RealTime Transcriptions

TRANSCRIPTION OF THE

COMMISSION OF INQUIRY

MARIKANA

BEFORE TRIBUNAL

THE HONOURABLE MR JUSTICE FARLAM (RETIRED) - CHAIRPERSON MR TOKOTA SC MR HEMRAJ SC

HELD ON

DAY 2 3 OCTOBER 2012 PAGES 66 TO 111

HELD AT

CIVIC CENTRE, RUSTENBURG, NORTH WEST PROVINCE



© REALTIME TRANSCRIPTIONS

64 10th Avenue, Highlands North, Johannesburg P O Box 721, Highlands North, 2037 Tel: 011-440-3647 Fax: 011-440-9119 Cell: 083 273-5335 E-mail: realtime@pixie.co.za

<u>realtime@pixie.co.za</u>

Web Address: http://mysite.mweb.co.za/residents/pak06278



Page 66

[PROCEEDINGS ON 3 OCTOBER 2012]

- 2 [09:04] CHAIRPERSON: Good morning, everybody,
- 3 the Commission resumes. What we had planned to do this
- 4 morning is to give the parties an opportunity to state
- 5 their versions. We understand that the police have
- 6 prepared a PowerPoint presentation indicating their
- 7 version. I don't know whether they're prepared to show it
- to us this morning but I would I hope they are. And then 8
- 9 we have the witnesses from the inspection in loco, those
- 10 who pointed places out to us. This is the inspection in
- 11 loco which we did on the 1st of October, first day, relating
- 12 to the events on the 16th of August in the vicinity of the
- 13 koppie at Wonderkop, the flat area of land in front of it

14 and then on what was described as the "klein koppie", the

smaller koppie behind. Those witnesses we – witnesses who 15

pointed out places at the request of the evidence leaders 16

17 will testify.

18

19

20

21

1

I understand also that certain other documents and so forth will be put before us, but I want to begin by inviting the representatives of the parties to present, if they are able to do so, their versions at this stage. It's

22 appropriate to call -

23 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman -

CHAIRPERSON: 24 Yes?

25 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Dumisa Ntsebeza. Mr even the footage of what happened on that day is known

- because it is known in the United States, in Russia and
- everywhere else. Let me tell you, Mr Chairman, that when
- my attorneys visited those areas in Lusikisiki and the
- 5 border, there is not even radio communication. Now we are
- 6 going to be here, seeing what we have seen as
- 7 commissioners, as leaders of evidence, as attorneys, as
- 8 everybody else. There are people who are related to the
- 9 dead who have not even seen video footages of what happened
- 10 and therefore we are making a plea, Mr Chairman, we are
- 11 making a plea that, whilst expedition - I've got it right
- this time, Mr Chairman where expedition is important, 12
- 13 there should be a level of sensitivity.

14 Can you indulge me and I take you back, Mr 15 Chairman and members of the Commission, to Monday. On Monday you were given a script, now it is clear, you were

- 17 given a script which assumed the presence of those whom we
- are representing. You were even made to say, I have been
- told that the majority of you are present here except for 20 those who come from Lesotho and Swaziland. Now we know
- 21 there wasn't anybody here. It can't be correct, Mr
- 22 Chairman, in our humble and respectful submission, that we
- 23 enquire into the dead and that their families are not here.
- 24 It is your duty, Mr Chairman, with respect - and I say so
 - taking into account section 16 of the Regulations. I don't

Page 67

19

8

19

20

21

22 23

24

25

- Chairman, I crave your indulgence to make yet another
- submission and again it is a submission that follows what 2
- 3 you advised us on Monday after refusing our application for
- 4 a postponement and that was that the Department of Social
- 5 Development, you had been told, was making arrangements for
- the families. I thought it would be appropriate for us, 6
- before we resume today's proceedings, for you to be given a 7
- 8 sense of where we are at -
- 9 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.
- 10 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: - with regard to that.
- 11 CHAIRPERSON: Yes.
- 12 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: And may preface my
- 13 remarks by saying, Mr Chairman, that for us, as well as for
- our clients, it is a matter of grave, grave importance that 14
- 15 this Commission should not proceed in their absence. This
- 16 Commission is about dead people, those people who died
- 17 between the requisite dates. I would – I'm sure Mr Semenya
- 18 will speak for his clients - I would be very concerned if
- 19 the widows of those who died and the relatives of those who
- 20 died are absolutely absent. This is about, a commission
- 21 into their deaths, I mean - I see everything else about
- Lonmin and what else could have been done, but this is 22
- 23 about those people who died.
- There is an assumption, Mr Chairman and please, 24
- I know you will indulge me there is an assumption that

Page 69 want to be seen to be disparaging or saying anything about

- the Chairperson or about this Commission, I make these in
- 3 earnest and I say to, Mr Chairman, please let all the
- 4 parties which it is contemplated ought to be present, let
- them be present. Let's all proceed with a Commission which
- wanted to get the job done, but that job could only be done 6
- 7
 - if we are seen to be sensitive.

You yourself, Mr Chairman, expressed very

9 passionately - and I know you meant it - you expressed very

passionately about how this Commission is seeking to do 10

11 everything in its power to ensure that justice is done. It

12 should be justice done to the families of those who fell in

13 the main and if they are not here, what are we doing here?

14 Is it asking too much, Mr Chairman, that give us a few 15

days, these people are here. Am I being obstructionist?

16 Am I kicking for touch, as one of my colleagues submitted

17 to you? Do I look like I'm kicking for touch? Is there no

18 sense in what I'm saying?

I seek to persuade you, Mr Chairman, that the people who are affected - Mr Mpofu will speak for himself, but the people who are affected, it is critically important that they should be present in proceedings about those - I don't want to make a fine point of it but that is - that is what I want to submit.

Now, let me tell you what happened, Mr Chairman,

Page 73

Page 70

- because I think it is my duty to advise you. You were
- 2 advised - and I mean to impute no dishonesty to those who
- 3 advise you - you were advised on Monday that the Department
- 4 of Social Development is arranging for the families to be
- 5 present and indeed my learned friend Mr Madlanga brought
- two social workers to us and my attorney and the two social 6
- 7 workers got into an interaction and this is the situation.
- The Department those two social workers made it very 8
- 9 clear that they have no mandate or any instructions to
- 10 provide any transportation of any of those families from
- wherever they are to this venue. Now, that's what they 11
- said. They said they have only a mandate to provide 12
- services of a counselling nature when they are here. In 13
- 14 fact, when they came to the attorney they said, where are
- 15
- these people, so that we can do our job. And they had to
- be told the expectation from us is that the government 16
- through your Department is going to do three things, in the 17
- 18 main. One, it is going to locate all the families,
- 19 wherever they are, make arrangements for their
- 20 transportation to this venue - and that can only be what
- 21 anyone should expect reasonably, because you cannot assume
- 22 that because you have had this conversation then they must
- 23 come from wherever. By definition, they are poor people.
- 24 Now, that is what my attorney actually expressed 25
 - himself very clearly to the social workers. We expect or

- yesterday and then those who instruct me have indicated
- that this is the minimum that we request. Contact must be
- made, they must be fetched, they must be brought to your
- Commission. When they are here, they must be reasonably
- 5 accommodated. Those who might - we don't know who might
- 6 even feel that they need counselling on an ongoing basis,
- 7 that must be provided. It must be, please - some of these
- 8 people are going to see, and we submit it is important that
- 9 they do so, they are going to see these video footages for
- 10 the first time. It's going to be traumatic to them.
- 11 Provision must be made for people who'll be there on an
- 12 ongoing basis to make sure that if they break down whilst
- 13 we are watching the footages, they are able to be attended
- 14 to. That's what we did in the Truth and Reconciliation
- 15 Commission, we anticipated that due to the nature of what
- is going to happen, people must be in place to make sure
- 17 that in the event there are those kinds of breakdowns, the
- people are able to be attended to.

These are not just figures that we must refer to, these are people. These are people who lost their loved ones. This Commission expressed itself on Monday as a

- 22 caring Commission. I know it should be. Mr Chairman,
- 23 please allow me to - I mean, allow me to express this. You
- 24 yourself - and allow me the liberty to say so - you
 - yourself know that in the dark days in the '80s I used to

Page 71

19

20

21

3

4

5

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

22

23

24

- 1 that is what we understood – that when government says,
- 2 through its Department of Social Development, it's going to
- 3 provide for the families, that the families are going to be
- 4 fetched from all those places, if that it took them three
- 5 days to reach them - Thursday, Friday, Saturday, Sunday,
- four days. Let them be fetched from there, let them be 6
- 7 brought to this venue. For the duration of the hearing
- 8 here, let them be accommodated in some reasonable
- 9 accommodation, that's what I would expect. And whilst they
- are here, let them be fed. Let all those decent things 10
- that you and I are entitled to or at least reasonably 11
- 12 expecting should be done to us at a venue like this, let it
- 13 happen to those people. It's a government appointed
- Commission of Inquiry and let this Commission never go down 14
- 15 in history as a Commission that never cared for those for
- whom particular care should be given to. And that's what 16
- 17 my attorney said to the social workers, then the social
- workers told them, we have no mandate, we haven't got a 18
- 19 mandate like that.

20

Have the Commission - have the individual

- 21 families been contacted? Now that we've told the Commission, and we're not lying, that they had not been 22
- 23 told, even about today - no, we have not contacted them.
- 24 Contact only began yesterday - we will be able to make this
- 25 by way of affidavit, if needs be - contact was made

brief you all the way from Cape Town to come and apply for people to be released from detention, even though the laws were draconian, and you'd say but these laws will not permit this and I would say, go into that court and fight for the release of this person, don't tell me about what

the law provides - and you did it and in one case you were 6 7 successful, in spite of those laws. 8

I am instructed to come and persuade you with the same passion that this is a moment when this Commission should redeem itself. We cannot, with a clear conscience, proceed without those who are affected. Make sure, Mr Chairman, that your Commission is enabled by those who instituted it, to deal with all the participants here on the basis that they are cared for, on the basis that everything is done to provide for them that is reasonable and within the mandate of this Commission.

So what is our request? It will not be proper for anyone to give a version – I mean even if they were not eye witnesses, if Mr Semenya is going to give a version on behalf of his clients, they are not here, they are not here to react, like they were not here yesterday to know that this is where Mamboes died, this is where one person died. I saw him personally yesterday, a body was found, a body was found here, a body was found there. If they say we don't have the courage to go round and make those

Page 76

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

1

4

7

8

9

10

15

25

Page 74

inspections, let it be their choice. 1

That is done now, that's over. May I just plead that before we contemplate proceeding, we must take into account that we have an obligation, all of us here - all of us, even those who represent the Constitution, all of us here have an obligation to help these people. I want to be able to, now and again when a version has been given, to go to my people there and say, you have seen that there, is there anything that you want to say about it? They are not here. Something about that, Mr Chairman, members of the

We can use the day fruitfully, as far as I understood. I think the day, there was a process or as procedure thing where we could exchange, that day can be fruitfully used. I am not obstructionist, in fact I resent any indication that I'm raising these issues because I'm just being obstructionist. I do so because I feel for those people. I do so, if you allow me, because there was a commission not unlike this one, in which I served, in which we put the interests of the victims first. Those are my submissions, Chair.

Commission, darkens - and I implore you.

CHAIRPERSON: Is there anything that you wish to say in response to this, Mr Madlanga or those appearing with you? And when you have finished, if you propose saying something, I'll then give the

for the sake of completeness -

2 ADV MADLANGA SC: And may I say of course by saying that I am by no means suggesting that Mr Ntsebeza was suggesting otherwise.

> ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Not at all

6 ADV MADLANGA SC: I know, I just meant to

7 give clarity on the matter.

8 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, just by 9 way of completeness, I've since been advised that in fact

10 after we had had this communication from the social

11 workers, my attorneys yesterday were sitting on the 12 Department of Social Development and this is the latest.

13 The latest is that they have now come to an accord in terms

whereof they undertake that they will make sure that the

families - I'm sorry about this device -

[09:24] They make sure that the families are here at the

17 latest, Monday the 8th. Now to that extent - but I would

really like it to be pursued. They will be here, they will

19 be kept in reasonable accommodation. They will be fed.

20 They will be transferred from wherever their venue is to 21 this Commission and all of those things. But that's

22 detail. But as at the end of the day yesterday, because

23 there was constant pressure being put by my attorney, that

24 is where we are at this stage.

> CHAIRPERSON: Mr Madlanga suggested that

Page 75

25

6

7

8

9

10

13

14

15

representatives of the other parties an opportunity to

2 speak also.

3 ADV MADLANGA SC: Mr Chairman,

Commissioners, may I ask perhaps that our other colleagues

5 respond in the meantime? We're just trying to establish

what, how we should deal with the matter. 6

CHAIRPERSON: There are also issues. I understand, in relation to the correctness or otherwise of the information that we were given on Monday, which I

communicated to the parties about the arrangements made by

11 the Department of Social Responsibility but I take the 12 point you made. I invite the other parties to speak.

13 ADV MADLANGA SC: I would deal with that 14 part of it quickly now, Mr Chairman, just to make sure that

no wrong impression is created. I was not party to that 16 advice and I feel that I should make that point because my

17 name was mentioned by my learned friend Mr Ntsebeza. What

18 happened is, after the Commission had risen to go for the

19 in loco inspection, two ladies, unsolicited, approached me

20 and said that they were from the Department of Social

21 Development. I immediately took them to Mr Ntsebeza who

was standing there, down the stairs there and I left them. 22

23 So just to say I was not party to any advice that had been

24 given to anybody. Thank you.

> ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Mr Chairman, may I just

Page 77 I call upon the representatives of the parties to respond,

if they wish to do so, to the submission that Mr Ntsebeza

3 has made. Is there anybody among the representatives of

4 the parties wish to address the Commission on this aspect.

5 I see you are raising your hand, Mr Bizos.

ADV BIZOS SC: Sympathetic to the appeal made by Mr Ntsebeza, and it may well be that the showing of the film which is vital to the families to witness, perhaps it should not be shown, because they have to use my learned friend's word, been deprived of their presence whilst the

the film being shown to them later. I haven't made up my

11 pointing out were done. 12 CHAIRPERSON: There is nothing to prevent

mind in relation to what -

ADV BIZOS SC: Yes.

16 CHAIRPERSON: - Mr Ntsebeza said, but as 17 far as the film is concerned, it could be shown now, and

18 could be shown subsequently to them privately, possibly

19 with appropriate arrangements for counselling at some later

20 stage. Sorry, I am interrupting you.

21 ADV BIZOS SC: Be that as it may in relation to the film, Mr Chairman, we are trying our best

to prepare our work without knowing what the police version 23

24 is. I believe, with respect to my learned friend that

viewing or hearing what the police version is going to be

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

Page 81

Page 78

will be very, very helpful if it happens today. It will

- enable us, Mr Ntsebeza and his team, and everyone else 2
- 3 concerned, to use the time between now and Monday to
- 4 prepare. So don't let us waste the day. It cannot
- 5 prejudice the families if their team conveys to them, if we
- 6 hear it today what the police version is. There will be no
- 7 comfort in it for them but it may be to their benefit that
- we actually hear what the police have to say so that we can 8
- 9 prepare to deal with their version, and this is why I
- believe that we should not miss that opportunity today. 10

11 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Bizos. My 12 colleague, Adv Tokota, wishes to ask you a question, Mr

13 Bizos.

14 ADV TOKOTA SC: Thank you, Mr Chair. If I understood you correctly initially, you indicated that it 15 is important that they should be here when the video 16

17 footage -

18 ADV BIZOS SC: Yes. I have no doubt. I

19 have no doubt.

20 ADV TOKOTA SC: Is it not also important 21 that when the evidence is being led, they should be present

22 to hear what has to be said -

23 ADV BIZOS SC: I agree.

24 ADV TOKOTA SC: - by the policemen.

25 ADV BIZOS SC: I agree.

Page 79

ADV TOKOTA SC: If that is the position, 1

if we proceed today in the absence of these people hearing 2

3 the police giving their version, how does it tally with

your initial -4

10

14

15

17

5 ADV BIZOS SC: Because I understand the

position, Mr Chairman, that there will be no evidence. I 6

7 understand the position that counsel for the Police is

8 going to tell us what their version is going to be. That

9 is a different matter. That can be communicated to

everybody, including Mr Ntsebeza's clients and it will help

11 all of us, in order to use the time available to prepare.

12 It's not going to be – if I understood correctly, it was

13 not going to be evidence that is led.

> ADV TOKOTA SC: Sorry, how is that going to be communicated to you? Do you mean that you will have a conference or is it - the evidence leaders, are they going to make a statement, opening statement, or?

18 ADV BIZOS SC: I haven't been privy to Mr 19 Semenya's thinking, I don't know what he intends doing. I

20 only heard from the evidence leaders that there will be a

21 statement by the Police. If in fact, it is not viva voce

evidence given by police officers, but merely what in broad 22

- terms the Police version is, it can't be to the prejudice 23
- 24 of the families, as weighed against the time being used to
- give us an opportunity to know what we have to we will

have to face so that we can prepare.

2 ADV TOKOTA SC: Is it possible that that

3 can be done through say, call it a pre-trial conference

4 between the representatives of the parties without -

5 ADV BIZOS SC: I would have no objection 6 to it, provided it is recorded, I would not object to that,

it would serve our purposes, if we have the representatives

7

8 of the police officers to say, this is going to be the

9 Police case, and it is recorded in the presence of all of

10 us, it needn't necessarily be a sitting of the Commission

11 but the time, the two days left, it is two days or three,

12 will be usefully utilised in order to progress.

13 ADV TOKOTA SC: Usefully utilised without

14 having to proceed with the proceedings.

15 ADV BIZOS SC: Let us assume that the 16 Commission adjourns, so that there is no evidence, but it's

17 like a pre-trial conference, so to speak, which can be

18 substituted for the hearing of evidence. Provided that

19 takes place, we would have no objection in adopting that

20 procedure. We are interested in getting on. We don't want

21 to deprive the families of any of their fundamental rights. 22

CHAIRPERSON: I think the appropriate

23 thing to do is to ask Mr Semenya whether he is going to

24 respond to the invitation at this stage, or was preparing

to do so, to give a statement to us, what the version of

2

the Police will be.

ADV MATHIBEDI: Good morning, it is T F

3 Mathibedi, on behalf of the South African Police Services.

It has never been our intention, and at this stage, we are

5 not yet ready to present a version of the account of the

6 Police.

7 CHAIRPERSON: So that point then falls

away. I did understand that it was proposed to hand on

from the Bar, without evidence at this stage, the post

10 mortem reports on the, in respect of the people who were

11 shot. It seems to me that that would be very helpful. I

12 can't understand any prejudice being suffered by anybody if

13 that was to take place. It would enable the parties to

14 prepare. There may be technical reasons why it's desirable

15 that they should be handed in rather than just handed over

16 outside the Commission, but I invite Mr Madlanga to address

us on this point. 17

18 ADV MADLANGA: Chair, members of the

19 Commission, well let me directly, initially you invited me 20 to respond to Mr Ntsebeza's application. May I touch on

21 something that Mr Bizos, my learned friend across has

22 touched on, whilst debating with Commissioner Tokota.

23 Quite early on, as soon as he can come on board, my

24 colleague, Mr Semenya, did propose a pre-hearing conference

so the point I too was going to make is that the day would

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

2 3

4

5

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

19

Page 82

not be lost if there were to be a postponement. We, as the

legal representatives, could remain here today and engage 2

3 each other and come up with, or chart a path for ourselves.

4 Also, I just wanted to remind all of us gathered here, of

5 the very logo under which this Commission operates, and it

reads, "Marikana Commission of Inquiry, Truth, restoration 6

7 and justice." Speaking for myself, I would say that I read

that to speak to the families of the deceased, more than it 8

9 does to anybody else gathered here today, and if one were

10 not to be sensitive to what Mr Ntsebeza has said, I think

11 we would be going the wrong way about it. Lastly, on the

12 Police presentation, of course, my learned friend, Mr

13 Mathibedi has responded to that. I would have said that my

14 colleagues, learned friends, Mr Matthew Chaskalson and

15 Charles Wesley, have had the pleasure of viewing, not

pleasure in the sense of enjoyment, I mean in the sense of 16

17 the benefit, yes, benefit, thank you to the first language

18 English speaker to my right, I am a third language English

19 speaker and I think I am doing very well, Mr Chairman.

20 Back to being serious, the point I wanted to make about the

21 Police presentation, Chairman, Commissioners, is that

22 according to my colleagues to my left that runs for no less

23 than six hours without interpretation. So the point I

24 would make is, surely in it there must be something that

25 those families would be interested to see or to view or to

Page 83

be part of, or to be a part of. So to me, not even that, it would not be in order to view even that as this stage.

Then back to your last question, Mr Chair, we are

ready to hand up the post mortem reports from the Bar, but my learned friend Mr Chaskalson has been tasked to attend

to that part of our duties. I am not even sure that we 6 7

have enough copies. The photocopying facilities that we

have been given, packed up yesterday, but he is in a better

position to speak to all of that, Mr Chair, thank you.

CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Madlanga. Mr Chaskalson.

MR CHASKELSON: Mr Chair, firstly just to correct what may be a misunderstanding that I don't want to cause any, well suspicions later. The time of six hours is not something that I've personally witnesses. We have seen a power point presentation without viewing the video clips

17 that are built into the power point presentation. So what

18 we saw didn't run for two hours, it ran for considerably

less because we were just being scrolled through slides. 20

The figure of six hours is what was communicated to me as a

21 very rough estimate of what it might take to present that

presentation in Commission. So if it turns out that it is 22

23 a lot shorter people shouldn't be concerned that we saw

24 something of six hours and the Commission sees something

that is shorter. We have just seen slides. We haven't

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

Page 84

seen the videos and as I understand it, the Police are really estimating what the total time would be.

In relation to the post mortem reports, we have logistical problems. In fact my master copy is currently at a print shop in Rustenburg, being copied, to generate copies for the legal team. We do have three files which we are in a position to hand up to the Commission. They are not an exhaustive set of post mortem reports, and if I might briefly describe what they comprise. In relation to the 34 victims of the 16th, we have 31 post mortem reports which we are satisfied to hand up at present. There is one post mortem that is still outstanding in the sense that the doctor is making last minute finalisations to the draft, or is settling the draft. We expect to get that report within, if not today, then within the next couple of days.

There are two post mortem reports which we have, which have been furnished to us which are final, but we are not yet satisfied of proof of identity because there is no, in the post mortem bundles that have been furnished to us, there is no proof of identity of the body satisfactory for us to hand it up as a post mortem report of one of the victims. That accounts for the 34 victims of the day.

Of the victims in the week leading up to the day, at present, we have three post mortem reports, three of the ten. The three that we have, are the three that relate to

Page 85

investigations that were conducted by IPID because they were investigations in respect of which it was, there was a

3 suspicion that the Police may have been involved in the

4 killings. The remaining post mortem reports, we are still

to locate. We've had technical difficulties which needn't

6 detain the Commission, but the hard, an external hard drive

7 that we have received from the Police, we have been unable

8 to open but we will be opening it today, and we are hoping

9 that we might find those post mortem reports there. But at

10 present, what I would propose then, Mr Chair, with your

11 leave, is for us to hand up to the Commission the files

12 that contain the 31 post mortem reports that we can verify

13 of victims of the 16th. The two additional post mortem

14 reports that we have reason to believe are also victims of

15 the 16th, but have as yet not been identified, and the three

16 post mortem reports relating to victims of the week before

17 the 16th. And we will, we are unfortunately not in a

18 position to give these files to our colleagues but in the

19 course of the day, we will be in a position to do so.

20

CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Yes, did you indicate, you wished to speak?

22 ADV MPOFU: Chairperson.

23 CHAIRPERSON: I ask people please to identify themselves, to assist those who are transcribing

what is being said.

21

1

Page 86

ADV MPOFU: Chairperson, my name is Dali

- 2 Mpofu, and I think I want to emphasise again who I
- 3 represent, because it's going to become relevant to what I
- 4 am going to say. As I said on Monday, I represent three
- 5 parties or instances. The first one is the group of 270 or
- 6 so persons who were arrested on the 16th, and charged with
- 7 murder, among whom is a group of the injured persons who
- 8 are covered by the terms of reference, since some of those
- 9 people were either kept in hospital under police guard and
- 10 subsequently released when the rest of the 270 persons were
- 11 released. The second group of persons that we represent is
- 12 the Lonmin Community Committee. That committee is a broad
- 13 committee that has been formed to look after the broad
- 14 interests of the Marikana, or rather the Marikana Community
- 15 Committee, and to look after the broad interests of the
- 16 Marikana Community and indeed some of the 270 persons who
- 17 were not necessarily Lonmin employees, but just members of
- 18 the community who were here in solidarity with their
- 19 community members. Some of them were members of the unions
- 20 and to that extent, there might be an overlap but some of
- 21 them were not unionised persons. The members of that
- 22 committee for the record are here, some of them, in a
- 23 representative capacity and we took that step, Chair, as a
- 24 practical measure because of the relative impracticality of
- 25 having all the 270 people here. However, Chair having said

Page 87

- 1 that it is important to note that these people are back at
- 2 work, even now are being requested to make letters so that
- 3 they can prove to their employers that they were here.
- 4 [09:44] And it's an arrangement that I'm hoping, maybe if
- 5 we do have a pre-trial, we will be able to reach with
- 6 Lonmin, in particular, so that when the representatives of
- 7 the committee come here they can rotate or any other
- 8 practical arrangement that we can come to, but the most
- 9 important thing, Chair, is that we would like those people
- 10 to always be represented here. We can't it would be
- 11 extreme if we say they must all be here, because, as I say,
- 12 it would not be practical, but one way or the other, we
- 13 would like them to always be represented. The third
- 14 instance that we represent, Chair, is the family of the
- 15 deceased councillor, Pauline Masutle, and to that extent we
- 16 represent one of the deceased persons provisionally, and
- 17 I'll explain why we say provisionally just now, but to the
- The explain why we say provisionally just now, but to the
- 18 extent that she is a victim and a deceased victim, then
- 19 obviously we are in the same boat as Mr Ntsebeza.

21

22

- 20 I can mention, Chair, that the funeral of that
 - particular victim is taking place this Saturday, and the family one, the sister, joined us and I introduced her to
- 23 you, Chair, at the inspection yesterday, and they are
- 24 leaving for the funeral which will take place a month
 - later, and therefore they cannot be sitting here for the

next few days.

2 CHAIRPERSON: I think I must point out

3 that the death of the councillor, it doesn't strictly

4 speaking fall within the terms of the reference of the

commission. You indicated to me at the inspection that youwere applying to the president to have the terms of

6 were applying to the president to have the terms of7 reference expanded to cover the period relevant.

8 ADV MPOFU: I was moving to that, Chair.

9 CHAIRPERSON: I see, sorry, well carry

10 on.

11

22

23

24

5

ADV MPOFU: Thank you, Chair, the reason

12 I used the word provisionally, I used it advisedly for that

13 reason, Chair, and I might as well, now that the Chair has

14 raised the issue, just deal with that very quickly,

briefly. As I indicated, and indicated to you, Chair, so

16 that we don't mislead the court – the commission, when the

17 list of victims was being read on Monday, Ms Masutle's name

18 was read, and that was correct, because she is a victim of

19 what might broadly be described as the Marikana crisis.

20 She's indeed the 45th of the 46 victims, and I think it was

21 correct to include her among these victims.

Due to that and due to very strong instructions coming from her family, a week after her death, we addressed this letter to the president of the Republic of

South Africa. And I did say yesterday, Chair, that this is

Page 89

- a matter I wish to place on record today. I'm doing that,
- 2 but I'm also going to contextualise it within what
- 3 Mr Ntsebeza and the other colleagues have been discussing,
- if I get the indulgence to do so.

The letter we wrote, Chair, is dated 21st

- 6 September 2012 and, with your permission, I'll read it into
- 7 the record. "Dear Honourable President, representations
- 8 for the extension of the terms of reference of the Farlam
- 9 Commission of Inquiry. 1, We act for the family of Ms
- 10 Pauline Masutle, who died on Wednesday, 19th September 2012,
- 11 as a result of injuries sustained at Marikana during last
- 12 weekend's raids by the security forces of South Africa.
- 13 The deceased suffered injuries from a bullet fired by the
- 14 said security forces. Ms Masutle was a municipal
- 15 councillor. 2, The family is not satisfied with both the
- 16 circumstances surrounding the shooting, nor his mysterious
- 17 death in hospital after she showed signs of recovering. 3,
- 18 we have learnt in the media that the government
- 19 contemplates an investigation into her death. 4, We have
- 20 been instructed to make the request, as we hereby do, that
- 21 instead of launching a parallel inquiry, it would be more
- 22 practical, efficient and cost-saving rather to incorporate
- 23 the issues arising from the death of, into the existing
- 24 Farlam Commission. We are advised that it is within the
- 25 powers of the Honourable President to extend the existing

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions

Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22 23

24

tactics.

Page 92

Page 90

- terms of reference to incorporate the issues associated
- 2 with said raids and the resultant death. 5, We are already
- 3 set to participate in the inquiry on behalf of a separate
- 4 set of clients and it would be convenient for us to deal
- 5 the matters in the same proceedings. 6, In addition, it is
- our humble view that Ms Masutle, being the 46th victim and 6
- 7 the first woman fatality of the broader Marikana crisis, is
- in the same position as the other 45 victims. Her life is 8
- 9 worth the same as the other victims. 7, we are also of the
- 10 view that including this issue would ensure total closure
- of the issues of the Marikana issue once the commission has 11
- finalised its work. 8, We have already been informed by 12
- 13 the Commission Secretariat that the work of the commission
- 14 will commence on 1 October 2012. We would accordingly
- 15 appreciate a response to this request on or before
- Wednesday, 26 September 2012, so that we may either 16
- commence our preparations or seek alternative ways to 17
- 18 pursue the wishes of the family. 9, This letter will be
- 19 copied to the Minister of Justice and Constitutional
- development and we are more than willing to meet and engage 20
- 21 with any functionaries of your office of the South African
- 22 government to further engage on this matter should it be
- 23 deemed necessary by your good offices. This may provide an
- 24 opportunity for us to expand on and further to motivate
- 25
- this request. We await your urgent response." My attorney

heart to ensure that the plight of the victims is not

- underestimated. The impressive manner in which you started
- this commission shows that you do care about the victims. And haste might just result in us having a half-baked - a
- 5 very hasty and rushed, but half-baked product.

I wanted to say this without any fear of contradiction, since I represent, broadly speaking, the victims, as I've defined, together with Mr Ntsebeza and other parties. There is nobody in this country who is more keen for the finalisation of this commission than the victims. I think that has to be made very clear, but that does translate into a rush job, which will not result in the reconciliation and the truth and the justice, nogal, that we all seek. So I think that that statement needs to be made, so that there are no accusations about delaying

The last point I want to make, Chair, is that is to link this issue, at least as far as we are concerned. with the other issues that we raised on Monday about resources. It is very difficult for the parties that we represent to participate in this commission. It is extremely difficult. It is extremely difficult even for us, as the legal representatives, given the distances, the number of people. Just to give you a perspective, Chair, to have to consult with 270 people, even if you were to

Page 91

- sent the letter and it was acknowledged receipt was
- acknowledged by the Office of the President, dated 21st 2
- 3 September 2012, and acknowledged by the Minister of
 - Justice, dated 25th, just after the long weekend.
 - I raise this issue, as I said, Chair, for two
 - reasons: one, to place it one the record, but also to find
 - common cause with the issue of the presence of that family
- 8 here. I might also place on record that we have not
- 9 received the response from the president, as we had
- suggested, which we would have wanted to receive before the 10
- 11 Monday, the commencement of the commission. And our
- 12 instructions from the family are to leave no stone unturned
- 13 to ensure that this death is included in this commission.
- 14 I'm not at liberty at this stage to indicate what steps we
 - may take should this request be refused, but we will leave
- no stone unturned. 16

1

4

5

6 7

15

17

18

19

20 21

22

23

24

25

Now, Chair, coming back to the issue at hand, my impression, Chair, I may be wrong, is that no party sitting here is ready to proceed with this matter. For, after the interventions of Mr Madlanga and Mr Mathibedi, it would seem that, at least about that, there's no dispute. The second issue is that, Chair, the haste - the issue of the credibility of the commission is quite important. There's already a public discourse about this issue of the victims

and I know you, Chair, that is something that you take to

Page 93 estimate it an hour or two hours per person, that goes into

- 2 about a month, a full month of consultations, before you
- 3 even decide which of those people you are going to call.
- 4 And to have to do that under the extreme trying
- 5 circumstances, for people who are poor and who's reason for
- 6 being killed in the first place was the fact that they earn
 - R4 000 a month, is really I think stretching it too far.

And therefore, if there were to be break, Chair -I'm raising it only in this context - of any sort, it would not only serve the purposes of having the pre-trial issues that my colleagues have eloquently spoken about, but it would assist the victim parties to pursue this issue of how it is going to be that for the next four months, the victim parties are well-resourced, and I'm not - I'm just talking about logistical resources here, I'm not even talking about fees - that's matter that we can deal with separately, maybe with the Department of Justice, but just merely to

And, Chair, the last point I want to make is that we have represented these people pro bono in the criminal cases. We have no problem with that. There will be subsequent civil cases for their wrongful arrests, their assaults that they suffered at the hands of the police, their unlawful detentions. We do not need anybody's assistance with that, but as far as the participation in

make them able to participate meaningfully.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119 RealTime Transcriptions Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

Page 94

- this inquiry is concerned, Chair, there is no moral or
- legal or logical reason why these people should not be 2
- 3 assisted. They are here not to gain anything from this
- 4 commission, they are here to assist you, Mr Chair, to
- 5 assist the country to reach the truth and the
- reconciliation and the justice that is sought. They could 6
- 7 have stayed away for all that matters. There's no monetary
- judgment that will come into their favour, and as much as 8
- 9 any other party that is here, is here to assist the
- commission and the country, they are also in that same 10
- position. And once again, if this issue of the resourcing 11
- 12 of the victims is not heeded, we will take it to the next
- 13 level, but at this stage we are trying to use as peaceful
- 14 means as possible to write letters, to petition, to speak
- the Department of Justice, to appeal to the president, to 15
- 16 appeal to you, Chair, that there must be equality of arms.
- 17 That there must be recognition that these victims need to
- 18 be assisted one way or the other, and therefore any break
- 19 will also assist us to deal with those issues. Chair, I
- 20 will stop at that. I just wanted to place these matters
- 21 insofar as they might also be dealt with during whatever
- 22 break is contemplated. Thank you, Chair.
- 23 CHAIRPERSON: Mr Mpofu, you heard what Mr
- 24 Chaskalson said. Speaking for myself, I can't see any
- 25 prejudice to anybody. If the post-mortem reports that are
 - Page 95
 - available are handed in now, having full regard to the
- sensitivity questions which have been raised, which are 2
- 3 very important in a case of this kind, having full regard
- 4 to those, there can be no prejudice to anybody, in fact, an
- 5 advantage, as I see it, if that material is handed up and
- made available to enable full instructions to be taken and 6
- 7 so forth. Do you -

1

- 8 ADV MPOFU: Yes, Chair, I agree with you.
- 9 On the contrary, it would be to our advantage if the
- material was dissipated at this stage, and I might say that 10
- for the post-mortem of the female victim, that I referred 11
- 12 to, is also underway and we will, when we get access to it,
- 13 ensure that our colleagues get it. So I would - I don't
- think and I can speak for Mr Ntsebeza without even 14
- 15
 - consulting him, that the dissipation of those post-mortems
- 16 would cause any prejudice.
- 17 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Does anyone -
- 18 any other member present, representing the parties, wish to
- 19 say anything at this point. Mr Bizos, it would help if you
- 20 turned your machine on.

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

- 21 ADV BIZOS SC: A further interest which
- we must bring to the notice of the commission, the people 22
- 23 that have been injured, who are Mr Dali's client's - Mr
- 24 Mpofu, I'm sorry, I know he was a clerk so this is why - we
- have asked him and he has agreed to make his clients

- available to go with Mr Powell of our team to the place, so
- that each one of them points out the spot where the bullet
- hit him, and Mr Powell will measure the distance between
- where the police were, or were supposed to be, and the spot
- 5 where they were hit and what they were doing, were they
- running away or facing the police, what they were doing. 6
- 7 That is absolutely vital evidence for our pathologists'
- 8 reports.
- 9 The analysis of those wounds are as important as the
- 10 findings of the post-mortem examinations, in order that
- 11 inferences may be drawn why shots were fired. So that I
- 12 thought I would bring that to the commission's attention.
- 13 What we were hoping is that we could do, in the meantime,
- 14 things that will not prejudice the families, but we,
- ourselves, consider that information and we are ready to
- start today. The wield is nearby, you don't need a tape
- 17 measure anymore, you just wield something. This is what I
- 18 learnt recently.

19

- So we, ourselves, want to be ready. Our forensic
- 20 pathologists want to see that evidence so that, please, can
- 21 we - we've managed to get about 50 lawyers together, can we
- 22 all try to get a couple of busses into the Eastern Cape to
- 23
- bring the people here so that we can get on with the job? 24
 - I appeal to my colleagues to cooperate in that regard, so
- that we can get on with the work of the commission.

Page 97

- CHAIRPERSON: 1 I understood from what Mr
 - Ntsebeza said thank you, Mr Bizos. I understood from
 - what Mr Ntsebeza said that this later instruction that he
 - got, that he gave us in his reply, was to the effect that
 - 5 negotiations are underway, and it would appear that there's
 - 6 already a commitment, if I understood him correctly, from
 - 7 the Department to assist people to be here. Did I
 - 8 understand you correctly, Mr Ntsebeza?
 - 9 ADV NTSEBEZA SC: Yes, you did, Chair.
 - 10 In fact, the Department or the social workers indicated
 - 11 that they might be ready to do so on the 8th.
 - 12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you. Does anybody
 - 13 wish to make any comment before -
 - 14 ADV BRUINDERS SC: Chair, yes, Tim
 - 15 Bruinders, AMCU, we of course don't have any objection with
 - what appears to be the way that you propose to proceed this 16
 - 17 morning, but there's one question that we'd like to ask and
 - 18 that is this, in addition to the post-mortem reports being
 - 19 handed up, why can the PowerPoint presentation not be
 - 20 distributed before it's dissipated, why can that not be
 - 21 given to the parties this morning? It doesn't have to be
 - led formally, we just want a copy of it so that we can
 - 23 prepare. We have written numerous letters to the
 - commission requesting a number of documents and audiovisual
 - material. We haven't had a response to any of them. We

Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

5

6

7

8

1

18

19

20

21

22

Page 98

make no point about that. We understand that it is very

2 difficult to get documents out of not only the SAPS, but

3 also Lonmin. We'd like to see whatever there is available

4 now, not here this morning, but in the comfort of the trees

we consult under in Marikana, so that we can prepare.

CHAIRPERSON: I think the question you ask in relation to the PowerPoint presentation should be

addressed to the representatives of the South African

9 Police Service. They have the PowerPoint presentation.

Part of it, as you heard, was shown to Mr Chaskalson and 10

his learned friend, Mr Wesley. Even they didn't see the 11

12 full presentation. The commission evidently hasn't got it

13 at the moment, but it's a request which will properly be

14 addressed by the representatives of the Police Service, and

15 I would appeal to them and to the parties generally, to

cooperate with each other as much as possible, so that we 16

17 can expedite these proceedings and time won't be

18 unnecessarily spent on procedural matters which can be

19 solved outside the place where the commission holds its

formal sittings. What I would suggest is, - what I would 20

21 suggest is the following way forward, that we receive the

22 post-mortem reports, or the copies that are available, we

23 hear that extra copies will be made and given to the

24 parties. We see those now.

25 [10:04] I had hoped we could see the TV footage, but

Page 99

- there are two problems. The one is the one that Mr
- Ntsebeza's mentioned. I though that could be solved by 2
- 3 showing that to them later, particularly in the company of
- 4 people who could give them the necessary counselling. But
- 5 there is another problem, and that is, we haven't got all
- the footage that we would like to see. You will remember 6
- 7 that I made an appeal to the representatives of the media
- 8 houses, to make other material that has not actually been
- 9 broadcast available. I understand there hasn't been a full
- 10 response to that. I also understand that there is or may
- 11 be at the very least, footage available in respect of the
- 12 events of the 13th, on the Monday which were dealt with in

13 the inspection in loco yesterday. So it would presumably

14 be advisable if all the TV footage that is available, if

15 there is TV footage available on that as well, should all

be shown at the same time. So proceeding with the TV

16 17 footage today, doesn't seem a practical proposition.

The post mortem reports clearly no one can be prejudiced if they are handed in now. If the Police aren't able, or consider themselves not able at this stage to give us their power point presentation, they will be given an opportunity to do so when we next meet. The further point,

which I had hoped we'd be able to deal with today, would be 23

24 evidence from the people who pointed out spots at the

25 inspection in loco yesterday and the day before, just

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

confirming effectively on oath what they had pointed out to

us and giving some extra explanation, but it would seem

3 that it is thought that members of the family might wish to

4 be present when that evidence is given as well, and so it

may well be appropriate to hold that back also. But is

6 there anything that counsel for the evidence-leaders wish

7 to add before we - I deal with the application?

8 ADV MADLANGA: No, Mr Chairman, thank

9 you.

12

15

10 Mr Chairperson, I just want MR MAHLANGU:

11 to very briefly explain to -

> CHAIRPERSON: I think you must say who

13 you are, for the benefit of the transcribers. Sorry, Mr

14 Ntsebeza, you want to say something?

> ADV NTSEBEZA: Chair, I just wanted to in

reply to, to just put the correct position, so that there 16

17 is no misunderstanding about what I m instructed by my

attorney. My attorney seems to have been dealing with a Ms

19 Cutshwa, spelt C-U-T-S-H-W-A, and Mr Ganyile, G-A-N-Y-I-L-

20 E, the social workers in the Department of Social

21 Development, one from the Eastern Cape and I would like to

22 just read what she has said to be the position, so there

23 are no mistakes about what I said here when things do not

24 work out well. And in relation to that, I am going to

request the assistance of the Commission and I can already

Page 101 bank on the assistance of the evidence-leaders, who have

been extremely helpful in assisting us to get this thing on

3 track. But this is what has happened. When we contacted

4 the people in the Department of Social Development, he says

5 in paragraph 19 of what would be his affidavit. "Ms

6 Cutshwa confirmed the arrangements between her office and

7 Mr Ganyile's office. She said the Eastern Cape Provincial

8 Government and Department of Social Development was

9 facilitating the families attendance of the Commission on 8

10 October 2012. She confirmed that the Department of Justice

11 would pay for transportation and accommodation of the

12 families to attend the Commission. I enquired from her as

13 to the duration of the families' attendance at the

14 Commission. In particularly I enquired if the families

15 will be unable to attend the Commission for a specific

16 period, or for the entire duration of the Commission. Ms

17 Cutshwa said she did not have answers to my questions, and

18 advised me to direct those questions to Mr JB Skosana." Mr

19 JB Skosana, as the Commission will know is the secretary of

20 this Commission. So it is none too clear and it is for

21 that reason that I would appeal for the Commission at your

level. Mr Chairman, and at the level of the evidence-

23 leaders to be involved in this matter to the extent that

24 the Commission is itself satisfied that we will not deal

here with a token appearance on the 8th, and then we are

18

1

Page 102

- back to square one. We really want, when once we start, we
- 2 run with this. We have made arrangements for exactly that.
- 3 But for me, it will be a charade if they are only brought
- 4 here for the 8th of October. They are not provided for in
- 5 terms of accommodation, they are not provided for in terms
- 6 of where they will stay, and the time is none too clear as
- 7 to for how long they can stay. We are expecting that for
- 8 the duration of the Commission they should be here. It can
- 9 only be fair that if that Commission is going to be
- 10 enquiring into all of the mandated terms of reference that
- 11 they should be here for the duration of the Commission.

12 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you.

13 ADV NTSEBEZA: We would really need a 14 period of time before we resume when these matters will 15 have been clarified.

16 CHAIRPERSON: Thank you, Mr Ntsebeza.

17 The points that you have made will be taken into

consideration. I don't think it appropriate for me to say

19 any more than that about that at the moment. What I

20 suggest we do now, is we allow Mr Chaskalson to hand in

- 21 what he was proposing to hand in. Thereafter it seems to
- 22 me that it's virtually to be common cause among all the
- 23 parties present that we should have an adjournment. The
- 24 only question outstanding is until when? And what I
- 25 suggest we do is that we, after Mr Chaskalson has handed in

Page 103

- the documents to which has referred, we take an
- adjournment, to enable the representatives of the parties 2
- 3 to meet together, to see whether they can reach an
- 4 agreement as to the date when we should resume. I hope
- 5 that when they do that, they will have regard to the two
- 6 factors that I mentioned in the beginning namely the need
- 7 for expedition, on the one hand, on the other hand the need
- 8 to deal with the matter, not as described by Mr Mpofu, in
- 9 half-baked fashion, but what the nation expects of us is a
- 10 proper investigation, not a superficial one, expect us to
- 11 deal with the matter expeditiously of course, but they also
- 12 expect us to do a proper job and be thorough, not in
- 13 relation necessarily to every bullet that was fired by
- 14 every person, because that may be the subject of other
- 15 cases later, but certainly in respect of the terms of
- 16 reference we have. So, Mr Chaskalson, are you ready to
- 17 hand in the documents?
- 18 MR CHASKALSON: I am, Mr Chairperson.
- 19 What strikes me is that we may have difficult indexing and 20 paginating - well, when nobody else has copies of them in
- 21 front of them, but possibly with the, unless any of my
- colleagues object, we can index and paginate or give them 22
- names, attend to the pagination and put up and index, which 23
- 24 - from which everybody else can paginate once the copies
- 25 have been furnished to them.

Page 104 CHAIRPERSON: That sounds like a sensible

suggestion. I suggest you proceed along the lines you have

indicated.

MR CHASKALSON: Then, if we can then hand

up those there files, and if I can suggest an appropriate 6

annexure numbering.

CHAIRPERSON:

8 numbers? I suppose the whole bundle can be exhibit 1, and 9 then it will be accompanied in due course by an index which

Shall we give them exhibit

10 will indicate what precisely is contained in the exhibit,

11 is that correct?

12 MR CHASKELSON: Given the circumstances, 13 that would be the most convenient approach, Mr Chairperson,

14 but at the outset I might just draw your attention to a

number of issues, or if you can just note them at this

stage, because the document isn't yet paginated. I don't

17 have my master file in front of me, so it's not going to

help me even if it is paginated because that's at the copy

19 shop. But my copy is at the printers. Mr Chair, it's

20 merely a note, I don't need a file in front of me, but I

21 want to draw attention to the fact that the two, that the

22 first three post mortems that you will find in that file

23 with death registration numbers 553 of 2012, 555 of 2012,

24 and 554 of 2012, in other words 553 to 555, although they

are not sequentially appearing in the bundle, are the post

Page 105 mortems in respect of the three victims prior to the 16th in

- respect of whom there was a suspicion that the police may
- have been responsible for the killing. All of the
- 4 following post mortem reports are the post-mortem reports
- 5 of victims of the 16th itself, and the two reports in
- 6 respect of which there is not yet satisfactory
- 7 identification have the death registration numbers 578 of

8 2012 and 583 of 2012.

9 The last point that I would make is that we are 10 in possession of black and white photographs of post mortem

photographs to accompany these reports in respect of all 11

12 but the first three of the post-mortem reports. We are

13 currently trying to locate colour copies of those

14 photographs, because the black and white copies are of very

15 little assistance. If we can locate colour copies within

16 the near future, that is what will be distributed to the

17 Commission and to the parties but if we can't, we will have 18 to make do with the black and white photographs which at

19 present are not included in that file.

20 And finally, Mr Chair, just to repeat that there 21 is one report that is still outstanding from the 16th but we expect to receive that very soon.

23 CHAIRPERSON: That's the one that's not

24 been finalised yet?

25 MR CHASKALSON: Indeed, Mr Chair.

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

Page 109

Page 106

CHAIRPERSON: Right thank you. We have 1 received this bundle of documents as exhibit 1. We will 2 3 return the copies to you, so that the index can be inserted 4 and the pages can be appropriately paginated. Now, I 5 suggest that we take the - I propose that we take the tea adjournment. We won't resume immediately in 15 minutes, 6 7 unless we are told, which is unlikely that we will be told, that the parties have had a meeting and have agreed on 8 9 certain aspects which are part of the way forward. The 10 first thing of course, is the date to which we should 11 adjourn. If the parties can't agree then I will have to decide what date's appropriate, but I hope that they will 12 13 be able to agree, being mindful of the two factors that I 14 mentioned. But there are various other matters which I 15 have, some of them I've mentioned here in formal sittings of the Commission, others I've mentioned outside, things 16 that the parties can agree on, which will shorten the 17 18 proceedings and in fact make it much easier for us to 19 proceed with the necessary expedition, and these matters 20 can also be discussed by counsel. At this point, we will 21 adjourn and we will resume after we've been told that it is 22 appropriate for us to continue.

Page 108 Mothalepula Msenyeno. Family member Sam Monene, deceased

2 Hendrick Monene Sam. Family member Mamiki Adelaide

Tsemele, deceased Papi Ledoane. I believe the last one,

Papi, was a policeman.

CHAIRPERSON: Those members who are present whose names were read out, who are family members of the deceased, the Commission wishes to express its sympathy and its condolences on the loss which they've suffered and to give them the assurance which we gave also on Monday, that we will do everything we can to the best of our ability to ascertain the facts which gave rise to the deaths of the deceased persons whose names were mentioned. Thank you, Mr Interpreter. Mr Madlanga, are you now able to inform us what happened, what the results are of the meeting that you had with the representatives of the other

16 parties? 17 ADV MADLANGA SC: Thank you, Chairman, 18 Commissioners. Mr Chairman, agreement was reached on a 19 number of issues covering a whole range of matters, including the exchange of witness lists, witness 21 statements, discovery of documents and of course that the 22 matter be postponed to a specific date. I do not propose 23 that saying anything - or rather, stating or setting out 24 the dates of the time frames other than the dates of

Page 107

3

6

7

8

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

COMMISSION RESUMES]

Good afternoon, the

representatives of the parties had a very fruitful meeting

[COMMISSION ADJOURNS

[14:04] CHAIRPERSON:

2 at which various matters were discussed and agreed, ways in

Commission resumes. I understand the advocates and other

3 which the proceedings can be expedited and proceed more

4 efficiently, but before I call upon Mr Madlanga to address

5 us on that, I've been informed that we have with us today

6 the members of the family of five of the deceased persons,

7 people who were not here when we started on Monday and I'd

8 ask my colleague, Adv Tokota, to read out their names,

9 together with the names of the deceased whose family

members they are and then I wish to say something to them. 10

Excuse me, Mr Interpreter, I'm sorry, I understand these 11

12 people are either Sesotho speaking or Setswana speaking. I

13 know that you're proficient in those two languages also, so

14 would you please make the interpretation - I don't know

15 whether, if you're interpreting Sesotho, the Setswana-

speaking people will follow you, but I'll leave that to 16

17 your discretion. Thank you. Mr Tokota, would you please

18 read out the names of the family members who are present as

19 well as the deceased persons whose families they belonged

20 to.

23

24

25

1

21 ADV TOKOTA SC: Thank you, Mr Chairman. Family member Ithumeleng David Sagalala, the deceased 22

Modisaotsile Van Wyk Sagalala. Family member Esther

23 24 Dinkwese Mabebe, Eric Thapelo Mabebe the deceased. Family

25 member Msenyeno Lebogang Fransina, deceased Andries 2012, that is the date that we propose the Commission should postpone the matter to.

postponement and the agreed date is the 22nd of October

There was agreement on all the issues, unanimous agreement, except for on the date of postponement but even on that, there was sufficient consensus that the matter be postponed to the 22nd of October. Thank you, thank you Chair.

CHAIRPERSON: I think that if regard is had to the proposed timetable for the exchange of documents, the preparation of a consolidated index and bundle of documents and so on, it would be unrealistic for these proceedings to be adjourned for any date prior to the 22nd of October. I want to stress though that the - an enormous amount of work will have to be done, not only by the parties' representatives but also by the members of the Commission over that period. There's an enormous amount of reading that will have to be done.

The documents, as I understand it, which will be exchanged by the parties will be made available to the Commission and the idea is that we will all be in possession of sufficient knowledge of what's in the documents to ensure that the evidence, when it is led, is dealt with expeditiously, without undue interruption or anything of that kind.

So I'm grateful, my colleagues and I are grateful

Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

Email: realtime@pixie.co.za

Page 110 to the representatives of the parties for the trouble that they took to come to this agreement and for the many 2 3 excellent suggestions which are contained in this document which will, I am sure, enable the Commission to perform its 5 work as effectively and efficiently as can be expected in the circumstances. 6 7 So the order that I make, insofar as I'm called 8 upon to make an order, is that the proceedings will be 9 adjourned until the 22nd of October. Is there anything, before we formally take the adjournment, that anyone wishes 10 to place on record. 9 o'clock on the morning of Monday, 11 12 the 22nd October. Does anyone wish to add anything or raise any question before we formally adjourn? I don't see any 13 14 indication. I beg your pardon, Mr Semenya. 15 ADV SEMENYA SC: Chairperson, we had also requested some direction on how the Commission intended writing on the various themes and what it is that is 17 18 expected of us. I don't know if that has *11:03. 19 ADV MADLANGA SC: My I respond to that, 20 Chair? We have not approached the Commission on that issue yet. We will do that and we will communicate the response 21 22 to our colleagues. Thank you. 23 CHAIRPERSON: We were handed the minutes 24 of this meeting a few minutes before we came into court. 25 We read them, but we haven't had a chance to consider the Page 111 various points that have been referred to us for decision 1 but, as Mr Madlanga says, I can give the parties 2 3 reassurance, we'll apply our minds to those matters and we will communicate to them as soon as we can what our views 5 in respect of the proposals are in respect of the points raised. 6 7 The Commission stands adjourned until 9 a.m. on 8 Monday, the 22nd of October. 9 [COMMISSION ADJOURNED] 10 11 12 13 14 15 17 18 19 20 21 22 23

Tel: 011 021 6457 Fax: 011 440 9119

bullet 89:13 96:2

A **ability** 108:11 **able** 66:21 71:24 72:13 72:18 74:7 87:5 93:18 99:20,20,23 106:13 108:13 **absence** 67:15 79:2 **absent** 67:20 absolutely 67:20 96:7 access 95:12 accommodated 71:8 72:5 accommodation 71:9 76:19 101:11 102:5 accompanied 104:9 accompany 105:11 accord 76:13 account 68:25 74:4 81:5 accounts 84:22 accusations 92:15 acknowledged 91:1,2,3 act 89:9 add 100:7 110:12 addition 90:5 97:18 additional 85:13 address 77:4 81:16 107:4 addressed 88:24 98:8 98:14 Adelaide 108:2 adjourn 106:11,21 110:13 adjourned 109:12 110:9 111:7,9 adjournment 102:23 103:2 106:6 110:10 adjourns 80:16 106:23 adopting 80:19 Adv 66:23,25 67:10,12 75:3,13,25 76:2,5,6,8 77:6,15,21 78:12,14 78:18,20,23,24,25 79:1,5,14,18 80:2,5 80:13,15 81:2,18 85:22 86:1 88:8,11 95:8,21 97:9,14 100:8 100:15 102:13 107:8 107:21 108:17 110:15 110:19 advantage 95:5,9 advice 75:16,23 advisable 99:14 advise 70:1,3 advised 67:3 70:2,3 76:9 89:24 101:18 advisedly 88:12 advocates 106:25 **affidavit** 71:25 101:5 Africa 88:25 89:12 African 81:3 90:21 98:8 afternoon 106:24 agree 78:23,25 95:8 106:11,13,17

agreed 95:25 106:8 107:2 108:25 agreement 103:4 108:18 109:3,4 110:2 allow 72:23,23,24 74:18 102:20 alternative 90:17 **AMCU** 97:15 amount 109:14,16 analysis 96:9 Andries 107:25 annexure 104:6 answers 101:17 anticipated 72:15 anybody 68:21 75:24 77:3 81:12 82:9 94:25 95:4 97:12 anybody's 93:24 anymore 96:17 appeal 77:6 94:15,16 96:24 98:15 99:7 101:21 appear 97:5 appearance 101:25 appearing 74:24 104:25 appears 97:16 **application** 67:3 81:20 100:7 apply 73:1 111:3 applying 88:6 appointed 71:13 appreciate 90:15 **approach** 104:13 approached 75:19 110:20 **appropriate** 66:22 67:6 77:19 80:22 100:5 102:18 104:5 106:12 106:22 appropriately 106:4 area 66:13 areas 68:4 aren't 99:19 arising 89:23 arms 94:16 arrangement 87:4.8 arrangements 67:5 70:19 75:10 77:19 101:6 102:2 arranging 70:4 arrested 86:6 arrests 93:22 ascertain 108:11 asked 95:25 asking 69:14 aspect 77:4 aspects 106:9 assaults 93:23 assist 85:24 93:12 94:4 94:5,9,19 97:7 assistance 93:25 100:25 101:1 105:15

assume 70:21 80:15 **assumed** 68:17 **assumption** 67:24.25 assurance 108:9 attend 83:5 101:12,15 103:23 **attendance** 101:9,13 attended 72:13,18 attention 96:12 104:14 104:21 attorney 70:6,14,24 71:17 76:23 90:25 100:18,18 attorneys 68:4,7 76:11 audiovisual 97:24 **August** 66:12 available 79:11 95:1,6 96:1 98:3,22 99:9,11 99:14,15 109:19 await 90:25 **a.m** 111:7 В 87:1 91:17 100:5

back 68:14 82:20 83:3 102:1 **bank** 101:1 Bar 81:9 83:4 basis 72:6,12 73:14,14 beg 110:14 began 71:24 beginning 103:6 behalf 73:20 81:3 90:3 believe 77:24 78:10 85:14 108:3 **belonged** 107:19 benefit 78:7 82:17,17 100:13 best 77:22 108:10 better 83:8 Bizos 77:5,6,15,21 78:11,13,18,23,25 79:5,18 80:5,15 81:21 95:19,21 97:2 black 105:10,14,18 board 81:23 **boat** 87:19 body 73:23.23.24 84:20 **bono** 93:20 border 68:5 break 72:12 93:8 94:18 94:22 breakdowns 72:17 **brief** 73:1 briefly 84:9 88:15 100:11 bring 95:22 96:12,23 broad 79:22 86:12,13 86:15 broadcast 99:9 broader 90:7 broadly 88:19 92:7 **brought** 70:5 71:7 72:3

103:13 **bundle** 104:8.25 106:2 109:11 **bundles** 84:19 **busses** 96:22 call 66:22 77:1 80:3 93:3 107:4 called 110:7 can't 68:21 79:23 81:12 87:10 94:24 105:17 106:11 capacity 86:23 Cape 73:1 96:22 100:21 101:7 care 71:16 92:3 cared 71:15 73:14 **caring** 72:22 carry 88:9 case 73:6 80:9 95:3 cases 93:21,22 103:15 cause 83:14 91:7 95:16 102:22 certain 66:18 106:9 certainly 103:15 Chair 74:21 78:14 81:18 83:3,9,12 85:10 86:23,25 87:9,14,20 87:23 88:8,11,13,13 88:15,25 89:5 91:5,17 91:18,22,25 92:17,24 93:8,19 94:1,4,16,19 94:22 95:8 97:9,14 100:15 104:19 105:20 105:25 109:7 110:20 **Chairman** 66:23 67:1 67:13,24 68:3,10,12 68:15.22.24 69:3.8.14 69:19,25 72:22 73:12 74:10 75:3,14,25 76:8 77:22 79:6 82:19,21 100:8 101:22 107:21 108:17,18 Chairperson 66:2,24 67:9.11 69:2 74:22 75:7 76:25 77:12.16 78:11 80:22 81:7 83:10 85:20,22,23 86:1 88:2,9 94:23 95:17 97:1,12 98:6 100:10,12 102:12,16 103:18 104:1.7.13 105:23 106:1.24 108:5 109:8 110:15 110:23 **chance** 110:25 charade 102:3 charged 86:6 Charles 82:15 **chart** 82:3 **Chaskalson** 82:14 83:5 83:11 94:24 98:10 102:20,25 103:16,18

CHASKELSON 83:12 104:12 choice 74:1 circumstances 89:16 93:5 104:12 110:6 civil 93:22 clarified 102:15 clarity 76:7 clear 68:16 70:9 73:10 92:11 101:20 102:6 clearly 70:25 99:18 clerk 95:24 clients 67:14,18 73:20 79:10 90:4 95:25 **client's** 95:23 **clips** 83:16 **closure** 90:10 colleague 78:12 81:24 107:8 **colleagues** 69:16 75:4 82:14,22 85:18 89:3 93:11 95:13 96:24 103:22 109:25 110:22 colour 105:13,15 come 68:20 70:23 73:1 73:8 76:13 81:23 82:3 87:7,8 94:8 110:2 comfort 78:7 98:4 coming 88:23 91:17 commence 90:14,17 commencement 91:11 **comment** 97:13 Commissioner 81:22 commissioners 68:7 75:4 82:21 108:18 commission's 96:12 commitment 97:6 committee 86:12,12,13 86:15,22 87:7 common 91:7 102:22 communicate 110:21 111:4 communicated 75:10 79:9,15 83:20 communication 68:5 76:10 **community** 86:12.14 86:16,18,19 company 99:3 completeness 76:1,9 comprise 84:9 concerned 67:18 77:17 78:3 83:23 92:18 94:1 condolences 108:8 conducted 85:1 **conference** 79:16 80:3 80:17 81:24 **confirmed** 101:6,10 confirming 100:1 conscience 73:10 consensus 109:5 consider 96:15 99:20 110:25 considerably 83:18 consideration 102:18 consolidated 109:10

assisted 94:3,18

assisting 101:2

associated 90:1

104:4 105:25

Bruinders 97:14,15

102:3

built 83:17

constant 76:23
Constitution 74:5
Constitutional 90:19
consult 92:25 98:5
consultations 93:2
consulting 95:15
contact 71:24,25 72:2
contacted 71:21,23
101:3
contain 85:12
contained 104:10 110:3
contemplate 74:3
contemplated 69:4
94:22
contemplates 89:19
context 93:9
contextualise 89:2
continue 106:22
contradiction 92:7
contrary 95:9
convenient 90:4 104:13
conversation 70:22
conveys 78:5
cooperate 96:24 98:16
copied 84:5 90:19
copies 83:7 84:6 98:22
98:23 103:20,24
105:13,14,15 106:3
copy 84:4 97:22 104:18
104:19
correct 68:21 83:13
88:18,21 100:16
104:11
correctly 78:15 79:12
97:6,8
correctness 75:8
cost-saving 89:22
councillor 87:15 88:3
89:15
counsel 79:7 100:6
106:20
counselling 70:13 72:6
77:19 99:4
country 92:9 94:5,10
couple 84:15 96:22
courage 73:25
course 76:2 82:12
85:19 97:15 103:11
104:9 106:10 108:21
court 73:4 88:16
110:24
cover 88:7
covered 86:8
covering 108:19
crave 67:1
created 75:15
credibility 91:23
criminal 93:20
crisis 88:19 90:7
critically 69:21
currently 84:4 105:13
Cutshwa 100:19 101:6
101:17
C-U-T-S-H-W-A
100:19

D
Dali 86:1
Dali's 95:23
dark 72:25
darkens 74:11 date 103:4 106:10
108:22,25 109:1,4,12
dated 89:5 91:2,4
dates 67:17 108:24,24
date's 106:12
David 107:22
day 66:11 68:1 74:12 74:13,14 76:22 78:4
81:25 84:22,23 85:19
99:25
days 69:15 71:5,6 72:25
80:11,11 84:15 88:1
dead 67:16 68:9,23 deal 73:13 75:6,13 78:9
88:14 90:4 93:16
94:19 99:23 100:7
101:24 103:8,11
dealing 100:18
dealt 94:21 99:12
109:23 Dear 89:7
death 88:3,23 89:17,19
89:23 90:2 91:13
104:23 105:7
deaths 67:21 108:12
debating 81:22 deceased 82:8 87:15,16
87:18 89:13 107:6,9
107:19,22,24,25
108:1,3,7,12
decent 71:10
decide 93:3 106:12 decision 111:1
deemed 90:23
defined 92:8
definition 70:23
delaying 92:15
Department 67:4 70:3 70:8,17 71:2 75:11,20
76:12 93:17 94:15
97:7,10 100:20 101:4
101:8,10
deprive 80:21
deprived 77:10
describe 84:9 described 66:14 88:19
103:8
desirable 81:14
detail 76:22
detain 85:6
detention 73:2 detentions 93:24
development 67:5 70:4
71:2 75:21 76:12
90:20 100:21 101:4,8
device 76:15
didn't 83:18 98:11 died 67:16,19,20,23
73:22,22 89:10
different 70:0

difficult 92:20,22,22 98:2 103:19 difficulties 85:5 Dinkwese 107:24 direct 101:18 direction 110:16 directly 81:19 discourse 91:24 discovery 108:21 discretion 107:17 discussed 106:20 107:2 discussing 89:3 dishonesty 70:2 disparaging 69:1 dispute 91:21 dissipated 95:10 97:20 dissipation 95:15 distance 96:3 distances 92:23 distributed 97:20 105:16 **doctor** 84:13 **document** 104:16 110:3 documents 66:18 97:24 98:2 103:1,17 106:2 108:21 109:10,11,18 109:22 doesn't 88:3 97:21 99:17 doing 69:13 79:19 82:19 89:1 96:5,6 don't 66:7 68:25 69:23 72:5 73:5,25 78:4 79:19 80:20 83:13 88:16 95:13 96:16 97:15 102:18 104:16 104:20 107:14 110:13 110:18 doubt 78:18,19 draconian 73:3 draft 84:13,14 draw 104:14,21 drawn 96:11 **drive** 85:6 due 72:15 88:22,22 104:9 **Dumisa** 66:25 **duration** 71:7 101:13 101:16 102:8,11 duties 83:6 duty 68:24 70:1

E 100:20 early 81:23 earn 93:6 earnest 69:3 easier 106:18 Eastern 96:22 100:21 101:7 effect 97:4 effectively 100:1 110:5 efficient 89:22 **efficiently** 107:4 110:5 either 86:9 90:16 107:12

eloquently 93:11 emphasise 86:2 employees 86:17 employers 87:3 enable 78:2 81:13 95:6 103:2 110:4 **enabled** 73:12 engage 82:2 90:20,22 English 82:18,18 enjoyment 82:16 enormous 109:14,16 enquire 68:23 enquired 101:12,14 enquiring 102:10 ensure 69:11 90:10 91:13 92:1 95:13 109:22 **entire** 101:16 entitled 71:11 equality 94:16 Eric 107:24 establish 75:5 **Esther** 107:23 estimate 83:21 93:1 estimating 84:2 event 72:17 events 66:12 99:12 everybody 66:2 68:8 79:10 103:24 **evidence** 66:16 68:7 78:21 79:6,13,16,20 79:22 80:16,18 81:9 96:7,20 99:24 100:4 101:22 109:22 evidence-leaders 100:6 101:1 evidently 98:12 exactly 102:2 examinations 96:10 excellent 110:3 exchange 74:14 108:20 109:9 exchanged 109:19 Excuse 107:11 exhaustive 84:8 **exhibit** 104:7,8,10 106:2 existing 89:23,25 **expand** 90:24 expanded 88:7 **expect** 70:21,25 71:9 84:14 103:10,12 105:22 expectation 70:16 **expected** 110:5,18 expecting 71:12 102:7 expects 103:9 expedite 98:17 expedited 107:3 **expedition** 68:11,12 103:7 106:19 expeditiously 103:11 **finalised** 90:12 105:24 109:23 finally 105:20 explain 87:17 100:11 **find** 85:9 91:6 104:22 explanation 100:2 **findings** 96:10

express 72:23 108:7

expressed 69:8.9 70:24 72:21 **extend** 89:25 extension 89:8 extent 76:17 86:20 87:15,18 101:23 external 85:6 extra 98:23 100:2 extreme 87:11 93:4 **extremely** 92:22,22 101:2 eye 73:19

F F 81:2 face 80:1 facilitating 101:9 facilities 83:7 facing 96:6 fact 70:14 74:15 76:9 79:21 84:4 93:6 95:4 97:10 104:21 106:18 **factors** 103:6 106:13 facts 108:11 fair 102:9 fall 88:4 **falls** 81:7 families 67:6 68:23 69:12 70:4,10,18 71:3 71:3,21 76:15,16 77:8 78:5 79:24 80:21 82:8 82:25 96:14 101:9,12 101:13,14 107:19 family 87:14,22 88:23 89:9,15 90:18 91:7,12 100:3 107:6,9,18,22 107:23,24 108:1,2,6 far 74:12 77:17 92:18 93:7.25 Farlam 89:8,24 **fashion** 103:9 fatality 90:7 favour 94:8 fear 92:6 fed 71:10 76:19 feel 72:6 74:17 75:16 fees 93:16 fell 69:12 **female** 95:11 fetched 71:4,6 72:3 **fight** 73:4 **figure** 83:20 **figures** 72:19 file 104:17,20,22 105:19 files 84:6 85:11,18 104:5 **film** 77:8,13,17,22 **final** 84:17 finalisation 92:10 finalisations 84:13

different 79:9

fine 69:23

hours 82:23 83:14.18

83:20.24 93:1

hour 93:1

houses 99:8

finished 74:24 fired 89:13 96:11 103:13 **first** 66:11 72:10 74:20 82:17 86:5 90:7 93:6 104:22 105:12 106:10 **firstly** 83:12 **five** 107:6 **flat** 66:13 **follow** 107:16 **following** 98:21 105:4 follows 67:2 footage 68:1 78:17 98:25 99:6,11,14,15 99:17 **footages** 68:9 72:9,13 forces 89:12,14 forensic 96:19 formal 98:20 106:15 formally 97:22 110:10 110:13 **formed** 86:13 forth 66:19 95:7 forward 98:21 106:9 found 73:23,24,24 four 71:6 93:13 frames 108:24 Fransina 107:25 Friday 71:5 friend 70:5 75:17 77:24 81:21 82:12 83:5 98:11 friends 82:14 friend's 77:10 front 66:13 103:21 104:17.20 fruitful 107:1 **fruitfully** 74:12,15 full 93:2 95:1,3,6 98:12 99:9 functionaries 90:21 fundamental 80:21 funeral 87:20,24 furnished 84:17,19 103:25 further 90:22,24 95:21 99:22 **future** 105:16 \mathbf{G} gain 94:3 **Ganvile** 100:19

G gain 94:3 Ganyile 100:19 Ganyile's 101:7 gathered 82:4,9 generally 98:15 generate 84:5 getting 80:20 give 66:4 69:14 73:18 73:19 74:25 76:7 79:25 80:25 85:18 92:24 99:4,20 103:22 104:7 108:9 111:2 given 67:7 68:16,17 71:16 74:7 75:9,24 79:22 83:8 92:23 97:21 98:23 99:21

R C H I V E F O R J U S

100:4 104:12 giving 79:3 100:2 **go** 71:14 73:4.25 74:7 75:18 96:1 goes 93:1 going 68:6 70:17,18 71:2,3 72:8,9,10,16 73:19 77:25 79:8,8,12 79:13,14,17 80:8,23 81:25 82:11 86:3,4 89:2 93:3,13 100:24 102:9 104:17 good 66:2 81:2 90:23 106:24 **government** 70:16 71:1 71:13 89:18 90:22 101:8 grateful 109:25,25 grave 67:14,14 group 86:5,7,11 **guard** 86:9 G-A-N-Y-I-L 100:19 H half-baked 92:4,5 103:9 hand 77:5 81:8 83:4 84:7,11,21 85:11 91:17 102:20,21 103:7,7,17 104:4 handed 81:15,15 95:1,5 97:19 99:19 102:25 110:23 hands 93:23 happen 71:13 72:16 happened 68:1,9 69:25 75:18 101:3 108:14 happens 78:1 hard 85:6.6 hasn't 98:12 99:9 haste 91:22 92:4 hasty 92:5 haven't 71:18 77:13 79:18 83:25 97:25 99:5 110:25 hear 78:6,8,22 98:23 heard 79:20 94:23 98:10 hearing 71:7 77:25 79:2 80:18 heart 92:1 heeded 94:12 help 74:6 79:10 95:19 104:18 helpful 78:1 81:11 101:2 Hendrick 108:2 **history** 71:15 hit 96:3,5 hold 100:5 holds 98:19 Honourable 89:7,25 hope 66:8 103:4 106:12 hoped 98:25 99:23

hoping 85:8 87:4 96:13

hospital 86:9 89:17

humble 68:22 90:6 idea 109:20 identification 105:7 identified 85:15 identify 85:24 identity 84:18,20 immediately 75:21 106:6 **implore** 74:11 importance 67:14 important 68:12 69:21 72:8 78:16,20 87:1,9 91:23 95:3 96:9 impracticality 86:24 **impression** 75:15 91:18 impressive 92:2 **impute** 70:2 **include** 88:21 included 91:13 105:19 including 79:10 90:10 108:20 **incorporate** 89:22 90:1 index 103:22,23 104:9 106:3 109:10 **indexing** 103:19 indicate 85:21 91:14 104:10 indicated 72:1 78:15 88:5,15,15 97:10 104:3 indicating 66:6 indication 74:16 110:14 individual 71:20 indulge 67:25 68:14 **indulgence** 67:1 89:4 inferences 96:11 inform 108:14 **information** 75:9 96:15 **informed** 90:12 107:5 initial 79:4 initially 78:15 81:19 injured 86:7 95:23 injuries 89:11,13 inquiry 71:14 82:6 89:9 89:21 90:3 94:1 inserted 106:3 **insofar** 94:21 110:7 **inspection** 66:9,10 75:19 87:23 88:5 99:13.25 inspections 74:1 instance 87:14 instances 86:5 instituted 73:13 instruct 72:1 **instructed** 73:8 89:20 100:17

91:12 95:6 **intended** 110:16 **intends** 79:19 intention 81:4 interaction 70:7 interest 95:21 interested 80:20 82:25 interests 74:20 86:14 86:15 interpretation 82:23 107:14 **Interpreter** 107:11 108:13 interpreting 107:15 interrupting 77:20 interruption 109:23 interventions 91:20 introduced 87:22 investigation 89:19 103:10 investigations 85:1,2 invitation 80:24 invite 75:12 81:16 **invited** 81:19 **inviting** 66:20 involved 85:3 101:23 **IPID** 85:1 isn't 104:16 issue 88:14 90:10,11 91:5,7,17,22,22,24 92:18 93:12 94:11 110:20 issues 74:16 75:7 89:23 90:1,11 92:19 93:10 94:19 104:15 108:19 109:3 Ithumeleng 107:22 it's 66:21 71:2,13 72:10 79:12 80:16 81:14 86:3 87:4 97:20 98:13 102:22 104:17,19 I'd 107:7 I'll 87:17 89:6 I'm 87:4 89:1,2 91:14 93:9,14,14,15 95:24 I've 83:15 92:8 106:15 106:16 J **JB** 101:18,19 **iob** 69:6,6 70:15 92:12 96:23 103:12 **joined** 87:22

93:17 94:6,15 101:10 K keen 92:10 kept 76:19 86:9 kicking 69:16,17 killed 93:6 killing 105:3 killings 85:4 kind 95:3 109:24

judgment 94:8

justice 69:11,12 82:7

90:19 91:4 92:13

kinds 72:17 klein 66:14 know 66:7 67:25 68:20 69:9 72:5,22,25 73:21 76:6 79:19,25 91:25 95:24 101:19 107:13 107:14 110:18 knowing 77:23 knowledge 109:21 known 68:1,2 koppie 66:13,14,15

 \mathbf{L} ladies 75:19 land 66:13 language 82:17,18 languages 107:13 **Lastly** 82:11 latest 76:12,13,17 launching 89:21 law 73:6 laws 73:2,3,7 lawyers 96:21 leaders 66:16 68:7 79:16,20 101:23 leading 84:23 learned 70:5 75:17 77:9 77:24 81:21 82:12,14 83:5 98:11 learnt 89:18 96:18 leave 85:11 91:12,15 107:16 leaving 87:24 Lebogang 107:25 led 78:21 79:13 97:22 109:22 Ledoane 108:3 **left** 75:22 80:11 82:22 legal 82:2 84:6 92:23 94:2 Lesotho 68:20 letter 88:24 89:5 90:18 91:1 letters 87:2 94:14 97:23

link 92:18 list 88:17 lists 108:20 little 105:15 locate 70:18 85:5 105:13,15 loco 66:9,11 75:19 99:13,25 logical 94:2 logistical 84:4 93:15 logo 82:5

Let's 69:5

life 90:8

lines 104:2

level 68:13 94:13

liberty 72:24 91:14

101:22.22

logo 82:5 long 91:4 102:7 Lonmin 67:22 86:12,17 87:6 98:3 look 69:17 86:13,15

loss 108:8

instructions 70:9 88:22

instruction 97:3

lost 72:20 82:1 lot 83:23 loved 72:20 Lusikisiki 68:4 lving 71:22

M

m 100:17 Mabebe 107:24,24 machine 95:20 Madlanga 70:5 74:23 75:3,13 76:2,6,25 81:16,18 83:10 91:20 100:8 107:4 108:13 108:17 110:19 111:2 **MAHLANGU** 100:10 main 69:13 70:18 majority 68:19 making 67:5 68:10,11 84:13 Mamboes 73:22

Mamiki 108:2 managed 96:21 mandate 70:9,12 71:18 71:19 73:16

mandated 102:10 manner 92:2

Marikana 82:6 86:14 86:14,16 88:19 89:11 90:7,11 98:5 master 84:4 104:17

Masutle 87:15 89:10,14 90:6 Masutle's 88:17

material 95:5,10 97:25 99:8

Mathibedi 81:2,3 82:13 91:20

matter 67:14 75:6 76:7 79:9 89:1 90:22 91:19 93:16 101:23 103:8 103:11 108:22 109:2 109:5

matters 90:5 94:7,20 98:18 102:14 106:14 106:19 107:2 108:19 111:3

Matthew 82:14 mean 67:21 70:2 72:23 73:18 79:15 82:16 meaningfully 93:18 means 76:3 94:14 meant 69:9 76:6 measure 86:24 96:3.17 media 89:18 99:7 meet 90:20 99:22 103:3 meeting 106:8 107:1 108:15 110:24

member 95:18 107:22 107:23,25 108:1,2 members 68:15 74:10 81:18 86:17,19,19,21 100:3 107:6,10,18

108:5,6 109:15 mentioned 75:17 99:2

CHIVE FOR

mention 87:20

merely 79:22 93:17 104:20

103:6 106:14.15.16

mind 77:14 mindful 106:13

108:12

minds 111:3 **minimum** 72:2 Minister 90:19 91:3

minute 84:13 minutes 106:6 110:23

110:24 mislead 88:16 mistakes 100:23

misunderstanding 83:13 100:17

Modisaotsile 107:23 moment 73:9 98:13 102:19

Monday 67:3 68:15,16 70:3 72:21 75:9 76:17 78:3 86:4 88:17 91:11 92:19 99:12 107:7 108:10 110:11 111:8

Monene 108:1,2 monetary 94:7 month 87:24 93:2,2,7 months 93:13

moral 94:1 morning 66:2,4,8 81:2 97:17,21 98:4 110:11

mortem 81:10 83:4 84:3,8,10,12,16,19,21 84:24 85:4,9,12,13,16

99:18 105:4.10 mortems 104:22 105:1

motivate 90:24 Motlhalepula 108:1

moving 88:8 Mpofu 69:20 85:22

86:1,2 88:8,11 94:23 95:8,24 103:8

Msenyeno 107:25 108:1 municipal 89:14

murder 86:7 mysterious 89:16

N

name 75:17 86:1 88:17 names 103:23 107:8,9 107:18 108:6,12 **nation** 103:9 **nature** 70:13 72:15 near 105:16 nearby 96:16 necessarily 80:10 86:17 103:13 necessary 90:23 99:4 106:19

need 72:6 93:24 94:17 96:16 102:13 103:6,7 104:20

needn't 80:10 85:5 needs 71:25 92:14 negotiations 97:5

never 71:14.15 81:4 nogal 92:13 note 87:1 104:15.20 notice 95:22

Ntsebeza 66:23,25,25 67:10,12 75:17,21,25 76:3,5,8 77:2,7,16 78:2 82:10 87:19 89:3 92:8 95:14 97:2,3,8,9 100:14,15 102:13,16

Ntsebeza's 79:10 81:20 99:2

number 92:24 97:24 104:15 108:19 numbering 104:6

numbers 104:8,23 105:7 numerous 97:23

O

oath 100:1 **object** 80:6 103:22 **objection** 80:5,19 97:15 obligation 74:4,6 obstructionist 69:15 74:15,17 obviously 87:19 October 66:1,11 90:14 101:10 102:4 108:25 109:6,13 110:9,12 111:8

office 90:21 91:2 101:6 101:7 officers 79:22 80:8 **offices** 90:23

once 90:11 94:11 102:1 103:24 ones 72:21 ongoing 72:6,12

open 85:8 opening 79:17 85:8 operates 82:5 **opportunity** 66:4 75:1 78:10 79:25 90:24

99:22 order 79:11 80:12 83:2

96:10 110:7.8 ought 69:4 outset 104:14 outside 81:16 98:19

106:16 outstanding 84:12 102:24 105:21

overlap 86:20 o'clock 110:11

P

packed 83:8 pages 106:4 paginate 103:22,24 paginated 104:16,18 106:4 paginating 103:20 pagination 103:23 Papi 108:3,4

paragraph 101:5

parallel 89:21 pardon 110:14 part 75:14 83:1,1,6 98:10 106:9 participants 73:13 **participate** 90:3 92:21 93:18 participation 93:25 particular 71:16 87:6 87:21 particularly 99:3

101:14 parties 66:4,20 69:4 75:1,10,12 77:1,4 80:4 81:13 86:5 92:9 92:20 93:12,14 95:18 97:21 98:15,24 102:23 103:2 105:17 106:8,11,17 107:1 108:16 109:15,19 110:1 111:2

party 75:15,23 91:18 94:9

passion 73:9 passionately 69:9,10 path 82:3 pathologists 96:7,20 Pauline 87:15 89:10

pay 101:11 peaceful 94:13 **people** 67:16,16,23 68:8 69:15,20,21 70:15,23 71:13 72:8 72:11,16,18,20,20

73:2 74:6,8,18 79:2 81:10 83:23 85:23 86:9.25 87:1.9 92:24 92:25 93:3,5,20 94:2 95:22 96:23 97:7 99:4 99:24 101:4 107:7,12

perform 110:4 **period** 88:7 101:16 102:14 109:16 permission 89:6 permit 73:4 person 73:5.22 93:1 103:14

107:16

personally 73:23 83:15 persons 86:6,7,10,11 86:16,21 87:16 107:6

107:19 108:12

perspective 92:24 persuade 69:19 73:8 petition 94:14 photocopying 83:7 photographs 105:10,11 105:14,18

place 72:16 80:19 81:13 87:21,24 89:1 91:6,8 93:6 94:20 96:1 98:19 110:11

places 66:10,16 71:4 planned 66:3 plea 68:10,11 **plead** 74:2

please 67:24 69:3 72:7 72:23 85:23 96:20 107:14,17 pleasure 82:15,16 plight 92:1 **point** 69:23 75:12,16 81:7,17,25 82:20,23 83:16,17 88:2 92:17 93:19 95:19 98:1 99:21,22 105:9 106:20 pointed 66:10,16 99:24 100:1

pointing 77:11 points 96:2 102:17 111:1,5 police 66:5 77:23,25 78:6,8 79:3,7,21,22

79:23 80:8,9 81:1,3,6 82:12,21 84:1 85:3,7 86:9 93:23 96:4,6 98:9,14 99:19 105:2 policeman 108:4

policemen 78:24 poor 70:23 93:5 **position** 79:1,6,7 83:9 84:7 85:18,19 90:8

94:11 100:16,22 possession 105:10 109:21

possible 80:2 94:14 98:16

possibly 77:18 103:21 **post** 81:9 83:4 84:3,8 84:10,12,16,19,21,24 85:4.9.12.13.16 99:18 104:22,25 105:4,10

postpone 109:2 postponed 108:22 109:6

postponement 67:4 82:1 108:25 109:4 post-mortem 94:25 95:11 96:10 97:18

98:22 105:4,12 post-mortems 95:15 Powell 96:1.3

power 69:11 83:16,17 99:21

PowerPoint 66:6 97:19 98:7,9

powers 89:25 practical 86:24 87:8,12 89:22 99:17 precisely 104:10 **preface** 67:12

prejudice 78:5 79:23 81:12 94:25 95:4,16 96:14

prejudiced 99:19 preparation 109:10 preparations 90:17 prepare 77:23 78:4,9 79:11 80:1 81:14

97:23 98:5 **prepared** 66:6,7

preparing 80:24 **presence** 68:17 77:10 80:9 91:7 **present** 66:20 68:19 69:4,5,22 70:5 78:21 81:5 83:21 84:11,24 85:10 95:18 100:4 102:23 105:19 107:18 108:6 presentation 66:6 82:12,21 83:16,17,22 97:19 98:7,9,12 99:21 **president** 88:6,24 89:7 89:25 91:2,9 94:15 pressure 76:23 presumably 99:13 prevent 77:12 pre-hearing 81:24 **pre-trial** 80:3,17 87:5 93:10 **print** 84:5 **printers** 104:19 **prior** 105:1 109:12 privately 77:18 privy 79:18 **pro** 93:20 **problem** 93:21 99:5 problems 84:4 99:1 procedural 98:18 procedure 74:14 80:20 proceed 67:15 69:5 73:11 79:2 80:14 91:19 97:16 104:2 106:19 107:3 **proceeding** 74:3 99:16 **proceedings** 66:1 67:7 69:22 80:14 90:5 98:17 106:18 107:3 109:12 110:8 **process** 74:13 product 92:5 proficient 107:13 progress 80:12 **proof** 84:18,20 **proper** 73:17 103:10,12 properly 98:13 proposals 111:5 **propose** 74:25 81:24 85:10 97:16 106:5 108:22 109:1 **proposed** 81:8 109:9 proposing 102:21 proposition 99:17 **prove** 87:3 **provide** 70:10,12 71:3 73:15 90:23 **provided** 72:7 80:6,18 102:4,5 provides 73:6 Provincial 101:7 **Provision** 72:11 provisionally 87:16,17 88:12 public 91:24 purposes 80:7 93:10 pursue 90:18 93:12 CHIVE FOR

pursued 76:18 put 66:19 74:20 76:23 100:16 103:23 $\overline{\mathbf{o}}$ question 78:12 83:3 97:17 98:6 102:24 110:13 questions 95:2 101:17 101:18 quickly 75:14 88:14 quite 81:23 91:23 R radio 68:5 raids 89:12 90:2 raise 91:5 110:12 raised 88:14 92:19 95:2 111:6 raising 74:16 77:5 93:9 ran 83:18 range 108:19 reach 71:5 87:5 94:5 103:3 **reached** 108:18 react 73:21 read 82:7 88:17,18 89:6 100:22 107:8,18 108:6 110:25 **reading** 109:17 reads 82:6 ready 81:5 83:4 91:19 96:15,19 97:11 103:16 really 76:18 84:2 93:7 102:1,13 reason 85:14 88:11,13 93:5 94:2 101:21 **reasonable** 71:8 73:15 76:19 reasonably 70:21 71:11 72:4 reasons 81:14 91:6 reassurance 111:3 receipt 91:1 receive 91:10 98:21 105:22 received 85:7 91:9 106:2 recognition 94:17 reconciliation 72:14 92:13 94:6 record 86:22 89:1,7 91:6,8 110:11 recorded 80:6,9 recovering 89:17 redeem 73:10 refer 72:19 reference 86:8 88:4,7 89:8 90:1 102:10 103:16 referred 95:11 103:1 111:1

96:24 103:5 109:8 registration 104:23 105:7 **Regulations** 68:25 **relate** 84:25 related 68:8 **relating** 66:11 85:16 relation 75:8 77:14,22 84:3,9 98:7 100:24 103:13 relative 86:24 relatives 67:19 release 73:5 released 73:2 86:10,11 relevant 86:3 88:7 remain 82:2 remaining 85:4 remarks 67:13 remember 99:6 remind 82:4 repeat 105:20 reply 97:4 100:16 report 84:14,21 105:21 reports 81:10 83:4 84:3 84:8,10,16,24 85:4,9 85:12,14,16 94:25 96:8 97:18 98:22 99:18 105:4,4,5,11,12 represent 74:5 86:3,4 86:11 87:14,16 92:7 92:21 representations 89:7 representative 86:23 representatives 66:20 75:1 77:1,3 80:4,7 82:2 87:6 92:23 98:8 98:14 99:7 103:2 107:1 108:15 109:15 110:1 **represented** 87:10,13 93:20 representing 68:18 95:18 Republic 88:24 request 66:16 72:2 73:17 89:20 90:15,25 91:15 98:13 100:25 requested 87:2 110:16 requesting 97:24 requisite 67:17 resent 74:15 resources 92:20 93:15 resourcing 94:11 respect 68:24 77:24 81:10 85:2 99:11 103:15 105:1,2,6,11 111:5,5 respectful 68:22 respond 75:5 77:1 80:24 81:20 110:19 responded 82:13 response 74:23 90:15

rest 86:10 restoration 82:6 result 89:11 92:4.12 resultant 90:2 results 108:14 resume 67:7 102:14 103:4 106:6,21 resumes 66:3 106:23 106:25 return 106:3 right 68:11 82:18 106:1 rights 80:21 rise 108:11 risen 75:18 rotate 87:7 rough 83:21 round 73:25 run 83:18 102:2 running 96:6 runs 82:22 rush 92:12 rushed 92:5 Russia 68:2 **Rustenburg** 84:5 R4 93:7 S

Sagalala 107:22,23 sake 76:1 Sam 108:1,2 **SAPS** 98:2 satisfactory 84:20 105:6 satisfied 84:11,18 89:15 101:24 Saturday 71:5 87:21 saw 73:23 83:18,23 saying 67:13 69:1,18 74:25 76:3 108:23 says 71:1 101:4 111:2 **SC** 66:23,25 67:10,12 75:3,13,25 76:2,5,6,8 77:6,15,21 78:14,18 78:20,23,24,25 79:1,5 79:14,18 80:2,5,13,15 95:21 97:9,14 107:21 108:17 110:15.19 script 68:16.17 scrolled 83:19 second 86:11 91:22 Secretariat 90:13 secretary 101:19 **section** 68:25 security 89:12,14 see 67:21 72:8,9 77:5 82:25 88:9 94:24 95:5 96:20 98:3,11,24,25 99:6 103:3 110:13 seeing 68:6 seek 69:19 90:17 92:14 **seeking** 69:10 seen 68:6,9 69:1,7 74:8 83:15,25 84:1

110:15 **Semenva's** 79:19 sense 67:8 69:18 82:16 82:16 84:12 sensible 104:1 sensitive 69:7 82:10 sensitivity 68:13 95:2 sent 91:1 separate 90:3 separately 93:16 **September** 89:6,10 90:16 91:3 sequentially 104:25 serious 82:20 serve 80:7 93:10 served 74:19 Service 98:9,14 services 70:13 81:3 Sesotho 107:12,15 set 84:8 90:3,4 Setswana 107:12,15 **setting** 108:23 settling 84:14 She's 88:20 shooting 89:16 **shop** 84:5 104:19 **shorten** 106:17 **shorter** 83:23,25 **shot** 81:11 shots 96:11 shouldn't 83:23 show 66:7 **showed** 89:17 **showing** 77:7 99:3 **shown** 77:9.13.17.18 98:10 99:16 **shows** 92:3 signs 89:17 sister 87:22 sitting 76:11 80:10 87:25 91:18 sittings 98:20 106:15 situation 70:7 six 82:23 83:14,20,24 Skosana 101:18,19 slides 83:19,25 **smaller** 66:15 social 67:4 70:4,6,6,8 70:25 71:2,17,17 75:11,20 76:10,12 97:10 100:20,20 101:4,8 solidarity 86:18 solved 98:19 99:2 soon 81:23 105:22 111:4 sorry 76:15 77:20 79:14 88:9 95:24 100:13 107:11 sort 93:9 sought 94:6 **sounds** 104:1 South 81:3 88:25 89:12 90:21 98:8

refused 91:15

refusing 67:3

regard 67:10 95:1,3

90:25 91:9 97:25

Responsibility 75:11

sees 83:24

Semenya 67:17 73:19

80:23 81:24 110:14

99:10 110:21

responsible 105:3

speak 67:18 69:20 75:2

75:12 80:17 82:8 83:9

84:6.24.24.25.25

85:21 94:14 95:14 speaker 82:18.19 speaking 82:7 88:4 92:7 94:24 107:12,12 **specific** 101:15 108:22 **spelt** 100:19 **spent** 98:18 **spite** 73:7 spoken 93:11 spot 96:2,4 spots 99:24 square 102:1 stage 66:21 76:24 77:20 80:24 81:4,9 83:2 91:14 94:13 95:10 99:20 104:16 stairs 75:22 standing 75:22 stands 111:7 start 96:16 102:1 started 92:2 107:7 state 66:4 statement 79:17,17,21 80:25 92:14 statements 108:21 **States** 68:2 **stating** 108:23 stay 102:6,7 stayed 94:7 step 86:23 steps 91:14 stone 91:12,16 stop 94:20 stress 109:13 stretching 93:7 strictly 88:3 strikes 103:19 strong 88:22 **subject** 103:14 submission 67:2,2 68:22 77:2 submissions 74:21 submit 69:24 72:8 submitted 69:16 subsequent 93:22 subsequently 77:18 86:10 substituted 80:18 successful 73:7 suffered 81:12 89:13 93:23 108:9 **sufficient** 109:5,21 suggest 98:20,21 102:20,25 104:2,5 106:5 suggested 76:25 91:10 suggesting 76:3,4 suggestion 104:2 suggestions 110:3 Sunday 71:5 superficial 103:10 suppose 104:8 supposed 96:4 sure 67:17 72:12,16 73:11 75:14 76:14,16

83:6 110:4 surely 82:24 surrounding 89:16 **suspicion** 85:3 105:2 suspicions 83:14 sustained 89:11 Swaziland 68:20 Sympathetic 77:6 sympathy 108:8 Т T 81:2 tactics 92:16 81:13 83:21 87:24 106:5,5 110:10

take 68:14 74:3 75:11 91:15,25 94:12 103:1 taken 95:6 102:17 takes 80:19 talking 93:14,15 tally 79:3 tape 96:16 tasked 83:5 tea 106:5 team 78:2,5 84:6 96:1 technical 81:14 85:5 tell 68:3 69:25 73:5 79:8 ten 84:25 terms 76:13 79:23 86:8 88:4,6 89:8 90:1 102:5,5,10 103:15 testify 66:17 thank 75:24 78:11,14 82:17 83:9,10 85:20 88:11 94:22 95:17 97:2.12 100:8 102:12 102:16 106:1 107:17 107:21 108:13,17 109:6,6 110:22 **Thapelo** 107:24 that's 70:11 71:9,16 72:14 74:2 76:21 93:16 104:18 105:23 105:23

themes 110:17

thev're 66:7

109:8

100:3

thev've 108:8

there's 91:21.23 94:7

97:5.17 109:16

thing 74:14 80:23 87:9 101:2 106:10 things 70:17 71:10 76:21 96:14 100:23 106:16 think 70:1 74:13 80:22 82:10,19 86:2 88:2,20 92:11,14 93:7 95:14 98:6 100:12 102:18 thinking 79:19 third 82:18 87:13 thorough 103:12 thought 67:6 96:12 three 70:17 71:4 80:11

85:15 86:4 104:22 105:1.12 Thursday 71:5 Tim 97:14 time 68:12 72:10 78:3 79:11,24 80:11 83:14 84:2 98:17 99:16 102:6,14 108:24 timetable 109:9 today 71:23 78:1,6,10 79:2 82:2,9 84:15 85:8 89:1 96:16 99:17 99:23 107:5 today's 67:7 token 101:25 **Tokota** 78:12,14,20,24 79:1,14 80:2,13 81:22 107:8,17,21 **told** 67:5 68:19 70:16 71:18,21,23 106:7,7 106:21 total 84:2 90:10 touch 69:16,17 81:20 **touched** 81:22 **Town** 73:1 track 101:3 transcribers 100:13 transcribing 85:24 transferred 76:20 translate 92:12 transportation 70:10 70:20 101:11 traumatic 72:10 trees 98:4 trouble 110:1 truth 72:14 82:6 92:13 94:5 trv 96:22 trying 75:5 77:22 93:4 94:13 105:13 **Tsemele** 108:3 turned 95:20 turns 83:22 **TV** 98:25 99:14,15,16 two 70:6,6,8 75:19 80:11.11 83:18 84:16 85:13 91:5 93:1 99:1 103:5 104:21 105:5 106:13 107:13

U unable 85:7 101:15 unanimous 109:3 underestimated 92:2 understand 66:5.18 75:8 79:5,7 81:8,12 84:1 97:8 98:1 99:9 99:10 106:25 107:11 109:18 **understood** 71:1 74:13 78:15 79:12 97:1,2,6 undertake 76:14 **underway** 95:12 97:5

unionised 86:21 unions 86:19 United 68:2 unlawful 93:24 unnecessarily 98:18 unrealistic 109:11 unsolicited 75:19 unturned 91:12,16 **urgent** 90:25 use 74:12 77:9 78:3 79:11 94:13 usefully 80:12,13 utilised 80:12,13

 \mathbf{v} Van 107:23 various 106:14 107:2 110:17 111:1 venue 70:11,20 71:7,12 76:20 verify 85:12 version 66:7 73:18,19 74:7 77:23,25 78:6,9 79:3,8,23 80:25 81:5 versions 66:5,21 vicinity 66:12 victim 87:18,18,21 88:18 90:6 93:12,13 95.11 victims 74:20 84:10,22 84:22,23 85:13,14,16 88:17,20,21 90:8,9 91:24 92:1,3,8,11 94:12,17 105:1,5 video 68:9 72:9 78:16 83:16 videos 84:1 view 82:25 83:2 90:6,10 viewing 77:25 82:15 83:16 views 111:4 virtually 102:22 visited 68:4 vital 77:8 96:7 viva 79:21 voce 79:21

want 66:19 69:1.23.24 74:6.9 80:20 83:13 86:2 92:17 93:19 96:19,20 97:22 100:10,14 102:1 104:21 109:13 wanted 69:6 82:4,20 91:10 92:6 94:20 100:15 wasn't 68:21 **waste** 78:4 watching 72:13 way 71:25 73:1 76:9 82:11 87:12 94:18 97:16 98:21 106:9 ways 90:17 107:2 Wednesday 89:10 90:16

W

week 84:23 85:16 88:23 weekend 91:4 weekend's 89:12 weighed 79:24 well-resourced 93:14 Wesley 82:15 98:11 we'd 97:17 98:3 99:23 we'll 111:3 we're 71:22 75:5 we've 71:21 85:5 96:21 106:21 what's 109:21 **whereof** 76:14 whilst 68:11 71:9 72:12 77:10 81:22 white 105:10,14,18 who'll 72:11 who's 93:5 widows 67:19 wield 96:16,17 **willing** 90:20 wish 74:23 77:2,4 89:1 95:18 97:13 100:3,6 107:10 110:12 wished 85:21 wishes 78:12 90:18 108:7 110:10 witness 77:8 108:20,20 witnesses 66:9,15,15 73:19 83:15 woman 90:7 Wonderkop 66:13 won't 98:17 106:6 word 77:10 88:12 words 104:24 work 77:23 87:2 90:12 90:13 96:25 100:24 109:14 110:5 workers 70:6,7,8,25 71:17,18 76:11 97:10 100:20 worth 90:9 wounds 96:9 write 94:14 writing 110:17 written 97:23 wrong 75:15 82:11 91:18 wrongful 93:22 **wrote** 89:5 Wvk 107:23

yesterday 71:24 72:1 73:21,23 76:11,22 83:8 87:23 88:25 99:13.25 you'd 73:3 you're 107:13,15

000 93:7 09:04 66:2 **09:24** 76:16 **09:44** 87:4

R C H I V E F O R J U S

undue 109:23

unfortunately 85:17

Page 7 1 **1** 89:9 90:14 104:8 106:2 1st 66:11 **10:04** 98:25 **11:03** 110:18 13th 99:12 **14:04** 106:24 **15** 106:6 **16** 68:25 **16th** 66:12 84:10 85:13 85:15,17 86:6 105:1,5 105:21 **19** 101:5 19th 89:10 **2** 89:15 **2012** 66:1 89:6,10 90:14,16 91:3 101:10 104:23,23,24 105:8,8 109:1 **21st** 89:5 91:2 **22nd** 108:25 109:6,13 110:9,12 111:8 **25th** 91:4 **26** 90:16 **270** 86:5,10,16,25 92:25 3 **3** 66:1 89:17 **31** 84:10 85:12 **34** 84:10,22 4 **4** 89:19 **45** 90:8 45th 88:20 **46** 88:20 **46th** 90:6 **5** 90:2 **50** 96:21 **553** 104:23,24 **554** 104:24 **555** 104:23,24 **578** 105:7 **583** 105:8 **6** 90:5 **7** 90:9 **8** 90:12 101:9 **8th** 76:17 97:11 101:25 102:4 **80s** 72:25 **9** 90:18 110:11 **1**11:7