3434:11	09:31 3400:2
videos 3447:21	3462:25 3463:4,7,8	3433:18,19,22	3463:9 3480:9	09:51 3408:12
view 3446:18,21 3456:6	way 3402:21 3404:15	3434:10,11 3435:8,19	3485:15 3491:24	
3493:3 3506:16	3406:21 3408:23	3435:22,25 3436:6,13	3498:9	1
views 3456:8 3490:22	3413:20 3416:8,14	3437:2,8,11,13,22		1 3404:22 3408:17,17
3497:1	3422:25 3431:18	3438:3 3439:10,11,15	Y	3421:10 3427:11
VIP 3437:4	3432:15 3433:8	3440:7,24,25 3441:9	year 3493:24 3509:9	3438:3 3439:12,12,12
visit 3467:15	3440:16 3448:13,22	3441:19 3444:19,23	3510:21,23 3511:13	3439:16 3440:6,22
vis-à-vis 3410:2	3453:10 3455:6	3445:22 3458:9	years 3401:15 3436:4	3441:11 3443:19
vocabulary 3411:9	3456:9,20 3458:14	3464:14 3467:1,7,9	3493:18	3444:14 3447:18
	3460:8,21 3463:23	3467:21,21 3468:4,10	yesterday 3407:3	3453:3 3455:9,10
<u> </u>	3472:12 3478:25	3468:12,24 3469:4	3411:5 3412:3	3458:17 3467:12,19
wage 3492:24 3496:4	3490:13,14,19	3509:16	3432:18,18 3433:1,25	3467:22 3468:22
3497:3,11	3492:10 3493:19	wires 3467:16 3468:25	3434:1 3436:1	3469:1,20 3470:7
L.,	I		I	

Page 3528

				Faye 5520
3479:4 3488:17	197 3468:10,10	6 3428:19 3498:14		
3489:2,3 3504:16	3469:12	3509:17		
10 3427:21 3511:2,5	1999 3402:2	5509.17		
10 3427.21 3511.2,5 10th 3420:4,15 3421:3	1999 3402.2	7		
	2			
3421:25 3422:7,9,13		7 3420:19 3421:7,10		
3502:10 3503:3	2 3421:5,6,16,18	3500:17		
10:11 3418:18	3422:14,19 3428:22	70 3429:3,10 3430:23		
10:31 3429:16	3429:14 3443:25	77 3443:6 3444:22		
10:51 3439:18	3444:11,14,15 3455:9	78 3430:22,24 3431:2		
11 3444:24 3479:18	3455:10,24 3457:25			
3496:8 3498:14	3458:17,18,22,24,25	8		
11(7) 3409:3,15	3462:20,22 3463:1	8 3493:18 3496:9		
11:23 3445:10	3469:21 3470:7	3500:17 3509:16		
11:43 3452:25	3504:17,21,22	8(1) 3498:18		
116 3447:12	20 3400:1 3478:14,15	8.1 3498:14 3499:3		
12 3510:14	2002 3405:7	8.2 3499:7		
12th 3500:18	2012 3400:1 3420:5,16	80 3423:6		
12:03 3463:20	3465:12 3470:9			
12:23 3472:9	3471:8 3488:1	9		
12:43 3480:23	3500:18	9.1 3499:18		
13 3471:8	21 3478:23	9.2 3499:22		
13th 3470:11 3484:19	21 3476.23 21st 3510:23 3511:1,6	9:30 3470:16		
3503:21	215 3447:15 3450:5	98 3427:3,6,6 3429:19		
13:30 3511:4	213 3447.13 3430.3 22% 3493:10,12	· · ·		
	-	3430:6,9 3458:10		
13:38 3489:5	3496:8,12	/ 31* 2002 84		
13:58 3497:23	235 3461:14,15,17	A DETON	20.00	
135 3424:16,18,21,22	3462:5,14	E ceva	China	
3424:23	236 3461:7,10,11,21	to and ET to	I A C.	
136 3424:25 3427:8,10	237 3461:24,25 3462:1			
137 3425:10 3426:23	3462:3	home, prine on 10	have	
138 3428:3,4,5	262 3402:9 3407:16	marty Kely	woth	
139 3425:18 3428:8,9	3498:5		7 1 0 C	
14th 3470:11	2884 3477:3,7 3478:14	HIVE FOR JUS	TICE	
14:18 3507:25	2885 3477:3 3478:15			
140 3428:15	3478:23 3479:18			
142 3428:21	2886 3477:3 3479:4			
144 3429:2,6,7				
1463 3448:8,25	3			
15 3445:8	3 3423:19 3429:3,21			
15th 3448:24 3470:10	3430:7 3458:24,25			
3470:12.14	3459:1 3462:20,25			
16 3465:12 3486:20	3465:12,15 3496:9			
16th 3421:24 3423:2,4	3500:3			
3423:16 3424:19	3.2.1 3504:9			
3429:19 3430:14				
3429:19 3430:14 3432:23 3451:22	31st 3511:4			
3452:5 3464:19	4			
3466:5 3467:2 3470:9	4 3477:19 3479:4			
3477:25 3481:12	45 3425:12 3426:15,24			
3487:25 3490:21	3427:20,23			
3491:24 3494:8				
1619 3474:17	5			
1620 3474:17	50 3431:13,13			
166 3503:15	53 3425:18 3426:14,18			
1665 3421:1	3427:1 3428:2,12			
167 3503:15	57 3429:9			
1679 3503:16				
1723 3422:4,6	6			
	1	1	1	1